

Leadership of a Diverse Workforce within a South African Municipality

Laurence Benidict Corner

A research report submitted to the Faculty of Commerce, Law and Management, University of the Witwatersrand, in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Business Administration.

Johannesburg, 2012

ABSTRACT

Creating and effectively leading workforce diversity is crucial for sustainable development and economic growth in not just South Africa but also in the rest of the world. The purpose of this study was to investigate the state of diversity and leadership thereof within the South African public sector. The democratic South African government had been able to rigorously drive greater racial and gender diversity within the public sector.

In depth one on one interviews were conducted with a small diverse group of municipal employees. The main themes and findings that emerged from these interviews were synthesised to formulate an overall view of diversity and the state of diversity leadership within the organisation.

The main findings of the research were that employees did not perceive the municipality to be effective in creating and leading diversity. The failure to fully embrace programmes such as affirmative action and equal employment programmes were of concern.

DECLARATION

I, Laurence Benidict Corner, declare that this research report is my own work except as indicated in the references and acknowledgments. It is submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Master in Business Administration in the University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg. It has not been submitted before for any degree or examination in this or any other university.

Laurence Benidict Corner

Signed at

On the day of2012

DEDICATION

To my creator whose grace has been sufficient in my life. I also dedicate this to my wife, Lavinia, who encouraged me to reach for the stars, my children; Callan, Laurence (Jnr) and Erin who have been understanding and supportive over the last few years while I pursued my dream of completing this degree. To my mother whose prayers have always carried me and my father who I know is watching from heaven, thank you.

To everyone who have ever played a role in my life; your story will live on.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This study was conducted at a large municipality in Gauteng. I wish to express my sincere thanks to:

- The management of the municipality, in particular Mr Peter Tshidino who helped to coordinate the interviews
- The interviewees for their willingness to participate; and
- My supervisor, Dr Christoph Maier, for his endless patience and willingness to support and guide me through this process.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABSTRACT.....	ii
DECLARATION.....	iii
DEDICATION.....	iv
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS.....	v
APPENDICES	ix
LIST OF TABLES.....	ix
LIST OF FIGURES.....	ix
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	x

CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION1

1.1	Purpose of the study	1
1.2	Context of the study	1
1.3	Research Questions	3
1.4	Significance of the Study	3
1.5	Delimitations of the Study	8
1.6	Definitions of terms	9
1.7	Assumptions	10
	1.7.1 Assumption 1	10
	1.7.2 Assumption 2	10
	1.7.3 Assumption 3	11
	1.7.4 Assumption 4	11
	1.7.5 Assumption 5	11
	1.7.6 Assumption 6	11

CHAPTER 2: LITERATURE REVIEW12

2.1	Introduction	12
2.2.	Defining Diversity and the Perception of Diversity in Organisations	15

2.2.1 Valuing Diversity	16
2.2.2 Cultural Diversity and Values	20
2.2.2.1 Diversity and Values	20
2.2.2.2 Cultural Diversity	22
2.2.3 Transforming Organisational Culture	24
2.2.4 Diversity at an Individual level	29
2.3 Impact of the Political and Legislative changes on diversity in the South African workplace	32
2.3.1 Redressing past oppressive legislation and inequalities in the workplace	32
2.3.2 Challenges with Affirmative Action and Equal Employment Opportunities	35
2.4 Managing and Leading Diversity in Organisations	38
2.4.1 Dealing with Diversity in Organisations	38
2.4.2 The role of the manager or leader in managing diversity	41
2.4.3 The Type of Leadership needed to Lead Diversity	43
2.4.4 Maier's Alternative Perspective on Leading Diversity	47
2.4.5 Maier's Conceptual Framework on Leading Diversity	48
2.5 African Leadership principles as an approach to leading diversity	50
2.6 Conclusion of Literature Review	55
2.6.1 Research Question 1: How do staff in municipalities perceive and define diversity?	55
2.6.2 Research Question 2: How have the changes in the South African political and legislative landscape impacted diversity within the municipalities?	57
2.6.3 Research Question 3: Do managers and leaders in municipalities have the necessary skills and competencies to lead and manage a diverse workforce effectively?	57
2.6.4 Research Question 4: Are South African managers applying traditional African centred leadership principles and practices?	58
CHAPTER 3: RESEARCH METHODOLOGY	60
3.1 Research Methodology/ Paradigm	60
3.2 Research Design	61

3.3	Population and Sample	62
3.3.1	Population	62
3.3.2	Sample and sampling method	63
3.4	The research instrument	63
3.5	Procedure for data collection	64
3.6	Data analysis and interpretation	64
3.7	Limitations of the study	66
3.8	Credibility, Dependability, Transferability and Conformability	67

CHAPTER 4: PRESENTATION OF RESULTS70

4.1	Introduction	70
4.2	Sample Demographics	70
4.3	Results pertaining to the interview questions	71
4.4	Summary of the Results	86

CHAPTER 5: DISCUSSION OF THE RESULTS88

5.1	Introduction	88
5.2	Discussion pertaining to research question 1: How staff in municipalities perceive and define diversity	88
5.2.1	Popular and Less Obvious Diversity Dimensions:	89
5.2.2	The Individual as a diverse entity:	92
5.2.3	Dealing with Diversity:	94
5.3	Discussion pertaining to research question 2: How the changes in the South African political and legislative landscape have impacted diversity within the municipalities	97
5.4	Discussions pertaining to research question 3: The skills and competencies needed by managers and leaders in the municipalities to lead and manage a diverse workforce effectively	102
5.4.1	The Current Management and Leadership situation in the Municipality	103
5.4.2	Management and Leadership needed in the municipality	104

5.5	Discussions pertaining to research question 4: The application of traditional African centred leadership principles and practices by South African managers	106
5.6	Conclusion	108

CHAPTER 6: CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS110

6.1	Introduction	110
6.2	Conclusions of the study	110
6.3	Recommendations	111
6.4	Suggestions for Further Research	113

REFERENCES115

APPENDICES127

Appendix 1: List of Interview Candidates.....127

Appendix 2: Sample Interview Transcript – Senior Manager.....129

Appendix 3: Sample Interview Transcript – Lower-level Employee.....133

LIST OF TABLES

Table 1: A selection of possible diversity dimensions	30
Table 2: Differences between Equity and Diversity Management	37
Table 3: John Kotter’s differentiation between managers and leaders	42
Table 4: Interview Sample	71
Table 5: Diversity Dimensions as per Interviewees	74

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1: Gain versus Pain Theory	6
---	---

Figure 2: Paradigms of Diversity within Public Organisations	17
Figure 3: Centrality of Cultural elements	22
Figure 4: Cultural Diversity and its influences on management	27
Figure 5: Model of Managerial Leadership – The Components.....	44
Figure 6: Conceptual Framework for Leading Diversity.....	49
Figure 7: Creswell’s Data Analysis Spiral.....	65

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

AA	Affirmative Action
ANC	African National Conference
BEE	Black Economic Empowerment
BBBEE	Broad Based Black Economic Empowerment
COSATU	Congress of South African Trade Unions
EE	Employment Equity
EEA	Employment Equity Act
EEO	Equal Employment Opportunity
EEP	Employment Equity Policy of the Municipality
EOC	Equal Opportunities Commission
HR	Human Resource
HRD	Human Resource Development
IMATU	Independent Municipal and Allied Trade Union
LGTA	Local Government Transition Act
LGSETA	Local Government Sector Education and Training Authority
MPG	Managing Personal Growth
NP	National Party
SAMWU	South African Municipal Workers Union

TQM	Total Quality Management
WSP	Work Skills Programme