



Name and Surname: Zandile Samantha Gqoboza

Student number: 942841

Status: Full-time

Title: **The State's Responses to
Urban Marginality in
Natalspruit**

Supervisor: Obvious Katsaura

Word Count: 22 571

Declaration

I declare that this paper is my original work. It is being submitted for the Master of Arts in the Faculty of Humanities (Development Studies) at the University of the Witwatersrand. This dissertation has not been submitted for any other degree at any other university.

Name: Zandile Gqoboza (942841)

Signature: Zandile Samantha Gqoboza

Date: 20 April 2020

Abstract

This research argues that dimensions of ‘urban marginality’ are reflected in South African cities, in informal trading in poor urban peripheries; specifically, in ‘townships’ and ‘informal settlements’. One finds in post-apartheid South Africa, poor urban margins, where individuals are forced to create alternative forms of employment as a means to survive. These alternative forms of employment are part of the waiting experience of the urban poor (Auyero, 2012).

The findings of this paper dispute a claim made by Yamada (1996) stating that informal self-employment is by choice and that it is economically sufficient. Contrary to the above claims the research illustrates that this form of employment is forced and is unprofitable and is therefore economically insufficient. This study therefore suggest that the post-apartheid state should formulate policies with the understanding that this sector is forced and is economically insufficient.

To illustrate the above, the research focuses on the experiences of informal traders in the trading area of Natalspruit and analyze their relationship with the municipal state in Ekurhuleni.

Acknowledgments

I could not have completed this research if it were not for the advice and encouragement that I received from several individuals. It is therefore paramount to acknowledge their contributions toward my study.

I would like to extend my gratitude to my supervisor and the development studies department for their guidance and their support.

I would also like to thank my amazing family, especially my parents, for constantly supporting me and believing in me. I truly could not have completed this process without their undying support.

Last but not least, I would like to extend my greatest gratitude towards the traders in the Natalspruit market area. It is because of your willingness to participate in my research that I was able to complete this paper. I am forever grateful for your cooperation.

Contents

Declaration.....	2
Abstract.....	3
Acknowledgments.....	4
Chapter 1: Introduction: Thinking informal trading through urban marginality.....	8
1.1: Introduction.....	8
1.2: Research Question.....	10
1.3: Theoretical framework.....	10
1.4: Urban marginality.....	11
1.5: Research Methods.....	14
1.6: Research Outline.....	15
Chapter 2: Literature review.....	16
2.1: Introduction.....	16
2.2: Informality.....	17
2.3: Survivalist entrepreneurs.....	24
2.4: Poor Urban Spatial Arrangement.....	27
2.5: Reconnecting with the concept of 'urban marginality'	30
2.6: Conclusion.....	31
Chapter 3: Methodology.....	32
3.1: Introduction.....	32
3.2: Population.....	32
3.3: Sampling.....	33
3.4: Data collection and analysis.....	34
3.4.1: Case study research.....	34
3.4.2: Observation.....	35
3.4.3: Interviews.....	35
3.4.4: Document-based research.....	36
3.5: Reflections on Fieldwork.....	37
3.6: Conclusion.....	38
Chapter 4: State policies towards informal traders.....	39
4.1: Introduction.....	39

4.2: National Policy.....	39
4.3: Municipal Policy.....	42
4.4: Conclusion.....	46
Chapter 5: Characteristics of the street traders' enterprises in poor urban peripheries.....	48
5.1: Introduction.....	48
5.2: Observations of the market area.....	48
5.3: Traders merchandise.....	51
5.4: Informal traders or survivalist entrepreneurs.....	53
5.5: The aspirations of street traders.....	56
5.6: Urban marginality.....	58
5.7: Conclusion.....	59
Chapter 6: Challenges faced by survivalist entrepreneurs in the Natalspruit market area.....	60
6.1: Introduction.....	60
6.2: Unprofitability of the survivalist traders.....	60
6.3: The marginalization of the traders.....	62
6.4: South Africa's poor urban spatial plan.....	64
6.5: Scarcity of formal employment.....	65
6.6: Minimal state assistance.....	66
6.7: Conclusion.....	67
Chapter 7: Relations between the municipality and the traders.....	68
7.1: Introduction.....	68
7.2: The municipalities' sympathetic stance towards the informal sector.....	68
7.3: Informal Trade Plan strategies concerning the traders.....	69
7.4: Ekurhuleni Community Enterprise Development Fund.....	77
7.5: Informal Trader Organization in the Natalspruit.....	78
7.6: Conclusion.....	79
Chapter 8: Summary and Conclusion.....	80
8.1: Introduction.....	80
8.2: Urban marginalization.....	80
8.3: Empirical data.....	81
8.4: Limitations of the research and recommendation for future research.....	82
8.5: Conclusion.....	83
Bibliography.....	85

Appendices.....	92
Appendix 1: Traders interview questions.....	92
Appendix 2: Participation sheet.....	94
Appendix 3: Traders consent form.....	95
Appendix 4: University of the Witwatersrand Ethics Certificate.....	97

List of figures

Figure 1: A view of a trading stall on the pavement in the Natalspruit trading area. Picture by Author, December 2019.....	45
Figure 2: A trader and her toddler at a stand in front of one of the shopping center entrance. Picture by Author, December 2019.....	46
Figure 3: Maria's DIY stand which she built because she did not receive a municipal stand. Picture by Author, December 2019.....	52
Figure 4: A row of traders, in front of one of the entrances of the shopping center, all selling secondhand clothing items. Picture by Author, December 2019.....	57
Figure 5: The environmental conditions in which the traders work under in the Natalspruit informal market. Picture by Author, December 2019.....	59
Figure 6: The picture illustrates the traders storing mechanism, a dustbin, which is a common feature in this informal market. Picture by Author, December 2019.....	68

Chapter 1: Introduction: Thinking informal trading through urban marginality

1.1: Introduction

This research argues that the urban difficulties currently facing South Africa reflect how urbanization has created a new urban culture of poverty at the margins of towns and in cities (Bonner, 1995; Cherry, 1992). This research argues that urban marginality has a direct relationship with the creation of informal trading in poor urban peripheries in South Africa, specifically in historically created townships and informal settlements. Therefore, it is because of this phenomenon that one finds in post-apartheid South Africa poor margins where individuals are forced to create alternative forms of employment as a means to survive. These alternative forms of employment are part of the waiting experience of the poor urban (Auyero, 2012). The study is cognizant of observations made by Yamada (1996), that informal employment does not produce competitive earnings and is employment opportunity that is not necessarily entered by choice. It is in view of this that the study appreciates the need for the post-apartheid state to change its approaches to the informal sector; by finding ways of supporting this sector to cater for a significant population of the urban poor who operate at the margins of the economy.

To illustrate the above, the research will study the experiences of informal traders in Natalspruit and analyze their relationship with the state, in the form of the municipality of Ekurhuleni. This research finds it paramount to make an analysis, through the eyes of the poor urban, to establish whether state policies adequately assist the poor urban. This point is of importance to this paper because authors such as Ash Amin (2013) and Loic Wacquant (2008a; 2008b) argue that government policies are numb to the interest of the urban poor and rather cater to the needs of

urban elites. The research can, therefore, validate or invalidate such arguments by closely analyzing the activities of those in the informal sector and their views of the state. Such a study is vital as it will illustrate whether the urban poor sees a positive change in the conditions in which they are faced with in the post-apartheid regime. Reference to the post-Apartheid state is vital as historically townships were created for the black, coloured and Indian population and were a specific attempt to “contain black urbanization” (Smith, 1992, p. 2); as these areas were mere hubs for the residence of cheap labour. Townships were areas where the population's growth outstripped that of the economy and as a result, the increasingly poor inhabitants were and still are compelled to “find their solutions to the daunting challenges of day-to-day living” (Smith, 1992, p. 8–9). Therefore, interviewing informal traders residing in urban poor areas helps to provide answers to the question of whether their conditions have stagnated, improved or deteriorated over the years.

The research will, therefore, study street traders in townships to understand the economic and social impacts of being part of informal activities in urban poor peripheries. The second part of the research looks at the state's responses to the informal sector and assesses whether or not the state fully understands informality. It does the above by conducting interviews, analyzing state policies as well as looking at the survivalist entrepreneur's perception of the state utilizing urban marginality and as a lens of analyses. It is important to note that for scope reasons the paper will only study a particular township which is part of the Municipality of Ekurhuleni, namely Natalspruit in Katlehong. This area is of interest to the research as it is the market area in Katlehong where many street traders operate in on a daily.

1.2: Research Question

Main Research Question

What perceptions do survivalist entrepreneurs in Natalspruit have about state policies towards the informal economy in Ekurhuleni?

Sub-questions

1.1) What are the characteristics of the survivalist entrepreneurs in the Natalspruit informal trading market?

1.2) What are the challenges faced by survivalist entrepreneurs?

1.3) What are the survivalist entrepreneur's perceptions of state policies?

1.3: Theoretical framework

The following component of the research process provides ideas that will help explain the social phenomenon described throughout this paper. Urban marginalization has created hierarchies where the rich reap the benefits and wealth of urbanization while those in the poor urban margins are left at the bottom of the hierarchy (Wacquant, 2008a). Deductive theory-testing best suits this study because this research will utilize urban marginalization, which explains the sidelining of the poor urban by the state. The study takes a grand approach to understand how marginalized groups navigate urban structures while also considering how policymaking affects the composition of marginalized groups themselves. This is a top-down approach because it starts with a general overarching theory and then draws conclusions from various pieces of evidence about the phenomenon. Based on whether or not evidence from the study supports or opposes the urban marginalization theory, the paper will conclude on the extent to which the theory applies to

the case study of Ntshongweni. Essentially this will be a review of the social theory of urban marginalization. The hypothesis, which argues that state policies do not adequately assist the poor, will then be confirmed or denied based on the evidence collected. If the findings from the study match the expected outcome of urban marginalization theory, then the findings will serve to strengthen the theory. However, if the findings from this study depart from the expected outcomes of urban marginalization theory then the study will serve to revise the theory, attempting to offer insight to the phenomenon in an African developing context.

1.4: Urban marginality

As mentioned in the above paragraph the research will utilize urban marginality as a theoretical framework that explains the occurrence of survivalist entrepreneurs in poor urban peripheries. This theory is formed because intrinsically urbanization is multilayered, entangled and contradictory. Urban marginality is the byproduct of “extraordinary urbanization of the 20th century which has produced urban peripheries of devastating poverty and inequalities in cities worldwide” (Holston, 2009). Unfortunately, there is no solid definition attributed to urban marginalization, what one finds, however, are universal components or characteristics associated with this concept. Firstly, this is a global phenomenon because growth is “traced to particular characteristics of urban compositions and global connectivity rather than the national economic and political environment” (Amin, 2013) of individual countries. This, therefore, means that this concept can be applied on a global scale, in both developing and developed economies. This phenomenon has resulted in dual economies within cities, where one finds the upper class, and to an extent, the middle class, in well-allocated urban nodes in parts of the city, benefiting from this process and the lower class in poor urban territories living in poverty-ridden territories. What Amin (2013) and Holston (2009) adequately illustrate is that governments in cities worldwide do not factor in their individual country's compositions but are merely interested in producing cities

that compete on a global scale. This is why in South Africa and many other developing countries; one finds areas that could compete with cities in developed economies although the country in and of itself has high inequality and high poverty rates. It is, however, important to note that the severity of urban marginality differs, hence one will see that the inequality levels in the advanced economies will not be at the same extent as what one will find in developing economies. However, the point being made here is that this a global phenomenon that has resulted in an entrenched system of differentiated citizenship (Holston, 2009) in cities worldwide.

Secondly, the government's obsession with international competitiveness results in its refusal to prioritize the provisioning of 'indivisible commons' to which the poor have equal entitlement on a human rights basis (Amin, 2013). This sentiment is further argued by Wacquant (2008a) who goes further and dubs the above refusal as the penalization of poverty in urban Brazil. However, for this research, it will refer to the penalization of poverty in a South African context. Nonetheless, according to Wacquant (2008a), the penalization of the urban poor takes place because governments prioritize the needs and wants of the elites over the basic needs of the poor. Hence one finds that in cities the 'diversion of city resources from households to firms and from the bottom to the top of the class structures' (Wacquant, 2008b, p. 8). The institutional abandonment that Wacquant is referring to is illustrated by the lack of investment and underdevelopment found in townships in South Africa, favelas in Brazil, the ghetto in the USA and the villa miseria in Argentina, etc. in comparison to the more affluent territories in each of cities of the above-mentioned countries. The market cannot or rather will not resolve this problem, therefore strategic state intervention is required (SERI, 2016) to ensure that resources are channeled into poor urban territories. Nonetheless, urban marginality dualizes or segregates

urban spaces, with the elites residing in affluent territories and the poor residing in the deprived centers and margins of cities where the space between the rich and the poor continually grows.

A further attribute of urban marginality is the inability of the labour market to generate income security, resulting in the exclusion of the poor from wage labour. Wacquant argues in his book *Urban Outcasts* that over time there has been an erosion of the integrative capacity of the wage labour relation whereby “wage has turned from the fount of homogeneity, solidarity, and security into a source of social fragmentation and precariousness for those confined to the border zones” (Wacquant, 2008b, p. 234). Therefore, alongside the lack of assistance by the government because of their bias to the elites of cities, individuals in poor peripheries are left out the only game/employment opportunity in town (Bauman, 2004), leaving them in dire circumstances as they are unable to enter formal labour markets. These individuals, therefore, have to upgrade themselves and appropriate local interventions to ensure that they in some way make an income to sustain themselves. This is done by creating alternative ways of generating an income in various forms of the informal sector and via illegal criminal elements, however, this point will be discussed in detail in the next paragraph. Nonetheless, the barriers to formal or wage employment opportunities result in growing poverty pushing increasing numbers into the informal sector (Swanson, 2007). It is important to note that the creation of alternative income-generating employment is due to circumstance and the scarcity of wage employment opportunities.

As alluded to in the above paragraph urban marginality further creates an increase in the presence of the informal sector in poor parts of the city. Furthermore, is the refusal of the “provisioning of commons to which the poor have equal human rights” (Amin, 2013), to survive the poor have to create alternative forms of employment. Therefore, entrance into the informal

employment sector is a subsistence strategy of the last resort. This point is crucial to this research on the existence of survivalist entrepreneurs. However, this will be further explained in the next paragraph. Nonetheless, the poor's creation of survivalist activities is often celebrated by state officials because they have relinquished their social contract towards the urban poor (Amin, 2013). This approach by the state resembles the atomist view of society (Heywood, 2013), where individuals are expected to pull themselves by the straps of their boots. Therefore, arguing for zero or minimal forms of state intervention especially with regards to insecure wage relations, forcing the urban poor into the informal market as a means for to survive.

The arguments presented in the above paragraphs illustrate that the poor urban is involved in the politics of invisibility, of everyday arrangements and constant mobility (Bénit-Gbaffou, 2014), which correlates with the survivalist entrepreneur arguments. Survivalist entrepreneurs engage in informal employment activities because of the lack of opportunities in the formal employment sector, and this means that these individual's existence in this sector is merely a survival mechanism (Fisher, 2011). Furthermore, arguing that the state's celebratory, self-help entrepreneur policy is inadequate as these unprofitable activities are due to the scarcity of formal employment in poor margins of urban areas. Therefore, urban marginality arguments illustrate that street trading is a survivalist activity, by illustrating that these activities are unprofitable and are an activity of circumstance and not by choice. Furthermore, this theory will illustrate the fragile relationship between the urban poor and the state, by illustrating that state policies, whether antagonistic or pro-development, are not in touch with the realities and needs of the traders in question.

