SECONDARY TRAUMATIC STRESS AND COPING: A CASE STUDY OF THE SOCIAL WORKERS EMPLOYED AT THE SOUTH AFRICAN POLICE SERVICE

FRANCINE JULIA MASSON

A thesis submitted to the Faculty of Humanities, University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy.

February 2016
DECLARATION

I, the undersigned, hereby declare that this is my own original work. Any part of this study that does not reflect my own ideas has been fully acknowledged in the form of citations. No part of this thesis has been submitted in the past, or is being submitted for a degree at any other university.

__________________________  _________________________
FJ MASSON                      DATE
DEDICATION

I dedicate this work to:

My parents:

• Tony and Doreen Davies, my dad and step-mom, for all your support and assistance especially during the most difficult period of my life. In particular, dad thank you for coming to Australia with me;

and

• Valerie Patricia Howard, (17 June 1944 – 17 December 2007), my mom, who inspired me in so many different ways. Kenneth Anthony Howard, (18 December 1924 – 04 May 2009), my step-dad, for everything that you ever did for me and for always having such a positive approach to life;

Not a day goes by that I don’t miss both of you!

and

My son:

• To Kyle Kenneth Masson, for being the delightful child that you are.
“The Light shines in the Darkness, and the Darkness has not overcome it”.

I John 1:5

“Blessed be the name of God forever and ever,
For wisdom and might are His.
And He changes the times and the seasons;
He removes kings and raises up kings;
He gives wisdom to the wise
And knowledge to those who have understanding.
He reveals deep and secret things;
He knows what is in the darkness,
And light dwells with Him”.

Daniel 2:20-22
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This work would not have been possible without the support of the following:

• My Heavenly Father, for your unfailing love and mercy, thank you that your grace is sufficient.

• Professor Eleanor Ross – I am so grateful for the academic mentor that you have been to me over the years. Your ability to see the bigger picture while at the same time keeping your focus on the detail, has taught me so much. I am particularly grateful for your guidance, time, support and most of all for your belief in me – Thank you!

• Dr Erica Stutterheim and the management of the South African Police Service for allowing me to conduct this research.

• The social workers at the South African Police Service for your time and for being willing to share your experiences with me, I am extremely grateful.

• Professor Gregory Lee and Jackie Moodley for assistance with the statistical aspect of this research.

• The following people who have all supported me in different ways - Vivienne Solomons, Dawn Shewring, Bridget Bremner, Linda Smith, Stephen Davies, Anne Lunksy, Stewart Belsham, Professor Edwell Kaseke, Beverly Jackson, Adrie Vermeulen, Elmarie Tredoux, James Tully, Ndangwa Noyoo, Michael Howard, Colette van Heerden, Tanya Graham, Celeste Olivier, Renate Gericke and Gifty Nyarko. I’m privileged to know each one of you.

• To my spiritual family who have prayed for me through this chapter of my life.

• To my clients, who through sharing their journeys with me, have also taught me so much about resilience and the strength of the human spirit.

• My parents, Tony and Doreen Davies, for your love and support and especially for being the best grandparents to Kyle.

• The Carnegie Foundation for providing financial assistance with this research.

• The Faculty of Humanities, University of the Witwatersrand, for the Faculty Research Grant.

• The National Research Foundation for the PhD Completion Grant, which gave me time to complete this research. This work is based on the research supported in part by the National Research Foundation of South Africa (Unique Grant No 92681).
ABSTRACT

South Africa is regarded as one of the most violent countries in the world. Colonialism and apartheid laid the foundations for a divided and segregated society where violence was accepted as a legitimate means of conflict resolution in order to ensure the domination of one racial group over all other groups. As social and economic inequalities have become more entrenched in South African society, criminal violence has escalated. However, the nature of violence in the country has changed from political violence to criminal violence. Against this backdrop of violence and associated trauma, the South African Police have the insurmountable task of trying to maintain law and order.

The science of traumatology is a burgeoning field; traditionally empirical research has focused on the responses of primary trauma victims. However, in recent decades the secondary effects of traumatisation on those who counsel the victims of primary trauma, has received significant attention. Located within the South African Police Service, is an often forgotten secondary group of professionals who assist the police officials through assuming the roles of occupational and forensic social work. The profession of social work is inherently stressful and demanding, especially in a country like South Africa, where social problems are ubiquitous and pervade every facet of South African society. Furthermore, a particular occupational stressor significantly impacting on these social workers as they investigate child abuse or provide counselling for a police officer, is secondary traumatisation. The questions arise: firstly, how these social workers are affected by the amount of traumatic material to which they are exposed by the very nature of their work, and secondly, what coping strategies they employ. It was therefore deemed imperative to explore the effects of secondary traumatisation experienced by these social workers in the South African Police Service in order to understand and ameliorate the negative effects of secondary traumatic stress. Furthermore, social work supervisors can enhance the quality of care their social workers provide to clients if they are adequately supported. It was therefore also considered necessary to explore the stressors these social workers experience and to identify the necessary support mechanisms appropriate to such therapeutic endeavors.

