LEADING CHANGE IN THE CAPRICORN DISTRICT MUNICIPALITY

Magobotla Daniel Kganakga
421894

A research report submitted to the Faculty of Commerce, Law and Management, University of Witwatersrand in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Master in Public and Development Management.

Johannesburg

September 2014
ABSTRACT
Leading change in the Capricorn District Municipality (CDM) has been confronted with pressures of considering new mechanisms and strategies to deal with the imperatives of meeting service delivery targets as reflected in the Integrated Development Plan of the CDM. The devolution of water services and environmental health services functions to the municipality respectively meant that the municipality needed to reposition itself in order to respond to these emerging imperatives. In response, the CDM undertook a number of studies with the aim of developing an institutional development plan/road map. Following a qualitative paradigm, this study sought to investigate the factors that led to the unsuccessful implementation of several change management processes in the municipality.

The study revealed that the recommendations of previously undertaken change management interventions were not implemented. Findings also revealed that there was a need for a change management framework to support change processes within the municipality. These issues found resonance in the approaches and models of leadership proposed by the researcher. These findings will then be juxtaposed with the lessons from Kotter's Leading Change (1996) and Kouzes & Posner's The Leadership Challenge: How to Get Extraordinary Things Done (1997). These two models are recommended as lessons that should be followed for successful implementation of change interventions. Highlights of the best practice on the African continent and internationally are given as lessons for leading change in the CDM.
DECLARATION
I declare that this research report is my own work. It is submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements of the degree of Master of Public and Development Management at the University of Johannesburg. It has not been submitted before for any degree or examination at any other University.

_________________
M.D. Kganakga
26 September 2014
DEDICATION

This report is dedicated to my beloved wife Dineo Phillipa Kganakga, through whom I have learnt the importance of love and sacrifice. I shall forever be grateful for her presence in my life. Her unconditional love, commitment to our family, resilience, strength, sense of direction, patience and understanding as well as clarity of thought have inspired me to finish my thesis.

In addition, the thesis is also dedicated to my mother Mary Metja Kganakga whose efforts to raise me and my siblings never wavered amidst all challenges she went through to put us through school. “Setjoamadi” your efforts have paid off. Thanks to God for her life!
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Praise the Lord! “All things work together for good” (Romans, 8:28).

I would like give gratitude and thanks to the following people for their support during these trying times when compiling this report:

**My Spiritual Parents:** Apostle and Prophetess Nkuna, thank you for breathing purpose into my life. Without you labouring over my life I would have never comprehended that “to them God willed to make known what are the riches of the glory of this mystery among Gentiles: which is Christ in you the hope of glory” (Colossians, 1:27).

**My family:** My beloved wife Dineo and my super hero son Mashupa Dzunisani for their love and support through and through! My son whose formative years were stolen by my absence as I went to my contact sessions/classes far away in Johannesburg and my beloved wife who made sure that our home remains intact and warm at all times. Lastly to Sesi Jeannie our housekeeper thanks to her for standing in our gap when it was impossible for my wife and I to bath or feed Mashupa.

**My supervisor:** Dr Matshabaphala: Thank you so much for your motivating efforts, patience, guidance and accommodation. So great to reconnect again from our previous interactions in the Non-Governmental Sector. Your oratory teachings and knowledge on the leadership subject inspires me to do even greater things.

**P & DM Staff:** All of you thanks for your support during my time at the University. Special mention goes to Ntomboxolo Currie, Sam More and Matome Ramokgolo whose help and support made the cold winters on campus and long classes bearable and worthwhile.

**Research participants:** Thanks for giving me your precious time to answer my questions and being available for interviews.

**Classmates:** To all of you from different walks of life across Africa and abroad, thank you for an enriching experience and for your contribution to my own personal development that came out of a lot of robust debates. *As for Tania & Regi you guys rock!*
TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABSTRACT ............................................................................................................................. ii
DECLARATION ....................................................................................................................... iii
DEDICATION ........................................................................................................................ iv
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS ....................................................................................................... v
ABBREVIATIONS .................................................................................................................. ix
List of Diagrams...................................................................................................................... xi
Tables  xii

CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION ....................................................................................... 1
1. Introduction ....................................................................................................................... 1
1.1 Best practices of local government change: global context ........................................... 2
1.2 Best practice of leading change in local government: African and Southern African context ...... 8
1.2.1 The Enablers and Disablers of Leadership for Transformational Change in Africa......... 11
1.2.2 Africa Transformation – Ready: The Strategic Application of Information and Communication Technology (ICT) to Climate Change Adaptation in Africa................................. 12
1.3 Best practice of leading change in local government: South African context ................. 18
1.4 Best practice of leading change in local government: Limpopo Province context .......... 23
1.5 Capricorn District Municipality .................................................................................... 26
   Map 1: Locality of the Capricorn District Municipality ...................................................... 27
1.6 Background ................................................................................................................... 32
1.7 Problem statement ....................................................................................................... 33
1.8 Purpose of the research ............................................................................................... 33
1.9 Research questions ...................................................................................................... 33
1.10 Significance of the study ........................................................................................... 34
1.11 Overview of the research study .................................................................................. 34

CHAPTER TWO: LITERATURE REVIEW ............................................................................. 36
2. Introduction ....................................................................................................................... 36
2.1 Significance of literature review .................................................................................... 36
2.2 Change management .................................................................................................... 39
2.3 Organisational transformational change ....................................................................... 42
2.4 Strategic change management ..................................................................................... 46
2.5 Business process reengineering .................................................................................. 47
2.6 TQM versus BPR ....................................................................................................... 50
2.7 Kotter’s leading change model ..................................................................................... 53
4.2.2 Trends in leading change in the CDM ................................................................. 92
4.2.3 Strategies for consideration in leading change in the CDM .............................. 96
4.3 Conclusion ............................................................................................................. 97

CHAPTER FIVE: INTERPRETATION AND ANALYSIS OF FINDINGS ....................... 98
5. Introduction ............................................................................................................. 98
5.1 INTERPRETATION AND ANALYSIS OF KEY THEMES ........................................... 99
5.1.1 Factors leading to the problems being experienced in leading change in the CDM ....... 99
5.1.2 Trends in leading change in the CDM ................................................................. 101
5.1.3 Strategies for consideration in leading change in the CDM .............................. 103
5.2 Kouzes and Posner’s Leadership Challenge Model and Kotter’s Leading Change: Why Transformations Efforts Fail Model: Models for Consideration .................. 105
5.2.1 Transforming CDM through Kotter’s Model and Kouzes and Posner’s Model ....... 108
5.3 CONCLUSION ..................................................................................................... 112

CHAPTER SIX: CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS ...................................... 113
6.1 Research questions .............................................................................................. 113
6.2 Summary of research findings and analysis ......................................................... 113
6.2.1 Research Question 1 ..................................................................................... 113
6.2.2 Research Question 2 .................................................................................... 114
6.2.3. Research Question 3 ................................................................................ 115
6.4 Conclusion ........................................................................................................... 117
6.5 Recommendations .............................................................................................. 118
6.5.1 Leading change in the Capricorn District Municipality ....................................... 118
6.5.2 Leading change in local government: Limpopo Province Context ......................... 119
6.5.3 Leading change in local government: South African Context ............................... 121
6.5.4 Leading change in local government: African, SADC and global contexts ............ 121
6.6 Conclusion ........................................................................................................... 122

