

**SOCIO SPATIAL EXCLUSIONS AND POLICY
IMPLICATIONS:
A CASE STUDY OF MENLYN PARK MALL**

Research Report by:

THABANG RAPITSE MOFOKENG

Submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree

Master of Science in Development Planning

in the
School of Architecture and Planning
at the
University of the Witwatersrand

Supervisor:
DR TSEPANG LEUTA

MAY 2020

DECLARATION

I **Thabang Mofokeng (1558593)** am a student registered for the course **Master of Science in Development Planning** in the year **2020**.

I hereby declare the following:

I am aware that plagiarism (the use of someone else's work without their permission and/or without acknowledging the original source) is wrong.

I confirm that the work submitted for assessment for the above course is my own unaided work except where I have explicitly indicated otherwise.

I have followed the required conventions in referencing the thoughts, ideas, and visual material of others (I have referred to the Graduate School of Engineering and the Built Environment style guide).

I understand that the University of the Witwatersrand may take disciplinary action against me if there is a belief that this is not my own unaided work for that I have failed to acknowledge the source of the ideas or words in my writing.

TR Mofokeng

Signature

2020-05-29

Date

The statement is directly from the University of the Witwatersrand Plagiarism Policy.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

LIST OF TABLES.....	v
LIST OF FIGURES.....	v
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS.....	vi
LIST OF DEFINITIONS.....	vii
ABSTRACT	1
CHAPTER 1 - INTRODUCTION.....	2
1.1 BACKGROUND.....	2
1.2 PROBLEM STATEMENT	3
1.3 MAIN RESEARCH QUESTION.....	4
1.4 SUB-RESEARCH QUESTIONS.....	4
1.5 IMPORTANCE AND BENEFITS OF THE PROPOSED STUDY	5
1.6 SUMMARY	5
CHAPTER 2 - LITERATURE REVIEW AND CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK	6
2.1 INTRODUCTION.....	6
2.2 THE ECONOMIC ROLE OF CITIES	6
2.3 COMPETITIVENESS OF CITIES.....	7
2.4 RIGHT TO THE CITY	8
2.5 SPATIAL JUSTICE AND TRANSPORTATION	9
2.6 THE DEVELOPMENT AND ROLE OF PLANNING IN SOUTH AFRICA	15
2.7 CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK	19
2.8 CONCLUSION	23
CHAPTER 3 – RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODS.....	25
3.1 RESEARCH PARADIGM / PHILOSOPHY	25

3.2	DESCRIPTION OF INQUIRY STRATEGY AND BROAD RESEARCH DESIGN	26
3.3	SAMPLING.....	27
3.4	DATA COLLECTION.....	27
3.5	DATA ANALYSIS	29
3.6	ASSESSING AND DEMONSTRATING THE QUALITY AND RIGOUR THE PROPOSED RESEARCH DESIGN	30
3.7	RESEARCH ETHICS	30
CHAPTER 4 – FINDINGS		32
4.1	INSIGHTS FROM THE MENLYN PARK MALL SURROUNDING AREA	32
4.2	INSIGHTS FROM MENLYN PARK MALL.....	38
4.3	INSIGHTS FROM PEDIESTIRIAN EXPERIENCES.....	40
4.4	INSIGHTS FROM THE DEPARTMENT OF PLANNING, MONITORING AND EVALUATION	42
4.5	INSIGHTS FROM THE DEPARTMENT OF TRANSPORTATION	46
4.6	INSIGHTS FROM THE TSHWANE MUNICIPALITY.....	48
4.7	INSIGHTS FROM THE TRASNPORTATION INDUSTRY	50
4.8	CONCLUSION	51
CHAPTER 5 – DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSION.....		52
5.1	DISCUSSION OF FINDINGS ASSESSED AGAINST CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK.....	53
5.2	CONCLUSIONS BASED ON RESEARCH QUESTIONS.....	56
5.3	LIMITATIONS OF THE STUDY.....	58
5.4	RECOMMENDATIONS AND SUGGESTIONS FOR FUTURE RESEARCH	59
REFERENCES		60

APPENDIX 1 – PARTICIPATION INFORMATION SHEET	71
APPENDIX 2 – FORMAL CONSENT FORM.....	73

LIST OF TABLES

Table 1: Core concepts of integrated transport and land-use planning	11
Table 2: NDP spatial development principles	18
Table 3: SPLUMAs development principles.....	18
Table 4: Conceptual Framework.....	20
Table 5: Interviewee demographics.....	40
Table 6: Results of Likert scale questionnaire	40

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1: Context map of Menlyn Park Mall.....	32
Figure 2: Atterbury Road outside of Menlyn Park Mall	33
Figure 3: Atterbury road and Lois Avenue intersection.....	34
Figure 4: Lois Avenue outside of Menlyn Park Mall.....	35
Figure 5: Lois Avenue outside of Menlyn Park Mall.....	36

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

Abbreviation	Meaning
CoT	City of Tshwane
DRDLR	The Department of Rural Development and Land Reform
DoT	Department of Transport
GIS	Geographic Information System
IDP	Integrated Development Planning
IUDF	Integrated Urban Development Framework
LUM	Land Urban Mark
MSA	Municipal Systems Act
MPM	Menlyn Park Mall
NDP	National Development Plan
PMG	Parliamentary Monitoring Group
MTA	Menlyn Taxi Association
S.A.	South Africa
SDF	Spatial Development Framework
SPLUMA	Spatial Planning and Land Use Management Act, 2013

LIST OF DEFINITIONS

Actor/s	Key role player/s.
Context	Circumstances that form the setting for an event.
Density	The quantity of people or things in a particular area.
Global North	Countries defined as more developed and richer.
Global South	Countries defined as still developing or less developed.
Participation	The action of taking part in an activity or event.
Right to the City	Power for the working class, for people of colour, for immigrants, youth and for all others committed to a truly democratic society.
Space	The freedom to live and develop as one wishes.
State	The municipal government.
Topography	The arrangement of the physical features of an area. A detailed description of an area.
Users	A person who uses or operates something. The continued use or enjoyment of a right.

ABSTRACT

Menlyn Park Mall (MPM) has recently completed an expansion project that has seen it become the largest mall in Africa (Nkosi, 2016). While MPM has significantly increased in size as well as in customer base. Public transportation users have not been provided with safe infrastructure inside or outside the grounds of the mall. Pedestrians need to cross a busy main road (Atterbury Road) or a busy side road (Lois Ave) in order to gain access to the mall and to leave the mall, resulting in pedestrians needing to dodge on-coming traffic when gaining entry into the mall. On numerous occasions pedestrians have been struck by oncoming traffic.

This phenomenological study investigates spatial inequality in South African transportation systems by interrogating the implementation of planning policy at MPM, and assessing how the space is affecting public transportation users, as they have been provided with inadequate infrastructure when entering and leaving the mall. The objective of this study was to determine whether planning policy is being effectively interpreted and implemented by local government and the public sector and to interrogate the experiences of public transportation users entering and leaving MPM. The main research question of this study is: Using MPM as a case for spatial inequality in South African urban transportation systems, what are the reasons for the lack of adequate provision of public transportation infrastructure in and around MPM?

The study dived into the lived experiences of the users of space around MPM and policy implementation, by way of observations, document analysis, and interviews of public transportation users, the taxi industry, MPM, the Tshwane Municipality, the Department of Transportation, and the Department of Planning, monitoring and evaluation and assessment of planning policy.

The study found that there is a clear lack of public transportation infrastructure in and around MPM and the majority of pedestrians interviewed do not feel safe entering and leaving the mall. The lack of regulation and formalisation of the minibus taxi industry acts as a barrier to access adequate public transportation infrastructure and causes spatial exclusion; and planning policy currently promotes integrated land use and transportation planning while providing no guide about how to achieve this integration, so municipalities are not empowered to implement it.

CHAPTER 1 - INTRODUCTION

1.1 BACKGROUND

The Menlyn area in Pretoria, Gauteng, has developed rapidly since 2014. Over R 2.5 billion was invested in a redevelopment project of Menlyn Park Mall (MPM); the mall was still fully operational during the expansion. This expansion project resulted in MPM becoming the largest mall in Africa at 177 000 square meters; the upgrades were completed and the mall had a grand reopening showcasing its new sections on 24 November 2016 (Nkosi, 2016). The mall has 16 entrances, 16 parking exits and 8250 parking bays to accommodate customers visiting the mall. Although the mall has thousands of parking bays to accommodate private car commuters, MPM only has 6 public transportation stops, outside the mall, that are inadequate to accommodate public transportation commuters. Since the expansion of MPM, the Menlyn area has seen the arrival of a boulevard mall (Menlyn Maine), a casino (Times Square Casino), and many high raised commercial and residential buildings. These developments have been aimed at accommodating the middle and upper class and to bring new economic diversity to Pretoria.

Good quality of life in large cities attracts educated, high-income households who support new ideas and innovation (Carlino, 2005); but in order to remain competitive, cities often exclude poor urban inhabitants (Huchzermeyer, 2011). Because of this, most successful countries institute policies that create uniform living standards across space (World Development Report, 2009). Minibus taxis transport approximately 15 million commuters daily, this constitutes around 65% of the commuting public and workforce of South Africa (SANTACO: undated). Stats SA (2015) states that a large majority of South African citizens use public transportation (76.7%); taxis (51%) are the most common form of public transport, followed by buses (18.1%), and trains (7.6%).

After apartheid, socio-spatial inequality, racial inequality and marginalisation became ingrained in the urban landscape of South Africa and the needs of the majority of South Africans have often been overlooked in spatial planning (Murray, 2008). Space in

cities, can be used to demonstrate dominance and repression or it can be used ethically to promote spatial justice (Dikeç, 2001). Planners use space to communicate their language when it comes to the spatial make up of an area, it therefore appears when there is a service or infrastructure lack for a certain group of people that can or could have been addressed, that the oversight is due to carelessness or a disregard for the needs of this group. This is usually the case for the marginalized and the poor. This may be the case when plans are visionary but do not consider the cost or practicality of implementing these plans leading to implementation failures in the long run (van Rij and Altes, 2008).

MPM is situated on the corner of Atterbury road and Lois Avenue. Atterbury Road is a main arterial road off ramping onto the National Route 1 (N1). Both of these roads are busy, filled with buses, taxis and private vehicles entering the mall or dropping off workers and customers near the malls entrances. There have been recorded instances where pedestrians trying to gain access to or leave the mall have been struck by oncoming traffic on Atterbury Road or Lois Avenue.

1.2 PROBLEM STATEMENT

MPM has recently completed a R2.5 Billion expansion project. The expansion project has not resulted in the adequate accommodation of public transportation users who are dropped off and collected on two busy main roads (Lois Avenue and Atterbury Road) when entering and leaving the mall. Both roads are busy and filled with buses, taxis, and private vehicles dropping off workers and customers near the mall's entrances. There have been reported incidents of pedestrians being struck by oncoming traffic when entering and leaving MPM. The goal of planning in developing South Africa post-1994, has been the achievement of integration, inclusive development and removing the injustices of the past. Yet the needs of the majority of South Africans are still over-looked.

Purcell (2002) puts forward the question of how to merge the interests of different groups when it comes to right to the city and how right to the city can play a role in building a democratic society. All citizens in a city are equal but how do you merge their interests and ensure that inclusion and equality is taking place? Dikeç (2001)

declares that equitable distribution of access does not take place in cities and that spatial justice encompasses social injustice; if you have one missing there will be problems. Schoeman (2015) argues that planning policy is lacking and that planning models as well as current planning laws have not integrated and aligned themselves to deliver true spatial change, but they have rather widened the exclusion, injustices, and segregation on the ground.

1.3 MAIN RESEARCH QUESTION

Planning policy in South Africa is lacking and planning models and laws have failed to eliminate spatial exclusion. MPM recently completed an expansion project that saw it become the largest mall in Africa. The pedestrians entering and leaving MPM have to cross two busy main roads in order to access the mall. During the expansion project, MPM increased their parking bays to 8250 for car driving customers. Regardless of this, public transportation users have not been provided with adequate infrastructure to enter and leave the mall safely. Using MPM as a case for spatial inequality in South African urban transportation systems, what are the reasons for the lack of adequate provision of public transportation infrastructure in and around MPM?

1.4 SUB-RESEARCH QUESTIONS

The purpose of this study is to investigate spatial inequality in South African urban transportation systems by: investigating the inadequate provision of public transportation infrastructure at MPM, investigating how public transportation users are affected by these inadequacies, and scrutinizing planning policy, theory, values and ethics in an attempt to gain a better understanding of how they provide for integration between transportation and land use in development, and how these policies translate to implementation; by answering the following questions:

What social and spatial problems have been caused by a lack of adequate public transportation infrastructure in and around MPM and who are the stakeholders affected by these inadequacies?

What are the reasons for the inadequate provision of public transportation infrastructure in and around MPM and can the lack of adequate public transportation infrastructure in and around MPM be classified as spatial exclusion?

From a policy perspective, what were the municipality of Tshwane's planning requirements regarding integration of land use with transportation and has MPM met all of their requirements?

SPLUMA has been branded the solution to the inadequacies of planning policy. Is SPLUMA, and other planning policy, in its current state able to address the challenges caused by inadequate public transportation infrastructure through implementation?

1.5 IMPORTANCE AND BENEFITS OF THE PROPOSED STUDY

Approximately 60 – 70% of the commuting public and workforce in South Africa make use of public transportation (Arrive Alive: undated). In a country like South Africa where the majority of citizens are public transportation users, a study like this one is important as it contributes to growing literature on the spatial inclusion of all economic groups in society. It emphasises the need for all stakeholders to be taken into account in planning the use of public spaces; and indicates a need for planning policy makers to investigate possible ways to adjust planning policy and implementation to achieve the integration of public transportation and land use.

