
**SECONDARY TRAUMATIC STRESS AND COPING: A
CASE STUDY OF THE SOCIAL WORKERS EMPLOYED
AT THE SOUTH AFRICAN POLICE SERVICE**

FRANCINE JULIA MASSON

A thesis submitted to the Faculty of Humanities, University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy.

February 2016

DECLARATION

I, the undersigned, hereby declare that this is my own original work. Any part of this study that does not reflect my own ideas has been fully acknowledged in the form of citations. No part of this thesis has been submitted in the past, or is being submitted for a degree at any other university.

FJ MASSON

DATE

DEDICATION

I dedicate this work to:

My parents:

- Tony and Doreen Davies, my dad and step-mom, for all your support and assistance especially during the most difficult period of my life. In particular, dad thank you for coming to Australia with me;

and

- Valerie Patricia Howard, (17 June 1944 – 17 December 2007), my mom, who inspired me in so many different ways. Kenneth Anthony Howard, (18 December 1924 – 04 May 2009), my step-dad, for everything that you ever did for me and for always having such a positive approach to life;

Not a day goes by that I don't miss both of you!

and

My son:

- To Kyle Kenneth Masson, for being the delightful child that you are.

“The Light shines in the Darkness, and the Darkness has not overcome it”.

I John 1:5

**“Blessed be the name of God forever and ever,
For wisdom and might are His.
And He changes the times and the seasons;
He removes kings and raises up kings;
He gives wisdom to the wise
And knowledge to those who have understanding.
He reveals deep and secret things;
He knows what *is* in the darkness,
And light dwells with Him”.**

Daniel 2:20-22

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This work would not have been possible without the support of the following:

- My Heavenly Father, for your unfailing love and mercy, thank you that your grace is sufficient.
- Professor Eleanor Ross – I am so grateful for the academic mentor that you have been to me over the years. Your ability to see the bigger picture while at the same time keeping your focus on the detail, has taught me so much. I am particularly grateful for your guidance, time, support and most of all for your belief in me – Thank you!
- Dr Erica Stutterheim and the management of the South African Police Service for allowing me to conduct this research.
- The social workers at the South African Police Service for your time and for being willing to share your experiences with me, I am extremely grateful.
- Professor Gregory Lee and Jackie Moodley for assistance with the statistical aspect of this research.
- The following people who have all supported me in different ways - Vivienne Solomons, Dawn Shewring, Bridget Bremner, Linda Smith, Stephen Davies, Anne Lunksy, Stewart Belsham, Professor Edwell Kaseke, Beverly Jackson, Adrie Vermeulen, Elmarie Tredoux, James Tully, Ndangwa Noyoo, Michael Howard, Colette van Heerden, Tanya Graham, Celeste Olivier, Renate Gericke and Gifty Nyarko. I'm privileged to know each one of you.
- To my spiritual family who have prayed for me through this chapter of my life.
- To my clients, who through sharing their journeys with me, have also taught me so much about resilience and the strength of the human spirit.
- My parents, Tony and Doreen Davies, for your love and support and especially for being the best grandparents to Kyle.
- The Carnegie Foundation for providing financial assistance with this research.
- The Faculty of Humanities, University of the Witwatersrand, for the Faculty Research Grant.
- The National Research Foundation for the PhD Completion Grant, which gave me time to complete this research. This work is based on the research supported in part by the National Research Foundation of South Africa (Unique Grant No 92681).

ABSTRACT

South Africa is regarded as one of the most violent countries in the world. Colonialism and apartheid laid the foundations for a divided and segregated society where violence was accepted as a legitimate means of conflict resolution in order to ensure the domination of one racial group over all other groups. As social and economic inequalities have become more entrenched in South African society, criminal violence has escalated. However, the nature of violence in the country has changed from political violence to criminal violence. Against this backdrop of violence and associated trauma, the South African Police have the insurmountable task of trying to maintain law and order.

The science of traumatology is a burgeoning field; traditionally empirical research has focused on the responses of primary trauma victims. However, in recent decades the secondary effects of traumatising on those who counsel the victims of primary trauma, has received significant attention. Located within the South African Police Service, is an often forgotten secondary group of professionals who assist the police officials through assuming the roles of occupational and forensic social work. The profession of social work is inherently stressful and demanding, especially in a country like South Africa, where social problems are ubiquitous and pervade every facet of South African society. Furthermore, a particular occupational stressor significantly impacting on these social workers as they investigate child abuse or provide counselling for a police officer, is secondary traumatising. The questions arise: firstly, how these social workers are affected by the amount of traumatic material to which they are exposed by the very nature of their work, and secondly, what coping strategies they employ. It was therefore deemed imperative to explore the effects of secondary traumatising experienced by these social workers in the South African Police Service in order to understand and ameliorate the negative effects of secondary traumatic stress. Furthermore, social work supervisors can enhance the quality of care their social workers provide to clients if they are adequately supported. It was therefore also considered necessary to explore the stressors these social workers experience and to identify the necessary support mechanisms appropriate to such therapeutic endeavors.