The primary aim of this study was therefore to explore the nature and extent of secondary traumatic stress experienced by social workers employed by the South African Police Service. The research design adopted for this study was exploratory, descriptive and correlational, while the
research methodology employed was a hybrid of both quantitative and qualitative paradigms. As this study involved an in-depth analysis of a bounded system comprising social workers employed at SAPS, the research was considered a case study. The study comprised two phases: In the first phase questionnaire booklets containing seven standardised research tools and open-ended questions, were administered in group settings. In addition, questionnaires were posted to social workers who were not able to attend the group meetings along with a self-addressed envelope. The research tools measured the nature of secondary trauma exposure, levels of secondary traumatic stress, vicarious trauma, compassion satisfaction, burnout, coping resources and dimensions of the work environment. Two hundred questionnaire booklets were distributed and 128 usable questionnaires were returned. Descriptive and inferential statistics were used to analyse the quantitative data, through the use of statistical programmes, SAS and SPSS.

In the second stage of the study, 30 participants who participated in the first part of the study and who indicated that they were willing to be interviewed, were purposively selected. A structured research tool was used to guide the interview in order to explore the participants’ perceptions and experiences of secondary trauma while working for SAPS. The interviews were conducted either face-to-face, telephonically or through Skype. The qualitative data that emerged from the interviews were analysed through the use of Atlasti, a qualitative computer programme, which assisted the researcher in the thematic analysis. Through the process of incorporating qualitative techniques, the researcher also made use of reflexivity when analysing the qualitative data.

In total 128 social workers participated in the study, of whom 102 were occupational social workers while 26 were forensic social workers, all located within South Africa. The extent of exposure to secondary trauma varied substantially between both occupational and forensic social work when considered as separate divisions, as well as within each discipline. This variation manifested in frequencies and duration of cases. In the interviews forensic social workers identified particularly traumatic cases as those where the sexual abuse was severe or the child had died as a result of extreme abuse. In comparison, occupational social workers identified some of the worst cases they had dealt with as cases where the police officers became disabled; and where they were required to deal with police suicides and police family murders or femicide-suicides.
Most participants presented with high or average levels of secondary traumatic stress and vicarious trauma as well as with moderate and low levels of burnout. Furthermore, there was a strong positive correlation between levels of secondary traumatic stress and burnout. The majority of participants experienced average levels of compassion satisfaction from their work. Participants identified various coping strategies and resources incorporating different individual dimensions, namely, physical, emotional, cognitive, social and spiritual. Participants showed high levels of resilience and findings indicated that resilience was negatively correlated with vicarious trauma. There were numerous significant differences between the different ranks of the participants. Participants of higher rank reported greater trauma exposure and had significantly higher secondary traumatic scores. Coloured participants experienced significantly lower levels of vicarious traumatisation than Black participants. Furthermore, there were numerous statistically significant differences apparent between the forensic and occupational social workers. Forensic social workers manifested significantly higher levels of vicarious trauma than occupational social workers, and forensic social workers had greater distortions regarding self-intimacy than occupational social workers. In addition, forensic social workers presented with lower coping resources and lower levels of resilience than occupational social workers.

Participants also experienced below average levels of satisfaction within the work environment at SAPS. The results from the work environment scale showed that in particular the relationship aspects in the work environment were problematic and that colleague support levels were below average. There were also significant differences in work satisfaction levels between Black and White participants. These findings enhance understanding of trauma in racially polarised societies.

Multivariate analysis revealed the complex relationships existing between the numerous variables in the study, further contributing to the theory of trauma in divided societies. Two structural equation models were developed to show the relationships of the variables measured in the study which were identical apart from the vicarious trauma variable which was separated to incorporate beliefs about self and beliefs about others. The models revealed that coping mechanisms moderated the relationship between traumatic stress exposure and vicarious trauma (self) and that such mechanisms moderated the resilience and burnout relationship.

These findings of the study highlight the need to involve social workers at SAPS in the drafting and implementation of a self-care policy which would help to promote empowerment and
responsibility of social workers for their own mental health. Recommendations for social work policy, education, practice, supervision and support as well as future research are also provided.

Keywords: secondary traumatic stress, vicarious trauma, compassion satisfaction, burnout, coping resources, resilience, work environment, forensic social work, occupational social work, South African Police Service
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

Declaration ................................................................................................................................. ii
Dedication ................................................................................................................................. iii
Acknowledgements .................................................................................................................. iv
Abstract ...................................................................................................................................... v
Table of Contents ..................................................................................................................... x
List of Tables ................................................................................................................................ xxii
List of Figures ........................................................................................................................... xxiv
Abbreviations used in the Study .............................................................................................. xxvi

**PART ONE: THE PROLOGUE** ................................................................................................. 1

**CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION TO THE STUDY** .............................................................. 2