1.6 SUMMARY

The remainder of this dissertation is structured as follows. This introductory chapter will be followed by a review of relevant literature in Chapter 2. Chapter 3 will outline the research methods used in this study. This is followed by a detailed discussion of the results in Chapter 4; and conclusions, limitations, recommendations and ideas for future research in Chapter 5.

CHAPTER 2 - LITERATURE REVIEW AND CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK

2.1 INTRODUCTION

The new age movement (neoliberalism) has forced cities to adopt a more entrepreneurial approach to long-term spatial planning (Olsen, 2014). Cities now compete more aggressively and at a larger scale to promote exclusive events and build iconic projects in order to attract and retain tourism, investment, and skilled people (Turok, 2004). While this new approach to spatial planning has resulted in increased productivity and competitiveness for many cities (UN Habitat, 2011), spatial policies that are concerned with the accumulation of capital and building a skilled population have also impacted cities in negative ways (Huchzermeyer, 2011). This chapter will assess current literature on urban competitiveness, spatial inclusion and transportation in South Africa.

2.2 THE ECONOMIC ROLE OF CITIES

Economists have not come to a definitive answer on the causes of economic growth in cities but they do acknowledge that it goes beyond the accumulation of capital and labour (Glaeser, 1994). While cities push for capital and labour investments, this will not necessarily always translate into economic growth; rather, a city will take on this investment risk in the hope of eventual economic prosperity.

Cities provide efficiency benefits, which result in economies of scale in productivity and competitiveness (UN Habitat, 2011). Cities are the show grounds for economic growth and opportunities for countries, and they have become critical in GDP contribution as well as the development of specialized economies. While cities are becoming economic hubs, businesses are almost given carte blanche to do what they need to develop these specialized economies.

Economic growth experienced by cities can be unbalanced, leading to high levels of inequality. Because of this, most successful countries institute policies that create

uniform living standards across space (World Bank, 2009). Big cities that offer more choices to residents attract high-skilled, high-income households that supports the cities' ability to support new ideas and innovation (Carlino, 2005). While policy seeks to improve the lives of the urban poor in order to improve spatial inclusion, accommodating the urban poor is not in the interest of economic competitiveness meaning that companies are not always willing to invest in such initiatives (Huchzermeyer, 2011). The consequences of the growth of cities on the urban poor as well as the resultant depletion of natural resources required to fuel this growth are often neglected (Turok and Mcgranahan, 2013).

2.3 COMPETITIVENESS OF CITIES

Cities are a major driving force of production, development and competitiveness so they need to attract populations that have specialised and superior skills (Trullen and Boix, 2008). Developing countries attract foreign direct investment, which results in rapid urban development and population sizes (Kiamba, 2012). Good quality of life in large cities attracts educated high-income households and entrepreneurs who support new ideas and innovation (Carlino, 2005). Cities need to make sure that they are competitive if they are to attract these households. Attracting and retaining these households allows cities to export knowledge-intensive products (Turok, 2004).

Cities do not aim to be competitive merely as an end in itself, competitiveness is an indication of economic success. Cities have become aggressive in marketing themselves in order to attract private investment and tourism; cities market themselves through exclusive events, iconic projects and providing a good quality of life to citizens (Turok, 2004). Cities try to position themselves by building or developing landmarks that are significant on a global scale (Taylor, 2017). The need to remain competitive has forced cities to adopt a more entrepreneurial approach to long-term planning (Olesen, 2014).

The Global South is unique but it is following the norms and method of the developments of the Global North (Andersen, Jenkins, and Nielsen, 2015). Forgetting that there are certain needs that the South has that the North does not, which is why there is a problem with the copy and pasting of developments coming from the Global

North in a South African context. Cities have been the main reasons for sustained economic growth across the world, as they not only attract investments but specialized skills and trade (UN Habitat, 2011).

Cities are constantly creating cultural economies and they are employing more people, producing higher skilled citizens and promoting an intensive vibrant economy for investment to thrive through services and manufacturing (Scott, 2004). Reducing regulation limitations in terms of trade and types of sectors that may be present in the spatial make up of cities, creates spaces for integrated booms and makes clear the type of people that the city aims to attract and accommodate (Turok, 2004). Reducing regulation provides the business sector with confidence that it will be able to operate freely and grow in cities, which attract more sectors. This is good, as cities are not solely relying on national government for development and economic transformation, they are actively driving investments, and attracting and producing specialized skills.

Competition between cities and regions may widen social inequalities (Turok and McGranahan, 2013). Marcuse (2009) supports this view and states that capitalism is a major force that brings about many spatial changes and investments, which inadvertently creates spatial demands that can lead to some kinds injustice and exclusion. In order to remain competitive, cities often exclude poor inhabitants (Huchzermeyer, 2011). Long term planning exercises that wish to improve the quality of life of current and future generations need to find ways to disrupt social inequalities (Olesen, 2014).

2.4 RIGHT TO THE CITY

David Harvey, the proponent of Right to the City, called for the Just City. A city where all people reap the benefits of the urban realm and he spoke of how neoliberalism and capitalism is to blame for the spatial injustices experienced by society (Marcuse, 2009). Capitalism controls the urbanist agenda and although it has resulted in the growth of many economies, it has also created fragmented societies. Although the capitalist agenda plays a major role in the successful transformation of cities, the quality of life of the inhabitants of these cities should be of great importance (Baker,

2012). Purcell (2002) poses a critical question, he asks: What is the alternative to the capitalism movement as a solution to bringing about urban democracy?

Murray (2008) highlights that cities, for many citizens in a country, are seen as escapes for a better life, better jobs and better quality of life. Some of the metropolitan cities in South Africa like Johannesburg and Pretoria are seen as escapes for people coming from rural, peri-urban areas and former apartheid homelands. Urban employment is imperative in reducing urban poverty (Chen and Skinner, 2014). There is global interest in the right to the city movement but there is also a danger of it being over-used and maybe even exploited (Purcell, 2013).

Lefebvre's take on Right to the City can be argued as being too radical and utopianism in the urban context. Lefebvre argues that the marginalised citizens living in a city have a right to the city and there should be inclusion in spaces; something that is missing in South African cities (Huchzermeyer, 2011). Watson (2009) emphasizes that urban planning alone cannot fix the ills of capitalism and the 21st century problems that come with it, capitalism plays a major role in some of the challenges people face in cities but social capital of individuals must be used to fix the problems on the ground.

Lefebvre calls on all to rethink space and how they interact with it. Lefebvre also calls for a shift away from the status quo of power structures and to allow citizens to decide how their urban space should be planned and lived in (Purcell, 2002). Ultimately, the goal of the Right to the city movement is to provide citizens living in cities with the power to reap the benefits of their cities (Miller and Nicholis, 2013). Citizens should be given the opportunity to participate in the political life, management and administration of their cities (Dikec, 2001).

2.5 SPATIAL JUSTICE AND TRANSPORTATION

The definition of spatial justice is very broad and context specific (Mihalopoulos, 2014a). There is not much clarity on what spatial justice looks like socially, or how it should be administered. When spatial remedies are used to address spatial injustices, they need to address not only the physical space but heal the social scars carried by residents as well (Marcuse, 2009). Spatial justice goes hand in hand with the law.

Achieving spatial justice requires the application of the law and the achievement of corrective action to rectify the injustices experienced.

Spatial justice as a concept incorporates geographical, sociological and legal aspects; and it is defined as the desire of multiple parties to occupy the same space at the same time (Mihalopoulos, 2014b). Analysing this definition makes it obvious that some parties will probably not be happy with the outcome of any spatial distribution achieved as a result of applying spatial remedies. Marcuse (2009) supports this view by stating that it is not possible to achieve spatial justice in a capitalist system as the system of capitalism is itself unjust. The urban poor are poorly represented in government as capitalism has crippled government's ability to govern which leads to their urban exclusion (Merkel, 2014).

Cillers and Victor (2018) state that although a lot of change has occurred in South Africa, inequality and unbalanced development still takes place due to Apartheid legacy planning. Tibaijuka (2006) states that planning increases social exclusion by sweeping away poor inhabitants in planned cities, and she states that a new approach to planning needs to be developed that is inclusive of the poor. Watson (2009) called for planning to achieve social inclusion by addressing issues like poverty and inequality in the urban environment. Bostrom et al (2015) refer to the concept of social sustainability which addresses aspects like quality of life, access to resources and green spaces, cultural and gender issues, employees' rights, and participation in the urban environment. It is necessary for planning to address these issues if it is to contribute to the achievement of social justice in the urban environment.

The Global South and North are worlds apart when it comes to transportation and land use. Globally, the use of cars has increased. In the Global North, car use has reached its apex while car use in the Global South is fuelled by economic growth. In the Global South, public transportation usage is predominantly unplanned and planning is car orientated; resulting in a road hierarchy in Global South cities that is not equitable (Cervero, 2013).

Transportation plays a crucial role in ensuring accessibility to the expanse of cities (Daniels and Mulley, 2013). The urban form of South Africa's transportation systems

is geared towards accommodating the wealthy car driving minority, regardless of the fact that 67% of South African households living in urban areas rely on public transportation to get to work and school (StatsSA, 2014). In order to improve land use and increase access to sustainable transportation, planning has been aimed at intensification (development) of cities for many decades (Duffhues and Bertolini, 2016).

The World Health Organisation (2013) states that urban forms should reduce the occurrence of fatalities, injuries and costs caused by traffic accidents. Regardless of this, South Africa had 14 071 traffic fatalities in 2016 (AfricaCheck, 2018). In order for public transportation to be a real alternative to private cars, transportation networks need to be integrated with land use (Curtis and Scheurer, 2017). South African Cities Network (2014) suggests that integrated transport and land-use planning can assist with the achievement of equity of access, safety and efficiency in cities (Refer to Table 3).

Table 1: Core concepts of integrated transport and land-use planning

Concept	Definition
Equity of access	South African transit systems need to be accessible to car-drivers, public transportation users and pedestrians. Car-centred transit systems, like the current South African systems, are usually inequitable and inaccessible to pedestrians and public transportation users.
Safety	Traffic accidents are one of the leading causes of non-natural deaths in South Africa, with South Africa having one of the highest traffic fatality rates in the world. The land use process and the design of the built environment heavily influences transportation in cities, the behaviour of commuters and their safety while commuting.
Efficiency	Public transportation needs to be accessible enough for pedestrians to be able to access within a 20 minute walk. Having said that, the demand for public transport needs to be high enough to support viable public transport networks.

Source: Adapted from South African Cities Network (2014)

There is a need for efficient and effective transportation systems in African nations in order to support economic growth and development (Faajir and Zidan, 2016), but a lack of adequate land use and infrastructure development has resulted in a decline in transportation development and minibuses taxis (which are cheap and often unsafe) are the main mode of reliable transportation in many developing African nations (Abuhamoud, Rahmat, and Ismail, 2011).

In East African countries, planning in silos and a lack of stakeholder engagement has resulted in poor public transportation quality (Kanyama, 2016). Klopp (2012) found the same problem in Lagos, Addis Ababa and Nairobi where transportation projects are not prioritised by policy makers and civil society regardless of their ability to improve the quality of life of urban inhabitants. There is a large need for transportation infrastructure in East African countries but challenges with financing and a lack of stakeholder inclusion in transportation infrastructure decision-making has resulted in a lack of accountability to citizens (Klopp and Makajuma, 2014).

Taki, Maatouk, Qurnfulah and Aljoufie (2017) state that in China when public transportation integration was applied to the development of roads, it brought about social cohesion. Transport oriented development enhances public transportation integration in growing cities; and integration of transportation with land use has been found to enhance the experience of commuters. Transportation is important in the urban realm as it directly impacts the economy by transporting labourers and professionals, and impacts social activity by bringing people together and connecting them to vital services. Urban realms have the most connected transport systems; the bigger the city, the greater its challenge to ensure access for all (Asmu'i and Fitriati, 2014).

Doulet, Delpirou and Delaunay (2017) found that investment, economic growth, attractiveness, and future plans are what shapes urban development. It was found in China, that as property developers were given more freedom, they shaped the urban fabric which resulted in the urban transit systems constantly being upgraded (Taki, Maatouk, Qurnfulah and Aljoufie, 2017). This was not the case in India where planning of transportation systems has not accommodated all users as it does not reflect the needs of the poor – travel choices there are not made by the users of public

transportation but are made by powerful and influential individuals; proper access to transportation infrastructure that is well planned connects people to economic activity and public space (Levy, 2013). The urban realm is constantly growing and it is important that transportation and land use integration be considered in planning to accommodate this growth so that the lives of the users of this space are influenced positively. Integration can also help correct urban traffic congestion (Wang, Zhu, Li, and Wu, 2013). In China, urban transportation and infrastructure struggles to accommodate rapid growth in travel demands (Zou, Chen, Yu, Tong, Huang, Li and Zou, 2013). The same problem was experienced in Romania where an increase of wealth resulted in increased car ownership and migration resulted in city growth. Transportation infrastructure has to grow to accommodate this growth in city inhabitants (Tosa, Mitrea, Sato, Miwa, and Morikawa, 2018).

Multiple stakeholder involvement is required to solve the issues caused by transportation and to create accessible and integrated transportation systems, not only by government and professional stakeholders but also the users of the space. Movement for people without cars in the United States of America (USA) is unrestricted, this resulted from planners and engineers deliberately working together to maximise societal transportation needs in the 1940s (Balsas, 2015).

In the Netherlands, planning in silos resulted in fragmented spatial planning. It was found that while planning had the right tools in terms of problem-solving space issues, they were not utilised effectively (Heeres, van Dijk, Arts and Tillema, 2017). In Europe, improvements in integration of transportation and land use resulted from the inclusion of stakeholders and the right policies being implemented (Helming and Perez-Soba, 2011). A study conducted in Italy shared the same view, finding that stakeholder and public engagement became key in the transportation planning process and that different countries had different levels of stakeholder engagement. Stakeholders are key in establishing an overall vision for the future (Cascetta and Pagliara, 2012).

