

https://dspace.org/

Searching for solutions to Zimbabwe's education crisis : citizenship education in a time of teacher de-professionalization?

Erlwanger, John

2013-08-19
http://hdl.handle.net/10539/13038

Downloaded from a DSpace repository. https://dspace.org/

Searching for solutions to Zimbabwe's education crisis: Citizenship Education in a time of teacher de-professionalization?

A Research Report submitted in partial fulfilment of a Masters in Development Studies by coursework and Research Report.

Faculty of Humanities, University of the Witwatersrand

By

John Erlwanger

2013

DECLARATION

I declare that the research report is my own unaided work. It has been submitted for the partial fulfilment of the degree of Master of Arts: Development Studies by coursework and research report to the University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg. It has not been submitted before, for any other degree or examination, to any other university.

SIGNED: Erlwanger

Student: John Edward Erlwanger

Date: 11 June 2013

Student no.: 571823

Degree: Development Studies

School: Social Sciences

Faculty: Humanities

Table of Contents

Contents

Acknowledgements v
1 Chapter One: Introduction 1
1.1 Introduction 1
1.2. Background of the Study 1
1.3. Statement of the Problem 4
1.4. Aims and Objectives 5
1.5. Research Questions 6
1.6. Significance of the Study 6
1.7. Summary and Report Outline 7
2 Chapter Two: Literature Review 9
2.1. Introduction 9
2.2. Background to the Citizenship Education debate 9
2.3. The Potential Value of Citizenship Education to Zimbabwe 16
2.4. The De-professionalization of Teachers and its Consequences 25
2.5. The Symptoms of Teacher De-professionalization in Zimbabwe 32
2.6. Summary 36
3 Chapter Three: Methodology 37
3.1. Introduction 37
3.2. The Research Design 37
3.3. Population and Sampling. 39
3.4. The Research Instruments 42
3.5. Limitations of the Study 47
3.6. Ethical Considerations 48
3.7. Summary 49
4 Chapter Four: Data Presentation 50
4.1. Introduction 50
4.2. Themes 52
4.3. Summary 78

5 Chapter Five: Discussion of the Findings 79
5.1. Introduction 79
5.2. Discussion of the Data 80
5.3. Conclusion 92
6 Chapter six: Summary and Recommendations 93
6.1. Summary 93
6.2. Recommendations 96
7 Bibliography 101
8 Appendices 112
Appendix A 113
Appendix B 114
Appendix C 115
Appendix D 116
Appendix E 117

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to thank my parents for their love and financial support. My cousin, Kennedy Erlwanger and his wife Gladys for supporting me whilst in South Africa and my supervisor, Prof. Rajohane Matshedisho, for guiding me through the long process of writing this Research Report.

1 CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION

1.1 Introduction

There is a school of thought in Zimbabwe, supported by scholars such as Shizha and Kariwo (2011), Sigauke (2011a) and Tshabangu (2006) that suggests citizenship education should be introduced to the country's schools in light of the current education crisis. Citizenship education, which is educating pupils to be good citizens, is held as being part of the answer to the economic, social and political ills that plague the country and its education system.

However, this report will argue that, while the proposed introduction of citizenship education may be desirable in Zimbabwe, there are a number of pre-conditions that need to be met before it can be meaningful, some of which I will demonstrate. In this report, I will demonstrate the conditions of teachers under de-professionalization. I will also argue that unless the de-professionalization of teachers is addressed it will be meaningless and unproductive to implement citizenship education.

As Kombo and Tromp (2009) recommended, this chapter will clarify the need for the Study and the researcher's view of the problem. It consists of the background to the Study, the statement of the problem, aims and objectives, the significance of the Study and the report outline.

1.2. Background of the Study

After attaining independence in 1980, the government of Zimbabwe placed an enormous commitment on its education system. The education system that the Zimbabwean

government had inherited from its white minority predecessors was not made to aid national development. Rather, it was tailor made to consolidate and perpetuate the colonial system and deny basic citizenship rights to the majority. The ruling Rhodesian Front had actually reduced spending on African education from 8% to 2% of the budget after 1965. As a result, by the time the new government took power, literacy among Africans was only 40% (Brown, 1991). This made the task of running and developing the country very difficult after majority rule was achieved.

Post-independence Zimbabwe's educational emphasis has traditionally been '*growth with equity'*, the purpose of which was to create an egalitarian society and redistribute the resources formerly skewed by the colonial regime. This was in order to rectify the aforementioned problems faced by Zimbabwe's education system (Kanyongo, 2005). The government was praised for introducing free and compulsory education at primary and secondary level and for treating education as a basic right. However, there has never been a firm attempt to teach a citizenship education that includes human rights and which empowers people to take active part in the political decision making of the country (Shizha and Kariwo, 2011).

Since the ruling Zimbabwe African National Union Patriotic Front (ZANU PF) was popular in the early 1980s many civic organizations, like trade unions, social clubs and town associations, preferred to co-operate with the government rather than oppose the party's dominance in the political sphere. Thus, there was little public call for better civic policy as civilians toed the official party line, allowing ZANU PF to entrench itself in a position of uncontested power. However, the 1990s saw the introduction of neo-liberal programmes such as the Economic and Structural Adjustment Programme (ESAP), which led to Zimbabwe's spending move, from social support to servicing debt. This situation, along with a series of poor government decisions and an unfavourable economic climate, led to a noticeable economic decline in the late 1990s. The unplanned 'land redistribution program' from the year 2000 onwards worsened the situation. Zimbabwe, therefore, in the

early twenty first century had become a failed State as it could no longer provide its citizens with basic services, such as food, rule of law and education (Bourne, 2011).

Burde (2004) writes that a country in conflict often suffers from a near total decline of the State, displaying symptoms like forced migrations, shortages of teachers, breakdown in communications, healthcare and other State run services. All that Zimbabwe lacks now are child soldiers and land mines to make Burde's list of a country in conflict. These listed symptoms create and exacerbate obstacles to the provision of educational services. Thus it can be said that Zimbabwe has undergone a series of economic, social and political crises that have negatively affected many institutions in the country. These include the education system, which has become a shadow of its former self due to reduced investment and the political turmoil affecting it (Chireshe and Shumba, 2011).

Zimbabwe’s problems have led to increased demands for more liberties and better social welfare. However, the government has not created an environment conducive for non-political civic groups. Threatened by the upsurge in civic activity, it responded to the genuine concerns of Zimbabwean civic organizations by blocking, frustrating, infiltrating and neutralizing them, until most citizens no longer engaged in policy issues. The country effectively swung from a semi-democratic to a totalitarian State, further suppressing any attempts to implement effective citizenship participation that might have helped prevent the crises Zimbabwe was to suffer after 2000 (Shizha and Kariwo, 2011).

Nziramasanga (1999), Sigauke (2011a), Shizha and Kariwo (2011) and Tshabangu (2006) argue that the way forward for Zimbabwean education is to introduce citizenship education as part of the school curriculum. Though there are many different interpretations of what citizenship education is, it is based on the idea that becoming a citizen requires more than just acquiring civil status. It needs schools to train the youth to exercise social contribution and responsibility, which means acting in a way that serves the interests of society and does not adversely affect the people around them (Evans, 2000). This would empower the youth with the knowledge of the working of their

country and the ability to make decisions on their own future. By empowering the citizenry this way, it is reasoned, Zimbabwe would not only become more democratic, it would also enjoy improved economic development (Shizha and Kariwo, 2011).

Unfortunately, Zimbabwe's high school teachers are experiencing problems with teaching the current curriculum under the current conditions. High school teachers are experiencing hardships such as decreased spending power and shortages of vital teaching materials due to the economic problems and government intimidation. Teachers are the grassroots agents expected to actually teach any proposed citizenship education in Zimbabwe's classrooms. Therefore, this report is based on the idea that improvement in teachers working environment should be part of the pre-conditions to implementing citizenship education.

Zimbabwean high school teachers, it can be argued, have experienced a form of de-professionalization. De-professionalization is described by scholars such as Ingersoll and Merrill (2011), Teferra and Skauge (2006) and Shizha and Kariwo (2011) as a decrease in the occupation’s status due to poor work environment and absence of opportunities for self improvement. This report will critically discuss de-professionalization in chapter 2, but it is important to note that it negatively affects Zimbabwe’s high school teachers’ ability to teach their students adequately. Unless the issue of teacher de-professionalization is addressed, this report argues that it will be meaningless and unproductive to implement citizenship education.

1.3. Statement of the Problem

Chireshe and Shumba (2011), Manguvo et al (2011) and Shizha and Kariwo (2011) argue that Zimbabwe's economic and political crises have had a negative effect on Zimbabwe's education efforts. Introducing citizenship education has been advocated as a possible way to teach students how to be good citizens. This would, in part, help prevent the abuses of power that have caused the aforementioned crises in the future, and give Zimbabweans

the ability to chart their own economic futures. However, Zimbabwean teachers who would be expected to teach any future citizenship education curriculum may be unable to do so, as their occupation has been de-professionalized. I believe that the current state of teacher de-professionalization might affect the any attempt to introduce citizenship education to Zimbabwe's schools. Therefore, the question that this report tries to answer is whether citizenship education can be meaningful in Zimbabwe given the de-professionalization of teachers?

1.4. Aims and Objectives

These are objectives and purposes stated in specific measurable terms, which break up the aim into achievable measurable components that reflect the intention and direction of the study (Kombo and Tromp, 2009). However, due to the qualitative nature of the Study, it must be noted that the results of this Study cannot be truly measured. Rather, they reflect the views and opinions of the teachers who participated in focus group discussions and interviews, which cannot be measured. The objective of this report is to try and answer whether Zimbabwe's high school teachers could teach citizenship education satisfactorily given their de-professionalization.

The aims are:

1. To explain data from the literature review on the nature of citizenship education.
2. To discuss data from the literature review concerning the de-professionalization of teachers and its effect on their occupation.
3. To find out from some teachers who have taught in Zimbabwe about their opinions and experiences of trying to carry out their duties under conditions of de-professionalization.
4. Finally, this report will use the gathered data to put forth the argument that the way forward for Zimbabwean education is to introduce citizenship education as part of the school curriculum. However, teachers may not be able to teach

citizenship education satisfactorily, due to the de-professionalization of their occupation. Further there are other factors which may render any attempt to implement citizenship education meaningless and unproductive.

1.5. Research Questions

A. Main question.

Can citizenship education be meaningful in Zimbabwe given the de-professionalization of teachers?

B. Sub-Questions:

1. What are the conditions under which Zimbabwean teacher's work?
2. What do high school teachers in Zimbabwe think are the factors that cause their de-professionalization?
3. How might de-professionalization affect teaching citizenship education in Zimbabwe?

1.6. Significance of the Study

This section outlines the importance of the issue at hand (Kombo and Tromp, 2009). This Study is significant in three ways;

A. Practically, it would help those people, such as future education policy makers and planners, intent on rebuilding Zimbabwe's education system understand the challenges faced at a local level by the biggest employees of the education system, the teachers themselves.

B. It will add to the theoretical debates by Shizha and Kariwo (2011), who argued that teachers cannot be expected to teach citizenship education satisfactorily due to de-professionalization and political intimidation. It will also argue that Shizha and Kariwo (2011) were correct about de-professionalization negatively affecting teachers' ability to teach citizenship education. The report will include other factors that may negatively affect any attempted implementation of citizenship education curriculum. It will provide future scholars with research material to update the ongoing debates on citizenship education.

C. While there is substantial literature advocating citizenship education in Zimbabwe, by authors such as Nziramasanga (1999), Tshabangu (2006), Shizha and Kariwo (2011) and Sigauke (2011a) there is little on the practical difficulties likely to be encountered when introducing it. This report will add to the literature by addressing the issue of pre-conditions for citizenship education. In this case the pre-conditions include the working environment of teachers.

1.7. Summary and Report Outline

The rest of this report will consist of five chapters:

After this first Chapter is Chapter two, the review of literature pertinent to the topic. The review discusses issues involving the nature of citizenship, citizenship education and de-professionalization. Chapter two also reviews literature on citizenship education and the de-professionalization of Zimbabwe's teachers.

Chapter three describes and justifies the methods which were utilized during the research. It includes a description of the research instruments, population and sample employed. The qualitative method of research used: focus group discussions and semi-structured interviews, is also be discussed. The chapter ends with an explanation of the limitations of the Study and the ethical considerations taken before and during the research.

Chapter four presents the findings gathered from the twenty-five informants who were involved in the investigation. It demonstrates that the informants believe that they are suffering from many of the symptoms of de-professionalization identified in chapter two.

Chapter five will discuss the findings. This Chapter will argue that while citizenship education may be beneficial to Zimbabwe, it may not be taught satisfactorily under the current conditions of de-professionalization which are being experienced by Zimbabwe's high school teachers.

Chapter six will summarize the findings of the previous chapters and conclude the report. It will also include recommendations to alleviate the problems identified in the report, and discuss possible future studies to expand on this knowledge.

2 CHAPTER TWO: LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1. Introduction

The themes in this literature review are concerned with understanding the issues which may impact on attempts to implement citizenship education successfully in Zimbabwe. Before arguing about whether or not citizenship education can be meaningful, it is necessary to explain what citizenship education and de-professionalization are. Then these concepts will be used to examine the data obtained from the interviews and focus group discussions I had with Zimbabwean high school teachers.

The first part of this review will explain the concepts of citizenship and citizenship education as well as the major debates on its possible implementation in Zimbabwe's schools. The second part of the literature review will examine the issues surrounding de-professionalization. It will include sub-sections discussing the symptoms of de-professionalization of Zimbabwe's teachers. This literature will be referred to in Chapters four, five and six.

2.2. Background to the Citizenship Education debate

There exists an ongoing debate in Zimbabwe on introducing citizenship education in the curriculum. The first mention of the possible introduction of citizenship education actually took place in the government sanctioned study by Nziramasanga (1999). This study is widely known in Zimbabwe as 'The Nziramasanga Report'. Soon after this report was tabled, it was followed by studies from scholars such as Shizha and Kariwo (2011), Sigauke (2011a) and Tshabangu (2006). Their literature argued that citizenship

education was necessary to cope with the changes that had negatively affected the country's education and development in the last twenty years. These changes notably included the neo-liberal reforms of the 1990s and the ongoing government mismanagement of the country.

In the same period it was acknowledged by a wide number of scholars, such as Bourne (2011), Mawadza (2009) and Tonini (2005) that Zimbabwe's teachers were undergoing considerable hardships. These included personal insecurity, as they were targeted by the State security apparatus as perceived members of the political opposition. Other hardships were steadily eroding income due to the weak economy, high levels of attrition, and reduced standing in society. Shizha and Kariwo (2011) associated such issues with the de-professionalization of the teaching occupation in Zimbabwe.

Cunningham (1992) argues that teachers have an enormous impact on their pupils, which can extend over a life time. This means that they are critical to the success or failure of citizenship education. Brighouse (2006) agrees, arguing that citizenship education needs a large pool of knowledgeable and well equipped teachers, who are able to assess their pupils' work on a daily basis. Therefore, the working conditions of Zimbabwe's teachers need to be taken into account before citizenship education can even be considered. Indeed, Nziramasanga (1999) acknowledges that Zimbabwean education programmes have failed in the past due to policy makers not taking the centrality of teachers into account.

Introducing a citizenship education curriculum to Zimbabwe would entail a great deal of change to Zimbabwean high school teachers work which, as Poppleton, Williamson and Menlo (2004) note, frequently involves adding a new layer of responsibilities. Booyse and Swanepoel (2004), writing on South Africa, agree, arguing that the country's well meaning attempt to improve education ended up subjecting the teachers to too many changes, too quickly, resulting in failure. According to the two authors, failure, in part, was due to the planners not consulting or taking adequate notice of the teachers

themselves. Decisions would come from the central government, often made by people who were not involved in the teaching process. This left South African teachers feeling deceived by the education authorities who not only did not consult them on changes that affected their occupation, but also failed to give them the necessary assistance to implement these changes. Unless the conditions of Zimbabwean teachers are taken into account when plotting the way forward for Zimbabwean education, any possible future citizenship education curriculum may suffer these same problems.

Effective teaching of any subject, whether citizenship education or otherwise, partly requires well motivated and equipped teachers. The de-professionalization may hamper teachers' attempts to implement citizenship education satisfactorily. This means that even if citizenship education was introduced, it might not result in the desired benefits that its supporters hope for, due to the de-professionalization of teachers. Thus, before any changes are made in the Zimbabwean curriculum, it is necessary to address the issues of de-professionalization experienced by the ones expected to carry out the actual teaching, the teachers themselves.

While the debate on citizenship education continues in Zimbabwe, it is significant to note that there are many different interpretations of citizenship education; what exactly it is, how desirable it is and what it entails. So before discussing citizenship education, it is important to explain the contested concept of citizenship.

There is considerable literature on the nature of citizenship, and understanding its history is an important way of understanding it. Butts (1988), in Shizha and Kariwo (2011), traced the concept of citizenship to the early Greek philosophers, who viewed it as the highest moral and political role for humans, basing it on justice, freedom, equality and participation. Adler (2005) in Shizha and Kariwo (2011) and Kostakopoulou (2008) write that holding citizenship meant being part of a class in society that shared in the civic life of ruling, and being ruled in turn. According to Salisbury (1979) the traditional Greek idea of citizenship meant full participation in all facets of civil society, including what

would now be thought of as economic and social activity. It separated those with rights from those without, such as slaves.

However, the definition of citizenship was to change over the centuries until, as Salisbury (1979) notes, the American and French revolutions of the 18th century gave rise to the divorce of citizenship and civil society. This meant that the idea of citizenship was equated to participation in and control over decisions, for example, what citizens might do (vote), must do (serve on Juries) and could refuse to do (shout allegiance to leaders.). The situation led to Wilkins (2000) arguing that citizenship encompassed all members of a State, not just an elite class. It is currently, therefore, important to note that the modern idea of citizenship is often heavily contested. Salisbury (1979) and Wilkins (2000) argue that, thanks to modern empirical research on citizenship, it is now easier to identify the competing values involved in any philosophical debate concerning the role of the citizen. Where, for example, citizenship was once thought of in terms of a purely western tradition, social scientists have begun to gather, compare and contrast data from modern communities which have different views on what constitutes desirable citizenship.

Davies (2001) in Sigauke (2011a) writes that the nature of citizenship is influenced greatly by the political context and ideology of the State. In some communities, for example, the concept of a good citizen involves one who unquestioningly and uncritically accepts the status quo. This is similar to the views of Tshabangu (2006) and Wilkins (2000) who note that pupils are encouraged to conform, rather than become critically conscious participants in national decision making. Rowe (1992) concurs, observing how some models of citizenship emphasize loyalty and responsibility, while others emphasize rights or affective ability such as citizenship education which involves caring for the community.

Kostakopoulou (2008) argues that modern citizenship should consist of free and equal citizens, who are united by a shared set of values and patriotic allegiance in a quest for patriotic governance. This citizenship, the author adds, may be defined as equal

membership of a political community from which enforceable rights, obligations, benefits and resources, participatory practises and a sense of identity spring. Nziramasanga (1999) defines citizenship as a set of relations that prevail between the individual and the State or the nation and the rights, duties and responsibilities of individuals. These rights include the right to be heard, to participate in governance and a guarantee for fair treatment. This definition is echoed by Heater (1992) who claims that citizenship is an official legal recognition of the cluster of civil, political and social rights that the individual has acquired from the State. The alternative to a State founded on these principles of citizenship is a State founded on privilege or faction. This is inherently unstable as discontent, among those who do not have citizenship rights, is a danger to the cohesion of the State.

To Wilkins (2000), citizenship implies possessing an abstract sense of bonding to the concept of a State or civic order rather than to an individual. These citizens are encouraged to follow common attitudes and practises which are considered to have positive virtues that become criteria for membership of the State. They are rewarded for their conformity with certain privileges, or rights. Thus, as Salisbury (1979) posits, citizenship is partly motivated by self interest as different classes in a State co-operate for the benefits that citizenship can confer on them. To Shizha and Kariwo (2011) citizenship carries with it duties and responsibilities, demanding active participation in the activities of the community and working for peace, justice and democracy. Scholars such as Kostakopoulou (2008), Rowe (1992), Shizha and Kariwo (2011), Sigauke (2011b), Tshabangu (2006) and Wilkins (2000) generally agree that citizenship can, in the modern age, be defined as the membership of, and active participation in the activities of a community, especially the nation, State, or group of communities. It impacts on our public and private lives by shaping the way we behave, lets us know how we can live together and what we can expect from the State and what it expects of us.