1.5: Research Methods

This research utilized several methods to collect the data found in this report, which enabled me to triangulate the data collected and further see whether the municipal policies correlate with the realities of the street traders in the Natalspruit informal market. The report utilized semi-structured interviews with street traders. It further utilized document-based research, to collect data on the policies regarding informality in Ekurhuleni. Lastly, I immersed myself in the short term in the informal market to strengthen the research's data on the realities of the street traders.

1.6: Research Outline

The next chapter (Chapter 2) reviews relevant literature, with a focus on urban informality, survivalist entrepreneurs and spatial injustice in urban South Africa. Chapter 3 outlines the methodology employed in this research, explaining in detail how the data was collected and why a qualitative case study approach best answers my research question. The chapter also reflects on fieldwork experiences. Chapters 4, 5 and 6 discuss the research findings, in line with the three research sub-questions; utilizing the data collected from the interviews and state policy documents. Chapter 7 concludes the dissertation by crystallizing its empirical findings and contributions to literature, as well as highlighting areas for future research.

Chapter 2: Literature review

2.1: Introduction

This literature review has three focus areas: namely informality, survivalist entrepreneurship, and spatial justice in South Africa's urban spaces. Firstly, because the population under study, street traders, is part of the informal economy the paper will utilize various definitions by Bayat (1997), Bryceson (2006), and Portes, Castells, and Benton (1989) to explain the characteristics of individuals in this economy. These definitions are crucial in that they illustrate that this form of employment is indeed an alternative form of revenue generation based on the inaccessibility to formal employment. This section will discuss arguments that express pessimistic sentiments for the informal sector as well as the celebratory views of the informal sector. The former will be discussed utilizing Marxist and Structuralist views on the informal sector, who are highly critical of the informal sector and the popular policies that are utilized by the developing countries. The latter category will be argued by utilizing various positivist arguments and pro-capitalist arguments, which view the informal sector in a celebratory manner. The next section will focus on survivalist entrepreneurship as a concept, which is in line with the pessimistic understanding of street trading occurrence. The research will unpack this concept by utilizing definitions given by Jesselyn (2006) and Fisher (2011), which argue amongst many things that street trading is an unproductive survival mechanism. Therefore, arguing that policies that look to develop unproductive enterprises may not be in touch with the needs of the street traders. This is because such policies would be futile for individuals who would rather be in the formal employment sector, as the street traders' entrants in the informal market are because of the scarcity in the formal employment economy. Lastly, the research will look at arguments about spatial mismatch and spatial injustice found in South Africa's urban spaces. In this section, the research establishes a connection between urban poor peripheries and the predominance of the informal

sector in townships such as Natalspruit. This is because little has been done to transform the spatial planning of towns in South Africa, where commercial investments and developments are continuously directed into the center of each city resulting in a scarcity of formal labour in the urban poor peripheries.

2.2: Informality

To adequately analyze the relationship between the state and the informal economy, one needs to understand the informal economy. It is important to first define what this paper means by an informal sector or an informal economy. Portes, Castells, and Benton (1989, p. 12) state that “The informal economy is ... a process of income-generation characterized by one central feature: it is unregulated by the institutions of society, in a legal and social environment in which similar activities are regulated.” This definition explains how this particular means of employment, as opposed to the formal sector, accumulate income for citizens of a particular country in an unregulated manner. Therefore, this type of income generation results in state institutions having little to no control over the operations and the profits of the sector. Furthermore, this income generation activity illustrates “livelihood experimentation that has ensued” (Bryceson, 2006, p. 5) as the African urbanites population has increased in the absence of economic growth and industrialization, which results in a few formal employment opportunities for these urbanites. This literature has relevance to this research as it talks about employment activities, outside of the formal activities, that individuals take part in because they are unable to work in the formal employment sector. Furthermore, the above literature describes the poor urban as subalterns who are attempting “to survive and live a dignified life” (Bayat, 1997: 58) in urban spaces. Such subalterns’ activities describe small subsistence businesses such

as street traders and according to and Miraftab (2007) and Bayat (1997) beggars, sex workers, petty thieves, the homeless, and car guards.

In addition to the above, framework, the paper will also utilize Bayat's explanation of informality concerning the state. Bayat (1997) sees informality as a practice of autonomy, where the informal urban poor are not integrated into the system and are therefore somewhat autonomous. This explanation illustrates how the poor urban are marginalized and are therefore left to fend for themselves. The research would like to argue that the autonomy that Bayat speaks of is forced autonomy as the urban poor are not integrated into the economy, because of various reasons such as poor spatial arrangements and poor policies that result in the marginalizing of the poor in a state's economy. Bayat's (1997) explanation of an autonomous informal sector illustrates the global trend in the promotion of self-sufficiency for their citizens as a way to shift responsibility on to them. The characterization of the informal sector is an acceptance of particular states that are unable to adequately deal with developmental challenges such as the scarcity of labour, poverty, poor housing and which results in the state shifting their responsibilities to the poor urban population.

Following the above, within the literature on the informal economy in the global south one finds many views but for scope purposes, this paper looks at two views about the sector, one that is optimistic; pro-capitalist, and the other pessimistic; Marxist and Structuralist arguments. For Marxist, the informal sector is a direct result of the capitalist system which "generates surpluses of unwanted labour" (Marx. 1939, p. 695). The informal sector would fall under the "stagnant population" which offers capital "reservoir of available labour power (Cardoso & Faletto, 1979 and Marx, 1939, p. 711). For Marxists, the territories of deprivation and dereliction found in cities, which results in mass unemployment and allows for the creation of the informal sector,

works for the benefit of capital or capital accumulation. Therefore, the barriers to formal or wage employment are a deliberate attempt to ensure that labour reserves are ready and available. According to these arguments, the large reservoir of surplus labour is beneficial to capitalist because it increases the supply of cheap labour and decreases wage roles (Barnes, 2012). The above arguments correlate with arguments made by urban marginality; which argues that the informal sector is merely a waiting area for prospective formal employees. According to the above pessimist view, the development of these urban peripheries is unlikely because of the above conditions that maintain the supply of cheap labour.

Following the above, describing the minimal livelihoods as flexible, dynamic and any other positivist view helps negate government from their social contract towards the poor. The celebratory account, which refashions the poor as the future middle class, rules out “attending to the urban poor” (Amin, 2013). This literature argues that participants in the informal sector upgrade themselves and appropriate their local interventions (Amin, 2013), suggesting that the government does need not cater to the needs of those in the urban poor margins. This argument is relevant to my research because it understands that the urban poor live in dire circumstances and describing this circumstance as “African urbanism” or just how things are in developing cities negates the government’s responsibility towards the urban poor. This argument helped to establish whether policies are of assistance to those in the margins of the economy or if the state policies are of no assistance.

Lastly, the Structuralists and Marxists alike further present a critical point of view of popular informal sector policies. For one, these schools argue that so long as the informal sector coexists with large scale capitalist enterprises, these enterprises will not develop (Gerry, 1987). Therefore, positivist and dualistic policies which simply seek to morph the informal into the

formal, through regulation programs will be of no assistance for informal traders. A policy that simply morphs the two sectors would result in small enterprises being “transformed into disguised wage workers serving the interest of capital growth and the perpetuation of poverty” (Gerry, 1987, p.113). The above argument is illustrated in the critic of De Soto's comprehensive regulation programs, which argue that the provision of property rights and other legal documents will be sufficient to assist struggling informal enterprises. De Soto fails to illustrate how providing the poor with property rights would result in banks and other official financial and credit institution's willingness to give systematic credit to the poor even though there is historical evidence contrary to the above (Fernandes, 2002). Therefore according to the above arguments, especially the structuralist approach, institutional fixes are necessary but not sufficient in assisting the poor. Critics of the informal sector, who reject the concept in its entirety because of the abovementioned links with the formal sector and argue for a radical state to support small indigenous entrepreneurs against large enterprise (Gerry, 1987). It is however important to note that even this “radical solution” also assumes, like the pro-capitalist camp, that all informal enterprises are entities worth the investment. The above arguments are relevant to the research because they illustrate that positivist descriptions negate the government’s responsibility towards the urban poor. Furthermore, these arguments will help establish whether informal policies adequately address the needs of those who reside in the margins and working in the informal sector. This will be done by not merely looking at municipality policies but speaking to the individuals who work and live in the poor margins of the cities, to see how they view state policies.

The other side of the argument, which is optimistic, is adequately represented by what this paper dubs the pro-capitalist arguments. This literature sees the informal sector and making the most

out of minimal resources as being natural and flexible. And therefore, see informal employment as being a voluntary activity that produces competitive incomes (Yamada, 1996). This positivist account of the informal economy has mostly been adopted by optimistic liberals. This outlook of the informal sector stems, from the formal sector's inability to absorb the surplus labour and their inability to provide competitive wages in cities in developing and emerging economies. Therefore, “one surest way of increasing the national income is to create new sources of employment” (Lewis, 1963, p. 404), in the form of the informal sector. These small-scale entrepreneurs provide a significant contribution to the national economy (Bromely, 1990), and can be absorbed into the capitalist system, as formidable formal enterprises. This understanding of initiatives that fall out of the government and formal private sectors regulated economies (Bromley, 1990, Hart, 1973 & De Soto, 2000) take on Arthur Lewis's concept of integrating “backward” subsistence work into a forward capitalist market, dualism. This approach has unsurprisingly been the accepted view of informality. Examples of this acceptance are found in the ILO, which allowed for many states and economists to follow suit with the above approach.

The Kenya mission report of 1972, is where the positivist account of the informal sector begun. The report dubbed informality as being efficient, innovative, and resilient (Bangasser, 2000). It was in this report that, unlike the mere description of the phenome of Harts work, that one found a concrete definition of informality. The paper described informality by the ease of access, resilience on indigenous resources, family ownership of enterprise, unregulated and competitive markets, etc. (Bangasser, 2000). The report further illustrated how the urban poor “is largely ignored, rarely supported, often regulated and sometimes actively discouraged by the government.” (Bangasser, 2000, p. 10). The paper argued that the largely economically efficient entities were not in of themselves problematic, but they cannot be productive because of

“debilitating restrictions” that stem from the prejudice towards this sector” (Bangasser, 2000, p. 10). The generalization of the productive nature of the informal sector may be problematic because it assumes that all enterprises in the informal sector can be long term vehicles for economic growth. This paper, questioned the report's positivist outlook of the sector, as there's a substantial portion of this sector that is precarious and can only be viewed as a waiting place for formal employment. The Kenya Report, therefore, ignores Hart's description of a sector that is legitimate but is highly precarious and is not seen by many of its inhabitants as long-term employment. For a reasonable amount of the participants, informal employment provides a temporary cushion for a worker that cannot find a job in the formal sector. This is not to dispute that there are entities within the informal sector that are productive, as there are, but it is a substantial number of entities that are not productive and this cannot be ignored. The phenomena of unproductive members of the informal sector will be explained in the next section, titled survivalist entrepreneurs.

The danger of ignoring the above exists in the assumption that is found in the report that the informal sector is the magical solution for urban unemployment. This assumption leads to a conclusion of “the importance of the urban informal sector in employment and income generation” (Bangasser, 2000, p.12). These supposedly economically efficient and innovative entities ought to be brought into the capitalist systems, formalized, and absorb surplus labour. In South Africa's case, the African National Congress (ANC) has utilized the concept of sustainable livelihoods which argues for “broader than wage labour employment and embraces efforts to transform “informal sector” economic activities into higher income-generating and higher quality productive activity” (Davies, 2004). This approach argues that formalization: skills investment, training, or the provision of property rights in the case of De Soto, results in the success of the

informal economy. The above pro-capitalist approach, therefore, views the informal economy which is precarious and unprofitable, as a silver bullet solution for the high unemployment in the perspective cities. The above strategies are not sufficient for entities that lack entrepreneurial mindsets, which is an essential component for the productiveness and growth of an enterprise. Property rights, training, etc. are essential however entrepreneurship is as necessary an ingredient for stimulation growth and employment opportunities (RSA, 2013 and De Soto, 2000). Where there is a lack of entrepreneurship none of the above strategies will assist, this is illustrated by South Africa's high rates Small, Medium, and Micro Enterprises (SMME) failure rate, where between 15% to 95% fail within 5 years of operation (Willemse, 2010). The policy, therefore, needs to take into account that while there entities that can be formalized and assist in curbing high employment rates.

However, the above reformist but pro-capitalist arguments, are accurate in highlighting the marginalization of the poor in cities. De Soto argues that people are "pushed into the black market and wider informal economy because governments refused to recognize and promote legal ownership of land and assets" in developing countries (Free to Choose Network, 2015). He illustrates how difficult it is for individuals in the informal economy to formalize their businesses because they are excluded by unfair and long procedures (De Soto, 2000 and Free to Choose Network, 2015). It is because of the above debilitating restrictions that the individuals in the informal economy are unable to reach their full potentials. The marginalization of the informal economy is accurately explained by the theoretical lens which is utilized by the paper, urban marginalization. And accurately depicts how the majority of the developing world's population is simply not catered for by the government. This demography is "denied success by the formal opportunity structures" (Hart, 1973, p. 67). The above sentiments are seemingly startling because

governments in the developing countries have adopted sentiments which seek to promote the informal sector and small businesses have been given greater legitimacy (Gerry, 1987, p. 115). In the wake of high unemployment rates, the informal sector is viewed as the surest way of increasing the national income and is a recommended national development strategy (Bromley, 1990 and Lewis, 1963). The above is evident in South Africa's national and local policy, which largely views the informal sector as an essential vehicle to increase national incomes. The research, therefore, explored the accuracy of the developing world sentiments on the informal economy by gauging the trader's opinion of the state.

Lastly, the research attempted to expand on the different definitions stated in the above paragraph, by illustrating that informality could be seen as forced autonomy, adding on to Bayat's (1997) definition. The research, therefore, illustrated that in specific the poor partake in the above economy because they do not have the luxury to enter the formal economy. There are of course instances whereby individuals voluntarily leave the formal economy and enter the informal sector voluntarily, and the research does not dispute the above. This paper is not necessarily studying those individuals but is rather focusing in particular on individuals who are 'stuck' in the informal markets and if granted the opportunity to leave would do so. The paper, therefore, illustrated the above by utilizing several concepts such as urban marginality and the survivalist entrepreneur arguments, attempting to illustrate that street trading is part of this 'forced' phenomenon.

2.3: Survivalist entrepreneurs

Entrepreneurship is seen as a vital component of bringing about economic growth and employment opportunities for economies. Businesses are seen as vital vehicles for economic growth and development (Choto, Tengeh, and Iwu, 2014; Kuratko and Hodgetts, 2001). Such

arguments understand all types of entrepreneurship as being homogenous. This research would like to argue that this not the case. That there are different types of entrepreneurs, and not all of them can be seen as a necessary means to bring about development and growth in emerging economies, but as mere survival mechanisms for the urban poor. Therefore, it is incorrect to assume that all forms of entrepreneurship are a positive and necessary feature of developing economies. For example, street vendors and hairdressers can be viewed, on the surface, as profit-making entrepreneurship but is a coping mechanism because of a lack of availability of adequate income-generating employment opportunities.

This is why this research will look at a specific type of entrepreneurship, the survivalist entrepreneurs found in the informal sector which this research would like to argue is not an activity that should be celebrated as this a coping mechanism. Survivalist entrepreneurs are: “individuals who run and manage enterprises due to inability to secure employment in the formal sector, and therefore have to find alternatives ways to survive. Their income levels are below the minimum poverty line (Jesselyn, 2006). Survivalist entrepreneurs are therefore individuals who create their businesses as a mere means for economic survival (Fishers, 2011) because they are not being absorbed into the formal sector. The difference then between survivalist entrepreneurs and ordinary entrepreneurs, is that the latter has the choice of regular wage employment but chooses to start their businesses. Whereas the former goes into “entrepreneurship” to get some form of income to survive.