In Japan, transportation strategies that included efficiency, equity and the environment were the most effective and it was found that any transportation system needed to consider all of these elements in order to be effective. While transportation systems worked efficiently and were equitable in cities, the dense population of cities resulted

in large amounts of CO₂ emissions, and sustainability could only be achieved through stakeholder inclusivity (Doi and Kii, 2012).

In Denmark, urban planning needed to be integrated with transportation planning in order to accommodate urban growth caused by migration; forecasting was key in achieving an effective and sustainable transportation system (Wei and Magharabi, 2013). In the 20th century, transportation planning was aimed at cars and the safety of motorists in North America, but there has been a shift and transportation planning now considers integration and safe access to transportation for all road users (Manaugh, Badami and El-Geneidy, 2013). An Australian study supports this view by stating that new approaches to planning need to be considered in order to achieve true integration and transportation systems that serve all users (not only on motorists), again the study emphasises stakeholder inclusion (Curtis and Scheurer, 2017).

On paper, South Africa's planning policies are integrated, democratic, strategic and sustainable; but practically find it difficult to instigate the transformation that is required in South African urban spaces (Coetzee, 2012). Translating planning knowledge into an implementable form can be difficult and complex, which often results in the concept of planning appearing inaccessible (Papa et al, 2016). Spatial planning needs to merge with land development while being inclusive. Planners may be visionary in the policies that they create but these plans may be impractical in implementation. Strategic and operational planning needs to link, a fractured link leads to misalignment of objectives and implementation failures (van Rij and Altes, 2008).

Spatial planning needs to have a long-term view and be sustainable while also solving short-term problems which can be challenging (Nichersu and Iacoboa, 2011). It seems that uneven development has only intensified under the new age movement (Golubchikov, Badyina and Makhrova, 2014). Many of South Africa's poor do not have access to South African metropolitan cities (Cilliers and Victor, 2018).

2.6 THE DEVELOPMENT AND ROLE OF PLANNING IN SOUTH AFRICA

Section 9 of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa (1996), the highest legal mandate of the country, deals with equality. It mandates national government to put an end to discrimination. Schedule 4 deals with the responsibilities of local government and binds municipalities to the constitution. Municipalities, bound by legislation passed by local government, have the autonomy to take the actions that they deem necessary to effectively achieve their mandate. The Bill of Rights, contained in the constitution, contains laws about civil rights, freedom, equality and human dignity.

The Development Facilitation Act of 1995 (DFA) was created to prescribe land development principles on urban and rural land and it saw the creation of the Development and Planning Commission at the same time to help local government to drive spatial transformation. Urban LandMark (2010) explains that although the DFA was created to combat complex issues created by apartheid, these issues still persisted and municipalities were not able to deliver on their mandate due to a lack of resources. The act would later be repealed to be replaced by the Municipal Systems Act of 2000, a more comprehensive act aimed at helping local government achieve its mandate of spatial transformation.

During apartheid, black people lived in Bantustans, where traditional leaders were given ceremonial authority but no power to effect any real change. Industries were, by law, not allowed in Bantustans. This deprived these areas of potential property taxes that could be collected from businesses, resulting in stagnation of growth and development in black areas and the black population of South Africa (White Paper, 1998).

The White Paper was introduced after apartheid to guide municipalities in how to integrate all people into the urban environment. The White Paper (1998) proposed the following support mechanisms to assist municipalities to achieve their objectives:

- Increasing local government's authority,
- Securing constitutional rights of local government and consultation during legislation and policy process support for improved service delivery,

- Having a hands-on approach to the transformation of service delivery systems and capacity building at the core,
- On-going institutional development,
- Municipalities working with all stakeholders and having funded pilot programs, and
- Facilitating shared learning amongst different municipalities.

The Municipal Systems Act no. 32 of 2000 was created to define the social and economic role of municipalities, in order to aid them in fully servicing the communities under their jurisdiction, enabling change away from Apartheid planning. The framework attempts to enable proper community development through participation, the development of Integrated Development Plans (IDPs) and Spatial Development Frameworks (SDFs), and the planning requirements and duties of the municipalities. Prior to the municipal systems act, municipalities did not have a clear mandate that truly defined their role, although the White Paper and the DFA was around, they lacked some clarity on bigger issues like resources, the extent of their functions and powers. Municipalities now had duties and rights to exercise their powers and resources, ensure delivery of services, ensure a fair government, promote progressive development, and protect their citizens (PMG, 2007).

Section 27 of the Municipal Systems Act mandates that municipalities create Integrated Development Plans (IDPs) that bind local and district municipalities. IDPs are pushed and completely compiled by local government and are used to fast track greater socio-economic spatial transformation; introduced under the Municipal Systems Act and directly linked to the Spatial Development Framework (SDF) to fast track transformation in municipalities from old apartheid planning models. IDPs are used as key municipal indicators of performance in municipal boards, they are five-year plans developed by the ruling party in the local government and, along with SDFs, are used for land use management.

Harrison (2008) puts forward that IDPs brought focus to the participatory process, community development, and poverty alleviation. IDPs were created to ensure that municipalities would deliver spatial change and deliver what the White Paper intended. IDPs are process-centred events that create a better local government, but they can become a hinderance to ill-equipped municipalities who have limited technical,

decision-making and implementation capacity (Ngamlana & Englin, 2015). Todes (2004) supports this view by stating that in order to achieve sustainable development, IDPs need a strong emphasis on participation and partnerships, this would result in development between local government and civil society.

Good quality IDPs that clarify needs, strategies and projects could lead to improved downward co-ordination and integration but not all municipalities have access to the resources to make that happen (Friedmann, 2003). IDPs are not stand-alone documents, but they rely on other policies, such as: the Municipal Systems Act, Spatial Development Frameworks (SDF), and the Constitution. IDPs, SDFs and other planning tools that municipalities have at their disposal are key in making progress, but municipalities also need to better balance the interests of different stakeholders and find creative ways to incorporate private sector resources in creating planning solutions that meet the needs all users of space (NDP, 2011).

Spatial Development Frameworks (SDF) are a part of Integrated Development Plans (IDP), and are mandated in the Municipal System Act. SDFs have a five-year cycle, that run in line with the current political party/person in office. SDFs are used to drive change, direct investment and are aligned with the government progress goals, they provide municipalities with direction on the achievement of integrated and sustainable spatial development, that is also investor conscious (DRDLR, 2011). SDFs are critical in supporting municipalities to achieve their IDPs. SDFs are meant to promote equity, sustainability, socio-economic needs and capacity in urban spaces and provide guidance to development not only to the government but also to the private sector (Ngamlan and Englin, 2015).

The National Development Plan 2030 (NDP), developed by the South African government to define the desired destination of South Africa by 2030, was created to unite, reduce poverty, encourage an inclusive society, and create sustainable development for all South Africans in the country regardless of colour and social class. The plan comes from the National Planning Commission, an office created in 2010, with the aim of transforming South Africa using a long term strategic plan and vision. It plans to address the injustices created and that still persist in South Africa today due to apartheid planning (NDP, 2011). The NDP is built on 12 pillars which are either

directly or indirectly linked to the Spatial Planning and Land Use Management Act of 2013 (SPLUMA). Overall SPLUMA calls for spatial development that seeks to undo the errors of South Africa's past. The NDP has spatial development principles that it would like to achieve by 2030 (Refer to Table 1).

Table 2: NDP spatial development principles

Spatial justice	Equal access to space and ensuring that development is inclusive.
Spatial sustainability	Spatial transformation that is not detrimental to the environment.
Spatial resilience	Protection of ecological networks.
Spatial quality	A built environment that is inclusive of all people and their various needs.
Spatial efficiency	Production of transport infrastructure that is accessible for jobs and business sector while ensuring all people can use it.

Source: Adapted from NDP (2011)

SPLUMA was passed in 2013 and became the national act on spatial development empowered by the Constitution of South Africa. SPLUMA has five developmental principles that it aims to achieve (Refer to Table 3).

Table 3: SPLUMAs development principles

Spatial justice	Reversing the errors of the past and ensuring the policies and frameworks developed by government are inclusive of the previously disadvantaged.
Spatial sustainability	Land use management by municipalities that is financially efficient and in line with environmental protection. Promoting land use that is sustainable as well as limiting urban sprawl.
Principle of efficiency	Limiting the effects of bad decision making, having application procedures that are efficient in making the best use of existing resources.

Spatial resilience	Planning policies, frameworks and other systems that ensure that citizens are protected against economic and environmental shocks.
Principle of good administration	Government structures that enables empowerment of citizens, planning use that is guided by integrated development.

Source: Adapted from SPLUMA (2013)

Du Plessis (2016) finds that SPLUMA has no clear provision of sustainable development where citizens in the urban context are protected against unfair practices but rather has principles that talk to design and planning of sustainable cities. Schoeman (2015) highlights that SPLUMA is lacking and that planning models and laws are not integrated and aligned enough to deliver true spatial change but rather widen the exclusion, injustices and segregation on the ground. SPLUMA is viewed as lacking in its integrated development process for all but it is not clear if this is the case for all spatial developments or for only certain areas.

In order to ensure that municipal planning is co-ordinated and harmonious, Chapter 4 of the City of Tshwane Land Use Management By-law (2016), that deals with Land Use Schemes, states that any Land Use Scheme adopted by the municipality should comply with section 25 of SPLUMA as well as the municipal By-laws.

2.7 CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK

The discipline of planning has strong ethically based foundations. Planning in cities needs to support the economic growth of cities, while being sustainable and inclusive. These foundations form the basis of planning theory, legislation and policy. The data collected from the interviews conducted in this study will be assessed against a conceptual framework developed based on these foundations.

Many planners find planning theory not to be useful as they've learned planning through application and not through theories. And there is no consensus in academia of what constitutes planning theory and many planners go through their planning

education without gaining a clear understanding of what planning theory is (Friedmann, 2003). Regardless of this, there are planning concepts that guide planners in decision making which could be argued to constitute planning theory. These concepts will assist in analysis to try and assign meaning the findings of this study:

- Economic role of cities,
- Competitiveness of cities,
- Right to the city, and
- Spatial justice and transportation, and
- Planning legislation and policy.

Table 4: Conceptual Framework

Economic role of cities	Most successful countries institute policies that create uniform living standards because economic growth in cities can lead to inequality and exclusion (World Bank, 2009; and Marcuse, 2009).
	Planning policy seeks to improve the lives of the urban poor through spatial inclusion but companies are not always willing to invest in these initiatives as they are not profitable (Huchzermeyer, 2011).
	Cities rely on the investment of businesses to develop efficiency benefits, increased productivity, employment and competitiveness, they contribute critically to GDP growth in many countries. The heavy reliance on businesses by cities makes them vulnerable to making unfavourable concessions to businesses in order to achieve necessary economic growth.
Competitiveness of cities	Good quality of life in large cities attracts human capital who support growth and innovation (Carlino, 2005).
	In order to attract investment and tourism, cities market themselves through iconic projects, developing landmarks, and by providing a good quality of life to citizens (Turok, 2004; and Taylor, 2017).
	Cities have adopted a more entrepreneurial approach to planning in order to remain competitive (Olesen, 2014).
	Although the Global South is unique, they often try to follow Global North planning methods (Andersen, Jenkins, and Nielsen, 2015).

	Cities try to reduce regulation in the business sector so that they can appear attractive to investors.
Right to the city	Marginalised citizens living in South African cities have a right to the cities they are living in but they are often excluded from space (Huchzermeyer, 2011).
	Capitalism has played a crucial role in the successful development of many cities, while also creating fragmentation and poor quality of life for many city inhabitants (Baker, 2012).
	Urban planning alone, will not address all of the challenges faced by people living in cities, social capital is also crucial (Watson, 2009).
	Citizens living in cities should be given the opportunity to be represented politically, and in the management and administration of their cities (Dikec, 2001).
Spatial justice	Spatial remedies aimed at addressing spatial injustice need heal social scars carried by residents and it is not possible to achieve spatial justice in a capitalist system as the system of capitalism is unjust (Marcuse, 2009). The law should be applied to rectify spatial injustices.
	Currently, planning increases social exclusion by sweeping poor inhabitants to the peripheries, new approaches to planning need to be developed (Tibaijuka, 2006).
	Planning needs to address issues of quality of life, access to resources and green spaces, cultural and gender issues, employees' rights, and participation if it is to be socially sustainable (Bostrom et al, 2015).
Transportation	South Africa's transportation system is geared towards the car driving minority and not the 67% of urban households who rely on public transportation (StatsSA, 2014).
	South African planning has been aimed at improving land use and increasing access to sustainable transportation (Duffhues and Bertolini, 2016).
	Traffic accidents are one of the leading causes of traffic fatalities in South Africa. Urban forms should reduce the occurrences of traffic accidents (World Health Organisation, 2013).
	For public transportation to be considered an alternative to private cars, transport networks need to be integrated with land use (Curtis and Scheurer, 2017).

	Integrated transport and land use planning can assist with the achievement of equity of access, safety and efficiency (CitiesNetwork, 2014).
Transportation Global South	Planning in the Global South is car oriented and does not accommodate public transportation which has resulted in a road hierarchy that is not equitable (Cervero, 2013).
	Minibus taxis are the main mode of reliable and affordable transportation in African countries regardless of the fact that they can often be unsafe (Abuhamoud, Rahmat, and Ismail, 2011).
	Planning in silos and a lack of stakeholder inclusion has resulted in poor transportation quality and a lack of accountability by policy makers and civil society to citizens (Klopp and Makajuma, 2014; Kanyama, 2016).
	In China, public transportation integration in the development of roads brought about social cohesion and enhanced the experience of commuters (Taki, Maatouk, Qurnfulah and Aljoufie, 2017).
	In India, where travel choices are made by powerful and influential individuals, the planning of transportation systems do not accommodate the needs of the poor (Levy, 2013).
Transportation Global North	The collaboration of planners and engineers in the 1940s resulted in people without cars having unrestricted access to urban space in the United States of America (Balsas, 2015).
	In the Netherlands, planning in silos resulted in fragmented spatial planning (Heeres et al, 2017).
	In Europe, it was found that stakeholder inclusion and the right policies being implemented resulted in improvements in the integration of transportation and land use (Helming and Perez-Soba, 2011).
	In Italy, it was found that stakeholder and public engagement is key in transportation planning (Cascetta and Pagliara, 2012).
	In Japan, it was found that the most effective transportation strategies were stakeholder inclusive and considered efficiency, equity and the environment (Doi and Kii, 2012).
	A study in North America found that there has been a shift in transportation planning from cars and the safety of motorists to safe access to transportation for all road users (Manaugh, Badami and El-Geneidy, 2013).