REFERENCES ............................................................................................................. 123
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Full Form</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>OECD</td>
<td>Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DAs</td>
<td>Development Agencies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ALCRL</td>
<td>Albert Luthuli Centre for Responsible Leadership</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICTs</td>
<td>Information Communication Technologies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MDGs</td>
<td>Millennium Development Goals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NEPAD</td>
<td>New Partnership Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MACRA</td>
<td>Malawi Communication Regulation Authority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RSA</td>
<td>Republic of South Africa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SOHO</td>
<td>South Africa’s History Online</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LED</td>
<td>Local Economic Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IDP</td>
<td>Integrated Development Plan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IDeP</td>
<td>Institutional Development Plan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SALGA</td>
<td>South African Local Government Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CoGHSTA</td>
<td>Cooperative Governance, Human Settlements and Traditional Affairs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CoGTA</td>
<td>Cooperative Governance and Traditional Affairs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EEDBS</td>
<td>Enhanced Extended Discount Benefit Scheme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MEC</td>
<td>Member of Executive Cabinet</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LGTAS</td>
<td>Local Government Turnaround Strategy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CDM</td>
<td>Capricorn District Municipality</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MSA</td>
<td>Municipal Systems Act</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UA</td>
<td>University of Adelaide</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abbreviation</td>
<td>Description</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OD</td>
<td>Organisational Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EDR</td>
<td>Enterprise Development Roadmap</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DWAF</td>
<td>Department of Water Affairs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DoH</td>
<td>Department of Health</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ODDST</td>
<td>Organisational Diagnostic Survey</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSFs</td>
<td>Critical Success Factors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T.A.S.K</td>
<td>Tuned Assessment of Skills and Knowledge</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BPR</td>
<td>Business Process Re-engineering</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TQM</td>
<td>Total Quality Management</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
List of Diagrams

Diagram 1  CDM Geographical Space Dispersion
Diagram 2  Top Structure of CDM
Diagram 3  The Burke Litwin Model
Diagram 4  Individual Change Journey
Diagram 5  The Process Re-engineering Model
Diagram 6  The BPR Model
Diagram 7  Kotter's Eight Step Change Model
Diagram 8  Framework for Research – the interconnectedness of worldview, design and research methods
Diagram 9  Institutional/Organisational Development Approach
Tables
Table A  Tabular Illustration of Development Agencies as Change Agents
Table B  Employment Status as per Occupational Category as at March 2013
Table C  TQM vs. BPR by Bergman & Klefsjö
Table D  Five Practices of Exemplary Leadership
Table E  Alignment of Lewin’s Change Model & Kotter’s Eight steps for leading change
Table F  Transforming CDM through a juxtaposition of Kouzes and Posner’s and Kotter’s Models
Table G  Kouzes and Posner’s and Kotter’s models
CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION

1. Introduction

During the 1980s and the 1990s most, if not all, municipal administrations throughout the world were subjected to a series of structural and organisational reforms (Dollery, Garcea and LeSage Jr., 2008). The mid-1990s brought structural reorganisation to local authorities in Scotland, Wales and parts of England (Stewart, 1988). Hegewisch and Larsen (1996), as well as Halligan (2003 as cited in Dollery et al. 2008), point out that the municipal reforms of the past two decades have often coincided with reforms to other components of the national and sub-national governance systems. The most notable of these have been the public management reforms at the national and sub-national levels of government.

According to Dollery and Robotti (2008), in most advanced countries, contemporary local government arose from historical “accident” rather than by deliberate design, and its subsequent evolution represents the outcome of constitutional reform, legislative change, political opportunism, popular agitation, technological progress, urbanisation and a host of many other incidental influences. Stewart (1998), maintains that no local authority, however, can escape the need to keep under continuous review its political and managerial structures and processes. To varying degrees, almost all councils are caught up in far-reaching changes of one nature or another.

According to Newman (1996), many studies have emphasised that leading change must be seen as a collective and multifaceted process because of there is no particular example of leadership in local government. However, leadership in local government is fundamentally from other spheres of governance different because of the pivotal importance of the officer or member relationship, and because of the divisionalised form of most local authorities. The extensive literature on administrative reforms underlines the ongoing modernisation, minimisation and marketisation of the public sector in recent decades, and the infusion of private sector management techniques into public organisation (Van Der Voet, 2013, citing Hood, 1991; Pollit and Bouckaert, 2004; Kickert, 2007; Bekkers, Edelenbos and Steijn, 2011).
All these developments ultimately result in changes in public organisations and the behaviour of employees. Despite the prevalence of change in public management research, there is relatively little attention on the way organisational change in public organisations is implemented (Steward and Kringas, 2003 and Kickert, 2010 in Van Der Voet, 2013). Wiseman (2002, as cited by Van Der Voet, 2013) argues that many government organisations are occupied with the implementation of public management reform which is underpinned by a managerial logic through which government organisations should be based more on business-like values, rather than Weberian, bureaucratic principals. The research

1.1 Best practices of local government change: global context
According to Halfani (1997 in Swilling, 1997), the impetus for change in the 1990s was triggered by the global wave of political and economic reforms in the major urban centres. Urban systems are compelled to bear the major burden of globalisation, and new patterns of accumulation require a re-orientation by the institutions and factors of production in order to facilitate the production and the export of goods and to attract external investments. The hunt for the best institutional activities to support profitable growth has been an important mission for the state at the level of municipalities and their strategic stakeholders for a number of years (Mountford, 2009).

With the many forms of worldwide change have also emerged a series of problems, ranging from environmental pollution and degradation to global warming and overpopulation, the latter of which has led in many instances to poverty, crime, disease and ethnic strife (Serfontein, 2006 citing Carnall, 1995; Korsten, 1995).

Globally, scores of municipalities, provincial and nationwide governments have pursued organisational improvements in the previous two decades to come up with new mechanisms to address challenges in local government. This has led to the creation of developmental agencies (DAs) and comparable organisations whose specific purpose is facilitating development plans (Mountford, 2009). Mountford (2009) shows that in the OECD countries, an array of municipalities, provincial and central governments decided to put certain, or most, of their local profitable programs be managed by suitably structured corporations as opposed to running such activities in the broader municipal arrangement.
According to Mountford (2009,) these profitable interventions are considered to be best placed managed in a corporate environment than in a municipality. It is generally acknowledged that economic development may best be delivered through a corporate rather than in a municipality. DAs and their methods are viewed as valuable in the implementation of economic development approaches as they are able to:

- Combine incongruent economic development efforts in a single organisation that can create proficiency and usually has a reputable success rate;
- Enhance the tempo of the city’s response to investment and developmental imperatives;
- Advance the degree of implementing numerous programmes and projects through speedy access of more assets;
- Gain the confidence of the potential investors in decision making procedures by ensuring that the city's representatives are of reputable character and standing;
- Employ effective ways to split costs and risks between the actors promoting development and investments;
- Develop mechanisms for value and benefit capture, enabling some of the incentives of economic development to be recycled within city budgets and programmes;
- Utilise redundant assets, such as in real estate or infrastructure, to ensure optimum utilisation and probably make them more profitable;
- Mobilise completely new investment sources and instruments through partnership with private sponsors;
- Ensure that the city’s key projects are more than ready to attract external investment;
- Improve the effective usage of land, property and opportunities for local investment as well as the coordination of disjointed jurisdictions;
- Enhanced promotion of the city or sub-region by addressing information gaps and asymmetries and building a clearer corporate image and identity; and provide clarity in as far as roles and responsibilities to promote the intricacies of local economic development.
According to Caufield (2006, in Dollery et al. 2008), the reforms to municipal governments and those of other levels of government were often related. The chief reason for this is that although municipality-focused reforms ostensibly sought to improve municipal systems of governance, management and service provision, in a number of instances they were also designed to improve broader service provision in each country.

It is against this background that the researcher decided to use the experiences of the OECD countries in their use of DAs in pursuing their development agendas as a case study for global best practice in facilitating change. A similar study by Mountford (2009) examined sixteen (16) different economic DAs and/or corporations from thirteen (13) cities across Europe, North America and the rest of the world. Some of these DAs are from highly developed cities or regions within the most advanced economies and others are from cities where major urban restructuring is underway. In this study, the researcher will only give a summarised account of six DAs and reflect on how they were used as change agents to propel local government agendas. These DAs were deliberately selected as, according to Mountford (2009) they were characterised by:

- Dissimilar financial status quo as well as all-embracing trade failure and fast paced fiscal growth;
- Dissimilar statutory contexts;
- Individual positions for municipalities and provincial government;
- Distinguishing spatial scales as well as city-wide, sub-regional, and wider economic spheres.