Adding to the above, there are also arguments of different types of entrepreneurs such as those found in the entertainment areas and those found in the urban poor periphery (Amin, 2013). Survivalist entrepreneurs are mostly found in informal settlements and not in urban entertainment areas. Urban entertainment centers are areas created through urban redevelopment

strategies that combine shopping, recreation, and entertainment within various spaces” (Lee and Hwang, 2018) which are inhabited by the elites of urban areas. This type of entrepreneurship occurs because people are unable to secure employment in the formal sector and have to find alternative ways to survive (Rogerson, 1996). It is also important to note that the income generated by survivalist entrepreneurs provides a minimal livelihood (Simone, 2004). For instance, the survivalist entrepreneurs in the Natalspruit trading area are said to make “an average monthly income of just under R2000 for each person working at the market.” (Wits Business School, 2009, p. 1). This data of the income generated by these traders, which may have slightly increased as this data is from 10 years ago, illustrates that the revenues generated are insufficient for the trader’s basic needs. The listed characteristics of the urban poor entrepreneurs are beneficial for the research as it brings to question whether or not the occurrence of such activities is entrepreneurship that is beneficial for the individuals who take part in it.

Following the above characteristics of survivalist entrepreneurs, the homogeneous understanding of entrepreneurs living in the urban areas, could be misleading and therefore could bring about misleading solutions or policies. As Simone puts it in *For the City Yet to come*: The sense of throwing things together does not necessarily make society more flexible or productive (Simone, 2004). Furthermore, their increase in the existence of survivalist business during the period where there is an absence of formal employment and an increase in general poverty (Ranyane, 2015) is a phenomenon that is worth noting. However, it is important to note that this paper understands that there are entrepreneurs in the urban poor margins who have the productive capacity, however, this research is looking at survivalist entrepreneurs, whose business generates minimal livelihoods and is merely taking part in these activities for survival. Therefore, the

research will look at individuals who might be better off if they had access to wage employment in the formal sector. The above theory on survivalist entrepreneurs will be refuted or accepted by the traders who will be interviewed. The interviews will, therefore, establish whether or not the employment activities are merely a means of survival due to the scarcity of formal employment or an ordinary form of entrepreneurship.

2.4: Poor Urban Spatial Arrangement

The spatial arrangement of urban South Africa is paramount to this research as it assists in analyzing the informal sector in urban poor areas and the scarcity of formal employment in urban poor areas. The research establishes a connection between South Africa's urban planning, in specific the urban poor peripheries, with the predominance of the informal sector in townships such as Natalspruit.

Historically, the creation of urban South Africa was developed from the creation of race as part of the intricate development of modern urban society (Parnell, 1995). This paper will briefly explain the historical making of what is popularly known as the Apartheid city. During the planning of South Africa's urban economy, one finds a gradual progression of a race premised urban policies, which is illustrated by migrant labour and permanent migration. Initially when the urban areas were established one found the moving back forth of black labour from urban centers to rural areas. This state policy labour policy was created to ensure "labour-power without labourers" (Maylam, 1990, p. 57). Gradually, because of the 1940's land invasions and squatter movements, the state conditionally accepted the presence of black communities in towns (Sapire, 1990). The conditions were premised around the highly regulated institutions such as the creations of compounds and locations where African communities could reside (Sapire, 1990). The racially divided territories were designed not merely to separate races but importantly to this

research to place Africans outside of predominantly white city centers, where one found an abundance of formal employment. The issue, therefore, is that the legacy of the Apartheid cities has continued in democratic South Africa 20 odd years after the demise of Apartheid. A legacy that has resulted in exclusion and the social struggles by the urban poor to “reconquer the right to the city” (Mbembe 2004, p. 391) by creating alternative means of employment in spaces created for them.

Following the above, the research would like to argue that the prevailing legacy of the structure of the Apartheid city is paramount to the predominance of the informal sector in townships in South Africa. The legacy continues as the private sector, which creates formal employment, prefers “to construct housing and commercial developments in already-established zones of economic and social activity” (SERI, 2016, p.6), which are predominantly white residence. It is important to note that gradually predominantly white territories have, with removal segregation policies, comprised of the mixing of all races in these residential areas. Nonetheless, in post-apartheid South Africa, one finds spatial injustices that result in “jobs and economic opportunity concentrated around city centers while the majority of the urban poor and unemployed live in dense settlements on the urban periphery” (SERI, 2016,). Therefore in post-apartheid one finds a scarcity of labour in townships and other urban poor peripheries and the issue of the proximity of work in the urban centers.

According to this research, spatial injustice in South Africa is a crucial element that may explain why the informal sector is predominant in the townships. This is the case because jobs and economic opportunities are concentrated around particular city centers, which results in the scarcity of jobs in the residential areas of the urban poor. One may argue that these individuals could commute to urban centers to have access to employment opportunities, as many

individuals in townships do. However, this is problematic for many reasons, by nature these territories are poor, and wages in the formal employment sectors are relatively low. According to Stats SA “black Africans earn the lowest wages when employed” (Stats SA, 2019). Therefore, the expectation that black employees form predominantly poor residential areas and who make insufficient wages to then utilize that income to commute is a huge task as they will incur costs that they are unable to pay for as they are part of a poor section of the urban population. This, therefore, acknowledges the systemic bias, “people living on peripheries are disproportionately poorer than people living in central areas, and thus more likely to rely on public transport than private cars” (SERI, 2016, p. 19) and which adds on to the difficulties of the poor. Therefore, according to this research, low wages, poverty, and the proximity of labour force the urban poor to partake in the informal economy to survive in the urban economy.

South Africa’s spatial arrangement and the concentration of a wide variety of formal employment in specific areas is a phenomenon that has generated literature and the attention of the South African democratic state. This, therefore, means that the research acknowledges the various measures, such as the RDP policy, that the post-apartheid state has implemented to curb the legacy of spatial planning and its dire effects on the poor. One crucial example of literature that aims to explain the phenomena is a SERI paper that explains how South Africa’s spatial arrangement results in peripheral unemployment (SERI, 2016) in the countries' municipalities. In particular to the research, the paper looks at Ekurhuleni as one of the papers case studies and illustrates how “unemployment is comparatively low around the main nodes of economic activity clustered in the center-west of the municipality” (SERI, 2016, p. 31-30). These economic nodes and centers are namely Bedfordview, Boksburg, and Edenvale, etc. Peripheral unemployment, therefore, results in the scarcity of formal employment in the areas outside of the economic

nodes and centers. This, therefore, results in residents of the urban poor peripheries being forced to create alternative forms of employment, such as informal trading.

This research would, therefore, argue that because of evidence shown by the SERI paper, South Africa's spatial arrangement plays a role in the predominance of informal trading. The research, therefore, argues that the state's inability to create policies that expand the economic nodes to areas in the peripheries results in a scarcity of formal employment opportunities and therefore results in the creation of informal employment opportunities. Therefore, the spatial arrangements found in South Africa are a key development challenge that results in peripheral unemployment and results in the continuation of the informal employment sector in South Africa's peripheries.

2.5: Reconnecting with the concept of 'urban marginality'

If one looks at the arguments relating to informality, survivalist entrepreneurship, and the spatial dumping of the urban poor, it becomes clear that they resonate with the idea of urban marginality. For instance, the literature on survivalist entrepreneurs, and to a certain extent informality, is the description of individuals who are adversely affected by the processes of urbanization; those who are marginalized by this process. Firstly, "the erosion of the integrative capacity of wage-labour relations" (Wacquant, 2008b, p. 235) is an integral reason that the poor are unable to secure labour in the formal sector. The poor in urban spaces are pushed to create alternative forms of employment because of the scarcity of formal labour. Therefore, if one closely observes the above literature with urban marginality, one sees why the poor remain in activities, such as survivalist entrepreneurship, that do not even meet their basic needs, they do not have another alternative.

The poor are facing institutional abandonment; with no real investment being made in the territories that they inhabit and their inability to secure wage employment, these individuals are

left in a bad predicament. This predicament forces them to appropriate activities in the informal economy, such as street trading, as a means to survive. Therefore, when one views the above concepts collectively one sees the forced processes of the poor residing in urban spaces. These concepts therefore adequately paint a picture of the individuals who are marginalized by the economy and are unassisted by the state in circumstances that are beyond their control, e.g. the scarcity of labour. Utilizing the picture painted by the above data, the research argues then that it is unfair for the state to then view such as sector as vehicles to eradicate development challenges (National Planning Commission, 2012), survivalist entrepreneurship is not a solution but is in and of its self a development challenge. Any policy which treats such activities as developmental solutions will be out of touch with the realities and the needs of the poor.

2.6: Conclusion

The above literature was crucial in answering the question; “What perceptions do survivalist entrepreneurs in Natalspruit have about state policies in Ekurhuleni?” and understanding why the traders hold particularly, negative sentiments about the state responses. Furthermore, combined with the above literature, informality, survivalist entrepreneurship, and poor urban spatial planning, alluded to a gap between the Ekurhuleni policies and the traders in which the policies are meant to assist. The paper is ultimately arguing that state policies choose to see entrepreneurship instead of vulnerability (Ouple, 2012) which helps negate the government’s responsibility towards the urban poor. Therefore combined, the above literature, is in line with the arguments presented by urban marginality and the state's poor responses towards the poor urban and informality. Nonetheless, the next section will discuss which research tools will be utilized to answer the research question.

Chapter 3: Methodology

3.1: Introduction

This section explains which research tools were used in the collection of the data and why these tools were utilized. The research utilized qualitative research methods, which encompasses methods that help reveal the behavior and perception of a target population regarding a particular topic. (Punch, 2013; Gentles, Charles Ploeg, and McKibbin, 2015). In terms of data collection, the research utilized one-on-one interviews, observation, document-based research, and case study research. These methods ensured that the research achieved its mandate to better understand informal trader's activities in the Natalspruit market area as well as their relations with the state in the form of the City of Ekurhuleni. Essentially, this section illustrated how the researcher collected the data which is used to answer and prove its hypothesis.

3.2: Population

The target population of the research was street traders who operate and reside in a trading area called Natalspruit, in Katlehong. Therefore, their participation in informal employment activities is a mere means to attain some form of income to survive. Furthermore, if granted the opportunity to work in the formal employment sector these individuals would be willing to leave the informal sector. This population was selected because I had easy access to the street traders in that particular market area. This was because the area is of proximity to the area in which I reside and I know survivalist entrepreneurs, who work and reside in Natalspruit, who were willing to participate in the interviews. Furthermore, the market area in question has been around for more than two decades and can, therefore, give the research in-depth information about participants in the informal sector.

Before commencing the research's fieldwork, the issue of whether to include foreign nationals in the research was presented. Before conducting the fieldwork, the research was considering whether or not foreign nationals should be considered as participants during the fieldwork. Guided by the supreme law of the constitution and the many litigation cases against different municipalities lodged by different entities representing informal traders which included foreign nationals, the research opted to treat all the traders equally irrespective of their nationality and citizenship status. In particular, the research's decision not to discriminate between the foreign and residents was guided by the right to human dignity. Therefore as stated by one of the court verdicts related to foreign informal traders "[I]f ... a refugee or asylum seeker is unable to obtain wage-earning employment and is on the brink of starvation, which brings with it humiliation and degradation, and that person can only sustain him- or herself by engaging in trade ... such a person ought to be able to rely on the constitutional right to dignity..." (Fisher, 2014). This, therefore, illustrates that so long as the foreign nationals in question reside lawfully in a particular municipality, they have the right to make an income for themselves and their families, and action by the municipality to take away their ability to earn an income would be infringing these individuals' rights to dignity. Therefore, the research guided by the constitution wanted to select the participant in a responsible manner that did not discriminate against the traders and did not add on to the already heightened xenophobic tensions. Lastly, some of the foreign nationals in the Natspruit market area have operated in the market since the inception of the market and would, therefore, gave in-depth knowledge of the life of informal traders in the market areas.

3.3: Sampling

This research utilized snowballing as a means to find the street traders in the trading area in Natspruit. Snowballing or referral sampling is a technique whereby a few participants are identified and then "rely on each participant to guide the research to the next one, etc." (Bless,

Higson-Smith and Sithole 2013, p. 176). I, therefore, approached one trader, who introduced me to other street traders, etc. Furthermore, the selection process was in such a way that it attempted to interview street traders that rendered different services to ensure that the data collected represent as many of the traders as possible. The research interviewed 15 street traders, to ensure, as much as possible, that the sample was representative of the population of street traders in Ntalspruit. Snowballing was the most effective way to select the street traders, as the research assumed that traders know one another, and these individuals would be willing to introduce the researcher to fellow traders. This was assumed because the street traders work and reside in the same community, and therefore know each other.

3.4: Data collection and analysis

3.4.1: Case study research

Case studies are a “detailed investigation of individuals, events, actors, and relationships (Lipson, 2005). The study of the Ntalspruit market area will provide the research with a detailed understanding of the informal traders and the challenges that it faces. Therefore, it provided a detailed account of the relationship between the informal traders in the Ntalspruit market and the City of Ekurhuleni. All the above information was gathered through one-on-one interviews with the traders, document-based research, and observation of the Ntalspruit market area, which will be further discussed in the following paragraphs.

Furthermore, because a case study is a narrow in-depth study of a particular situation, which is “useful for testing whether scientific theories and models work in the real world” (Friedrich, 2017 p. 266). This research wanted to illustrate the usefulness of the theoretical framework, urban marginalization, which according to the research has an effect on the continuation and growth of the informal sector which could be applied in the market area of Ntalspruit. Therefore, the market area of Ntalspruit was an ideal case study because of the informal

economic activities that are predominant in this specific area such as stallholders of fruits and vegetables (Wits Business School, 2009) and hairdressers, etc. The location was a suitable research site as it provided the research with a population, street traders, that helped illustrate that this was a survivalist activity that is a direct result of urbanization. Therefore, the case study approach would help to prove or disprove the usability of the theoretical framework that this research utilized.

3.4.2: Observation

Before the interviews: I immersed myself, in the short-term, with the area in which the street traders operate. This was done to get a general observation of the area in which the traders operate and how they conduct their businesses. Before commencing with the interviews, I spent the market, solely observing the market with minimal interaction with the traders. Initially, I wanted to go and observe how the market operated and how the traders interacted with one another. I went to the market in the morning, just when the traders started to arrive to see where they stored their merchandise etc. While observing the site, I took the opportunity to take photographs of the trading area, which are found in the empirical chapters of the dissertation. The photographs are useful as the images helped me remember certain aspects of the trader's working environment. This approach assisted the research because the traders did not know that I would be interviewing them and would give an accurate account of how they operated with one another. Furthermore, I have seen how useful images can be in illustrating conditions, for instance in the May 13th, 2019 Times magazine cover. Therefore, the research utilized the images in the empirical chapters of the paper, which will assist the reader to imagine the conditions described in the research.

3.4.3: Interviews

The research further used one-on-one interviews as a means to collect data to answer the research question. This form of data collection is popularly used to “gain factual data about a particular phenomenon, event or object, to elicit the opinions or perspectives of an interview participant” (Lamont, 2015, p. 83). In the case of this research, the interviews with traders were the only way to give detailed accounts of the trader's characteristics and the challenges they face as well as their perspective of the Ekurhuleni municipality. To do the above the research utilized semi-structured interview questions to attain a “more in-depth probing on issues of interest to the research” (Lamont, 2015, p. 84) and also allowed for flexibility for the participant. Therefore, this structured and conversational approach guided the participants to talk about issues that were related to the research but also allowed for the participants to give additional information that could better the research. Therefore, this qualitative data collection was the primary tool to obtain information on the street traders in the Natalspruit trading area.