1.1 INTRODUCTION .................................................................................................................. 2
1.2 STATEMENT OF THE PROBLEM ......................................................................................... 2
1.3 RATIONALE FOR THE STUDY ............................................................................................ 5
1.4 ANTICIPATED VALUE OF THE STUDY .............................................................................. 7
  1.4.1 Development of Theory ................................................................................................. 8
  1.4.2 Implications for Policy Development ........................................................................... 8
  1.4.3 Implications for Social Work Education ....................................................................... 8
  1.4.4 Implications for Social Work Practice ......................................................................... 8
  1.4.5 Implications for Supervision and Support ................................................................... 8
1.5 PRIMARY AIM, RESEARCH QUESTIONS AND OBJECTIVES ............................................. 9
  1.5.1 Primary Aim ................................................................................................................ 9
  1.5.2 Research Questions ...................................................................................................... 9
  1.5.3 Secondary Objectives .................................................................................................. 10
  1.5.3.1 Secondary objectives for the quantitative data collection phase ............................ 10
  1.5.3.2 Secondary objectives for the qualitative data collection phase .............................. 10
1.6 OVERVIEW OF THE RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY ............................... 10
1.7 THEORIES UNDERPINNING THE STUDY.................................................................................. 12
1.8 PRE-UNDERSTANDINGS UNDERPINNING THE STUDY .......................................................... 13
1.9 LIMITATIONS OF THE STUDY ............................................................................................. 14
1.10 DEFINITION OF KEY TERMS .............................................................................................. 16
1.11 ORGANISATION OF THE THESIS ......................................................................................... 18

PART TWO - THE THEORETICAL LENS FRAMING THE STUDY .......................................................... 20

CHAPTER TWO: TRAUMATOLOGY .............................................................................................. 21
2.1 INTRODUCTION ..................................................................................................................... 21
2.2 OVERVIEW OF THE HISTORY OF TRAUMA ........................................................................ 22
2.3 THE CONCEPTUALISATION OF TRAUMA .......................................................................... 23
2.3.1 Defining Trauma and Traumatic Stress .......................................................................... 23
2.3.2 Classifications of Trauma .............................................................................................. 24
2.4 PRIMARY TRAUMATISATION ............................................................................................... 25
2.4.1 Posttraumatic Stress Disorder Classification .................................................................. 25
2.4.2 Acute Stress Disorder (ASD) .......................................................................................... 31
2.4.3 Complex Posttraumatic Disorder .................................................................................... 31
2.4.4 Posttraumatic Stress Disorder and Comorbid Disorders .................................................. 32
2.5 SECONDARY TRAUMATISATION ......................................................................................... 32
2.5.1 Secondary Traumatic Stress (STS).................................................................................... 33
2.5.1.1 Conceptual understanding of secondary traumatic stress ........................................... 33
2.5.1.2 Vulnerability to secondary trauma .............................................................................. 36
2.5.1.3 The impact of secondary traumatic stress ................................................................. 37
2.5.1.4 Secondary traumatic stress and social workers ............................................................ 40
2.5.2 Vicarious Trauma ............................................................................................................ 41
2.5.2.1 Conceptual understanding of vicarious trauma ........................................................... 41
2.5.2.2 Constructivist self-development theory and the effects of vicarious trauma ............... 41
2.5.2.3 The impact of vicarious trauma on the helping relationship ....................................... 43
2.5.2.4 Empirical research on vicarious trauma ................................................................. 45
2.5.2.5 Criticisms of vicarious trauma ................................................................................. 45
2.5.3 Compassion Fatigue (CF) ............................................................................................... 45
2.5.3.1 Conceptual understandings of compassion fatigue .................................................... 45
2.5.3.2 Vulnerability to compassion fatigue ................................................................. 46
2.5.3.3 Compassion fatigue studies .............................................................................. 48
2.5.4 Compassion Satisfaction (CS) ............................................................................. 48
2.5.5 Burnout ................................................................................................................... 50
2.5.5.1 Conceptual understandings of burnout ............................................................. 50
2.5.5.2 Predictors of burnout ......................................................................................... 51
2.5.5.3 Effects of burnout ............................................................................................. 51
2.5.5.4 Burnout and social workers ............................................................................. 53
2.5.6 Transference and Counter-transference ............................................................... 53
2.5.6.1 Conceptual understandings of transference and counter-transference ......... 54
2.5.6.2 Counter-transference in relation to PTSD ......................................................... 55
2.5.6.2 Counter-transference in relation to secondary stress ....................................... 55
2.5.7 Shared Trauma (ST) ............................................................................................. 55
2.6 THE OTHER SIDE OF THE COIN - POST TRAUMATIC GROWTH ............... 57
2.7 TRAUMA AND CULTURE ...................................................................................... 58
2.8 CONCLUSION ............................................................................................................ 59