The primary aim of this study was therefore to explore the nature and extent of secondary traumatic stress experienced by social workers employed by the South African Police Service. The research design adopted for this study was exploratory, descriptive and correlational, while the

research methodology employed was a hybrid of both quantitative and qualitative paradigms. As this study involved an in-depth analysis of a bounded system comprising social workers employed at SAPS, the research was considered a case study. The study comprised two phases: In the first phase questionnaire booklets containing seven standardised research tools and open-ended questions, were administered in group settings. In addition, questionnaires were posted to social workers who were not able to attend the group meetings along with a self-addressed envelope. The research tools measured the nature of secondary trauma exposure, levels of secondary traumatic stress, vicarious trauma, compassion satisfaction, burnout, coping resources and dimensions of the work environment. Two hundred questionnaire booklets were distributed and 128 usable questionnaires were returned. Descriptive and inferential statistics were used to analyse the quantitative data, through the use of statistical programmes, SAS and SPSS.

In the second stage of the study, 30 participants who participated in the first part of the study and who indicated that they were willing to be interviewed, were purposively selected. A structured research tool was used to guide the interview in order to explore the participants' perceptions and experiences of secondary trauma while working for SAPS. The interviews were conducted either face-to face, telephonically or through Skype. The qualitative data that emerged from the interviews were analysed through the use of Atlasti, a qualitative computer programme, which assisted the researcher in the thematic analysis. Through the process of incorporating qualitative techniques, the researcher also made use of reflexivity when analysing the qualitative data.

In total 128 social workers participated in the study, of whom 102 were occupational social workers while 26 were forensic social workers, all located within South Africa. The extent of exposure to secondary trauma varied substantially between both occupational and forensic social work when considered as separate divisions, as well as within each discipline. This variation manifested in frequencies and duration of cases. In the interviews forensic social workers identified particularly traumatic cases as those where the sexual abuse was severe or the child had died as a result of extreme abuse. In comparison, occupational social workers identified some of the worst cases they had dealt with as cases where the police officers became disabled; and where they were required to deal with police suicides and police family murders or femicide-suicides.

Most participants presented with high or average levels of secondary traumatic stress and vicarious trauma as well as with moderate and low levels of burnout. Furthermore, there was a strong positive correlation between levels of secondary traumatic stress and burnout. The majority of participants experienced average levels of compassion satisfaction from their work. Participants identified various coping strategies and resources incorporating different individual dimensions, namely, physical, emotional, cognitive, social and spiritual. Participants showed high levels of resilience and findings indicated that resilience was negatively correlated with vicarious trauma. There were numerous significant differences between the different ranks of the participants. Participants of higher rank reported greater trauma exposure and had significantly higher secondary traumatic scores. Coloured participants experienced significantly lower levels of vicarious traumatisation than Black participants. Furthermore, there were numerous statistically significant differences apparent between the forensic and occupational social workers. Forensic social workers manifested significantly higher levels of vicarious trauma than occupational social workers, and forensic social workers had greater distortions regarding self-intimacy than occupational social workers. In addition, forensic social workers presented with lower coping resources and lower levels of resilience than occupational social workers.

Participants also experienced below average levels of satisfaction within the work environment at SAPS. The results from the work environment scale showed that in particular the relationship aspects in the work environment were problematic and that colleague support levels were below average. There were also significant differences in work satisfaction levels between Black and White participants. These findings enhance understanding of trauma in racially polarised societies.

Multivariate analysis revealed the complex relationships existing between the numerous variables in the study, further contributing to the theory of trauma in divided societies. Two structural equation models were developed to show the relationships of the variables measured in the study which were identical apart from the vicarious trauma variable which was separated to incorporate beliefs about self and beliefs about others. The models revealed that coping mechanisms moderated the relationship between traumatic stress exposure and vicarious trauma (self) and that such mechanisms moderated the resilience and burnout relationship.

These findings of the study highlight the need to involve social workers at SAPS in the drafting and implementation of a self-care policy which would help to promote empowerment and

responsibility of social workers for their own mental health. Recommendations for social work policy, education, practice, supervision and support as well as future research are also provided.

Keywords: secondary traumatic stress, vicarious trauma, compassion satisfaction, burnout, coping resources, resilience, work environment, forensic social work, occupational social work, South African Police Service

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Declaration.....	ii
Dedidcation.....	iii
Acknowledgements	iv
Abstract.....	v
Table of Contents.....	x
List of Tables	xxii
List of Figures	xxiv
Abbreviations used in the Study.....	xxvi

PART ONE: THE PROLOGUE 1

CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION TO THE STUDY	2
1.1 INTRODUCTION.....	2
1.2 STATEMENT OF THE PROBLEM	2
1.3 RATIONALE FOR THE STUDY	5
1.4 ANTICIPATED VALUE OF THE STUDY.....	7
1.4.1 Development of Theory.....	8
1.4.2 Implications for Policy Development.....	8
1.4.3 Implications for Social Work Education	8
1.4.4 Implications for Social Work Practice	8
1.4.5 Implications for Supervision and Support	8
1.4.6 Stimulation of Future Research	9
1.5 PRIMARY AIM, RESEARCH QUESTIONS AND OBJECTIVES.....	9
1.5.1 Primary Aim	9
1.5.2 Research Questions	9
1.5.3 Secondary Objectives.....	10
1.5.3.1 Secondary objectives for the quantitative data collection phase	10
1.5.3.2 Secondary objectives for the qaltitative data collection phase	10
1.6 OVERVIEW OF THE RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY	10

