

https://dspace.org/

From enclosed domestic labour to training centers: challenges of the union and the NGOs in organizing paid child domestic workers in Tanzania

Kapinga, Silpha

2009-07-03T11:01:00Z
http://hdl.handle.net/10539/7066

Downloaded from a DSpace repository. https://dspace.org/

FROM ENCLOSED DOMESTIC LABOUR TO TRAINING CENTERS: CHALLENGES OF THE UNION AND THE NGOs IN ORGANIZING PAID CHILD DOMESTIC WORKERS IN TANZANIA

STUDENT NAME: SILPHA KAPINGA

STUDENT NUMBER: 334099

SUPERVISOR: DR. SHIREEN ALLY

A RESEARCH REPORT SUBMITTED TO THE FACULTY OF HUMANITIES OF THE UNIVERSITY OF THE WITWATERSRAND, JOHANNESBURG, IN PARTIAL FULFILMENT FOR THE DEGREE OF MASTER OF ARTS IN LABOUR AND DEVELOPMENT

DECEMBER 2008

DECLARATION

I declare that except for reference to other people's works, which have been duly acknowledged, this report is my own unaided work. It is being submitted in partial fulfilment for the award of Master of Arts in Labour and Development at the University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg, South Africa. This report has not been submitted before any degree or examination in any other University.

_____

Silpha Kapinga

December 2008

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

This work is a product of collective efforts, dedication and support of many individuals and institutions. Since it will not be easy to mention everybody by their names, let me collectively express my sincere thanks to them all for their enormous contribution and support. I would like to assure them that I greatly honor value and treasure their quality contributions and lessons I learnt from them all.

In a very special way I would like to thank my supervisor Dr. Shireen Ally for her valuable guidance throughout the preparation of this work. Her comments, advice, criticisms were very valuable and have contributed immensely in improving the content, form and shape of this work. Despite her busy work schedules she always found time to read and comment on my work.

Many thanks to the Global Labour University for granting me the Scholarship to do my M.A studies in Labour and development. Indirectly I would also like to thank different donors who contributed to the scholarship basket.

This study enjoyed greater cooperation and support from individual staffs of various government organizations, development partner's agencies and civil society organizations, many thanks to them all for their valuable comments and answers to my interviews. Here I would like to mention the Trade Union Congress of Tanzania (TUCTA), CHODAWU, KIWOHEDE, ILO - Tanzania office, Ministry of Work,

I would like to end up by giving very special thanks to my beloved husband, Geoffrey Mulisa for his constant moral and psychological support to me during the course of my study.

DEDICATION

This Report is dedicated to my parents, Mr. Silas Kapinga (the late) and Mrs. Kalista Kapinga whose contribution made me successfully complete my primary, secondary, undergraduate, and post graduate (M.A) education. To my dear father, although you did not live to see my completion of this study, the advice you always gave me, and the training and discipline you taught me already had laid the foundation for doing and completing this work.

To my husband Geoffrey Mulisa for his dedicated support to my family all the time I was away for studying.

ABSTRACT

The challenges surrounding organizing of paid child domestic workers have been relatively under-explored. This study is about the strategies and challenges of the union (CHODAWU) and the NGO (KIWOHEDE) in organizing paid child domestic workers in Tanzania. The study attempts to analyse the institution of paid domestic work, in particular paid child domestic work.

In many countries, domestic service has been predominantly done by adult domestic workers, quite often foreign immigrants or intra-imigrants from rural areas to urban centers. In Tanzania the situation is quite different. The dominant work force in domestic service are children often with very low or basic primary education, a majority of whom come from poor rural families. Experience has shown that organizing of such child domestics is challenging. The trade union (CHODAWU) and the NGO (KIWOHEDE) have tried to organize paid child domestics without any tangible progress. This study attempted to assess the roles and strategies that the NGOs and unions use in organising paid child domestic workers. It also examines the different challenges facing both the NGOs and the unions in organising paid child domestics. The field interviews were conducted with the Union 2008 in Dar es Salaam city, the capital city of Tanzania.

In terms of the research methodology, the study used both primary and secondary sources of data collection. The field research was conducted to the officials of the two selected organisations KIWOHEDE (NGO) and CHODAWU (local union) in Dar es salaam city.

Among other things the study found that despite their differences in structures, composition, goals and roles, both the union and the NGO use similar strategies in organising paid child

domestic workers. i.e they use provision of vocational skills and training as the means to reach and interact with the domestic workers.

It was also found that there is no clear and unified legal position on the definition of a child domestic worker as well as on the employment status of the same. This legal ambiguity creates one of the more potent challenges for organising.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
Certification …….....	ii
Declaration and Copyright …….....	iii
Acknowledgement ……	iv
Dedication ……..	vi
Abstract	vii
Table of Contents …….....	viii

CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND

TO THE RESEARCH PROBLEM **1**

1.1 Background to the Problem .....……..... 1

1.2 Statement of the Problem……..... 6

CHAPTER TWO: LITERATURE REVIEW **7**

2.1 Introduction 7

2.2 Working Conditions of Child Domestics 15

2.2 Union Vs Association Model 24

CHAPTER THREE: RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

AND TECHNIQUES **27**

3.1 Introduction 27

3.2 Sampling……..... 27

3.3 In-depth Interviews…….. 29

3.4 Documentary Review……... 31

3.5 Data Collection and analysis ……..... 31

3.6 Challenges and Ethics 32

CHAPTER FOUR: FINDINGS AND ANALYSIS

4.1 The Conservation, Hotels, Domestic and

Allied Workers Union (CHODAWU)…… 34

4.2 Kiota Women Health and Development

Organization (KIWOHEDE) ……..... 35

4.3 Characteristics of a Child Domestic Worker in Tanzania..... 37

4.4 Challenges of union and NGO in Organizing

Child domestic Workers in Tanzania..... 41

4.5 Roles of union and NGO in Organizing

Child domestic Workers in Tanzania..... 49

4.6 Strategies in Organizing Child domestic

Workers in Tanzania..... 50

CHAPTER FIVE:

CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE STUDY **58**

5.1 Discussion of Findings and

Conclusion of the Study..... 58

5.2 Recommendations of the Study 62

REFERENCES ……..... 64

CHAPTER ONE

INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND TO THE RESEARCH PROBLEM

1.1 Background to the Research Problem

This study attempts to assess the problem of organizing paid child domestic workers in Tanzania. It uses a comparative assessment of the roles, strategies and challenges faced by the union and the NGO, CHODAWU and KIWOHEDE respectively.

The problem of paid child domestic workers is characterised by unique features and characteristics which create inherent challenges in organizing paid child domestic workers in general. Hondagneu and Riegos (1997:54) have argued that obstacles to organizing paid domestic workers are built into the job, it is not the workers themselves, but rather the spatial location and the structure of the job, that weaken labour organizing.

Their working in the isolated private workplaces creates even more complexity. There are no shared work sites or spaces where workers can meet during or after work to discuss issues that relate to their work. There are no common employers as is the case with other working sectors. Each child domestic worker comes from a different employer. Their work places are their employer´s private residence and therefore cannot be easily accessed by people from outside.

Paid child domestic labour is one of the most common in Tanzania. It involves the employment of children below the Tanzanian legal employment age of 14 and can lead to physical abuse, psychological torture and social exclusion. Because of their young age, low levels of education, and consequent lack of skills and confidence to bargain during their employment, many paid child domestic workers work under very isolated and exploitative

conditions. Paid child domestic work in Tanzania is mainly done by young girls. The ILO estimates that about 6.5% of children under the age of 15 in Tanzania are engaged in some form of harzaduous work in defferent sectors including domestic work.

Quite often, paid child domestics are overworked and underpaid. Their work includes cooking, sweeping, mopping, washing, ironing, looking after young children and sick people, going to the market, tending to the garden, etc. These girls work up to 18 hours per day, seven days per week and are paid very low wages (about 10 USD) per month if they are fortunate enough to be paid at all. Some of the child domestic workers have also been sexually abused, i.e forced to have sex with the male members of the households in which they work.

In Tanzania, the law prohibits all kinds of child labour less than 14 years old under all circumstances and restricts light work which is not harmful to children of 14-18 years olds. In other words there is a gap between theory and practice, law and reality. However despite the legal prohibition of child labour, in practice the paid child domestic work industry is expanding. According to KIWOHEDE, the NGO dealing with paid child domestic workers in Tanzania, the majority of child domestics are between the ages of 10-15 years but in some cases children of about 7 years have been found working as paid domestic workers.

Different efforts of the stakeholders have predominantly tended to focus on the abolition of child domestic labour and other forms of child labour rather than improvement and organizing of the entire domestic work industry. For instance, the ILO in partnership with trade unions and NGOs (through the ILO-IPEC programme), have been greatly involved in removing children from various forms of harzaduos employment and re-introducing them to schools.

One of the main reasons why this study focussed on organizing of paid child domestics rather than abolition is the observation that despite the efforts to abolish child labour in domestic service, the child domestic service industry has increasingly expanded in the country. And there is no clear evidence that the campaign to abolish paid child domestic labour will reach all the child domestics in different places in Tanzania. The existence of a mixed legal position on (who is a child domestic) the definition and the rights of a child domestic worker creates even more difficulty. Many people have continued to prefer employing child domestics rather than adult domestics because they are 'cheap' and easy to control. Each year there is an increase in number of young girls moving from rural areas to urban areas seeking domestic work employment. In this study therefore I decided to focus on practice (reality) i.e the huge unorganised paid child domestic service industry.

Another reason for focusing on organizing is based on the fact that unlike in many other countries where domestic service is predominantly undertaken by adult domestic workers (often foreign immigrants) who can easily understand the importance of getting organized and being mobilised. In Tanzania domestic service is largely carried out by child domestics or young girls, usually with no formal education at all or with very basic education (primary school) and often coming from very poor rural families. In this context it is therefore important that paid child domestic workers be organized as they can not organise themselves as is the case with adult domestic workers. In many countries women domestic workers themselves took the initiative and the lead to create networks amongst themselves.

The origin of the South African Domestic Workers Association offers a good example on how adult domestics took the trouble to begin organising themselves. Florence De Villiers´

story *"From Domestic Worker to Head of the Domestic Workers Union*" is a good example. As a domestic worker, De Villiers decided to mobilise her fellow domestic workers and successfully they managed to launch the National Domestic Workers Union in Cape Town in November 1986. It's quite obvious that such kind of bravery and courage is rare in child domestic workers.

Another factor that creates the necessity to consider organizing of paid child domestic workers is the relative freedom of movement and association that paid child domestic workers get in Tanzania. Child domestics are almost completely denied freedom to move outside the employer´s house or freedom to associate. In many cases this denial is implicit and not explicit. For instance the employer would ensure that the child domestic is fully occupied with work to the extent that she can not have spare time to do other things. This is even worse when the law does not guarantee any protection to such young workers.

As Adelle Blackett (ILO 2000) notes, despite different initiatives at the international level to deal with the question of child domestic workers, there isn't yet a specific convention on domestic workers. To date, no international instrument is devoted to prescribing labour standards that exclusively apply to domestic workers.