This research report will take citizenship to represent a relationship, formally defined by means of a network of rules concerning rights and duties of membership, between the

individual and one or more State communities. The purpose of citizenship, according to Shizha and Kariwo (2011), Sigauke (2011a) and Tshabangu (2006), is to create a critically conscious citizen. Since citizenship is so integral to the well being of the State and the people within it (Heater, 1992), these scholars argue that educating Zimbabwean youth for citizenship maybe necessary to the well being of future generations. This brings us to the definition of citizenship education.

A. What is citizenship education?

Evans (2000), Kerr (1999), Shizha and Kariwo (2011) and Wilkins (2000) observe that the definition of citizenship education has assumed various forms overtime. It broadly encompasses preparation of young people for their roles and responsibilities through the role of education by schooling, teaching and learning. Evans (2000: 157) quotes the RT Hon Bernard Weatherill,

> "I believe that citizenship, like anything else, has to be learned. Young people do not become good citizens by accident anymore than they become good nurses or good engineers or good bus drivers or computer scientists".

It is generally agreed that citizenship education is educating pupils on how to be good citizens; the difference is on what it entails.

Internationally, the debate on what citizenship education should entail has no single school of thought. A good starting point on the concept of citizenship education would be the Crick report in modern day Britain, as discussed by Wilkins (2000). It revolves around three dimensions of what should be part of any programme of citizenship education. The first dimension concerns *social and moral responsibility* which fosters the growth of desirable personal social and moral values and behavior. Crick feels that this is an essential pre-condition of citizenship as it teaches responsibility as a political as well as moral virtue. The second dimension is *community involvement*. This encourages pupils

to develop civic responsibilities and political skills necessary for involvement in their community. Finally, there is the dimension of *political literacy,* which means teaching pupils awareness of the broad nature of democracy, the institutions of government and role of community organization.

Sigauke (2011b) also describes three possible types of citizenship education. Firstly, *education for citizenship,* a compound of factual knowledge and applied skills and values, which focuses on developing skills and values for active citizenship, but only for adulthood. Secondly, *education about citizenship,* which stresses the knowledge of political systems: the structures, processes and history of the system. Kerr (2003) in Sigauke (2011b), comments, though, that this is a narrow approach to citizenship education as it does not empower learners directly, but treats them as citizens in waiting. Finally, Sigauke (2011b) mentions *education through citizenship.* This involves experiential learning through involvement in school and community activities, where knowledge and skills learnt during practise are immediately put to use, and learners also critically debate issues they learn. Nziramasanga (1999) argues that the discipline should broadly cover teaching morality, heritage, the constitution, government branches and the working of parliament, national identity and activities, legal education, local governance and international understanding.

Wilkins (2000) and Tshabangu (2006) are in agreement that citizenship education can take very specific approaches. Tshabangu (2006) argues that there are two noticeable tendencies in citizenship education. The first is passive non-questioning and deferring to the status quo, and the second is active, responsible and critical of institutional arrangements. Wilkins (2000) concurs, but separates the approaches into three tendencies. The first is *conforming*, that is following traditions that uphold the current order. This is similar to Tshabangu's (2006) passive non-questioning stance. The second is *reforming;* this is a more analytic and critical form of citizenship education and it recognizes conflict and ambiguity in society. It aims to reform society by encouraging individual understanding of matters like knowledge and prejudice. The third is *transforming* where

the aim is not simply understanding but empowering of the citizen to change their material circumstances.

Sigauke (2011b) relates how a distinction is made between citizenship education that empowers the learner, and indoctrination, where the learner uncritically accepts ideas from the teacher and is not given an opportunity to think for him or herself. Indoctrination is useful for those in political power who seek to prevent questioning of the status quo. In contrast genuine citizenship education develops critical thinking skills. Sigauke (2011b) adds that genuine citizenship education also involves teaching and learning about social and moral responsibilities, involvement in the community and about political literacy.

In conclusion, from studying these arguments, it is clear that interpretations of citizenship education are many and varied depending on the role that those who would implement it envision for it. It is argued by Evans (2000) that citizenship education has both minimal and maximal interpretations. Minimal interpretations are when the pupil is taught only basic institutionalized rules concerning rights and obligations. Maximal interpretations are where education develops critical and reflective abilities, independence of thought on social issues and capacities for active participation in social and political processes.

Since there is no plan in Zimbabwe, at the time of research, to implement any kind of citizenship education by the authorities, this report will work under the assumption that any future citizenship education curriculum will have maximal interpretations. This is where the pupils are not only taught about the workings of the government, community and the wider world, but actively encouraged to participate in government. The next sub-section will discuss the value that teaching citizenship education may have for Zimbabwe.

2.3. The Potential Value of Citizenship Education to Zimbabwe

Having established a broad understanding of what citizenship and citizenship education are, this section examines the potential to introduce citizenship education in Zimbabwe. It explores the possible benefits that citizenship education could bring to alleviate Zimbabwe's educational problems, by scholars such as Shizha and Kariwo (2011) and Sigauke (2011a). The section also includes arguments on 'why' citizenship education should be introduced in Zimbabwe.

Rowe (1992), for example, observes that formal citizenship is just one of the many kinds of community membership that people experience. Knowledge gained in one community is partly transferable to others. Thus, knowledge gained from the school community can be applied to the State community, allowing the education of better citizens. Schools make excellent training grounds for citizenship education. This is because they have much in common with State communities, due to the demands that they place on their members and the way they function. Both school and State have value systems, linked to their purpose and role, as well as power structures, and rules linked to a justice system. They have citizens or subjects exhibiting different degrees of loyalty to the community and are affected by disaffected elements that cannot be discarded. They may take steps to reduce alienation by engendering a sense of community pride, shared purpose and values and encouraging a feeling that all their members matter.

Salisbury (1979) echoes Rowe's (1992) sentiments, seeing participation in citizenship as a way of acquiring power to re-allocate society's resources. To exclude or discourage any group from participation will severely deprive that group of its share of public policy benefits. Brighouse (2006) argues that citizenship education can be used to inculcate patriotism which benefits the nation by teaching pupils various traits useful to society, namely:

A. *Obligation*, the idea that people have a duty to their fellow citizen and are more likely to discharge these duties if they are taught a sense of national obligation.

B. Sense of *solidarity* that helps people make the sacrifices necessary to achieve and maintain a just distribution of liberties, opportunities and resources in society.
C. *Citizenship,* feelings which benefit the State, as people who identify with their compatriots will find it easier to develop and exercise the traits of good citizenship. It will be easier for them to modify their demands with reason if they acknowledge that they are arguing with people they can identify with, and finally
D. *Flourishing,* which involves identification with a particular place and its people. It is an important part of human flourishing, when people grow as human beings.

Nziramasanga (1999: 319) recommends that citizenship education be at the centre of the twenty-first century education curriculum, in order to counter the problems in Zimbabwean society, stated as follows,

> "Vandalism, violence and ill discipline in our schools are a result of a lack of values, relevant ethics, morals, individual and collective responsibilities for protecting property and valuing human life".

The author envisages that citizenship education would create good citizens who conform to certain accepted practises and the local norm and carry out all civic duties and responsibilities. These include paying taxes, defending the nation and protecting both private and public property. It would be expected to develop patriotism, obedience to legitimate authority and respect for other citizens' views on various social, economic and political issues.

Shizha and Kariwo (2011) argue that citizenship education could be a tool for building or developing citizens into active participants in society by educating them on the basic concepts of democratic participation, accountability and leadership at various levels of society. It would serve to dispel apathy, fear and intolerance that have become prevalent in Zimbabwe. Adler (2005) in Shizha and Kariwo (2011) writes that citizenship is, in fact,

the primary political office, with the citizens as the de facto permanent rulers while those elected or appointed are merely transient. Therefore, Zimbabwean citizens need to be taught how to manage their nation.

Shizha and Kariwo (2011: 107) argue as follows

> "In Zimbabwe civic education has to become a strategic necessity if democracy is going to take root once a democratic political environment is achieved".

They further argue that the benefits of citizenship education would give teachers, pupils and general society a critical consciousness to actively engage in their liberation from the chains of poverty and oppression which are controlled by the political elite. It is also possible that citizenship education could be used to build democratic institutions in countries. Therefore it is important that pupils are properly educated in citizenship.

Sigauke (2011a) also posits that the voices of young people and their thoughts need to be incorporated in policy development in Zimbabwe, if policies are to empower learners. Rowe (1992), like Heater (1992), agrees that if an individual wishes to be a citizen, he or she must learn how the government works; it would be dangerous to neglect citizenship education and let pupils pick up inaccurate views about politics and legal affairs from unreliable sources. Both Sutherland (2001) and Rowe (1992) hold the view that citizenship education is necessary because it develops more adequate knowledge of government structures, formal rights of citizens, international organizations and relationships. This is echoed by Heater (1990, 104) in Wilkins (2000) who argues that,

> "All liberal/Social democracies require critically aware citizens in order to operate effectively, and this need for a sophisticated, politically literate citizenry, is complemented by the skills and outlook encouraged by an education system whereby students are taught to question rather than obey, experiment rather than learn by rote".

Rowe (1992) further states that young secondary school pupils are part of a complex society and it could be argued that they have a right to information on its essential elements. If they are denied this then, due to their youth and inexperience, they may be prone to be exploitation and victimization. A lack of legal awareness may lead to people not being aware of their rights and even inculcate fears of the legal system that exists to serve them. If teenagers are trained, from secondary school onwards, on their rights and responsibilities as citizens then there would be fewer cases of citizens being abused or misinformed.

Evans (2000) stresses that becoming a citizen can be seen as more than acquiring civil status, rights and obligations; it requires the youth to exercise responsibility and social contribution. Rowe (1992) agrees, writing that citizens should have the right understanding skills, and exercise an element of control over those in power. Tshabangu (2006: 57) argues that the notion that children are subjects and not active citizens as they pass through school needs revisiting. The author says,

> "Educating towards responsible citizens explores the notion children have a sacred moral and legal right to be active participants in the search for solutions to the problems bedeviling their world of existence".

Brighouse (2006) adds that, even if a child may not automatically gain from citizenship education, society can if there is a critical mass of well functioning civilians who can bring the country democracy and economic development. The author further argues that as individuals, we share the State with other nationals whom we can render vulnerable to our decisions. Therefore, we are obliged to help them meet us, as equals. This is especially true for poor citizens of poor countries who are especially vulnerable to the decisions of others and lack the protection available to poor citizens in rich countries. Rowe (1992) agrees, stating that citizenship, both as a legal status and a service, relies ultimately on the citizen as a moral agent. Thus, Zimbabweans could learn their

responsibilities to fellow citizens who are less fortunate than themselves, from citizenship education.

There are some arguments against the introduction of citizenship education. Wilkins (2000) notes that some people view politics as an adult study, unsuited to young people as it can only be truly understood by actual engagement in it. Politician Nick Tate, in Brighouse (2006: 100), argues that citizenship education is considered by some to be open to political manipulation. This is because children are open to heightened emotions and indoctrination. He states,

> "There was such a widespread association between national identity, patriotism, nationalism, xenophobia and racism that it was impossible to talk about the first two without being accused of all the rest."

This is echoed by Sutherland (2001) who writes about how the issue of citizenship education has caused discord among British educators in the past, possibly due to memories of Nazi authoritarianism, which was reinforced by a form of citizenship education. Wilkins (2000) agrees that citizenship education can be abused to maintain unfair conditions instead of improving the right of the citizen. Shizha and Kariwo (2011) give the example of 19th century Britain, which practised a kind of citizenship education that trained the children of the wealthy for leadership, whilst training the lower classes to be obedient workers. Thus, the ruling party in Zimbabwe could attempt to use citizenship education to reinforce its position rather than to teach pupils how to be responsible citizens.

Heater (1992) notes that some educators fear that there may be dangers in the demand for rights that most forms of citizenship education advocate. The author argues that whole clusters of rights granted in a constitution might result in political discontent among the populace if they can't be satisfied. Rowe (1992) concurs, noting that where citizens feel

themselves to have less access than others to the benefits of the State, they are less likely to feel a sense of shared identity, and social bonding will soon weaken.

Brighouse (2006) agrees that the use of citizenship education for purposes other than raising a responsible citizen is a concern. The researcher posits that since the education system is an agent of the State, the government can use the system to distort history and produce sentiments in the population that are designed to win consent for it. Tshabangu (2006) and Wilkins (2000) also argue that, as education for citizenship is about access and empowerment, it would result in critical citizenry. This would create a potential threat for a political establishment driven by a desire to maintain stability and a grip on power, as critical citizens may limit their power. Heater (1992) notes that the State can also withdraw the rights of citizenship from those who fall foul of it, which they could use against those who attempt to exercise their citizenship rights. This may bring political pressure to bear against teaching citizenship education.

The Zimbabwean government commissioning of the Nziramasanga Report of 1999 may sound admirable. However, Sigauke (2011b) holds a different interpretation of its intentions and findings. This relatively tame document could be perceived as a way that the government wishes to use citizenship education to enforce the status quo rather than create critically conscious citizens. Sigauke (2011b) points out that although the presidential commission consisted of twelve members of various backgrounds, all were selected by the president. Such a situation may have brought a potential bias in the commission, as the members may not have been free of pro-government leanings. It is unlikely, though, that any government would actively encourage people to question it. Given the ZANU PF government's history of trying to subvert citizenship ideals, Sigauke (2011b) suggests fears that the government might create a citizenship education curriculum whose underlying motives are to silence the youth are justified.

It is argued by Shizha and Kariwo (2011), Tshabangu (2006) and Sigauke (2011a), that Zimbabwe should adopt a citizenship curriculum, which would foster a democratic

dispensation. Such a curriculum would promote knowledge that empowers the future leaders of Zimbabwe. Nziramasanga (1999), however, seems to advocate that citizenship education should be about conformity and compliance. The author, for example, argues that children should conform to certain accepted practises, and hold certain beliefs. The implication here is that a pupil who challenges conformity is a bad citizen. Such an assumption could raise dangers that the government may view citizenship education as a tool to indoctrinate the youth.

According to Sigauke (2011b), the Nziramasanga Report, which was commissioned and sponsored by the ZANU PF government, seems to suggest that it is an inclusive study, as it uses terms like 'we' and 'our', while the youth are described as 'they'. It also suggests that the 'people' were the ones airing this view to protect 'our' democracy, despite the fact that only a few presidential appointees compiled the report and the opinions of large swathes of the population were ignored. Thus, the State may claim to be democratic, but not practise universally practised democratic principles. Tshabangu (2006) argues that this has narrowed the governmental definition of citizenship education down to a pro ZANU PF outlook, of passive, non-questioning deference to the status quo policy, rather than the production of critically conscious citizenry.

Nziramasanga (1999) argues that globalisation and foreign influence are corrupting young people and, therefore, activists should not have free access to pupils. This way schools need not adopt foreign perspectives on human rights ideology wholesale. Yet knowledge of alternate systems of government and the world beyond the State is considered a key component of any decent citizenship education by Shizha and Kariwo (2011) and Sigauke (2011b).

On the matter of pupil behaviour, Nziramasanga (1999) claims that Zimbabwean youths are anti-social and lack knowledge of, or interest in, citizenship education. This assertion has been refuted by Sigauke (2011a) whose research shows that most of the pupils he interviewed possessed substantial knowledge of citizenship issues. Sigauke (2011a)

argues that the 'vandalism and anti-social behaviour' complained of, is actually about pupils exercising their civic duties and rights, for example, the demonstrations at the University of Zimbabwe against increased tuition fees. It is the government that, rather than acknowledge that it is their right to feel concerned on matters that directly affect them, seeks instead to suppress their civic activities.

Furthermore, Tshabangu's (2006) study in Zimbabwe of pupils' written comments found that they had a great deal of knowledge of issues affecting the school, like torn textbooks or an empty library. Yet pupils are not consulted on a wide range of issues, such as learning, management and social activities. Sigauke (2011a) asked pupils how often they trusted the State monopolized electronic media and it was revealed that two thirds of them did not trust the media and only sometimes trusted local councils. Further, two thirds never trusted political parties. Sigauke (2011a) also noted that more younger pupils trusted these institutions than older ones, suggesting that pupils grow more jaded and distant from citizenship ideals as they grow more experienced. This fits in with Schlee's (2011) argument that a climate of fear, powerlessness and humiliation has taken over, in most Zimbabweans, causing them to exhibit distrust of all policy-makers.

Zimbabwe's former ruling party, ZANU PF, tried to introduce a kind of quasi-citizenship education program in the early 21st century, called the National Youth Service (NYS). Shizha and Kariwo (2011) describe this program as a heinous attempt to introduce citizenship education that taught the children that their allegiance was to the party, not the country, and encouraged violence and persecution of citizens who did not adequately toe the official line. The end effect of the government's attempts at citizenship education is that, currently, people do not see themselves as citizens with rights safeguarded by the State but, as Wilkins (2000) suggests, subjects of a consortium.

From the data gathered on the debate on citizenship education, this report argues that it is indeed desirable to introduce citizenship education to Zimbabwe's education system. Provided that it is dedicated to,

> "The development of pupils into good citizens who are aware of how their country is run, how the social political and economic institutions function and what their role in the scheme of life is."

as suggested by Shizha and Kariwo (2011: 111). Before even starting to plan for such a citizenship education curriculum, however, the question arises as to how it could be successfully implemented under Zimbabwean teachers' current conditions. This brings us to the main issue of this research; can citizenship education be meaningful in Zimbabwe given the de-professionalization of teachers?

2.4. The De-professionalization of Teachers and its Consequences

A. What is de-professionalization?

Defining de-professionalization is complicated by the fact that there is no consensus on what exactly professionalization entails, among education critics. It is first necessary to define three terms; profession, professional and professionalization. Ingersoll and Merrill (2011) write that sociologists have to be careful to differentiate professionalization and de-professionalization. Professionalization refers to the degree to which occupations exhibit the structural or sociological attributes, characteristics and criteria identified with the professional model. Professionalism, on the other hand, is when the individual is not an amateur and is committed to a career and public service. This report concerns itself with professionalization, not professionalism. Though there are large variations between and within traditional professions like law or medicine in the degree to which they exhibit these models, they are usually regarded as the best examples of the professional model. As will be discussed later in this review, teaching is widely not seen as having a professional status.

A profession is thus an occupation which bares the attributes of professionalization, but what these attributes consist of is contested. To some scholars, Ingersoll and Merrill (2011) observe, the essence of a profession is advanced training. Therefore, to professionalize a career like teaching, it is necessary to upgrade teacher skills and knowledge through professional development. For others, professionalization lies in the attitudes individual practitioners hold towards their work. Therefore, the best way to professionalize their work is to instill a sense of professionalism through the ethos of public service and high standards. Others feel that the focus is on the organizational conditions under which teachers work. So to professionalize an occupation like teaching one must improve their working conditions.

Shizha and Kariwo (2011) posit that the conditions of the professional have changed from being a free practitioner in a market of services to that of a salaried specialist in a large organization. It is still something to be defended or to be obtained by occupations in a different historical context, in radically difficult work settings, and in radically altered forms of practise. To Ingersoll and Merrill (2011), professionals are considered experts in whom substantial authority is vested, and professions are marked by a degree of self governance. Sachs (2001) describes professional identity as a set of externally described characteristics used to differentiate one group from another, that are imposed on the profession by either outsiders or members.

According to Ingersoll and Merrill (2011), while there is considerable debate on what professionalization is, most sociologists have developed a series of organizational and occupation characteristics associated with professions and professionals. These include rigorous training and licensing requirements, positive working conditions, an active professional organization or association, substantial work place authority, relatively high compensation, and prestige.