1.7 THEORIES UNDERPINNING THE STUDY.....	12
1.8 PRE-UNDERSTANDINGS UNDERPINNING THE STUDY	13
1.9 LIMITATIONS OF THE STUDY.....	14
1.10 DEFINITION OF KEY TERMS.....	16
1.11 ORGANISATION OF THE THESIS	18
 PART TWO - THE THEORETICAL LENS FRAMING THE STUDY	 20
 CHAPTER TWO: TRAUMATOLOGY	 21
2.1 INTRODUCTION.....	21
2.2 OVERVIEW OF THE HISTORY OF TRAUMA	22
2.3 THE CONCEPTUALISATION OF TRAUMA	23
2.3.1 Defining Trauma and Traumatic Stress.....	23
2.3.2 Classifications of Trauma	24
2.4 PRIMARY TRAUMATISATION	25
2.4.1 Posttraumatic Stress Disorder Classification	25
2.4.2 Acute Stress Disorder (ASD).....	31
2.4.3 Complex Posttraumatic Disorder.....	31
2.4.4 Posttraumatic Stress Disorder and Comorbid Disorders	32
2.5 SECONDARY TRAUMATISATION.....	32
2.5.1 Secondary Traumatic Stress (STS).....	33
2.5.1.1. Conceptual understanding of secondary traumatic stress	33
2.5.1.2 Vulnerability to secondary trauma	36
2.5.1.3 The impact of secondary traumatic stress.....	37
2.5.1.4 Secondary traumatic stress and social workers	40
2.5.2 Vicarious Trauma	41
2.5.2.1 Conceptual understanding of vicarious trauma	41
2.5.2.2 Constructivist self-development theory and the effects of vicarious trauma.....	41
2.5.2.3 The impact of vicarious trauma on the helping relationship.....	43
2.5.2.4 Empirical research on vicarious trauma	45
2.5.2.5 Criticisms of vicarious trauma.....	45
2.5.3 Compassion Fatigue (CF).....	45
2.5.3.1 Conceptual understandings of compassion fatigue	45

2.5.3.2 Vulnerability to compassion fatigue	46
2.5.3.3 Compassion fatigue studies	48
2.5.4 Compassion Satisfaction (CS).....	48
2.5.5 Burnout	50
2.5.5.1 Conceptual understandings of burnout.....	50
2.5.5.2 Predictors of burnout	51
2.5.5.3 Effects of burnout	51
2.5.5.4 Burnout and social workers	53
2.5.6 Transference and Counter-transference	53
2.5.6.1 Conceptual understandings of transference and counter-transference.....	54
2.5.6.2 Counter-transference in relation to PTSD	55
2.5.6.2 Counter-transference in relation to secondary stress.....	55
2.5.7 Shared Trauma (ST).....	55
2.6 THE OTHER SIDE OF THE COIN - POST TRAUMATIC GROWTH.....	57
2.7 TRAUMA AND CULTURE.....	58
2.8 CONCLUSION.....	59
 CHAPTER THREE: COPING, RESILIENCE AND TRAUMA	61
3.1 INTRODUCTION.....	61
3.2 COPING AND TRAUMA.....	62
3.2.1 The relationship of coping and trauma.....	62
3.2.2 Determinants of Trauma and Coping	63
3.3 DIFFERENT THEORETICAL APPROACHES TO UNDERSTANDING COPING WITH TRAUMA	65
3.3.1 Psychoanalytical Understanding and Treatment Approaches.....	65
3.3.2 Cognitive Theories and Interventions.....	66
3.3.3 Narrative Therapy	67
3.3.4 Existential Therapy.....	67
3.3.5 Neurobiological Theories.....	68
3.3.6 The Neoterics or Power Therapies	69
3.3.7 Trait Theories	70
3.3.7.1 Personality type	70
3.3.7.2 Hardiness	70
3.3.7.3 Locus of control	70
3.3.7.4 Neurotic anxiety.....	71

3.4 RESILIENCE	71
3.4.1 Defining Resilience	71
3.4.2 Understanding Resilience	72
3.4.3 Family and Cultural Resilience	73
3.4.4 Resilience and Trauma	74
3.5 COPING AND SELF-CARE STRATEGIES	75
3.5.1 Coping Strategies	75
3.5.2 Individual Self-Care Strategies	76
3.5.2.1 The Bio-physical dimension	76
3.5.2.2 The Emotional intrapersonal dimension	77
3.5.2.3 The Cognitive intra-personal dimension	78
3.5.2.4 The Inter-personal dimension	81
3.5.2.5 The Spiritual-cultural dimension	82
3.5.3 Professional Strategies	84
3.5.3.1 Supervision	84
3.5.3.2 Learning the limits of the professional role and establishing appropriate boundaries	87
3.5.3.3 Becoming more experienced and recognising patterns	88
3.5.3.4 Utilising educational opportunities	88
3.5.3.5 Peer support and professional networking	88
3.5.4 Organisational Strategies	89
3.5.4.1 Procedures for the recruitment of appropriate professionals	89
3.5.4.2 Debriefings, defusion and supportive strategies	90
3.5.4.3 Changing the variety and extent of work tasks	91
3.5.4.4 Ensuring adequate leave policies	91
3.5.4.5 Promoting a safe, healthy and resilient work environment and organisation	92
3.6 CONCLUSION	93
 CHAPTER FOUR: THE WORK MILIEU	 94
4.1 INTRODUCTION	94
4.2 THE DEFINITION AND MEANING OF WORK	94
4.2.1 Defining Work	94
4.2.2 The Meaning of Work	95
4.3 AN OVERVIEW OF THE HISTORY OF WORK	96