Evidence from the literature suggests that there have been very little attempts, if any, by both trade unions and NGOs to organize child domestic workers in Tanzania. Both the NGO and union have been involved in various activities for child domestic workers, but without any success in organizing.

The problem of organizing paid child domestic workers is a complex one. This study attempted to delineate the different challenges that face both the NGOs and trade unions in organizing child domestics. It also assesses their roles and strategies. Among other things, the study found that despite their different structures and composition, both the union and the NGO use similar strategies, i.e they use provision of vocational skills and training as a means to access and interact with the paid child domestics. CHODAWU and KIWOHEDE have established training centers where child domestic workers go regularly for training not only about life skills but also employment rights and other labour issues.

It was further found that due to legal ambiguity on who is a child and what are the child's employment rights and limits, different stakeholders including the union and the NGO always face challenges in organizing paid child domestic workers. On the one hand, there is a strong international drive and support led by the ILO to completely abolish child labour, on the other hand there is an expansion of the child domestic work industry under exploitative conditions. In principle this lack of a unified legal position around child employment creates a problem in traditional organizing. Organizing attempts tend to lack legal legitimacy since most of the workforce in the domestic sector is girl-children below 18 years of age which is the Tanzanian adult minimum employment age.

Depending on the context, evidence from literature show that there are different options for organizing domestic workers in the world. Ally (2005) characterises the landscape of organising as bifurcated and contrasts what she calls the ´union model´ with the ´association model´ of organising. The reasons for the two styles of organising is the shift in workers´ mobilisation from traditional national union organising around class exploitation to non-traditional organisations mobilised around the injustices of migrancy.

These options or variations are based upon two models namely, the union model (sometimes refered to as traditional model) and the association model. The association model involves "a non-union model of representation where migrant, ethinic, women´s human rights, legal advocacy and non-governmental organisations mobilise on a wider range of issues than just employment" (Ally 2005:3). The union model is a traditional way of mobilising workers whereby workers are mobilised and organised on the basis of their worker and/or class identities.

Statement of the Problem

The above background shows that organizing paid child domestic work is characterised by different structural and practical challenges. Because of the private and isolated nature of domestic service itself, organising paid child domestic workers has been viewed by several unions and researchers as almost impossible. In Tanzania, for instance there is no adequate information on any systematic attempt to organise paid child domestics. At a conceptual level there are two options for how organising paid child domestic workers can be approached, that is organising via a union model or 'association model'. The study seeks to attempt to analyze and compare between organizing by the union and the NGO, the non-union model and the opportunities and problems they face in organizing paid child domestic workers in Tanzania. In other words, I seek to bridge the gap between the ideal practice of labour rights activism and the reality of paid child domestic workers in Tanzania.

CHAPTER TWO

LITERATURE REVIEW

> "Paid domestic work is a feature of household all over the world, from Equador to Swaziland, from Spain to the Ivory Coast. In many countries, it probably constitutes the single largest female employment sector (though its invisibility can make this difficult to document). It is work that is predominantly performed by women, and is usually managed by other women. Yet it has received very little attention, either from feminists or from trade unionists, or indeed from political activists in general." (Anderson 2001:25)

2.1 Introduction

Historical literature on different debates on the origin of domestic labour links it with the development of capitalism and the emergence of structures of inequality amongst different classes of society. Cock (1980:9) writes that, " the specific machinations of the domestic labour debate that followed this recognition, (domestic labour as reproductive labour) resulted in various houdini-type gyrations attempting to locate the exact relationship of domestic labour to capitalism".

Hansen (1989) further argues that while this recognition has revolutionalized our understanding of gender inequality by pointing to the importance of women´s domestic work both in the reproduction of capitalism and patriarchy, paid domestic work as an institution has shattered these expectations that all women are equal.

The second level of debate on paid domestic work was inspired by the 1970s wave of feminism which made domestic labour the main focus in understanding women´s oppression. As Hansen (1989:51) writes: " ... in the 1980s a vibrant scholarship emerged

showing that some women were able to displace their gendered burdens for housework on to other women, complicating the idea that housework was the 'common difference of women'. During this period the question of gender inequality was divided between race, ethinicity and class, so that some less privelleged women (by virtue of their race and class locations) accepted their responsibility to do housework and child care.

This kind of inequality has continued to be reflected in the institution of paid domestic work over time, as Hondagneu-Sotelo (2001:14) acknowledges that "[w]ith few exceptions, domestic work has always been reserved for poor women, for immigrant women, and for women of colour."

Historical literature on paid domestic work show that paid domestic was closely tied to the production and reproduction of class especially in Europe. It was for instance predicted that with development of industrialization and modernization, the relations of feudal servitude including domestic work would become obsolete. On the contrary the literature on paid domestic work in the 1980s shows that paid domestic work has been increasingly expanding and transforming because of its relationship to capitalism and globalization.

Both in the North and in the South the numbers of those engaged in paid domestic work has grown rapidly. In some cases like China and India, intra-state migration is predominant. Elsewhere, in the United States, Canada, and Western Europe, as well as in areas such as the Gulf States, Hong Kong, Singapore, Taiwan, and Malaysia, the presence of large numbers of migrant domestic workers from abroad has been striking. It is reported that by the late 1990s there were between 1.3 and 1.5 million Asian women working in Middle East. Whereas in 1970s women formed about 15 percent of the migrant labour force, in the mid 1990s almost 60 percent of Filipino migrant labour force was female and that women

constituted approximately 80 percent of the Sri Lankan and the Indonesian migrant labour force (Gamburd 2000:35).

Globalization and the imagined sense of global community continues to accelerate migration of paid domestic workers as a class with shared inequalities, to countries and places with high wages. Parrenas (2001:11) writes that, “The contemporary outmigration of Filipinas and their entrance into domestic work is a product of globalization; it is patterned under the role of the Philippines as an export-based economy in globalization; and it is embedded in the specific historical phase of global restructuring".

Elsewhere the class inequality in paid domestic work was/is based on racial or ethnic lines, whereby paid domestic workers have faced hard working conditions and exploitation simply on the basis of the colour of their skin. Writing about domestic service in the United States, Rollins argues that “ thus from its beginnings, domestic servitude in this country embodies a kind of contradiction between principles and behaviour that did not exist in seventeeth-or eighteenth-century Europe, a contradiction between the value of egalitarianism and the actual class and caste stratification”. (Rollins 1985:48)

Another peculiar and most degrading aspect of domestic service was the requisite of invisibility. "The ideal servant would be invisible and silent, responsive to demands but deaf to gossip, household chatter, and conflicts, attentive to the needs of the mistress and master but blind to their faults…. Only black could be invisible people in white homes" (Katzman 1978:36).

In South Africa, the inequality in paid domestic worker based on race was predominant during Apartheid. Jacklyn Cock in her seminal study, Maids and Madams (1980) writes that;

> "The situation of black and white women in South Africa presents a challenge to any oversimplified feminist notion of ´sisterhood´. That challenge is sharpest in the institution of domestic service where the wages paid and hours of work exacted by white ´madams´ from their black ´maids´ suggest a measure of oppression of women by women". (Cock 1980: 1)

What is the picture in other African countries? Elsewhere in Africa, the institution of paid domestic work was formally introduced during the colonial period, where the different social classes that had developed needed domestic service. Thus social stratums were developed along racial and ethinic lines. The first class was that of the colonial whites, the second class was the Asians and other colored and the third class was the indigenous black. During colonial period domestic service was done by black African in the homes of the whites or Indians, later on even some elite black household began to employ paid domestic workers. Therefore it's important to note that formal paid domestic service as such was introduced to Africa largely during the colonial period.

Hansen (1992) writes about the experiences of European domesticity in African colonies. "Throughout Europe´s colonial experience, the colonizers tried to bring their notions of domesticity along to new locations. In her epistolary novel written for a fictitious young friend about to join her husband in Africa, Emily Bradley, the wife of a colonial civil servant in Nothern Rhodesia, described a particular form of domesticity by giving advice on household management and servants, children and health, entertainment, and male/female relations". (Hansen 1992:2)

The introduction of European domesticity to Africa during colonial times had impacts on both the indigeneous Africans as they selected and adopted some ways of organizing domestic homes, and the domestic service itself, i.e how to do domestic work. Since this was a new encounter to Africans, many could not do the domestic work as expected by the masters and mistresses. Literature shows that in some parts of colonial Africa, the colonialists introduced domestic science training so as to train African domestic workers. Different missionary schools introduced in their teaching syllabus home craft lessons and these were taught largely to black women (Shivji 1986:20).

Using a case study from Tanga, Janet Bujra in her book "*Serving Class: Masculinity and the Feminisation of Domestic Service in Tanzania*", documents the institution of domestic service and attempts to show how it reproduces class as a set of social relations. Bujra´s study was based on field work carried out in 1986 in Tanga, an industrial town (by then) of over 100,000 people in northern Tanzania and on historical research both in Tanzania (National Archives and personal interviews) and in Britain by way of tracing European excolonial residents of what was then the territory of Tanganyika. (Bujra 2000)

Bujra focused her study on domestic work with a formalized contractual nature and those who worked in highest class level households. It is therefore important to understand Bujra ´s study in its context of time and space. One needs to be careful in analysing the significance of paid domestic work before generalizing to the entire Tanzania. The work offers a beautiful historical insight on the status of paid domestic work during the colonial period, and how domestic workers as a social class related to the other classes.

However I would like to argue that the domestic work situation and context in Tanzania has changed dramatically since 1986 when Bujra did her study. Trade and business have grown in many towns and urban centers. The demand for domestic service has also increased to the extent that almost every ordinary middle class household in Tanzania employs or hire domestic servants. The dominant domestic work force now is largely child girls or young girls and not men as it is reported in Bujra´s work. Quite often these domestics are employed without any formal contract.

During the colonial period the employers of such servants in Tanzania (known as Tanganyika by then) were mainly Asians and Arabs (mostly engaged in commercial activities), and Europeans (colonial officials, settler farmers and estate managers, missionaries, commercial agents). (Bujra 2000)

The debate on the predominance of men in the domestic work force offers less significance to the contemporary understanding and practice of paid domestic work as now the industry is dominated by women and young girls. As we have shown above domestic work is regarded as women´s or girls´ work. Evidence shows that there were different reasons why men got into domestic work during the colonial period in some places in Tanzania. Tanzania ´s colonial economy was largely not a settler economy, there were few places including Tanga, where colonialists established small scale settler plantations, mainly in sisal. This was a period where forced migrant labour was strongly practiced and the preferred labour force was men as women had to stay back caring for the families. The wages for working in the plantations were very low without mentioning the tax that was to be paid. Note that the tax system was introduced so as to force men to work in the plantation so that they get

wages to pay for the tax. Not all men got job in the plantations some men looked for other jobs in these urban areas.

"Men predominate in domestic work for the same reason that they predominate in all other forms of wage labor in Tanzania. The coercive process whereby a wage labour force was constituted in colonial Tanganyika was not gender-neutral. It entailed forced labour, zealous recruitment, and male taxation," argues Shivji (1986:35). Bujra adds that this was also built on the dual need to maintain the rural productive basis for social order while at the same time drawing off exploitable labour (Bujra 2000:260).