Unfortunately, scholars such as Bennell (2004), Chataa (2010), Ingersoll and Merrill (2011), Sachs (2001) and Shizha and Kariwo (2011) argue that teachers worldwide are

falling far short of most of these credentials for being professionalized. In most cases, their conditions are often worsening in such a way that they are considered to be undergoing de-professionalization. Teferra and Skauge (2006) agree that the status of teachers has decreased over the years due to poor work environment and absence of opportunities for self improvement. Teaching has lost its lustre from once being one of the most respected jobs, to the point where most qualified school leavers prefer more profitable work or overseas careers to joining the education system. As Bennell (2004) argues, occupations that have achieved professional status tend to share the following characteristics which I will discuss individually:

1. A high level of education and training based on a unique and specialised body of knowledge

Bennell (2004) argues that one of the major symptoms of de-professionalization is the heterogeneity in educational attainment and professional training. Ingersoll and Merrill (2011) state that the most important qualities distinguishing professions from other occupations may be the degree of expertise and complexity involved in their work. These are not easily acquired and held. For this reason professions are often called ‘knowledge based’ occupations. Bennell (2004) and Chataa (2010) note that in most Lower Income Countries (LICs) the teaching occupation's members have very diverse credentials, often ranging from primary school to post-tertiary education. This means that they cannot boast the same high level of education or cohesiveness as traditional occupations such as law or medicine, weakening their claims to being a profession.

Chataa (2010) adds that, in the past, in most African countries, teachers were considered to have access to information that no one else had and they were respected for it. But as Craig (1990) points out, education expansion often saw them lose their monopoly on knowledge and literacy, the characteristics which gave them their highly regarded position in society during the colonial era. Chataa (2010) concurs with this assessment,

claiming that the teaching profession has no unique body of knowledge of which they can boast, unlike medicine or architecture.

In terms of education levels, Manguvo et al (2011) has shown that Zimbabwe's certified teachers actually dropped in number to about 50% at government schools, from 2005 to 2008. This has left a lot of unqualified personnel to teach Zimbabwean pupils, contributing to the de-professionalization of teaching. Heystek (2010) concludes that teachers who do not provide quality education cannot be treated as professionals or be protected by unions. This sentiment argues against Zimbabwean teachers being considered as having professional status.

2. A strong ideal of public service and an enforced code of conduct and high levels of respect from the public.

Traditionally, Ingersoll and Merrill (2011) hold that while prestige and status can be difficult to assess, compared to salary or power, public perceptions can be measured. The occupations considered as professions, by the public, are usually granted high prestige and status. Unfortunately, scholars such Bennell (2004), Chataa (2010) and Shizha and Kariwo (2011) argue that the teaching occupation in most LICs have little public respect.

Shizha and Kariwo (2011) have documented the intimidation, harassment, detention, arrests, torture and the unprecedented unleashing of State security agents on the schools. The treatment meted out to Zimbabwean teachers has been one where they are despised by their own employer. Nziramasanga (1999) and Women of Zimbabwe Arise (WOZA) (2010a) accuse teachers of poor work ethic. WOZA (2010b) perceives teachers as being greedy and not working hard in spite of the incentives that they receive. Nziramasanga (1999) recorded public accusations of teachers' absenteeism, drunkenness and sexual relations with pupils, as there were poor disciplinary mechanisms to stop them. Such are not the signs of a well respected profession.

3. Registration and regulation by the profession itself.

Ingersoll and Merrill (2011) argue that the rationale behind professionalization is to place substantial levels of control into the hands of experts. This allows them to exert substantial control over the curriculum, admissions and accreditation of professional training schools, as well as to set and enforce behavioural and ethical standards for practitioners. This protects the interests of the public by assuring it that practitioners have agreed upon levels of intelligence, by filtering those with substandard qualities. It also ensures that lay people cannot practise illegally even if they acquired the necessary complex skills.

Another widespread assertion that has been made is that teaching does not regulate itself to the same degree as medicine or law. Chataa (2010) observes that it cannot close off its membership as it does not have control over its own credentials and the government decides on membership. In many African countries, due to the expansion of education and the scarcity of teachers, governments can hire unqualified teachers who can even be hired permanently; teachers have no power or say over who the government hires. Furthermore, Bennell (2004) comments that, since teaching is a mass occupation, it is difficult to exclude others, especially where teachers' unions are weak. Ingersoll and Merrill (2011) note that teachers in secondary school often teach subjects they did not major in during their training, contributing to de-professionalization.

In Zimbabwe's case, as Sigauke (2011b) writes, the Nziramasanga Report goes as far as suggesting that teachers should go through a compulsory staff development program. This ignores the difficulties this would place on an already beleaguered occupation. It also ignores the democratic right of choice, and this further disempowers teachers' rights over their own occupation. Clore (2003) writes that in addition, many teachers and pupils have been forced by government to attend 're-education camps' by the Zimbabwean. These teach lessons that centre on a narrow party-oriented history of the country,

including the formation of the ruling party, ZANU PF and why this party deserves to remain in power. Clearly the profession does not regulate itself.

4. Trusted to act in the client's best interests within a framework of accountability.

Bennell (2004) holds that, since teaching is considered an occupation of last resort among pupils, it would be unrealistic to expect them to act in the client's, the pupils they are entrusted to teach, best interests. As Welsh (2009: 4) notes,

> "The notion that anyone can teach is pure myth. No matter how much one may know or how altruistic one maybe, some people are just temperamentally unsuited to teach and are toxic for kids. The problem is that it is difficult to identify those types."

It can be thus argued that people who enter the teaching, not by choice but because alternative forms of employment are unavailable, may be unsuited to teach. Therefore they may be unwilling or able to act in the pupils' best interests.

WOZA (2010b) reveals that public trust in teaching has fallen substantially in Zimbabwe. Many members of the public, the 'clients' of the teachers, seem to feel that teachers are not producing quality work, lack commitment and discipline in spite of the incentives or top ups on salaries. The status of teachers has been further eroded by a large proportion of untrained teachers entering the system to make up for the shortfall in teaching staff, and this has lowered the occupation even more. Shizha and Kariwo (2011) state that by 2011, out of the 75 000 teachers in Zimbabwe only around 40 000 were actually qualified. Chataa (2010) opines that teachers in sub-Saharan Africa have also affected their own status negatively through drinking, indulging in love affairs and impregnating their learners. Such behavior has revealed a lack of accountability and provided reasons for loss of respectability and trust from the public.

5. A supportive working environment.

Ingersoll and Merrill (2011) argue that, beyond pre-service training and induction, professions also need ongoing in- service technical development and growth on the part of practitioners throughout their careers. A supportive working environment is based on the assumption that achieving a professional level mastery of complex skills and knowledge is a prolonged and continuous process that must be continually updated as the body of knowledge and skills grows.

Zimbabwean teachers, however, are shown to live and work in conditions of high stress. Manguvo et al (2011), Mawadza (2009) and Shizha and Kariwo (2011) write that Zimbabwean teachers face a distinct shortage of educational materials, large workloads, political interference, and pupil ill discipline, all for very low pay.

6. Similar levels of compensation as other professions.

Bennell (2004) and Eggers and Calegari (2011) argue that a profession should be able to match the income of other professions at a near similar level as others that have the same qualifications. The lengthy training and complexity of learning should result in relatively high compensation, to recruit and retain capable, motivated individuals. Professionals are typically well compensated and are provided with relatively high salary and benefits in their careers. Teaching, however, has become well known for its low level of pay.

Eggers and Calegari (2011) point out that teachers in the USA made 14% less than other professions requiring a similar level of qualifications. This results in 62% of teachers working outside of class to make ends meet and college leavers usually preferring to join other professions. Sawchuk (2012) argues that teaching is increasingly seen as a second choice profession, beneath capacity of talented individuals. The low level of Zimbabwean teachers' compensation has been remarked on by Mawadza (2009), Manguvo et al (2011), Shizha and Kariwo (2011) and WOZA (2010a).

Bennell (2004) posits that regardless of status most teachers in most countries have never enjoyed full professional status. Ingersoll and Merrill (2011) argue that if we assume professionalization attracts capable recruits to an occupation, fosters their expertise and commitment and ultimately provides assurance to the public of quality service, then teaching does not have that standing. Both Bennell (2004) and Ingersoll and Merrill (2011) have found teaching to be semi-professional at best.

As mentioned before, it is the teachers themselves who will be required to carry out any changes to the curriculum in any future attempt to implement citizenship education. Therefore, their conditions and experiences should play an important role in any decision making if Zimbabwean authorities ever attempt to craft a citizenship education curriculum. This section of the literature review will discuss the factors that Shizha and Kariwo (2011) identify as symptoms of teacher de-professionalization in Zimbabwe. These are: teachers' motivation and job/career satisfaction in Zimbabwe, teachers and the economy, and teacher attrition. In light of this report's interests, I have included a sub-section, namely teacher pedagogy and the curriculum, as teaching citizenship education would involve heavy changes to this.

2.5. The Symptoms of Teacher De-professionalization in Zimbabwe

A. Low teacher motivation and job/career satisfaction

George et al (2008), Seco (2002), Shizha and Kariwo (2011) Suryanarayana and Luciana (2010) and Wexly and Yukl (1984) have all agreed that job satisfaction, which is the degree to which employees are satisfied with their working conditions, is important to employees. It affects employee variables like turnover, absence, age, occupation and size of the organization. Shizha and Kariwo (2011) have argued that happy, satisfied employees, who feel that they are making a positive contribution and are valued by their employer, tend to work harder and are less likely to engage in secondary activities to

supplement their incomes. George et al (2008) and Rosenholtz and Simpson (1990) found that a lack of job satisfaction led to aggressive behaviour towards colleagues and learners, early exits from the teaching occupation and psychological withdrawal from work. Some teachers may remain at their work place, but do minimum work.

In Zimbabwe, according to Chireshe and Shumba (2011), Kusereka (2003) and Shizha and Kariwo (2011), teachers experience poor motivation and job satisfaction. This is because of two main reasons. Firstly, teachers deemed by ZANU PF to be sympathetic to the opposition party, the MDC, are subjected to intimidation, beatings and kidnappings, despite their importance to the education of the youth. Secondly, Chireshe and Shumba (2011), Kusereka (2003), Manguvo et al (2011) and Shizha and Kariwo (2011) have shown that most Zimbabwean teachers are not highly motivated due to inadequate working conditions, heavy workloads, unavailability of transport and low pay. This poor motivation and job satisfaction has manifested itself in an unwillingness to participate in school activities, poor attendance, absenteeism, late coming, uncreative and unstimulating teaching which is partly responsible for the poor performance, and ill discipline of pupils.

B. Teachers and the economy

International Institute for Educational Planning (IIEP) (2010) recognises that, while teachers are motivated to do their work by success in the classroom, working conditions and respect of the occupation, it is the teacher's pay that is the critical factor. Fredriksson (2004) writes that it is crucial that they have a good salary as low wages and poor working conditions feed corruption. Bennell and Akyeampong (2007) also show that teachers who live near or below the poverty datum line are believed to be more at risk from AIDS and family members getting AIDS. Chivore (1988) and WOZA (2010a) and Mawadza (2009), Shizha and Kariwo (2011) have shown that Zimbabwean teachers are experiencing reduced compensation for their work due to years of the country’s economic hardship.

Bennell and Akyeampong (2007), Caillods and Postlethwaite (1989) and IIEP (2010) comment that where economic conditions are difficult, teachers tend to engage in 'survival activities' to earn extra income, especially when faced with an unrealistically large work-load and large classes, for low pay. Shizha and Kariwo (2011) confirm that the conditions in Zimbabwe have led to many teachers not attending classes as they try to make ends meet by supplementing their meager salaries, through survival activities or going on strike.

C. Teacher attrition

Grossman (2009: 3) writing on the staffing of the United States of America's education system, comments that for any education system to work well,

> "We need to attract a highly capable work force, devise better systems to support teachers in their first years on the job, create conditions that keep highly effective ones in the classroom".

In agreement, Brighouse (2006) adds that citizenship education needs a large pool of teachers, who are able to assess their pupils' work daily, and are well equipped and knowledgeable in the necessary subjects. Yet teacher attrition, the rate at which teachers leave the occupation for retirement, join other careers or migrate to work in other countries, is one of the symptoms of de-professionalization noted by Shizha and Kariwo (2011) in Zimbabwe. As early as 1993, Gould (1993) commented that poor facilities and the rise of new employment options considered better than teaching have led to it being seen more as a stepping stone to other careers, than a respectable, life- long occupation.

The problem of teacher attrition has been noted in Zimbabwe for many years now. According to Nziramasanga (1999) and Shizha and Kariwo (2011), the high rate of

attrition of teachers has led to the government engaging untrained teachers. This, in turn, has led to difficulty in retaining better qualified and more experienced teachers in the profession, and an uneven distribution of quality teachers in schools. Bennell (2004) argues a high attrition rate affects teacher standing in the community negatively as they come and go too quickly to develop relations with the community. By 2009, Mawadza (2009) reported that this has negatively affected education as when teachers leave their school without replacement, it disrupts their pupils' lessons.

D. Teacher pedagogy and curriculum

One of the biggest problems experienced by teachers is the high pupil to teacher ratio, described by IIEP as the average number of pupils per teacher in an education system. Bennell and Akyeampong (2007), Gould (1993), Machingaidze et al (1998) and Nziramasanga (1999) argue that the introduction of free primary education in sub-Saharan Africa has resulted in very large classes. This has necessitated more demanding school management which has increased the teacher workload. Within the classrooms themselves, Chataa (2010) argues that teachers have also lost power over their pupils, are no longer accountable solely to their superiors, but to the school parents as well. This has lost them authority and status in the eyes of their pupils and the parents.

Tshabangu (2006) notes that Zimbabwe does have subjects at secondary-school level like Education for a Living, Guidance and Counseling, and Aids Education. Unfortunately, they are not taught in most schools and where they are taught they are often inhibited due to weak delivery in the classroom, apathy, lack of knowledge and skills, and psychological impact at personal level. Nziramasanga (1999) and WOZA (2010a) criticize the quality of teaching provided, which has left out vocational subjects and emphasized quantity over quality of education. Tshabangu (2006) has called this 'teaching the syllabus as opposed to teaching the children', which grants a low level education that has left most students unable to gain employment.

In addition to the importance of school teachers to citizenship education, Brighouse (2006), Cunningham (1992) Nziramasanga (1999), Rowe (1992) and Shizha and Kariwo (2011) draw attention to another important factor in the success or failure of teacher pedagogy; informal education. According to Nziramasanga (1999), African culture stresses, that it takes a whole community to raise a child with the proper ideals of citizenship education, and both teachers and parents have to work together to ensure success. Unfortunately, Manguvo et al (2011) and Tshabangu (2006) mention how high levels of child abuse, child headed families and AIDS orphans have left teachers trying to deal with pupils who suffer despair and disillusionment without community support.

2.6. Summary

The objective of this report revolves around whether citizenship education can be meaningful in Zimbabwe given teacher de-professionalization. In order to establish a background for this, it was necessary to divide the literature review into two parts. The first part of the literature review defined citizenship and citizenship education, which encompasses teaching pupils to be good citizens. There were, however, differences in opinion on what being a good citizen should entail. Citizenship education was revealed to have many possible benefits that may eliminate Zimbabwe's problems.

The second part of the literature review showed that Zimbabwean teachers are currently experiencing the symptoms of de-professionalization. This has been shown to have a profound impact on the teachers' ability to teach their pupils satisfactorily. Chapter four will describe, from the informants' data, how Zimbabwean high school teachers say they have experienced de-professionalization. Chapter five will argue that teachers are unable to teach citizenship education satisfactorily due to de-professionalization, as asserted by Shizha and Kariwo (2011). However, it will also argue that there are other factors which may render attempts to teach citizenship education meaningless and unproductive.

3 CHAPTER THREE: METHODOLOGY

3.1. Introduction

This chapter discusses the methods that I used in order to ensure that the evidence obtained answered the main question as unambiguously as possible and provides the information by which the validity of the Study is judged (de Vaus, 2001). The main question was ‘Can citizenship education be meaningful in Zimbabwe, given the de-professionalization of teachers?’ The methodology normally explains why specific procedures are used, justifying the design and explaining the analysis of the data. It will have enough information to ensure that the Study can be repeated by others successfully, as prescribed by Kallet (2004). Finally, the chapter will discuss the limitations of the Study, as well as the ethical considerations that were observed.

3.2. The Research Design

As noted by Kombo and Tromp (2009) and Best and Khan (1993) the research design serves to structure the research, it is the 'glue' that holds all the parts of the research report together. This section focuses on this report’s research design, showing how the researcher obtained answers to the research question ‘Can citizenship education be meaningful in Zimbabwe given the de-professionalization of teachers?’

I was presented with two methods, to assist me in obtaining the data. The first was through the use of quantitative data. Quantitative research methods use investigation and application to gather data, and they have a distinctive numeric nature. They gather data by using the survey method, which is usually in the form of a questionnaire administered on a large group of people, to draw conclusions (Greenstein et al, 2004). However, I elected to use the other method, the qualitative research method. This involves findings

gathered, not in the form of statistics, but as details on people's lives or interactions, to answer the question (Strauss and Corbin, 1990).

Qualitative research methods are used to produce inductive data, without using statistical analysis, and are often used in focus groups and interviews. They concern themselves with an in depth understanding of human behaviour, and investigate the how and why of decision making. Later, they categorise data into patterns, as the primary basis for organizing and reporting results. It is for this reason that they use smaller and focussed samples.

Qualitative research further emphasises words rather than quantification in the collection and analysis of data (Bryman, 2004). I chose to use phenomenological research methods, which seeks to describe the lived experience of the individual, to illuminate the specific, to identify phenomena through how they are perceived by the actors in a situation (Lester, 1999). In this case the actors are the teachers who were interviewed and took part in the focus group meetings.

This qualitative research method suited my report as I wished to base my data on the personal views of Zimbabwean high school teachers. Unlike in quantitative research methods, there are no pre-set answers to questions, which are left open-ended. The qualitative research methods, therefore, allow probing of responses, and their open-ended questions are more specific. Thus, I had the latitude to probe relevant information more thoroughly than a written questionnaire would have allowed. Closed questions would not have let me probe the informants' knowledge as effectively as open-ended.

Unfortunately, qualitative methods also generate a large amount of data that can overwhelm novice and even experienced researchers. Transcribing the data can be time consuming, as an important part of qualitative data analysis consists of reducing data by examining, categorising, tabulating or otherwise recombining it (Rabiee, 2004).

Qualitative analysis can be difficult, unlike the structured borders to be found in quantitative research. Thus a researcher can reap illogical input and inconsistencies, and sieving through this can take hours of work (Roller, 2011). To overcome this problem, I enlisted the help of a transcriber.

Roller (2011) and Sofaer (1999) comment that some scholars decry qualitative methods as inherently biased, because the methods and analyses depend so much on the perspective and skills of the researcher. Conscious of this I, therefore, used the literature review as the guide for methods and analysis. Thus, I will describe the phenomena, the opinions and experiences of high school teachers in Zimbabwe, and use them to explain whether or not citizenship education can be meaningful, given the de-professionalization of teachers.

3.3. Population and Sampling.

The population, according to scholars such as Borg and Gall (1983) Kombo and Tromp (2009) and Wiersma (2000) is the set of all the members of a particular group of people to whom the findings of the Study can be generalised. In the case of this report, the population involves all the high school teachers of Zimbabwe. It is, however, impossible to interview every high school teacher in Zimbabwe, therefore, I had to identify the portion of the population accessible in the available time and with the resources at hand (Ary et al, 1972).

Kombo and Tromp (2009) and Punch (2000) describe sampling as the procedure by which a researcher gathers peoples, places or things to study. Samples are always sub-sets or small parts of the total number that could be studied. In the case of the current research, the sub-set came from the population of teachers working at urban high schools in Zimbabwe. This sample, a small section of the population to be studied, was selected from the high school teachers of two high schools of Gweru Urban District. Gweru is the third largest city in Zimbabwe and it is situated in the centre of the country. From the

accessible population, the sample was selected in such a way as to be representative of the population of Zimbabwean high school teachers (Ary et al, 1972). I visited the heads of school and persuaded them, by guaranteeing anonymity, to let me ask their teachers questions for my research.

