DECLARATION

I submit this research report in fulfilment of the requirements for the Degree of Master of Science at the University of the Witwatersrand. I declare that, apart from the assistance acknowledged, this research is my own unaided work. All sources that I have used or quoted have been acknowledged by means of complete citation and referencing. I further declare that I have not submitted this research report for any other degree or examination at any other university.

Tholani Tshuma

3rd day of November 2016
ABSTRACT

This research explores the potential influence of Life Sciences teacher curriculum support materials on unscientific ideas about evolution by natural selection. The Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statement document, seven learner Life Sciences textbooks and their seven teacher guides were investigated by content analysis to find out firstly, the nature and extent of misconceptions about evolution; secondly, the nature and extent of latent problems associated with the topic of evolution; thirdly, the extent to which the Grade 12 Life Sciences textbooks pointed out common misconceptions and went on to provide the correct scientific explanations to counter the misconceptions; and fourthly, the extent to which teacher guides address teachers’ pedagogical content knowledge (PCK) for teaching the topic of evolution by a) pointing out common misconceptions; b) providing the correct science to counter a specific misconception; c) pointing out pre-requisite knowledge which ought to be learnt first in order to understand the topic of evolution; d) pointing out typical difficulties students encounter when learning the topic of evolution. The Grade 10 and 11 textbooks and teacher guides were analysed for fragmentation and sequencing by use of a checklist.

The results show the presence of manifest errors and latent problems in the CAPS document, textbooks and teacher guides. The CAPS document had one manifest error and five instances of latent problems. The section on alternatives to evolution was judged to be a manifest error because religious ideas are not regarded as science by the scientific community. The manifest error found in the CAPS document was also found in the textbooks and teacher guides. Frequent manifest errors occurred in the textbooks, averaging 11 per publisher. The CAPS document had fragmented evolution ideas and probably because textbook authors use this document to write their books, the evolution content in textbooks was also found to be fragmented. Whilst some of the teacher guides were found to address the issue of teacher PCK for teaching the topic of evolution in different ways, some of them were found to be deficient in that respect.

The presence of latent problems across all the three curriculum support materials investigated is a cause for concern. Latent problems are problematic if not handled with care because they pose a risk of being misinterpreted, and this may in turn cause the development of evolution misconceptions.

An investigation of whether the unscientific evolution ideas in the curriculum documents actually influenced learners’ evolution ideas was not part of this study. However, because textbooks are generally considered as authoritative sources of knowledge upon which teachers and students rely, the presence of misconceptions in these curriculum support materials poses a risk that users of such documents could pick up these misconceptions during teaching and learning.

The study highlights the need for a multifaceted approach involving all relevant stakeholders (teachers, authors, publishers and the Department of Education officials) working together in an attempt to address the problem of evolution misconceptions in the Life Sciences curriculum support materials.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

My greatest appreciation goes to the following:

My supervisor, Professor Martie Sanders, for her passion and dedication which has been a great inspiration to me. I am also grateful for her expert and professional guidance and unwavering support throughout my research.

The Department of Animal Plant and Environmental studies for providing work facilities for the project.

The Biology Research Group of Martie Sanders for financial support towards this project.
DEDICATION

This work is dedicated to my twin boy and girl Mhabisi and Sthabiso born at a time when I was busy with this project.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

Declaration................................................................................................................................. i  
Abstract....................................................................................................................................... ii  
Acknowledgements....................................................................................................................... iii  
Dedication......................................................................................................................................... iv  
Table of Contents .............................................................................................................................. v  
List of Tables ..................................................................................................................................... x  
List of Figures .................................................................................................................................... xi  
List of Appendices............................................................................................................................ xii  

## CHAPTER 1: Context of, and motivation for, the study........................................................... 1  
### 1.1 BACKGROUND TO THE STUDY ...................................................................................... 1  
#### 1.1.1 Reasons for the inclusion of evolution in biology courses ........................................... 1  
- Evolution provides an explanatory framework for understanding biology.......................... 2  
- Evolution is a unifying theme across many sciences subjects.............................................. 2  
- Applications of evolution theory underpin many technological advances......................... 3  
- Knowledge of evolution is important for scientific literacy................................................. 4  
#### 1.1.2 Evolution in the South African school curriculum ....................................................... 4  
- Terminology used in the South African school curriculum................................................... 5  
- Evolution in the General Education and Training (GET) band............................................ 6  
- Evolution in the Further Education and Training (FET) band............................................ 8  
### 1.2 PROBLEMS MOTIVATING THE STUDY ....................................................................... 10  
#### 1.2.1 Many learners have misconceptions about evolution, which impact on further learning 10  
#### 1.2.2 Many teachers have misconceptions about evolution................................................... 12  
#### 1.2.3 South African curriculum support documents contain misconceptions about evolution 12  
### 1.3 AIM OF THE STUDY ....................................................................................................... 13  
### 1.4 THE RESEARCH QUESTIONS ........................................................................................ 13  
### 1.5 THE MISCONCEPTIONS TERMINOLOGY ISSUE .......................................................... 14  
#### 1.5.1 Efforts to understand the terminology issue............................................................... 14  
#### 1.5.2 Terminology for this study........................................................................................ 15  
### 1.6 THE VALUE OF THE STUDY .......................................................................................... 15  
### 1.7 THE STRUCTURE OF THIS DISSERTATION ................................................................ 15  