3.4.4: Document-based research

Furthermore, the paper utilized document-based research as a means to collect the data. As the research was unable to conduct interviews with an Ekurhuleni municipality representative, it needed to utilize a source that directly represents the cities policies towards informal traders. The research therefore utilized primary sources as these are “original documents authored by individuals who had direct access to the information they are describing directly or experienced a particular.” (Lamont, 2015, p. 80), as the primary representation of the municipalities policies towards the street traders. The paper used both national state documents, such as the National Development Plan, The Business Act, and the Constitution and municipal documents such as the Ekurhuleni Urban Policy, the 2012 Ekurhuleni Informal Trade Plan as well as official speeches made by the Mayor's that spoke to the issue of the informal sector. The paper further used

secondary resources to refer to and analyze official state documents, such as various SERI documents that spoke to issues related to the informal sector and the state. All the documents assisted the research inadequately analyzing the relations between the municipality and the informal traders in the market area in question.

3.5: Reflections on Fieldwork

There were several challenges and difficulties that I experienced during the research process. Firstly, the fieldwork was delayed by the occurrence of xenophobic attacks throughout the country. Many of these violent attacks were waged against people in the informal sector as there are a substantial number of foreign nationals in the sector. A few of the stalls were left vacant because the street traders feared for their lives and worried that their merchandise would be stolen as looting is prominent during these attacks. Therefore, I decided to halt the fieldwork as a safety precaution. The delays from the above attacks resulted in me cutting down the participants from 20 to 15 because I was worried, I would not be able to complete the research in time. Secondly, it took me a while to receive the contact details of a government official that would be able to assist with the questions regarding informal employment policies. I only received the contact details in late November and did not receive correspondence regarding my request for an interview. I, therefore, made the call to solely use primary and secondary sources such as white papers and other policies and speeches that the municipality published on the topic of the informal employment sector and compare this with the data received from the street traders.

Once the fieldwork began some of the participants were hesitant to participate in the research and had no desire off the bat to participate in the fieldwork as they did not think it would do them any good. It is, however, important to note that a vast majority of the traders that I had

approached were more than willing to participate in the research and share their experiences as traders in the Ntalspruit market. However, although many of the participants were happy to converse, many were put off by my request to record the interviews and the signing of some of the documents such as the consent form. Therefore, I had to make some of the participants comfortable by not recording and therefore writing detailed notes, and where they did not want to sign I simply added their supposed names to the documents in question to get the information that I needed. Once we moved from the technical aspects of the research many of the participants were very receptive to me and my research and shared more information that I had not asked for in the interview questions. In hindsight, I see how useful a conversational approach was as it opened the research to highly useful information. Nonetheless, the combination of conversational and semi-structured approaches allowed me to receive all the information that was required for the research.

One last challenge that I faced during the fieldwork was a language barrier, especially with the research questions being in English. Once I established that some of the traders did not understand the questions fully, I resorted to translating the questions into Zulu so that the participants could better understand what was being asked of them. Therefore, the majority of the interview questions were translated into vernacular to assist the participants. I also found that when I communicated in vernacular the participants were far more comfortable and open to participating in the interviews. This is not to say that all the participants did not understand the English version of the question, however, most of the participants preferred to be interviewed in vernacular.

3.6: Conclusion

This chapter explained why and how the research gathered the data which is presented in the next chapters. I have explained why how the sample was selected and why the Natalspruit market area was an excellent site to have access to the sample that was needed for the research. This section also explained why qualitative research tools, namely observations, interviews, and document-based, were effective in collecting the data that was needed for the research. Lastly, I illustrated the challenges I was presented with during my data collection and how I managed to get through the hurdles that were mentioned. Therefore, this section was my attempt to explain to the reader how I went about collecting the data in this research. The next chapter outlines all the policies, both national and local, which talk to the issue of the informal traders.

Chapter 4: State policies towards informal traders

4.1: Introduction

The purpose of this section is to outline the relevant policies, both national and local, regarding the informal economy. Firstly, the chapter talks about the gradual national move, from apartheid restrictive policies to a relaxed National Development Policies, etc. which welcome the activities as alternative forms of job creation. Secondly, the section discusses the various municipal informal policies, with the provision of the Business Act of 1991. This act allows for the different municipalities to have different bylaws regarding the informal sectors, hence there are cases where municipalities utilize policies that are contradictory to the national provisions. In particular, the paper refers to the Ekurhuleni municipality laws which at face value seem to correlate with national laws but are not implemented in reality. Lastly, the paper refers to other non-state organizations that were created as a representation of the informal sectors, therefore

illustrating that local policies are not representative of the needs of the individuals in the informal sector, hence the need for third parties.

4.2: National Policy

At a national level, the democratic government in South Africa has reached a point whereby they have accepted the existence of the informal economy. The democratic states' urban policy towards the informal sector has gone through two stages; “a brief period of relaxation following the dismantling of official apartheid; and thirdly, a more recent effort towards formalization.” (SERI, 2011, p. 6). Of course, one could argue that the post-Apartheid state has at times utilized restrictive policy towards the informal economy which can be associated with the Apartheid state's attitude towards the informal sector. Such an example of this restrictive policy is the City of Johannesburg's “Operation Clean Sweep” campaign which is aimed “to rid much of the CBD of informal traders and became the focal point of rights-based resistance” (Pieterse, 2017). This illustrates that it is not always accurate to argue that contemporary South Africa wholly embraces informal trade, there are instances of restrictive policies. Nonetheless, one sees in the National Development Plan, how the state accepts the informal economy as it foresees this sector “creating between 1.2 and 2 million new jobs by 2030” (National Planning Commission, 2012, p. 121). The acceptance of the informal sectors is an example of the celebratory African urbanism argument that the paper mentioned in the literature review. Through such acknowledgments, the state sees the urban poor as being responsible for their development and the right to human development is something that people are expected to acquire (Amin, 2013). Why the South African state resorted to acceptance of the informal sector, is partly because of the formal sectors' inability to absorb the many potential labourers in cities into the formal economy. Therefore, because of the various developmental challenges, particularly high rates of unemployment, the

South African government sees the informal sectors as a means to alleviate the high unemployment and high poverty rates, etc. found in its cities.

It is, however, important to note that the above explanation of the national government's acceptance of the informal sectors, is a partial answer. South African executives need to ensure it adheres to the highest rule of law, which is the Constitution. Constitutional rights such as those found in Chapter 2: 22, which states “Every citizen has the right to choose their trade, occupation or profession freely. The practice of a trade, occupation or profession may be regulated by law.” (Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, 1996) and Chapters 1: 11 inherent right to human dignity. It is under such constitutional obligations that the state, both national and local, has been held accountable by NGO's and traders, through the state's judicial system. It is therefore under the guide of the constitution that the Executive is obligated to protect and accept the existence of informal traders.

In addition to the supreme law's provisions that are created by the Constitution, the Business Act of 1991 is a policy that is frequently referred to when discussing the legislature regarding the informal employment sector. The Act was established to “repeal or amend certain laws regarding the licensing and carrying on of businesses, and shop hours; to make certain new provisions regarding such licensing and carrying on of businesses; and to provide for matters connected therewith” (Business Act 1991, P. 30). Importantly the provisions of “the Business Act 71 of 1991 allowing for the restriction of such trade only in limited circumstances” (Pieterse, 2017, p. 5). This is a crucial move as it illustrates a transition from Apartheid states complete restriction of street trading, to a relaxation of policies regarding street traders or hawkers. It is important to note that the Act is a relaxation and not necessarily a complete transition from restrictive legislature towards street traders. Firstly, the Act gives the administrator the authority

to “designate a local authority, or appoint any person or body, as a licensing authority for an area” (Business Act, 1991, p. 3). This means that the municipality or the province demarcates which areas in which the traders may or may not operate. And secondly, “a licensing authority may at any time, after giving the license holder concerned a reasonable opportunity to be heard, withdraw or suspend a license” (Business Act, 1991, p. 5). Therefore, the above provisions illustrate a slight relaxation of the former policies of apartheid as they still allow the state to restrict trading in particular areas, and the act grants the state provision to revoke trader’s licenses at its discretion. Therefore, the Act represents a partial transition from the Apartheid state’s restrictive policies towards the informal traders.

Outside of the Constitution, national departments such as the Department of Small Business have programs that are aimed at assisting small businesses. Understanding that there is a vacuum of pragmatic support for small and informal businesses and are therefore attempting to fill this gap. One of the programs which allocate grants to small business and therefore has relevance to the research is the Informal and Micro Enterprise Support Programme (IMESP). This program “provides funding for skills development support in the form of technical support (including marketing, product improvement, and regulatory compliance support), organizational support, or management and governance training through a grant of up to R60 000.” (SERI and SELGA, 2018, p. 22). Such grants are an essential form of investment for a business that does not have sufficient funds for capital and cannot get financial assistance from the private banking sector. Examples of the implementation of this program’s support can be found in the partnership with the City of eThekweni and the Department of Small Business initiative which created over 217 new jobs and supported approximately 53 enterprises (Project Preparation Trust, 2016). The program is said to assist with business plan development, business mentorship, and training and

skills development assistance. However, although this program is said to provide support to the informal employment sector it does seem to narrowly support small businesses/enterprises and not necessarily the informal street traders who might need the support that is provided to enterprises. For instance, enterprises need to meet specific conditions such as “enterprise viability, job creation potential, and entrepreneur commitment”. If the program is inclusive and such support would be of great assistance in developing the services provided by the informal traders.

4.3: Municipal Policy

Having dealt with the national government stance of the informal economy the paper will look at the local or municipalities’ approach, which is paramount in answering this paper. The local government, and specifically to this paper the municipality, has “a crucial role to play in developing and implementing a supportive and facilitative regulatory and policy environment for informal trade.” (SERI, SALGA, 2018, p. 1). This is because in many instances the municipality is the entity responsible for the urban management of their particular areas, which is where many of the informal traders operate. How each municipality incorporates informal trade in the economy varies as the Business Amendment Act of 1993 allows different municipalities to utilize different approaches to informal trade within their municipalities. The Ekurhuleni Municipality acknowledges the importance of informal traders and in doing so “develop strategies to support and manage this constantly growing sector as best they can.” (Informal Trade Plan, 2012, p.1) using the plan. Crucially the plan adequately identifies 12 needs and requirements however for this research the paper will look at the following needs and requirement: “the lack of access to financial services, limited access to training in areas such as business skills, technical training, limited access to infrastructure and basic services like housing, water, electricity, rubbish removal, and channels, competition from peers due to over trading

(especially among hawkers) and effects of competition from large retailers” (Informal Trade Plan, 2012, p. 7). By identifying the above requirements, the municipality, therefore, illustrates that it understands that these constraints need to be looked into to ensure the success of the informal traders. Whether or not in practice, the municipality assists with the above requirements and needs will be established after the analyses of the trader’s interviews. Furthermore, whether or not these requirements coincide with actual needs will further be established in the next chapters. However, the research would argue that these requirements are essential for the growth and the assistance of the traders.

Important to this research, the plan argues that are three types of traders (2012):

- Survivalist trader: a trader who can meet his own needs and those of his family by trading.
- Informal trader: a trader who meets his own needs and those of his family but is also able to operate on a profit basis.
- Formal trader: a trader trading from a fixed location and that follows formal business principles. There may be a formal brick and mortar shop elsewhere where products are manufactured.

The three categories are created to illustrate a hierarchy and a linear evolution, with the latter of the three being the most ideal trader that would bring about true economic growth. This distinction is crucial for research for many reasons. Firstly, illustrates that the aim of the municipal policy is primarily to incorporate them into the economy by formalizing or regulating the hawkers. A policy that is orientated around the graduation from survivalist trader to an informal trader illustrates that municipality laws are” focused on ensuring the control of the activities of informal traders or the strict compliance with by-laws than with facilitating more favorable conditions for informal traders.” (SERI and SALGA, 2018, p. 6). The “strict

compliance laws” that the above quote refers to are demarcation laws that establish particular territories where traders can and cannot trade-in. This argument is in line with the research hypothesis as it illustrates that relations between the state and the traders, is not necessarily conducive to enhancement or development of the businesses of the traders. Therefore, the restrictive laws created by this municipality hinder the growth and the success of business in the informal sector. This, therefore, illustrates that the municipality does not comprehend the needs of the informal traders, as they are primarily focused on restricting the whereabouts of the trader rather than assisting their trading or understanding business needs.

Furthermore, under the leadership of Mayor Mzwandile Masina, the municipality has advocated for a “pro-poor” policy. During the 2019 budget speech, Doctor Xhakaza argued that the city would utilize a growth strategy which outlined “that sustainable economic development can only be achieved when the economy is in the hands of the people – for an economy that thrusts the people at the edge of the periphery is an economy that is incapable of bringing about genuine transformation” (Budget speech, 2009, p. 2). This pro-poor agenda talks to maintaining clean audits, developing transport infrastructure such as implementing the BRT system, and many other initiatives but does not refer to the informal economy. The fact that this budget speech makes no mention of the informal traders but argues that its policy is pro-poor which is re-urbanizing and attempting to assist with the unemployment crises that have rendered “6.2 million South Africans” speaks volumes of the lack of importance of this sector to the municipality. Therefore, there seems to be a shift in policy from the 2012 Trade development plan to Mayor Masina’s policy that does not acknowledge the contribution that the informal sector has to the economy. Arguing that a municipality growth strategy is inclusive and pro-poor without making any reference to a sector that creates employment for poor urban South Africans is a

contradictory stance. Therefore, the lack of mention of informal traders in the transformation of the economy fundamentally deviates from the municipalities' Informal Trades Policy.

Lastly, broadly speaking the formation and “growth in the number of organizations which are aimed at influencing and resisting informal trading policy” (Matjomane, 2013, p. 5) and the emergence of cases against municipalities illustrates the hostile relationship between the state and traders. Examples of the organizations which represent informal trades are entities such as the South African Informal Traders Forum (SAITF), South African National Traders Retail Alliance (SANTRA), and One Voice of All Hawkers Association (OVOAHA) and Thutukani. Furthermore, the legal battles with entities that represent the informal traders, such as SERI, against municipalities and policies which hinder the trader’s constitutional rights to dignity and trade further illustrate the fragile relations between the two entities. A prominent example of non-state organization intervention on behalf of the traders is the SANTIF and SAITF Supreme Court and Constitutional Court application against the City of Johannesburg Operation Clean Sweep which resulted in the displacement of the street traders. In this matter, the Constitutional Court ruled against the City of Johannesburg arguing that the cities action illustrated “flagrant disregard” (Hogans and Lovell, 2014) for the trader's right to trade and right to dignity. The assistance and intervention that informal trader seeks from non-governmental institutions and the judicial system illustrate a breakdown of communications lines between the traders and the respective municipalities. The above intervention further illustrated that municipal laws and constitutional laws towards informal traders can be at odds with one another, with the latter seeking to protect the traders and the latter having little disregard for the informal sector. Therefore, illustrating the complex nature of South Africa’s informal sector and the state's responses to the informal traders.

4.4: Conclusion

In conclusion, it seems on paper the executive entities of the democratic South Africa “acknowledged that it is important to ensure that the informal sector and consequently informal trade, is given room to develop and flourish.” (SERI and SELGA, 2018, p. 1). This is visible in the rights enshrined in the Constitution, and different national programs such as the Informal and Micro Enterprise Support Programme (IMESP). The move from a highly restrictive policy to a more relaxed policy is reflected by the implementation of the Business Act 71 of 1991, which is “allowing for the restriction of such trade only in limited circumstances.” (Pieterse, 2017, p. 5). The implementation of this act was guided by the Constitution and the understanding of the state’s inability to create formal employment opportunities for a vast amount of the urban population. As mentioned in the above paragraphs the Act does have provisions that are contradictory and that are restrictive. However, specific to this research one sees how the Ekurhuleni municipality has outlined key challenges that the informal traders face in the operation of their business illustrating an awareness of the challenges in this sector. However, one sees that even with all the policies that supposedly support the informal traders, relations between the state and the informal sector are fragile. One sees policies that merely aim to restrict the sector and not necessarily assist in the development of the sector. Furthermore, the fragile interactions are further emphasized by the established unions and organizations that represent the traders and grant them a voice when interacting with the state. Lastly and importantly one sees the emergence of “successful litigation conducted on behalf of the informal trader” (Pieterse, 2017, p. 6). In conclusion, it seems that national policies and the municipal policies are at odds with one another, with the former attempting to integrate the street traders and the latter merely tolerating and at times applying policies that act in a restrictive manner. Therefore the entity that is supposed to play a crucial role in developing and implementing a supportive and facilitative

regulatory and policy environment for informal trade (SERI and SELGA, 2018) lacks sympathy for traders and counteracts the strides being made at the national level, which is highly problematic. Policies and the implementation of policies regarding informal traders are therefore fraught with contradictions, which may explain the fragile relationship between the state and the informal traders.