Implementation	South African planning policies are integrated, democratic, strategic and sustainable but they fail to achieve these objectives in practice (Coetzee, 2012).
	SPLUMA encourages sustainable development but has no remedy available to provide citizens with protection against unfair planning practices (Du Plessis, 2016).
	Planning models and laws are not aligned enough to deliver true spatial change and have only widened exclusion and segregation (Schoeman, 2015).
Planning legislation and policy	The National Development Plan (2030), built on the principles of spatial justice, spatial sustainability, spatial resilience, spatial quality, and spatial efficiency, aims to unite South Africans and achieve an inclusive society and sustainable development.
	SPLUMA has five developmental principles that it aims to achieve: spatial justice, spatial sustainability, efficiency, spatial resilience and good administration.
	The City of Tshwane By-laws that deals with Land Use states that any Land Use Scheme adopted by the municipality needs to comply with SPLUMA as well as the municipal By-laws.

2.8 CONCLUSION

Africa is going through an informal industrial revolution, resulting in a boom in cities across the continent. This urbanisation is being funded by the private sector and urban planning is reacting to this revolution; but in meeting the needs of high-income households, the urban poor have become marginalised. For many, cities are seen as an escape for a better life, and urban employment is seen as a solution to reducing urban poverty. The ultimate goal of the right to the city movement is to provide all citizens with the opportunity to reap the benefits of their cities.

Since the end of Apartheid in South Africa, planning policy and legislation has been aimed at reducing poverty, sustainable development, creating inclusion and spatial justice. Regardless of this, it seems that unbalanced development is still taking place. Transportation plays a key role in ensuring accessibility to cities. South Africa's transportation system is geared towards accommodating wealthier car driving citizens, regardless of the fact that 67% of South African households rely on public

transportation to commute to school and work. Integrated transportation and land-use planning as well as stakeholder inclusion have been branded as the answer to the achievement of effective and efficient transportation in cities. South Africa's planning policies are considered to be integrated, democratic, strategic and sustainable, but are riddled with implementation failures.

CHAPTER 3 – RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODS

Menlyn Park Mall (MPM) has made adequate transportation infrastructure provisions for car drivers travelling to and from the mall, but have failed to do so for pedestrians using public transportation to access the mall. This phenomenological study aims to investigate spatial inequality in South African urban transportation systems by interrogating the lack of adequate provision of public transportation infrastructure at MPM. This chapter outlines the research methods used in this study. Due to the complexity of the research question, data in the form of interviews was collected and analysed in order to gain different insights that could be evaluated in reaching the final conclusions. This chapter outlines the research methods used in this study.

3.1 RESEARCH PARADIGM / PHILOSOPHY

A research paradigm describes a researcher's view of the world. There are five main research paradigms that a researcher can follow, namely: positivism, post-positivism, interpretivist, transformative and postcolonial. The researcher follows an interpretivist approach to answering the research question in this study. Interpretivism aims to understand the world as others experience it and involves qualitative research methods. This research paradigm believes that the truth is subjective and context specific and that reality is based on people's perspectives and their understanding of a given situation (Wagner, Kawulich and Garner, 2012).

This study aims to answer the research question by collecting data through observations and interviews in order to gain an understanding of the phenomenon being investigated. Given that the purpose of this study is to gain insight through understanding people's experiences, the author believes that an interpretivist approach will best assist in answering the research question. The author considers that there are multiple viewpoints regarding the topic and aims to answer the main research question by considering it from these multiple perspectives.

3.2 DESCRIPTION OF INQUIRY STRATEGY AND BROAD RESEARCH DESIGN

This study follows an interpretivist research paradigm, which involves qualitative research methods. There are four main research designs that can be used to collect qualitative data, namely: Ethnography, action research, grounded theory and phenomenology. The present study makes use of a phenomenological research design. Phenomenological studies attempt to understand situations by examining the lived experiences, perceptions and perspectives of people (Leedy and Ormrod, 2014).

The present study attempts to gain an understanding of the situation under investigation by conducting interviews with people in order to gain an understanding of their perceptions and perspectives (Wagner, Kawulich and Garner, 2012). This study makes use of primary data for analysis. Primary data is data that is collected specifically for the purpose of a specific research project. Primary data is not as easily accessible as secondary data as it has to be specifically collected for a specific project, but it is beneficial because it specifically addresses the research needs of the project. Its reliability is more verifiable than secondary data as it is collected specifically for a project in a process selected and administered or supervised by the researcher. Primary data is more time consuming to collect but it can assist in answering a research question more accurately.

Qualitative research can usually be categorised as being conducted for the following purposes (Leedy and Ormrod, 2014):

Descriptive – Research that describes the characteristics of a specific population;

Evaluative – Research that evaluates the impact or outcomes of an intervention;

Interpretative – Research that provides an understanding of a problem that needs to be studied more clearly; and

Verification – Research that attempts to test the validity of specific assumptions or theories.

The present study falls into the category of interpretive research as it aims to understand the reasons for a lack of accommodation of public transportation users regardless of policy existing on the inclusion of all spatial users. The study aims to

answer the research questions by formulating a conceptual framework for assessing and understanding the research problem.

3.3 SAMPLING

The sample of this study consists of the main stakeholders involved and affected by the lack of adequate public transportation infrastructure at MPM. The sample consists of the following:

- An interview with the Department of Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation; who are responsible for facilitating and supporting effective implementation of planning policy.
- An interview with the Department of Transportation; who are responsible for the expansion of road based public transportation and public transportation policies and legislation;
- An interview with the Tshwane municipality; who are responsible for ensuring the proper implementation of planning policy in developments in the Tshwane district;
- An interview with the Menlyn Taxi Association; the association responsible for the organisation of minibus taxis transporting public transportation users in and around the Menlyn area;
- An interview with Menlyn Park Mall; the developers of the space and the mall where the inadequate provision of public transportation infrastructure has occurred; and
- 100 Interviews with public transportation users entering and leaving MPM to gain insight into their experiences with regards to the efficiency of public transportation access in and around MPM.

3.4 DATA COLLECTION

Data was collected by way of structured interviews, observations and images of traffic, and document analysis; as is common with qualitative studies (Black, 2006), and phenomenological studies specifically which attempt to gain an understanding of a situation through the perceptions and perspectives of affected parties to a situation. All of the data was collected directly by the researcher to ensure consistency and quality.

Structured interview questions were compiled. The questions were pre-tested by going through a process of ethical clearance at the university to ensure understandability, clarity and ethical soundness. A different interview schedule was compiled for each of the Department of Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation, the Department of Transportation, the Tshwane Municipality, the Menlyn Taxi Association, Menlyn Park Mall and public transportation users entering and leaving MPM. The purpose of the interview was explained to each interviewee and informed consent of the interviewees was obtained and they were given the opportunity to refuse to be interviewed before an interview was conducted.

Interviews were held with the developers of the space (Menlyn Park Mall), and the departments in charge of planning policy development and implementation at a local and national level (Municipality of Tshwane, the Department of Transportation and the Department of Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation), and with the users of the space under investigation (public transportation users entering and leaving MPM).

The interview schedule for the public transportation users, along with longer structured interview questions, contained six items that were measured on a five-point likert scale (1 = strongly disagree, 5 = strongly agree) in line with Sponem and Lambert, 2016. The researcher conducted 100 public transportation user interviews. The researcher interviewed public transportation users until saturation had been reached. Saturation is a widely accepted qualitative research principle that states that interviews should be conducted until information redundancy is reached (the point at which no new data is apparent) (Saunders *et al*, 2017). Saturation was reached after 45 interviews, so the requirement of saturation was met.

The following questioning strategies were adopted during the formulation of interview questions:

- Questions were clear and neutral,
- Questions were concise and not too long,
- Interviews were kept as short as possible, and
- Clarifying questions were asked to the interviewees to ensure that the correct meaning was interpreted.

Direct observations of the area under investigation were conducted and images were captured by the researcher to provide insight and a description of the flow of public transportation traffic outside of MPM in an effort to gain an understanding of and to improve the interpretation of the problem under investigation. These observations also assisted with the formulation of the research problem and questions asked to interviewees. Observations provide the opportunity to give detailed descriptions of the space under investigation and aid in interpretation of results.

Document analysis consisted on a checklist that was collected from the City of Tshwane Municipality outlining the requirements that need to be complied with in order for developments to obtain planning approval and sign off. This document assisted in corroborating the interview results, thereby increasing their validity.

3.5 DATA ANALYSIS

The data collected by way of structured interviews was analysed as follows:

- The results from the interviews were recorded and captured.
- The results from the interviews with the Department of Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation, the Department of Transportation, the Tshwane Municipality, the Menlyn Taxi Association, and Menlyn Park Mall were then interpreted, discussed and common themes in people's experiences were identified and described.
- Descriptive statistics was compiled with the results of the likert scale questionnaire and the longer interview answers were grouped into common experiences with data collected from the public transportation user interviews.
- The findings of the interviews were assessed against planning ethics, theory, legislation and policy in order to assign meaning to the experiences of the interviewees and to formulate answers to the research questions.

The data collected by way of direct observations of the area under investigation and captured images were analysed as follows:

- The images were captured and recorded.

- The details observed under direct observation in the images were described and analysed in order to gain an understanding of the area under investigation and how people interact with the space.
- The findings of the observations and images were assessed against planning ethics, theory, legislation and policy in order to assign meaning to the observations.

The checklist collected from the City of Tshwane Municipality was analysed and used to corroborate the results from the interview with the Municipality of Tshwane.

3.6 ASSESSING AND DEMONSTRATING THE QUALITY AND RIGOUR THE PROPOSED RESEARCH DESIGN

Data was collected through structured interviews, direct observations and traffic images, and document analysis. A combination of data collection techniques were employed in order to triangulate the data and increase its reliability during analysis. Triangulation has been used extensively in qualitative research to improve the validity of the data collected.

Data was collected directly from MPM and pedestrians entering and leaving MPM, the environment where the problem was identified in order to ensure the data's trustworthiness. Data was also collected directly from the government departments that deal directly with planning decisions related to MPM. All of these measures were conducted to ensure that the data collected was as close to the natural environment as possible.

The researcher constantly verified his understanding of data being collected during the interview process by asking clarifying questions to interviewees.

3.7 RESEARCH ETHICS

This study makes use of interviews and includes human subjects. An application for ethical clearance had to be submitted to the School of Architecture and Planning for consideration.

This study involves the contribution of human participants, and as such approval to conduct interviews with the participants has been sought from the University of the Witwatersrand's Ethics Committee. Formal ethical clearance has been granted by the university to conduct the interviews, with approved participant information sheets and consent forms (see signed approval, consents forms and participant information sheets in Appendix 2).

Confidentiality of participants was kept in a password-protected document housed in a laptop under alias names so that no one would know the nature of the documents but the author. This was done to ensure the full confidentiality of participants.

All data collected from the study through interviews, observations and other documentation was used for research purposes only. To show respect to MPM users, permission was sought from the MPM/CoT before visiting and taking photographs. All the protocols were followed, such as requests for participation and participation information sheets (Refer to Appendix 1 and 2).

CHAPTER 4 – FINDINGS

This phenomenological study took an interpretivist approach to answering the research question. Menlyn Park Mall (MPM) has failed to provide adequate public transportation infrastructure for public transportation users entering and leaving the mall. This study acts as a case for spatial inequality in South African transportation systems. This chapter presents the findings of the study.

4.1 INSIGHTS FROM THE MENLYN PARK MALL SURROUNDING AREA

Figure 1: Context map of Menlyn Park Mall



Source: ArcMap GIS

MPM, the largest mall in Africa, is situated at the corner of a busy main road, Atterbury road (Highlighted in Yellow), and a busy side road, Lois Avenue (Highlighted in red). Pedestrians entering and leaving MPM have to cross one or both of these roads in order to gain access to the mall (Refer to Figure 1).

Figure 2: Atterbury Road outside of Menlyn Park Mall



Figure 2 shows minibus taxis dropping off and picking up pedestrians on Atterbury road outside MPM. It is common to see Minibus taxis parked outside of the mall on both sides of Atterbury road. Pedestrians can be seen crossing the road, while exiting the mall and an informal recycler can be seen walking along the road, past a minibus taxi. There is no pedestrian crossing to cross the road and the only pedestrian drop-off zone for public transportation to drop pedestrians off is a bus stop across the mall; so pedestrians need to cross the road to gain access to the mall from the bus stop. Minibus taxis drop pedestrians off on the side of the road and pedestrians enter the mall on foot. Minibus taxis also park on the side of the road and wait for public transportation users to fill up the taxis before leaving to drop off these travellers to their next destination.

Figure 3: Atterbury road and Lois Avenue intersection



The intersection of Atterbury road and Lois Avenue is a major source of congestion (Refer to Figure 3). Cars often have to contend with multiple Minibus taxis turning onto Lois Avenue at the same time in a rush to drop off and collect passengers. The traffic lights do assist in managing the traffic but the minibus taxis parked on the sides of the road or stopping to drop off and pick up pedestrians cause major congestion. There is also some road works taking place on the road, adding to the congestion.