CHAPTER THREE: COPING, RESILIENCE AND TRAUMA ........................................ 61
3.1 INTRODUCTION ........................................................................................................ 61
3.2 COPING AND TRAUMA ......................................................................................... 62
3.2.1 The relationship of coping and trauma ................................................................. 62
3.2.2 Determinants of Trauma and Coping .................................................................. 63
3.3 DIFFERENT THEORETICAL APPROACHES TO UNDERSTANDING COPING WITH TRAUMA .......... 65
3.3.1 Psychoanalytical Understanding and Treatment Approaches ............................... 65
3.3.2 Cognitive Theories and Interventions ................................................................. 66
3.3.3 Narrative Therapy .............................................................................................. 67
3.3.4 Existential Therapy ............................................................................................. 67
3.3.5 Neurobiological Theories .................................................................................. 68
3.3.6 The Neoterics or Power Therapies ...................................................................... 69
3.3.7 Trait Theories ...................................................................................................... 70
3.3.7.1 Personality type ............................................................................................... 70
3.3.7.2 Hardiness ........................................................................................................ 70
3.3.7.3 Locus of control .............................................................................................. 70
3.3.7.4 Neurotic anxiety ............................................................................................ 71
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.4 RESILIENCE</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.1 Defining Resilience</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.2 Understanding Resilience</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.3 Family and Cultural Resilience</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.4 Resilience and Trauma</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5 COPING AND SELF-CARE STRATEGIES</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5.1 Coping Strategies</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5.2 Individual Self-Care Strategies</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5.2.1 The Bio-physical dimension</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5.2.2 The Emotional intrapersonal dimension</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5.2.3 The Cognitive intra-personal dimension</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5.2.4 The Inter-personal dimension</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5.2.5 The Spiritual-cultural dimension</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5.3 Professional Strategies</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5.3.1 Supervision</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5.3.2 Learning the limits of the professional role and establishing appropriate boundaries</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5.3.3 Becoming more experienced and recognising patterns</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5.3.4 Utilising educational opportunities</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5.3.5 Peer support and professional networking</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5.4 Organisational Strategies</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5.4.1 Procedures for the recruitment of appropriate professionals</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5.4.2 Debriefings, defusion and supportive strategies</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5.4.3 Changing the variety and extent of work tasks</td>
<td>91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5.4.4 Ensuring adequate leave policies</td>
<td>91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5.4.5 Promoting a safe, healthy and resilient work environment and organisation</td>
<td>92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6 CONCLUSION</td>
<td>93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER FOUR: THE WORK MILIEU</td>
<td>94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1 INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2 THE DEFINION AND MEANING OF WORK</td>
<td>94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.1 Defining Work</td>
<td>94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.2 The Meaning of Work</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3 AN OVERVIEW OF THE HISTORY OF WORK</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4.3.1 Prehistoric and Medieval Societies ............................................................................. 96
4.3.2 Capitalism and the Industrial Revolution .................................................................. 96
4.3.3.1 The rise of the factory .............................................................................................. 97
4.3.2.2 Scientific Management ............................................................................................. 97
4.3.2.3 Fordism and Post-Fordism ...................................................................................... 97
4.4 WORK STRESS .............................................................................................................. 99
4.4.1 Understandings of Work Stress .................................................................................. 99
4.4.2 Models of Work Stress ............................................................................................... 99
4.5 DIMENSIONS OF THE WORK ENVIRONMENT THAT REDUCE OR EXACERBATE WORK STRESS .... 100
4.5.1 The Relationship Dimension .................................................................................... 100
4.5.1.1 Involvement ............................................................................................................. 100
4.5.1.2 Co-worker Cohesion ............................................................................................... 101
4.5.1.3 Supervisor Support ................................................................................................. 101
4.5.2 The Personal Growth Dimension .............................................................................. 102
4.5.2.1 Autonomy ................................................................................................................. 102
4.5.2.2 Task Orientation ...................................................................................................... 102
4.5.2.3 Work Pressure ........................................................................................................ 103
4.5.3 The System Maintenance and Change Dimension ....................................................... 103
4.5.3.1 Job Clarity ................................................................................................................. 103
4.5.3.2 Managerial Control ................................................................................................. 104
4.5.3.3 Innovation ................................................................................................................ 104
4.5.3.4 Physical Comfort .................................................................................................... 105
4.6 THE DEVELOPMENT OF EMPLOYEE ASSISTANCE AND EMPLOYEE WELLNESS PROGRAMMES TO DEAL WITH WORK STRESS .................................................................................. 105
4.7 CONCLUSION ............................................................................................................... 107

PART THREE - THE CONTEXT OF THE STUDY .................................................................. 109

CHAPTER FIVE: THE SOCIAL CONTEXT OF WORK IN SOUTH AFRICA ........................................ 110
5.1 INTRODUCTION .............................................................................................................. 110
5.2 THE SOUTH AFRICAN HISTORICAL CONTEXT ............................................................ 111
5.3 THE SOCIO-ECONOMIC REALITIES OF SOUTH AFRICA ............................................ 115
5.4 CONTEXTUALIZING TraUMATIC STRESS IN SOUTH AFRICA ....................................... 118
5.5 THE HISTORY OF WORK IN SOUTH AFRICA .................................................................. 124
5.5.1 Industrialisation in South Africa.............................................................................. 124
5.5.2 Work in the Apartheid System.............................................................................. 127
5.5.3 Work Post 1994 in South Africa............................................................................ 129
5.6 THE WORK CONTEXT OF THE SOUTH AFRICAN POLICE SERVICE......................... 131
5.6.1 Historical Overview of the South African Police Service..................................... 131
5.6.2 Occupational Stress of the Police ....................................................................... 134
5.7 CONCLUSION............................................................................................................ 136