Castillo (2009), Borg and Gall (1983) and Leedy (1993) all note that sampling is useful, for it is normally impossible to question every single character in a population. Castillo (2009), however, also notes that sampling limits generalization and may cause systematic bias. Due to the nature of this Study, which is qualitative, systematic bias is not an issue as the informants' experiences cannot be measured. This Study does not generate representative data for generalisations, but elicits the specific views of those teachers who participate in the Study and, thus, gain a ground level view of their experiences. Tolonen et al (2002) add that a target population sample should include the geographical area covered by the target group, as well as age group and gender. In the current Study the geographical area is Gweru Urban District, while the teachers of high schools are the target population.

When choosing the sample, I decided on Gweru, Zimbabwe's third largest city. Gweru is situated in the middle of the country. Purposive sampling was used to choose informants for the study (Kombo and Tromp, 2009). In this case, these informants were the urban based teachers of government run high schools in Gweru. Teachers were selected by the heads of school, to attend focus group discussions. Gweru urban district was also chosen as the location of the study, due to the fact that urban schools are usually the best funded government schools. Further, they usually have the most highly qualified and experienced teachers who, because of easier access the media, maybe generally better informed than their rural counterparts. Urban teachers are also less likely to suffer political intimidation for speaking to a researcher.

The choice of high school as the sample was influenced by Heater's (1992) argument that pupils could marry at sixteen and vote at eighteen, thus becoming involved in legal

responsibilities. School and curriculum, therefore, have to acknowledge that pupils are part of a complicated civilisation and culture, and that they have a duty to introduce them to their essential elements. Though I did not interview the pupils, I did interview the teachers who teach them and who would bear the responsibility for teaching them in any citizenship education curriculum. Sigauke (2011a) agrees, commenting that research from around the world shows that much of the foundation for political life is already in place by the young person's adulthood. For this reason I also found high schools to be excellent to use in the research. Government high schools bore the full effects of the recent economic and political crises, they employed the bulk of high school teachers, and they have the majority of high school pupils.

For the current research, the population of Zimbabwean urban based teachers was simply too large to be feasibly studied. Instead the main source of information for the report was the knowledge, gained from the twenty-nine urban based teachers of Zimbabwe, all teaching at two urban high schools in Gweru district, at the time of the Study. They would share their observations with me as the population sample of the wider urban based teachers of the country.

Stroud (2010) writes that an analyst must determine which strategy applies to a particular situation and address questions such as how much data was needed. Generally, the greater the accuracy or precision needed from the Study, the larger the sample needed. The current research is centred on analysing the opinions and experiences of Zimbabwean high school teachers on the conditions under which they work. Thus, the sample was chosen from a relatively small group, when compared to the large numbers of teachers who work in urban Zimbabwe. However, they had very wide experience of teaching in different types of schools: private, public, rural and urban. Most had, at least, a decade's worth of experience in teaching. Thus the data they would provide could be very well informed, making it unnecessary to use a larger sample than that employed, especially with the qualitative methods of research used. I approached the heads of the respective

schools and obtained permission from them to organise focus groups, and interview teachers, using the research instruments described below.

3.4. The Research Instruments

A major task for a researcher is to select dependable measuring instruments for the purpose of quantifying the behaviours and attributes he has chosen to study (Ary et al, 1972). These are called the research instruments. Best and Khan (1993), Kombo and Tromp (2009) and Leedy (1993) write that the research instruments may refer to questionnaires, interview schedules, observation and focus group discussions, the tools used for the systematic collection of data from the sample. Greenstein et al (2004) described them as the specific tools used by each method in order to collect data.

In this Study, I used focus group discussions and semi-structured interviews for reasons discussed in this section. In order to test the methods I employed I carried out a pilot study, using a sample interview schedule, some months before the actual research in July 2011. The pilot study took place at one of the urban schools I was to later use for the main Study and was used to test for reliability so that I would be able to craft valid questions for the main Study. The questions I used were refined, based on experiences and suggestions gained from this pilot study. I believe that the research instruments were credible in that they were based on concerns expressed by teachers questioned during the pilot study.

The purpose of the interviews and focus group discussions was to explore the opinions and experiences of the school teachers of urban Zimbabwe, on the conditions under which they worked. The data would be collected by the use of a digital recorder during the interviews which lasted a average of twenty minutes each, and the two focus group meetings, which each lasted about an hour. This was meant to provide a ground level view from the people who translate the prescribed curriculum and provide instruction to the pupils (IIEP, 2010). This data would then be used to answer whether it would be

possible to implement citizenship education satisfactorily in Zimbabwean high schools. The following two sub-sections will describe the research instruments used in the Study.

Questions from both the interview questionnaire and focus group schedule, which are included as appendices C and D respectively, were crafted to inquire after the teachers experiences. They included questions such as ‘Have there been any negative or positive changes at your school since you began?’ and ‘How do you see the future of education in the future will it get better or worse and why?’It must be noted that I did not ask questions directly dealing with citizenship education because it is considered a politically charged topic that might lead to teachers being opened to political victimisation.

A. Focus group

Kitzinger (1995), Kombo and Tromp (2009), Seymour (2004) and Webb and Kevern (2001) praise focus group studies. These are special groups composed of several participants, each of whom share characteristics necessary for the Study, as useful tools to gather qualitative data. In the case of the current research, two separate sessions, were held, each with a group of ten teachers. These teachers had no distinction in age or rank, but were all teaching at high school level in urban Zimbabwe. This data was gathered from two focus group meetings conducted in July and December 2011.

Seymour (2004) and Kitzinger (1995) argue that one of the values of the focus group is that they can garner information on how groups of people can think or feel about a particular topic. This gives greater insights as to why they hold the opinions they do and it encourages participants who would normally believe that they had nothing to say to add to the conversations after others start it. This was my experience as often some teachers would remain silent, letting others handle the debate, but suddenly pick up on a spoken point and start to expand on it or refute it.

Seymour (2004) further argues that focus groups are limited in that they do not provide valid information on individuals. Fortunately, the current research was not overly concerned with individuals, but with the experiences and opinions of urban teachers in general. While Seymour (2004) suggests that there should be no more than three questions, in addition to facilitator probes. I, however, found it necessary to use nineteen. This was due to the participants all too often giving single word answers rather than debating the question during the pilot study. Giving them more questions provoked more discussion and helped me obtain more information.

The trouble with qualitative focus group research is that all the answers one receives are in a sense 'correct', where individual differences do not matter and all responses are legitimate (Roller, 2011). This was not a problem for the current research which was not seeking ‘correct’ answers, but opinions of the focus group participants. It is also noted that one does not get a natural opinion from this method as the participants are always mindful that they are being recorded, which influences what they say (Kitzinger, 1995). I, however, found it useful in that focus groups are similar to everyday conversations, which is good as people comment or tease reminding each other of facts.

A moderator was chosen who ensured that no one colluded or intimidated the others (Wilkinson, 2004). Throughout the focus group session, the participants were aware that their words and opinions were to be published and this may have made them wary of being more open on more controversial factors (Kitzinger, 1995). When confronted with hesitation in the discussions, I would remind the focus group participants that their anonymity was protected by the ethics forms that they had signed.

Some scholars argue that when group dynamics work well the participants can take the research into new and unexpected directions. However, poor group interactions can scupper it as people may feel intimidated with talking about sensitive issues (Webb and Kevern, 2001). While some argue that talking about sensitive issues is difficult in a group, I found group support was common as the focus group participants encouraged

each other to speak (Wilkinson, 2004). Interaction in the focus group discussions was rather mild as the participants had near uniform opinions on most of the topics. When I questioned them on this, they revealed that they had often discussed these matters in their spare time with other teachers, for years, during and after the economic crisis. However, some of the more controversial questions would result in a great deal of dialogue, which greatly benefited the report.

B. Interview

Originally, the current research was to be a purely focus group only exercise, but I noticed that, during the pilot study, gatherings of teachers were often unwilling to address some issues in the company of their peers. This was especially true of those issues that could reflect negatively on their schools or their colleagues. The difficulty of bringing large groups of teachers together, during working hours, also made the use of focus groups difficult. As a result, I interviewed six teachers, using one on one semi-structured interviews. This was also due to constraints of time and the reluctance of some teachers to speak of sensitive issues in company of their colleagues. Therefore, six teachers who were available to be interviewed were questioned separately, using a semi-structured interview schedule in order to return fuller development of information (Weiss, 1995). The interview schedule was slightly modified from the focus group's questions. According to Kombo and Tromp (2009), this focussed interview style intensively investigates a particular topic to gain a complete and detailed understanding. I found this to be true.

I had the choice of using two different types of interviews. The first was the structured type, where the questions follow a rigid and pre-determined route. Its advantage lies in that it is standardised and the answers can be easily classified and analysed. However, it is also inflexible and may seem overly formal and intimidating (Weiss, 1995). The restrictions may increase its reliability, but reduce its depth. The second type of interview is unstructured. This is an informal free questioning of the subject, making it possible to

regard the interviewee's views, attitudes and beliefs, allowing the subjects to go beyond simple responses and thereby revealing their views any way they wish. Unfortunately, this makes it difficult to quantify (Ary et al, 1972). However, as mentioned earlier, I did not use quantitative data, so the lack of quantification was not a problem for this report. I selected semi-structured interviews to collect data.

Barriball, K. and While, A. (1994) describe a semi structured interview schedule as useful in qualitative research for two reasons. Firstly they are well suited for the exploration of the perceptions and opinions of respondents regarding complex and sometimes sensitive issues and enable probing for more information and clarification of answers. Second, the varied professional, educational and personal histories of the sample group precluded the use of a standardized interview schedule. It also allows acknowledges informants may have different levels of understanding of vocabulary used in the question. Thus, semi-structured interviews allow the interviewer to change the words, but not the meaning of the question so that all informants involved can understand what is asked of them. Harrell and Bradley (2009), Best and Khan (1993) and Leedy (1993) note that semi-structured interviews have the advantage of more in-depth information than surveys. They also allow the interviewer to question the respondent, face to face, and to follow up previous sessions. This was useful as I could probe answers, asking the interviewee to expand or clarify on points granting a lot of useful information.

Valenzuela and Shrisvastava (2008), Harrell and Bradley (2009) and Hawley (2008) write that interviews are a far more personal method of research than self administered questionnaires, and are easier for the respondent to answer. Using interviews, a skilled interviewer can uncover the most important elements of a participant’s perspective without introducing bias. Hackos and Redish (1998), cited by Hawley (2008), advise interviewers to avoid asking leading, overly complex questions. I was, therefore, careful to avoid leading questions and I kept my body language, tone and expression neutral so as not to influence the interviewee. The fact that I was a teacher for two years in urban Zimbabwe might also have caused bias. To avoid this bias the sample was taken in a

different town in different schools and with different teachers than the ones that I worked with.

Harrell and Bradley (2009) do note that interviewing is more time consuming and resource draining than surveys. I overcame this by choosing schools within walking distance from my residence. When choosing a venue, the two authors advise use of ones with the least noise and distractions. These were kindly provided by the school. Though it was impossible to block out the sound of children during recess, it did not affect the interviews negatively. Once the data was collected one could begin interpreting, showing what one has learned in the project and how it fits in the field (Ary et al, 1972).

To analyse the data, I sifted through the responses of the informants and developed themes which to explore and develop a conversation on the subject of citizenship education. First, in chapter four, I compiled the most prominent themes that emerged from the Study. Then, in chapter five, I developed my argument on whether citizenship education could be meaningfully taught given the issues raised in chapter four. Finally in chapter five, I made recommendations based on the analysed data.

3.5. Limitations of the Study

The limitations of the Study exist to discuss the challenges faced in the research process. These challenges involve time, finance, political worries and inaccessibility of data. Discussions of these challenges include comments on how they were overcome (Kombo and Tromp (2009). In the case of the current Study, the most severe challenges faced concerned analysis of data and the time consuming nature of the research instruments used. This section of the methodology will discuss how these problems affected the research and were solved.

On the matter of time, I was carrying out my studies in South Africa during the period I was expected to be gathering data. Finances were stretched by the expensive and time consuming travels to and from Gweru in Zimbabwe. Due to border controls and bus

routes, travelling would often take three days at a time. This problem was overcome by relatives assisting with financial problems. The only periods I got to interview subjects were two, week long periods separated by five months. My problems were also compounded by the fact that while I could and did make arrangements for focus group meetings, months in advance, unexpected problems would crop up for the focus group participants, which would prevent them from being ready in time to be interviewed. This led to many missed opportunities.

Another problem of note was that the teachers could not be forced to attend focus group discussions or interviews. I had to spend a lot of time at the schools hunting down teachers to try and persuade them to be interviewed. Fortunately, the heads of school organised a time table that allowed teachers who were free from lessons at a particular time to attend the sessions. This severely reduced the amount of time to gather data, and made following up on previous interviews difficult, as teachers were very busy during most of the year. This issue was dealt with by using the researchers' personal contacts to organise sessions with the teachers. At times, I had to make do with new interviewees and participants, rather than follow up old ones. This affected the Study negatively as I could not follow up questions and interesting points that occurred to me whilst transcribing data.

Zimbabwe's political problems and uncertainties also discouraged many potential interviewees. I had to persuade them that they would be anonymous and the Ethics committee would not betray their confidence. Unfortunately, four of the twenty-nine teachers I had interviewed later backed out of the report, citing worries about possible repercussions due to their participation, and asked me to leave out their contributions. This left me with a sample of twenty-five informants. However, this did not negatively impact on the Study as the remaining informants participated fully.

3.6. Ethical Considerations

As noted by Giddens, (2006) all research concerned with human beings can pose ethical dilemmas, as it may put the participants in some form of danger. Researchers, therefore, must question themselves on whether their research poses risks that are greater, to the subjects, than the risks they face in their everyday lives. Given the politicised state of education, in order to protect the welfare of research participants, I did not interview any traditionally vulnerable groups, and I made sure that I gained the informed consent of those interviewed, as suggested by Wassenaar (2006). I was careful to note in the consent form, appendix B, that the conditions under which confidentiality would be breached, as suggested by Weiss (1995). The questions steered away from political affiliations so that the teachers would not have to worry about possible political problems. My ethics application with the University of Witwatersrand has been accepted and is displayed as appendix E. The researcher was given permission by the heads of school to invite teachers for interviews, and provided them with participant information forms, appendix A and participant consent forms, appendix B.

3.7. Summary

This chapter has explained the methods used in this research report to answer the question ‘Can citizenship education be meaningful in Zimbabwe given the de-professionalization of teaching?’ It has further described the two research instruments used: focus group discussions and semi-structured interviews, as well as the reasons qualitative research methods were selected over quantitative. Chapter three has also explained how Zimbabwean high school teachers were chosen as the population to be studied, and how a sample of twenty-five high school teachers, from Gweru, was selected to be this report’s informants. Further, the chapter has discussed the limitations of the Study, and explained how they were overcome, as well as the ethical considerations that were taken into account when conducting the research. The next chapter, chapter four, will present the data and use it to demonstrate that, according to the informants, Zimbabwean high school teachers are experiencing symptoms of de-professionalization described in the literature review.

4 CHAPTER FOUR: DATA PRESENTATION

4.1. Introduction

This research report sought to investigate and argue that citizenship education is meaningless given the de-professionalization of Zimbabwean high school teachers. Chapter one explained the purpose and outline of the report. Chapter two critically discussed the literature relevant to the question, and Chapter three listed and explained the methods used to collect the data. This chapter presents the data gathered from the twenty-five high school teachers, referred to as the informants from Gweru urban district, who took part in the Study. It will answer sub-questions 1 and 2. These are, 'What are the conditions under which Zimbabwean teachers work?' and 'What do high school teachers in Zimbabwe think are the factors that cause their de-professionalization?', respectively.

The informants were selected without regard to age, ethnicity, gender or subjects taught, as these attributes were irrelevant to the Study. These informants are referred to by pseudonyms in this report. The informants who took part in focus group discussions will be referred to as focus group participants, and will have one letter in their pseudonym. Those who took part in interviews will be referred to as interviewees, with two letters in their pseudonym. All of the twenty-five informants took part in the focus group discussions, while six of them were also part of the interviews. Chapter 4 is divided into eight sub-sections and presents the eight themes that I identified when I reviewed the data. These themes demonstrate that, according to the informants, Zimbabwean high school teachers are suffering from the symptoms of de-professionalization described in the literature review. The sample summary of the informants is presented in table 1 below.

Table 1: Demographic Data

Method of data collection	Informants		
	Male	Female	Total
Focus Group discussions only	9	10	19
Focus Group discussions and Interviews	2	4	6
Total	11	14	**25**

4.2. Themes

A. Insufficient Remuneration

Chivore (1988) and WOZA (2010a) write that, in the 1980s, the major draw of the teaching occupation to educated Zimbabweans was the salary and benefits of the teacher, which were considered very good and desirable. However, in this Study, five interviewees state that the recent economic problems which Zimbabwe has faced have had a negative effect on their salaries. They consider the remuneration paid to them by the State for their work as educators as insufficient for their needs. The remaining interviewee did not comment on whether or not her remuneration was adequate. Bennell (2004) and Eggers and Calegari (2011) argue that professionals are typically well remunerated and are provided with relatively high salaries and benefits in their careers. The dissatisfaction with their remuneration which the informants expressed may be taken as a symptom that high school teachers in Zimbabwe suffer from de-professionalization.

One interviewee mentioned that when she first joined the profession, twenty years ago, teaching was a well paying job. Her income was now no longer adequate for her needs, despite the introduction of incentives paid by parents to teachers, in addition to their official remuneration (Interview with Ms RE). Mr GA mentioned that many teachers had left Zimbabwe to look for work in other countries, due to the poor pay that the occupation continues to offer.

Though dollarization of the economy, where the teachers are paid in American dollars rather than the Zimbabwean currency, has been described as being helpful financially, the informants claim that they are still experiencing challenges in making ends meet with their current pay,

> "It's challenging, especially as we are not well paid so we are just working for peanuts and it's no longer interesting" (Interview with Ms RE).

Challenges mentioned include price distortions from the introduction of new currencies, which teachers are not used to (Interview with Mr. AO). One interviewee describes that being in debt between pay cheques has become a normal feature of the teacher's life (Interview with Ms ND). Another describes the detrimental effects that their insufficient remuneration has had on his work,

> "I actually transferred from where I had been teaching because of transport cost. I wanted to cut costs because from here to my home is walking distance, so that's specifically the reason why I transferred to this school." (Interview with Mr. AO).

Ms MU also complained about low salaries, leading to many teachers employing cross-border trading and other survival activities.

The inadequacy of salaries was a recurring theme in the focus group discussions. Ms I stated that before the year 2000,

> "Things were normal, there were no problems and the remuneration was average, on the average, that's all I can say."

However, after the year 2000 the interviewees were in agreement that it became difficult to survive as the economic crisis bit into their salaries. Ms S described how financial difficulties often led to the adoption of survival strategies, to the detriment of their teaching,

> "Also food, we had shortages of food. In shops, some shops were being closed so when the time you hear there was mealie meal at OKs, people

> would leave work and then you'd find there's some cooking oil there, Ai, it was a pandemic. So people would move all over and we would leave our work because we couldn't come and teach when we are hungry. So we would also go to try change money to, because we also wanted to have those Rands or those Pulas then we'd go to Botswana or South Africa to buy our groceries, so it was chaotic."

She went on to explain how their poor salaries affected their dependants,

> "And again you know as Africans we also have extended families at home, we'd also go there to make sure they also feed. And we had problems again of HIV/ Aids. Our relatives during those times were dying like anything. So we would have problems again. If you would go to the hospital when you're sick, there's no medicine and you don't have money to buy, so we had a lot of problems then." (Ms S).

Ms Q agreed, describing how the problems contributed to teacher absenteeism, which in turn affected the academic performance of their pupils,

> "So that affected the system really. All that because there was a lot of absenteeism, teacher absenteeism from school, because we were going to burying our dead, going out there to change money. That created a problem, teacher absenteeism, which affected even the results at the end."

One informant also noted how their poor remuneration often forced them into compromising positions,

> “Um, the other problem that we face is that of accommodation, um teachers, because of the remuneration that they get they can't find proper accommodation, they end up lodging and that affects their professional performance, because you may be lodging at a place where one of the children there is actually attending your school.” (Mr C).

B. High Pupil to Teacher Ratio

Bennell (2004) argues that the work environment is a good indicator of professionalism, with occupations with supportive working environments enjoying professional status. The informants, in this Study, revealed that they were often forced to work in an environment where, as teachers, they were forced to cope with more pupils than they could cater for satisfactorily. According to the informants, the high pupil to teacher ratio, the number of pupils to a teacher in a class, made the teachers work environment difficult by increasing their work loads and putting pressure on the educational resources available. This can be described as a symptom of the de-professionalization that teachers in Zimbabwe are enduring.