The researcher holds the view that these DAs were used as change agents and to improve local government mainly because they presented an opportunity for seamless reform without being subjected to the incapacitating bureaucratic characteristics of public institutions generally and local government in particular, which stifle organisational transformation.
According to the OECD’s Report on Restructuring Public Utilities for Competition (2001), the previous two decades of reform in OECD countries implemented essential changes in the space of competition in regulated network industries, which was additional motivation for the researcher’s choice.

Industries that before functioned as vertically-integrated and strictly regulated monopolies have, by a mixture of structural reforms and liberal regulatory controls, been opened to competition. Below is a summarised account (Table A) of how six DAs were used as change agents on a global scale.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name of DAs/City</th>
<th>Type of intervention</th>
<th>What did the DAs do</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><em>Barcelona Activa</em> – Barcelona</td>
<td>Crisis response mandate</td>
<td>It was able to speedily resolve the city’s economic crisis and to arrange different role-players to take urgent collective action. Intervened in a challenging encounter where there was no agency to handle the crisis.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>HafenCity Hamburg GmbH</em> – Hamburg</td>
<td>Special zone/un-served district mandate</td>
<td>It was able to pay particular attention to needs of an identified redevelopment area or major project, which did not include the rest of the municipality. It was able to bring about new a new proposal for a geographical area for which no other ‘ready’ governance structure existed.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Milano Metropoli</em> – Milan</td>
<td>Transparency mandate</td>
<td>Managed transparent processes for delivering monetary support and incentives to business and crucial resource allocation decisions, in a manner that was influenced by politics, and could be viewed as unbiased, and not the responsibility of politicians.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Name of DAs/City</td>
<td>Type of intervention</td>
<td>What did the DAs do</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Madrid Global – Madrid</td>
<td>Positioning and promotion mandate</td>
<td>Able to complete a corporate identity directed towards external clients for the city to promote and improving its appeal and attractiveness for external investment in a targeted manner. It was different from the public debate on how the area needs to be augmented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abyssinian Development Corporation and New York City Economic Development Corporation – New York</td>
<td>Leverage mandate</td>
<td>Achieved legal or economic status which permitted it to use a range of mechanisms, motivations, cash injections or share, management of assets and development programs that were not available for local governments.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Build Toronto and Invest Toronto – Toronto</td>
<td>Business interface mandate</td>
<td>Became more investor-oriented and business-like in its character than the municipal or government entity. Able to deal directly with potential sponsors and critical stakeholders in the property sector, provide services to private sector, management of money-making funds, and dealing directly with relevant stakeholders in business.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source: Mountford (2009, p.12 to p.13)*
1.2 Best practice of leading change in local government: African and Southern African context

During the last quarter of the twentieth century the African city has been characterised by a profound disjuncture between its demographic, economic, and political structures (Halfani, 1997 in Swilling, 1997). According to Swilling (1997), local government means a complex set of vertical and horizontal relations that are changing rapidly as a result of developments at the political, socio-economic, spatial and global levels.

Although world attention tends to focus on the South African democratisation process as this nation attempts to break from its apartheid past, no less remarkable changes are taking place in nations emerging from war (Angola, Mozambique, Eritrea), tribal conflict (Uganda and Sudan), centralised one party regimes (Zimbabwe, Zambia, Kenya), structural adjustment (Ghana, Ivory Coast, Egypt) and numerous other maladies that beset African societies.

Rwanda and Burundi had to address their own civil war challenges. According to Wolff (2006), the United Nations in Burundi, after a 1993 rebellion that murdered the first democratically elected Hutu president in a country by tradition controlled by its Tutsi minority, did well in stopping civil war of equally genocidal proportions to the one experienced in neighbouring Rwanda. Farah, Hussein and Lind (1992 cited in Lind and Sturman, 1992) indicate that, in the four decades of the Somali independence, the nation has been through more than ten years of civil war since 1991. In this time there were attempts, though unsuccessful to bring about ceasefire and harmony. Several changes in government leadership have not helped to further peace building and national reconciliation.

The Somalis who are typical nomads traditionally were introduced to agrarian and urban lifestyles by colonialism. Colonialism in Somalia came with other noteworthy changes like the growth of places like Mogadishu in the south and Hargeisa in the north. Mogadishu, Hargeisa, Kismayu and Baidoa served as centres of political and economic life for elites whose political interests were motivated by the need to defend their riches and their profitable dealings. These towns provided opportunities to generate and accumulate wealth.
The directive of leadership in these towns was changed from controlling of kinfolks and rights to controlling the access to water and grazing and decisively right of entry in the socio – political as well as the societal profits of government (Farah et al., 1992 in Lind and Sturman 1992). According to Dollery and Robbotti (2008), local governance in its broadest form predates the modern nation-state as it arose from the customs of local clans and tribes long before the emergence of the centralised state.

In most advanced countries, contemporary local government thus arose from historical “accidents” rather than by deliberate design, and its subsequent evolution represents the outcome of constitutional reform, legislative change, political opportunism, popular agitation, technological progress, urbanisation and a host of many other incidental influences.

Halfani (1997 in Swilling, 1997) argues that despite the historical differences in the institutional genealogy of municipal systems in the five sub-regions of Africa, none of the inherited urban management systems are working effectively.

The entire range of institutional traditions (Anglophone, Francophone, Lusophone) has proven to be unsuitable for handling the challenges of urban development during the previous quarter of the twentieth century. Halfani (1997) indicates that as Africa struggles with the inherent problems of rapid growth and acute poverty, its position in the global accumulation system is also deteriorating. Changes in global industrial production have drastically altered the international division of labour and dislocated what competitive advantages Africa may traditionally have had against other economies.

Halfani (1997, in Swilling 1997) states that the performance of municipal governments has not been impressive, even after numerous attempts at reform. Local authorities from Cape Town to Cairo and from Dar es Salaam to Dakar are battling with unstable and poor administrations with poor turnaround time in as far as service delivery is concerned.
This recurrent challenge is visible from the lack of confidence in municipalities by citizens and poor administrative capabilities. Onibokom (1995, cited by Halfani, 1997 in Swilling, 1997), lists political instability, unregulated inter-governmental relations, poor coordination, fiscal dependency, ineffective administration and limited private sector participation as common features of governance in Anglophone West Africa.

Dollery and Wallis (2001, in Dollery and Robbotti, 2008) argue that despite these problems, scholars from politics, legal fraternity, economic sector, government and sociology, have nonetheless sought to construct theoretical principles that can explain local government. They argue that development, whether global or local, starts with strategic thinking.

The objectives of the Millennium Development Goals and the New Partnership Development provide corrective measures to deal with the many and seemingly overwhelming challenges in Africa. In meeting these challenges Kauzya (2007) emphasises that the requirement for the need for human resources cannot be overestimated. Curristine, Lonti and Joumard (2007) argue that there is generally no practical blueprint for enhancing public sector efficiency in most of these societies and regions.

In examining best practice in leading continental change, the researcher used as a point of reference two distinct African studies, one being The Enablers and Disablers of Leadership for Transformational Change in Africa by the commissioned by the UONGOZI Institute, in partnership with the Albert Luthuli Centre for Responsible Leadership and the other being Africa Transformation – Ready: The Strategic Application of Information and Communication Technologies to Climate Change in Africa study commissioned by the African Development Bank, the World Bank and the African Union.
1.2.1 The Enablers and Disablers of Leadership for Transformational Change in Africa

According to this study, as quoted by the Africa Platform for Development Effectiveness (2014), African leadership is based on the foundation that leadership is vital in changing Africa’s ability to attain fair and viable social development. A further premise of African leadership is that current transformational opportunities can contribute aspects that either enable or disable leaders from facilitating or achieving sustainable change.