CHAPTER SIX: THE PROFESSION OF SOCIAL WORK....................................................... 137
6.1 INTRODUCTION.......................................................................................................... 137
6.2 SOCIAL WORK AS A PROFESSION.......................................................................... 138
6.2.1 The Origins of Social Work.................................................................................... 139
6.2.2 The Status of Social Work as a Profession............................................................ 140
6.2.3 Financial Cutbacks and Changes in the Nature of Professional Services.............. 142
6.2.4 The Care/Control Debate...................................................................................... 142
6.2.5 Teamwork.............................................................................................................. 143
6.2.6 Ethical Dilemmas.................................................................................................. 144
6.2.7 Dealing with Vulnerable Clientele ...................................................................... 144
6.2.8 Threats to Personal Safety.................................................................................... 145
6.2.9 Work Satisfaction and Staff Turnover................................................................... 146
6.3 SOCIAL WORK IN SOUTH AFRICA........................................................................ 147
6.3.1 Social Welfare in South Africa Prior to 1994....................................................... 147
6.3.2 Social Work in South Africa Post 1994................................................................. 148
6.4 OCCUPATIONAL STRESS OF SOCIAL WORKERS IN SOUTH AFRICA................... 149
6.4.1 Professional Status and Professional Identity ....................................................... 149
6.4.2 The Socio-Economic Realities of Social Work Students....................................... 150
6.4.3 The Appropriateness of South African Social Work Undergraduate Training .... 151
6.4.4 Working with Other Social Service Professions.................................................. 152
6.4.5 Lack of Career Development and Opportunities................................................ 153
6.4.6 Excessive Caseloads.............................................................................................. 153
6.4.7 Inadequate Supervision....................................................................................... 154
6.4.8 Lack of Personal Safety....................................................................................... 152
6.4.9 The Working Environment................................................................................... 155
6.4.10 Rural Conditions................................................................................................. 155
CHAPTER SEVEN: RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY .................................................. 167

7.1 INTRODUCTION ........................................................................................................ 167

7.2 RESEARCH QUESTIONS .......................................................................................... 168

7.3 RESEARCH AIMS AND OBJECTIVES .................................................................... 168

7.3.1 Primary Aim ........................................................................................................ 168

7.3.2 Secondary Objectives .......................................................................................... 168

7.3.2.1 Secondary Objectives for the Quantitative Data Collection Phase .................. 168

7.3.3.2 Secondary Objectives for the Qualitative Data Collection ................................ 169

7.4 HYPOTHESES OF THE STUDY ............................................................................. 169

7.5 RESEARCH DESIGN ............................................................................................... 170

7.5.1 Description of the Research Design ................................................................... 170

7.5.2 The Mixed Methods Approach ......................................................................... 171

7.5.3 The Quantitative Paradigm ................................................................................. 173

7.5.4 The Qualitative Paradigm ..................................................................................... 174

7.5.5 Case Study .......................................................................................................... 175

7.5.6 Reflexivity ............................................................................................................ 176

7.6 RESEARCH METHODOLOGY .................................................................................. 178

7.6.1 Unit of Analysis ................................................................................................... 178

7.6.2 Sampling Procedures .......................................................................................... 179

7.6.2.1 Sampling procedure during the first phase .................................................... 179

7.6.2.2 Sampling procedure during the second phase .............................................. 179

7.6.3 Methods of Data Collection .............................................................................. 180
7.6.3.1 Methods of data collection in phase one ............................................. 181
7.6.3.2 Methods of data collection in phase two ........................................ 182
7.6.4. Research Instrumentation ..................................................................... 184
7.6.4.1 First phase of the data collection ....................................................... 184
7.6.4.2 Second phase of the data collection ................................................... 190
7.7 THE PILOT STUDY ................................................................................... 192
7.7.1 Piloting the Research Tools in Phase One............................................ 192
7.7.2 Piloting the Interview Schedule in Phase Two ...................................... 193
7.8 THE RESEARCH PROCEDURE ................................................................. 194
7.9 DATA ANALYSIS ..................................................................................... 195
7.9.1 Quantitative Data Analysis .................................................................. 195
7.9.1.1 Scoring .............................................................................................. 195
7.9.1.2 Descriptive statistics ........................................................................ 196
7.9.1.3 Inferential statistics ........................................................................... 196
7.9.2 Qualitative Data Analysis .................................................................... 202
7.9.2.1 Thematic content analysis ................................................................. 202
7.10 RELIABILITY AND VALIDITY OF THE QUANTITATIVE DATA ............ 204
7.10.1 Reliability ............................................................................................ 204
7.10.2 Validity ................................................................................................. 204
7.10.2.1 Content validity ............................................................................... 204
7.10.2.2 Face validity .................................................................................... 204
7.11 ENHANCING TRUSTWORTHINESS OF THE QUALITATIVE DATA ....... 205
7.11.1 Credibility ........................................................................................... 205
7.11.2 Transferability ..................................................................................... 205
7.11.3 Dependability ...................................................................................... 206
7.11.4 Confirmability ..................................................................................... 206
7.11.5 Rigour .................................................................................................. 206
7.12 ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS ................................................................. 207
7.12.1 Informed Consent ............................................................................... 207
7.12.2 Confidentiality and Privacy ................................................................. 208
7.12.3 Avoidance of Harm or Non-maleficence ............................................ 208
7.12.4 Deception ............................................................................................ 208
7.12.5 Coercion and Perverse Incentives ...................................................... 209
7.12.6 Researcher’s Competence and Actions ............................................... 209
7.12.7 Approval of the Study by Institutional Ethics Committee ........................................... 209
7.12.8 Publication of Findings and Feedback Given to Participants......................................... 209
7.13 CONCLUSION.................................................................................................................... 210