The increasingly high pupil to teacher ratio was opined to be a severe problem by four interviewees, with two not mentioning the pupil to teacher ratio at all. As one described it,

> “Because they're large classes, I mean large classes, larger than large classes. If we're talking like this, you don't see the classroom, it doesn't make any sense. Let's get to the classroom, you see the class seated and the teacher in front, that's when you realize there are large classes.” (Interview with Mr AO).

It was also argued that the large classes made it hard for them to give each pupil the attention they needed as individuals,

> “Um, the major problem that I've faced so far is of the class occupants. The ratio itself is too big so it's very difficult for us to impart skills on each and every pupil that we are teaching. So I just think we need to be having a number of teachers so that we can cope up.” (Interview with Mr AO).

One interviewee blamed the relaxed standards necessary to advance through school for the high pupil to teacher ratio,

> “When we started, one, the children we inherited from the colonial regime were very keen to learn and it was very easy to teach them. Then when, after independence, when anyone could go through, the pupils became relaxed, because prior to independence, there was bottleneck type of education, then it became a free for all, then the pupils just say 'If I get into grade 1 then I can go until O 'level'. Then it became a problem to teach. And then the classes became bigger and bigger!” (Interview with Ms MH).

Classes were said to have become less enjoyable to teach due to their size, according to one informant,

> “I've had both positive and negative changes in the school. Positive in that the school has remained intact, negative in that numbers have swollen up, size of the class has become bigger than it was before, thereby making them enjoy teaching a little less than they used to.” (Interview with Mr GA).

Mr GA went on to mention that he had to give his pupils less work to cope with the marking, to the detriment of the pupils. One interviewee complained that she often had to teach classes of sixty five to sixty seven pupils at O' Level. Further, she often had to spend five minutes of lesson time trying to get the pupils settled before she could even begin teaching. This reduced the amount of time she could dedicate to teaching (Interview with Ms RE).

Both focus groups discussed how the large classes affected their work. Notable complaints included the large numbers of pupils producing a great deal of work for the teachers to mark,

> "Classes are too large, they are too big, this teacher student ratio. We mark piles and piles, up to sixty students in a class. And we have six classes." (Ms T). "And the other issue is on the resource side, the teacher, the pupil ratio, ah, it's very, very low such that most of the pupils are learning whilst they are sitting on each other, which will make it difficult for the pupil to check the information which is being presented by the teacher. It takes long for the pupil to finish writing the notes given by the teacher because they will be putting, they will be placing or putting a note book on their thighs." (Mr E).

C. Insufficient School Resources

Bennell (2004) holds that a supportive working environment is necessary for an occupation to claim professional status. Yet four interviewees held that they had to work with insufficient school resources, described by Lee and Zuze (2011) as material, human and time resources. The remaining two did not mention it. Their comments portrayed Zimbabwean high school teachers as lacking the resources, such as textbooks, furniture and computers, which they needed, to carry out their duties satisfactorily. The lack of

educational resources can be said to be a symptom of de-professionalization (Bennell, 2004).

The shortage of resources was described by one interviewee as being a result of the expansion of education not being matched by an increase in infrastructural expansion,

> "Yeah, resources, I can say at independence, ok, many schools were opened up, especially secondary schools. When there were no structures. That is people were allowed to open up, to start secondary education either attached to a primary school or something, but there was no infrastructure for that, no resources, those were the problems that we suffered." (Interview with Ms MH).

Ms ND believed that though her school was run well during the worst of the Zimbabwean economic crisis, it suffered and still suffers from a shortage of books and computers, preventing teachers from teaching to the best of their abilities. This concern was echoed by Ms Mu, who noted that the appearance of officials from the Ministry of Education gave her hope for improvement. Despite this problem, one interviewee insisted that he always tried his best to teach,

> "The moment I'll get into the classroom, I'll do the teaching, despite the challenges, despite remuneration, despite lack of materials, despite large numbers, despite all the challenges. When we get in front of the classroom, a very ethical teacher who has got ethics will tell you they go and teach. That's how I was schooled anyway." (Interview with Mr AO).

The focus group participants also held that teaching was being hampered by a lack of resources. A shortage, in necessary teaching materials, was noted to have existed even

before the economic crisis of 2000, as one interviewee reminisced about the school she joined in 1997,

> "I thought I was going to the best school with the best equipment for me as a science teacher, but to my surprise there was nothing. No chemicals, equipment, you know. It has gone down, it has more or less, it has broken down, it has been depleted." (Ms O).

It was also lamented that there was very little updating and modernizing of equipment.

> "And also I think that for standards to improve, education must move with the times, we need to move with times. The education system is moving with the times, the introduction of technology, there are so many things we can use as resources, (like) modern textbooks. We want computers, we want so many machinery which must benefit the students to meet with the times modern textbooks." (Ms Q).

Mr K argued that while they were rebuilding their stocks of textbooks and learning materials, as well as buying new computers, the lack of money was preventing them from raising standards back to an acceptable level,

> "Right now we are rebuilding our stocks in terms of text books, in terms of learning materials. We are now able to buy computers for our classes which we failed to do in the previous years. So the current standards of education are still very low in that it needs a lot of money to support it, to put it back on its feet."

He also stressed that government in-house fighting was preventing improvement,

> “Because, you'd find that the formation of the unity government is actually an in-house fighting system that was put in place, overlooking and overshadowing their core business of service delivery and looking after their employees. At the moment you'd find that if anything along the lines of, eh, increasing civil service salaries, there is war in the country of words such that by the end of the day they are doing more fights than providing service to the various systems of education than cooperating.” (Mr K).

D. Pupil Discipline

Bennell (2004) argues that a profession should have high levels of respect from the public. However, data provided by the informants indicated that there was a distinct lack of respect for teachers from the members of the public, as well as those that they have the greatest responsibility towards; their pupils. Two interviewees described pupil ill discipline as one of the problems that they faced, while four did not mention anything about them. One interviewee claimed that the long period of disturbances in the education system during the Zimbabwean crises, had left the pupils without proper instilling of discipline from teachers (Interview with Ms MU). Mr GA lamented what he saw as the decreased focus of pupils, which would at times discourage him,

> “I joined the school in January 1984 and my hopes were that children here would have a vision and a focus which would make them love to work towards set goals, but when I got here, down the line, I noticed that many of them were losing this goal and not showing any clear focus.”

He went on to claim that the government laws against administration of corporal punishment left the teachers without a way to discipline their pupils, to the detriment of teaching classes.

According to some of the focus group participants, part of the reason for the decrease in pupil discipline could be attributed to the years of strikes, during which they were deprived of classroom discipline,

> "The other point is our pupils have been affected by the previous crisis, 2007-2008, where there were a lot of teacher strikes and so on. So they lost a lot of lessons and so their background is very poor, especially those in form 4, form 5 and form 6. Now that the school is back to normal they find it very difficult to adapt to the, the content which is required and so they, they tend to go towards truancy. It is a matter of difficulty grasping the contents and so on." (Ms L).

Another informant added that pupils tended to grow more disobedient as they grew up,

> "I teach, usually, teach form one, they are usually, with form ones, they are not a problem, but some in the middle, their behaviour becomes a bit rude." (Mr N).

According to some focus group participants, some pupils received large amounts of money from their parents overseas, thus leading them to look down on their own teachers who make less,

> "This has been compounded by the fact that has been said earlier on, that they have lots and lots of moneys when they look at their teacher they can

really wear their teacher down because as far as their pockets are concerned they pocket more than what the teacher pockets after thirty days, so that also contributes to their attitude that they display, they no longer see the value of education at all." (Ms T).

According to Mr C, the economic downturn in Zimbabwe has compounded the view among some students that education is no longer necessary for financial security,

"They (the pupils) have mixed views on education. Some no longer view it as important for someone to survive or to any good life because during the hyper inflationary period, and even up to now, those who are managing to acquire more of material assets such as cars, renting good houses, affording good meals or clothing are those who are the gamblers, those who are able to venture into more risky, more corrupt activities compared to the professionals within the, especially within the education system. Their (professionals within the education system) remunerations are not arousing and they cannot, and the way the professionals are living in Zimbabwe compared to the gamblers themselves, the professionals are failing to make it because the cost of living is very high compared to the low remunerations. Whilst you are forced to turn for thirty days a month for a job which at the end of the month will give you very, very little compared to the poverty datum line, whilst someone who is a gambler, for example the money changers themselves, the cross border traders are making good lives, so pupils have mixed views on whether, is it worth it to go to school whilst you receive little and cannot afford to buy, to buy cars, to have uh, to have high rentals to rent good accommodation and even to have, good quality of food so it's a mixed view."

Pupil discipline was also negatively affected by their belief that even with an education it was impossible to gain anything, due to the lack of employment opportunities,

> "Our students no longer regard education as something thing serious. Why? One, the majority of our students have been left by their parents as they go for greener pastures. Their being left alone here receiving large amounts of the U.S dollar, they don't see the need of working hard because they can easily get the money. Secondly, the majority of our children who are also child headed families because of the AIDS pandemic have realized that even if you go to school, maybe, you cannot get a job so they would rather go to do, maybe, many other menial jobs instead of actually focusing on education, so that they can get something immediately instead of just going through six years and then to university another four or so years." (Ms J).

One interviewee mentioned how new technologies, provided by wealthy parents, were being used in ways that were harmful to pupil discipline.

> "While we are on that, for the parents who have left their kids here while they go to diaspora, they are also sending these gadgets like the cellphones. Now during the year 2007 they were getting these other sophisticated phones where they would have Bluetooth and what have you, they would then send this other information to other students, which are not school like, for example the pornographic pictures and what have you and what have you." (Mr L).

The increased use of drugs and abuse of substances was also remarked upon.

> “And pupils are also exposed to drugs, buying these hard drugs from these high density suburbs where they are staying. When they come here they will be telling each other, 'if you use this it will work', and also drinking some alcohol, those are some of the things which will make them being carried away.” (Mr L).

An increase in pupil truancy was, according to Mr K, another sign of lapsed discipline which has carried on from the economic and political crises,

> “We have a problem right now of truancy is very common. It is because, uh, pupils are running away from school, because they have lost much of their time doing other things, now that they are towards exam time they are failing to cope with the amount of work, then they run away from school. So it becomes a problem so the background is one contributory factor.”

Like the teachers themselves, pupils would often leave school to engage in survival activities,

> “And they leave their school work and others joined this business, like they, change monies during the economic hardships when our dollar was of less value. They would get their money from their parents who would send their money here and you'd hear them say that 'today teachers are getting less money, and if you were getting a lot of money, would you concentrate on your school work?”

The lack of parental supervision was also noted as a problem in the focus group discussions. As the pupils were not receiving discipline at home, they reacted poorly to it at school.

> “Most of our students, again, they are staying alone. Most of their parents, guardians are in the diaspora, where they are working, sending money back here. When these small kids get the money they get overwhelmed. They use this money on other things other than intended, that is another contributory factor that I think is affecting that our schools now.” (Ms S). “No, and they would go and buy these lavish foods, chicken inn and food express and what have you, and can see there'll be chaos.” (Mr L).

E. Lack of External Support

With regard to the work environment, support from non-governmental sources can be used in emergency situations to make up for lack of traditional support for teachers, which can offset the symptoms of de-professionalization the teachers face (IIEP, 2010). When questioned about sources of support when dealing with the symptoms of de-professionalization, the informants referred to parents and Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs) as offering aid. However, the informants’ answers showed that they received relatively little support from parents and NGOs. Pertaining to support from parents, the responses of the interviewees were mixed, with three interviewees; Mr AO, Ms ND and Mr GA, describing the school relations with their parents’ body, the School Development Association (SDA), as cordial,

> “I think it's very cordial… teachers work very, very well with everybody, with the community around, we have no problem, we have no problem whatsoever. They come for consultation, we consult. Things like that, they

> come even in the school when they feel like there's problem there, their, their kid as a problem they want that to be attended to." (Interview with Mr AO).

Another informant agreed that while parents did have problems with teachers, relations were cordial,

> "It is cordial in that, while parents are struggling to make ends meet, they appreciate the need to keep teachers in the classroom. They see the need to help teachers help their children, they also it as necessary that pupils would get the best instruction and when they come together discussing issues like incentives, when they discuss levies and the like they have been very supportive, because they realize that there is need to keep the teacher fairly happy and get the best from them by way of instructing their children without any distractions." (Interview with Mr GA).

One interviewee, however, did complain that parents would not keep promises of support that they made to teachers, especially regarding incentives. Parents would also sometimes blame the teachers for the poor performance of their pupils.

> "Yes, they do especially when you have consultation days. Uh, their reactions differ, some parents appreciate what you tell them, but others they show negative attitudes to what you are saying especially if the kid is not performing well." (Interview with Ms RE).

One interviewee claimed to have no knowledge of the relations with parents.

> "I don't see them. I don't know." (Interview with Ms MH).

Only two interviewees, Ms MU and Ms ND, spoke of the NGO's as a source of support for their problems. These helped pupils, though not teachers.

The focus group discussions, however, tended to be a bit more critical of parental support for education,

> "We also have lack of parental support, uh, to groom a child you need both the support of the home and the school. You find that at times whatever the children do at home those negative habits are encouraged by the parents. When they come to school and we try to discipline those students the parents would be against the type of discipline the students are given." (Ms G).

One focus group informant stated that parents could not help as much as they wanted to, due to problems in their own lives,

> "Some of the parents are no longer working because some of the company have closed, for example Alloys, so, the parent will have a child here so sometimes they won't pay the fees in time because he's not working. So the parent will sort of being withdrawn because of, he cannot manage. And then since we'd said we need books and the like with these SDCs if the parents are not all paying all at the same time, that money doesn't all come at one go. So the buying of books can delay and whilst pupils won't be learning because there are no resources." (Ms S).

It could be argued that another demonstration of de-professionalization in the informants' testimony was that teachers seemed to be receiving less respect from the parents of their

pupils. It was mentioned in the focus group that some parents blocked much needed fees increases, without realizing their importance to the school's education efforts,

> "The school is supposed to be a former group 'A' school and yet we are now enrolling even from the townships. Parents from the townships don't normally want to co-operate, they want to simply oppose developmental projects for the sake of opposing. For example, I can cite a case whereby school committees are trying to increase the levies. The parents simply oppose, yet they don't know really what that money is supposed to be used for, sometimes that money is used for buying furniture, is used for buying textbooks, used for buying cleaning materials. But when you present such issues to the parents they oppose that, for example, they don't realize that the school needs to employ workers to clean the classrooms, to cook for the children at the hostels. Those workers need some salary increases now and then. Whenever such employees are getting some increase, but when you tell the parents to do the same, especially with the levies, they oppose for the sake of opposing." (Mr A).

In a focus group discussion, Mr N expressed resentment at the role the government granted parents, feeling that they interfered with the running of the systems.

> "Education is the sole responsibility of the government, you see? The government must run the education business, than let parents to run (it)."

Another focus group informant argued that the parents simply did not realize that the times of turbulence in Zimbabwe were over and that teachers were concentrating on their work again.

> “I want to say that it was more of a transition from the Zim dollar era to the dollarization era, and what has happened is that the community where the parents have not yet maybe, maybe got to understand that, business at school is more of a serious thing when compared to that era where you'd find out that the teachers were not go, may not be teaching, but as of now there has been progress, so I think the major challenge is that the parents have to encompass that there is now serious business at government school and the urgent education delivery system has improved” (Mr E).

Shizha and Kariwo (2011), argued that teachers’ work was being transformed beyond recognition by forces intent on devolution, marketisation, de-professionalization and intensification. The attitude and actions of some of the parents as described by the informants seems to bear this out.

One focus group participant stated that some parents did not pay attention to their children's well being. This was advanced as another sign of the lack of support for teachers,

> “Often we are presenting, uh, a pupil showing they are performing poorly or badly, the parents seem to be surprised, which shows that at home they do not constantly check the progress of the pupil. Which shows part of like, uh, sort of like, I call it negligence where we are saying parents are not also taking their part in terms of assisting their pupil, their child, to get focused with school work, because if you show them they need to know even ... the end of term marks which could be evidenced through the school reports, which are given at the end of the term. Then, between, parents are more, most of the parents are, who are come for consultation, they seem not to

know the progress where there are exercise books as well as school reports which are brought as evidence of the pupils performance at school." (Mr C).

F. Pupil Welfare

(IIEP, 2010) mentions that teachers are motivated to work because they worry about the welfare of their pupils, and the knowledge that they are teaching them skills that will serve to better their lives. This was the case among the informants. There seemed to be wide scale concern among them about the future of their pupils, and generally their welfare, because of the poor state of affairs in the country. Literature has advanced that this negatively affects the motivation at the workplace, and this is a symptom of de-professionalization.

Four of the interviewees stressed that they had concerns for the welfare of their children, while the remaining two did not speak of it. The pupils were described as having suffered lingering problems due to the Zimbabwean crisis (Interview with Ms MU). Only one of the four interviewees was upbeat about the pupils' prospects,

"To a large extent we are not likely to have any negative problems because we have realized, we have universities springing up, there are so many in Zimbabwe, teachers have been trained, teacher training colleges continue to turn out teachers, who to my opinion, are of high caliber, making their teaching not suspect, it is what we still believe can maintain the desired standards, of course amid worries cries and complaints." (Interview with Mr GA).

However, two interviewees, Ms ND and Ms MU, while agreeing that post-high school pupils had excellent opportunities to further their education, still felt that the poor state of the employment market in Zimbabwe meant many would end up unemployed, regardless of their efforts. One

interviewee mentioned that the many former pupils frequenting the towns shopping district was a sign that education was not securing them jobs.

> “You go in town there, it's not an open secret if you have been to Bahadur, lots of young people there are selling cell phones, handsets and things like that. And many other things they are selling. Because, some years ago you could complete your education and get a job. Nowadays unemployment rate is very high.” (Interview with Mr AO).

This sentiment was echoed by another interviewee,

> “They don't have the same focus. Some of them view education as a road to success or to get away from poverty .Others see it as waste of time especially those who have seen some people getting into, what can we call them, soon after I think 2008 2009... there was one, cross-border, there were people going on there to, coming back with what looked lucrative and so, some of them are negative and especially I think people who are along the border of Zimbabwe.” (Interview with Ms MH).

The idea that the period of economic hardship had endangered the welfare of the pupil was also prevalent in the focus group discussions,

> “Due to the economic hardships, I think I can say from the year 2000, we saw that our economy drastically dropped to almost 0 by the year 2008. So I think during those years, the standard of education went down to the extent that even the students themselves, they didn’t want to attend classes. And we lost quite a number of students during the year 2006, 7 up to 8, were going to private colleges this is why you find 2005, 6, 7 a lot of private colleges sprouted throughout the country.” (Mr N).

The problems the pupils faced were considered by some focus group informants to possibly threaten their future,

> “Maybe one of the most obvious facts are that since the standards are low, their performance is low as well. Their results won't be good enough to secure them any bright future in terms of taking up any course that would learn them at a better level in society. So currently (sigh) the prospects are really gloomy.” (Ms O).

It was also argued in the focus group discussions that only pupils with money could really benefit from the education available,

> “Yes, I think it has, because in the rural areas, the majority of the students no longer go to school because they cannot, they fail to even raise a dollar, they can't raise the fees, the levies which are being asked for by the, the institutions so as a result the majority of the rural areas, the majority of the students are not going to school and as a result also in rural areas there are no incentives, the teachers are not teaching at all.” (Ms I).

Focus group participant, Ms T, however, claimed that even if they did receive regular lessons, only those pupils who could afford extra tuition had any hope of passing well enough to make something of themselves,

> “And if ever there are any, it's partly those who are getting private lessons, not formal lessons in class, they are some who are, who are still showing some, some trends that they are students just because they are getting

> private lessons and those who are getting private lessons are those who have got money, who have got parents who they can afford, the majority they are not getting those private lessons at the same time, they're not doing anything about putting an effort in class, they no longer have that, that nature."