The Institute of African Leadership for Sustainable Development (UONGOZI Institute), in partnership with the Albert Luthuli Centre for Responsible Leadership (ALCRL) at the University of Pretoria, and its network of more than 50 researchers in more than ten African countries, commissioned a pilot project on African leadership in 2003. The project was aimed at strengthening and building continental leadership through research, policy development and capacity building.

The project was meant to examine and record case studies for transformation and to utilise them for a foundation for a qualitative process in which enabling and disabling factors for transformation change could be identified. Tanzania was selected as a case study for this pilot project. According to the report’s findings, three transformational focus areas were identified, namely: a transformational change in road infrastructure development; women in political decision-making structures; and HIV/AIDS awareness.

The report indicates that each of these focus areas identified aspects that made transformation possible or impossible as enablers or disablers for the respective desired transformation. The combination thereof resulted in the following enablers and disablers of leadership emerged:

**Appropriate changes in legislation and policies** - In all the case studies, it was clear that appropriate changes in legislation and policies play a major role in enabling transformational change. However, appropriate legislation and policies should not be equated with their implementation.
**Partnership for change** - Collective expressions of leadership are crucial for stimulating or supporting change. A key feature of these partnerships is that they seem to be organised around a shared perception of a collective challenge faced by all or much of society.

**Agency** - A major enabling factor is the willingness of persons to view themselves as agents with a responsibility towards society.

**Appropriate skills** - The development of appropriate skills is shown to be an important factor in enabling persons to bring about change.

**Personal support structures** - Even though not an explicit feature of all case studies, the enabling role of personal support structures in enabling individuals to facilitate change is essential.

Given these findings, the report concludes that the Leadership for Africa project, in accordance with the most recent developments in the field of leadership research, provides a comprehensive understanding of leadership dynamics.

The report states that institutional change is a result of interaction between the various dimensions of leadership, namely, a single person as an agent of change, a leader as a representative of an institution and a leader as a participant in a collective effort. The report states that in order to remain true to the project’s research framework, the enablers and disablers of leadership will be systematised in terms of the individual, institutional and collective dimensions of leadership.

**1.2.2 Africa Transformation – Ready: The Strategic Application of Information and Communication Technology (ICT) to Climate Change Adaptation in Africa**

This segment of the research will detail the second case study for best practice in leading change in local government in Africa generally and in southern Africa specifically. To do this, the researcher will highlight how this study contributed towards transformation through the strategic application of ICT and climate change adaptation in Africa.
Huerta Melchor (2008) explains that in politics and academia change and reform as concepts are concepts normally used. In politics, for example, policymaking is described as a change-oriented activity aimed at transforming, modifying or altering the status quo. The researcher uses the research report titled *Africa Transformation – Ready: The Strategic Application of Information and Communication Technologies (ICTs) to Climate Change Adaptation in Africa* in order to present a second best practice case study for leading change in Africa. The report was done for the World Bank, the African Union and the African Development Bank, by Akoh, Parry, Creech, Karami, Echeverria, Hammil and Gass (2011).

According to Akoh et al. (2011), African countries are getting ready for the implications brought about climate change by equipping themselves with knowledge in terms gauging its impact, learning more about climate science, looking at priorities for adaptation, putting in place response and adaption measures. A major role of support could be played by ICTs.

However, societies’ understanding of the potential benefits of ICTs is currently limited. According to the study, ICT infrastructure in Africa has developed remarkably in recent years, reflecting the wider growth of technology and telecommunications on the continent, particularly the rapid take-up of mobile telephony and the deployment of new undersea fibre cable infrastructure.

ICTs are recognised as a major role-player in contributing to the combat of climate change. ICTs are generally appreciated of the role they could also play in reducing emissions of greenhouse gases (mitigation), and in preparing for and responding to unavoidable changes in climate change (adaptation). There is a need of a methodical approach to use ICTs in addressing challenges of adapting to climatic changes.(Akoh et al., 2011).

According to Attahi (1997 in Swilling, 1997), there is advanced transformation in the operating principles or, in other cases, the appearance of real partnerships defining the roles of and options of interventions for the various partners. The new forms of management that come within the shared management logic of urban services may vary, depending on the national or local context and on the service provided.
In the late eighties, policies relating to the water kiosk operators initiated by the national companies in Senegal, the Ivory Coast, Mali and Burkina Faso encouraged the emergence of bolder partnerships. In Senegal, ICTs have been given prominence in national development policy, with strong support at presidential level and a direct link between the presidency and decision-making agencies (Akoh et al., 2011).

According to Akoh et al. (2011), the engagement of the ICT private sector in climate change adaptation is less substantial and widespread than it is in mitigation, where the sector is directly involved in developing clean technologies, energy efficiency, efforts to reduce carbon footprints and other areas of innovation. It is based on this background that the International Institute for Sustainable Development (IISD) commissioned a sectoral study to look at a best practise that can be replicated for utilisation of ICTs for climatic change adaptation, drawing on case studies in Senegal, Uganda and Malawi. The study explored the barriers, opportunities, implementation risks and challenges concerning the use of ICTs for adaptation to climate change from the stakeholders’ perspective (Akoh et al. 2011). Some of the best practices from the case studies are highlighted below.

1.2.2.1 Senegal

Akoh et al. (2010) argue that the government of Senegal’s recognition of technology transfer as a pillar of its policy is an indication of its commitment to use ICTs to address the impact of climate change. It also suggests the possibility of redefining ICT use in policies for building local technical capacity in the use of tools and applications, and for creating platforms for knowledge and information exchange. In this regard, the study in Senegal explored the importance of online knowledge platforms for the sharing of knowledge for climate change adaptation.

The most important points that emerged from the review of the climate change and the ICT landscape in Senegal are as follows:

- Climate projections in Senegal are hampered by a lack of information resulting from insufficient daily temperature observations being made to identify trends in temperature extremes.
• The government of Senegal has identified three pillars on which to focus its priorities and needs, namely, the use of ICTs for adaptation through the introduction of supportive policies, the development of technical capacity and the application of new technologies for monitoring, alerts, mapping and data generation. These seek to address climate change and its impact and are focused on technology use and transfer. Appropriate applications would include sensor networks, remote sensing applications and early warning systems that address current gaps.

• As host to a wide variety of local, regional and international climate change focused institutions, Senegal is well placed to benefit from information and knowledge that are systematically shared and can be applied in local communities. Information sharing about research outcomes, community experiences and successful activities in different communities with similar circumstances can be effectively enabled using ICTs.

• The widespread deployment of telephone (including mobile) infrastructure is an opportunity for the installation of ground station equipment, data capture and generation, the installation of monitoring devices including sensor networks. The shortage of available data suggests the need for an overhaul of the entire information management production line, including the generation of data, its transmission, storage and management, sharing and dissemination (Akoh et al., 2011).

1.2.2.2 Uganda

The Uganda case study focused on how ICTs could be used to help farmers adapt to climate change. According to Akoh et al. (2011), the summary of findings in this regard indicates that:

• Uganda is a country largely dependent on its agriculture, which generates over ninety per cent of its export earnings and which could be strongly impacted by climate change.

• Research is required in a number of areas, particularly those concerned with the relationship between climate variability and diseases in coffee and other
crops. Gaps in research need to be filled by supporting the development of local research and technical capacity for knowledge and information sharing, including information about existing practices.

- Human interface or community knowledge workers, armed with appropriate ICTs, are needed to improve coordination, foster synergies, raise awareness, share knowledge and build local capacity, and to bridge the communication gap between farming communities and national meteorological offices, government offices, research and financial institutions and other stakeholders.

- ICTs can be applied to strengthen meteorological services in the areas of collecting information, circulation of information, and of the availability, correctness, deadlines and availability of information. Weather and climate related information is often out of date by the time it reaches the target audience. ICTs could assist in disseminating information more quickly, in improving its local relevance and translating it into local languages, in maintaining and preserving successful adaptation practices, and in fostering convergence between indigenous adaptation techniques and new scientific knowledge.