PART FIVE – THE FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION SECTION ................................................................... 211

CHAPTER EIGHT: FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION 1 - TRAUMA EXPOSURE AND SECONDARY
TRAUMATIC STRESS .................................................................................................................. 212
8.1 INTRODUCTION..................................................................................................................... 212
8.2 DEMOGRAPHIC PROFILE OF PARTICIPANTS .................................................................... 213
8.2.1 Areas of Social Work, Race and Gender of Survey Participants ....................................... 213
8.2.2 Age Distribution, Marital Status and Family Composition of Participants ...................... 215
8.2.3 Participants’ Ranks and Geographical Location............................................................... 216
8.2.4 Educational Qualifications and Previous Social Work Experience.................................. 217
8.2.5 Demographic Profile of Interview Participants.............................................................. 219
8.2.6 Reasons for Joining SAPS and Experience at SAPS......................................................... 219
8.3 DIMENSIONS OF SECONDARY TRAUMA EXPOSURE ...................................................... 221
8.3.1 The First Objective .......................................................................................................... 221
8.3.2 Secondary Trauma Exposure and the Traumatic Stress Schedule (TSS)............................ 221
8.3.3 The Nature of Forensic Social Workers’ Exposure to Secondary Trauma ...................... 224
8.3.4 The Nature of the Occupational Social Workers’ Exposure to Secondary Trauma .............. 225
8.4 SECONDARY TRAUMATIC STRESS .................................................................................... 234
8.4.1 The Second Objective ...................................................................................................... 234
8.4.2 Secondary Traumatic Stress Levels.................................................................................. 234
8.4.3 Hypothesis Testing .......................................................................................................... 237
8.4.4 Secondary Traumatic Stress Symptoms ........................................................................ 239
8.4.5 Interview Participants’ Experiences of Secondary Traumatic Stress ............................... 243
8.5 CONCLUSION...................................................................................................................... 247

CHAPTER NINE: FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION 2 - VICARIOUS TRAUMA, TRANSFERENCE AND
COUNTER-TRANSFERENCE, COMPASSION SATISFACTION, BURNOUT AND THE WORK
ENVIRONMENT .......................................................................................................................... 249
9.1 INTRODUCTION..................................................................................................................... 249
9.2 VICARIOUS TRAUMA (VT) .................................................................................................. 250
9.2.1 The Third Objective ........................................................................................................ 250
LIST OF TABLES

