List of Corrections: 770061

Comment from External Examiners	Correction/Status
Comments Examiner 1	
1. The importance of valuation cannot be overemphasised. Valuation is required for so many purposes including selling/buying properties, mortgages, insurance purposes, letting, rating/taxation purposes etc. It is therefore important to ensure that the valuation estimates are accurate so that such important decisions made based on the estimates can a true reflection of the property values. The topic is therefore of high importance to academics and the practitioners. The candidate has shown that he/she understands the nature and purpose of the investigations almost all the important literature are included in the thesis. The methodology employed is also good. The candidate should however consider the following to improve the quality of the thesis.	Noted and appreciated.
2. Findings should be well highlighted in the abstract. The candidate should also mention at least one of his recommendations in the abstract. This is important to guide the readers as to what they should expect in the other chapters.	Abstract reviewed, findings and recommendations incorporated.
3. There should be an introduction to the literature.	Done refer page() in fact all chapters have been introduced.
4. The population size should be indicated. The candidate should also justify why the top four lending institutions, namely, FNB, Nedbank, Standard Bank, and ABSA are used and not the small ones. Again, the candidate should also justify why only three provinces are used and why this particular provinces, namely, Gauteng, Western Cape and Kwa-Zulu Natal are used.	Done, refer to page ()
5. On page 19, Table 1 (Heading of the table) in chapter 3 should be changed to 3.1. Again, in chapter 4, page 24, Table 1 (heading of the first table) should be changed to Table 4.1.	Tables numbers have been fixed accordingly, see pages ()

The next table in chapter in chapter 4 should be called Table 4.2 and so on…..In chapter 4 again, page 20, Figure 1 (heading of the first figure) should be changed to figure 4.1. The next figure in Chapter 4 should be called 4.2 and so on….	
6. The entire Chapter 4 needs to be improved. The candidate should also discuss the intuitions behind the implications of the results. The candidate should also discuss the results in relation to the literature by identifying those studies whose findings are similar to or different from what he/she is reporting and then discuss them together.	The need for accurate valuations cannot be overemphasised based on the fact that valuation is a decision making tool. It is the bases for performance measurement and other investment advice (MacAllister, 1995). Therefore users of valuation ought to be assured that valuation is the best tool to measure their investment performances and property values. Inaccurate valuations can be very detrimental to clients and the economy at large. Overvaluations on mortgage valuations can lead to incurable losses to the mortgage finance institutions, while under valuations can also lead to financial losses to sellers and investors pledging their properties as equity. *Thus measuring appraisal accuracy is very important for clients and investor confidence.* Our study concluded that valuations are reliable for the purpose of estimating market values. The implications of the results mean that investors can now consider real estate as an investment portfolio because they can be certain of their investment worth and returns like other investment vehicles which have a central market. For discussion of results in relation to literature refer to Page 48 (4.4.21) See also for **4.2 Preliminary Survey Details** for further improvement of chapter 4. The filed data for the study was collected between January and February, 2017. The data was sourced from mortgage finance institutions and valuers. The data from the banks was received in Microsoft Excel format and was exported to R software version 3.2.2 for analysis. Variables were renamed for ease of reading with the help

	of the codebook. Data was cleaned to remove outliers, illegal and inconsistent values. Data for external valuers and in-house quality assurance valuers was collected and analyzed by Qualtrics then exported reports to Microsoft word.
7. The heading of Chapter 5 should be "Summery and Conclusion" instead of Discussion and Conclusion we have at the moment. The chapter should be structured as follows; ▪ 5.1 Introduction ▪ 5.2 Summery of findings ▪ 5.3 Conclusions ▪ Recommendations	Done, Refer to page (58 and 60.)
Examiner 2	
1. Valuation Accuracy in South Africa by Sandile Mabuza I have had an opportunity to read the abovementioned master degree report by Sandile Mabuza. Before going into a detailed report of the quality of the report I must say that I did find it an inspiring read, and it gave fuel to an ongoing debate that has been around in Sweden for quite some time on the accuracy of real estate agents appraisals of properties. The Swedish Real Estate Inspectorate has been on the lookout for real estate agents continuous practice of undervaluation and underestimation of list prices, in order to establish a best practice of real estate brokerage services. The accuracy of valuation in the South African context would therefore be of interest for a cross-country comparison, and I do hope that would be feasible in the future.	Thank you and I truly appreciate comment. I hope to pursue the cross country comparison in my Doctorate studies.
2. Introduction The introduction to the report is to the point and provides an interesting start to the topic. The section contains an identification of the research topic with reference to the classical works, as well as up to date studies within the	Thank you.