1.2.2.3 Malawi

In Malawi, according to Akoh et al. (2011), the study examined the value of community-generated participatory geographic information systems for water and resource management. Outcomes from this case study of climate change can be summarised as follows:

- Malawi’s environmental challenges include deforestation, soil erosion, sedimentation and siltation. Its climate vulnerabilities are compounded by poverty, poor infrastructure, limited credit opportunities, food insecurity and reproductive and broader health challenges.

- The government considers the improvement of its climate monitoring capacity through the use of an early warning system, enhanced decision making capacity and sustainable use of lakeshore resources to be three important factors in developing its ability to address the challenges of climate change.
A significant number of adaptation projects are being implemented by a number of international development organisations, international financial institutions and local community-based institutions. This focus on agriculture, research, capacity building and support for policy development though these initiatives could assist the broader introduction of an ICT infrastructure.

The relatively large number of adaptation related projects in the country could benefit from better coordination which could be facilitated by ICTs. This would help to avoid duplication, improve availability of information, build capacity, and help the development and sharing of knowledge among stakeholders.

Capacity building challenges are evident among policy makers, practitioners and researchers. The introduction of relevant curricula and school programs at primary, secondary and post-secondary levels could help to address long-term environmental capacity requirements. Improvements in the capacity of the communications regulator Malawi Communications Regulations Authority (MACRA) are also needed.

Despite the large number of projects involving monitoring and climate data generation in the country, there is a shortage of readily usable data available to practitioners and researchers. Policies are needed to encourage the release of government meteorological data for research purposes, along with practical ICT channels to make the data available.

In conclusion, Akoh et al. (2011) state that the relationship between climatic change adaptation and ICTs has only been looked at two to three years ago. There has, in particular, been only limited research to date on whether and how climate change education and communication strategies have been implemented, particularly at the local level in developing countries. There has also been limited research on what the outcomes of those strategies have been, in terms of what works, what does not and thus what needs to be done next.
1.3 Best practice of leading change in local government: South African context

In the previous twenty years local government went through a process of socio-economic and political transformation. A huge number of legislative and policy changes were introduced and that has had an impact on the process since it started in the 1990s (Reddy, Nzimakwe and Ramlucken, 2012). According to Williams (2000), for the most part of its colonial and apartheid history, the city reflected the racist planning frameworks of the successive white-controlled governments, a situation made explicit on 30 May 1952, in a speech in Parliament, by the then Minister of Native Affairs, Dr Hendrick F Verwoerd, when he declared that:

- Every town or city, especially industrial cities, must have a single corresponding black township.
- Townships must be large, and must be situated to allow for expansion without spilling over into another racial group area.
- Townships must be located an adequate distance from white areas.
- Black townships should be separated from white areas by an area of industrial sites where industries exist or are being planned.
- Townships should be within easy transport distance of the city, preferable by rail and not by road transport.
- All race group areas should be situated so as to allow access to the common industrial areas and the CBD without necessitating travel through the group area of another race.
- There should be suitable buffer spaces around the black townships, the breadth of which should depend on whether the buffer area touches on densely or sparsely populated white areas.
- Townships should be a considerable distance from main, and more particularly national roads, the use of which as local transportation routes should be discouraged and if existing, wrongly situated areas should be moved.
- Everybody wants his servants and his labourers to be readily available, but nobody wants to have a native location near his own suburb (cf Cape Times, 14 July 1949; Cape Times, 31 May 1950; Durban City Council, 1951, as cited by Williams 2000)
Williams (2000, citing Marias, 1998; Mabin, 1999a; Soimone, 1999; Saul, 1999; Bond, 1999a), indicates that this explicit, race-influenced, planning agenda was methodically imposed by the administration of the apartheid regime to satisfy only white people. It is the cumulative impact of these racially-contrived planning frameworks that resulted in what Williams (2000) calls “islands of spatial affluence in a sea of geographical misery” at the end of twentieth century South Africa.

Following the democratic elections of 1994 and a new political dispensation, local government authorities strove for not only economic development, but also social and spatial integration, and thus began to take on a more aggressive role in this regard (Mountford, 2009).

Swilling (1997) states that although fraught with seemingly insurmountable fiscal, institutional and political problems, the previous frameworks for managing the transformation of the local government system via local forums created through the interim constitution and the Local Government Transition Act had major implications for urban governance.

The newer and more equitable frameworks emerged largely out of the efforts of the social movements in their challenges against the apartheid system. Municipalities established during this initial period did not have enough income sources, the strong administration or the political acceptability to rule their area of authority (Reddy, 1996:55, cited by Reddy et al. 2012).

Cameron (1999, as cited by Nyalunga, 2006) argues that municipal system before the 1994 was created in the early 1920s through periodic changes in an effort to justify the racially biased system without success. The municipal system provided for race-based municipal authorities, in terms of which white group areas were ruled by white local authorities (WLAs) that were fully fledged municipal institutions with a political council and administration to carry out the functions of the council, including taxation powers (Nyalunga, 2006).

According to Sono (2013), when the Interim Constitution was adopted in November 1993, South Africa moved to the building of a new political, social and economic mandate.
The change involved political emancipation for the black majority who were oppressed by the apartheid rule since 1948. The change was also about the elimination of a dictatorial system in South African government and ushering in a democracy.

Maharaj (2002, citing Swilling, Monteiro and Johnson, 1995,) indicates that restructuring local government was momentous for South Africa in the rising of democracy, considering that this change to place in an unprecedented manner as compared to other international viewpoint. There was no revolution in our regime change and it is debatable what ultimate significance this had for the development of local government.

According to Makobe (2002, as cited by Nyalunga, 2006), municipalities in South Africa find themselves in a constant state of change, partly because many are struggling to shake off the legacy of apartheid-based local government. Bell (2001) points out in South Africa the municipal change is identical to the broader democratic change and appears as a prevalent course for almost all social transformation.

Transformation is used to define and validate an immense range of social and political change processes and as a result, it is fast becoming rhetorical and its semantic essence vague.

Makobe (in Nyalunga, 2006) identified the following elements found in many municipalities which have not yet experienced comprehensive transformation:

- Many are still traditional, rule-driven bureaucracies which serve the public in a responsive manner.
- Many are not structured or capacitated in such a manner to undertake multi-dimensional activities, such as Integrated Development Planning (IDP) or local economic development (LED).
- Many municipal administrators still use old and obsolete approaches and a managerial culture which is usually top-down and non-creative.
- Service delivery is often neither cost effective nor efficient; and
- Apartheid employment regulations are often still in place, creating inflexibility in the system.
Powell (2012) argues that one of the primary considerations in local government reform is that local government is a mirror of the larger political and economic forces, cleavages and problems that are shaping South Africa. It is these deeper fault lines in society, rather than any government turnaround strategy, which will drive future policy and determine its effects.

In other words, problems in local government are so nested in the broader problems of our society that developments in each sphere of government inevitably have an effect on developments in other spheres.

According to Huerta Melchor (2008), public sector reforms are complex, in many cases unpopular, contested, fraught with risk, and require a long time to produce results and prove their benefits. Municipal administrators then have to devise strategic means of how to maintain legitimacy, increase support, sustain the impetus for reform and avoid losing people’s trust while introducing controversial but ultimately necessary initiatives.

About these municipalities, Swilling (1997) states that “besides being racially structured, they were also built up over decades to be extremely hierarchical, technocratic, multi-layered, inward-looking bureaucracies incapable of being developmental and citizen friendly”. Certain transitional councils identified this as a problem and mounted ‘change management’ strategies to reform their administrations.

One example is the former Greater Johannesburg Transitional Metropolitan Council, now City of Johannesburg Metropolitan Municipality. The prescribed change management approach that was built into the agreement reached by the forum that created this structure, namely the Central Witwatersrand Metropolitan Chamber, was probably the most innovative aspect of the agreement because it demonstrated an understanding of the critical connection between newly established constitutional structures on the one hand, and the need to create results-oriented citizen-friendly development administrations on the other.
The change management approach was premised on the assumption that organisational change should be a process managed in accordance with the following principles:

- Organisational change should be strategy-led – structures and systems should flow from an agreed strategy;
- Strategic vision must be collectively generated by groups that comprise senior and middle management as well as front-line workers rather than determined from the top via a conventional strategic planning approach;
- The knowledgebase for organisational change should be derived from expertise located within the organisation at all levels rather than from outside management consultants operating in accordance with predetermined expert models;
- The quality and sustainability of organisational change is dependent on the degree to which leadership at all levels is developed and empowered to understand and guide the change process.