Table 2.1: Levin, Kleinman and Adler’s (2014) Table , of PTSD Criteria in DSM-IV-TR versus DSM-5 27
Table 2.2: Risk Factors for Posttraumatic Stress Disorder (Friedman, 2006, p.16) 30
Table 2.3: Newlwll, Nelson-Gardell and MacNeil’s (2015, p.2) Terminology and and Secondary Construct Timeline 34
Table 2.4: Figley’s (1995, p.8) Comparison Between Primary and Secondary Trauma 35
Table 2.5: The Personal Impact of Secondary Traumatic Stress (Yassen, 1995, p. 184) 38
Table 2.6: The Impact of Secondary Traumatic Stress on the Work Environment 40
Table 2.7: Figley’s (2002a) Ten component Model of Compassion Fatigue (Udipi et al., 2008, p. 459) 47
Table 3.1: Elements for a Theory of Traumatic Stress Reactions (Wilson & Lindy, 1994, p.21) 64
Table 7.1: Stages of the Research Process 171
Table 7.2: Quantitative and Qualitative Elements of the Design Components 172
Table 7.3: Work Environment Sub-Scales and Descriptions 189
Table 7.4: Internal Consistencies, Corrected Average Item-Sub-Scale Correlations and One-Month Test-Retest Reliability of the Work Environment Scale 190
Table 7.5: Rationale for Inclusion of Items in the Interview Schedule 191
Table 7.6: Suggested Changes from the Pilot Study 193
Table 7.7: The Five Fundamental Aspects of Data Analysis 207
Table 8.1: Demographic Information on the Survey Participants 213
Table 8.2: Demographic Profile of the Interview Participants 219
Table 8.3: Participants’ Reasons for Joining SAPS 219
Table 8.4: The Nature of Secondary Trauma Exposure as Measured by the Traumatic Stress Schedule 223
Table 8.5: Participants’ Endorsement of Diagnostic Criteria B, C and D of PTSD 235
Table 8.6: Correlation Matrix 236
Table 8.7: Means, Standard Deviations and Ranges of STS 237
Table 8.8: STS Percentiles and Interpretations 238
Table 8.9: Linear Regression Model with STS as Dependent Variable 239
Table 8.10: Mean, Standard Deviations and Ranges of STS Sub-Scales 240
Table 9.1: Regression Model with Vicarious Trauma as the Dependant Variable 251
Table 9.2: Quotations to Illustrate Vicarious Trauma 256
Table 9.3: Regression Model with Compassion Satisfaction as the Dependant Variable 263
Table 9.4: Regression Model with Burnout as the Dependent Variable ............................................. 268
Table 9.5: Regression Model with Burnout as the Dependent Variable ............................................. 274
Table 10.1: Linear Regression Model with Coping as Dependent Variable ........................................ 300
Table 10.2: Coping Resources and Strategies Identified by Interview Participants .............................. 305
Table 10.3: Interview Participants’ Views on Attending Counselling as a Coping Resource ............... 311
Table 10.4: Regression Model with Resilience as the Dependent Variable ..................................... 324
Table 10.5: Mean Resilience Sub-Scale Scores .................................................................................... 325
Table 10.6: Factors Identified As Contributing To Personal Resilience .......................................... 328
Table 11.1: Internal Reliability of Construct Dimensions ..................................................................... 341
Table 11.2: Hierarchical Regression Model with Vicarious Trauma (Self) as Dependent Variable ... 344
Table 11.3: Hierarchical Regression Model with Vicarious Trauma (Other) as Dependent Variable 345
Table 11.4: Hierarchical Regression with Burnout as the Dependent Variable .................................. 347
Table 11.5: Effects Decomposition of Vicarious Trauma (Self) Structural Equation Model ............ 353
Table 11.6: Effects decomposition of vicarious trauma (other) structural equation model .............. 355
Table 11.7: Summary of Moderation Model Findings ........................................................................ 357
Table 11.8: Moderation of Coping on the Traumatic Stress Exposure and Vicarious Trauma (Self) Relationship ........................................................................................................ 358
Table 11.9: Moderation of Coping on the Resilience and Burnout Relationship ............................. 360
LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1.1: The Stages of the Research Process ............................................................................ 12
Figure 2.1: Hudnall Stamm’s (1999) Conceptualization of Traumatic Stress .............................. 24
Figure 2.2: Creation of Compassion Satisfaction or Compassion Fatigue (Radney & Figley, 2007, p. 208) ........................................................................................................................................ 49
Figure 2.3: Hudnall Stamm’s (2010) Conceptual Framework of Compassion Fatigue .................. 50
Figure 3.1: Figley’s (1995) Model of Coping and Trauma Transmission ...................................... 63
Figure 3.2: Meisenhelder and Marcum’s (2008) Relationship of Stress, Trauma and Spiritual Outcomes ........................................................................................................................................ 82
Figure 7.1: Reflexive Questions: Triangulated Inquiry (Patton, 2002, p.66) .................................. 63
Figure 7.2: Representation of Formative-Type Structure Used in Thesis ..................................... 201
Figure 8.1: Diagrammatic Representation of the Concurrent Triangulation Design ...................... 212
Figure 8.2: Area of Social Work, Sex and Race of Participants .................................................... 214
Figure 8.3: Map of South Africa Depicting Participants’ Geographical Location ......................... 216
Figure 8.4: The Universities Where Survey Participants had Studied ......................................... 217
Figure 8.5: Fields of Social Work where Participants had Worked Prior to Joining SAPS .............. 218
Figure 8.6: Survey Participants’ Examples of Traumatic Cases Dealt with in the Past Six Months 221
Figure 8.7: STS Symptoms Experienced Occasionally, Often or Always by the Participants ........ 242
Figure 9.1: Interpretation of TABS T-Scores .............................................................................. 250
Figure 9.2: Average TABS Self Sub-Scale Scores ....................................................................... 253
Figure 9.3: Average TABS Other Sub-Scale Scores ..................................................................... 254
Figure 9.4: Levels of Compassion Satisfaction .......................................................................... 262
Figure 9.5: Levels of Burnout .................................................................................................. 267
Figure 9.6: Work Environment Scale Total Scores ..................................................................... 273
Figure 9.7: WES Standard Sub-Scale Scores ........................................................................... 276
Figure 9.8: WES Sub-Scales Depicting Relationship Dimension Standard Scores ..................... 277
Figure 9.9: WES Sub-Scales Depicting the Personal Growth Dimension ..................................... 282
Figure 9.10: WES Sub-Scales Depicting the System Maintenance and Change Dimension ........ 288
Figure 9.11: Participants’ Recommendations to SAPS ............................................................... 292
Figure 10.1: Mean Total Standard Coping Scores ..................................................................... 297
Figure 10.2: Mean Standard Sub-Scale Coping Scores ............................................................. 298
Figure 10.3: Coping Strategies Identified by Interview Participants ............................................ 304
Figure 10.4: Resilience Scores of the Participants ........................................323
Figure 10.5: Mean Resilience Sub-Scale Results ........................................326
Figure 10.6: Resilience Themes Analysed Through Wagnild’s Resilience Characteristics ........330
Figure 10.7: Box Chart Showing Participants’ Resilience Score and their Perceptions of their Resilience ...............................................................333
Figure 10.8: Survey Participants’ Suggested Strategies to Reduce Secondary Traumatisation ....336
Figure 11.1: A Model of Secondary Trauma and Vicarious Trauma .............................349
Figure 11.2: Final Path Analysis (Standardised Paths) for Vicarious Trauma (Self) ............352
Figure 11.3: Final Path Analysis (Standardised Paths) for Vicarious Trauma (Other) .........354
Figure 11.4: Moderation of Coping on the Traumatic Stress and Vicarious Trauma (Self) Relationship .................................................................359
Figure 11.5: Moderation of Coping on the Burnout and Resilience Relationship ...............361
## Abbreviations Used in the Study