4.3.1 Prehistoric and Medieval Societies.....	96
4.3.2 Capitalism and the Industrial Revolution.....	96
4.3.3.1 The rise of the factory.....	97
4.3.2.2 Scientific Management	97
4.3.2.3 Fordism and Post-Fordism	97
4.4 WORK STRESS	99
4.4.1 Understandings of Work Stress	99
4.4.2 Models of Work Stress.....	99
4.5 DIMENSIONS OF THE WORK ENVIRONMENT THAT REDUCE OR EXACERBATE WORK STRESS	100
4.5.1 The Relationship Dimension	100
4.5.1.1 Involvement.....	100
4.5.1.2 Co-worker Cohesion	101
4.5.1.3 Supervisor Support	101
4.5.2 The Personal Growth Dimension	102
4.5.2.1 Autonomy	102
4.5.2.2 Task Orientation	102
4.5.2.3 Work Pressure.....	103
4.5.3 The System Maintenance and Change Dimension	103
4.5.3.1 Job Clarity.....	103
4.5.3.2 Managerial Control	104
4.5.3.3 Innovation	104
4.5.3.4 Physical Comfort	105
4.6 THE DEVELOPMENT OF EMPLOYEE ASSISTANCE AND EMPLOYEE WELLNESS PROGRAMMES TO DEAL WITH WORK STRESS	105
4.7 CONCLUSION.....	107
PART THREE - THE CONTEXT OF THE STUDY.....	109
CHAPTER FIVE: THE SOCIAL CONTEXT OF WORK IN SOUTH AFRICA	110
5.1 INTRODUCTION.....	110
5.2 THE SOUTH AFRICAN HISTORICAL CONTEXT	111
5.3 THE SOCIO-ECONOMIC REALITIES OF SOUTH AFRICA	115
5.4 CONTEXTUALIZING TRAUMATIC STRESS IN SOUTH AFRICA	118
5.5 THE HISTORY OF WORK IN SOUTH AFRICA.....	124

5.5.1 Industrialisation in South Africa.....	124
5.5.2 Work in the Apartheid System.....	127
5.5.3 Work Post 1994 in South Africa	129
5.6 THE WORK CONTEXT OF THE SOUTH AFRICAN POLICE SERVICE.....	131
5.6.1 Historical Overview of the South African Police Service.....	131
5.6.2 Occupational Stress of the Police	134
5.7 CONCLUSION.....	136
 CHAPTER SIX: THE PROFESSION OF SOCIAL WORK.....	 137
6.1 INTRODUCTION.....	137
6.2 SOCIAL WORK AS A PROFESSION	138
6.2.1 The Origins of Social Work.....	139
6.2.2 The Status of Social Work as a Profession	140
6.2.3 Financial Cutbacks and Changes in the Nature of Professional Services.....	142
6.2.4 The Care/Control Debate.....	142
6.2.5 Teamwork	143
6.2.6 Ethical Dilemmas.....	144
6.2.7 Dealing with Vulnerable Clientele	144
6.2.8 Threats to Personal Safety	145
6.2.9 Work Satisfaction and Staff Turnover	146
6.3 SOCIAL WORK IN SOUTH AFRICA	147
6.3.1 Social Welfare in South Africa Prior to 1994	147
6.3.2 Social Work in South Africa Post 1994.....	148
6.4 OCCUPATIONAL STRESS OF SOCIAL WORKERS IN SOUTH AFRICA	149
6.4.1 Professional Status and Professional Identity	149
6.4.2 The Socio-Economic Realities of Social Work Students.....	150
6.4.3 The Appropriateness of South African Social Work Undergraduate Training.....	151
6.4.4 Working with Other Social Service Professions	152
6.4.5 Lack of Career Development and Opportunities	153
6.4.6 Excessive Caseloads	153
6.4.7 Inadequate Supervision	154
6.4.8 Lack of Personal Safety	152
6.4.9 The Working Environment.....	155
6.4.10 Rural Conditions.....	155

6.4.11 Language Barriers	156
6.4.12 Professional Exodus	157
6.5 SPECIALISED AREAS OF SOCIAL WORK.....	157
6.5.1 Forensic Social Work (FSW)	158
6.5.2 Occupational Social Work (OSW).....	159
6.6 SOCIAL WORK IN THE SOUTH AFRICAN POLICE SERVICE (SAPS)	162
6.6.1 Forensic Social Work in the SAPS.....	162
6.6.2 Occupational Social Work in SAPS	163
6.7 CONCLUSION.....	165