Since urban development and service delivery problems inevitably appear and are experienced as predominantly residential issues, it is imperative for planning authorities to initiate development programmes that are informed by metropolitan-wide considerations as opposed to being driven by mere parochial concerns.

Swilling (1997) argues that the change management process will be jointly driven by management and the municipal trade unions. The approach to the change management process outlined above will fundamentally challenge the rigid, hierarchical, bureaucratic and user unfriendly administrations that have developed over decades. The complexity of managing change in the public sector is exacerbated by the occurrence of simultaneous change processes that make the managing and understanding of change a daunting task, and that justify the need to examine how countries are responding to the effects of their reform initiatives (Huerta Melchor, 2008).
1.4 Best practice of leading change in local government: Limpopo Province context

The second phase of the democratisation process in local government after 2000 consisted mainly in achieving efficient administration, so that communities could actually experience democratisation. By the time of the 2011 local elections, the integration of local government continued to be carried out in eight metropolitan municipalities, 44 district municipalities and up to 225 local municipalities (Fujimoto 2013 in Makino and Sato, 2013).

Koma (2010) states that local government is aptly defined as the sphere of government located within communities and is well placed to respond to local needs, interests and expectations. Van der Walt (2006, in Koma 2010) also says that local government is at the coal face of public service delivery.

According to Roux (2005:64, as cited by Koma, 2010) local government could be described as public organisations authorised to manage and govern the affairs of a given territory or area of jurisdiction. It is also important to note that local government refers to a sphere of government, and not to an individual municipality.

Steytler (2003) states that in Section 84 of the Municipal Structures Act, 1998, local government competencies, listed in schedules 4B and 5B of the Constitution, are divided between district and local municipalities. The method used is to list all the functions and powers of district municipalities and leave the residue of schedule 4B and 5B competencies to local municipalities. Section 84(1) allocates some of these functions to district municipalities.

Steytler further states that the new role of district municipalities has a number of implications for local municipalities. Local municipalities argue that they, with their system of wards and ward committees, will be held politically responsible for the delivery of basic services. Until 2000, provinces had direct relations with all municipalities in the province. In terms of the Constitution, provinces are expected to monitor and support local government, which includes local municipalities. However this support role is now taken over by the district municipalities (Steytler, 2003).
According to the South African Local Government Association (SALGA) (2014), Limpopo is the natural resource treasure chest of South Africa. It boasts some of the greatest reserves of agriculture, mineral and tourism resources, many of which are underexploited. A unique feature of this province is that it shares borders with three countries, namely Botswana, Mozambique and Zimbabwe. The province is also linked to the Maputo Development Corridor through the Ba-Phalaborwa Spatial initiative, a network of road and rail corridors connecting to the major seaports set to open up Limpopo and the surrounding regions for trade and investment. This province hosts thirty municipalities, made up of five district and 25 local municipalities.

The Independent Online (IOL, 2014), quoting a 2014 report by Ishmael Kgetjepe, the MEC for Co-operative Governance, Human Settlements and Traditional Affairs (CoGHSTA)), states that the Limpopo government claims it has “drastically” reduced service delivery backlogs in water, sanitation and electricity in the past ten years.

The report, covering the 2011/12 financial year, however reveals that:

- Only 22.7 % of residents have access to flushing toilets
- Only 52.3 % have access to piped water
- About 87 % have access to electricity.

In his report, Kgetjepe identified seven municipalities that he said required political intervention. Top of the list is the Bela-Bela local municipality, to which the national Treasury has stopped transferring funds in terms of Section 216 of the Constitution. Kgetjepe said this was because Bela-Bela had notoriously flouted Treasury regulations. “In terms of municipal service delivery, the report demonstrates that despite all challenges related to the development of infrastructure in the province, service delivery backlogs have been drastically reduced,” said Kgetjepe.
In his 2014 State of the Province address, the Premier of Limpopo, Stan Mathabatha, indicated that:

“Local government, as the third sphere of government, is the strategic centre of gravity in terms of delivery of basic services. In the last 20 years, we were able to establish a non-racial and democratic local government. We have increased the number of people with access to water from 78% in 2001 to 86% in 2011. In the same vein, we have increased the provision of electricity to our people from 62.9% in 2001 to 87.3% in 2011. The majority of the beneficiaries are the historically marginalised, especially those in the far-flung villages of our province. Since 1994, we have built over 250 000 houses for poor families, benefiting about 1 million people. In addition to this, we transferred over 12 000 housing units through the Enhanced Extended Discount Benefit Scheme (EEDBS). These are the houses for which our people were denied ownership and placed under a 99 year lease during the apartheid era. We have now given them ownership of these houses for free”.

Although the Premier acknowledges the challenges faced by the municipalities, CoGHSTA, according to Oberholzer (2012), in its own assessment of the state of local government in 2009, concluded that local government is in distress and that a comprehensive turnaround strategy is needed.

The report refers to challenges of huge service delivery backlogs, leadership and governance failures, corruption and fraud, poor financial management, insufficient capacity due to a lack of skills, high vacancy rates, poor performance management and inadequate training.

Cadre deployment without adequate assessment of skills during this process has further exacerbated the problem. The Premier alluded to the fact that in an effort to transform and address challenges at the local government level, the province has followed in the example of all other provinces across the country by developing a Local Government Turnaround Strategy (LGTAS) as a guide to support capacity at local government level.
According to Mathabatha, some illustrations of transformational best practice in the province include the establishment of a pilot Food Park in the Capricorn District by the Limpopo government. “The Food Park initiative benefits the food insecure, poor and vulnerable residents of Limpopo. To date sixty (60) NGOs in the Capricorn District are distributing food items to the destitute and vulnerable members of society”, said the Premier.

1.5 Capricorn District Municipality

1.5.1. Context and location

The Capricorn District Municipality (DC35) is situated in the centre of Limpopo Province, sharing its borders with four district municipalities, namely, Mopani (east), Sekhukhune (south), Vhembe (north) and Waterberg (west). The district is situated at the core of economic development in the Limpopo Province and includes the capital of the province, the city of Polokwane. One national and various major provincial roads pass through the district municipal area, i.e. the N1 from Gauteng to Zimbabwe and the rest of Africa, the P33/1 (R37) from Polokwane to Burgersfort/Lydenburg, the P94/1 (R521) from Polokwane to Alldays and Botswana and the P17/1 (R71) from Polokwane to Tzaneen and Phalaborwa.

The Capricorn District Municipality (CDM) comprises of five local municipalities, which are:

- Aganang Local Municipality
- Blouberg Local Municipality
- Lepelle-Nkumpi Local Municipality
- Molemole Local Municipality
- Polokwane Local Municipality
According to the final CDM IDP document (2013/14), the district municipality covers an area of about 2 180 530ha, which constitutes 12% of the total surface area of the Limpopo Province. Figure 2 below illustrates the relative coverage area within the CDM of the five local municipalities. Blouberg Local Municipality has the largest proportion, at around 43% (927,270ha), followed by Polokwane Local Municipality, and the least being Aganang Local Municipality, which contributes 9% (190,798ha).
1.5.2 Establishment, category and type of municipality

1.5.3 CDM institutional structures
The council comprises of the political and administrative components responsible for decision-making and implementation respectively.

1.5.4 Political structures of the CDM
The Executive Mayor and the Speaker head the political component of the municipality. The overall executive and legislative authority vests in Council. However, the CDM has an approved delegation system that seeks to decentralise and democratise decision-making within the institution and improve the pace at which services are delivered to the community.