In that way some men entered into domestic work, and as Bujra noted that most men who got to work as domestics actually had no prior knowledge of the job, hence they started learning by doing. In Tanzania then, men do not enter employment as servants with ready-made domestic skills, rather the opposite: they have to overcome an aversion to performing what is seen as women´s work. It is important to note that in terms of wages, domestics were earning more than those working in plantantions and other types of jobs. To support this point Bujra writes that, "But in the early colonial days, the supply of houseservants in Tanganyika did not match demand and wages were relatively high compared to other types of work". (Bujra 2000:252)

Bujra´s work attempts to make a historical documentation of the institution of domestic service in Tanzania during the colonial period. Her account clearly points out the historical connection and reasons as to why for instance men became the predominant work force in the domestic service. Historical conditions and context are important factors in trying to understand the origin and development of the institution of domestic service in Tanzania and

elsewhere in the world. The experience shows that the origin and development of domestic work industry varies greately from one country to another due to certain specific and unique conditions prevailing in a particular time and space.

Tanzania got her independence in 1961. The period after independence was characterised by the decline the number of men in the domestic work force and was replaced by the increasing number of women. Today the domestic work force in Tanzania is predominantly made of women including girl children and young women who do mainly the cooking, cleaning, washing and child caring activities. Men, especially boys have remained doing activities such as taking care of cattles, gardening and guarding. This is completely the opposite picture of what happened during the colonial period. Bujra´s findings showed that the colonial Tanzania had little if not none, feminization in domestic service. Today there is a very strong feminization of domestic work in Tanzania whereby all the urban towns employ domestic workers.

The main focus of this study is about organizing paid child domestic workers in Tanzania. So far my discussion has focused on the general literature on paid domestic work. I have explored the debate on the origin and historical development of paid domestic work. The next section will take us into the contemporary discussion and debate on the working conditions and attempts at organizing paid child domestic work in general and later specific to Tanzania.

2.2 The Working Conditions and the Organising of Paid Child Domestics

The International Labour Organization – ILO, defines child domestic work as "domestic work undertaken by children under the legal minimum working age, as well as by children above the legal minimum age but under the age of eighteen, under slavery-like hazardous, or other exploitative conditions – a form of child labour to be eliminated as defined in the international treaties" (ILO – IPEC 2007: 3).

At the global level there are different attempts and initiatives trying to understand systematically the challenges of child domestic work. Before addressing the question on the problem of organising domestic workers, it would be important to reflect on what is known about children working as paid domestics at a global level. Although the picture seems to be incomplete, we are beginning to know much more about child domestic workers around the world, thanks to the work of NGOs and support from international organisations. Maggie Black argues that numbers are elusive, but the practice of employing children as domestics is very wide spread. In Indonesia, over half of a million girls under 18 are estimated to be working in the capital, Jakarta, while "In Brazil, Colombia and Equador, 20% of all girls between ages 10 and 14 work as domestics, and in rural areas the percentage may rise above 30%. In Togo, 95% of all domestics are children aged between 7 and 17. In the Philippines 4% of the country's estimated 766,000 domestic workers are aged between 10 and 14 years old, and 36% between 15 and 19" (Maggie 2002:4).

Although paid domestic work in Tanzania is generally carried out by girls and boys, men and women, existing evidence shows that girl-children form the majority of the domestic

work force in Tanzania. As Nataschal Klo notes, the majority of child domestic workers are girls, and they work under difficult and exploitative conditions:

> "child domestic workers, or 'house girls' are kids who work in other people's houses doing a whole range of domestic chores – cooking, sweeping, mopping, washing, ironing, looking after young children and sick people, going to the market, tending to the garden and even taking care of household livestock. In Tanzania, child domestic work is one of the only types of work open to girls who come from poor rural villages and who don't get the chance to go to secondary school. Because they come from poor families, these girls know that they need to work in order to supplement their parents' income and to help support their younger siblings through primary school" (Klo 2006:3)

The ILO estimates that almost 30% of children between 10 and 14 in Tanzania are economically active. They are employed as domestic servants, in piecework manufacturing and in mining (LO/FTF report 2003:40). The 2000/2001 Integrated Labour Force and Child Labour Survey, (conducted by the National Bureau of Statistics) estimated that 47.8% (about 4.7 million) of all children aged 5 - 17 were engaged in housekeeping activities. However it was noted earlier that not all children who are engaged in housekeeping are child domestic workers. Some of them perform activities considered to be child work in their homes, rather than as child labour (ILO 2006). However a great deal of information from surveys done on domestic labour in Tanzania focus mainly on the child labour dimension of domestic work, because it is so prevalent.

Section 5 of the *Tanzania Employment and Labour Relations Act (1994*) prohibits child labour of under 14-years-old under all circumstances and restricts labour of 14- 18-years-old to light work which is not harmful to the child's health or development or which prevent the child's school attendance. It allows for participation in vocational orientation or training programmes that are approved by the authority concerned. The Section also prohibits labour of under 18-years-old in mines, factories, ships or any worksite, including non-formal

settings or agriculture, where conditions can be considered hazardous for the child. *(Employment and Labour Relations Act, 2004*).

Existing evidence and experience shows that there is a huge domestic work industry in Tanzania which operates under hard and hidden exploitative conditions, and if left unorganised, children will continue to be exploited and abused. "According to the Kinondoni Municipality's Community Development Office report, in Dar es Salaam about 40,000 – 60,000 children who work as domestic workers in Kinondoni District (one of the three districts of Dar es Salaam City) are girls. This roughly makes the estimation of about 200,000 – 250,000 child domestic workers working in Dar es Salaam city alone and 2,040,000 working in the whole country" (KIWOHEDE 2005:1)

Child domestics work in a range of difficult and exploitative conditions across the globe. For instance some of the working conditions reported, show that children work between 10 – 15 hours per day. There is also alarming evidence of physical, mental and sexual abuse of children and adolescents working as domestics.

Klo (2006:3) writes: "Child domestic work in Tanzania is entirely unregulated and because it takes place in people's homes, house girls are at great risk of exploitation and abuse. These girls work up to 18 hours a day, seven days a week and are paid very low wages (about 10 USD per month), if they are fortunate enough to be paid at all……. with some studies even suggesting that as many as 60 % of house girls in Tanzania have been forced to have sex with male members of the households in which they work, some of these girls are locked up, no contact with outside world, not even with their families".

There is alarming evidences of sexual abuse to child domestic workers in different parts of the world. For example, " in Lima, Peru, one study estimated the proportion at 60 per cent. In Fiji, eight out of 10 domestic workers reported that their employers sexually abuse them. In Haiti, *restavèk* girls are sometimes called '*la pou sa*', a Creole term meaning 'there for that'. They are accepted sexual outlets for the men or boys of the household' (UN Commission on Human Rights 2002:65).

In cases where the girls become pregnant they are often thrown out of the house and since the shame of their situation makes it difficult for them to return home, they are forced to care for themselves on the streets. Many families reject these 'spoiled girls' because 'their behaviour' has brought dishonour to the family. In these instances, domestic work typically becomes a precursor of prostitution, as the young girls have few other options available. (ILO 2006). In Bangladesh, for example, a local NGO interviewing children working in commercial sexual exploitation in the capital Dhaka found that all of them had previously worked as child domestic workers and had been sexually abused by the employing family. (Ford 2004)

DeVilliers (1989:176) writes that, "Domestic workers are sexually harassed because some white empoyers think they can do whatever they want with these women because they are black. We know of endless numbers of cases where women are beaten up if they don't give in to their employers, and others are sacked (fired) and made to leave the premises immediately without pay".

Almost without exception, children who are in domestic labour are victims of exploitation. They often leave their own family at a very early age to work in the houses of others and are

considered almost as a ‘possession’ of the household. They are exploited economically, forced to work long hours with no time off and low or no wages. They generally have no social or legal protection. And unfortunately the hazards of domestic service are often underestimated because the problem remains hidden and difficult to measure and analyse. Only solid evidence and recognition of the problem can lead to appropriate policies, legal frameworks and financial support.

Although there are initiatives at the international level to deal with the problem of child domestic workers, there isn’t yet a specific convention on domestic workers. To date, no international instrument is devoted to prescribing labour standards that exclusively apply to domestic workers. However, International Labour Standards in many key areas including the fundamental human rights Conventions on freedom of association, equality rights and forced labour apply to domestic workers (Blackett 2000).

One of the main objectives of this study was to assess the strategies and problems in organizing child domestic workers in Tanzania. Different sources of literature have discussed the 'organizability' of child domestic workers and the possible challenges.
Domestic service workers are an extremely fragmented sector of poor urban women and girls, and they become aware of their work and social conditions only with difficulty. They need organizations that will extend their perspective beyond their individual participation in work and stimulate collective reflection toward consciousness of their rights as workers and as women (Prates 1998).

The quest to organise domestic workers at a regional and global level started long time ago. Some countries have more successfully organised the domestic workers into unions and

associations than others. Van Raaphhorst (1988) documents this early history of domestic worker unionisation in the United States and profiles the formation of domestic worker unions like the American Servant Girls´ Association and the Domestic Worker Industrial Union of the International Workers of the World. Organizing domestic workers and getting the union or association to function are two separate but challenging activities. There are different account on how domestic workers have struggled to organise themselves into union or association. In South Africa where the political economic conditions were even more challenging during Apartheid organizing paid domestic workers was a difficult task. Florence De Villiers in "From *Domestic Worker to Head of the Domestic Workers´ Union",* describe how difficult, were her early attempts to organise domestic workers in South Africa;

> Most people saw organizing domestic workers' union as impossible. But with the help of a friend we opened a small office in central Cape Town. All had was a telephone in the corner on the floor. We started to talk to domestic workers on the streets and in the parks and at the shops". One of the first things that I did was to teach people to read and write. We had meetings at our office on a nightly basis and at weekends. We had meetings in people´s rooms, in church halls, wherever we could talk to people. We encouraged women to get involved to become organized to see themselves as women not as slaves…About seventeen hundred people attended the lauching of the National Domestic Workers Union in Cape Town on 29 – 30 November 1986 (De Villiers 1989:175).

Ally (2008:3), writes "Despite the constraints on unionization imposed by the nature of paid domestic work, domestic workers in South Africa have had a long history of collective organisation, and unionisation. They were among the first members of a new proletariat class to organise, first into criminal gangs such as the *Amalaita* and *Izigebengu* and then

later into unions such as the African domestic Servants League" (Van Onslen, 1982, Hirson 1989, Ally 2008).

In some countries domestic workers unions and associations exist but the domestic law does not allow collective bargaining. Writing about foreign domestic workers in Canada, Abigail Bakan (1997:134) writes that "in seven out of ten provinces, domestic workers have been formally included under collective-bargaining legislation. But despite the legal recognition of the collective bargaining, domestic workers´ unions and association across the country have not been able to use the law to achieve effective collective-bargaining". One example is the Toronto Organisation for Domestic Workers Rights, INTERCEDE, which has represented domestic workers in Toronto since it was established in 1979.