PART FOUR – THE EMPIRICAL STUDY 166

CHAPTER SEVEN: RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY	167
7.1 INTRODUCTION.....	167
7.2 RESEARCH QUESTIONS	168
7.3 RESEARCH AIMS AND OBJECTIVES.....	168
7.3.1 Primary Aim	168
7.3.2 Secondary Objectives.....	168
7.3.2.1 Secondary Objectives for the Quantitative Data Collection Phase	168
7.3.3.2 Secondary Objectives for the Qualitative Data Collection	169
7.4 HYPOTHESES OF THE STUDY	169
7.5 RESEARCH DESIGN	170
7.5.1 Description of the Research Design.....	170
7.5.2 The Mixed Methods Approach	171
7.5.3 The Quantitative Paradigm.....	173
7.5.4 The Qualitative Paradigm	174
7.5.5 Case Study.....	175
7.5.6 Reflexivity.....	176
7.6 RESEARCH METHODOLOGY	178
7.6.1 Unit of Analysis	178
7.6.2 Sampling Procedures	179
7.6.2.1 Sampling procedure during the first phase	179
7.6.2.2 Sampling procedure during the second phase	179
7.6.3 Methods of Data Collection	180

7.6.3.1 Methods of data collection in phase one	181
7.6.3.2 Methods of data collection in phase two	182
7.6.4. Research Instrumentation	184
7.6.4.1 First phase of the data collection	184
7.6.4.2 Second phase of the data collection	190
7.7 THE PILOT STUDY	192
7.7.1 Piloting the Research Tools in Phase One.....	192
7.7.2 Piloting the Interview Schedule in Phase Two	193
7.8 THE RESEARCH PROCEDURE	194
7.9 DATA ANALYSIS	195
7.9.1 Quantitative Data Analysis.....	195
7.9.1.1 Scoring.....	195
7.9.1.2 Descriptive statistics	196
7.9.1.3 Inferential statistics	196
7.9.2 Qualitative Data Analysis	202
7.9.2.1 Thematic content analysis	202
7.10 RELIABILITY AND VALIDITY OF THE QUANTITATIVE DATA	204
7.10.1 Reliability	204
7.10.2 Validity	204
7.10.2.1 Content validity	204
7.10.2.2 Face validity	204
7.11 ENHANCING TRUSTWORTHINESS OF THE QUALITATIVE DATA	205
7.11.1 Credibility	205
7.11.2 Transferability	205
7.11.3 Dependability	206
7.11.4 Confirmability	206
7.11.5 Rigour.....	206
7.12 ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS	207
7.12.1 Informed Consent	207
7.12.2 Confidentiality and Privacy	208
7.12.3 Avoidance of Harm or Non-maleficence	208
7.12.4 Deception.....	208
7.12.5 Coercion and Perverse Incentives	209
7.12.6 Researcher's Competence and Actions	209

7.12.7 Approval of the Study by Institutional Ethics Committee	209
7.12.8 Publication of Findings and Feedback Given to Participants	209
7.13 CONCLUSION.....	210

PART FIVE – THE FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION SECTION 211

CHAPTER EIGHT: FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION 1 - TRAUMA EXPOSURE AND SECONDARY TRAUMATIC STRESS	212
8.1 INTRODUCTION.....	212
8.2 DEMOGRAPHIC PROFILE OF PARTICIPANTS	213
8.2.1 Areas of Social Work, Race and Gender of Survey Participants	213
8.2.2 Age Distribution, Marital Status and Family Composition of Participants	215
8.2.3 Participants’ Ranks and Geographical Location.....	216
8.2.4 Educational Qualifications and Previous Social Work Experience.....	217
8.2.5 Demographic Profile of Interview Participants.....	219
8.2.6 Reasons for Joining SAPS and Experience at SAPS.....	219
8.3 DIMENSIONS OF SECONDARY TRAUMA EXPOSURE	221
8.3.1 The First Objective	221
8.3.2 Secondary Trauma Exposure and the Traumatic Stress Schedule (TSS).....	221
8.3.3 The Nature of Forensic Social Workers’ Exposure to Secondary Trauma	224
8.3.4 The Nature of the Occupational Social Workers’ Exposure to Secondary Trauma	225
8.4 SECONDARY TRAUMATIC STRESS	234
8.4.1 The Second Objective	234
8.4.2 Secondary Traumatic Stress Levels.....	234
8.4.3 Hypothesis Testing.....	237
8.4.4 Secondary Traumatic Stress Symptoms.....	239
8.4.5 Interview Participants’ Experiences of Secondary Traumatic Stress.....	243
8.5 CONCLUSION.....	247

CHAPTER NINE: FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION 2 - VICARIOUS TRAUMA, TRANSFERENCE AND COUNTER-TRANSFERENCE, COMPASSION SATISFACTION, BURNOUT AND THE WORK ENVIRONMENT	249
9.1 INTRODUCTION.....	249
9.2 VICARIOUS TRAUMA (VT)	250
9.2.1 The Third Objective.....	250