Figure 4: Lois Avenue outside of Menlyn Park Mall



Figure 4 shows Lois Avenue near the Atterbury road intersection. Minibus taxis are parked on the sides of the road waiting to transport pedestrians leaving the mall. The road is scattered with litter. Lois Avenue is the worst affected by the congestion, making driving through the road during peak hours very difficult and crossing the road unsafe.

Figures 2, 3 and 4 show the extent of the spatial problems caused by not having adequate infrastructure to accommodate public transportation and pedestrians in and around MPM. The reliance of cities on the investment of businesses to drive development and improve competitiveness makes them vulnerable to making unfavourable concessions for the people living in these cities in favour of economic growth. Public transportation users do not pay a fare to the mall for parking so it is not in the mall's interest to accommodate them in the same way that the mall would do for car driving visitors paying for parking. This is an example of where capitalism, while it

has played a crucial role in the development of the city, creates fragmentation (Baker, 2012).

South African transportation networks are geared towards car drivers (StatsSA, 2014), it is evident from the exclusion of pedestrians from the grounds of the mall that this trend extends to private systems as well. It has become the norm in South African cities to exclude the urban poor in this way but it is important to note that pedestrians who have been excluded in this way, also have the right to the use of the mall and its surrounding roads as much as the car driving citizens, and their exclusion from the safe use of this space is an infringement of this right (Huchzermeyer, 2011).

Figure 5: Lois Avenue outside of Menlyn Park Mall



A car can be seen dropping off a pedestrian outside MPM. Because of the inadequate public transportation infrastructure, cars often stop in the road to drop off and pick up pedestrians even if cars coming from behind have to stop as well or drive around them.

According to the World Health Organisation (2013), urban forms should reduce the chances of accidents, it is evident by the dropping off of a pedestrian in the middle of the road in Figure 5 and the fact that 28% of pedestrians interviewed have witnessed or been involved in an accident outside MPM that the chances of car accidents is increased as a result of the lack of adequate public transportation infrastructure. The fact that MPM was able to provide 8250 parking bays for car driving visitors of the mall and such inadequate infrastructure for pedestrians supports the views of Cervero (2013), that the Global South is car orientated and lacks an equitable road hierarchy. It is not equitable to not accommodate a large portion of the visitors to the mall, it is a spatial exclusion.

4.2 INSIGHTS FROM MENLYN PARK MALL

An interview was conducted with a respondent from Menlyn Park Mall, the case for spatial inequality in this study. A summary of the interview and a discussion of the results are presented below.

According to the respondent, since the upgrade of MPM, the mall has had an increase in the number of customers coming to the mall. There are currently an average of R1.4 million people visiting the mall on a monthly basis. The respondent states that the development department was responsible for dealing with and obtaining the necessary approvals for the redevelopment from the city of Tshwane and he was not part of that process but that the mall has met all of the requirements set out by the Tshwane Municipality in order to trade and the mall is in possession of a certificate of conformity and an occupancy certificate. The mall submits the necessary drawings and documentation to the municipality every time a new tenant enters the mall and makes sure that the necessary zoning certificates are obtained. The respondent did state that he was not part of the planning and development team involved in the redevelopment of the mall so he cannot comment on whether or not the mall met all of the planning requirements or what those requirements were. He advised the interviewer to contact Head Office, Head Office refused schedule an interview.

When asked if MPM was aware of traffic congestion outside the mall, the respondent stated that MPM was aware of the congestion. The respondent explained that the problem was caused by minibus taxis that park on Lois Avenue and Atterbury road. He stated that the minibus taxi's use the bus stop as parking and they occupy the road, leaving only one lane open for passing cars which causes the congestion. MPM does not seem to see themselves as having contributed to the congestion problem. Stating that the problem is caused by minibus taxis parking outside the mall, taxis park there in order to transport customers and employees of the mall and it is not an indication that the mall is failing to consider that the minibus taxis park there out of necessity and because they have not been provided with a practical alternative drop-off area. The same problem has been observed in India where travel choices are made by influential people who do not accommodate the needs of the urban poor (Levy, 2013). Only the more well off car driving customers and employees of the mall have been

accommodated, pedestrians have been excluded. For a mall that has 1.4 million people visiting it every month, this oversight seems like a deliberate exclusion of the urban poor.

The respondent stated that the mall has plans to build a taxi drop-off zone and a pedestrian bridge so that pedestrians can enter the mall safely and to deal with congestion. The fact that the mall sees the need to build a taxi drop-off zone for pedestrians seems like an admission by the mall that they are responsible for providing pedestrians with a safe entrance and exit from the mall, but the fact that they are only thinking of doing it after the entire expansion project has already been concluded indicates that the mall did not feel that this was important to do from the onset or they may feel that it is the municipality's responsibility to provide these facilities. When asked about how the mall provides for pedestrians, he stated that the mall holds meetings with the Mamelodi Amalgamated Taxi Association as well as the Menlyn Taxi Association to ensure that they accommodate employees of the mall working late especially during the festive season when the mall holds trading hours of up to 22:00.

When asked if the mall had ever been approached by public transportation organisations to be accommodated on the grounds of the mall, the respondent explained that they had and the mall has previously provided an area of parking for public transportation users on the grounds of the mall, giving taxi drivers access cards to allow them onto the grounds without paying. He says that the mall eventually decided to kick the minibus taxis out of the mall due to littering and using the drop-off area as a bathroom area as the mall had not provided toilets for the drivers near the area. Even their attempt to accommodate the minibus taxis on the premises was not met with adequate facilities to provide pedestrians with a safe, efficient and effective public transportation area. The mall takes on the responsibility of keeping all areas clean but they were not willing to do that in this public transportation area. It appears, by their actions, that MPM does not see the provision of a pedestrian drop off area for the pedestrians as either their responsibility or their priority.

4.3 INSIGHTS FROM PEDIESTIRIAN EXPERIENCES

100 interviews were conducted with public transportation users entering and leaving MPM on Lois Ave and on Atterbury road to gain an understanding of their experiences. The results of the interviews as well as a discussion are recorded below.

Table 5: Interviewee demographics

Race	Black	96%
	White	3%
	Coloured	1%
Gender	Male	51%
	Female	49%
Age group	18 – 19	8%
	20 – 29	44%
	30 – 39	29%
	40 – 49	13%
	50 – 59	4%
	60 +	2%
Work at MPM	Yes	31%
	No	69%

96% of the interview respondents were black, and there was an almost equal distribution of male and female respondents. 73% of the interviewees fell into the age group 20 – 39 years of age and 31% of the sample of pedestrians interviewed work at MPM (Refer to Table 4).

Table 6: Results of Likert scale questionnaire

I am concerned about my safety when entering MPM.	Strongly disagree	21%
	Disagree	13%
	Neutral	17%
	Agree	11%
	Strongly agree	38%
I am concerned about my safety when leaving MPM.	Strongly disagree	21%
	Disagree	12%
	Neutral	18%
	Agree	15%

	Strongly agree	34%
I want access to a safe entrance when entering /leaving MPM.	Strongly disagree	8%
	Disagree	7%
	Neutral	15%
	Agree	20%
	Strongly agree	47%
MPM can do better for safer access into the mall for pedestrians.	Strongly disagree	4%
	Disagree	12%
	Neutral	14%
	Agree	23%
	Strongly agree	46%
Public transport infrastructure is easily accessible when entering/leaving the mall.	Strongly disagree	4%
	Disagree	2%
	Neutral	8%
	Agree	16%
	Strongly agree	70%
There is a need for better access to public transport.	Strongly disagree	8%
	Disagree	6%
	Neutral	8%
	Agree	20%
	Strongly agree	58%

As seen in Table 5, 49% of all interviewees agreed that they were concerned about their safety when entering and leaving MPM. While 67% of interviewees agreed that they would like access to a safe entrance when entering or leaving MPM, 69% agreeing that MPM could do better to provide them with safer access to the mall. 86% of interviewees agreed that the mall was easily accessible for them, however 78% of interviewees agreed that there is a need for better access to public transportation at the mall. Overall, the majority of public transportation users interviewed felt that they were concerned about their safety when entering and leaving the mall and they agreed that there was a need for safer access to the mall.

The main reason for coming to the mall for most of the interview respondents was shopping. 70% of interviewees indicated that they were concerned about their safety during peak hours because of the traffic congestion outside of the mall. 64% of the interview respondents had other malls that they frequent that either had a pedestrian

drop off zone or adequate public transportation infrastructure. 71% of respondents stated that they would like to have public transportation infrastructure on the grounds of MPM as it would be more convenient for them and they would have safer access to the mall, while 29% felt that they would not like that as they feel that it would probably just cause congestion inside the mall and they were happy to leave things as they were currently. When asked if they had ever had any safety incidents outside the grounds of MPM, 72% of the respondents said no, and 28% said that they had either witnessed or been involved in a car accident outside the mall, and one person stated that they had witnessed a theft outside the grounds of the mall. It is evident that there is a lack of integration of public transportation with land use at MPM resulting in poor access to the mall, unsafe conditions and a system that is not as efficient as it should be. In China, it was found that integrating public transportation with land use resulted in social cohesion and a better experience for commuters (Taki et al, 2017); it does seem that integrating public transportation into the infrastructure of MPM would result in better experiences for the pedestrians at MPM, better equity of access to the space, safer access to the mall, and greater efficiency (CitiesNetwork, 2014).

It is important to make sure that spatial justice is achieved through spatial remedies if people are to heal from past spatial exclusions (Marcuse, 2009). In South Africa where the previously disadvantaged African majority are the ones most affected by the spatial exclusions at MPM, exclusions like the one experienced by pedestrians at MPM makes it difficult for Africans to move on from the injustices of Apartheid and to feel included in society as equal members. Sweeping poor inhabitants to the peripheries, while it is common practice, should not be accepted. Integration of land use and transportation in the Global North was achieved as a result of stakeholder inclusive planning strategies (Helming and Perez-Soba, 2011; Cascetta and Pagliara, 2012; and Doi and Kii, 2012). It is imperative that the urban citizens being excluded are represented and included in the spatial planning of the spaces that affect them.

4.4 INSIGHTS FROM THE DEPARTMENT OF PLANNING, MONITORING AND EVALUATION

An interview was conducted with the Department of Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation. This government department is responsible for supporting and facilitating

the implementation of planning policy in South Africa. A summary of the interview as well as a discussion is recorded below.

According to the respondent, the department is responsible for assessing draft 5-year strategic plans submitted by government departments for legal compliance and compliance with the Medium Term Strategic Framework (MTSF). The department is also responsible for the annual budget prioritization framework that the budget is aligned with the overall objectives of the National Development Plan (NDP) and the MTSF. The respondent is responsible for ensuring that there is a link between the overall planning system and the Spatial Planning and Land Use Management Act (SPLUMA).

The respondent notes that there are many non-spatial elements that drive spatial decisions at a micro level. For example, there are many public schools sitting empty in Soweto because many parents perceive the area to be unsafe and of a poor quality so they spend already scarce financial resources paying for their children to use public transportation to attend schools in areas that are perceived to be safer and of a better quality. Although this is a planning problem, it is not necessarily something that planners can take the blame for.

The respondent states that South Africa has a problem of spatial inequality as a result of Apartheid spatial planning. She states that the urban poor are located far away from opportunities resulting in them travelling very far to and from work and they spend a disproportionate amount of their earnings on transportation making it difficult to maintain a better standard of living than would be achieved if they lived closer to work, because of this it is important that the principles of SPLUMA are applied to achieve better efficiency and better social infrastructure.

The respondent stated that it is difficult to get all of society to buy into spatial transformation because of competing interests. There is significant under investment in densely populated areas in South Africa, usually the poorer areas. These issues are caused by class issues and capitalism. The respondent suggests that spatial transformation has not been achieved in South Africa and while SPLUMA is still a work-in-progress act, the reason that there is still such high spatial fragmentation in

South Africa is because of poor management in government and a lack of trust between groups that should be working together, making processes that should run smoothly take over-long.

The respondent stated that the department works with municipalities on budget and planning alignment issues. They also give input on SPLUMA implementation. She states that there are many internal contradictions and competition between SPLUMA and the Infrastructure Act as well as the Municipal systems Act which need to be resolved. SPLUMA has resolved the spatial planning and spatial framework weaknesses of municipal regulations and clarified areas that were not clear.

The respondent feels that there is a lot of internal contradiction within SPLUMA and if you co-read SPLUMA with other acts you can sometimes find contradicting mandates; but she also states that in many ways SPLUMA picks up on weaknesses in spatial planning and spatial frameworks in municipal regulations and strengthens them. She states that there is a need for a more consolidated national government that is able to mediate conflict across mandates so that they can support municipalities to live up to their mandates. The respondent states that municipalities have been given the public transport mandate but in many instances they do not have the capacity to carry out this mandate and that municipalities need support. SPLUMA encourages sustainable and equitable development (Du Plessis, 2016), but it does not provide remedies to people who suffer from unfair spatial practices so there is no way to hold developers accountable for not upholding the act (Coetzee, 2012).

When asked about the lack of adequate public transportation infrastructure in the minibus taxi industry the respondent stated that establishing a functional transportation system is extremely expensive and that while the bus industry in South Africa is floundering, the taxi industry has managed to come up with a system that works. One of the major challenges facing the minibus taxi industry however is a lack of formalisation and regulation. Some of the reasons why the industry is so effective though is that they have managed to keep costs low, not pay taxes, they have low safety standards, and taxis do not have a requirement for how often they should be serviced. Although formalising and regulating the minibus taxi industry would probably result in an increase in integrated public transportation infrastructure, it would probably

also result in an increase in taxi fare prices and possible taxation of minibus taxi fares, but it would also probably result in higher safety standards in the industry. While integrated transportation and land use planning results in equitable access to transportation networks, safer transportation for commuters and greater efficiency (CitiesNetwork, 2017); it is also more expensive to achieve and the users of public transportation in South Africa cannot afford to bare these costs so there is a lot of interest in maintaining the informality of the minibus taxi industry. It may be more of a viable option if government were to subsidise the minibus taxi industry, which could only happen if the industry was regulated and formalised.