Chapter 5: Characteristics of the street traders' enterprises in poor urban peripheries

5.1: Introduction

This chapter will analyze the characteristics of the street traders that are found in poor peripheries such as in Natalspruit, utilizing the empirical data collected in the fieldwork. It will do the above by outlining and discussing the type of merchandise that is found in the market.

Secondly, the section illustrates that the traders at the Natalspruit market area, based on the trader's' characteristics recorded in the empirical data, are survivalist entrepreneurs. Furthermore, this section will discuss and analyze the aspirations and future plans of the traders. Lastly, this section will illustrate how urban marginality as a theoretical framework, explains the characteristics exhibited by the traders in the market area in question. This section attempts to paint a picture of what it means to be a street trader in a poor periphery such as the one in question.

5.2: Observations of the market area

The area is crowded by commuters who utilize the various taxi ranks, as well as workers and customers who utilize the shopping center and the informal market. This type of scene is beneficial for the traders, as an overcrowded facility means that they are more likely to sell some of their products. The traders operate within the premises of the mall and around the mall and in front of the former Natalspruit hospital. Most of the street traders operate on paved areas in metal structures [see Figure 1] which are provided by the municipality while a few of the traders operate in DIY structures as they have not been provided shelter by the municipality.



Figure 1: A view of a trading stall on the pavement in the Natalspruit trading area. Picture by Author, December 2019

The majority of the traders operating in the area in question belong to the black African ethnic group with a few Indian street traders. The gender demographics are mixed, with the majority of the traders being female. Furthermore, the medium of communication observed is Zulu, Shangan, Portuguese and English. The market has individuals who have been operating as street traders in the Natalspruit informal market for more than 20 years.



Figure 2: A trader and her toddler at a stand in front of one of the shopping center entrance. Picture by Author, December 2019

During my numerous visits to the market area, 5 trips to be exact, I noticed orderly operations among the traders. Every morning, each trader comes with their belongings and merchandise, while some of the traders store their merchandise in locked-up black municipal dustbins and settle at their demarcated stalls. The market may be informal, but the traders operate in a formal manner where there are no scuffles regarding where each trader sells their merchandise. Lastly, the majority of the traders seem to have good relations with one another. Different traders move around the different stalls having conversations with one another or purchasing goods from each other stalls. During fieldwork there were overall, friendly interactions amongst the traders in the market in question. It is further important to note that in some instances there were whole intermediate family members at an individual's stores. For example, at one of the stalls, which

sold snacks such as sweets and chips, there was a father, mother and a child, while at many other stalls the female traders had their children, who are mostly toddlers.

5.3: Traders merchandise

The majority of the participants spoke to the precarious nature of this form of employment in terms of how the revenues generated provided for their needs. For instance, one of the participants Arthalina, who sells shoes and socks, stated that customers hardly buy her products and stated that “business is on and off”. Such sentiments were shared by a significant portion of the participants, with only two of the participants arguing that the revenues generated were enough to cater to their daily needs. The difficulty for traders to generate a substantial income that caters to their daily needs is hindered by two factors. Firstly, the market is overcrowded by traders and therefore highly competitive. In some instances, four consecutive traders are selling the same product. Secondly, the market is right next to a shopping center, which provides all, but the hairdressing business and nail art services, the service that is provided in the informal market. Therefore, even though the market area is an excellent site for business because of its proximity to a variety of ranks, many individuals may opt to purchase their goods from the shopping center as opposed to the street traders which negatively affects the trader’s revenue. The congestion of homogenous goods in the market has dire effects on traders as several of the participants do not have other forms of work outside their hawking activities in the markets. Therefore, making themselves as well as their dependents reliant on the income or revenue received from trading in this market. It is important to note that the research did not establish the degree of financial support, whether it is shared with another individual or whether or not they were the breadwinners, or whether another family member assisted them with financial support. The only instance where the research can to some degree establish sole dependence on the income is at

stalls where whole families were participating in the trade, such as the family mentioned in the above paragraphs.

Nonetheless, one sees in the above paragraphs how entrepreneurship requires “creativity, innovation, growth, uniqueness, and entrepreneurship focusing on outcomes such as the creation of value” (Choto et al., 2014, p. 94). Therefore, partaking in such unprofitable enterprises and the lack of qualities of the above skillsets illustrate a lack of entrepreneurial mindset in the street traders. These activities are just the act of throwing things together as a means to sustain themselves (Simone, 2004). Nonetheless, this form of employment which is embraced by national and some local policies generates minimal livelihoods (Simone, 2004) that barely assist in catering to the trader’s daily needs.

Furthermore, there is a sense among the traders that formal work central in our lives even though it is a scarce entity (Ferguson, 2007). Though many of the participants have been operating in the market for a substantial amount of years, and though they aspire to grow their business, many of the participants would like to be incorporated into the formal sector. It, therefore, seems that the traders utilize the informal trading employment opportunity as a waiting area until the formal employment opportunities present themselves. The lack of formal employment opportunities based on answers to the availability of formal employment is an important determinant of the creation of alternative employment opportunities such as street trading. Therefore, though traders see themselves as entrepreneurs, it does seem that this is because of the scarcity of formal employment opportunities. And this, therefore, means many of the traders are entrepreneurs because of circumstance, and if they were given the option of a 9/5 formal employment opportunity, they would take it. Having argued the above, the research is not outrightly disputing the presence of traders who are in the profession by choice such as Maria. The research

acknowledges the presence of individuals who want to be self-employed within the market, however, it seems that a vast majority of the traders do not fall under the category of entrepreneurship by choice but rather entrepreneurship because of circumstance. Therefore, for the majority of the participants, street trading is a provision of income opportunities as the last resort (Skinner, 2016, p. 18).

5.4: Informal traders or survivalist entrepreneurs

It is further paramount to the research that it establishes if the informal traders in the Ntshokeng market are survivalist entrepreneurs. Establishing this would then inform the research whether the informal traders in this particular market area are in it by choice or by circumstance. According to the definitions utilized in the literature review, survivalist entrepreneurs are individuals who create alternative forms of employment because of the scarcity of formal jobs, the incomes generated from these alternative forms of employment are not sufficient for their basic needs and they establish these enterprises or service in informal settlements. Now according to the above definition of survivalist entrepreneurs the research has established that there is evidence that the traders are indeed in this occupation because of circumstance and not necessarily choice. Firstly, the data collected from the interviews established that all the participants believe that there is a shortage in the availability of formal employment in their areas of residence. The majority of the participants, but one of the participants, stated they would leave the informal market if they were granted an opportunity to work in the formal employment sector. One of the participants, Sanele, stated that he would leave as "there are too many problems associated with working in the informal market". Furthermore, all of the participants stated that formal jobs are scarce in the township of Ntshokeng. Therefore, the inability to secure employment in the formal sector near their places of residence coerces the individuals to create alternative forms of employment as a means to survive (Jessely, 2006). From the above data, the

research concludes that the trader's participation in the informal market is a survival mechanism. This coincides with the notion that street trading is simply "people who are unable to secure regular wage employment" (Rogerson, 2000 p. 674) and are therefore survivalist entrepreneurs. The research concludes based on the above data that the lack of formal employment opportunity has a direct effect on the formation of informal employment in Natalspruit. This is because the informal activities that they participate in are seen as "a survival niche of the most marginalized poor and most vulnerable groups" (Rogerson, 2000, p. 674), individuals who do not have a variety of choices regarding formal employment opportunities.

It is, however, important to note that the data also illustrated that 50% of the participants stated that the informal market was their first choice of employment. Furthermore, some of the hawkers have operated in the Natalspruit market for more than 2 decades and the market continues to attract new traders. The above information can be seen as contradictory to the conclusion in the above paragraph as to why would individuals remain in a market that does not generate sufficient income. However, the reasoning behind why street trading is the first choice of employment for 50% of the participants is explained when one looks at the labour market disadvantages and the scarcity of formal labour. For instance, Sandra stated that this was her first choice because salons paid low wages, inadequate working conditions, and cronyism hence she preferred "being her own boss". Two of the younger men stated that they had unsuccessfully searched for formal employment for over a year after matriculating and therefore resorted to selling, secondhand clothes, and snacks to make ends meet. It is, therefore, the above barriers to the formal employment market, high youth unemployment, and low wages, etc., which force individuals to create alternative employment. This then illustrates that the vast majority of the participant's activities in the informal market of Natalspruit are a mere means of economic survival (Fishers,

2011) as they are unable to enter the formal market and therefore play a role in the narrative that these participants are indeed survivalist entrepreneurs.

Furthermore, when the traders were asked if they would leave the informal sector if adequate formal employment opportunities presented themselves, a vast majority excluding one participant answered yes. From the conversation with the traders, adequate formal employment range from professional hairstyling, retail work, and domestic services. The data further reiterates that this form of employment is indeed their last resort and a mere means of economic survival. The phenomena in the informal trading area of Ntshongweni illustrates Auyero's (1999) description of the poor people's waiting experience. The traders are waiting for the provision of adequate formal job opportunities and when they present themselves, they would be more than willing to jump ship. Issues such as chronic unemployment levels, which some of the participant's states as barriers to the formal economy, and the high levels of poverty found in South Africa's poor peripheries, are circumstances that require these individuals to 'wait' in the informal sector. This information accurately illustrates why there is a willingness to leave the informal sector as the informal sector is a waiting area where they can generate some income, as they "wait" for adequate formal jobs to present themselves.

Therefore, the data collected from the interviews correlates with definitions provided by Jesselyn (2006), Fishers (2011), Amin, (2013) and Rogers (1996) that these traders are indeed survivalist entrepreneurs. Developmental challenges such high unemployment rates found in South Africa forces the poor to create alternative employment opportunities that do not produce adequate incomes while they wait for adequate employment opportunities to present themselves. The research, therefore, concludes, based on the research's findings, that the informal market of Ntshongweni can be seen as the poor's waiting area, which resulted in the barriers of entry into the

formal employment sector. Therefore, the research is justified to refer to the traders in question as survivalist entrepreneurs.

5.5: The aspirations of street traders

Questions 5, 8, and 9 attempted to establish any future aspirations that the traders might have in the informal sector or the formal employment sector. The data recorded from the above questions illustrated that more than the majority of the participants stated that they considered themselves to be entrepreneurs, merely one participant gave a negative response. Following these responses, the participants stated their aspirations of expanding their street trading businesses. One of the participants, Prince, stated that the trading of secondhand clothing was a small business that he would grow if he had enough finances. Furthermore, Maria, who also sells clothing, stated that she saw herself as an entrepreneur, as she preferred to be her “own boss” and not work for anyone else (see Figure 3).



Figure 3: Maria's DIY stand which she built because she did not receive a municipal stand. Picture by Author, December 2019

Two of the participants, Nandos and Arthalina, argued that they were entrepreneurs, but this was due to circumstances, such as the lack of availability of formal employment. It is important to note that many of the participants did not clearly understand what it meant to be an entrepreneur and gave yes or no responses.

With the majority of the participants arguing that they considered themselves to be entrepreneurs, many of the traders expressed long term goals for their businesses. When asked about their future plans for their business, many expressed visions of growing their businesses and formalizing them. All but one of the participants stated they wanted to expand their businesses and have access to formal shops where they could store their stock in one place. According to the participant's responses to the question, expansion meant having access to space where their stock could be stored permanently and safely. Furthermore, the growth of their businesses goes hand in hand with increasing their finance so they could purchase more stock. Therefore, the majority of the participants have long term goals of growing their business. Only one participant stated she wanted to keep her stall as is and had no aspiration of growing it. Maria stated that she would prefer to keep her business as is as "owning a formal business comes with added expenses, such as rent". Therefore, for her, staying in the stall which she built on her own, as she was not given a stall, is a more viable option. Nonetheless, the majority of the participant shared the aspiration of using their current means of employment as a foundation for building or growing their businesses.

Ironically, when asked if they would leave the informal sector if they were granted formal employment, all but one participant, Maria, stated they would leave the informal sector. A vast majority of the participants stated they would leave informal trade for formal employment because there are many problems associated with working in the informal sector, and a lack of

security and a lack of finance were the top responses for leaving the informal sector. Therefore, even though the majority of the participant in the above paragraphs argued that they were entrepreneurs and had long-term visions for their businesses, all but one of the participants would, if the opportunity came would continue as a street trader. Maria was the only participant who illustrated consistency in her answers. She stated that she never wanted to work for another person, and she was more than happy to work as a street trader.

5.6: Urban marginality

The data collected talks to several issues that are raised by the urban marginality theory, namely the scarcity of formal employment, underdeveloped residential areas, and the state's exclusionary measures upon individuals in the poor peripheries. This, therefore, illustrates the usability of urban marginalization as a theory in this research. First is the trader's inability to secure formal employment opportunities in their residential areas. This ties into an urban marginality claim that argues that wage employment has become internally unstable and is a "vector of social instability and life insecurity (Wacquant, 2008, p. 234) which forces individuals in urban spaces into the informal economy. The insecurity within the formal employment sector has resulted in the occurrence of the informal market as a waiting area in urban spaces. Therefore, according to the traders and urban marginality, informal markets such as the one in Ntshongweni can be seen as waiting areas. The individuals in these markets are waiting for formal employment opportunities to present themselves.

Furthermore, the long-term aspirations that were shared by the traders illustrate, that though they would like to enter the formal economy, however, there's a possibility that this will not happen, and they are content with this. This is could be because subconsciously the traders, know that the poor are expected to "upgrade themselves and appropriate local interventions" (Amin, 2013, p.

4), which goes in line with urban marginality. Therefore, one sees that though the individuals hope to find adequate formal employment opportunities, they see that they are expected to partake in self-help initiatives. This could explain why one sees in the Natalspruit trading area, traders who have not received state stalls simply creating DIY stands, as they are expected to do so. Therefore, one sees how urban marginality explains the characters of street traders.

5.7: Conclusion

In conclusion, this section described and discussed the characteristics of street traders who operate in the Natalspruit informal market. It did the above by explaining the type of merchandise that traders sell in the market. It then attempted to illustrate that the street traders in the market area in question are indeed survivalist entrepreneurs, who participated in the informal sector because of a lack of employment opportunities in poor peripheries such as in this research case study. It then discusses the aspirations found among the traders. The final section of this chapter illustrated how urban marginalization explains the characteristics of the traders in the Natalspruit market area, illustrating how valuable this theoretical framework is in describing and explaining how the traders in the informal sector operate.

Chapter 6: Challenges faced by survivalist entrepreneurs in the Natsalspruit market area

6.1: Introduction

This chapter will discuss the common challenges faced by the survivalist traders in the Natsalspruit market area, based on the data collected from the fieldwork. Firstly, this chapter will discuss the insufficient income or profits generated by survivalist businesses. Then it will discuss the trader's sentiments of being part of the marginalized population in urban areas. Thereafter, it will discuss how the spatial construct of urban spaces harms the poor urban. The paper will then briefly, discuss the minimal state assistance received by the informal sector, leading to discussions in the next chapter.