9.2.2 The Trauma and Attachment Belief Scale (TABS)	250
9.2.3 Hypothesis Testing	254
9.2.4 Understanding Vicarious Trauma in SAPS Social Workers	255
9.3 TRANSFERENCE AND COUNTER-TRANSFERENCE	258
9.3.1 The Ninth Qualitative Objective	258
9.3.2 Understandings of Transference and Counter-transference.....	258
9.4 COMPASSION SATISFACTION	261
9.4.1 The Fourth Objective	261
9.4.2 The ProQOL's (2010) Measurement of Compassion Satisfaction.....	261
9.4.3 Hypothesis Testing	263
9.4.4 Understanding Compassion Satisfaction	264
9.5 BURNOUT.....	267
9.5.1 The Fifth Objective	267
9.5.2 ProQOL's (2010) Measurement of Burnout.....	267
9.5.3 Hypothesis Testing	269
9.5.4 Understanding Participants' Experiences of Burnout.....	269
9.6 THE WORK ENVIRONMENT.....	273
9.6.1 The Sixth Objective	273
9.6.2 Moos's (2008) Work Environment Scale (WES).....	273
9.6.3 Hypothesis Testing	275
9.6.4 Exploring the Work Dimensions of SAPS	275
9.6.4.1 The Relationship Dimension	276
9.6.4.2 The Personal Growth Dimension	282
9.6.4.3 The System Maintenance and Change Dimension	287
9.7 RECOMMENDATIONS TO SAPS	292
9.7.1 The Tenth Qualitative Objective	292
9.7.2 Participants' Recommendations to SAPS.....	292
9.8 CONCLUSION.....	295
 CHAPTER TEN: FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION 3 – COPING WITH TRAUMA AND RESILIENCE.....	 296
10.1 INTRODUCTION.....	296
10.2 COPING WITH SECONDARY TRAUMA	296
10.2.1 The Seventh Objective	296
10.2.2 Marting and Hammer's (2004) Coping Resources Inventory	297

10.2.3 Hypothesis Testing	300
10.2.4 Understanding How Participants Coped with Secondary Trauma Exposure.....	301
10.2.4.1 Not coping with the trauma	301
10.2.4.2 Exploring participants' coping strategies and resources	303
10.3 RESILIENCE	322
10.3.1 The Eighth Objectives	322
10.3.2 Wagnild's (2009) Resilience Scale.....	322
10.3.3 Understanding Resilience	327
10.3.4 Hypothesis Testing	331
10.4 PARTICIPANTS' RECOMENDATIONS.....	335
10.4.1 TheTenth Objective.....	335
10.4.2 Participants' Recommendations to Reduce the Effects of Secondary Trauma	335
10.5 CONCLUSION.....	338

CHAPTER ELEVEN: FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION 4 – TOWARDS A STRUCTURAL EQUATION MODEL FOR UNDERSTANDING SECONDARY TRAUMATIC STRESS AND VICARIOUS TRAUMATISATION....339

11.1 INTRODUCTION.....	339
11.2 MULTIVARIATE ANALYSIS	339
11.2.1 The Ninth Quantitative Objective	339
11.2.2 Results of the Analysis	339
11.2.2.1 Tests of Factor Structure.....	340
11.2.2.2 Regression Models.....	342
11.2.2.3 A Model of Secondary Trauma and Vicarious Trauma	348
11.2.2.4 Structural Equation Models	349
11.2.2.5 Moderation Models	356
11.3 CONCLUSION.....	361

PART SIX: THE EPILOGUE 362

CHAPTER TWELVE: MAIN FINDINGS, CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS.....	363
12.1 INTRODUCTION.....	363
12.2 SUMMARY OF THE STUDY	363
12.3 SUMMARY OF THE MAIN FINDINGS	365
12.3.1 Profile of Participants	365

12.3.2 The Nature of Participants' Secondary Trauma Exposure	367
12.3.3 Participants' Levels and Secondary Traumatic Stress Experiences.....	368
12.3.4 Participants' Levels and Vicarious Traumatization Experiences	369
12.3.5 Participants' Understandings of the Concepts of Transference and Counter-Transference ..	369
12.3.6 Participants' Levels and Compassion Satisfaction Experiences	370
12.3.7 Participants' Levels and Burnout Experiences	370
12.3.8 Participants' Experiences of the SAPS Work Environment.....	371
12.3.9 Understanding Participants' Coping Mechanisms with regard to Secondary Trauma	372
12.3.10 Participants' Levels and Understandings of Resilience.....	373
12.3.11 Summary of the Participants' Recommendations	374
12.3.11.1 Participants' recommendations to SAPS	374
12.3.11.2 Participants' recommendations to reduce the effects of secondary traumatization	374
12.3.12 Summary of the Multivariate analysis	375
12.4 CONCLUSIONS.....	376
12.5 RECOMMENDATIONS	381
12.5.1 Recommendations for Policy	381
12.5.2 Recommendations for Social Work Education	382
12.5.3 Recommendations for Social Work Supervision.....	383
12.5.4 Recommendations for Social Work Practice	383
12.5.5 Recommendations for Future Research	385
12.6 CONCLUDING COMMENT	386
 REFERENCES.....	 388
 APPENDICES	 427
APPENDIX A - Part One: The Questionnaire	428
APPENDIX B - Part Two: Interview Schedule	441
APPENDIX C - Ethics Clearance Certificate.....	444
APPENDIX D - Audit Trail.....	446