In South Africa, the colour barrier which kept servants in the backyard made it even more difficult for them to succeed in their struggles. The social networks which existed in every suburb, comprising church groups, hometown groups, beer brewing circles and informal leisure activities, afforded servants little opportunity of directly affecting working relations, even when it was possible to intervene by introducing friends to fill a vacancy in a neighbouring house, conditions of employment rested with the employer. (Gordon, 1985)
While the documented history of unionism amongst domestic workers is limited, especially in terms of the geographical and historical scope, it does reveal that far from being resistant to organisation, and especially unionisation, domestic workers have orgnised on the basis of their working status to form unions. (Ally 2005). However history reveals that organising domestic workers is still a challenging problem for many stakeholders.

The organisation of domestic workers has always been difficult. In disputes with employers, the confrontation has always been too individual and too isolated to afford the worker much possibility of success, and it has been difficult to establish a corporate identity cutting across separate households. (Gordon, 1985)

In Canada Bakan and Stasiulis (1997:122) write that, "the long hours and low wages of domestic workers prompted domestic workers to demand changes in their working conditions. As early as 1901, domestics across the country formed associations to overcome their isolation and engaged in collective action".

Paid child domestic workers are not only unorganised but also widely regarded as 'unorganisable' (Ally 2005). There are many explanations as to why paid child domestic workers are regarded as unorganisable. One of the arguments that seems to be supported widely is that there are structural limitations in organising paid child domestic workers, and that these limitations are inherent within the domestic service itself. The fact that child domestic workers work in isolation behind closed doors, make it difficult to organise them and more specifically to unionise them (Ally 2005).

One of the reasons attributed to the difficulty in organising domestic workers include their working in isolation in the private homes of their employers. As Hondagneu-Sotelo and Riegos (1997) argue: "The peculiar exceptionalism of paid domestic work centres on the spatial isolation and atomisation of individual employers, employees, and workplaces".

Their working in isolation creates a sense of invisibility of domestic workers. The domestic worker is not only invisible to many external activists and trade unionists but also invible to

her own employers in the household. Working in isolation can lead to first being invisible, second blurrubg domestic´s consciousness of the self and other domestics, i.e. one becomes ignorant of what is happening with other domestic workers elsewhere, and third this can lead to a sense of resentment amongst domestic workers (Rollins 1985:207).

Class consciousness amongst paid child domestic workers, to form solidarity with fellow child domestic workers, is often obstructed by the employer's ideologies which view worker as 'one of the family' and social ideologies that refuse to recognise child domestic workers as "workers". Eventually this leads to child domestic workers seeing themselves as not 'real workers' like other workers, hence difficulty in organising themselves (Bujra, 2000).

Conclusions from various studies on the relationship between organized labour and domestic workers unions from different parts of the world share one common assumption that much is still needed in terms of a collective response to the problem of organizing domestic workers. In Great Britain, it is argued that paid domestic work "has received very little attention.... from trade unionists" (Anderson 2001). In Bolivia, Gill (1994) argues that the "Bolivian labour movement and traditional political parties have ignored domestic workers". And in South Africa, where the Congress of South African Trade Unions (COSATU) has actually been highlighted as an exemplary union federation regarding the support for domestic workers" (ILO, 2004)., domestics had to make the following impassioned plea just not to be abandoned by the federation:

> "COSATU.... now we are in the dumps and you just leave us like that. You talk about how you are the umbrella and you give us all a shelter. But how come you don't give the domestic worker a shelter?....You don't know what a struggle we have got in the backyards... We can not (survive) without a union that knows our struggle." (South African Domestic Service and Allied Workers Union Pamphlet 1996)

For the case of Tanzania where there are largely live-in domestics, self initiative among domestics to organise themselves becomes even more challenging as they lack a common platform to interact and articulate their concerns. On the other hand the presumed traditional role of trade unions to organise and protect domestic workers is challenged by legal and social obstacles in accessing these domestics. Unlike in many other types of work where workers meet and interact with each other in their work place and agree to form some coordination for a common good. The situation with domestic workers is different, workers are separated as they live and work individually behind closed doors and back yards, some times not allowed to get out of the house or yard. Hence it becomes difficult for them to be coordinated or coordinate among themselves.

As Lee Siew Hwa, from the Committee for Asian Women, from Bangkok puts it: ”There are situations where it is very difficult for domestic workers to form or join trade unions. Where there is union-busting or political suppression, workers are scared and tend to form self-help associations or cooperatives rather than unions. We need to accept that informal workers cannot always join unions" (IUF 2007:12).

2.3 Union Vs Association Model

Analysis of contemporary domestic worker organizing shows that there is an increase in efforts and struggles to organize domestic workers. There are different views and approaches on the styles for organising domestic workers. One claims that different efforts to organising are characterised by two major representations namely, 'the association model' which involves non-union based migrant women, and 'the union model' which aims at overcoming organised labour´s historical failure to represent domestic workers (Ally 2005).

The union model assumes that workers mobilise themselves on the basis of their work identity. A class consciousness is built on shared work identity. The association model assumes that domestic workers mobilise themselves on the basis of a wider range of shared injustices.

As mentioned above there are a range of factors and issues that determine and drive mobilisation of domestic workers into associations rather than unions. For instance in the United States, the Domestic Workers Association of CHIRLA (Coalition for Humane Immigrant Rights in Los Angeles) is one of the successful examples of domestic workers organisation where mobilisation is based on the strength of workers' connections around gender, on "women's relational identities and group orientations" (Hondagneu-Sotelo and Riegos 1997:71)

In Canada the mobilising issues were mainly on immigration and citizenship as on much as traditional work place-related matters (Ally 2005).

In other places NGOs have been predominant in organizing domestic workers through associations. For instance in Asia and the Middle East, non-governmental organizations (NGOs) have become the main organizers of domestics, rather than unions. Juredini (2002) argues that, in Lebanon domestic worker organizing is dominated by NGO's that have organized primarily based on migrant identities and advocate on workplace-related issues in tandem with more broad-based relating to immigrant rights.

There are mixed views on the legitimacy of non-union forms of labour orgnizing. On the hand there are scholars and activists who support non-union model of labour ogarnising, on

the assumption that NGOs can best fill the domestic workers' representation gap for domestic workers which the union finds difficult to address.

Hondagneu-Sotelo and Riegos (1997:75) for example argue that “neither traditional union organising nor service provider models can accomplish the upgrading of the occupation”. Others do not privilege either form of labour organising, arguing that both union and non-union based forms expand the availability of representation of these vulnerable workers. For Ford (2004: 105) the debate is important given that "the empirical evidence about the extent and depth of non-union labour organising is occurring around issues concerning foreign domestic labour”.

The literature on domestic work in Tanzania does not offer enough evidence on unionising or organising domestic workers neither by association nor by union. There are countries that have been successful in organising domestic workers, however it’s important to emphasize that one of the arguments for labor unionizing is that domestic service contain some inherent structural and legal obstacles towards unionising. Depending on the existing regulations and nature of domestic workers themselves, some societies have been successful in organising through associations while others have adopted the union model. This argument is supported by an assumption that the association model is a transitory stage towards the formation of a union.

CHAPTER THREE

RESEARCH METHODOLOGY AND TECHNIQUES

3.1 Introduction

The research question of this study is “What are the differences in the strategies of the union (CHODAWU) and the NGO (KIWOHEDE) for organizing paid child domestic workers in Tanzania?". The study aimed at comparing the union’s and the NGO’s strategies and experiences in organizing child domestic workers.

3.2 Study Site and Sampling

The study was conducted around organizing the paid child domestic service industry in Tanzania. Tanzania has 25 regions and Dar es Salaam region was selected as the case study. Dar es Salaam is the capital city of Tanzania. The main objective of this study was to attempt to give a comparative assessment on the problems and challenges faced by the NGOs and the local labour union in organizing paid child domestic workers. Two organizations were sampled, the NGO (KIWOHEDE) and the local trade union (CHODAWU). Both organisations deal with child domestic labour issues. It was useful to use purposive sampling because in Tanzania there are few NGOs that deals with child domestic labour and there is only one local trade union which is mandated to deal with child domestic workers-related issues. The union is affiliated to the Trade Union Congress of Tanzania (TUCTA). The two organisations that were studied were, Conservation Hotels, Domestic and Allied Workers Union- CHODAWU and KIWOHEDE (NGO) also dealing with child domestic workers' issues. .

A total of 20 officials were interviewed from the two organisations, CHODAWU (local union dealing with domestic workers) and KIWOHEDE (NGO), of which 5 participants

were *office officials* and 5 were *field officials*[1] from the NGO and the Union respectively. This study used purposive sampling to select the 20 officials. The office-field categorization was used because the office-officers are mainly concerned with the leadership and planning attempts to organize or assist domestic workers while the field-officers deal with day-to-day activities and concerns of child domestic workers and the centres. Below is a brief description of the two selected organisations.

3.2.1 CHODAWU (Local Union)

The Conservation, Hotels, Domestic and Allied Workers Union (CHODAWU) is a trade union affiliated to the Trade Union Congress of Tanzania (TUCTA). CHODAWU was established in 1995 and registered on 15 September 2000 in accordance with the Trade Union Act of 1998. The union aims at improving conditions of domestic workers in the country. Through the support from ILO - IPEC programme the union has been actively involved in abolition of child labour**.** In this IPEC programme, ILO in partnership with CHODAWU and other NGOs in Tanzania jointly design programmes to study the status of child labour in different districts and thereby come up with a common strategy to remove children employed in difficult conditions and re-introduce them into schools or training center.

CHODAWU has been able to instigate incentives for poor parents through the assistance of donors. The union introduced various credit schemes for poor families with working children. IPEC support has allowed CHODAWU to give financial support through a

[1] The category "office-field officials" referred to the two groups of participants that were interviewed. It was observed that both the NGO and the Union have established 'training centres' which act as main point of interaction with child domestic workers. Eventually I learnt that there are two categories of officials working for these centres; one is that of office officials, mainly doing the coordination and administrational work at the head offices and the other category is that of field officials who daily deal with training in the centres, mainly referred to as matrons.

revolving fund to poor families and help them develop income-generating activities. Apart from the ILO-IPEC support program, CHODAWU runs training centres for domestic workers, who come daily to the center from the households they work for. In these centres, child domestic workers are being trained in various work skills such as tailoring, boutique making, and other hand craft skills.

3.2.2 KIWOHEDE (NGO)

Kiota Women Health and Development Organization (KIWOHEDE) is a national non-governmental community based organization in Dar es Salaam. The organisation was established in 1998 under registration number 8581. One of the main aims of the organisation is to promote children's rights, women's health and development at community level.

More specifically the organisation focuses mainly on promotion of children's rights, prevention of children entering into prostitution and prevention of hazardous child domestic work, reproductive health education including STD's and HIV/AIDS prevention. The organization also offers life and vocational skills training to the minority group particularly girls and those from low-income families.

3.3 In-depth Interviews

Considering the nature of the research question, that is, what are the differences in the strategies of the union (CHODAWU) and the NGO (KIWOHEDE) for organizing child domestic workers in Tanzania, the study used qualitative in-depth interviews rather than a survey. This methodology was selected to capture both the practice and the conceptual problems in organising paid child domestic workers.