This is intended to maximise administrative and operational efficiency and to provide for adequate checks and balances. In line with the delegation system, some decision-making powers have been cascaded from Council to the Executive Mayor, mayoral committee, its portfolio committees and the full-time councillors. Other powers have been delegated to the Municipal Manager.
The CDM council consists of 53 councillors (27 males and 26 females), ten of whom (six males and four females) are traditional leaders, as provided by Section 8(12) (a) of the Municipal Structures Act.

1.5.5. Administrative structure of the CDM
The administrative structure of the CDM comprises of six (6) departments. The structure below only shows the top management of the institution.

Source CDM Final IDP 2013/14

The municipality has 527 employees, of which 340 are male and 187 are female. There is currently a 35/65 gender balance across the municipality. However, this is proliferated at lower levels of employment categories as opposed to the senior managerial levels. The table below (Table B) depicts the current equity status in respect of the designated categories of employees at levels 0 - 3 for the year 2013.
1.5.6 Employment equity

Table B: Employment Equity Status per Occupational Category as at March 2013.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Occupation Category</th>
<th>Male</th>
<th>Female</th>
<th>People with Disability</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>African</td>
<td>Coloured</td>
<td>Indian</td>
<td>White</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0-3</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percentage</td>
<td>4.88%</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.18%</td>
<td>2.07%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The CDM is currently reflecting 5.06% men, 2.07% women and 0.18% people with disabilities representation in the abovementioned levels. The organisation is targeting to achieve 50% representation of women at levels 0 –3 of management by 2013.

1.5.7 Leading change in the CDM context

Organisations are under continuous pressure to adapt in order to meet the changing requirements of turbulent markets and a dynamic business environment. In order to remain competitive, and in some cases to merely survive, organisational leadership is confronted with the challenge of altering its approach to doing business (Shrock, 2004). Leadership is a crucial part for successful policy implementation and change management. Leading change refers to the idea that leaders may be individuals or small groups who may come from a broad occupational base and from any hierarchical level within an organisation (Pettigrew, 1997; Butler, 2003in Huerta Melchor, 2008).

The majority of successful change efforts begin when specific individuals or groups begin to examine a company’s relative competitiveness, market position, technological trends, and financial performance (Kotter, 1995).
Organisational change is not always something that is directed or initiated by managers, but any occupational level can be a transformational catalyst. Research on organisational change that adopts this social constructivist perspective is aimed at making sense of or better understanding the challenges of organisational change, and how managers perceive and react to change (Van Der Voet, 2013, citing Garcia and Cluesing, 2013).

According to Kuipers, Higgs, Kickert, Tummers, Grandia and Van der Voet (forthcoming) the notion that leadership is a key factor in organisational change appears in much of the literature on organisational change (e.g. Kotter, 1996, citing Van Wart, 2003). Trottier, Van Wart and Wang (2008) and Kuipers et al. (2013) argue that leadership in public organisations is distinct from leadership in private organisations. Leadership in the public sector is also discussed in terms of administrative or bureaucratic functionalities and responsibilities.

Public organisations often need to implement changes in the governance, design and delivery of public service. However, little is known about the implementation of organisational change in the public sector context. Because little will change without the cooperation of employees, the successful implementation of organisational change greatly depends on the acceptance or support of employees (Van der Voet, Kuipers and Groeneveld, 2013).

Much literature suggests that as organisations review and adjust to the changing environment, some of these change processes have been unsuccessful. Huerta Melchor (2008) explains that the available evidence suggests that drivers of reform in the OECD countries are mainly internal structural factors. The range varies according to the local political, economic and social context of each country. The CDM is no exception. The municipality has commissioned change management in terms of its business reengineering process, a SAP Growth Support Services, an organisational development study and an institutional development project. This research seeks to understand the challenges faced by the leadership of the CDM in leading change and will present models that could be adopted for the successful implementation of change interventions.
1.6 Background

The leadership of the CDM faces the pressures of considering new mechanisms and strategies to respond to the imperatives of meeting service delivery targets set out in the Integrated Development Plan (IDP). The municipality has implemented a number of change management processes in order to put in place new organisational structures and arrangements in order to deal with emerging challenges. However, these change management processes were not always successful and consequently had to be re-examined.

Since this had serious financial and leadership implications, there was a need to reflect on the approaches and models used during the change management processes. Newman (1996) indicates that local government review has profound implications for both the organisational and political cultures.

The CDM’s IDP provides a framework that requires member municipalities to identify institutional mechanisms that would address institutional challenges. These challenges would largely impact on the implementation of the IDP as well as meeting service delivery targets. The Municipal Systems Act (2000) has a specific chapter dedicated to IDPs and is the critical legislation for the development of IDPs.

Sector requirements include the following:

- Legal requirements for the formulation of sector plans (e.g. a water services development plan).

- A requirement that planning be undertaken as a component of, or part of, the IDP.

- Links between the IDP and budget process as outlined in the Municipal Finance Management Act.

Given this background, the municipality embarked on a comprehensive organisational/institutional intervention informed by the fact that as and when the IDP is reviewed, the municipality is required to identify institutional mechanisms that would address emerging and existing institutional challenges. These challenges would largely impact on the implementation of the IDP as well as on meeting service delivery targets.
In dissecting the CDM as a unit of analysis, the researcher will investigate the challenges experienced when leading change in the CDM. Below is a presentation of the purpose of the research, research questions, problem statement and limitations of the study as well as the significance of the study. Furthermore, the researcher will present a literature review which is aimed at providing an in-depth understanding of the concept of leading change.

1.7 Problem statement

The Capricorn District Municipality (CDM) has embarked on a number of change management processes, such as an organisational development study. These change processes have not always been successful because their recommendations and findings have not been properly or fully implemented. All councils, and not just the CDM, are caught up in far reaching change processes. Some of these changes come from local determination, others from central government policy and yet others from deeper changes in society. New problems, issues and opportunities demand from local governments a capacity to respond in new ways (Newman, 1996).

These change interventions have not always been well received in organisations and as a result have often failed to address change. The critical success factors and leadership challenges have not always been properly identified and reasons leading to the failure of these interventions have not always been properly assessed.

1.8 Purpose of the research

The purpose of this research is to investigate the challenges experienced in leading change in the CDM. The study will present the findings on the process of leading change in the CDM.

1.9 Research questions

The main purpose of the research is to investigate the factors that led to the unsuccessful implementation of change management processes in the Capricorn District Municipality.
In determining those factors, the following questions will be asked:

1. What factors led to the problems being experienced in leading change in the CDM?
2. What are the trends in leading change in the CDM?
3. What strategies should be considered in leading change in the CDM?

1.10 Significance of the study

The significance of this study is to ensure that conceptualised change is implemented and managed as per the IDP’s strategic priorities within the desired timeframes. The municipality has embarked on a number of change management processes informed by the fact that as and when the IDP is reviewed, the municipality is required to identify institutional mechanisms that would address institutional challenges.

These challenges would in turn have a considerable impact on the implementation of the IDP as well as on meeting service delivery targets. This study will critique the approaches and models used during the implementation change in the Capricorn District Municipality. This study will be of great value to the CDM as it will provide guidelines for improving current practices aimed at implementing and leading change management processes in the municipality.

1.11 Overview of the research study

Chapter 1: Introduction

This chapter will provide the introduction of the study containing the context of the study, background, problem statement, purpose of the research, research questions and significance of the study.

Chapter 2: Literature Review

This chapter presents a theoretical review of the concept of leading change. The literature review focuses on leading change in local government with a particular focus on Capricorn District Municipality.
The researcher provides an in-depth understanding of the concept leading change. In this chapter the researcher defines different concepts and key frameworks that are related to the concept of leading change.

**Chapter 3: Research Methodology**

In this chapter the researcher focused largely on the methodology that was followed in the research process. This chapter looked at the research approach, research design, data collection, data analysis, validity, reliability and ethical considerations.

**Chapter 4: Presentation of Findings**

In this section the researcher presents the analysis of data collected. All data gathered is discussed and analysed on the basis of the results of the study.