LIST OF TABLES

Table 2.1: Levin, Kleinman and Adler's (2014) Table , of PTSD Criteria in DSM-IV-TR versus DSM-5	27
Table 2.2: Risk Factors for Posttraumatic Stress Disorder (Friedman, 2006, p.16)	30
Table 2.3: Newlwl, Nelson-Gardell and MacNeil's (2015, p.2) Terminology and and Secondary Construct Timeline	34
Table 2.4: Figley's (1995, p.8) Comparison Between Primary and Secondary Trauma	35
Table 2.5: The Personal Impact of Secondary Traumatic Stress (Yassen, 1995, p. 184)	38
Table 2.6: The Impact of Secondary Traumatic Stress on the Work Environment	40
Table 2.7: Figley's (2002a) Ten component Model of Compassion Fatigue (Udipi et al., 2008, p. 459)	47
Table 3.1: Elements for a Theory of Traumatic Stress Reactions (Wilson & Lindy, 1994, p.21)	64
Table 7.1: Stages of the Research Process	171
Table 7.2: Quantitative and Qualitative Elements of the Design Components	172
Table 7.3: Work Environment Sub-Scales and Descriptions	189
Table 7.4: Internal Consistencies, Corrected Average Item-Sub-Scale Correlations and One-Month Test-Retest Reliability of the Work Environment Scale	190
Table 7.5: Rationale for Inclusion of Items in the Interview Schedule	191
Table 7.6: Suggested Changes from the Pilot Study	193
Table 7.7: The Five Fundamental Aspects of Data Analysis	207
Table 8.1: Demographic Information on the Survey Participants	213
Table 8.2: Demographic Profile of the Interview Participants	219
Table 8.3: Participants' Reasons for Joining SAPS	219
Table 8.4: The Nature of Secondary Trauma Exposure as Measured by the Traumatic Stress Schedule	223
Table 8.5: Participants' Endorsement of Diagnostic Criteria B, C and D of PTSD	235
Table 8.6: Correlation Matrix	236
Table 8.7: Means, Standard Deviations and Ranges of STS	237
Table 8.8: STS Percentiles and Interpretations	238
Table 8.9: Linear Regression Model with STS as Dependent Variable	239
Table 8.10: Mean, Standard Deviations and Ranges of STS Sub-Scales	240
Table 9.1: Regression Model with Vicarious Trauma as Dependent Variable	251
Table 9.2: Quotations to Illustrate Vicarious Trauma	256
Table 9.3: Regression Model with Compassion Satisfaction as the Dependant Variable	263

Table 9.4: Regression Model with Burnout as the Dependent Variable	268
Table 9.5: Regression Model with Burnout as the Dependent Variable.....	274
Table 10.1: Linear Regression Model with Coping as Dependent Variable.....	300
Table 10.2: Coping Resources and Strategies Identified by Interview Participants	305
Table 10.3: Interview Participants' Views on Attending Counselling as a Coping Resource	311
Table 10.4: Regression Model with Resilience as the Dependent Variable	324
Table 10.5: Mean Resilience Sub-Scale Scores	325
Table 10.6: Factors Identified As Contributing To Personal Resilience	328
Table 11.1: Internal Reliability of Construct Dimensions.....	341
Table 11.2: Hierarchical Regression Model with Vicarious Trauma (Self) as Dependent Variable ...	344
Table 11.3: Hierarchical Regression Model with Vicarious Trauma (Other) as Dependent Variable	345
Table 11.4: Hierarchical Regression with Burnout as the Dependent Variable.....	347
Table 11.5: Effects Decomposition of Vicarious Trauma (Self) Structural Equation Model	353
Table 11.6: Effects decomposition of vicarious trauma (other) structural equation model	355
Table 11.7: Summary of Moderation Model Findings	357
Table 11.8: Moderation of Coping on the Traumatic Stress Exposure and Vicarious Trauma (Self) Relationship	358
Table 11.9: Moderation of Coping on the Resilience and Burnout Relationship	360