When asked about the priority of minibus taxi infrastructure when compared to the Bus Rapid Transport (BRT) System the respondent stated that she feels that the City of Tshwane was maybe too hasty in implementing the BRT system as there is not enough density in the city to justify the system and there are busses driving empty. She is not a fan of the BRT system and thinks that National Treasury might not be either. They are building these dense corridors and they are not focused on creating transit oriented development which would be beneficial, so they could be using the money differently.

4.5 INSIGHTS FROM THE DEPARTMENT OF TRANSPORTATION

An interview was conducted with the department of transportation, who are responsible for public transportation policies and legislation formulation and implementation. The representative interviewed decided to provide typed out answers to the interview questions before the meeting occurred and the interview meeting was used to discuss the responses provided. The results of the interview and a discussion is recorded below.

The respondent explained that the department is responsible for the development of legislation, policy and strategies that drive development in the transportation sector. Chapter 4 of the National Land Transport Act 5 of 2009 states that land transport planning must be integrated with land development and that land development must be integrated with land use planning. The integrated transportation plans required by this act are designed to inform municipal planning. The department's strategic goals are to ensure an efficient and integrated transport infrastructure network that:

- promotes social and economic development,
- ensures a safe and secure transport sector,
- improve rural access to transportation,
- improves public transportation systems, and
- creates employment.

The respondent stated that the Department of Transportation does not deal directly with municipalities, but they are responsible for the development of the National Land Transport Strategic Framework (NLTSF) which serves as a framework for municipal transportation planning.

On SPLUMA, the respondent states that while it is an important act that guides legislation and policy, SPLUMA promotes integration in planning while providing no clear guide on how to achieve such integration. A view supported by Coetzee (2012), who found that while South African planning policies are integrated, democratic, and sustainable on paper, they do not achieve these objectives when put into practice. She further stated that the provisions of SPLUMA alone are not sufficient to ensure integrated transportation and land use. She states that there is currently a

misalignment of objectives between Spatial Development Frameworks and Integrated Transport Plans (ITP) which makes effective planning and subsequently effective implementation difficult. Schoeman (2015) supports this view and states that planning models and laws in South Africa are not aligned enough and they have only managed to widen spatial exclusion and segregation.

The respondent states that SPLUMA is an important act in addressing apartheid spatial planning. One of the key issues that need to be addressed is the distances that some people need to travel to gain access to economic and social services and opportunities. This problem can only be addressed by rectifying the relationship between land use and transportation in our society. There is, however, no piece of legislation that provides clear processes for how this integration of land use and transportation should occur.

As with the respondent for the Department of Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation; the respondent from the Department of Transportation feels that the largest challenges facing the minibus taxi industry is a lack of integrated public transportation systems, formalisation, and regulation of the taxi industry. Integrated public systems are important as they bring about social cohesion and enhance commuters' experiences (Taki et al, 2017). She suggests that government should consider developing a discussion paper on the formalisation of the taxi industry in the pursuance of a mutually beneficial formalisation of the industry. The respondent stated that South African cities are developing and implementing integrated transport networks, existing bus and minibus taxi operations need to be better integrated into the networks. When asked if there was a chance of the department ever considering minibus taxis in future infrastructure planning the respondent stated that planning for the inclusion of all modes of transport was important to the department and that planning for minibus taxi infrastructure needs to form part of municipal ITPs.

4.6 INSIGHTS FROM THE TSHWANE MUNICIPALITY

An interview was conducted with a respondent from the Tshwane Municipality, the municipality that forms the local government of Northern Gauteng. The interview and a discussion of the findings are recorded below.

The respondent from the municipality stated that the municipality had introduced the Bus Rapid Transport (BRT) network and more walkable sidewalks in an effort to move away from car oriented development and move towards transport oriented development. The respondent even stated that National Treasury has said that they are so happy with the integration achieved by the BRT that they want to implement the model in other cities. National Treasury have however stated that the BRT system covers a short area (8 km) is too expensive for commuters and they have urged the city to bring down the cost for commuters. The BRT system received criticism from the respondent from the Department of Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation for not being transit orientated enough, resulting in busses driving empty. So a system that is viewed with pride by the municipality is viewed totally differently by the department of Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation.

The respondent stated that the municipality does not have traffic requirements for malls, only that they have enough parking bays to reduce traffic and congestion. The city of Tshwane municipality only has guidelines but the City of Cape Town municipality has a policy.

The representative provided the researcher with the checklist that needs to be met when submitting a rezoning application, the following SPLUMA principles need to be met and ticked off on a checklist:

- Principle of Spatial Justice,
- Principle of Spatial Sustainability,
- Principle of Efficiency,
- Principle of Spatial Resilience, and
- Principle of Good Administration.

SPLUMA is used to provide the municipality with broad guidelines, and is used in decision making. The municipality applies the principles of SPLUMA by requiring SPLUMA principles to be met and ticked off on a checklist that they use to assess each application. Chapter 4 of the City of Tshwane Land Use Management by-laws (2016) states that Land Use Schemes adopted by the municipality must comply with SPLUMA, but because SPLUMA is not prescriptive. If a company misses a specific requirement, the application is not processed further. The municipality feels that that they have made good strides in the achievement of sustainability and integration but they do struggle with integration in certain areas of Pretoria where citizens challenge their development initiatives by taking the municipality to court.

The representative of the municipality felt that because SPLUMA is not prescriptive and instead has guiding principles and leaves implementation up to the judgement of users, this leaves the act open to manipulation from role players who have their own agendas that are not necessarily in line with that of the best interest of the majority of citizens. A view shared by Du Plessis (2016), who states that SPLUMA does not offer any remedies against unfair planning practices. A solution to this might be to use the law to rectify spatial injustice (Marcuse, 2009).

When asked if the municipality was aware of traffic congestion caused by minibus taxis at MPM, the respondent stated that the municipality is aware of the problem and they do have a plan to resolve the issue. The respondent stated that plans had been approved to have public transportation infrastructure built, alongside an extension of the BRT system to the Menlyn area, the infrastructure will be connected to the BRT system and it will hold 100 minibus taxis. The infrastructure has already been approved to be built by the municipality.

4.7 INSIGHTS FROM THE TRANSPORTATION INDUSTRY

An interview was conducted with a respondent from the Menlyn Taxi Association, the association in charge of the minibus taxis transporting passengers in the Menlyn and surrounding areas. A summary of the interview as well as a discussion is recorded below.

A 2015 study conducted by the Menlyn Taxi association and the City of Tshwane indicated that the association transports 45 000 passengers per day. The Menlyn Taxi Association considers it a priority to be on the grounds of MPM as they acknowledge that commuters are not safe crossing Atterbury road and Lois Avenue and pedestrians have been struck by on-coming traffic on numerous occasions.

When asked if the association would consider renting a space from MPM where they can establish a taxi rank, the association said that they would consider doing that but they would need to consider the cost as Minibus taxis fares are not subsidised like other modes of public transportation in South Africa. The association is aware of the traffic congestion that their Minibus taxis are causing but they do not have any other space that they could occupy as an alternative. The association has been operating in the Menlyn area since the 1980s but as the area developed, Minibus taxis were never integrated into the development and have been continued to be treated like outsiders by the private sector and by the City of Tshwane. This goes against the principles of Right to the City movement that states that the urban poor should not be marginalised, the Minibus taxis transport the urban poor to and from work and around the city yet they have not been clearly accommodated regardless of them having been transporting commuters around the Menlyn area from the 1980s.

The Menlyn Taxi Association feel that the role they play is undervalued, they transport over 45 000 commuters per day, they transport employees of the mall late at night when other forms of transportation are closed for business, and they create employment for over 600 citizens. Yet instead of working with them, they feel that the city seeks to replace them with the new BRT network, while the city says that they have plans to integrate them into the BRT system so it seems that there is a lack of communication between the parties. There are examples in the Global North as well

as the Global South – in China, United States of America, and Europe – where public transportation integration with land use, collaboration and stakeholder inclusion has resulted in social cohesion, better commuter experiences, unrestricted access to urban spaces, and integrated transportation systems (Taki et al, 2017; Balsas, 2015; and Helming, and Perez-Soba, 2011). It seems that the only way to resolve the issues created by the lack of adequate public transportation infrastructure in and around MPM would be through collaboration, stakeholder inclusion, and for better integration of public transportation with land use.

4.8 CONCLUSION

The inadequate provision of public transportation infrastructure at MPM has resulted in traffic congestion and an unsafe entrance and exit from the mall for pedestrians. The majority of pedestrians are concerned about their safety when entering and leaving the mall. This constitutes as a spatial exclusion and can be partly attributed to the fact that South African transport systems are car oriented, and a lack of regulation and formalisation of the minibus taxi industry. South African planning policy promotes integrated land use and transportation planning but does not advise on how this should be achieved resulting in implementation failures.

CHAPTER 5 – DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSION

Urban transportation systems in South Africa are plagued with spatial inequality, a legacy from Apartheid spatial planning. MPM, the largest mall in Africa, has 16 entrances and 8250 parking bays (Nkosi, 2016), yet fails to adequately accommodate public transportation users who are dropped off and collected on two busy main roads when entering and leaving the mall. Both roads are busy and filled with buses, taxis and private vehicles dropping off workers and customers near the mall's entrances and there have been reported incidents of pedestrians being struck by oncoming traffic when entering and leaving MPM. The majority of the commuting workforce in South Africa are public transportation users and MPM has an average of 1.4 million visitors monthly yet they have failed to accommodate a very large proportion of the population visiting the mall.

Purcell (2002) asked the question of how to merge the interests of different groups when it comes to right to the city and how right to the city can play a role in building a democratic society. All citizens in a city are equal but how do you merge their interests and ensure that inclusion and equality is taking place? Gentrification in cities has led in the urban poor being pushed out of cities because cities have become expensive to live in, but these same people then have to travel back to the cities in order to find employment.

Dikeç (2001) states that equal distribution of access does not take place in cities and that spatial justice encompasses social injustice. Schoeman (2015) argues that the lack of integration in current planning policy widens exclusion, injustices and segregation instead of achieving spatial change. This phenomenological study collected data by way of structured interviews, observations and images of traffic, and document analysis in order to answer the research questions.

5.1 DISCUSSION OF FINDINGS ASSESSED AGAINST CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK

Capitalism has played a crucial role in the development of many cities, while also creating spatial exclusion (Baker, 2012). In South African cities, the urban poor are marginalised and excluded from space even though all inhabitants should have access to public urban spaces (Huchzermeyer, 2011). Urban planning alone is not able to address the challenges faced by marginalised city inhabitants, all citizens living in cities need to be politically represented in order to achieve change (Dikec, 2001; Watson, 2009). Spatial remedies aimed at rectifying spatial exclusion do not only need to achieve spatial cohesion, but they need to heal the scars of marginalised inhabitants (Marcuse, 2009). In order to be effective, planning needs to create a better quality of life and social cohesion for all city inhabitants (Bostrom et al, 2014).

South African transportation systems are geared towards car drivers regardless of the fact that 67% of urban inhabitants rely on public transportation (StatsSA, 2014). Although urban forms need to reduce the occurrence of traffic accidents, traffic accidents are still one of the leading causes of deaths on South African roads (World Health Organisation, 2013). Integration of transportation and land use in planning has been found to achieve equity of access for all inhabitants, higher levels of safety and efficiency in transportation networks in cities (Cities Network, 2014). It is clear from the traffic images in Chapter 4 that the lack of appropriate public transportation infrastructure outside MPM has resulted in congestion and unsafe traffic conditions. The fact that the mall saw it fit to provide 8250 car spaces and only 4 public transportation stops when they have an average of 1.4 million people visiting the mall on a monthly basis indicates a clear spatial exclusion. Even more concerning is that out of the pedestrians interviewed (96% of the respondents were black), 49% of them were concerned about their safety when entering and leaving MPM and 26% stated that they had either witnessed or been involved in a traffic accident outside the ground of the mall. In a country like South Africa, with a fairly young democracy, this spatial exclusion seems to perpetuate apartheid legacy planning.

There is constant conflict between the goals of planning policy and capitalism in cities. While planning policy seeks to improve the quality of the lives of all urban inhabitants,

companies are not always willing to buy into these policies as they are almost always unprofitable, and cities in developing countries are usually very highly reliant on companies to achieve competitiveness and economic growth (Huchzermeyer, 2011). The achievement of economic growth often results in the spatial exclusion of the urban poor (Marcuse, 2009). MPM, being owned by a large institutional investor, holds power as they have funded the development of the mall and have created many jobs, stimulated the economy and achieved competitiveness for the city. Car driving customers pay for parking, which is a large source of income for the mall, while creating public transportation infrastructure for pedestrians is a non-income generating exercise. The mall's attitude towards public transportation users is reflected in the respondent from MPM stating that the mall holds meetings with the Mamelodi Amalgamated Taxi Association as well as the Menlyn Taxi Association during the festive season, when the mall's trading hours run very late, to ensure that they accommodate employees of the mall as they finish working at 22h00. They do not, however, engage the taxi associations on matters involving the lack of effective public transportation infrastructure. MPM was initially built in 1979, and over 40 years later they still have not been able to address this problem.

Cities that provide a good quality of life for their inhabitants are able to attract the necessary human capital to achieve economic growth through investment and tourism (Turok, 2004; Carlino, 2005; Taylor, 2017). The need to be competitive and attract the best resources encourages cities to be entrepreneurial resulting in the reduction of regulation by government in order to attract investors (Olesen, 2014). The respondent from the City of Tshwane stated that the municipality's only transportation requirement for the mall was that they build enough parking bays to reduce traffic and congestion; and they did not place a requirement for the mall to create public transportation infrastructure.