In-depth interviews were conducted with the four categories of respondents, namely; the field staff and the office staff from both the union (CHODAWU) and the NGO (KIWOHEDE). The respondents were carefully selected by first making an inquiry on who are the officials directly dealing with child domestic labour issues in the respective organizations. This inquiry was done before sending interview application letters asking for appointments. Informants were persons with knowledge and experience on the history and development of the problem of child labour, in particular paid child domestic labour, in Tanzania.

An interview schedule was prepared after making early confirmations and appointments with the officials responsible at CHODAWU and KIWOHEDE. In brief the schedule was organized to cover four weeks of data collection. Generally one interview lasted for about 30-40 minutes. The interview was guided by separate lists of open-ended questions for participants from the Union (CHODAWU) and the NGO (KIWOHEDE) respectively. Thus the interview schedule and questions were divided into four categories**,** namely questions for;

- CHODAWU – Senior officers who sit in the office mainly dealing with policy and organisational and administrational issues;
- CHODAWU – Matrons and officers who deal directly with child domestic workers at the training centres;
- KIWOHEDE - Senior officers who sits in the office mainly dealing with policy and organisational issues, and
- KIWOHEDE -Officers who deal directly with child domestic workers at the training centers.

There are many advantages for using qualitative in-depth interviews. In the personal interview the interviewer works directly with the respondent. The interviewer has the opportunity to probe or ask follow-up questions. Interviews are generally easier for the respondent, especially if what is sought is opinion or impressions. This technique was very useful for instance in obtaining information from field officials who were largely ordinary secondary school leavers, i.e. matrons who needed a lot of probing to get them respond to the question.

There was no pilot before embarking on the study, as the time given for field research was not enough to accommodate piloting of the study. Financial limitation was another reason, as this study was conducted in a different country (Tanzania).

3.4 Documentary Review

This involved the use of the secondary data or archival information, which consists of documents, reports, statistics, manuscripts and other written oral or visual materials (Babbie 1986:25). This method made it possible to acquire and analyze secondary data obtained from various books, manuals, papers, articles, journals, acts of parliament and newspapers. The information was obtained from the University of Dar es Salaam's Library, CHODAWU head office, TUCTA library, ILO - Tanzania head office's library, KIWOHEDE Head office. A great deal of information was also obtained during the International Child Labour's Day celebration whose date coincided with the data collection period.

3.5 Data Collection and Analysis

The study was purely qualitative, i.e. it used the qualitative approach in collecting and analyzing data. The reasons for chosing the qualitative approach is that, the nature of the research problem lent itself to qualitative inquire. During the data collection exercise, different documents with on child domestic labour were collected and reviewed. Thus in-depth interviews and documentary review techniques were used as the main sources of data collection.

The analysis was supported by both information from the field interviews as well as quantitative data from secondary sources (i.e. documents). The study took into consideration the representativity of the findings and what can be generalized to other urban-contexts in Tanzania. The data collected was organised and analyzed in relation to the research question. Three major themes were analysed. These included the different strategies for organizing paid child domestic workers in Tanzania, the roles of the NGO and the union in organizing paid child domestic workers and challenges faced by the NGO and the union in organizing paid child domestic workers in Tanzania. A comparison was drawn between the two institutions CHODAWU (union) and KIWOHEDE (NGO).

3.6 Challenges and Ethics

One of the ethical challenges during the designing and conducting of this study is whether paid child domestic workers themselves should be interviewed or not, as most of them were between the ages of 10 – 18 years. However since the main objective of the study was to assess the problems and challenges in organizing child domestic workers,and given the ethical problem of interviewing vulnerable children I decided to focus the interviews on officials and institutions that do the actual work of organizing paid child domestic workers.

Interviews were guided by open-ended questions that dealt with organizing of the paid child domestic workers. Most of the field participants from both the union and the NGO experienced some difficulties in understanding and interpreting the questions, as most of them were primary and secondary school leavers. Thus interviews with field officials lasted longer because the questions had to be explained further.

CHAPTER FOUR

FINDINGS AND ANALYSIS

4.1 The Conservation, Hotels, Domestic and Allied Workers Union (CHODAWU)

The Conservation, Hotels, Domestic and Allied Workers Union (CHODAWU) is a trade union affiliated to the Trade Union Congress of Tanzania (TUCTA). CHODAWU was established in 1995 and registered on 15 September 2000 in accordance with the Trade Union Act of 1998.

CHODAWU deals not only with domestic workers but also workers in the conservation, national parks, tourism; hotels, restaurants; and allied sectors such as security guards, faith based organizations, supermarkets, shops, bars, saloons and the informal sector. The headquarters of the union is based in Dar es Salaam with several Zonal Offices in the country. The union is well structured and has offices in all 21 regions of the mainland Tanzania.

In relation to the domestic work sector, CHODAWU emphasizes that all domestic work has dignity and therefore campaigns for personal dignity in the domestic work sector. The union has implemented a number of programmes on paid child domestic workers in the past seven years and has established a number of life skills-training centers in Dar es Salaam and in the districts where it operates. One of the major aims of CHODAWU is to uphold and protect the personal dignity of each domestic worker and ensure that they are treated justly. At the policy level the union lobbies for the legal recognition of domestic workers and for appropriate labour law reform. (ILO-IPEC, 2006).

As one of the senior officials to the organisation put it: "one of the major tasks of the union has been to raise people's awareness of the plight of domestic workers and also to inform workers in the sector that they have rights and should exercise them" (ILO - IPEC 2006:12)

4.2 Kiota Women Health and Development Organization (KIWOHEDE)

Kiota Women Health and Development Organization (KIWOHEDE) is a national non-governmental community based organization in Dar es Salaam. One of the main aims of the organisation is to promote children's rights, women's health and development at community level. The head office of KIWOHEDE is located at Buguruni-Ilala district, one of the low income areas of Dar es Salaam.

More specifically the organisation focuses mainly on the promotion of children's rights, prevention of children entering into prostitution and prevention of hazardous child domestic work, reproductive health education including STD's, HIV/AIDS prevention. The organization also offers life and vocational skills to minority groups particularly girls and those from low-income families.

In terms of administrational structure, KIWOHEDE has an executive secretariat which includes the chairperson, vice Chairperson, Secretary, Treasurer and Publicity Secretary. The full time staff include, the executive director, training coordinators, HIV/AIDS youth counsellors, STD/Family Planning counsellors, social workers and HIV testing laboratory technician.

Since KIWOHEDE aims at empowering women, youth and children in communities, the organisation has strong collaboration with local community leadership in implementing its

activities. Communities provide support in the form of voluntary services through committees and established structures.

In the area of child domestic labour, KIWOHEDE is engaged in direct and indirect services targeting child domestic workers. Currently the NGO has established about three drop-in/life skills training centers in Dar es Salaam. The centres reach the most affected child domestic workers of both sexes (boys and girls). Activities undertaken by KIWOHEDE include the following: community mobilization and awareness raising, community seminars, media advocacy, promoting income generating activities.

Both CHODAWU and KIWOHEDE were selected as implementing agencies of the ILO-International Program on Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC) - Time Bound Programmes (TBP) in different districts of Tanzania. Tanzania was one of the first three countries (Tanzania, El-Salvador and Nepal) in the world to have TBP against the Worst Forms of Child Labour. Following the launching of the ILO/IPEC Time Bound Programmes (TBP) on the elimination of the Worst Forms of Child Labour, specific action programs were initiated to prevent, withdraw and rehabilitate about 7500 children in domestic work and those at risk of entering into domestic work.

CHODAWU and KIWOHEDE have been spearheading the implementation of these action programmes at fighting abusive child domestic labour and protecting the rights of children and other workers in general in this sector. The IPEC programmes utilize a range of approaches and a special focus is placed on reaching working children and those who are particularly vulnerable, such as those living in remote areas, or on the streets. Through the support from ILO/IPEC/TBP, CHODAWU and KIWOHEDE in collaboration with the local

the communities identified areas with high rates of abusive child labour. After identification the union and the NGO held several awareness raising meetings, seminars and workshops in the affected areas with child domestic workers.

Through the same ILO-IPEC program, both the union and the NGO established vocational training centers, where vocational training skills are taught to child domestic workers. The training is done by trained social workers and union or NGO staff.

Although in principle the main thrust of the ILO-IPEC Time Bound Programme (TBP) project has been on the prevention and withdrawal of children from the worst forms of child labour, whereby domestic work is one among them, in practice the program has also strengthened the child domestic workers organizing capacity of both the union and the NGO.

4.3 Characteristics of a Child Domestic Worker in Tanzania

At the government level there is a framework for dealing with child labour in general, rather than child domestic workers specifically. The Ministry of Labour is responsible for the enforcement of labour laws along with the Commission for Mediation and Arbitration and the Labour Court. District or community level child labour coordinating committees and subcommittees identify and monitor cases of child labour but they do so with varying degrees of effectiveness. Several government ministries, including the Ministry of Labour, Youth Development and Sports have special child labour units.

There is no specific government mechanism or framework meant for domestic workers. The practice is that different NGOs that deal with activities related to domestic workers or child domestic workers tend to team up with CHODAWU in the implementation of some

domestic work-related programmes. Because of the private nature of domestic work it has often been difficult for organizations like CHODAWU to access child domestics, instead it has concentrated on elimination of child labour, possibly due to the fact that there has been strong pressure from the global institutions like ILO for governments to ratify all the international conventions related to Child Labour.

In Tanzania child domestic labour mainly consists of young workers of age 12 to 17 who are mostly poor girls who have moved from rural areas to towns and cities in search for work. They are commonly known and referred to as "house-girls". The vast majority of child domestic workers come from poor families and are pushed to labour at a very young age to support their parents. They may also enter child domestic work as a way to escape a miserable rural life and try their luck for a better life by working.

One of the negative aspects in the situation of the house-girl is her working in isolation. Being young and far away from their families, child domestic workers are deprived of many childhood rights. Children working as stay-home domestic workers usually do not see their families for years because they do not have annual leave. Since their work is basically in the house, some of them do not get the opportunity to socialize with friends or neighbours unless they are sent to them by their employers. Confinement or lack of interaction with friends and peers hampers the psychological development of a child. In some cases this leads to depression and loneliness. Employers fear that if they go out, they will interact with others and get to know about their rights in employment. Most child domestic workers work long hours. They wake up between 4-6 AM and go to bed at midnight or 1 AM. They therefore work between 14 – 16 hours daily. Normally they wake up before the family wakes up and only go to bed when the rest of the people in the family have slept.

Additionally most children work 7 days a week without rest and do not have holidays or annual leave.

In terms of the type of chores, child domestic workers are often overworked by doing a variety of domestic tasks continuously. The typical kind of tasks include, child care, cleaning, washing, doing laundry, cooking, fetching water, shopping for groceries, and even taking care of pets and poultry, helping with petty trading (kiosk, food vending) and increasingly caring for the sick. Where boys are employed they are often working outside more on gardening and grazing.