## CHAPTER 2: The conceptual framework for the study........................................................... 17  
### 2.1 CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORKS ......................................................................................... 17  
#### 2.1.1 Definition and characteristics of conceptual frameworks............................................. 17  
#### 2.1.2 Purpose of conceptual frameworks............................................................................. 19  
#### 2.1.3 Finding a conceptual framework for research studies.................................................. 19  
### 2.2 OVERVIEW OF THE CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK FOR THIS STUDY.......................... 20
CHAPTER 4: Results and discussion ................................................................. 81

4.1 ANALYSIS OF THE CAPS DOCUMENT AND TEXTBOOKS ........................................... 81

4.1.1 Manifest errors ......................................................................................... 81

Scientistically incorrect ideas associated with religious beliefs ...................... 82
Scientistically incorrect ideas associated with the mechanisms of evolution ....... 83
Scientistically incorrect ideas associated with the nature of science ................ 87

4.1.2 Latent problems ....................................................................................... 87

Unsatisfactory explanations in the CAPS document and the textbooks ............. 88
Poorly explained ............................................................................................. 88
Misleading wording ....................................................................................... 88
CHAPTER 5: Conclusions and recommendations ................................................................. 111
  5.1 APPRAISING THE STUDY ...................................................................................... 111
  5.1.1 Strengths of the study ..................................................................................... 112
  5.1.2 Limitations of the study ................................................................................ 113
  5.2 SUMMARY OF THE KEY FINDINGS AND INSIGHTS FROM THIS STUDY ............ 113
  5.2.1 Frequencies of manifest errors in the CAPS document, textbooks and teacher guides ........................................................................................................... 113
  5.2.2 Frequencies of latent problems in the CAPS document, textbooks and teacher guides ........................................................................................................ 114
  5.2.3 Teacher guides addressing teachers’ PCK ......................................................... 116
  5.3 POTENTIAL SIGNIFICANCE OF THIS STUDY .................................................... 117
  5.3.1 Potential importance, and recommendations for curriculum designers ............ 117
  5.3.2 Potential importance, and recommendations for publishers and textbooks writers ................................................................................................................. 117
  5.3.3 Potential importance, and recommendations for other teachers, and me as a classroom practitioner ............................................................................ 118
  5.3.4 Potential importance, and recommendations for Department of Education officials .... 119
  5.3.5 Potential importance, and recommendations for other researchers .................... 119

Incomplete explanations ........................................................................................................ 89
Teleological statements ......................................................................................................... 89
Anthropomorphic statements ............................................................................................... 90
Use of ‘risk terms’ in the CAPS document and the textbooks ........................................... 90
Euphemisms ......................................................................................................................... 91
Metaphors ........................................................................................................................... 92
Paradoxical jargon ................................................................................................................ 93
Use of specific risk terms .................................................................................................... 94
Fragmentation and sequencing in the CAPS document and the textbooks ......................... 96
Fragmentation ..................................................................................................................... 96
Sequencing .......................................................................................................................... 99

4.1.3 Textbooks addressing the problem of misconceptions ............................................ 100

4.2 ANALYSIS OF TEACHER GUIDES ............................................................................ 101
  4.2.1 Manifest problems ............................................................................................... 102
  4.2.2 Latent problems .................................................................................................. 104
    Unsatisfactory explanations ......................................................................................... 104
    Poorly explained statements ....................................................................................... 105
    The use of ‘risk terms’ ............................................................................................. 105
  4.2.3 Teacher PCK for teaching evolution ..................................................................... 106
    Pointing out common misconceptions about evolution ............................................ 107
    Pointing out common difficulties ............................................................................. 108
    Best teaching strategies for the topic of evolution ................................................... 109
    Inappropriate advice for the teacher ......................................................................... 109

4.3 CONCLUDING REMARKS .......................................................................................... 110

5.2.3 Teacher guides addressing teachers’ PCK ............................................................. 111

5.2.1 Frequencies of manifest errors in the CAPS document, textbooks and teacher guides ........................................................................................................... 113

5.2.2 Frequencies of latent problems in the CAPS document, textbooks and teacher guides ........................................................................................................ 114

5.2.3 Teacher guides addressing teachers’ PCK ............................................................. 116

5.3 POTENTIAL SIGNIFICANCE OF THIS STUDY .................................................... 117
  5.3.1 Potential importance, and recommendations for curriculum designers ............ 117
  5.3.2 Potential importance, and recommendations for publishers and textbooks writers ................................................................................................................. 117
  5.3.3 Potential importance, and recommendations for other teachers, and me as a classroom practitioner ............................................................................ 118
  5.3.4 Potential importance, and recommendations for Department of Education officials .... 119
  5.3.5 Potential importance, and recommendations for other researchers .................... 119
5.3.6 Filling a research gap ........................................................................................................... 120