Transportation planning in the global south is typically car oriented which has resulted in a road hierarchy that is inequitable (Cervero, 2013). Planning in silo and a lack of stakeholder inclusion in African countries has resulted in poor transportation quality (Kanyama, 2016; Klopp and Makajuma, 2014), similar findings were observed in India where transportation planning favours powerful and influential inhabitants (Levy, 2013). Transportation systems in South Africa are car oriented, regardless of the fact

that the majority of South Africans use public transportation travel to and from work and school. The Tshwane Municipality has introduced the Bus Rapid Transport (BRT) Network in an effort to integrate transportation with land use. Although they feel that they have been successful in achieving integration, the respondent from the Department of Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation felt that the cost of the network is too expensive and its implementation has not been successful as busses are running empty because the city is not densely populated enough to justify such a system.

A reason why minibus taxis work well in the South African economy is because they are cheap, but they have low safety standards, and a lack of formalisation of the industry means a lack of integrated public transportation infrastructure to support the industry. This results in situations like the one experienced at MPM. Although formalisation and regulation of the minibus taxi industry would likely result in an increase in the integration of transportation infrastructure with land use and higher safety standards thereby reducing traffic fatalities on South African roads, it would also result in an increase in taxi fare prices which the users of public transportation would not be able to afford. Formalisation of the industry would likely only work if government were to subsidise the industry.

The Menlyn Taxi Association stated that while they have been operating in the Menlyn area since the 1980s, the minibus taxi industry is not subsidised like other modes of transportation, they have never been integrated into development and they have been treated like outsiders by the municipality. Instead of working with them, the city seeks to replace them with the BRT Network. In China, the integration of public transportation in the development of roads resulted in improved commuter experience and social cohesion (Taki, Maatouk, Qurnfulah and Aljoufie, 2017). In the United States of America, the Netherlands, Japan and Italy, collaboration between planners and engineers, stakeholder inclusion, and public engagement has resulted in the integration of transportation and land use and unrestricted access to urban spaces for all citizens (Helming and Perez-Soba, 2011; Cascetta and Pagliara, 2012; Doi and Kii, 2012; Balsas, 2015). South African planning models have gained the reputation of being integrated, democratic and sustainable; yet they fail in implementation and only seem to widen spatial exclusion (Coetzee, 2012; Schoeman, 2015).

5.2 CONCLUSIONS BASED ON RESEARCH QUESTIONS

SUB-RESEARCH QUESTIONS

The purpose of this study was to investigate spatial inequality in South African urban transportation systems by investigating the inadequate provision of public transportation infrastructure at MPM, how this deficiency affects pedestrians entering and leaving the mall and to assess planning policy, theory, values and ethics to assess how they provide for integration between transportation and land use in development, and how these policies translate to implementation; by answering the following questions:

What social and spatial problems have been caused by a lack of adequate public transportation infrastructure in and around MPM and who are the stakeholders affected by these inadequacies?

The lack of adequate public transportation infrastructure in and around MPM has caused congestion around the mall and increased the chances of car accidents occurring around the mall as pedestrians need to walk across the street in order to access public transportation, there are people being dropped off in the street, and there are cars parked everywhere along the road also causing less visibility. 49% of pedestrians interviewed agreed that they were concerned about their safety when entering and leaving the mall and 28% of the respondents stated that they had witnessed or been involved in a car accident involving a pedestrian on the roads surrounding the mall. The public transportation are users unable to use the space effectively and safely and they have been spatially excluded.

What are the reasons for the inadequate provision of public transportation infrastructure in and around MPM and can we classify the lack of adequate public transportation infrastructure in and around MPM as spatial exclusion?

The lack of regulation and formalisation of the minibus taxi industry acts as a barrier to the access of adequate public transportation infrastructure for users of minibus taxis on South African roads. Another reason for the inadequate provision of public

transportation infrastructure is that transportation planning in South African cities is car oriented and not transport orientated. Regardless of the lack of formalisation and regulation of the minibus taxi industry, the fact that 65% of the commuting daily public of South Africa make use of minibus taxis as transportation and there is inadequate infrastructure to support the minibus taxi industry does constitute a spatial exclusion that continues the legacy of Apartheid spatial planning.

From a policy perspective, what were the municipality of Tshwane's planning requirements regarding integration of land use with transportation and has MPM met all of their requirements?

The only traffic requirement that the city of Tshwane Municipality had for MPM was to increase the number of parking bays in order to reduce traffic congestion. MPM did comply with this requirement.

SPLUMA has been branded the solution to the inadequacies of planning policy. Is SPLUMA, and other planning policy, in its current state able to address the challenges caused by inadequate public transportation infrastructure through implementation?

Municipalities consult with SPLUMA in the in the development of their framework for transportation planning, and SPLUMA promotes integrated land use and transportation planning while providing no guide about how to achieve this integration, so while the promotion of this integration exists, municipalities are not empowered to implement this as they have no guide on how to achieve it. Another challenge facing planning policy is internal contradictions within SPLUMA and planning models not being aligned enough therefore widening spatial exclusion.

MAIN RESEARCH QUESTION

Planning policy in South Africa is lacking and planning models and laws have failed to eliminate spatial exclusion. MPM recently completed an expansion project that saw it become the largest mall in Africa. The pedestrians entering and leaving MPM have to cross two busy main roads in order to access the mall. During the expansion project, MPM increased their parking bays to 8250 for car driving customers. Regardless of this, public transportation users have not been provided with adequate infrastructure to enter and leave the mall safely. Using MPM as a case for spatial inequality in South African urban transportation systems, what are the reasons for the lack of adequate provision of public transportation infrastructure in and around MPM?

There is a clear lack of public transportation infrastructure in and around MPM and the majority of pedestrians interviewed do not feel safe entering and leaving the mall. South African spatial planning is car oriented and not transport oriented, lacking inclusivity.

The lack of regulation and formalisation of the minibus taxi industry acts as a barrier to access adequate public transportation infrastructure and causes spatial exclusion. Another challenge is a lack of alignment in planning models and internal contradictions within planning policy.

Planning policy currently promotes integrated land use and transportation planning while providing no guide about how to achieve this integration, so while the promotion of this integration exists, municipalities are not empowered to implement it.

5.3 LIMITATIONS OF THE STUDY

The Department of Transportation chose to rather provide answers to the interview questions and then meet for a discussion of the provided answers making it difficult to collect the necessary data required from them.

Pareto Ltd, the parent company that owns MPM, refused to schedule a meeting so it was not possible to gain an understanding of the process that they went through in obtaining planning permission and approval for their expansion project and whether they were required to consider all of the different users of their space during planning. The only interview that was conducted with Menlyn Park Mall was with the respondent working at the mall.

The researcher was not able to obtain interviews with the people who were directly involved with the redevelopment of MPM at the City of Tshwane as well as at MPM itself and therefore had to rely on interviewing respondents from these organisations who were not directly involved.

5.4 RECOMMENDATIONS AND SUGGESTIONS FOR FUTURE RESEARCH

Integration of transportation with land use, public engagement, and stakeholder inclusion in transportation planning have resulted in social cohesion and integrated transportation networks in some countries in global north and the global south. In order for South African planning models to succeed in implementation, they need to be more stakeholder inclusive. And formalisation of the minibuss taxi industry, while it would probably need subsidisation, would probably result in more socially cohesive public transportation systems.

After conducting this research, the following areas for future research were identified:

1. What is the future of SPLUMA after realising the limitations of the Act to cause the spatial transformation that it hopes to achieve as different stakeholders can interpret the Act to suit their objectives, not necessarily acting in the spirit of the Act?
2. How can academia assist practice in creating more sustainable solutions to the challenges faced by planning professionals to implement the change envisaged by the National Development Plan (2030) and SPLUMA?

REFERENCES

Abuhamoud, M., Rahmat, R. and Ismail, A., 2011. Transportation and its Concern in Africa: A Review. *The Social Sciences*, 6(1), 51-63.

Africa Check, 2018. South African Road Agency Gets Traffic Deaths Stat Wrong. Africa Check, 12 April. INTERNET: <https://africacheck.org/reports/south-african-road-agency-gets-traffic-deaths-stat-wrong>, last accessed 4 June 2018.

Amsu'ia and Fitriati, R., 2014. Applying Interactive Planning on Leadership in the Organization: The Case of Transforming Public Transport Services in Banjarmasin. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 115, 283-295.

Andersen, J., Jenkins, P., and Nielsen, M., 2015. Who Plans the African City? A Case Study of Maputo: Part 1 – The Structural Context. *International Development Planning Review*, 37(3), 331-352.

Arrive Alive, (undated). The Bus Industry in South Africa. Arrive Alive. INTERNET: <https://www.arrivealive.co.za/The-Bus-Industry-in-South-Africa-and-Road-Safety>, last accessed 19 March 2018.

Baker, C., 2012. In Brenner, N., Marcuse, P. and Mayer, M., 2012 (eds). *Cities for People, Not for Profit: Critical Urban Theory and the Right to the City*. Routledge, London.

Black, I., 2006. The Presentation of Interpretivist Research. *Qualitative Market Research: An International Journal*, 9(4), 319-324.

Balsas, C., 2015. Sustainable Transportation Planning, A New Academic Specialization in the USA. *International Journal of Transportation Science and Technology*, 4(1), 1-16.

Boschma, R. and Frenken, K., 2011. The Emerging Empirics of Evolutionary Economic Geography. *Journal of Economic Geography*, 11(2), 295-307.

Bostrom, M., Vifell, A., Klintman, M., Soneryd, L., Hallstrom, K. and Thedvall, R., 2015. Social Sustainability Requires Social Sustainability Procedural Prerequisites for Reaching Substantive Goals. *Nature and Culture*, 10(2), 131-156.

Carlino, G. 2005. The Economic Role of Cities in the 21st Century. *Federal Reserve Bank of Philadelphia, Business Review (Third Quarter)*, 9-15.

Cascetta, E. and Pagliara, F., 2013. Public Engagement for Planning and Designing Transportation Systems. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 87, 103-116.

Castells, M., 2011. A Network of Power. *International Journal of Communication*, 5, 773-787.

Cervero, R., 2013. Linking Urban Transport and Land Use in Developing Countries. *Journal of Transport and Land Use*, 6(1), 7-24.

Chen, M. and Skinner, C., 2014. The Urban Informal Economy: Enhanced Knowledge, Appropriate Policies and Effective Organization. In Parnell, S. and Oldfield, S. (eds), *The Routledge Handbook of Cities of the Global South*. Pp. 219-250, Routledge, London.

Cilliers, J., and Victor, H., 2018. Considering Spatial Planning for the South African Poor: An Argument for 'Planning With'. *Town and Regional Planning*, 72, 29-42.

City of Tshwane Land Use Management By-Law, 2016.

Coetzee, J., 2012. The Transformation of Municipal Development Planning in South Africa (Post-1994)" Impressions and Impasse. *Town and Regional Planning*, 61, 10-20.

The Constitution of The Republic of South Africa, 1996.

Crane, R., 2000. The Influence of Urban Form on Travel: Interpretive Review. *Journal of Planning Literature*, 15(1), 3-23.

Curtis, C. and Scheurer, J., 2017. Performance Measures for Public Transport Accessibility Learning from International Practice. *Journal of Transport and Land Use*, 10(1), 93-118.

Daniels, R. and Mulley, C., 2013. Explaining Walking Distance to Public Transport: The Dominance of Public Transport Supply. *Journal of Transport and Land Use*, 6(2), 5-20.

Dauden, F., Carpio-Pinedo, J. and Garcia-Pastor, 2014. Transport Interchange and Local Urban Environment Integration. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 87, 103-116, 160, 215-223.

Department of Rural Development and Reform (DRDLR), 2011. *Annual Performance Plan 2011/2012*. Department of Rural Development and Reform.

Development Facilitation Act 67 of 1995.

Dikeç, M. 2001. Justice and the Spatial Imagination. *Environment and Planning*, 33, 1785-1805.

Dlamini, N. and Musakwa, W., 2014. The Impact of the Legislations Used to Regulate Spatial Planning and Land Use Management in South Africa. Paper Presented at Planning Africa Conference 'Making Great Places', International Convention Centre (ICC), Durban, 19-22 October.

Doi, K. and Kii, M., 2012. Looking at Sustainable Urban Mobility Through a Cross-Assessment Model Within the Framework of Land-Use and Transportation Integration. *IATSS Research*, 35, 62-70.

Doulet, J., Delpirou, A. and Delaunay, T., 2017. Taking Advantage of a Historic Opportunity? A Critical Review of the Literature on TOD in China. *Journal of Transport and Land Use*, 10(1), 77-92.

Duffhues, J. and Bertolini, L., 2016. From Integrated Aims to Fragmented Outcomes Urban Intensification and Transportation Planning in the Netherlands. *Journal of Transport and Land Use*, 9(3), 15-34.

Du Plessis, A. 2017. The Readiness of South African Law and Policy for the Pursuit of Sustainable Development Goal 11. *Law Democracy & Development*, 21, 239-262.

Faajr, A. and Zidan, Z., 2016. An Analysis of the Issues and Challenges of Transportation in Nigeria and Egypt. *The Business and Management Review*, 7(2), 18-29.

Friedmann, J., 2003. Why Do Planning Theory. *Planning Theory*, 2(1), 7-10

Glaeser, E., 1994. Cities, Information, and Economic Growth. *Cityscape*, 1(1), 9-47.

Golubchikov, O., Badyina, A. and Makhrova, A., 2014. The Hybrid Spatialities of Transition: Capitalism, Legacy and Uneven Urban Economic Restructuring. *Urban Studies*, 51(4), 617-633.

Harrison, P., 2008. The Origins and Outcomes of South Africa's Integrated Development Plans. In van Donk, M., Swilling, M., Pieterse, E. and Parnell, S., Consolidating Developmental Local Government, *Lessons from the South African Experience*. Pp. 321-337, UCT Press, Cape Town.