It has been reported that in some cases, child domestic workers eat leftovers of different food (normally poor diet, little quantity) from what their employer's family eats. In some households they eat alone in the kitchen. Sometimes they don't have even proper bedding or a place to sleep.

Most of the child domestic workers are less educated or uneducated a majority of them are those who have completed their primary school education level but were unable to continue with secondary school education largely due to lack of funds to pay school fees. Hence, they remain unaware of their rights of employment and have no job security. They are always working under permanent fear of being fired at any time. Their contracts are verbal often with no record. This is one of the reasons why they are preferred to adults.

Despite working in such difficult conditions, their wages are very low and in most cases they are paid in kind (food, shelter and clothing) and are promised to be paid at the end of

their contract or when visiting their homes. In some cases their pay is sent to their homes to help their parents with household expenditures. As one of the ILO (2006) reports put it,

> "There are also cases where salaries of child domestic servants are paid to the parents or guardians of the working children. Some child domestic workers, from the beginning of their employment, agree with their employers either to work in exchange for food and shelter only or be paid in kind, in most cases they are given second hand clothes" (ILO 2006:5)

Despite the above described poor working conditions, most child domestic workers in Tanzania are afraid of revealing what happens to them, even when they get a chance for fear of losing their jobs and thus remain quiet. In other words because of the poverty in their families, child domestic workers find themselves desperate for jobs, even if working conditions are poor and exploitative. It is interesting to note that sometimes it's the employer who goes to the rural areas to look for a domestic worker, and covers the transport costs for bringing the child to town. And quite often the child has never travelled to town before, such that she becomes a stranger and completely dependent on the employer.

There are different ways through which these young domestics find their ways to training centres organized by the union and the NGO. One of the most common ways is through interaction with fellow domestic workers when they are sent to buy or fetch something outside. Another way is through invitation from the unions or the NGO's officials who through the help of the community leaders of that area identify houses with child domestic workers and approach them directly or through their employers. At the beginning the child may feel threatened and fear to lose their job, but after several contacts with the union's or

the NGO's field officials the child slowly accepts the training, this is usually after the employer has granted permission for her to participate in the trainings.

At the centers, child domestic workers are taught different life skills techniques such as, tailoring, boutique making, literacy, embroidery, and many other handcraft activities. Each center has a matron who lives in the center and coordinates all the activities at the center on behalf of the union or the NGO. In most cases these matrons are experienced and are assisted by one or two field staff, often these are young men with vocational training background.

4.4 Challenges of the Union and the NGO in Organizing Child Domestic Workers in Tanzania

In Tanzania there is very limited documented evidence on the formal organizing of domestic workers. Some of the existing data shows that although the domestic work industry has been expanding, there is little public recognition of the sector's size, growth, and significance. As KIWOHEDE's report notes, "in Tanzania although domestic work is one of the most growing phenomenon and which has become a common form of child employment, there is inadequate information about the practice and the trend of child domestic workers employment and its intervention" (KIWOHEDE 2005:1).

In practice, the child domestic workers are organized by the NGOs and the local union. Organizing domestic workers is viewed by different scholars as challenging phenomenon, sometimes referring to it as "organizing the unorganisable". Hondagneu-Sotelo and Riegos (1997: 54) argue that "the obstacles to the organizing of paid domestic workers are inherent

in the domestic job itself. It is not the workers themselves--- but rather the spatial location and the structure of the job that dampens labour organizing".

This study tried to understand the challenges faced by unions and NGOs in organizing child domestic workers in Tanzania. One of the major challenges for organising child domestic workers is their legal status. Although the law in Tanzania does mention and recognize the minimum working age of a child as 14years, the labour law restricts formal employment rights to 18 years and above where the child is involved in light work. Implicitly, the right to formal membership of trade unions is also restricted to 18 years and above. The law prohibits engagement of children of less than 18 years in hazardous work. Further the law prescribes a minimum fine not exceeding the equivalent of five-thousand U.S dollars or imprisonment for a term of one-year or both penalties to any person convicted for engaging a child in hazardous work.

In principle, this lack of a unified legal position around the child domestic employment creates a problem in traditional organizing. Organizing attempts tend to lack legal legitimacy since majority of the workers in the domestic sector are girl-children below 18 years of age. Most of the officials who were interviewed from the NGO pointed out the lack of a unified legal position and enforcement on the definition of a child and its relation to the employment rights as one of the impediments towards organizing child domestic workers in the country. There is no specific law that protects interests and rights of domestic workers.

This lack of a unified legal position has another implicit consequence on the community's and employer's attitude towards paid domestic work. Since it's undefined by the national laws, some people look at domestic work as not "work" as such. One CHODAWU's senior

official notes that “CHODAWU acknowledges that there are a number of challenges which remain in organizing workers in the domestic sector. The very fact that it is mostly located in the informal sector remains the greatest difficulty facing any trade union. In addition the perception of the general public tends to be that domestic work cannot be defined as “work” in a formal sense. Domestic workers themselves have limited self-esteem and self confidence and many are illiterate and ignorant of their fundamental rights” (ILO – IPEC 2006:51)

With such mixed legal positions around employment rights for children, the NGOs and the union officials, face great challenges and difficulty in both identifying and accessing child domestic workers. Some employers deny access to their domestic workers access, and they are often "disguised" as relatives or part of the family of the employer. One NGO official said:

> “We can not go to the individual houses where they work without obtaining permission from their employers, and if the employer doesn't want then that child will not be accessed at all.” Another respondent said “...child domestic workers are sometimes denied not allowed by their employers to go out and attend training organised by the union...” (Union Participant No. 2, Field staff and research assistant)

> “It is very difficult to know her status in that family where she is working because most often they are referred to as “Dada” in Swahili language (Tanzanian common language) which means “sister”. Therefore for an outsider sometimes it's difficult to tell whether she is a child domestic

worker or just one of the members of the family, meaning relative." (NGO Participant No. 9 Field staff)

The problem of identifying paid child domestic workers in their homes is quite difficult as one of the officials from the union narrates how they identify paid child domestic workers:

"Sometimes we just go straight to the houses and ask if there is any domestic worker and request to talk to her. At times we go the homes with some representatives from the local government authorities such as "Mjumbe", ten cell leaders. After getting few domestic workers we invite them to our training centres for further discussion. There are also those domestic workers who are brought to the centres by fellow domestics."(NGO Participant No. 6)

The traditional major role of the union is to protect and promote workers' interests and rights by doing political advocacy and lobbying to the government, private employers and other public bodies. In practice the involvement of the union in political advocacy tends to create a certain sense of "hostility" between the union and the employers. This public image of the union as the authorised (legal) organisation to confront (on behalf of employees) the employers creates fear for both the employers and the domestic worker. For the domestic worker the fear comes due to the fact that once her/his employer learns that she/he is getting involved with trade union activities, the employer can expel her from the job. Hence some domestic workers would rather hide themselves when approached by the NGO or the union activisits.

The lack of both a unified legal position on the employment status of the child domestic and the enforcement mechanism creates a dillemma in organizing. The NGO's and the union's officials find themselves in a dilemma to either choose to be polite and soft to employers, so as to win their cooperation or to do activities that would not destroy child domestic worker- employer relationship, and child domestic worker - NGO/union relationship. Consequently both the NGO and the union find themselves doing similar activities and facing similar challenges in organizing child domestic workers. This picture creates some sort of conclusion that the solution to the legal definition and enforcement problem is beyond the efforts of CHODAWU and KIWOHEDE. I therefore argue in our recommendation section that there is a need for a more systematic and joint efforts by stakeholders to deal with the problem of legal stance and enforcement for paid child domestic workers.

Thus for effective traditional organizing of domestic workers to take place, the legal position on employment of paid child domestics need be established and widely shared with the public. Apparently there is no clear incentive for employers of domestic workers to cooperate with the union since they know that once child domestics´ employment is formalized, and then employment costs will go up. The assumption is that once the law is clear, then the fear of penalties and other court actions (for mistreating the domestics) would act as the incentive for employers to comply with the union´s terms.

The lack of financial resources and the place to keep the expelled paid child domestic workers is another challenge to both the NGO and the union. On the one hand, the union is unable to guarantee protection of employment to the paid child domestic workers, which

involves the ability to deffend in court the domestic's rights, and the ability to keep and maintain the child domestic once expelled. On the other hand, the poverty on the part of the child domestic workers themselves and their families 'forces' them to remain silent and continue to work in the exploitative conditions. It gives power to the employer in determining the terms of the employment for the child domestic workers. For instance one of the participants (Matron to the one of the union's training centres, said that,

> "...some children because of getting involved in the union's work they are expelled by their employers and the union has no hostels where to keep them. And because of the difficulty conditions from where they come from they choose to remain to their employers even if they are working in very hard conditions and treatments. For example now I am staying with two child girls who were former child domestic workers but were expelled and have nowhere to go...." (Union Participant no.1)

However the lack of enough financial resources has direct impact on the capacity of both the union and the NGO in hosting the expelled domestic workers. But most important when the NGO or the union opens or files a court case against the employer(s) this lack of finance (to pay fees to advocates) can lead to getting less quality legal assistance hence losing the case(s) quite easily. During field research some participants expressed that sometimes its quite difficult for them as field officials to confront the employers and instigate court procedures, as most of them do not have legal expertise. As one of the participants explained below;

> "Lack of finance is a really problem for us, you see sometimes after we get report of a serious mistreatment from the domestic workers, we fail to go to court because it involves some costs on travelling, court fees, fees for advocate. So what we do we just report the situation to the local government leadership in that area...."(NGO Participant No. 8)

Fear of being expelled from the job plus the inability of the union to guarantee paid child domestic workers protection of employment rights, poses a serious challenge in organizing workers. Most of the child domestic workers are either directly taken by their employers or employer's relatives or friends from the villages, so that all the transport costs and other costs is met by the employer. The sharp difference the living standards of the employers' family and the child domestic's rural family creates a sense of inferiority for the child domestics and hence she becomes vulnerable and easily manipulated by the employers. As one young official (who was a former domestic worker said:

> "what can I do, I know that the working conditions are bad, but this is better than going back to my village, after all if he expels me from job where do I go from here, since I came to Dar es salaam City I don't know anybody".(Participant No.10)

The point to flag here is the link between lack of finance and the impact it produces on the capacity of the NGO and the union in dealing with both logistical issues (identification, providing training) and serious lobbying to employers. The second issue to be emphasized

is the question of poverty and how it affects the decision of a child domestic worker to either accept to be assisted and organized despite the risk of losing the job or to remain working under difficult employment conditions.

As mentioned above, the challenges around organising paid child domestic workers in Tanzania were often simply logistical – i.e. accessing domestic workers, and funding. But, it was also clear that both the union and the NGO struggled to organize child domestic workers in part because of the political economy within which domestic work was situated. With high unemployment rates, extreme poverty, rural livelihood collapse, and the HIV/AIDS pandemic, child domestic workers often had no 'choice' but to accept exploitative conditions.