5.4 RECOMMENDATIONS FOR FURTHER RESEARCH .................................................................. 121

5.5 CONCLUDING REMARKS ........................................................................................................ 121

REFERENCE LIST .......................................................................................................................... 123
LIST OF TABLES

Table 1a: Changes in the evolution-related content in the GET band in the South African curriculum................................................................. 7
Table 1b: Changes in the evolution-related content in the FET band in the South African curriculum.......................................................... 8
Table 2: The extent of misconceptions about evolution in 22 studies reviewed at primary and high school level..................................................... 32
Table 3a: Problems identified in science textbooks in different countries ............................................................... 38
Table 3b: Problems (evolution-related) identified in textbooks in different countries................................................................. 39
Table 4. Documents used for analysis ........................................................................................................................................... 61
Table 5a. Coding system for manifest errors ........................................................................................................................................ 65
Table 5b. Language-related coding system for latent issues (unsatisfactory explanations and risk terms).................................................................................. 67
Table 5c. Coding system for fragmentation and sequencing matters........................................................................................................... 68
Table 5d. Coding system for checking what textbooks include to address common misconceptions........................................................................ 69
Table 5e. Coding system for checking whether teacher guides provided ‘feedback on tasks and activities’ in learner books that helped address evolution misconceptions ............................................................................. 69
Table 5f. Coding system for checking what textbooks include to address common misconceptions........................................................................ 71
Table 5g. Coding system for the prerequisite knowledge for understanding evolution by natural selection........................................................................................................... 72
Table 6. Checklist for PCK in the teacher guides ........................................................................................................................................ 74
Table 7. Logical sequencing of evolution topics by two experts (university lecturers) ........................................................................................ 77
Table 8. Frequency of manifest errors in textbooks and the CAPS document.................................................................................................... 84
Table 9a. Frequencies of unsatisfactory explanations in the textbooks and CAPS document ................................................................. 88
Table 9b. Frequencies of use of risk terms found in the textbooks and CAPS document................................................................. 91
Table 9c. Fragmentation of evolution topics in the CAPS document across the three grades.................................................................................. 97
Table 9d. Frequencies of ‘links’ problems in the textbooks and the CAPS document.......................................................................................... 98
Table 10. Frequencies of what textbooks have to help address evolution misconception .................................................................................. 100
Table 11a. Unscientific evolution ideas found the 7 teacher guides .............................................................................................................. 103
Table 11b. Frequencies of unsatisfactory explanations found in the teacher guides ........................................................................................ 104
Table 11c. ‘Risk terms’ found the teacher guides ................................................................................................................................. 104
Table 11d. ‘Risk terms’ found the teacher guides ................................................................................................................................. 106
Table 12. How teacher guides helped teachers with PCK for teaching the topic of evolution........................................................................ 107
# LIST OF FIGURES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Figure 1</td>
<td>Overview of Chapter 1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 2</td>
<td>Acquisition of knowledge (based on diSessa, 1993)</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 3</td>
<td>Overview of Chapter 2</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 4</td>
<td>Conceptual framework for the study</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 5</td>
<td>Categorising knowledge about the world</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 6</td>
<td>Curriculum types and slippages (source Goodlad, et al., 1979)</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 7</td>
<td>The curriculum support materials as a catalyst for teaching analogy (Ottevanger, 2001)</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 8</td>
<td>Shulman’s categories and subcategories of content knowledge (Shulman, 1986)</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 9</td>
<td>Categories of PCK, based on Shuman’s ideas but hierarchically re-arranged by Sanders (2008)</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 10</td>
<td>Research design for the study</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 11</td>
<td>Steps followed to gather and report data</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 12</td>
<td>Categories used in the coding system</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 13</td>
<td>Other codes added to the teacher guides coding system</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 14</td>
<td>Extract from the data-capture instrument for the CAPS curriculum document</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 15</td>
<td>Extract from the data-capture instrument for textbooks</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 16</td>
<td>Overview of Chapter 4</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 17</td>
<td>Overview of Chapter 5</td>
<td>115</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
LIST OF APPENDICES

Appendix A: Timeline on curriculum changes in South Africa, from Mahomed (2004), with details after 2008 added

Appendix B: Summary CAPS Natural Sciences, Technology and Social Sciences evolution content (shaded) and associated concepts (unshaded)

Appendix C: Modification of the Honours coding system to suit this Masters study

Appendix D: Check list for analysing teacher guides as a potential source of erroneous ideas about evolution

Appendix E: Details of ideas investigated by the checklist for PCK in the teacher guides

Appendix F: Checklist used to investigate fragmentation and sequencing in textbooks

Appendix G: Sequence of teaching evolution topics according to the three AAA maps

Appendix H: Fragmentation and sequencing of evolution and evolution-related content in the Grade 10 to 12 Life Sciences textbooks on the Department of Education approved list