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1.1: The Stages of the Research Process	12
Figure 2.1: Hudnall Stamm's (1999) Conceptualization of Traumatic Stress	24
Figure 2.2: Creation of Compassion Satisfaction or Compassion Fatigue (Radney & Figley, 2007, p. 208)	49
Figure 2.3: Hudnall Stamm's (2010) Conceptual Framework of Compassion Fatigue	50
Figure 3.1: Figley's (1995) Model of Coping and Trauma Transmission	63
Figure 3.2: Meisenhelder and Marcum's (2008) Relationship of Stress, Trauma and Spiritual Outcomes	82
Figure 7.1: Reflexive Questions: Triangulated Inquiry (Patton, 2002, p.66).....	63
Figure 7.2: Representation of Formative-Type Structure Used in Thesis	201
Figure 8.1: Diagrammatic Representation of the Concurrent Triangulation Design	212
Figure 8.2: Area of Social Work, Sex and Race of Participants	214
Figure 8.3: Map of South Africa Depicting Participants' Geographical Location	216
Figure 8.4: The Universities Where Survey Participants had Studied	217
Figure 8.5: Fields of Social Work where Participants had Worked Prior to Joining SAPS	218
Figure 8.6: Survey Participants' Examples of Traumatic Cases Dealt with in the Past Six Months ...	221
Figure 8.7: STS Symptoms Experienced Occasionally, Often or Always by the Participants	242
Figure 9.1: Interpretation of TABS T-Scores	250
Figure 9.2: Average TABS Self Sub-Scale Scores	253
Figure 9.3: Average TABS Other Sub-Scale Scores	254
Figure 9.4: Levels of Compassion Satisfaction	262
Figure 9.5: Levels of Burnout	267
Figure 9.6: Work Environment Scale Total Scores	273
Figure 9.7: WES Standard Sub-Scale Scores	276
Figure 9.8: WES Sub-Scales Depicting Relationship Dimension Standard Scores.....	277
Figure 9.9: WES Sub-Scales Depicting the Personal Growth Dimension	282
Figure 9.10: WES Sub-Scales Depicting the System Maintenance and Change Dimension	288
Figure 9.11: Participants' Recommendations to SAPS	292
Figure 10.1: Mean Total Standard Coping Scores.....	297
Figure 10.2: Mean Standard Sub-Scale Coping Scores	298
Figure 10.3: Coping Strategies Identified by Interview Participants	304

Figure 10.4: Resilience Scores of the Participants	323
Figure 10.5: Mean Resilience Sub-Scale Results.....	326
Figure 10.6: Resilience Themes Analysed Through Wagnild's Resilience Characteristics	330
Figure 10.7: Box Chart Showing Participants' Resilience Score and their Perceptions of their Resilience	333
Figure 10.8: Survey Participants' Suggested Strategies to Reduce Secondary Traumatism	336
Figure 11.1: A Model of Secondary Trauma and Vicarious Trauma	349
Figure 11.2: Final Path Analysis (Standardised Paths) for Vicarious Trauma (Self)	352
Figure 11.3: Final Path Analysis (Standardised Paths) for Vicarious Trauma (Other).....	354
Figure 11.4: Moderation of Coping on the Traumatic Stress and Vicarious Trauma (Self) Relationship	359
Figure 11.5: Moderation of Coping on the Burnout and Resilience Relationship	361

ABBREVIATIONS USED IN THE STUDY

AIDS	Acquired Immunodeficiency Syndrome
ANC	African National Congress
AZAPO	Azanian Peoples Organisation
BPP	Brief Psychodynamic Psychotherapy
CBT	Cognitive Behavioural Therapy
CF	Compassion Fatigue
CISD	Critical Incident Stress Debriefing
COSATU	Congress of South African Trade Unions
CPTSD	Complex Posttraumatic Stress Disorder
CR	Cognitive Restructuring
CRS	Coping Resources Scale
CS	Compassion Satisfaction
CTS	Continuous Traumatic Stress
CT	Counter-Transference
CUSA	Council of Unions of South Africa
DSD	Department of Social Development
DSM	Diagnostic and Statistical Manual
EAP	Employee Assistance Programme
EAPA	Employee Assistance Professionals Association
EHWP	Employee Health and Wellness Programme
ET	Exposure Therapy
FOSATU	Federation of South African Trade Unions
FSW	Forensic Social Work/er
GEAR	Growth, Employment and Redistribution Policy
HIV	Human Immunodeficiency Virus
ICU	Industrial and Commercial Workers Union
IFP	Inkatha Freedom Party
IFSW	International Federation of Social Workers
IMF	International Monetary Fund
IPID	Independent Police Investigative Directorate
NEDLAC	National Economic Development and Labour Council

OAP	Occupational Alcohol Programmes
OSW	Occupational Social Work/er
PCBP	Personnel Capacity Building Programmes
PD	Psychological Debriefing
PSWS	Police Social Work
PTS	Posttraumatic Stress
PTSD	Posttraumatic Stress Disorder
POPCRU	Police and Prisons Civil Rights Union
PROQOL	Professional Quality of Life Scale
RDP	Reconstruction and Development Programme
RS	Resilience Scale
SA	South Africa
SACP	South African Communist Party
SAP	South African Police
SAPS	South African Police Service
SACSSP	South African Council for Social Service Professions
SATLC	South African Trade and Labour Council
SACTU	South African Congress of Trade Unions
SOC	Sense of Coherence
ST	Shared Trauma
STS	Secondary Traumatic Stress
STSS	Secondary Traumatic Stress Scale
STPPG	Shared Traumatic and Professional Posttraumatic Growth
STS	Secondary Traumatic Stress
SW	Social Work
TABS	Trauma and Attachment Belief Scale
UDF	United Democratic Front
VT	Vicarious Trauma
WES	Work Environment Scale