Heeres, N., van Dijk, T., Arts, J. and Tillema, T., 2017. Coping With Interrelatedness and Fragmentation at the Infrastructure/Land-Use Interface: The Potential Merits of a Design Approach. *Journal of Transport and Land Use*, 10(1), 409-435.

Helming, K. and Perez-Soba, M., 2011. Landscape Scenarios and Multifunctionality Making Land Use Impact Assessment Operational. *Ecology and Society*, 16(1), 50-57.

Huchzermeyer, M., 2011. *Cities Without Slums: From Informal Settlement Eradication to a Right to the City in Africa*. UCT Press, Cape Town.

Huchzermeyer, M., 2013. Humanism, Creativity and Rights: Invoking Henri Lefebvre's Right to the City in the Tension Presented by Informal Settlements in South Africa Today. *Inaugural Lecture, School of Architecture and Planning, University of the Witwatersrand*.

Huchzermeyer, M., 2017. The Legal Meaning of Lefebvre's the Right to the City: Addressing the Gap Between Global Campaign and Scholarly Debate. *Geo Journal*, 83(3), 1-14.

Kanyama, A., 2016. Challenges of Institutional Coordination in Planning for Public Transportation in East Africa: Analysis Based on Perceptions of Stakeholders in Dar-es-Salaam and Nairobi. *World Journal of Social Science Research*, 3(3), 243-260.

Kiamba, A., 2012. The Sustainability of Urban Development in Developing Economies. *Consilience*, 8, 20-25.

Kim, C., 2012. Cities for People, Not for Profit: Critical Urban Theory and the Right to the City. *Localities*, 2, 371-377.

Klopp, J., 2012. Towards a Political Economy of Transportation Policy and Practice in Nairobi. *Urban Forum*, 23(1), 1-21.

Klopp, J. and Makajuma, G., 2014. Transportation Infrastructure Integration in East Africa in Historical Context. In Schiefelbusch, M. and Dienel, H. (eds), *The Formation of Common Standards and Visions for Infrastructure Development*. Pp.115-136, Ashgate Publishing, London.

Leedy, P. and Ormrod, J., 2014. *Practical Research: Planning and Design*. Pearson, London.

Levy, C., 2013. Travel Choice Reframed: “Deep Distribution” and Gender in Urban Transport. *Environment and Ecology*, 25(1), 47-63.

Manaugh, K., Badami, M., and El-Geneidy, A., 2014. Integrating Social Equity into Urban Transportation Planning: A Critical Evaluation of Equity Objectives and Measures in Transportation Plans in North America. *Transport Policy* (37), 167-176.

Marcuse, P., 2009. Spatial Justice: Derivative but Causal of Social Injustice. *Spatial Justice*, 1, 49-57.

Maritz, J., van Huyssteen, E., Le Roux, A., Pieterse, A., Ndaba, D., Mans, G. and Ngidi, M., 2016. Are We Achieving Spatial Transformation in South Africa? Can Sub-City Spatial Indicators Make a Contribution? Paper Presented at the South African Planning Institute (SAPI): Planning Africa Conference ‘Making Sense of the Future’, Sandton Convention Centre, Johannesburg, South Africa, 3-6 June.

Mashiri, M., Njenga, P., Njenga, C., Chakwizira, J., and Friedrich, M. 2017. Towards a Framework for Measuring Spatial Planning Outcomes in South Africa. *Sociology and Anthropology*, 5(2), 146-168.

Merkel, W., 2014. Is Capitalism Compatible with Democracy? *Zeitschrift fur Vergleichende Politikwissenschaft*, 8(2), 109-128.

Mihalopoulos, A., 2014a. The Movement of Spatial Justice. *Mondi Migranti*, 1, 7-19.

Mihalopoulos, A., 2014b. Spatial Justice: Body, Lawscape, Atmosphere. In Borch, C. (ed.), *Space, Materiality and the Normative*. Pp. 1-14, Routledge, London

Miller, B. and Nicholls, W., 2013. Social Movements in Urban Society: The City as a Space of Politicization. *Urban Geography*, 34(4), 452-473.

Municipal Systems Act No. 32 of 2000.

Murray, M. 2008. Social Justice and the Rights to the City. In Harding, V. and Jones, K. (eds), *Taming The Disorderly City*. Pp. 15-38, Cornell University Press, New York.

National Planning Commission, 2011. *National Development Plan: Vision for 2030*. National Planning Commission, Pretoria.

Nichersu, I. and Iacoboaia, C., 2011. Systematic Spatial Planning. *Theoretical and Empirical Researches in Urban Management*, 6(2), 67-77.

Ngamlana, N. and Englin, R., 2015. *Spatial Planning and Integrated Development Planning*. Afesis-Corplan, East London.

Nkosi, N. 2016. Revamped Menlyn Park Ready for Debut. Independent Online, 18 November. INTERNET: <https://www.iol.co.za/business-report/economy/revamped-menlyn-park-ready-for-debut-2091180>, accessed 13 March 2018.

Olsen, K., 2014. The Neoliberalisation of Strategic Spatial Planning. *Planning Theory*, 13(3), 288-303.

Papa, E., Silva, C., Brommelstroet, M. and Hull, A., 2016. *Journal of Transport and Land Use*, 9(3), 57-75.

Property 24, 2016. Grand Opening of New Look Menlyn Park Shopping Centre Today. 24 November. Property 24. INTERNET: <https://www.property24.com/articles/grand-opening-of-new-look-menlyn-park-shopping-centre-today/25091>, accessed 13 March 2018.

Purcell, M., 2002. Excavating Lefebvre: The Right to the City and its Urban Politics of the Inhabitant. *Geo Journal*, 58, 99-108.

Purcell, M., 2003. Citizenship and the Right to the Global City: Reimagining the Capitalist World Order. *International Journal of Urban and Regional Research*, 27(3), 564-590.

Purcell, M. 2013. Possible Worlds: Henri Lefebvre and the Right to the City. *The Journal of the Urban Affairs Association*, 36(1), 141-154.

Rij, E. and Altes, W., 2010. Looking for the Optimum Relationship Between Spatial Planning and Land Development. *The Town Planning Review*, 81(3), 283-306.

Saunders, B., Sim, J., Kingstone, T., Baker, S., Waterfield, J., Bartlam, B., Burroughs, H. and Jinks C., 2017. Saturation in Qualitative Research: Exploring its Conceptualization and Operation. *Quality and Quantity*, 52, 1893-1907.

Schoeman, C. 2015. The Alignment Between Spatial Planning, Transportation Planning and Environmental Management Within the New Spatial Systems in South Africa. *Town and Regional Planning*, 67, 42-57.

Schoeman, C., Cilliers, D., and Retief, F., 2017. Environmental Management and Land-Use Management in South Africa: Complexities, Challenges and Opportunities for Integrated Strategic Planning in Developing Countries. *State of the Art in Science and Engineering*, 100, 153-173,

Scott, A., 2004. Cultural Products Industries and Urban Economic Development, Prospects for Growth and Market Contestation in Global Context. *Urban Affairs Review*, 39(4), 461-490.

South African Cities Network (Cities Network), 2014. Using Land Use Management To Create Transit Friendly Cities. In Davidson, K. (ed.), *How To Build Transit Oriented Cities*. Pp.98-118, Ink Design, Cape Town.

South African National Taxi Council (SANTACO), (undated). South African National Taxi Council. INTERNET: <http://www.santaco.co.za/santaco-history/>, last accessed 4 June 2018.

Spatial Land Use and Management Act (SPLUMA). 2013. Act, No. 16 of 2013.

Sponem, S. and Lambert, C., 2016. Exploring Differences in Budget Characteristics , Roles and Satisfaction: A Configurational Approach. *Management Accounting Research*, 30, 47-61.

Statistics South Africa (Stats SA), 2013. *General Household Survey*. Statistics South Africa.

Statistics South Africa (Stats SA), 2014. *National Household Travel Survey*. Statistics South Africa.

Taki, H., Maatouk, M., Qurnfulah, E. and Aljoufie, M., 2017. Planning TOD With Land Use and Transport Integration: A Review. *Journal of Geoscience, Engineering, Environment and Technology*, 2(1), 84-94.

Taylor, I., 2017. Transnationalizing Capitalist Hegemony: A Poulantzian Reading. *Alternatives: Global, Local, Political*, 42(1), 26-40.

Tibaijuka, A. 2004. The Importance of Urban Planning in Urban Poverty Reduction and Sustainable Development. Paper Presented at the World Planners Congress. Vancouver, 19-23 June.

Todes, A., 2004. Regional Planning and Sustainability: Limits and Potentials of South Africa's Integrated Development Plans. *Journal of Environmental Planning and Management*, 47(6), 843-861.

Tosa, C., Mitrea, A., Sato, H., Miwa, T. and Morikawa, T., 2018. Economic Growth and Urban Metamorphosis: A Quarter Century of Transformations Within the Metropolitan Area of Bucharest. *Journal of Transport and Land Use*, 11(1), 273-295.

Trullen, J. and Boix, R., 2008. Knowledge Externalities and Networks of Cities in the Creative Metropolis. In Cooke, P. and Lazzeretti, L., (eds), *Creative Cities, Cultural Clusters and Local Economic Development*. Pp. 211-235, MPG Books, Cornwall.

Turok, I., 2004. Cities, Regions and Competitiveness. *Regional Studies*, 39 (9), 1069-1083.

Turok, I. and Mcgranahan, G., 2013. Urbanization and Economic Growth: The Arguments and Evidence for Africa and Asia. *Environment & Urbanization, International Institute for Environment and Development*, 25(2), 465-482.

United Nations (U.N.), 2015. *Work of the Statistical Commission Pertaining to the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development*. General Assembly. Resolution Adopted by the General Assembly on 25 September.

United Nations (U.N.) Habitat, 2011. *The Economic Role of Cities*. United Nations Human Settlements Programme, The Global Urban Economic Dialogue Series.

Urban LandMark, 2010. *Urban Land Development in Practice: Developers and Municipalities Share*. Urban LandMark, South Africa.

Van Rij E. and Altes, W., 2008. The Merits of Outmoded Planning Instruments for Improving Metropolitan Green Areas: The Midden-Delfland Approach. *Planning Theory and Practice*, 9, 345-362.

Wang, Y., Zhu, X. and Wu, B., 2013. Integrated Multimodal Metropolitan Transportation Model. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 96, 2138-2146.

Watson, V., 2009. The Planned City Sweeps the Poor Away...": Urban Planning and 21st Century Urbanisation. *Progress in Planning*, 72(3), 151-193.

Wager, C., Kawulich, B. and Garner, M., 2012. *Doing Social Research: A Global Context*. McGraw-Hill, London.

Wei, H. and Mogbarabi, A., 2013. Key Issues in Integrating New Town Development into Urban Transportation Planning. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 96, 2846-2857.

The White Paper on Local Government, 1998.

World Bank, 2009. *Reshaping Economic Geography*. World Development Report.

World Health Organization (WHO), 2013. *WHO Global Status Report on Road Safety 2013: Supporting a Decade of Action*. World Health Organization.

Zou, M., Chen, X., Yu, H., Tong, Y., Huang, Z., Li, M. and Zou, H., 2013. Dynamic Transport Planning and Operations: Concept, Framework and Applications in China. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 96, 2332-2343.

APPENDIX 1 – PARTICIPATION INFORMATION SHEET

PARTICIPANT INFORMATION SHEET

SOCIO SPATIAL EXCLUSIONS AND POLICY IMPLICATIONS: A CASE STUDY OF MENLYN PARK MALL

Greetings

My name is **Thabang Mofokeng** and I am currently a full time student studying towards a **MASTER of Science in Development Planning** at the School of Architecture and Planning (SOAP) at the University of Witwatersrand. I am currently investigating the extent to which **SPLUMA Act of 2013 is applied**.

I am inviting you to be part of the study through an **interview process/survey/ focus group etc.**

The interview will take no longer than **30 - 45 min** of your time. The place and time **SPECIFY**. During the course of the interview you will be asked questions regarding **YOUR UNDERSTANDING OF Menlyn Park Mall...**

The interview will be **recorded (cellphone)** using an audio recorder and hand written notes.

You have been selected to participate in this study due to your ...

Your participation is **voluntary**, you may refuse to answer any questions that make you uncomfortable, and you may withdraw at any time without penalty or loss. You will receive **no payment or other incentives for your participation**.

Your participation will be completely **anonymous** and you will not be personally identified in the final report. You will be referred to as number and official rank. However, your **organization** may be identified.



The results of the interview and your personal views **will not be linked to you in the final report**. *In the event that I use direct quotations from this interview, please note that your identity will not be revealed. Any comments that you make that you deem “**off the record**” or similar, will not be quoted. Further, any information that you share will be kept **confidential** and can only be accessed by me on a **password protected computer**. There are also no foreseeable risks associated with your participation.*

The research undertaken is **solely for academic purposes** and once completed will be available electronically and can be accessed publicly.

If you have any questions, concerns, or comments or if you would like a copy of the final report, please feel free to contact me at 1558593@students.wits.ac.za or my supervisor tsepang.leuta1@wits.ac.za.

Thabang Mofokeng
MSc in Developing Planning

APPENDIX 2 – FORMAL CONSENT FORM

FORMAL (SIGNED) CONSENT FORM

I hereby confirm that I have been informed by the student researcher of the purpose, procedures, and my rights as a participant. I have received, read and understand the written participant information sheet. I have also been informed of:

- ☐ the nature of my participation in the form of a written survey
- ☐ the place and duration of the study
- ☐ the reasons for why I was selected to participate in the study
- ☐ the voluntary nature, refusal to answer, and withdrawing from the study
- ☐ no payment or incentives
- ☐ no loss of benefits or risks
- ☐ anonymity
- ☐ confidentiality
- ☐ how the research findings will be disseminated

I therefore agree to participate in this study by completing the survey.

I AGREE / DO NOT AGREE to audio-recording during interviews.

PARTICIPANT:

Printed name

Signature

Date