The focus group participants did mention that pupils did receive support from a wide range of NGOs such as the Midlands Aids Service Organization (MASO), Basic Education Assistance Module (BEAM), and the Capernaum Trust.

G. Teacher Attrition

Ingersoll and Merrill (2011) mention that if we assume professionalization attracts capable recruits to an occupation, fosters their expertise and commitment, and ultimately provides assurance to the public of quality service, then the data shows that teaching does not have that standing. Teacher attrition, which is the rate at which teachers leave their occupation for retirement, other careers or migration, is one of the symptoms of de-professionalization described by Shizha and Kariwo (2011). The informants revealed that Zimbabwe has undergone a period of high attrition. Of the six interviewees, two spoke of a high level of attrition, attributing it to the difficulties experienced in the past. It was held by Mr GA that the difficult conditions of teaching led to this attrition,

> "It was basically due to inflation, harsh working conditions and poor remuneration, so people decided to move over to other places where they felt they would get value for their time and their expertise."

Mr AO echoed the sentiment further, stating that the areas of Mathematics and Science, in particular, were suffering from attrition of teachers who migrated to South Africa and other countries because of economic challenges. One interviewee stated that, while her school had experienced a high attrition rate in the years 2008 to 2009, she now believed that things were relatively stable (Interview with Ms MU).

Two of the interviewees declared a sense of dissatisfaction with their current positions as teachers.

> " I don't have any plan as a teacher except teaching, and if I get something that is different from teaching...(shrugs)." (Interview with Ms RE).

Ms Mu also declared that she wished to do something other than teaching. As researcher, I feel that this maybe important as, if teachers are dissatisfied with their conditions, Zimbabwean high schools could find it difficult to hold on to it's experienced workers. This maybe taken as a sign that the teaching profession may lose more teachers to attrition.

The issue of teacher attrition was also considered to have negatively affected teaching, by focus group participants as well.

> "The turnover is unstable, like we have said earlier on we have lost quite a number of teachers. We are losing teachers on a termly basis reasons being that they are going for greener pastures. Others of late are being attached to the ministry of higher and, higher and tertiary education, promoted on lectureship, or some may move, go and join their spouses in different centers but the main reason why the turnover is unstable is because the, uh, economy is failing to support and stabilize the teachers or these teachers to stay at one place, over a longer period. Like now you find we're losing

> teachers, they’re going to join schools in Namibia, some are still going to South Africa and the like. It is because still the issue of remuneration is still revolving around us, this is why we have this turnover.” (MR N).

The high attrition rate was described by one focus group participant as having a detrimental effect on the quality of the workforce.

> “In other words what we're saying is, if we don't get a qualified teacher we're given a temporary teacher and what do you expect there? You see? That's a poor turnover. And sometimes when you go on leave, for us to get a replacement for that teacher, we are not given a qualified teacher.” (MR N).

One focus group participant noted that on the bright side, due to their position in town, they did receive many teachers who were leaving their old schools precisely because of the desire for ‘greener pastures’ (Ms H).

H. Curriculum Relevance

Bennell (2004) describes professions as having control over regulation of their profession. It can be argued that control over what is being taught is an important part of this. Yet some of the informants claimed dissatisfaction with the curriculum requirements which they felt they were powerless to change. Two of the six interviewees, however, observed that the curriculum was relevant to the needs of their pupils. One complained that, while the curriculum was relevant, the heavy emphasis on academic achievement over practical use was worrying,

> “Yeah. The curriculum is relevant but the only problem is just that it’s only focused on, mostly, on academics, subjects.” (Interview with Ms RE).

Ms ND echoed the sentiment, stating that the curriculum granted average education to the pupils, which included the teaching of human rights. However, this often got left out due to emphasis on passing academic examinations.

There were some complaints that the curriculum needed to be updated,

> “Some of syllabus is meant for people who have very high IQ, the syllabus has never changed from pre-independence up to now. When we're teaching, I think I stated we had 12.5 percent channeled through that syllabus. And it's now everybody. I think we should have, should have different syllabus for different groups of pupils. Our education has not changed. I mean, the syllabuses we have used are still the same, therefore the standard of education I think it's still, for those who pass, it's ok because we still have a high standard of education, it has never changed.” (Interview with Ms MH)

However, two interviewees felt that the curriculum was still relevant,

> “To a large extent we have tried to maintain, as evidenced by results (standards), not only produced through the Zimbabwe school examination council, but even through Cambridge we have pupils who were taught in this school who have gone to sit examinations in Cambridge they've continued to excel which means that the standard is still by and large the same.” (Interview with Mr GA).

Ms MU insisted that the curriculum was one of the best in Africa.

Mixed opinions on the value of the current curriculum were common in the focus groups. Mr K insisted, for example, that the syllabus was of excellent quality and the onus was on the pupil to perform.

> "Yes it's quite relevant in that the syllabus is actually drawn up nationally and they sit for the same examination, so you'd find that what we teach them is actually coming from a national body and its national policy. What I want only to point out here is that you'd find that the system of education here in Zimbabwe is mostly focused on the student, and the student has to do a lot of input into the learning itself and the teacher only acts as a guide, one who monitors the child and guides the child to go through this learning system, which is different from other regions where you find students are normally given prepared material, prepared questions, they go research, copy and even bring the answers back, this is why you find that the education system in Zimbabwe education system is deemed to be very tough. It's because the students themselves are the ones that are actually asked to put a greater input into their learning than the teachers, himself or herself."

This was echoed by Mr C, who believed that the pupils only performed poorly, under the current curriculum, simply because they did not work hard enough,

> "Well the standard is ok, but only that the kids themselves are not serious as has already been said and I think, this is due to a lot of entertainment in their homes which is being afforded by the availability of the dollar."

One focus group informant spoke in favour of changing the curriculum on the basis that it was not adequate for pupil needs,

> “I think as he says there is need for a total curriculum change where there's emphasis on various areas. If there's academic, those who're good at academic they follow that route. In sport those who follow that route, they get scholarships for various sporting activities whatever it is. In practicals, those who are very good in practicals, they should be , colleges specifically meant, and universities specifically meant for those areas in particular, rather than mixing the academic part and the academical and the sport.” (Ms G).

4.3. Summary

This chapter has demonstrated that, in the opinion of the informants, Zimbabwean high school teachers have suffered the symptoms of de-professionalization as described in the literature review by Bennell (2004), Ingersoll and Merrill (2011) and Shizha and Kariwo (2011). These include poor pay, poor working conditions, a high rate of attrition from the occupation, a lack of respect and support from pupils and parents, and a lack of control over elements of their occupation. The next chapter will use the data to argue that de-professionalization of teachers may hamper attempts to teach citizenship education satisfactorily. It will also argue that there are other factors which would render citizenship education meaningless and unproductive. Chapter six will present the summary and recommendations of the report.

5 CHAPTER FIVE: DISCUSSION OF THE FINDINGS

5.1. Introduction

This research report was undertaken to answer the question, 'Can citizenship education be meaningful in Zimbabwe given the de-professionalization of teachers?' The question was to be answered using three research sub-questions:

1. What are the conditions under which Zimbabwean teachers work?
2. What do high school teachers in Zimbabwe think are the factors that cause their de-professionalization?
3. How might de-professionalization affect teaching citizenship education in Zimbabwe?

Chapter four of this Study answered sub-questions one and two. It presented the data gathered from twenty-five Zimbabwean high school teachers who participated in focus group discussions and interviews, on the conditions under which they work. It revealed eight themes that indicate that Zimbabwean high school teachers are undergoing a form of de-professionalization as described in the literature review.

This Chapter will use these themes to show that teachers cannot be expected to teach citizenship education satisfactorily, as argued by Shizha and Kariwo (2011), due to de-professionalization of their occupation. However, I also found other factors that may render any possible introduction of citizenship education meaningless and unproductive, even if the issue of teacher de-professionalization were addressed.

In addition to the de-professionalization experienced by teachers, the research informants further raised concerns about their pupils, and the lack of external support that they felt negatively affected their ability to teach. This report argues that citizenship education should develop pupils into good citizens who are aware of how their country is run, how the social political and economic institutions function and what their role in the scheme of life is (Shizha and Kariwo, 2011). Before even starting to plan for such a citizenship education curriculum, however, the question arises as to how it could be successfully implemented under Zimbabwean teachers' current conditions.

This brings us to the main issue of this research; can citizenship education be meaningful in Zimbabwe given the de-professionalization of teachers? The reasons why I believe that any possible citizenship education curriculum cannot be meaningful in Zimbabwe if introduced under the current conditions will be discussed in three sections. These are teacher issues, pupil issues, and lack of external support. I will use data from the literature review to support my argument.

5.2. Discussion of the Data

A. Teacher Issues

Shizha and Kariwo (2011) argue that teachers are currently unable to teach citizenship education, in Zimbabwe, due to de-professionalization of their occupation, and political intimidation. Due to the ethical concerns which were raised in Chapter three, I did not question teachers on political intimidation. However, my findings support Shizha and Kariwo's (2011) assessment on the teacher de-professionalization negatively affecting any attempt to teach citizenship education. Teacher issues, discussed by Shizha and Kariwo (2011), which have caused de-professionalization, are insufficient remuneration, teacher attrition, curriculum relevance, and the high teacher to pupil ratio. While none of

these are new to Zimbabwean schools the worsening of these symptoms, according to the informants, post 2000 are a symptom of worsening deprofessionalization.

Ideally, for any effective teaching to take place, the remuneration of teachers should be high enough to make them concentrate their efforts completely on educating their pupils (IIEP, 2010). However, one of the problems faced by Zimbabwean high school teachers, identified by the informants in this Study, is that their remuneration is insufficient to their needs. This has led to problems which, if not addressed, will make any citizenship education curriculum introduced to Zimbabwe, in the future, meaningless and unproductive.

Bennell and Akyeampong (2007), Caillods and Postlethwaite (1989), Fredriksson (2004) and Shizha and Kariwo (2011) have all described how, when faced with difficult economic conditions such as poor pay, teachers often undertake 'survival activities'. This means being involved in work other than teaching, to earn extra income, especially when faced with an unrealistically large work load and large classes for low pay. Crick (1998) notes how, for citizenship education to have any chance for success, it is essential that pupils have their work assessed daily by teachers, a task that requires their full attention. However, the informants have described how teachers have had to engage in cross border trading, raising poultry and other such survival activities, in order to supplement their pay. This may negatively affect any potential attempt to teach citizenship education, by diverting teachers' attention away from planning and carrying out their duties.

The informants also described how the insufficient remuneration led to them struggling to fulfill kinship obligations, such as providing for the extended family. They also experienced difficulties affording even the most basic needs, for example, transport to and from work as well as affording adequate accommodation. Chataa (2010) suggests that the aforementioned problems could lead to low motivation and low job satisfaction

which, in turn, could lead to disinterest and disenchantment among teachers. Hammett and Staeheli (2009) have argued that this problem is common among South African teachers who, as a result, experience difficulty teaching citizenship education. As Shizha and Kariwo (2011) state, unless teachers enjoy basic needs like housing, food and security, efforts to improve quality of education are unlikely to succeed.

The poor remuneration described by the informants has dire implications for citizenship education. Aside from their obvious role as educators, teachers are also expected to be role models for their pupils and examples of successful educated citizens. Therefore, if the pupils see their teachers struggling to acquire basic needs, it may undermine their respect for the people that they are supposed to be modelling themselves after. Pupils will also have watched teachers exercising their citizen rights, using industrial action, in order to improve their conditions. As their conditions remain poor, despite their efforts, it may undermine pupils' beliefs about human dignity and the benefits of citizenship.

Crick (1998) and Lee and Zuze (2011) argue that citizenship education cannot achieve its ends if it is not properly resourced with relevant teacher and learning materials, like textbooks. School resources are linked to the performance of pupils. Akar (2006) agrees that in order for citizenship education to be truly effective, pupils cannot simply rely on being taught about it, but need to go out and 'live' it. This would necessitate visiting areas of civic interest, like museums or city councils and seeing it in action, as it should encourage participation in national life. Unfortunately, the research focus groups, and the interviews revealed that the schools are often poorly resourced. The informants complained of a lack of furniture, text books and equipment for their pupils, even in relatively prestigious and wealthy schools, and a lack of money to take class trips for citizenship purposes. They maintained that this has forced them to rely on methods such as lecturing using prepared information, while pupils just take notes. Akar (2006) regards this as a very poor method to transmit knowledge as such a structure is monotonous, relies on memorization. It also denies pupils the full benefit of citizenship education as they don't actually learn how to participate in a democratic society.

The informants also mentioned the need to modernize available school equipment. However, Shizha and Kariwo (2011) argue that, given the current state of the Zimbabwean economy, it is impossible to place adequate resources in schools for citizenship education to be taught effectively. Hammett and Staeheli (2009) write that schools in South Africa have seen their citizenship education programmes fail to achieve their desired ends due to the lack of educational resources. It is likely, too, that Zimbabwean high school teachers will not be able to adequately teach citizenship education without sufficient and modernized educational resources.

Bennell and Akyeampong (2007), Machingaidze et al (1998) and Gould (1993) reveal also how high pupil enrollment has resulted in large classes. The informants responses agree with this claim, stressing that the classes in Zimbabwe's high school are often far larger than they could reasonably be expected to cater for. This has led to problems, such as large and stressful workloads, with which they cope by giving less class work than is ideal. Such large classes militate against any successful implementation of citizenship education because, as Crick (1998) argues, day to day assessment of pupil's work is necessary for citizenship education to be successful. If teachers struggle with heavy workloads from the overly large classes and also undertake survival activities mentioned earlier, it is unlikely that they will be able to teach citizenship education well. Evans (2000) mentions that in order for citizenship education to be truly effective, pupils are required to participate in class activities. The large class sizes make it difficult for the teachers to give each pupil the necessary attention and skills they need.

The implications for citizenship education are, therefore, bleak. Evans (2000) describes two interpretations of citizenship education. The first is minimal interpretations of citizenship education, where pupils are only taught basic institutionalized rules concerning rights and obligations. The second is maximal interpretations, where the pupils are not only taught about the workings of the government, community and the

wider world, but actively encouraged to participate in government. The large classes, lack of educational resources, and inability to afford field trips mean that at best only minimal interpretations of citizenship education are possible. This would mean teaching Zimbabwean pupils as ‘citizens in waiting’ as argued by Kerr (2003). Tshabangu (2006) Sigauke (2011b) and Wilkins (2000) argue that such an approach most likely lend to pupils becoming passive, non-questioning citizens, who conform to the ruling ideology with uncritical acceptance of authority instead of critically conscious citizens.

As mentioned in the literature review, in order for education to flourish, the teaching occupation has to attract, retain and support a highly skilled workforce (Grossman, 2009). Yet according to the informants, the economic and political crises experienced after the year 2000 saw a very high rate of teacher attrition in Zimbabwe’s high schools. While some of the informants claimed that the rate of teacher attrition had decreased from its previous levels, it has still left Zimbabwean schools with a severe lack of qualified teachers. To make matters worse, when qualified teachers go on leave from their school or quit the occupation entirely, the informants claim that the shortage of qualified teachers in Zimbabwe means that they are not replaced by equally qualified teachers. Grossman (2009) argues that such emergency credentialing harms the quality of teaching, an argument supported by Tshabangu (2006) who found that many new Zimbabwean high school teachers were poorly trained, apathetic and lacked knowledge and skills. Such poorly qualified teachers, especially if they face a lack of educational resources and insufficient remuneration, will not be able to teach a citizenship education curriculum adequately.

The implications of such a high attrition rate, for any future possible citizenship education, are grim. Some of the informants also expressed dissatisfaction with their employment as teachers and stated that they were only in the job because they could not get any better employment. Such disdain for the teaching occupation, according to Gould (1993), may lead to future teachers joining the occupation for a short while, simply to use

it as a ‘stepping stone’ to better careers. Grossman (2009) warns that it takes between four and five years for teachers to become skilled enough to be truly effective. If early exits from the teaching occupation become more common, it could prevent Zimbabwe building up a pool of skilled and experienced teachers to teach citizenship education satisfactorily. High attrition would disrupt pupils learning, denying them consistency that is necessary for learning their citizenship education lessons well.

Bennel (2004) points that strong link with the community is also of importance to any successful citizenship education teaching. However, if teachers leave the community too quickly to put down roots, it may undermine community and pupil confidence in education. The sense of obligation which good citizens have for one another that Brighouse (2006) holds is important to citizenship education may be also undermined, as pupils may see teachers early exits as a sign that they have little sense of civic obligation. Bennell (2004) argues a high attrition rate affects teacher standing in the community negatively as they come and go too quickly to develop relations with the community.

Shizha and Kariwo (2011) and Tshabangu (2006) claim that ideally, to teach citizenship education, Zimbabwean teachers would need the freedom to teach and present different world views. Unfortunately, the informants claimed that they did not have much control over the curriculum, and some of them claimed that much of it was not relevant to the needs of their pupils. They argued that the curriculum was too ‘academic’, meaning that it heavily emphasized passing examinations over practical use of learning. This problem is mentioned by Brighouse (2006), who states that there may be conflicts in between promoting good citizenship and facilitating autonomy in pupils. In Zimbabwe, according to some of the informants, teaching topics critical to doing well in examinations is promoted, by the curriculum. In contrast citizenship education related topics, such as human rights, are passed over as they are considered of little relevance to academic success. Tshabangu (2006) argues that many Zimbabwean schools operate like factories, focussing on the quantity of education rather than the quality. This is not conducive to the environment required by citizenship education.

It was posited by some of the informants that a great deal of the curriculum-related problems stemmed from the fact that most of the officials who crafted the curriculum had no actual teaching experience. This situation could be dangerous, as those who draft the constitution may lack an understanding of what teachers face in the classrooms, a problem Hammett and Staeheli (2009) agree can cause teacher disenchantment. They further argue that teachers morale is hurt when no one seems to acknowledge their concerns, an argument they put forth as one of the reasons that South Africa's citizenship education program is experiencing problems. The same could happen to any attempt to teach citizenship education in Zimbabwe unless these issues are addressed.

B. Pupil Issues

Shizha and Kariwo (2011) argue that teachers cannot teach citizenship education satisfactorily, due to teacher de-professionalization, and my research findings regarding Zimbabwean high school teachers support their claims. In addition, I found that many informants were also concerned that the pupils themselves suffered problems that were making teaching difficult. It is likely that the ill discipline of pupils, as well as concerns of their welfare, may hamper implementation of a successful citizenship curriculum.

The disruption of schooling in Zimbabwe, due to the economic and political crises that occurred after the year 2000, was regarded by some of the informants as contributing to pupils' ill discipline, as many pupils went for years without consistent teaching. This ill discipline has been characterized, by informants, as increased use of drugs and alcohol, widespread truancy, sexual activity, and a disrespect towards their teachers which has been fueled by peer pressure. Some of the informants also considered that the ministerial regulations against teachers engaging in corporal punishment have weakened their authority in the classroom, as pupils defy them without fear of punishment. Chataa

(2010) argues that this loss of status and authority in the eyes of the pupils often leaves teachers struggling to control and teach their classes. In some Zimbabwean schools, according to Manguvo et al (2011), the situation is so bad that teachers often let discipline infractions go unremarked upon.

The implications of pupil indiscipline, for citizenship education are grim. As Rowe (1992) argues, the very basis of citizenship education is that knowledge from one community can be transferred to another. Some Zimbabwean pupils can learn negative qualities that weaken the chances of them becoming good citizens instead of the positive qualities that were mentioned by scholars such as Nziramasanga (1999), Shizha and Kariwo (2011) and Sigauke (2011a). They may then teach these to other pupils in school, as some of the informants described it, who will continue to have such negative qualities when they become adults. Many of these negative qualities mentioned, like substance abuse, may stay with them for their entire lives, undermining attempts to make them good citizens.

The large class sizes that the informants complained of, combined with pupil indiscipline, may also hamper attempts to teach citizenship education by discouraging teachers from allowing pupil participation in class. One informant mentioned how she had to spend at least five minutes trying to settle her class down before lessons could begin. This is a very time consuming problem that Rosenholtz and Simpson (1990) argue, can lead to teachers spending more time trying to exert control over disruptive pupils, than teaching. Sigauke (2011a) found that three quarters of the pupils he interviewed did not feel that they were encouraged to participate in class, and that their teachers often feared to let children engage in civic participation outside of the school for fear they may misbehave. Citizenship education should be about participation; if teachers, in an effort to cut down on ill discipline, discourage participation and discussion then pupils will not learn how to be participatory citizens.