6.2: Unprofitability of the survivalist traders

During the fieldwork, the research established from the answers recorded from the question about revenues generated from informal trading, that a vast majority of the trader's businesses do not generate sufficient income to provide for the trader's basic needs. For instance, Arthalina, who sells both new and secondhand clothing items, stated that there were days where she did not make a single sale and therefore went home empty-handed. The difficulty for traders to generate a substantial income that caters to their daily needs is hindered by two factors. Firstly, the market is highly congested and therefore highly competitive (see Figure 4).



Figure 4: A row of traders, in front of one of the entrances of the shopping center, all selling secondhand clothing items. Picture by Author, December 2019

In some instances, as illustrated in the above figure, four or more consecutive traders are selling the same product in the market. Secondly, the market is right next to Letsoho shopping center, which provides all, but the hairdressing business and nail art business, of the services provided in the informal market. Therefore, even though the market area is an excellent site for business because of its proximity to a variety of ranks (Wits Business School, 2009), many individuals may opt to purchase their goods from the shopping center as opposed to the street traders which affects the trader's revenue. The above characteristic of the traders illustrates that the businesses run by the traders lack the potential of being high growth ventures (Choto et al. 2014) because of the homogenous products and services that one finds in the market. This, of course, is no surprise to the research, as survivalist trading by definition is not profitable and provides income levels below the minimum poverty line (Jesselyn, 2006). This, therefore, illustrates that claims made about this sector being profitable entrepreneurship activities that generate more income than the wage employment activities are indeed false in the case of the Natalspruit informal market.

Lastly, the presence of the traders in this unprofitable employment activity is a direct effect on disinvestments in urban poor territories which results in a lack of choice in employment opportunities. This is because capital will not invest in areas that are underdeveloped or lack sufficient infrastructure, meaning that they will invest in poor urban territories (SERI, 2016). The above, therefore, results in the lack of formal employment opportunities in poor urban territories as they would rather, for instance, build offices in developed spaces which are usually rich urban territories.

6.3: The marginalization of the traders

From the interactions with traders, one senses that traders feel as though they have been left out of the urban calculus (Amin, 2013), which results in traders being largely self-reliant. Although the Ekurhuleni municipality created informal policies similar to the stance of the 1970s that saw the informal sector as a solution to poverty and unemployment (Wacquant, ILO 1970), this sentiment does not seem to resonate with the traders on the ground. Many of the traders struggled to comprehend why the state would ever assist them in the development of their enterprises. This stems from the minimal state assistance that these individuals have received, which is merely the provision of stalls and nothing outside of that initiative (see Figure 5).



Figure 5: The environmental conditions in which the traders work in the Natalspuit informal market. Picture by Author, December 2019

The traders would appreciate and require financial, technical and security assistance, etc. from the state, however, the traders could not imagine why the state would assist them. For example, James stated that he could not even conceive of any municipal assistance, because “the municipality does not trust us”. This goes in line with Amin’s (2013) critique of telescopic urbanism which is numb to the needs of the urban poor, only focusing on specific sites and that results in a lack of social responsibility when it comes to the urban poor. The data recorded illustrates that street traders believe in the above sentiments as they believe that they are not entitled to any form of assistance from the state. Therefore, informal traders partake in self-help

initiatives with the understanding that as secondary citizens they are required to lift themselves out of the dire economic situations that they find themselves in.

6.4: South Africa's poor urban spatial plan

A further crucial component of understanding the occurrence of the informal sector in poor peripheries such as the case study in question is the legacy of apartheid spatial arrangement or what is popularly known as Apartheid cities (Pieterse, 2009). The creation of apartheid cities stems from the modernist approach to town planning which utilized policies that were preoccupied with maintaining urban segregation. Space was utilized as a control mechanism, as white town councils sought to impose their visions of social cohesion in towns by controlling their town's 'non-European' populations. It is therefore through such policies that one finds the establishment of poor residential areas, shadow cities, on the outskirts of the cities such as townships and informal settlements. Unfortunately, more the 20 decades after the dismantling of the legislature that allowed for such policies, the legacy of the Apartheid cities continues to exist throughout urban South Africa. One, therefore, sees the continuation of the peripheralization of urban black urban enclaves in post-apartheid South Africa.

The legacy of the above structural feature has grave developmental effects on the people living in urban poor peripheries. Firstly, unemployment rates are higher for the people who reside in areas that do not have adequate jobs close to their prospective places of residence (SERI, 2016). This coincides with the sentiments of the traders in the Natalspruit market areas, who all reside in the townships in Katlehong. When asked if it was easy to find different formal employment opportunities in Natalspruit or the township of Katlehong, they all gave negative answers to the question stating that employment in the formal sector is a scare entity. This data coincides with the Spatial Mismatch Hypothesis which predicts that unemployment rates will be higher for

people living in areas that do not have appropriate jobs nearby because this lack of proximity to jobs will make it harder for people to achieve employment (SERI, 2016). This is, therefore, why traders mention the issue of the scarcity of adequate formal employment opportunities in their areas of residence.

Following the above, a SERI paper illustrates this regard in its study of the municipality of Ekurhuleni. The study looked at a variety of municipalities throughout the country and attempted to establish whether the spatial arrangement of areas in South Africa had a direct impact on the availability of labour. The paper looked at the municipality of Ekurhuleni as a case study and concluded that “job proximity is a significant determinant of unemployment in Ekurhuleni.” (SERI, 2016, p. 30). The study illustrated a “clear picture of peripheral unemployment, with most unemployment concentrated in the peripheral north-west, east, and south. Unemployment is comparatively low around the main nodes of economic activity clustered in the center-west of the municipality” (SERI, 2016, p.31-32). Concerning this paper's research, the geographical area where the SERI study finds high unemployment consists of the township of Natalspruit and other townships within the municipality. This, therefore, illustrates and verifies that the spatial arrangement of Ekurhuleni has a direct effect on the scarcity of formal employment opportunities in the case study in question. Which therefore means that this has an indirect effect on the establishment of alternative employment opportunities such as what is found in the informal market area in Natalspruit.

6.5: Scarcity of formal employment

A recurring feature in the paper is formal employment opportunities, or rather the lack thereof. The data collected illustrates that traders are aware of the shortage of formal employment. This was established when the traders were asked about the availability of work in the areas, whereby

all the participants argued that formal employment opportunities in their townships are highly scarce. The majority of the participants attributed the lack of formal employment to a lack of finance and the countries battle with high unemployment rates. The traders are aware of the gradual increase in unemployment, with it rising to 29, 1% (Stats SA, 2019), and therefore attribute the scarcity of jobs to the unemployment crisis that the country is facing. Nonetheless, all the participants stated the difficulties of entering into the formal sector in Natalspruit. Furthermore, the majority of the participant referred to nepotism and/or cronyism as being a hindrance for individuals getting access to jobs in the formal sector. These two concepts refer to the allocation of jobs and other business favours based on family or friendship relations (Corruption Watch, 2014) and not merely based on merit. The bias regarding the allocation of jobs was adequately explained by James and MaNxumalo. MaNxumalo stated that “If no one knows you, you will not get any assistance. There is no usage of qualifications” when applying for jobs. Such statements correlate with arguments that were made by Corruption Watch five years ago, where they cited “irregularities and nepotism involving family and close friend” (Corruption Watch, 2014) in the allocation of jobs is an issue in South Africa. Therefore, the informal traders believe that for them, it is highly unlikely that they will enter the formal sector because of the above-mentioned bias. The sentiments shared on corruption coincides with the urban marginality claims that argue that the state pushes the poor into the informal market” (Wacquant, 2008a, p. 67) and are therefore unlikely to be catered for in the formal employment sector.

6.6: Minimal state assistance

During the fieldwork, all the traders spoke to challenges that they face, such as the lack of structures and security, etc., which ultimately requires state intervention. The data collected illustrates, contrary to the municipalities ‘pro-poor policies’, the municipalities' unwillingness to

assist the traders. This was illustrated in James and many of the trader's statements, that the municipality does not have any interest in assisting them. Nonetheless, the data illustrates that the traders can be grouped into two groups; those who want to leave the informal sector and those who have ambitions to grow their informal business. The former category comes from the answers of individuals who stated they want to leave the sector, because of various reasons such as the lack of security, etc. Whereas the latter category comes from the participants, who would like to grow their businesses. The data collected from the traders illustrated that the state is unable to assist traders in both categories, essentially their unwillingness to help all the traders. This is illustrated by the municipalities' inability to assist with the many challenges voiced by the traders, such as the provision of financial assistance or adequate shelters, etc. This unwillingness on the part of the state is explained by urban marginalization concepts such as the penalization of the poor and the expectation that the poor need to partake in self-help activities. Therefore, the research argues that it is highly unlikely that the state will provide for any of the trader's needs. The research, therefore, concludes that based on the data presented by the traders and based on urban marginalization as a theory, the survivalist entrepreneur's main challenge is the state's general unwillingness to assist the poor.

6.7: Conclusion

This chapter discussed the challenges faced by the survivalist traders in the Ntshongwen informal market, according to the themes which were occurred in the empirical data. The first theme which comes from the data is the insufficient income that is generated from the informal market. The next discussion is the marginalization of street traders, which comes from the state's unwillingness to assist the traders. Here to the paper illustrated how urban marginality explains the challenges faced by the street traders in Ntshongwen. The next chapter will go into detail explaining the trader's relationship with the state in the form of the Ekurhuleni municipality.

Chapter 7: Relations between the municipality and the traders

7.1: Introduction

This chapter seeks to establish how the municipality interacts with the traders in the Natalspruit informal market. It will do the above by comparing the data collected from the empirical data to the city of Ekurhuleni's informal trade policies. This chapter will establish whether the city of Ekurhuleni policies is in line with the needs of the traders. The above will be done by comparing the city of Ekurhuleni with other municipalities, illustrating Ekurhuleni's sympathetic stance towards street traders. It will then discuss some of Ekurhuleni's informal policies to illustrate that these policies do not necessarily coincide with the realities of the traders. Lastly, the chapter will illustrate the absence of non-governmental organizations that are supposed to assist the trader to communicate their needs to the state. This chapter will, therefore, illustrate how the municipality partakes in the politics of invisibility by not implementing strategies that are meant to assist the informal economy.

7.2: The municipalities' sympathetic stance towards the informal sector

It is crucial to note that, unlike many of the other municipalities that have become increasingly hostile towards street traders, this has not been the case in the Ekurhuleni municipality. The paper notes that there have been several litigation cases against municipalities by street traders in recent years. One example is the city of Johannesburg's restrictive, inconsistent and enforcement-orientated" (Webster, p.4) policies towards the traders over the years. The research established through the data collected from the interviews that the antagonistic relationship that exists between the city of Johannesburg and its street traders is not a factor in the Natalspruit

market. None of the participants stated any form of police brutality or any form of municipality harassment such as the city of Johannesburg's Operations Clean Sweep initiatives in the city of Johannesburg. For example, during the fieldwork, there were police officers seated at one of the stalls indulging in a meal that was prepared by one of the stall owners. This picture somewhat illustrates the peaceful coexistence between the security personals and the traders in the market. Therefore, contrary to the city of Johannesburg and other municipalities, the Ekurhuleni municipality seems to respect the constitutional rights of the traders and has made great strides to assist the informal traders in their market.

Furthermore, the Ekurhuleni municipality policies seem to embrace the National Development Plan strategies to allow the informal sector to assist in eradicating developmental challenges (National Planning Commission, 2012) such as high unemployment and poverty rates. One such example is the municipality's attempts to embrace the informal sector in the creation of the municipality's 2012 Informal Trade Plan. This plan was devised to "develop strategies to support and manage this constantly growing sector as best they can." (Informal Trade Plan, 2012, p. 5), utilizing 12 strategies. After comparing the empirical data and the plan, it seems that the plan is in touch with the challenges and needs of the informal traders. This is because the challenges stipulated in the plan are similar to that of the street traders. Therefore, on paper, it seems that the municipality understands the challenges and needs of the traders. The question is whether the municipality has materialized their understanding and applied these strategies to help combat the challenges faced by the informal traders.

7.3: Informal Trade Plan strategies concerning the traders

Firstly, when the traders were asked how the state could assist them, the most mentioned answer was financial assistance. Participants, such as Arthalina stated that state financial assistance

would assist them to purchase stock for their businesses and therefore assist them to grow their businesses. Fortunately, the cities informal trade plan also identified the “lack of access to financial services such as credit and savings” (Ekurhuleni Informal Trade Sectoral Plan, 2012, p. 6) as one of the constraints faced by street traders. Often time’s financial institutions tend to have a general policy bias against small and informal businesses in favour of big established businesses. For instance, banks often have “credit policies that discriminate naturally in favour of literate” (Griffin, 2002, p. 284) and well-established formal business. Of course, in the above quote, Griffin is discussing the bias against small farmers for large landowners, but this is also the case for small enterprises and well-established businesses because anything small and informal is deemed as being high risk. This bias then results in limited access to funds for small informal businesses, who like any other business need access to finance to grow and maintain their businesses. It was surprising that during the research’s fieldwork which was conducted in 2019 that none of the participants have received financial assistance from the municipality. What this essentially means is that since the establishment of the Informal Trade Plan in 2012, the street traders of the Natalspruit informal market have not received any such assistance from the municipality. Therefore, what the research establishes is that the municipality has recognized a constraint that resonates with the traders but has not acted in this regard. This illustrates the state's disillusion regarding the provision of financial assistance to the traders. Following the above, it is then no surprise that traders believe that the municipality “knows what we need but they do not want to assist us”.

Following the above, the aspirations of the traders to receive support, both financial and educational, to develop their businesses tell a telling story. De Soto argues that the informal sector is largely marginalized from the “capitalist system” which hinders the business ability to

grow. The exclusion that De Soto speaks to is the legal structures which he argues are long and have a bias towards the poor. An example of such an exclusionary measure is the informal enterprises' inability to access much-needed funds to expand their businesses (de Soto, 2000) because of the financial institution's bias against small businesses mentioned in the above paragraph. This exclusionary measure, therefore, requires government intervention, so when the private sector will not assist the state assists or puts in place policies that coerce the private sector to assist. The municipality must intervene to facilitate the graduation from the informal to the formal sector as the extra-legal structures created by the traders do not provide adequate support for the enterprises. These interventions, need to involve the traders, the public sector, and financial institutions, the above marginalization is to be dealt with.

Another one of the municipality's informal plan strategies recognized “crime including violent crime, shoplifting, and employee theft, especially among hawkers who do not take stock of their products” (Ekurhuleni, Informal Sectoral Plan, 2012, p. 7) as another challenge for the informal market. Seemingly taking note of the security issues faced by the traders in Natalspruit. Here to, the research established that the lack of security was the second most mentioned problem that required state assistance. MaNxumalo spoke about criminal elements that not only threaten their safety but threaten the safety of their customers. She mentioned and Sanele and Samuel attested to how on countless occasions many of their customers were held at gunpoint and robbed of their positions in their market. The participants argued that they had reported these acts of violence, but their cries fell on deaf ears. This then prompted the traders to come together and stop the criminals from attacking themselves and their customers. The ‘coming together’ of the traders because of the lack of state assistance resonates well with one of the urban marginality arguments that there is an expectation on the part of the state that the poor should assist

themselves. Prince stated that private security because the police weren't of assistance, would be appreciated to assist with the criminal elements in the market. The police's unwillingness to assist with security issues further illustrates urban marginality's argument that the state is simply unwilling to assist the poor. Therefore, it seems that here to the challenge are recognized but are not met with sufficient solutions. The municipalities' unwillingness to station a sufficient number of security reinforcements in an area that has high criminal activities further illustrates, in reality, the municipalities' lack of interest in assisting the informal traders.