As a conclusion to this section I emphasize that both the union and the NGO face very similar challenges in terms of organising paid child domestic workers. The most significant was the difficulty in identifying and accessing child domestic workers in the context of a non- unified legal position on definition and status of the child domestic. Though there is a child labour committee in each district, which works hand in hand with the union and the NGO, they don't have much power to force the employer to allow the domestic worker to attend the training, as it is the employer who has power with her/his employee. This issue was raised by most officials from both the union and the NGO as the main challenge in organizing. The second common issue raised as a challenge was the lack of finances and a place to support both the capacity of the organisations as well as the domestics who are in need and who are expelled by their employers.

NGO officials, however, emphasized the lack of a unified legal position and definition of child's employment age as well as related employment rights. The result was that while the union remained focused on employment security for child domestic workers, most NGO officials urged expanding the legislation for the sector

4.5 The Roles of the Union and the NGO in Organizing Child domestic Workers in Tanzania

This study attempted to understand the different roles of the NGO and the union in organizing paid child domestic workers in Tanzania. Findings revealed that there are both differences and similarities. At the general level I found that the ideal role of the union as understood by both the union and the NGO officials is to deal with political advocacy, lobbying, providing legal services to child domestic workers.

On the other hand the role of the NGO was widely perceived by many participants as to cater for the psycho-social needs including basic training in skills. Identification of child domestic workers was mentioned by union officials as the most significant role of the NGO. Through Identification *a* child domestic worker is brought into contact or platform for interaction with child domestic workers. Often this mobilization process occurs under the "umbrella" of educating them, training them with life skills and counselling. The KIWOHEDE NGO has several training centres where most of the training and coaching of child domestic workers is done. The content of training includes skills in tailoring, boutique making, embroidery, making different decorations and artifacts.

Once a child is identified s/he immediately introduced to the training centers where she/he meets and interract with fellow domestic workers from different places. At the initial stages

some guidance and counselling is done with a child domestic worker so as to create confidence for her to share experience. The point to be emphasized here is the NGO's role in identification. There is an implicit perception that NGOs because of their dealing with issues related to social service are closer to the local communities than the trade union. Because of that, KIWOHEDE has been successful in identifying child domestic workers in different homes without much resistances and suspicion from both the employers as well as the child domestic workers themselves.

On the other hand the union has been providing legal assistance to those already identified and mobilized child domestic workers. Most of the officials from the union perceive the following as their main role in organizing child domestic workers: Providing protection to child domestic workers rights and provision of legal assistance to child domestic workers. Thus I found that the main role of the union is to deal with the political advocacy and lobbying for child domestic workers' rights and good working conditions. It's also important to note that there is no mention of any social support role for the union, which leads to the conclusion that the NGO caters for such needs.

4.6 Strategies in Organizing Child domestic Workers in Tanzania

Despite the above challenges, this study noted that both the NGO and the union use different approaches to organize paid child domestic workers in Tanzania. One of the main approaches used by the union is sensitization and awareness creation. The local union (CHODAWU) uses direct sensitization and awareness creation by conducting workshops and seminars with local communities in different localities. Sensitization is also done with the assistance from the existing local government structures e.g. child domestic workers ward committees.

The target group of these sensitizations is both employers and paid child domestic workers. Employers are sensitized about the rights of employment of child domestic workers including the rights to decent working conditions. Child domestic workers are mainly sensitized about their rights of employment as well as right to freedom of expression and demand for better terms of employment. Most of the sensitization programs for child domestic workers are done during the training at the union's training centres.

CHODAWU organized awareness raising meetings and seminars about child rights and labour laws, to both employers and recruiting agencies of child domestic workers. 40 members of the community that attended the training include Ward executive officers (WEOs), village and hamlet leaders, women's groups and youth. Other members included representatives from CBOs, local NGOs, the police, magistrate, religious leaders, teachers and other community influential people.

Most of these awareness-raising meetings were done at ward level in each of the three districts of Dar es Salaam region. The meetings were facilitated by labour officers (ILO 2007). Although in principal political advocacy around child domestic workers is perceived as one of the core functions of the union, the reality is rather different. There is little evidence of the union's political advocacy for child domestic workers rights.

As noted in one of the union's report, "the union organized awareness raising meetings about child rights and labour laws, for 20 child domestic employers and recruiting agencies of child domestic workers. The meetings were facilitated by district labour officers to discuss labour laws governing domestic labour" (ILO - IPEC 2007:6)

Another programme in which sensitization is involved is through ILO - IPEC program in Tanzania, the union was very much involved in sensitization against exploitative child labour in different plantation areas. However it was revealed that effectiveness of both sensitization and advocacy depends on the willingness of the employer himself to attend to those awareness-raising meetings and to allow his/her domestic worker to attend the training.

Although some of the union officials don't perceive conducting of awareness meetings and advocacy as part of organizing, For example one of the union officials noted,

> "Yes currently we have not organized them, however child domestic workers are organized into the centres for the purpose of providing them with alternatives such life skills education, training and legal support when needed". (Participant No.4)

CHODAWU has thus been using sensitization meetings as the means to organize child domestic workers in Tanzania. The practice shows that provision of life skills training and sensitizations have been used as a means to organise child domestic workers by the union. The union's training centres are used for attracting and accessing domestic workers. Some training centres have been used not only for teaching life skills education, but also for teaching child domestic workers rights, challenges and possible alternative to improve their working conditions.

What then is the significance of sensitization and awareness creation as a strategy in organizing paid child domestic workers? The culture of transparency and open dialogue in

Tanzania is a recent phenomenon that came with the introduction of plural politics. Since independence in 1961 Tanzania was practising a semi-socialist system where almost every sector of the economy was centralized and monopolised by the state. Civic knowlege was very much limited to the few, to the extent that many ordinary people developed inferiority complex towards public institutions including the rights to freedom of expression. In this context it quite understandable that any attempt to organize child domestic workers need be supported by sensitization and awareness building to both the employers and the child domestic servants themselves. The level of poverty on the part of the paid child domestic worker blur her knowledge on what are employment rights, in other words the acquisition of the job becomes the priority. Likewise certain employers of child domestic workers do not know whether paid child domestic work is just like other jobs, and domestics need be treated in respect to certain rights and standards.

Because of the perceived difficulty in accessing child domestics, as well as the difficulty of bringing them together, the union tends to make use of the already existing child domestic workers' own networks and groups. For instance one of the union's field officials put it that:

> *"Child domestic workers themselves do go and find one another and come to our training centre". (Union Participant No.1)*

Writing on the need for a work space as one of the requirement for traditional organizing of domestic workers, Handagneu-Sotelo and Riegos (1997:15) argues that "lack of territorial space to conduct the organizing poses a big challenge to the union's attempt to organize child domestic workers. The spatial dispersion of employment precludes traditional

organizing efforts. There is no shared work place and not readily identifiable zone of employment, such as “the garment district” for organizers to target”.

The use of training centers and provision of vocational skills training is another strategy that is extensively used by both the NGO and the union in Tanzania. Due to the difficulty in accessing paid child domestic workers, the union and the NGO officials use the training centers as points of attraction and interraction for paid child domestics. In principle the significance of this strategy is that it fills the gap that is created due to the lack of "territorial space" or "work place" which is very important for any beginning of organizing any employed individuals. Sometimes child domestic workers themselves form their groups according to the type of skills they are being trained in and the facilitators at the centre use these groups for other purposes as well, including identification of other child domestic workers. Some of the strategies that are suggested by different scholars and labour rights activists as the way to deal with the problem of lack of shared work place include the non-union model of organizing or non-traditional model.

Handegneu Sotelo and Riegos (1997) argue that organizing non-traditional labour—where there is no shared employer, no shared work site and no shared co-workers – requires non-traditional approaches. This requires starting to define the issues with the workers themselves and enabling them to develop the skills to formulate effective strategies around job-related problems. That is, the worker becomes involved in both setting and meeting concrete goals, and through this process they develop the requisite skills to meet these goals.

In Tanzania, because the majority of the domestic workers are girl children often uneducated, working behind closed doors this idea of starting to define the issues with the

workers themselves might be difficult, as most child domestics are likely not to understand the whole process itself.

Evidence from officials that were interviewed show that there is a great potential of using child domestic workers' own groups to form associations. Within the centers different child domestic workers have formed their own networks mainly depending on the kind of skill they are being trained for. For instance one of the questions asked," what was the NGOs' and union's views as to which is the easiest way for Child domestic workers to join union or form association" A Majority of the officials who were interviewed from both the NGO and the union had the view that it is easier for Child domestic workers in Tanzania to join/form associations rather than joining the union. This is because a domestic worker identity has not been established and legally supported in Tanzania and therefore mobilising child domestic workers around workers' identity (which is core to traditional unionizing) becomes difficult.. One of the officials had these words to say:

> "It will be easier for child domestic workers to first form association then through these associations they can join trade union. This is because association are less binding to members than union, no membership fees, and it's quite flexible. Once the association become stronger then they can seek to be formally registered as unions"(NGO Participant No.14)

Evidence shows that both the NGO and then union have been attempting to organize paid child domestic workers, more or less in similar style with little difference in emphasis and practice. Both the union and the NGO used similar approaches in organizing activities for child domestic workers at different levels. For instance the use of local government and

local community support was used by both the NGO and the union. As one NGO official put it that,

> "We should involve the local community in the streets or locality, e.g., community leaders, government leaders, influential people and elders, religious leaders, business leaders etc. This is because sometimes employers are too uncooperative".(Participant No.16)

The use of local government and local community support aimed at increasing the accessibility of child domestic workers as well as win the employers' support and cooperation.

The very decision to compare the NGO and the union in organizing paid child domestic workers, assumes that the two organisations have different roles in organizing. In the debate about domestic workers organizing there is a view that, organizing has two major ends or objectives. One of the ends is that organizing provides for psycho-social servicing of the organized. This means through organizing, domestic workers will be able to meet their pyschological as well as social needs. There are different psychological problems that emanates from the working conditions that a single domestic worker alone can not adequately deal with. Other social needs may include trainings in life skills, communication skills, entrepreneurship or even ordinary basic education training. It is widely held that the NGOs are better in providing the psycho-social needs of the domestics.

The second end or objective of organizing is the political advocacy. The word ´political´ here connects organizing to the public processes and interest of workers. This involves

lobbying the decision makers for certain changes in the law or in the public policy. Organizing for political advocacy helps in building the decent public image of domestic work, it helps promoting the working conditions in a systematic and lasting way. This has been regarded as the major historical function of the union in organizing workers. There is a difference between organizing and doing the advocacy itself or providing the psycho-social servicing. Literature shows that some domestic workers associations and unions have been more effective in political advocacy than others.

CHAPTER FIVE

CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE STUDY

5.1 Discussion of the Findings and the Conclusion of the Study

In the course of comparing the two organizations, I tried to analyse three major themes that emerged from the field research and data analysis. These include, the roles of both the union and the NGO in organizing paid child domestic workers in Tanzania, the strategies used by these organizations and third are the challenges faced by these organizations during any attempt to organize paid child domestic workers.

The study has revealed a number of issues as mentioned above, one of the greatest challenges for organizing paid child domestic workers is their legal status in relation to employment. As noted in one of the IUF's conference, "In most countries there is legislation governing the minimum age for employment, but because domestic labour is not seen as work or at best only light tasks, so the minimum age laws are often not applied to it." (IUF 2007:22).