According to the informants, the welfare of their pupils was also considered important in so far as it affected their ability to learn. IIEP (2010) argues that teachers are motivated in their jobs by the knowledge that their teaching assists their pupils to do well in life. This knowledge improves their performance as educators. However, the informants have expressed doubts and worries about the welfare of their pupils that may demotivate them from teaching them well.

Zimbabwean pupils were recorded, by the informants, as suffering from personal problems such as not being able to afford school fees, absentee parents, suffering the effects of HIV and AIDS and failing to gain employment after finishing their studies. Hammett and Staeheli (2009) write that South African pupils' welfare has played an important part in their receptiveness to citizenship education. The pupils face problems similar to those of their Zimbabwean counterparts such as struggling to get to school, a lack of food, HIV and AIDS. It was, further pointed out, by Hammett and Staeheli (2009) that pupils suffering hardships have a hard time taking citizenship education seriously, and they do not see its relevance in their lives. All these reduce their capacity to concentrate on learning and are recorded as a major hurdle for citizenship education. It is possible that unless the welfare of Zimbabwe's own pupils are taken into account if a citizenship curriculum is ever crafted, then Zimbabwean pupils will also find it hard to concentrate on their studies.

According to the informants, due to the ongoing economic hardships some parents experienced great difficulty in obtaining the necessary foreign currency to help them to pay school fees and tend to the welfare of their children. Even when payments for formal schooling were made, it was accepted that only those pupils who could afford extra tuition had any hope of passing well enough to proceed in their studies. Hammett and Staeheli (2009) state that if pupils are suffering from financial difficulties that hamper their access to education, then any future citizenship curriculum risks failure.

Akar (2006) notes that citizenship education is hampered when there are conflicts between what pupils learn at school and what they experience on the outside. One teacher that Akar interviewed complained of how difficult it was to teach about good citizenship in a corrupt society, where pupils could observe that connections were more important than education, in obtaining success. This report's own informants have stated that 'gamblers'; people with little or no education who often engage in corrupt dealings, in Zimbabwe, are seen by pupils as leading more successful lives than educated professionals. Akar (2006) notes that when pupils observe that education is failing to provide success, they end up regarding citizenship education as ineffectual.

The implications of citizenship education not being taken seriously, in the future, are dire. Pupils may venerate uneducated but financially successful citizens rather than educated professionals and this will consequently make them neglect their education. Such a situation may hamper citizenship education. Another aspect concerns the gap between rich and poor pupils. The knowledge, by poor pupils, that they may miss out on the best of education, and the bright future it promises, may undermine citizenship solidarity, as noted by Brighouse (2006). This is especially of concern as the poor pupils may resent the wealthier ones and widen the gap between rich and poor. Without adequate knowledge granted by citizenship education, the poor pupils may have a more difficult time of participating in government, as they are also more likely to be excluded from full public policy benefits (Salisbury, 1979). Such an outcome could weaken social bonding and shared identity which Rowe (1992) argues is necessary for citizenship.

It was stated by some informants that there were many teacher training colleges and universities, in Zimbabwe, which could absorb high school graduates. However, the lack of employment opportunities, for the educated, was considered by the informants to make education near useless in the eyes of most of the pupils. The sight of many high school graduates loitering in the town shopping center or buying and selling goods could be demoralizing to both teachers and pupils. Teachers may feel that their efforts are for nothing as their pupils do not gain any meaningful employment and pupils may feel that

concentrating on their studies is a waste of time as they cannot use education to improve their lives. Nziramasanga (1999) and WOZA (2010a) observe that though there is an increase in number, of high school leavers, their low level of education does not qualify them for employment in Zimbabwe.

Brighouse (2006) argues that citizenship education should result in pupils becoming autonomous, self governing adults, but the lack of gainful employment, also mentioned by the informants, militates against this. This means that it may not be enough that pupils are knowledgeable about citizenship, they must also be able to support themselves in the future. If this cannot be perceived, it may be taken as a threat to any future citizenship education curriculum. If pupils do poorly, also, due to being taught by unqualified teachers, even if they learn what is expected of them as citizens, they may not be able to get meaningful employment or support themselves. This is not optimal for citizenship education.

C. Lack of External Support

Nziramasanga (1998) and Shizha and Kariwo (2011) both state that in order for citizenship education to be truly successful, it requires support from outside of the school. This is supported by Brighouse (2006) and Sutherland (2001) who argue that pupils are not only influenced by the school community, but also by what they experience outside of school. This means that what pupils learn and experience can be more influential than what they are taught at school. Thus, in order for a citizenship curriculum to be truly meaningful, teachers would need the support of the communities from which their pupils come. Unfortunately, the informants painted a very grim picture of the lack of external support when performing their duties that, if it continues, may hamper citizenship education.

Parents of pupils attending schools, have the most control over the environment of their children. They have the potential to provide the most support to teachers' efforts to educate their children, so they are especially important in this regard. Some of the research informants described relations with the parents as cordial and said that the parents were willing to provide money for a good education. Such parents acknowledged the importance of the teacher to their children. Teacher incentives, where the parents subsidize teachers' remuneration, were especially credited as being good for morale. However, there were several issues raised by the informants that painted a troubling picture, for any attempt to teach citizenship education in the future.

It was pointed out by some of the informants that some parents were either unable or unwilling to play a large role in supporting their pupils' education. Many parents were overseas or engaged in survival activities of their own, which prevented them from paying as much attention to their children's work as would be ideal. Such parents then expected teachers to do all the work of educating their children. This practise is decried by Nziramasanga (1999) who observes that both parents and teachers have a duty to develop the youth and support citizenship education. Lack of such support from some parents has led to pupils not doing their work, as they know that their parents will not check on their progress. The misbehavior of many of the pupils is worsened when their own parents fail to discipline them at home, contributing to difficulties of introducing citizenship education.

It was also observed, by some informants, that some parents often act hostile towards them and blame teachers for the poor performance of their children. The increased influence of parents over school affairs, through the School Development Association, was further sighted as a cause of some resentment. Some of the parents were accused of sabotaging school finances by blocking the raising of levies and incentives, or by paying their vitally needed fees late. Chataa (2010) argues that teachers are no longer accountable solely to their superiors, but to the school parents as well. This has lost them

their authority and status in the eyes of both their pupils and the parents. The implications for possible future citizenship education, therefore, seem grim. Brighouse (2006) argues that the lack of parental support for education at home can often counteract any citizenship education received at school. If parents and teachers exhibit such animosity towards each other, then pupils may come to lose respect for their teachers.

5.3. Conclusion

While it is entirely possible and highly desirable for the Zimbabwean government to introduce a citizenship education curriculum under the current state of teacher de-professionalization it would be meaningless and unproductive. According to the data collected, teachers are experiencing great difficulties teaching the current curriculum given their de-professionalization. If further changes to the curriculum were introduced they would just add to the burden that they bear, as argued by Booyse and Swanepoel (2004). Even if teachers' de-professionalization were adequately addressed, as suggested by Shizha and Kariwo (2011), they would still face teaching pupils who lack discipline and suffer personal welfare problems that would make them difficult to teach. There is also a noted lack of adequate support for education from the community outside of the school that would be necessary for citizenship education to take root. Chapter six will conclude the report and make recommendations. It will suggest a plan of action for the necessary pre-conditions before a citizenship education can be introduced to the country to ensure that it is meaningful.

6 CHAPTER SIX: SUMMARY AND RECOMMENDATIONS

6.1. Summary

This chapter concludes the report and consists of two sub-sections. The first sub-section summarizes the findings of the previous chapters. The second sub-section puts forward recommendations, detailed plans on how to alleviate the issues discussed in this report that may negatively affect any attempt to teach a citizenship education curriculum in Zimbabwe. Chapter one consisted of the background to the problem, which described the issues that Zimbabwe had experienced that led to calls for citizenship education to be introduced. To answer the main question, 'Can citizenship education be meaningful in Zimbabwe given the de-professionalization of teachers?' three sub-questions were created. These were, 'What are the conditions under which Zimbabwean teacher's work?', 'What do high school teachers in Zimbabwe think are the factors that cause their de-professionalization?' and 'How might de-professionalization affect teaching citizenship education in Zimbabwe?'

Chapter one included a statement of the problem and explained the objective of the report which was to find out whether Zimbabwe's high school teachers could teach citizenship education satisfactorily, given their de-professionalization. The objective of the research was to be fulfilled using the following aims. The first was to explain data from the literature review on the nature of citizenship education, and then the de-professionalization of teachers and its effect on their occupation. The researcher found out, from teachers who have taught in Zimbabwe, their opinions and experiences of trying to carry out their duties under conditions of de-professionalization. Finally, I used the gathered data from the literature review and field research to put forth the argument

that Zimbabwean teachers may not be able to teach citizenship education satisfactorily, due to the current state of their profession.

The significance of the Study, to the current debates on citizenship education in Zimbabwe, was also explained in Chapter one. Practically, it would help those people intent on rebuilding Zimbabwe's education system to understand the challenges faced at a local level, by the biggest employees of the education sector, the teachers themselves. Further, it would add to theoretical debates, by Sigauke (2006), Shizha and Kariwo (2011) and Tshabangu (2011), on citizenship education in Zimbabwe, by adding new information on teachers' beliefs, and their ground level view of the problems normally dealt with at national level. Another significant aspect of the topic is also that it would add to the available literature on citizenship education, by authors such as Nziramasanga (1999), Shizha and Kariwo (2011), Sigauke (2011a) and Tshabangu (2006). It would do this by expanding on the practical difficulties likely to be encountered if it is introduced.

Chapter two consisted of the literature review which detailed how prospective citizenship education may be derailed by the de-professionalization of teachers. The literature itself discussed citizenship education and de-professionalization. It showed that, while citizenship education was usually taken to mean educating pupils to be good citizens, there was no single interpretation of what citizenship and then citizenship education meant. Broadly speaking though, citizenship education was perceived as being concerned with educating pupils to be good citizens. What this entailed, though, varied greatly according to what a good citizen was considered to be, by those in power.

De-professionalization was also discussed and taken to mean the loss of an occupation's professional status. In the case of teachers, the symptoms of this de-professionalization were shown to include de-motivation and low job satisfaction, attrition and low remuneration. Teacher pedagogy and the curriculum were also discussed, as they were considered important to the success of any potential citizenship education program. The

literature suggested that Zimbabwean teachers were experiencing de-professionalization. Further, the literature on de-professionalization would be used alongside the data gathered from informants in Chapter four, to reveal whether Zimbabwean high school teachers were suffering from the effects of de-professionalization.

Chapter three detailed the methodology employed in this research report. It explained how focus group discussions and semi-structured interviews were used to gather qualitative data from the twenty-five Zimbabwean high school teachers who took part in this Study. It also revealed the limitations of the Study and how these were overcome, and further showed that ethical considerations had been taken into account when conducting the research.

Chapter four answered the first two sub questions, ‘What are the conditions under which Zimbabwean teacher’s work?’ and ‘What do high school teachers in Zimbabwe think are the factors that cause their de-professionalization?’ respectively. It displayed the data gathered from the informants and showed that they had experienced the symptoms of de-professionalization as described in the literature review. The chapter divided the main issues discussed by the informants into eight themes. These were insufficient remuneration, the high teacher to pupil ratio, insufficient resources, pupil discipline, lack of external support, pupil welfare, teacher attrition, and curriculum relevance. It showed that, in the opinions of the informants, Zimbabwean high school teachers had suffered the symptoms of de-professionalization.

Chapter five answered the third sub-question, ‘How might de-professionalization affect teaching citizenship education in Zimbabwe?’ It argued that Shizha and Kariwo (2011) were correct in their assessment, that teachers in Zimbabwe were too demotivated by de-professionalization to teach citizenship education. It further argued that there were, however, other important factors that could negatively affect teaching citizenship

education. These included lack of support from outside of the school, for both the teachers and the lessons that they taught, and the welfare of the pupils. Disciplinary problems with the pupils, attributed to the years of disruptions in schools, peer pressure and broken homes, were also cited as contributing to a picture of pupils unable or unwilling to learn. Now, Chapter six has summarized the previous five chapters and presents a plan of action, in the next sub-section, to reform education and allow teachers to teach citizenship education satisfactorily.

6.2. Recommendations

Making recommendations, to the problems presented in this report, is complicated by the political uncertainty in Zimbabwe at the time of this Study. Zimbabwe's government is currently under a unity accord where three parties with conflicting ideologies share power and often clash on national policy. This complicates even defining what a good citizen is, which would make a citizenship education curriculum difficult to create. This is coupled with the severe political and economic disruptions of the past, the effects of which are still being felt to this day. The consequences of these crises have been catastrophic, with large number of parents out of work, pupils suffering from the effects of broken homes and HIV/AIDS, and a large number of teachers suffering from de-professionalization. These problems would have to be attended to before teachers can be expected to teach citizenship education satisfactorily.

Ideally, in order to for teachers to be able to teach citizenship education effectively, the first plan of action would be to deal with these symptoms of de-professionalization. Teachers would need to be well motivated and have access to adequate educational resources. They would need to be able to concentrate completely on their tasks without needing to resort to 'survival activities'. The profession must also be made attractive to school leavers and be able to retain experienced teachers who are already in the

occupation. The pupils themselves should be receptive and enjoy an informal environment outside of school that would reinforce and strengthen the citizenship education lessons learnt in class. The community should be able to actively participate in raising the proper ideals of citizenship in pupils. This would require widespread political, economic and social reforms.

Sadly, due to the aforementioned political instability and conflicting ideologies of the government, it is unlikely that any major reforms will be possible any time soon. Thus, I have several suggestions for the local level that may help make local schooling more conducive to teaching citizenship education meaningfully.

- Low Remuneration

The most obvious seeming solution to this problem would be to increase teacher salaries. Unfortunately, due to the poor state of the economy, this is not feasible. Instead I advocate soliciting NGOs for support for teachers. As mentioned in chapter four, most NGOs are mostly concerned with supporting the youth who have been afflicted by hardships of the Zimbabwean crises. If they can be persuaded that the children's welfare is also served by ensuring consistent, good quality teaching then perhaps they could solicit funds to supplement teacher pay.

- High Pupil Teacher ratio

This problem is compounded by the fact that the building of school infrastructure in Zimbabwe has not kept up with the growth of pupils. I suggest that building of new schools is the only way to reduce the strain on already existing ones. It would be an expensive undertaking, but the only alternatives are the inefficient 'hot seating' method where teachers soon burn out from the heavy work load.

- Insufficient School Resources.

The lack of textbooks may be offset by shifting to electronic resources, especially computers. Cheap computers are available that schools can afford. The ministry of education could place educational resources on line, allowing schools to down load information and then print it for pupils use rather than buy expensive textbooks. It would also ensure that the information being taught is up to date. It may also be possible to ask the community for old and broken furniture that can easily be repaired that the pupils could use.

- Pupil Discipline

Pupils will also need to be re-motivated to realize that education is worth the effort that they put into it. Further, to counter the belief that education is no longer a path to success, inviting successful alumni to give speeches and offer advice to pupils could re-inspire them. For personal problems, increased guidance and counseling in schools should be implemented.

- Lack of External Support.

Inviting companies and businesses operating in the area to invest in education by offering them tax incentives to support pupils should also be considered. By sponsoring education they would be cultivating a new crop of employees and increase their standing in the community. They could also donate old stock and equipment to school resources and sponsor trips for pupils to important civic areas. Co-operation on the local level between parents and teachers should also be encouraged, beyond the usual formal School Development Association meetings, as input from both parents and teachers, is vital for the success of citizenship education. Teacher/ parent workshops and seminars can be organized on school grounds to discuss problems faced by the school and pupils. To garner further community support, implementing night school could aid those pupils who lost out on education time during the crises of the past. It will also give parents who

attend a firsthand view of the problems faced by teachers, such as the lack of furniture and overcrowding.

- Pupil Welfare.

Many pupils are AIDS orphans and have no guardians. Children-headed households are not uncommon (Nziramasanga, 1999). These children will need a great deal of community support, if they are to be taught citizenship education satisfactorily. Neighbourhood and community bodies could provide support by providing food, or lobbying for aid from NGO's and other well wishers. NGO's working in individual communities can be brought together to work in concert with community councils, to help pupils in need, and ease the burden of young family heads, providing them with income or work, or arranging for other forms of care that will allow them to attend school. The curriculum has been criticized as not granting pupils education relevant to life after school. I, therefore, advocate entrepreneurial training which should also be included in the citizenship curriculum. This way, the pupils may start their own businesses after school, instead of relying on the shrinking job market.

- Teacher Attrition

The loss of talented teachers from the occupation and their replacement with untrained educators who only join due to the lack of alternative employment is a serious problem.

To solve the problem of the occupation's lack of attractiveness, I suggest implementing a system of graded pay where new teachers may start off in the occupation with a basic salary that is adequate for their needs. Over a set number of years of service, more benefits could be added, such as car loans and housing allowances, training and mentoring. More off time for teaching courses and facilitating of correspondence courses should also be implemented. School leavers would also be attracted to the occupation and

this would help Zimbabwe to build a large pool of well educated, experienced and dedicated teachers.

In the case of untrained teachers, mentoring and training from experienced teachers may help them gain the ability they need to be effective teachers. Combined with the above mentioned benefits, it may alleviate teacher attrition, offering them the incentive to stay in the occupation.

- Curriculum Relevance

The curriculum has been criticized as not granting pupils education relevant to life after school. I, therefore, advocate entrepreneurial training which should also be included in the citizenship curriculum. This way, the pupils may start their own businesses after school, instead of relying on the shrinking job market. There should be more emphasis on human rights and other citizenship education related topics in the examinations at all levels. Even if it is not a full curriculum change, it could help alert pupils on these issues and pave the way for wider change.

7 BIBLIOGRAPHY

Adler, M. (2005) *Government, Citizenship and Education*. Retrieved 2005, May, 23 from Realuofc: http://www.realuofc.org/libed/adler/gce.html.

Akar, B. (2006) 'Teacher Reflections of Teaching Citizenship Education in Lebanon: A Qualitative Pilot Study.' *Reflecting Education.* Vol. 2 (2): 48-63.

Ary, D. Jacobs, L.C. and Razavieh, A. (1972) *Introduction to Research in Education.* New York: Holt, Rinehart and Winston.

Barriball, K. and While, A. (1994) 'Collecting data using a semi-structured interview: a discussion paper' *Journal of Advanced Nursing*, Vol. 19 (2): pp.328-335

Bennell, P. (2004) *Teacher Motivation, Perceptions and Incentives in Sub-Saharan Africa and Asia.* Retrieved 2011, June, 20 from Eldis: http://www.eldis.org/vfile/upload/1/document/0708/doc15160.pdf.

Bennell, P. and Akyeampong, K. (2007) *Teacher Motivation in Sub-Saharan Africa and South Asia.* London: Department for International Development, Educational Papers.

Best, J.W.B. and Khan, J.V. (1993) *Research in Education.* Boston: Allyn and Bacon.

Booyse, J. and Swanepoel, C. (2004) 'The Impact of Educational Change on Teachers of the Rainbow Nation' in P. Poppleton and J. Williamson (Eds.) *New Realities of Secondary*

Teachers Work Lives. pp 173-205. Oxford: Symposium Books.

Borg, W.R. and Gall, M.D. (1983) *Educational Research: an Introduction.* New York: Longman.

Bourne, R. (2011) *Catastrophe: What Went Wrong in Zimbabwe?* London: Zed Books.

Brighouse, H. (2006) *On Education.* New York: Routeledge, Taylor and Francis.

Brown, S.G. (1991) *Education in the Developing World: Conflict and Crisis.* New York: Longman.

Bryman, A. (2004) *Social Research Methods.* Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Burde, D. (2004) 'Weak States, Strong Communities? Promoting Community Participation in Post-conflict Countries' *Comparative Education.* Vol. 6 (2): 73-87.