Furthermore, the participants stated how they would appreciate it if the municipality provided them with adequate shelter. Although the traders who received the stands are highly appreciative of the municipal provided shelters, the current stalls do not provide sufficient shelter, leaving their stock vulnerable to weather conditions and further leaving the traders vulnerable to thieves. For instance, the stalls have no doors or windows, they are easily accessible to anyone. This is problematic for many reasons. Firstly, a few traders are unable to store their stock at their stalls and therefore need to travel with their products from their places of residence to their stalls daily. However, many of the traders have resorted to placing all their produce in a municipality black or green trashcan which is locked with a chain and left at the stall (see Figure 6).



Figure 6: The picture illustrates the traders storing mechanism, a dustbin, which is a common feature in this informal market. Picture by Author, December 2019

Though this method ensures that the traders do not move around with their stock this method is unsafe as anyone could steal or break into the dustbin and take their stock. Furthermore, as MaNxumalo stated, the stalls are inadequate because they are not weather conducive as they are open metal stalls, leaving them vulnerable to all weather conditions. For instance, in the summer they are hindered by the heat and the rain which negatively affects the shelf life of their products and in the winter the traders themselves are subjected to the cold. It is therefore for the above reasons that the participants stated that they would appreciate the municipality providing them with adequate shelter. Interestingly, the informal plan recognizers “limited access to business-related infrastructure such as manufacturing space, closeness to others involved in similar activities, as well as, trading and storage space” (Ekurhuleni Informal Sectoral Plan, 2012, p. 7) as a constraint for the street traders. One sees how the municipality has provided most of the traders in the Natalspruit with stalls and the traders with the stalls illustrated an immense amount

of gratitude for the provision of these stalls at no charge by the municipality. Therefore, the municipality, to a certain extent, has made strides in assisting the traders with access to business-related infrastructure by providing them with stalls. However, the issue is with the quality and usability of the stalls. An example of this is the hairstylist stand which unlike the other stalls does not have a metal corrugated roof, exposing her and clients to the rain. This will negatively affect her revenue as customers can be rightfully deterred from utilizing their services because these stalls are not weather conducive.

It is also important to note that the need for the provision of adequate stalls with storage units is not a new phenomenon. In 2009 the municipality of Ekurhuleni partnered with the Wits Business School to formulate a report called “*The informal economy and its development: The case of Ntalspruit trading area: Ekurhuleni*”. This paper aimed to study the traders and thereafter bring forth recommendations that would develop the businesses of the informal traders. Amongst the commonly reported problems experienced by the trader's shelter and a lack of storage was one of them. The recommendation was the provision of structures that provided “lockable storage, a shelter for goods and traders, and maximum display frontage” (Wits Business School, 2009, p. 57). What one therefore sees, in the case of the Ekurhuleni municipality is a pattern of understanding the challenges faced by the traders but a disinterest in implementing practical solutions, therefore turning a blind eye to the challenges faced by the traders.

Furthermore, is the issue of “competition from peers due to over trading (especially among hawkers) and effects of competition from large retailers” (Ekurhuleni, Informal Sectoral Plan, 2012, p. 7) outlined by the municipality's policy. As mentioned in the above paragraphs one of the issues that the research established is the highly competitive nature of the trading area, which stems from the trading of homogenous products amongst the street traders and the shops in the

shopping center. The competitive nature of the markets has adverse effects on the traders as it decreases the trader's profit margins as their services and merchandise are redundant and oversupplied. Furthermore, this strain has an immensely negative effect on the traders as this takes away from an already narrow revenue stream. Therefore, if the municipality understands and takes seriously that informal trade is "found to be major sources of provisioning for poor households" (Ekurhuleni, Informal Sectoral Plan, 2012, p. 6) then swiftly dealing with the above phenomena will be at the top of their agenda. Unfortunately, it seems at present the municipality has not sufficiently dealt with this or any of the challenges that the Informal Trade Plan made mention of.

After looking at the inadequate responses to the challenges faced by the informal traders in the municipality, it, therefore, seems impossible for the traders to "graduate" from survivalist to formal trader. Firstly, the municipalities' definition of a survivalist entrepreneur is problematic, and maybe the reason why the trader's challenges are not taken seriously or adequately dealt with. According to the Ekurhuleni Informal Street Trading Policy Management Framework, a survivalist entrepreneur is "a trader who can meet his own needs and those of his family by trading." (Ekurhuleni Informal Sectoral Plan, 2012, p. 5). Therefore, according to this definition what makes these traders survivalists is the fact that they do not operate on a profit basis and are not formalized, but the revenues generated sufficiently meet their daily needs. This definition is problematic because it differs from the survivalist entrepreneur definition utilized in this research as it assumes that these traders can meet their basic needs when we have established in the above paragraphs that these revenues are insufficient. Furthermore, the linear graduation approach is not cognizant of the fact that this type of entrepreneurship is due to the "labour markets disadvantages". As mentioned in earlier chapters, 40% of the participant stated that informal

trading was a mere waiting area for them until they could be absorbed into the formal sector. Utilizing a policy that assumes that all the traders are in this sector by choice is problematic as it does not deal with the root problem, which is a lack of adequate formal employment opportunities. However, the strategy utilized by the municipality proves informality critiques right as they argue that such definitions help dissolve any expectation that the “contract between state and society should extend to the poor as they are resourceful” (Amin, 2013, p. 484). If the state assumes that the trader’s revenue is sufficient for their daily needs, there is no need for the state to be expected to assist the traders.

Furthermore, the remaining 50 odd percent who claim that the informal sector was their first option are likely to leave this employment opportunity because of the lack of assistance given to such traders. These traders spoke about many challenges within the formal employment economy, such as nepotism, poor wages, and a lack of employment opportunities, which resulted in them choosing the informal economy. Therefore, unlike the participants in the above paragraph, they would be more accepting of assistance from the municipality that will help them graduate from “a survivalist trader, to an informal trader, to a formal trader by receiving the necessary support and education from the municipality and other spheres of government, as this would mean true sustainable economic growth.” (Ekurhuleni, Informal Sectoral Plan, 2012, p. 6). However, as proven in the above paragraphs the municipality has not given the necessary support and training that it is required for the traders to move along the linear line from survivalist informal traders to formal profitable traders. Therefore, illustrating that the municipality does not take seriously the development of these traders from being non-productive entities into profitable entities that create employment opportunities that decrease the high unemployment rates in the country.

Following the above, government interventions need not only focus on the traders but focus the same attention on the private sector. The formation of the informal sector is the direct result of the unstable and incoherent formal sector, which has resulted in high levels of urban unemployment. Furthermore, the research has established that a vast majority of the participants see the informal sector as a waiting area and ultimately want to work in the formal sector. It is therefore essential that both national and municipal policies deal with the elephant in the room, in this case, the formal sector which is an integral part of the problem. Therefore, in addition to assisting with the graduation of profitable informal enterprises, the state ought to adequately deal with “fading of labour laws and the splintering of social legislation” (Wacquant, 2008, p. 235) and other imperfections in the formal economy which result in high levels of unemployment. Therefore, state interventions ought to cater to all the needs of the individuals of the informal sector, both those who genuinely want to grow their enterprises and those who want employment in the formal sector.

7.4: Ekurhuleni Community Enterprise Development Fund

Since the 1st of November 2019, the city of Ekurhuleni approved the implementation of an enterprise development fund. This recent initiative by the municipality illustrates the cities commitment towards the development of small and informal businesses. The fund was established “to support the development of community enterprises in the form of individual entrepreneurs, small, micro and medium enterprises, cooperatives, informal traders and formal businesses as prescribed” (Ekurhuleni Community Enterprise Development Fund, 2019). Therefore, the fund is aimed at developing the township economy, industrialization, and human development in the municipality. Unfortunately, because the fund is relatively new the research could not establish how helpful the fund is towards the informal trader in the Natalspruit market area. However, if applied, this non-financial initiative would be of great assistance for the traders

as it will link them with entities and initiatives such as the Entrepreneurship Pitching Boosters Development Finance Institution, that will provide the trader or business with funding ranging from R100 000 to 3 million (Ekurhuleni Community Enterprise Development Fund, 2019). Therefore, only time will tell, if like the eThekweni fund street traders will be excluded from such initiatives or this will be an inclusive initiative. It is, however, important to note that such a fund illustrates the cities recognition of informal street trading as an integral part of the urban making of the city that should be developed (Informal Trade Sectoral Plan, 2012).

7.5: Informal Trader Organization in the Ntalspruit

As mentioned in earlier paragraphs the country has a substantial amount of non-state organizations aimed to represent the trader's needs to the local councils. Thutukani is one such representative who is popularly known for representing the traders of Ntalspruit “frustrations with the local council” (Wits Business School, 2009, p.19) with issues such as promised assistance with shelters. This association solely deals with the developmental issues of traders and fortunately does not have to deal with hostile law enforcement officials. This is the case because the municipality understands that the “relationships between government (especially law enforcement officials) and informal traders are generally strained.” because the agents are antagonistic towards the informal traders (Informal Trade Sectoral Plane, 2012, p. 6). With the missing element of police hostility and litigation cases against the state, the association seems to be failing in its only mandate to represent the trader's development challenges to the municipality. The research concludes the above as none of the participants referred to any association or any assistance from an association regarding the many development issues they spoke to. During the fieldwork, the participants stated that they received their stands because they as individuals went to the municipality's offices to apply for the stands. Furthermore, with regards to the criminal elements that troubled the traders MaNxumalo and Sanele spoke about

the traders coming together to curb the surge of criminal violence, there was no reference of any assistance from an association. It, therefore, seems that the presence of this association in the Ntshongwen trading area is not felt by any of the traders. Therefore, making such an association redundant as it seems to be incapable of dealing with the development issues that their associations are meant to be assisting with. It is, however, important to note that the research did not interview all the traders in the market and therefore cannot completely assume that the association has failed in its mandate.

7.6: Conclusion

The above chapter analyzed the collected data on the views which the street traders hold about the municipalities and its policies and whether the traders have adequate representation. It did the above by comparing the municipality's policies and national policy and sentiments, illustrating that municipalities policies are in line with national policies and are not antagonistic. It then established that although the municipality's informal policies are in line with some of the needs of the traders, there is a lack of implementation of the policies in reality. Furthermore, the interventions are solely orientated or focused towards the informal sector, and not adequately dealing with the formal sectors shortcomings. It further illustrated that national and municipal policy which advocate for the development of this sector based on arguments that individuals enter by choice and run profitable enterprises were incorrect. Therefore, illustrating the fragile relations between the municipality and the street traders. Lastly, this chapter established that the traders do not have adequate representation or assistance, from the state or non-state entities. Therefore, illustrating that the traders in the Ntshongwen market are an isolated and self-sufficient community with little to no assistance from the state and non-state entities.

Chapter 8: Summary and Conclusion

8.1: Introduction

This chapter will provide a summary of the findings articulated in the body of this research. It will do the above by outlining the answers given for the main question; “what perceptions do survivalist entrepreneurs in Natalspruit have about state policies in Ekurhuleni?” and sub-questions, illustrating the fragile relationship between the two entities. This will be further illustrated by showing how successful urban marginalization as a theory is in explaining and why the survivalist traders hold somewhat negative perceptions of the state. And how this theory proves the paper's hypothesis which argued that state policies do not adequately assist the poor urban. Lastly, based on the research findings, this section will discuss other topics that could be researched as a consequence of this research

8.2: Urban marginalization

The theoretical framework, urban marginalization, helped to explain why the survivalist traders may have a difficult relationship with the policies of the state regarding their economic activities. Three of the arguments from this theory were utilized to explain survivalist traders’ relations; firstly, the global phenomena of urbanization that has resulted in disinvestment and underdevelopment of areas of the poor urban areas. This point was further reiterated by the theory on South Africa’s spatial planning and how areas in parts of the margins of urban spaces receive little attention. Secondly, how the disinvestment and lack of assistance towards particular parts of urban spaces, the dualization of citizenship, takes place because of the state's bias towards firms and the upper class of its society. This then results in state policies that promote self-help strategies that relinquish them their social contract with the poor in the urban spaces, what Wacquant dubbed as the state's punitive measures towards the poor. Lastly, this theory

spoke to the contraction of the supply of formal employment for the poor, which therefore pushes the poor to take part in survivalist activities in the informal economy. Helping to explain why highly unprofitable informal businesses continue in poor urban margins such as the one in Katlehong. Therefore, urban marginalization as a theoretical lens at large successfully explained the occurrence of survivalist activities in urban poor margins.

8.3: Empirical data

There were some recurring themes from the data collected from the interviews with the street traders in the Natalspruit informal market. Firstly, the data illustrated that the trader's activities were survivalist and that the traders were in the sector because of circumstance and not by choice. Although all of the traders consider themselves as entrepreneurs, a vast majority of the participants stated they would leave the informal sector for the formal employment sector. Many common issues were stated for the traders wanting to leave the sector, mainly limited revenues due to the precarious nature of the informal sector and because of the lack of assistance from the state entities in alleviating the difficulties faced by the traders. The former common issue, of limited revenue generation, is due to an abundance of homogenous products within the market and the competition from the shopping center. Therefore, even though individuals voiced aspiration to grow their business, this was contradicted by sentiments that voiced the traders wanting to leave the informal sector. However, these contradictory sentiments illustrated that the informal market is the "poor people's waiting area" (Auyero, 2012) for adequate formal employment opportunities to present themselves.

Secondly, the empirical data further established that the relations between the state and informal sectors may not be hostile as it is in some cities, but it is fragile. Fragile as the municipality seems to understand in principle the challenges faced by street traders and have strategies to curb

these challenges but do not to apply these strategies in reality. This leaves the street traders in a predicament as they do not have a strong alternative in terms of an association to assist them in communicating this regard. The empirical data illustrated to a large extent the dissolving of the social contract between the poor (Amin, 2013) as traders are resourceful and should, therefore, assist themselves with limited or no assistance from the state.

However, it is important to note that the empirical data further illustrated that unlike many other municipalities, which have an antagonistic relationship with the traders, Ekurhuleni's informal trade policy illustrates an embrace of this sector. The municipality accepts the National Development Plans' attempt to increase people's capability of choosing between alternatives (Sen, 1999). Such policies, on paper, are an attempt to include informal business as a means to assist with the high unemployment rates. However, in reality, the empirical data illustrated a lack of implementation of these policies, which to a great degree align with the needs of the traders. The lack of tangible assistance further illustrates the state's unwillingness to assist the urban poor, therefore further illustrating the fragile relations between the Ekurhuleni municipality and the traders.

8.4: Limitations of the research and recommendation for future research

As this research utilized a single case study, this could be seen as a significant limitation, as the findings cannot be generalized and assumed to be correct in other case studies. However as mentioned in the methodology, the research utilized a single case study as this ensured a “detailed investigation of individual events, actors, and relationship” (Lipson, 2005). The research aimed to understand the informal market utilizing urban marginality as a lens to understand the urban poor experience. However, as Yin (2009, 15) noted that if a case study is done well, it can expand and generalize theories. Therefore, the research done in the Natalspruit

case study can be extended to other informal markets in other urban poor municipalities, providing comprehensive data of the state responses towards the informal sector. This could, therefore, provide the state with a detailed understanding of survivalist traders, and help develop policies that correlate with the trader's realities.

Furthermore, as mentioned urban marginality results in a significant contraction of the supply of formal employment opportunities towards the urban poor, which pushes poor urbanites into the informal economy. This point is superbly explained by Wacquant in *Urban Outcast*; “The persistent, exclusion from wage labour of a segment of the working class and the correlative growth of the informal economy in declining urban areas” (Wacquant, 2008b, p. 27). Research can be done to study the formal labour supply in urban economies and specifically the contraction of formal employment opportunities and the implications of this phenomenon on the urban poor. As mentioned in the research the scarcity of formal labour has grave implications on the poor and therefore this study could assist in again formulating policies that are pro-urban poor citizens. Therefore, opening the space for urban policies that are inclusive and that are of assistance to all members of urban societies.