In Tanzania there is no unified legal definition and position on who is a child domestic worker in this context, and what are the employment rights and limits. The study found that there is no clear and consensual legal position on paid child domestic workers and their employment rights. The mixed legal position on the part of the child domestic worker and the work itself creates challenge for both the union and the NGO. For any meaningful organizing of paid child domestic workers to take place, the legal status of both the child domestic worker as well as the domestic work itself need be harmonised and clearly defined.

Apparently in Tanzania both the union and the NGO officials find themselves in a dilemma as to which position they should take to justify the organizing of child domestic workers. One of the options is to abide by the position which is spearheaded by the ILO-IPEC Convention which requires governments to design Time Bound Programmes to prevent and withdraw children who are working in hazardous domestic work. This position is largely premised on the assumption that child labour is illegal and therefore should be abolished. I argue that this is a top-down process whose implementation is challenged as it does not arise from the need of the workers themselves.

Each country has a unique history on the origin and development of its domestic service industry. Because of the developed status of working conditions and rights in most industrialized countries, many domestic workers tend to emigrate from their countries where there are poor working conditions and low wages, and go to work in developed and industrialized contries. For instance there have been massive domestic workers emmigration from Zimbabwe to South Africa, from other Latin American countries to Brazil, from Philipines to Rome, e.tc. Thus focussing on abolition alone without thinking of the replacement process is close to unrealistic. The demand for domestic service is increasing in urban areas, at the same time the rate of unemployment in other types of jobs is also increasing dramatically.

The second position is that which grants employment rights of children restricting it to some kind of light work or non-hazardous work. This position sees child domestic work as something that in reality will have to stay and therefore the need to reduce it to non-hazardous or light work.

This difficulty of the legal status of a child domestic worker is compounded by another legal limitation to formal organizing by the union. Although the law in Tanzania does mention and recognize the minimum working age of a child as 14years, the same labour law restricts formal employment rights to 18 years and above where the child is involved in light work. This might serve as one of the explanations as to why the union and the NGO have tended to use similar strategies in organizing child domestic workers, mainly those that do not conflict with the current legal status of the child's employment rights. For instance the union instead of doing the political advocacy and lobbying it tended to do awareness rising, life skills training etc.

Another emerging issue on the component of training to domestic workers is the question whether training that is provided to child domestic workers can merely create better child domestic workers instead of bulding the spirit of radicalism and fighting for their rights. One of the traditional functions of the trade union is to cater for workers´ rights through political advocacy. It is that very function that gives public legitimacy to trade unions or any labour organizing. Building our argument on the assumption that training to domestic workers should lead to formation of workers' Associations and these associations should later transform or join trade unions.

The central question in this context is "Why organizing paid child domestic workers" One of the possible answers to this question is that child domestic workers are organized so as to strengthen their voice in demanding for their rights as workers. On the other hand life skills training that are being offered by both the NGO and the union assumes that child domestic work is just a transitory stage, and therefore the child is being equipped with life skill tools

to be used in the future when she quits domestic work, but this kind of assumption tend to ignore the possibility that not all child domestic workers later quit from domestic service.

What all this means is that there is a discrepancy or gap between principles and practice when it comes to sustainability of training as a means for organizing and the future of child domestic worker? In principle, for instance, child labour is prohibited, but in reality poverty on the part of the child creates inevitability for children to continue serving in the domestic industry. The study noted that the content of training was not meant to create perpetual domestic servitude, insteady, it prepared them for future self employment in different types of work.

As noted by the ILO-IPEC (2006:61), “in places where there are already domestic workers associations, domestic workers’ organization would have in place existing structures to help support child domestic workers…. However with caution that such programmes and policies could not be misconstrued as legitimizing child domestic labour itself". The above paragraph is evidence of the legal dilemma in dealing with organizing child domestic labour.

Overall the question of organizing via training is one of the common and cross-cutting practices in both the union and the NGO. One of the interesting phenomena is that despite the fact that in principle, the union in Tanzania recognises the above as their main role, in practice the union appears to do more or less same things as the NGO. That is they provide social support through establishment of training centres and provide life skills education to child domestic workers. One of the questions during this research has always been why the union fails to organize child domestic workers in Tanzania.

5.1 Recommendation of the Study

The study recommends that the first priority in preparing the ground for organizing shoul be focused on ensuring that the law of the country addresses the problem and is enforceable. Different stakeholders in this field, including unions and NGOs should work towards a unified legal definition on the age and employment rights of a child taking into account the expanding employment of children as domestic workers. Here we refer to processes such as joint lobbying and advocacy at legal and policy levels.The agreed legal position should be enforced, and the government should commit to give political support.

Big stakeholders like the ILO should expand their area of focus by recognizing the need for supporting organizing paid child domestic workers who are not working in "worst forms of employments" but are being exploited by their employers. The introduction of the Minimum working age policy in some countries, including Tanzania, is a first step towards recognizing that paid child domestic workers exist in significant numbers.

Another set of recommendation is regarding the union's political advocacy role in promoting child domestic workers' rights. One of the major findings of this study was that both the union and the NGO seem to do similar things. They both give same vocational training and counselling to paid child domestic workers. I therefore recommend that CHODAWU as a union should strengthen its political advocacy role, confronting both the government and the private employers and leave the psycho-socio needs to be met by the NGOs. However there are times when the two organizations (NGO and Union) can seek cooperation to work together on certain projects or issues. The NGO is regarded as being close to the community and therefore has the comparative advantage of knowing better the environment where the

child domestic workers comes from than with the union which is widely regarded most as a tool for collective bargaining, and fighting for workers' rights.

In terms of organizing, the study recommends that since these are children workers, the NGOs should continue identifying and give training to paid child domestic workers as a means or preparation for later formation of an association. The underlying assumption is that once these associations gets stronger and obtain support and recognition from the local community, employers, and the government, then they can formally be led to join the trade union. It is important to emphasize that the situation in Tanzania is relatively different from other countries, especially the non-industrialized countries, where domestic work is in the process of / has been mainstreamed in the main labour movements' frameworks. Quite often domestic workers in these other countries are adults or young adults who can easily understand the dynamics of labour movements and labour issues. In Tanzania we observed that there are predominantly girls who work as domestic workers and there fore they need strong support and intervention from both international and national bodies.

References

Ally, S. (2005) Caring about Care workers: Organizing in the Female Shadow of Globalization. Labour, Capital and Society. 38(1&2)

Ally, S. (2004) "Domestic Labour Pains". South African Labour Bulletin, Volume 28 Number 5 October 2004.

Anderson, B. (2000) Doing the dirty Work? The global Politics of Domestic Labour. London: Zed

Anderson, B. (2001). "Just Another Job? Paying for Domestic Work." Gender and Development Vol. 9, No. 1, March 2001.

Andall, J. (2000) Gender, Migration, and Domestic service: The Politics of Black Women in Italy. Burlington: Ashgate.

Babbie, E.R. (1986). The Practice of Social Research, (4th edition). Wadsworth, Inc.

Bakan, A.B et al (1997) Not One of the Family: Foreign Domestic Workers in Canada, Toronto. University of Toronto Press

Blackett, A. (2000), ILO, Making Domestic Work Visible: the Case for Specific Regulation - International Labour Standards

Bujra, J.M. (2000) Serving Class: Masculinity and the Feminization of Domestic Service in Tanzania. Edinburg: Edinburg University Press

Cock, J. (1980) Maids and Madams: A Study in the Politics of Exploitation (Johannesburg: Ravan Press

Conservation, Hotels, Domestic and Allied Workers' Union, pamphlet on The Situation of House Girls (Child domestic Workers) in Tanzania

Country Reports on Human Rights Practices - 2006. Released by the Bureau of Democracy, Human Rights and Labour, March 6, 2007

De Villiers, F. (1989) From Domestic Worker to Head of the Domestic Workers' Union in DEH Russel (ed). Lives of courage. Women for a New South African. New York Basic Books.

Ford, M. (2004) Organizing the Unorganizable: Unions, NGOs, and Indonesian Migrant Labour. International Migration.

Gamburd, P. (2000). "Investment, Trade, and Migration." International Migration Review

Gordon, S. (1985) Talent for tomorrow: Life stories of South African Servants. Johannesburg: Ravan Press.

Handagneu-Sotelo, P. and Riegos, C. (1997) "Latina Domestic Workers and Non-traditional Labour Organizing". Latino Studies Journal,Vol 8, No,3, Fall

Hansen, K.T. (1989) Distant Companions: Servants and Employers in Zambia, 1900-1985. Ithaca: Cornell University Press

Hansen, K.T. (1992). African Encounters with Domesticity. Rutgers University Press. New Brunswick, NJ

ILO, (2006), Emerging Good Practices on Action to Combat Child Domestic Labour in Kenya, Tanzania, Uganda and Zambia.

ILO-IPEC, (2007), Hazardous child domestic work: A briefing sheet, Geneva International Labour Office.

ILO-IPEC, Interregional Workshop on Child Domestic Labour and Trade Unions: Report, Geneva 1-3 February 2006

ILO, International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC). CHODAWU Implementation Report, July 2007

IUF, Respect and Rights; domestic Workers conference report, 2007, extract. March 2007

Jureidin, R. (2002). Women Migrant Domestic Workers Lebanon. International Migration Papers . Geneva ILO

Katzman, D. (1978). "Domestic Service: Women´s Work." In Ann Stromberg and Shirley Harkess, Eds, Women working: Theories and Facts in Perspective, Palo Alto, CA: Mayfield Publishing Company.

KIWOHEDE, (2005). The Situation of House Girls in Tanzania, a paper presented at the Popular Tribunal Event, in Dar es Salaam, Tanzania.

Klo, N. (2006) *Child Domestic Work*, Article published on S.E.E.D Online Newsletter, Issue 5, Dec 2006 (www.s-e-e-d.org.uk)

LO/FTF Council - Danish Trade Union Council for International Development Cooperation, Report (April 2003) on *the profile of the Labour market and Trade Unions in Tanzania*.

Maggie, B. (2002) Anti-Slavery International, A hand Book on Advocacy, Child domestic workers: Finding a Voice.

Prates, S. (1998) Organizing for Domestic Workers in Montevideo: Reinforcing Marginality? Muchachas No More

Parrenas, R.S. (2001) Servants of Globalization: Women, Migration, and Domestic Work, Stanford: Stanford University Press

Pape, J. (1993) "Still serving the Tea: Domestic Workers in Zimbabwe 1980-90". Journal of Southern Africa studies, 19(3)

Rollins, J. (1985). Between Women: Domestic Workers and their Employers. Philadelphia: Temple University Press.

Report by the International Confederation of Free Trade Union (ICFTU) for the WTO General Council Review of the Trade Policies of Tanzania, "*Internationally Recognised Core Labour Standards in Tanzania*

Shivji, I. (1983). Working Class Struggles and Organisation in Tanzania.. 1939 - 75. Mawazo 5 (2)

Trade Union Congress of Tanzania - TUCTA, 2002, Groups' Training Manual

United Nations Commission on Human Rights Report 2002