Butts, R.F. (1998) *The Morality of Democratic Citizenship: Goals for Civic Education in the Republics third Century*. Retrieved 2005, May, 23 from Civiced: http://www.civiced.org/papers/morality/morality_toc.html

Caillods, F. and Postlethwaite, N.T. (1989) 'Teaching/Learning Conditions in Developing Countries.' in F. Caillods (Ed.) *The Prospects for Educational Planning.* pp 134-173. Paris: IIEP/UNESCO.

Castillo, J.J. (2009) *Population Sampling Techniques.* Retrieved 2012, January, 9 from experiment-resources: http://www.experiment-resources.com/population-sampling.html.

Chataa, B. (2010) *Namibia: Factors Affecting the Status of Teachers.* Retrieved 2011, October, 11 from All Africa: http://allafrica.com/stories/201009020288.html.

Chireshe, R. and Shumba, A. (2011) ‘Teaching as a Profession in Zimbabwe: Are Teachers Facing a Motivation Crisis’ *Journal of Social Science,* Vol. 28 (2): 113-118.

Chivore, B.R.S. (1988) ‘Factors determining the attractiveness of the teaching profession in Zimbabwe’ *International Review of Education.* Vol. 34 (1): 59-78.

Clore, D. (2003) *Crisis in Zimbabwe.* Retrieved 2011, March, 15 from Bibliolibertaire: www.bibliolibertaire.org/Textes/crisis_in_zimbabwe.doc

Craig, J. (1990) *Comparative African Experiences in Implementing Educational Policies.* Washington D.C: World Bank Discussion Papers Africa Technical Department Series.

Crick, B. (1998) *Education for Citizenship and the Teaching of Democracy in Schools: Final Report of the Advisory Group on Citizenship.* London: QCA.

Cunningham, J. (1992) ‘Rights, Responsibilities and School Ethos.’ in L.B. Jones and N. Jones. (Eds.) *Education for Citizenship: Ideas and Perspectives for Cross Curricular Study.* pp 145-164. London: Cogan Page.

Davies, L. (2001) ‘Citizenship Education and Contradictions.’ *British Journal of Sociology of Education* Vol. 22 (2): 299–308.

Eggers, D. and Calegari, N.C. (2011) *The High Cost of Low Teacher Salaries* (published, May, 1, 2011). Retrieved 2012, August, 29 from The New York Times: http://www.nytimes.com/2011/05/01/opinion/01eggers.html

Evans, K. (2000) ‘Beyond the Work-related Curriculum: Citizenship and Learning after 16’ in R. Bailey (Ed.) *Teaching Values and Citizenship across the Curriculum: Educating Children for the World.* pp 157-170. London: Kogan Page.

Fredriksson, U. (2004) *Quality Education and the Key Role of Teachers.* Retrieved 2011, March, 14 from International Bureau of Education: http://www.ibe.unesco.org/International/ICE47/English/Organisation/Workshops/Workshop4CompENG.pdf

George, E., Louw, D.A. and Badenhorst, G.M. (2008) 'Job Satisfaction among Urban Secondary-School Teachers in Namibia.' *South Africa Journal of Education,* Vol. 28 (2): 135-154.

Giddens, A. (2006) *Sociology.* Cambridge: Polity Press.

Gould, W.T.S. (1993) *People and Education in the Third World.* London: Longman Scientific & Technical.

Greenstein, R., Roberts, B., and Sitas, A. (2004) *Qualitative Research Methodology* in Greenstein, R. (ed.) Research Methods Training Manual. (Unpublished).

Grossman, P. (2009) *Jobs are hard to find.* (published April 19, 2009). Retrieved from The New York Times: http://roomfordebate.blogs.nytimes.com/2009/04/19/teaching-no-fallback-career/

Hackos, J. and Redish, J. (1998) *User and Task Analysis for Interface Design*. New York: Wiley.

Hammett, D. and Staeheli, L.A. (2009) *Citizenship Education in South Africa: A Report to schools* Retrieved 2012, August, 13 from the University of Edinburgh: http://www.geos.ed.ac.uk/homes/dhammett/report.pdf

Harrell, M.C. and Bradley, M.A. (2009) *Data Collection Methods: Semi-Structured Interviews and Focus Groups.* Retrieved 2011, January, 9 from Rand Corporation: www.rand.org/pubs/technical_reports/2009/RAND_TR718.pdf on 9 January 2011

Hawley, M. (2008) *Preparing for User Research Interviews: Seven Things to Remember*. Retrieved 2012, January, 9 from Uxmatters: http://uxmatters.com/mt/archives/2008/07/preparing-for-user-research-interviews-seven-things-to-remember.php

Heater, D. (1990) *Citizenship: The Civic Ideal in World History, Politics and Education.* London: Longman.

Heater, D. (1992) 'Tensions in the Citizenship Ideal": in L.B. Jones, N. and Jones (Eds.) *Education for Citizenship; Ideas and Perspectives for Cross Curricular Study.'* pp 19-33. London: Kogan Page.

Heystek, J. (2010) 'Governing Body's Responsibility and Power for Quality Education', *Journal of Education Periodical of the Kenton Education Association* Vol. 48 (1): 99-118.

IIEP. (International Institute for Educational Planning) (2010) *Guidebook for Planning Education in Emergencies and Reconstruction.* Retrieved 2011, May, 2011 from IIEP: http://www.iiep.unesco.org/: http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0019/001902/190223e.pdf

Ingersoll, R.M. and Merrill, E. (2011) 'The Status of Teaching as a Profession.' in J. Ballantine and J. Spade (Eds.) *Schools and Society: A Sociological Approach to Education.* pp 184-198. California: Pine Forge Press/Sage publications.

Kallet, R.H. (2004) *How to Write the Methods Section of a Research Paper.* Retrieved 2011, October, 6 from Dartmouth: http://cancer.dartmouth.edu/documents/pdf/methods_section.pdf.

Kanyongo G.Y (2005) ‘Zimbabwe's Public Education System Reforms: Successes and Challenges’ *International Education Journal*, Vol. 6 (1), 65-74.

Kerr, D. (1999) *Citizenship Education: an International Comparison* Retrieved 2012, March, 18, from Inca: http://www.inca.org.uk/pdf/citizenship_no_intro.pdf

Kerr D. (2003) Citizenship education in England: the making of a new subject. *Online Journal of Social Science Education.* Vol. 2 (1): 1–11.

Kitzinger, J. (1995) ‘Introducing Focus Groups’ *British Medical Journal.* Vol. 311 (7000): 299-302.

Kombo, D.K. and Tromp, D.L.A. (2009) *Proposal and Thesis Writing*. Nairobi: Pauline Public Africa.

Kostakopoulou, D. (2008) *The Future Governance of Citizenship*. New York: Cambridge University Press.

Kusereka, L.G. (2003) *Factors influencing the motivation of Zimbabwean secondary school teachers: An Education Management Perspective* Retrieved 2011, October, 11 from UNISA:
http://uir.unisa.ac.za/bitstream/handle/10500/1071/01Dissertation.pdf?sequence=2

Lee, V. E. and Zuze, T. L. (2011) ‘School Resources and Academic Performance in Sub Saharan Africa’ *Comparative Education Review.* Vol. 55 (3): 369-397.

Leedy P.D. (1993) *Practical Research: Planning and Design*. New York: Macmillan.

Lester, S (1999) *An introduction to phenomenological research*. Retrieved 2013, May from sld.demon: http://www.sld.demon.co.uk/resmethy.pdf

Machingaidze, T., Pfukani, P. and Shumba, S. (1998) *The Quality of Primary Education: some Policy Suggestions based on a Survey of Schools.* Paris: IIEP

Manguvo, A., Whitney, S.D. and Chareka, O. (2011) 'The Crisis of Student Misbehavior in Zimbabwean Schools: Teachers Perceptions on Impact of Macro Socio-Economic Challenges.' *International Journal of Education, Administration and Policy studies.* Vol. 2 (4): 40-44.

Mawadza, A. (2009) *A System Broken Down: An assessment of the challenges facing the Education system in Zimbabwe*. Harare: States in Transition Observatory.

Nziramasanga, C.T. (1999) *Report of the Presidential Commission of Enquiry into Education and Training.* Harare: The Commission.

Poppleton, P., Williamson, J. and Menlo, A. (2004) 'Review, Reflections and Realities' in P. Poppleton and J. Williamson (Eds.) *New Realities of Secondary Teachers Work Lives*. pp 307-318. Symposium Books: United Kingdom.

Punch, K. (2000) *Developing Effective Research Proposals.* California: Sage publishers.

Rabiee, F. (2007) 'Focus Group Interview and Data Analysis.' *Proceedings of the Nutrition Society.* Vol. 63 (4): 655-660.

Roller, M.R. (2011) *Qualitative Research Design* Retrieved 2012, March, 12 from Roller Research: http://www.rollerresearch.com/MRR%20WORKING%20PAPERS/Qualitative%20Research%20Design.pdf

Rosenholtz, S.J. and Simpson, C. (1990) ‘Workplace Conditions and the Rise and Fall of Teachers’ Commitment.’ *Sociology of Education.* Vol. 63 (4): 241–257.

Rowe, D. (1992) ‘The Citizen and the Law: Teaching about the rights and duties of Citizenship’ L.B. Jones and N. Jones (Eds.) *Education for Citizenship: Ideas and Perspectives for Cross Curricular study.* pp 51-65. London: Biddles.

Sachs, J. (2001) ‘Teacher Professional Identity: Competing Discourses and Outcomes.’ *Journal of Education Policy.* Vol. 16 (2): 149-161.

Salisbury R.H. (1979) *Key Concepts of Citizenship. Perspectives and Dilemmas.* Washington: Dept. of Health, Education, and Welfare.

Sawchuk, S. (2012) *Teacher Quality, Status Entwined Among Top-Performing Nations.* Retrieved 2012, July, 4 from EducationWeek: http://www.edweek.org/ew/articles/2012/01/12/16teachers.h31.html

Schlee, B. (2011) *Economic crisis and political Apathy in Zimbabwe* Retrieved 2012, May, 14 from International Political Science Association: http://saopaulo2011.ipsa.org/sites/saopaulo2011.ipsa.org/files/papers/paper-1804.pdf

Seco, G.M.D.S. (2002) *Teacher Satisfaction: Some Practical Implications for Teacher Professional Development Models.* Paper presented at the European Conference on Educational Research, University of Lisbon, 11-14 September 2002.

Seymour, A. (2004) *Focus Groups: An Important Tool for Strategic Planning.* Retrieved 2012, January, 19 from Justice Solutions: http://www.justicesolutions.org/art_pub_focus_groups.pdf.

Shizha, E. and Kariwo, M.T. (2011) *Education and Development in Zimbabwe: A Social, Political and Economic Analysis.* Rotterdam: Sense publishers.

Sigauke, A.T. (2011a) 'Young People, Citizenship and Education in Zimbabwe' in *International Journal of Education*. Vol. 32 (2): 214-223.

Sigauke, A.T. (2011b) 'Citizenship and Citizenship education: Critical discourse analysis of Zimbabwe Presidential Commission Report.' *Education, Citizenship and Social Justice* Vol. 6 (1): 69–86.

Sofaer, S. (1999) 'Qualitative Methods: What Are They and Why Use Them?' *Health Services Research*. Vol. 34 (4): 1101-1118.

Strauss, A., & Corbin, J. (1990) *Basics of Qualitative Research: Grounded theory procedures and techniques*. California: Sage.

Stroud, J. D. (2010) *Basic Sampling Strategies: Sample vs. Population Data.* Retrieved 2012, September, 18 from iSixSigma: http://www.isixsigma.com/tools-templates/sampling-data/basic-sampling-strategies-sample-vs-population-data/

Suryanarayana N.V.S. and Luciana M. Z. (2010) *Teaching Competency and Teacher Satisfaction among Secondary School Teachers.* Retrieved 2012, November, 19 from Articlesbase: http://www.articlesbase.com/tutoring-articles/teaching-competency-and-teacher-job-satisfaction-among-secondary-school-teachers-3108434.html

Sutherland, M.B. (2001) 'Education for Citizenship in the United Kingdom-Caught or Taught?' in L.J. Limage (Ed.) *Democratizing Education and Educating Democratic Citizens: International and Historic Perspectives*. pp 245-266. New York: Routeledge Farmer.

Teferra, D. and Skauge, T. (2006) *Teacher Education in Africa: An International Reference Handbook.* Retrieved 2011, June, 12, from Knowpool: HTTP://www.knowpool.uib.no/docs/papers/2006/teferra-skauge.pdf

Tolonen, H. Mähönen, M. Kuulasmaa, K. and Nissinen, A. (2002) *Definition of Target Population and Sampling.* Retrieved 2011, October, 13 from the European Health Risk Monitoring Project: http://www.ktl.fi/publications/ehrm/product3/section2_1.htm

Tonini, D.C. (2005) 'The Breadbasket goes Empty: Zimbabwe a Country in Crisis' *Education in Emergencies and Post Conflict Situations: Problems Responses and Possibilities.* Vol. 2 (1): 93-105.

Tshabangu, I.P. (2006) 'Student Participation and Responsible Citizenship in a Non-Polyarchy: An Evaluation of Challenges facing Zimbabwe's Schools.' *International Education Journal*. Vol. 7 (1): 56-65.

Valenzuela, D. and Shrisvastava, P. (2008) *Interview as a Method for Qualitative Research.* Retrieved 2012, August, 13 from ASU: http://www.public.asu.edu/~kroel/www500/Interview%20Fri.pdf

de Vaus, D.A. (2001) *Research Design in Social Research.* California: Sages.

Wassenaar D.R. (2006) 'Ethical Issues in Social Science Research.' in M. TerreBlanche, K. Durrheim and D. Painter (Eds.) *Research in Practise; Applied methods for the Social Sciences.* pp 60-79. Cape Town: Jutas.

Webb, C. and Kevern, J. (2001) 'Focus groups as a Research Method: a Critique of Some Aspects of their use in Nursing Research' *Journal of Advanced Nursing.* Vol. 33 (6): 798-805.

Welsh, P. (2009) *If you don't love it, leave.* (Published April 19, 2009). Retrieved from The New York Times: http://roomfordebate.blogs.nytimes.com/2009/04/19/teaching-no-fallback-career/

Weiss, R.S. (1995) *Learning from Strangers: the Art and Method of Qualitative Interview Studies.* New York: Free Press.

Wexly, K.N. and Yukl, G.A. (1984). *Organizational Behaviour and Personnel Psychology.* Illinois: Homewood.

Wiersma, W. (2000) *Research Methods in Education: An Introduction.* Massachusetts: Needham heights.

Wilkins, C. (2000) 'Citizenship Education.' in R. Bailey (Ed.) *Teaching Values and Citizenship across the Curriculum: Educating Children for the World.* pp 14-27. London: Kogan Page.

Wilkinson, S. (2004) 'Focus Group Research.' in D. Silverman (Ed.) *Qualitative Research Theory Method and practise*. pp 177-200. Thousand Oaks: Sage.

WOZA. (Women of Zimbabwe Arise) (2010a) *Looking Back to Look Forward – Education in Zimbabwe: a WOZA Perspective.* Retrieved 2011, June, 14 from WOZA Zimbabwe: http://wozazimbabwe.org/wp-content/uploads/2010/01/looking-back-to-look-forward-education-in-zimbabwe-a-woza-perspective1.pdf

WOZA. (Women of Zimbabwe Arise) (2010b) *WOZA and MOZA Demand Real Education.* Retrieved 2011, June, 14 from WOZA Zimbabwe :http://wozazimbabwe.org/?p=613

8 APPENDICES

Appendix A

JOHN ERLWANGER: 571823

Development Studies

Focus group Participant information form

Dear Sir/ Madam

My name is John Erlwanger and I am carrying out focus group discussions to gather information as part of a research report for a Masters in Development Studies. It is titled "A study of the Experiences of the teachers in typical Zimbabwean Urban Schools during the Economic crisis." and seeks to understand the experience and observation of teachers who taught during the last 10 years. I would be very grateful if you, as a Zimbabwean school teacher, could help me with this by joining a group with your peers and telling me of your experiences. All that would be required of you is to discuss your experiences and observations on teaching with your peers, while I record details relevant to my research. The intended duration of this exercise should be 2 or 3 hour sessions at a private residence.

You are under no obligation and will suffer no loss or penalties for refusing this request. There are no risks to your employment if you participate as your name and school will not be mentioned in the final report. A pseudonym will be used instead of your real name. You can decline to answer any questions you feel uncomfortable with or leave the research at anytime. The information garnered from any discussion will be stored in my personal computer, but you can request to have it destroyed.

Appendix B

JOHN ERLWANGER: 571823

Development Studies

Focus group Participant consent form

I..... agree to take part in a focus group to discuss teachers experiences in Zimbabwe, and that the information gained may be used by the interviewee for his research report. I participate in the knowledge that I am free to withdraw from the study at anytime without prejudicing any current access to facilities. I also acknowledge that I am not entitled to any remuneration for this endeavor.

Signature

Name

Appendix C

INTERVIEW SCHEDULE SUBMITTED BY JOHN ERLWANGER

STUDENT NUMBER: 571823

TEL:
0783466936

1. Why did you become a teacher?
2. How long on average, have you been a teacher?
3. When did you join this school and what were your hopes and challenges when you did?
4. Have there been any negative or positive changes at your school since you began?
5. Can you please speak of your experiences of education up to 2008?
6. Were there any problems in education before 2000?
7. In your experience has dollarization of the economy affected education and if so how?
8. What do you think of the current standards of education?
9. How do you think the students you have taught view education?
10. How do you think these standards will affect the future prospects of the students you teach?
11. What is the teacher turnover of your school like? Why do you think this is so?
12. What are your long term plans as a teacher?
13. What are the challenges you face in your job as a teacher and how do you cope with them?
14. Have you seen any improvements in education since the formation of the unity government?
15. How is the schools relationship with the parents committee?
16. Do you get support when you face challenges? If so from where?
17. What do you think of what students are taught and how they taught?

18. How do you see the future of education in the future will it get better or worse and why?
19. Any observations you would like to add?

Appendix D

FOCUS GROUP SCHEDULE SUBMITTED BY JOHN EDWARD ERLWANGER STUDENT NUMBER:571823

TEL: 07834669 36

1. Why did you become teachers?
2. How long on average, have you been teachers?
3. When did you join this school and what were your hopes and challenges when you did?
4. Have there been any negative or positive changes at your schools since you began?
5. Can you please speak of your experiences of education up to 2008?
6. Were there any problems in education before 2000?
7. In your experience has dollarization of the economy affected education and if so how?
8. What do you think of the current standards of education?
9. How do you think the students you have taught view education?
10. How do you think these standards will affect the future prospects of the students you teach?
11. What is the teacher turnover of your school like? why do you think this is so?
12. What are your long term plans as teachers?
13. What are the challenges you face in your jobs as a teachers and how do you cope with them?
14. Have you seen any improvements in education since the formation of the unity government?
15. How is the schools relationship with the parents committee?
16. Do you get support when you face challenges? If so from where?

17. What do you think of what students are taught and how they taught?

18. How do you see the future of education in the future will it get better or worse and why?

19. Any observations you would like to add?

Appendix E

Research Office

HUMAN RESEARCH ETHICS COMMITTEE (NON MEDICAL)
H110806 Erlwanger

CLEARANCE CERTIFICATE	**PROTOCOL NUMBER H110806**
PROJECT TITLE	A study of the Experiences of the teachers in typical Zimbabwean Urban Schools during the Economic crisis
INVESTIGATOR(S)	Mr J E Erlwanger
SCHOOL/DEPARTMENT	Development Studies
DATE CONSIDERED	12 August 2011
DECISION OF THE COMMITTEE	Approved Unconditionally
EXPIRY DATE	31 August 2013
DATE 07 October 2011	**CHAIRPERSON** (Professor R Thornton)

cc: R Matshedisho

DECLARATION OF INVESTIGATOR(S)

To be completed in duplicate and **ONE COPY** returned to the Secretary at Room 10005, 10th Floor, Senate House, University.

I/We fully understand the conditions under which I am/we are authorized to carry out the abovementioned research and I/we guarantee to ensure compliance with these conditions. Should any departure to be contemplated from the research procedure as approved I/we undertake to resubmit the protocol to the Committee. **I agree to completion of a yearly progress report.**

Erlwanger
Signature

17 / 10 / 2011
Date

PLEASE QUOTE THE PROTOCOL NUMBER ON ALL ENQUIRIES