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Full Form</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AIDS</td>
<td>Acquired Immunodeficiency Syndrome</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ANC</td>
<td>African National Congress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AZAPO</td>
<td>Azanian Peoples Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BPP</td>
<td>Brief Psychodynamic Psychotherapy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CBT</td>
<td>Cognitive Behavioural Therapy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CF</td>
<td>Compassion Fatigue</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CISD</td>
<td>Critical Incident Stress Debriefing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COSATU</td>
<td>Congress of South African Trade Unions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CPTSD</td>
<td>Complex Posttraumatic Stress Disorder</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CR</td>
<td>Cognitive Restructuring</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CRS</td>
<td>Coping Resources Scale</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CS</td>
<td>Compassion Satisfaction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CTS</td>
<td>Continuous Traumatic Stress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CT</td>
<td>Counter-Transference</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CUSA</td>
<td>Council of Unions of South Africa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DSD</td>
<td>Department of Social Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DSM</td>
<td>Diagnostic and Statistical Manual</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EAP</td>
<td>Employee Assistance Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EAPA</td>
<td>Employee Assistance Professionals Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EHWP</td>
<td>Employee Health and Wellness Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ET</td>
<td>Exposure Therapy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FOSATU</td>
<td>Federation of South African Trade Unions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FSW</td>
<td>Forensic Social Work/er</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GEAR</td>
<td>Growth, Employment and Redistribution Policy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HIV</td>
<td>Human Immunodeficiency Virus</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICU</td>
<td>Industrial and Commercial Workers Union</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IFP</td>
<td>Inkatha Freedom Party</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IFSW</td>
<td>International Federation of Social Workers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IMF</td>
<td>International Monetary Fund</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IPID</td>
<td>Independent Police Investigative Directorate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NEDLAC</td>
<td>National Economic Development and Labour Council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abbr.</td>
<td>Description</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OAP</td>
<td>Occupational Alcohol Programmes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OSW</td>
<td>Occupational Social Work/er</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PCBP</td>
<td>Personnel Capacity Building Programmes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PD</td>
<td>Psychological Debriefing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PSWS</td>
<td>Police Social Work</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PTS</td>
<td>Posttraumatic Stress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PTSD</td>
<td>Posttraumatic Stress Disorder</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>POPCRU</td>
<td>Police and Prisons Civil Rights Union</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PRoQOL</td>
<td>Professional Quality of Life Scale</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RDP</td>
<td>Reconstruction and Development Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RS</td>
<td>Resilience Scale</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SA</td>
<td>South Africa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SACP</td>
<td>South African Communist Party</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SAP</td>
<td>South African Police</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SAPS</td>
<td>South African Police Service</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SACSSP</td>
<td>South African Council for Social Service Professions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SATLC</td>
<td>South African Trade and Labour Council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SACTU</td>
<td>South African Congress of Trade Unions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SOC</td>
<td>Sense of Coherence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ST</td>
<td>Shared Trauma</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STS</td>
<td>Secondary Traumatic Stress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STSS</td>
<td>Secondary Traumatic Stress Scale</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STPPG</td>
<td>Shared Traumatic and Professional Posttraumatic Growth</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STS</td>
<td>Secondary Traumatic Stress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SW</td>
<td>Social Work</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TABS</td>
<td>Trauma and Attachment Belief Scale</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UDF</td>
<td>United Democratic Front</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VT</td>
<td>Vicarious Trauma</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WES</td>
<td>Work Environment Scale</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>