area. Sandile provides the reader with arguments for the relevance of the chosen topic and why this is important to study in the South African context. The chapter closes with the aims and objectives of the research and the specific research questions is presented in a short and to the point way.	
3. Relevant Literature The second part of the report consists of a thorough literature review, in all ten very informative pages of text. The chapter starts with the description of the valuation profession in South Africa and putting it into context. Section 2.2 introduces the concept of valuation accuracy by citing the seminal studies in the field and these studies are elaborated upon in section 2.3, in which the importance of valuation accuracy is analysed in section 2.4, in which the measurement of valuation is described. These two sections are important and the literature in these sections is relevant and up to date, describing not only the US and European market but also research from Nigeria. The chapter is finalized with a section called Conclusion, a practice that is not very common, but something I do like.	 Thank you.
4. Understanding of method In my opinion, the quality of the research conducted is more or less the same as the quality and understanding of the methods used. Without a property understanding of the inherit limitations in qualitative and quantitative methods, the credibility of research is put into question. Therefore, a proper methodology section should answer all questions regarding methodological choices such as; why the chosen method, what were the alternatives, what have actually been done, whom have been interviewed, how long did the interview take, were the interviews taped and transcribed, etc. The methodology chapter written by Sandile is on the short side when it comes to the general reflection on methodology. It is for	Done, in the whole report.

instance possible to use a combination of methods, such as quantitative (the one used) with member checks and interviews? Furthermore, it would be interesting to know more about the financial institutions-as for now, the reader gets to know that they are "leading". Finally, the 32.826 observations are they the entire population or a sample.	
5. Area covered by research Sandile has covered quite some ground with his report. In the sample of focusing on residential properties the reader will get a good understanding of the current valuation practice in South Africa.	Thank you.
6. Methodology employed The method used in this research report is proper and there is a good fit between the purpose of the project and the method. I applaud the author for a good job in finding reliable data and putting it into good use in providing some interesting facts concerning valuation accuracy in South Africa and providing an insightful analysis of the topic.	Thank you.
7. Miscellaneous There are some minor issues that could be rectified for the final version of the report, including the following: ▪ The research questions are numbered 4.1.1 to 4.1.3, I am not sure why. ▪ The proper use of references should in many cases be instance, Crosby et al. (2003) instead of (Crosby et al. 2003) see page 5 for an example. ▪ The report should be proofread.	
8. Assessing the significance of findings The results section starts with a descriptive analysis of the respondents' background, etc. (4.1). Sandile writes that the respondents among female valuers is very low. I am not sure whether 1/3 of the sample is low, since I do not know how large proportion of the valuers that are women within the entire population. The results from the survey are	My study is not more representative than the study quoted as they both use DHS. This study differs from other studies which used less representative samples other than the one quoted. I have however rephrased.

interesting, but could be written more effectively, for instance editing out some of the tables and figures (i.e. figure 5). Table 6 & 7 in conjunction are very interesting in that they provide the reader with an insight into the heart of the problem with valuation accuracy. From 4.2 to 4.4.20 there is a lot of descriptive statistics concerning different aspects of valuation, type of residence, etc. The numbering of this part is a little confusing as 4.3-4.4.3 is missing. Some of the information in the could be edited out if this is to be a research paper (focus on the most common types of properties for instance), and some of the tables could be moved to the appendix, as the information is already provided in the text.	
9. Structure of the report The chosen structure of the report is logical, and the text has a nice flow to it. If any changes could be made regarding the structure it would be to rename the final chapter to Chapter 5-Analysis and to have a separate chapter 6 called *Conclusions and implications.*	Thank you.
10. Scope of research Sandile has made a report that identifies an important and current problem within the financial sector as well as within the valuation profession. The chosen literature is relevant to the purpose of the study and the data collected as is also aligned with the purpose. I find the chosen scope – valuation accuracy in three provinces in South Africa – provides a good fit between all parts of the report and that the chosen problem and purpose is answered at the end of the report.	Thank you.