8.5: Conclusion

This research has provided a detailed study of survivalist entrepreneurs residing in poor urban peripheries and their relations with the state. It illustrated, how informal activities, such as street trading, in urban poor areas are survivalist activities that do not adequately provide for the urban poor's needs. It further, showed that the state, in the form of Ekurhuleni municipality, though sympathetic to the poor in policies, does not adequately assist the urban poor in the informal sector, illustrating fragile relations between the two entities. It did the above by utilizing urban

marginalization to firstly, showcase the realities of the informal sector in urban poor spaces and secondly, to illustrate how state policies are largely unsympathetic towards the urban poor.

Bibliography

- Alexander, L., George & Bennet, A. (2005). Case studies and theory development in the Social Sciences. Cambridge, MA: MIT Press. Chapter 4-5, 77-108
- Amin, A. (2013). Telescopic urbanism and the poor., *17*(4), 476–492.
<https://doi.org/10.1080/13604813.2013.812350>
- Auyero, J. (2012). Patients of the state: The politics of waiting in Argentina. Duke University Press.
- Baldwin, A. (1975). Mass Removals and Separate Development. *Journal of Southern African Studies*, *1*(2), 215–227.
- Barnes, Thomas. "Marxism and informal labour." *Journal of Australian Political Economy*, *The 70* (2012): 144.
- Bauman, Z. (2004). *Wasted lives: Modernity and its outcasts*. London: Polity Press.
- Bayat, A. 1997. 'Un-civil society: The politics of informal people', *Third World Quarterly* *18*(1): 1997
- Benit-Gbaffou C. (2014). _A Political Landscape of Street Trader Organizations in Inner City Johannesburg Post Operation clean Sweep, CUBES, and the University of the Witwatersrand.
- Bless, C; Higson-Smith, C; Sithole, L. (2013). Fundamentals of social research theories: An African perspective. Juta
- Bollens, Scott A. (1998). Urban planning amidst ethnic conflict: Jerusalem and Johannesburg. *Urban Studies* *35*(4), 729-750
- Bonner, P. (1995). Urbanization on the Rand between the 1930s and 1960s: Its Social Character and Political Consequences', *Journal of Southern African Studies*, Vol. 21, No. 1

- Bromley, R. (1990). A New Path to Development? The Significance and Impact of Hernando De Soto's Ideas on Underdevelopment, Production and Reproduction. *Economic Geography*, Vol 66, No. 4, 328-348
- Bryceson, D. (2006). *Fragile cities: Fundamentals of urban life in east and southern Africa*
- Cherry, J. (1992) 'The Making of an African Working Class, Port Elizabeth, 1925-1963', M. A. dissertation, University of Cape Town
- Cardoso, F and Faletto, E. (1979). *Dependency and Development in Latin America*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Choto, P., Tengeh, R., & Iwu, C. (2014). Daring to survive or grow? *Environmental Economics*, 5(4), 93–101.
- Constitution of the Republic of South Africa. (1996). ISBN 978-0-621-39063-6.
<https://www.justice.gov.za/legislation/constitution/SACConstitution-web-eng.pdf>
- Davis, R. (2004). *Dualism in South Africa's Economy*. Institute for African Alternatives.
<https://ifaaza.org/2018/06/05/dualism-in-south-africas-economy/>
- Davis, R., & Thurlow, J. (2009). Formal-informal economy linkages and unemployment in South Africa. *International Food Policy Research Institute*, 1–32.
- Debrah, Y. A. (2007). Promoting the informal sector as a source of gainful employment in developing countries: insights from Ghana. *The International Journal of Human Resource Management*, 18(6), 1063–1084. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09585190701321716>
- De Soto, H. (2000). *The Mystery of Capital: Why Capitalism Triumphs in the West and Fails Everywhere Else*. New York: Basic Books
- Dugmore, C. “Model Locations and Ghettos: The Construction of Racialised Space in Krugersdorp, 1887-1923”, Chapter 6 of the *Making of Krugersdorp, 1887-1923*, Ph.D. Thesis (University of the Witwatersrand, 2006).
- Ekurhuleni Metropolitan Municipality. (2016). *Regional spatial development framework region A: Informal trade sectoral plan*, Draft 3

Ekurhuleni Metropolitan Municipality. (2019). Ekurhuleni Community Enterprise Development Fund.

Fernandes, E. (2002). The Influence of de Soto's "The Mystery of Capital". Lincoln Institute of Land Policy. <https://www.lincolnst.edu/publications/articles/influence-sotos-mystery-capital>

Gentles, S. J., Charles, C., Ploeg, J., & McKibbin, K. (2015). Sampling in Qualitative Research: Insights from an Overview of the Methods Literature. *The Qualitative Report*, 20(11), 1772–1789.

Gerry, C. (1987). Developing Economies and the Informal Sector in Historical Perspective. *The Informal Economy*: 493, 100-119.

Gous, N. (2018). Herman Mashaba apologizes for a post on citizen's arrest of cow heads trader.

Goffman, E. (1961). *Asylums: Essays on the social situation of mental patients and other inmates*. New York: Anchor Books.

Ferguson, J. (2007). Formalities of poverty: Thinking about social assistance in Neoliberal South Africa. *African Studies Review*. 50:2, 71-86

Friedrich, R. (2017). *The Virtual Team Maturity Model*. Springer

Fishers, G. (2011). Which type of entrepreneur are you? Expert Hub: <https://www.experthub.info/business/growing-a-business/performance-and-growth/which-type-of-entrepreneur-are-you/>

Hart, K. (1973). Informal income opportunities and urban employment in Ghana. *Journal of Modern African Studies*, 11, 61–89.

Harvey, D. (2012). The right to the city. <https://davidharvey.org/media/righttothecity.pdf>

Head, T. (2018). Inequality has increased in South Africa since apartheid” – World Bank. <https://www.thesouthafrican.com/news/inequality-increase-apartheid-south-africa/>

Holston, J. (2009). Insurgent Citizenship in an Era of Global Urban Peripheries: Insurgent Citizenship in an Era of Global Urban Peripheries. *City & Society*, 21(2), 245–267. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1548-744X.2009.01024.x>

Horrell, M. (1978). *Laws Affecting Race Relations in South Africa: 1948-76*. Johannesburg: South African Institute of Race Relations.

Jesselyn, M. (2006). *Fresh perspectives: Entrepreneurship*. South Africa: Pearson's.

Lamont, C. (2015). *Research methods in international relations*. Sage.

Lee, I & Hwang, S. (2018). Urban Entertainment Center (UEC) as a Redevelopment Strategy for Large-Scale Post-Industrial Sites in Seoul: Between Public Policy and Privatization of Planning. *Sustainability*. 10. 3535. 10.3390/su10103535.

Lewis, W. A. (1963). Economic Development with Unlimited Supplies of Labour. in A N Agarwala & SP Singh, eds., *The Economics of Underdevelopment*, New Delhi: Oxford Press, 400-449

Lipson, C (2005). *How to write a BA Thesis: A practical guide from your first ideas to your finished paper*. Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press

May 21, 2019, from Times LIVE website: <https://www.timeslive.co.za/news/south-africa/2018-11-14-herman-mashaba-apologises-for-post-on-citizens-arrest-of-cow-heads-trader/>

Maylam, P. (1995) Explaining the Apartheid City', *Journal of Southern African Studies*, vol.21, no. 1

Miraftab, F. 2007. "Governing Post-apartheid Spatiality: Implementing City Improvement Districts in Cape Town." *Antipode: Radical Journal of Geography* 39(4): 602-626

Mbembe, A. (2004). The Aesthetics of Superfluity. *Public Culture*. 16. 373-405.

National Planning Commission. (2012). *National Development Plan: Vision 2030*.

NMW-RI-Descriptive-Statistics-Final.pdf. (2015). Retrieved from <http://nationalminimumwage.co.za/wp-content/uploads/2015/09/NMW-RI-Descriptive-Statistics-Final.pdf>

Policies to reduce informal employment: An international survey. (2011, April). The World Bank.

- Portes, A. (1983). The Informal Sector: Definition, Controversy, and Relation to National Development. *Review* (Fernand Braudel Center), 7(1), 151–174. Retrieved from <https://www.jstor.org/stable/40240956>
- Potts, D. (2007). The state and the informal in Sub-Saharan African urban economies: revisiting debates on dualism. 29.
- Punch, K. F. (2013). *Introduction to Social Research: Quantitative and Qualitative Approaches*. SAGE Publications.
- Ranyane, K. (2015). Survivalist Entrepreneurship: An income-generating alternative for the unemployed populace. *Mediterranean Journal of Social Science*, 6(4) 301-306
- Rogerson, C. (1996). Urban poverty and the informal economy in South Africa's heartlands. *Environment and Urbanization*, 8, 167–179.
- Rogerson, C M. (1999). Emerging from apartheid shadow: South Africa's informal economy. *Journal of International Affairs*. 53: 4, 673-695
- Roy, A. (2017). *Cidades faveledas: Repensando o urbanismo subalterno* 1–16.
- Sapire, H. (1990). *African Urbanisation and Struggles against municipal control in Brakpan 1920 – 1958*. Ph.D. University of the Witwatersrand, 1920 -1958. Chapters 2 and 3.
- SERI, (2011). Criminalizing the livelihoods of the poor: The impact of formalizing informal trading on female and migrant traders in Durban. 1-60
- SERI, (2016). *Edged out: Spatial mismatch and spatial injustice in South Africa's main urban areas*. 1-88
- SERI, SELGA. (2018). *towards recommendations on the regulation of informal trade at local government level: A discussion document*. 1-36
- Simone, A. (2004). *For the city yet to come*. Duke University Press.
- Simone, A. (2010). A Town on Its Knees? *Theory, Culture & Society*, 27(7–8), 130–154. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0263276410383708>

- Simone, A. (2004). *People as Infrastructure: Intersecting Fragments in Johannesburg*. Public Culture, 23.
- Skinner, C. (2016). Informal sector employment: Policy reflections. WIEGO. 1-22
- Smith, D. M. (1992). *The apartheid city and beyond: Urbanization and social change in South Africa*. Routledge.
- Gehlawat, A. (Ed.). (2013). *The "Slumdog" Phenomenon: A Critical Anthology*. LONDON; NEW YORK; DELHI: Anthem Press. Retrieved from <http://www.jstor.org/stable/j.ctt1gxpc01>
- Smit, R. (2015). The impact of labor migration in Africa families in South Africa: Yesterday and Today. University of Toronto Press, 32, 533–548.
- Sinclair-Smith, Ken & Turok, Ivan. (2012). The changing spatial economy of cities: An exploratory analysis of Cape Town. *Development Southern Africa - DEV SOUTH AFR*. 29. 391-417. 10.1080/0376835X.2012.706037.
- Swanson, K. (2007). Revanchist Urbanism Heads South: The Regulation of Indigenous Beggars and Street Vendors in Ecuador. *Antipode*. 39. 708 - 728. 10.1111/j.1467-8330.2007.00548. x.
- Wacquant, L. (2008). The Militarization of Urban Marginality: Lessons from the Brazilian Metropolis. *International Political Sociology*, 2(1), 56–74. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1749-5687.2008.00037.x>
- Wits Business School (2009). *The informal economy and its development: The case of the Natalspruit trading area, Ekurhuleni*. Wits Business School
- Xhakaza, N. (2019). Ekurhuleni budget speech, City of Ekurhuleni. <https://www.ekurhuleni.gov.za/media-relations/budget-2019.html>
- Yamada, G. (1996). Urban informal employment and self-employment in developing countries: Theory and evidence. *Economic Development and Cultural Change*, Vol. 44, No. 2. 289-314. The University of Chicago Press

Appendices

Appendix 1: Traders interview questions

- 1) Do you live in the township of Natalspruit?
- 2) Please tell me in detail what your job entails?
- 3) Was this your first choice of employment?
- 4) Is the income that you make from this occupation sufficient/enough for you and your family's needs?
- 5) What future plans, if any, do you have for your business?
- 6) Please let me know of any assistance that your business gets from the government.
- 7) What can the government do to assist you and your business?
- 8) Would you consider yourself to be an entrepreneur?
- 9) If you had the option to work in the formal employment sector would you leave this occupation?
- 10) Do you think that it is easy to find different employment opportunities in Natalspruit?

Appendix 2: Participation sheet

Participant Information Sheet

Dear Sir / Madam,

My name is Zandile Gqoboza and I am a master's student in the development studies department at the University of the Witwatersrand in Johannesburg. As part of my studies, I have to undertake a research project, and I am investigating survivalist entrepreneurs in urban peripheries. The aim of this research project is to find out whether the state understands the needs of survivalist entrepreneurs/informal traders (Street vendors and salon owners), by looking at the Ekurhuleni municipality policies towards individuals who are in the informal sector. So essentially trying to establish why informality occurs in the urban peripheries, and to establish if state policy deals with issues accordingly.

As part of this project, I would like to invite you to take part in an interview. This activity will involve me as the researcher asking you 14 questions, which will take around 60 minutes maximum. With your permission, I would also like to record the interview using a digital device, as this will ensure that I record all the information that you give to me during the interview.

You will not receive any direct benefits from participating in this research, and there are no disadvantages or penalties for not participating. You may withdraw at any time or not answer any question if you do not want to. The interview will be completely confidential as the information you give to me will be held securely and not disclosed to anyone else. The research cannot guarantee anonymity but if you wish that the research does not disclose your name the research will use a pseudonym (false name) to represent your participation in my final research report. If you experience any distress or discomfort at any point in this process, we will stop the interview or resume another time.

If you have any questions during or afterwards about this research, feel free to contact me on the details listed below. This study will be written up as a research report which will be available online through the university library website. If you wish to receive a summary of this report, I will be happy to send it to you. If you have any concerns or complaints regarding the ethical procedures of this study, you are welcome to contact my supervisor on Obvious.Katsaura@wits.ac.za

Yours sincerely,

Zandile Samantha Gqoboza

Zandile Gqoboza, Gqobozazandile@gmail.com

Obvious Katsaura, Obvious.Katsaura@wits.ac.za

Appendix 3: Traders consent form

Consent Form

The states responses to urban informality in Ekurhuleni
Zandile Samantha Gqoboza

I,, agree to participate in this research project. The research has been explained to me and I understand what my participation will involve. Please circle the relevant options below.

I agree that my participation will remain anonymous YES NO

I agree that the researcher may use anonymous quotes
In his / her research report YES NO

I agree that the interview may be audio recorded YES NO

I agree that the information I provide may be used YES NO
anonymously by other researchers following this project

..... (signature)

..... (name of participant)

..... (date)

Appendix 4: University of the Witwatersrand Ethics Certificate



SOSS Human Research Ethics Committee

Clearance Certificate

Protocol Number: DVS20190106
Project Title: The State's Responses to Urban Marginality in Natalspruit
Investigator's Name: Gqoboza, Zandile Samantha (942841)
Department: Development Studies
Date Reviewed: August 2019
Decision of Committee: Approved / Unconditionally
Expiry Date: July 2021
Date:

Head of School

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "A. Mucha Musemwa", written over a horizontal line.

Professor Mucha Musemwa

CC supervisor: Obvious Katsaura

Declaration of Investigator

To be completed in duplicate and one copy to be returned to Ms. Sarah Mfupa in the School of Social Sciences, Room 152, 1st Floor, Robert Sobukwe Block.

I fully understand the conditions under which I am authorised to carry out the abovementioned research and I guarantee to ensure compliance with these conditions. If any departure from the research procedure as approved, I undertake to resubmit the protocol to the committee.

A handwritten signature in black ink, written over a horizontal line.

Student Signature

19/08/2019

Date