**Chapter 5: Interpretation and Analysis**

In this chapter the researcher presents major lessons from the findings of the study as per interpreted literature.

**Chapter 6: Conclusion and Recommendations**

In this chapter conclusion and recommendations based on research findings are presented. Also in this chapter the purpose, the research questions, research problem and all the scholarly discussions will be summarised.
CHAPTER TWO: LITERATURE REVIEW

2. Introduction

This section will present a literature review as a way to provide an in-depth understanding of the concept of leading change. Newman (2006) asserts that a literature review is based on the assumption that knowledge accumulates and that people learn from and build on what others have done. A literature review is a process that gives the researcher the opportunity to present a clear view of the research problem. A literature review also attempts to link the research question to the body of knowledge that already exists. Newman (2006) states that this would provide a basis on which to demonstrate familiarity with a body of knowledge and establish credibility, integrate various perspectives and summarise what is known.

The literature review should not consist of a mere compilation of separate, isolated summaries of the individual studies of previous researchers, cautions Welman and Kruger (1999). According to Welman, Kruger and Mitchell (2006), prospective researchers should acquaint themselves with previous research on a particular topic before they start planning their own research. Welman et.al (2006) further argue that by compiling a review of research findings on a particular topic, researchers may become aware of inconsistencies and gaps that may justify further research.

Such a review enables researchers to indicate exactly where their proposed research fits in (Welman and Kruger, 1999). The comprehensiveness of the literature review again depends on the kind of research being undertaken. Dissertations and theses require more extensive review than a journal article in which only previous research is referred to (Welman and Kruger, 1999).

2.1 Significance of literature review

Research proposals and research reports typically have a section that reviews literature. The review describes theoretical perspectives and previous research findings regarding the problem at hand.

The review’s function is to “look again” (re + view) at what others have done in areas that are similar, though not necessarily identical to, one’s own area of investigation (Leedy and Ormrod, 2005).
Consequently, Leedy and Ormrod (2005) indicate that in addition to helping you pin down your own research problem, as a researcher you should ultimately know the literature about your topic very, very well. In emphasising the importance of literature search, Welman et al. (2007), state that there are several other reasons why a literature search is important:

- A review of related literature can provide the researcher with important facts and background information about the subject under study.
- Such a review also enables the researcher to avoid duplication of previous reports.
- If a study on the same topic has been conducted before, a review provides the researcher with information about aspects of the problem which have not been investigated or explored before.
- A review can also help a researcher further develop various parts of the study than would have been possible.
- An insight of the weaknesses and problems of previous studies can help a researcher avoid such.
- The researcher gains new ideas on how to proceed with the investigation.
- In relational and exploratory studies, the review provides the researcher with a basis from which to determine variable relationships, types of relationships and how to measure the effectiveness of such relationships.
- Findings and conclusions of past studies can assist the researcher in arriving at his own findings and conclusions.
- Lastly, a literature review often provides motivation for a study.

The importance of organisational change and the difficulties of achieving it have resulted in both large scientific research literature and more practice-oriented literature (Van der Voet, 2013). Much of the public management literature is concerned with change.

Policy research indicates how policy brings about desirable societal outcomes (Van der Voet, 2013 citing Sabatier, 1984 and O’Toole, 2000). According to Van der Voet (2013), the processes through which organisational change in public organisations is implemented are often overlooked in public management research.
As a consequence, there are no public sector specific theories about organisational change and there is little evidence on the extent to which existing change management theory is applicable in public organisations.

However, according to Bennis (1996, in Poole and Van de Ven 2004), the distinction between theories of change, which focus on how organisations change and the factors that produce change, and theories of change which focus on how change can be brought about and managed in organisations, is useful. This distinction highlights the role of human agency in organisational change and innovation in terms of the contrast between planned and unplanned change, as discussed by Seo, Putnam and Bartunek in Poole and Van de Ven (2004). This factor is vital to the researcher in terms of the question of leading change in the Capricorn District Municipality.

Leadership is generally highlighted as one of the key drivers of implementation of organisational change (Van der Voet, 2013, citing Higgs and Rowland, 2005, 2010, 2011; Herold and Fedor, 2006; Herold et al., 2008 and Liu, 2010). Van der Voet (2013) argues that a great deal of change management literature is therefore concerned with change leadership. According to Van der Voet (2013), change leadership is generally seen as the behaviours of individuals, usually a limited number of individuals, with a formal managerial mandate located at the apex of the organisation, aimed at advancing the implementation of change.

Considering these perspectives, the researcher will provide an in-depth understanding of the concept, leading change. In this chapter the researcher will define different concepts that are related to the concept of leading change. The following terms and key concepts as well as frameworks will be discussed:

- Change management
- Organisational transformational change
- Strategic change management, and
- Business process reengineering (BPR).

The researcher will also explore different leadership models and frameworks in leading change. Kouzes and Posner’s Leadership Challenge Model and Kotter’s Leading Change: Why Transformation Efforts Fail Model will be some of the models explored.
These leadership models will be used to illustrate different theories about leadership as well as factors to consider when leading or implementing change in organisations. The researcher will then recommend for the CDM leadership models to be considered when leading change.

2.2 Change management

Change management is the process, tools and techniques used to manage the people side of business change to achieve the most successful business outcome (Blake and Bush, 2009). According to Van der Voet (2013), the core of change management theory is that the process of change - the way change comes about - influences the outcomes of organisational change. The outcomes of organisational change are not predetermined by the content of change and contextual factors, but can be influenced – managed – through the way change is implemented.

Essential to managing change is to stay close to the customer: the market place is usually the chief indicator for change, if not the source (Want, 1995). According to Poole and Van de Ven (2004), change is such a multifaceted phenomenon that every attempt is necessarily limited, but by piecing together partial and often diverse views, a broader understanding may emerge.

Change management literature takes into account a great number of concepts in order to account for the way in which organisational change is implemented (Van der Voet, 2013). In 2004, the CDM commissioned PriceWaterhouseCoopers (PWC) to conduct an organisational development study, out of the recognition that it was imperative to review and adjust the implementation and impact of the developmental process continuously.

The organisational development study (2004) also explored the concept of change management competency and how this could be related to change management. Change management competency is similar to change management (CDM Organisational Development Study Report (ODSR), 2004), but there are several key distinctions:

- Firstly, change management is the use of specific activities to manage the people-side of change in order to realise the successful outcome of a business change process.
- Change management competency is not a specific activity, but is an organisation’s ability to react to and manage change continuously. Change management competency is an organisation-wide capability to apply change management practices successfully and routinely.
- Secondly, while change management can be taught and learned, change management competency requires a fundamental shift in culture and values. It becomes part of day-to-day operations and cannot be simply demonstrated in training or by means of instructional material.
- Thirdly, change management competency must penetrate every facet and level of the organisation. Change management competency must be evident across the organisation. Too often, parts of the organisation lack the fundamental understanding and skills needed to be vehicles for change. While departmental or project teams can become skilled in change management, the entire organisation must undergo a shift in the way it approaches business as usual to build change competency.

According to the CDM’s ODSR (2004), the road to a change competent organisation is not a smooth chronological journey. Change management competency requires a new attitude and approach. Individuals in a change competent organisation define their jobs in relation to change. They value the ability to change as one of their primary responsibilities. They understand that change will occur, expect it and effortlessly perform during and after the change.

The ODSR provides an account of role clarification in change competent organisations because the report emphasises that in order to build change competency, all levels of the organisation must understand the change process and the related tools and techniques required to make change seamless and effortless across the organisation.

2.2.1 Role clarification in a change-competent organisation

Change-competent organisations, as viewed from each role in the organisation, have the following attributes:

- **Executive management and leadership** – Leadership and management play several critical roles in building change competency.
It is imperative that they constantly communicate with the organisation about the ability and the need to change. The organisation will seek support and guidance to successfully function in an ever-changing organisation.

The top structure of the organisation must be active participants in managing resistance throughout the organisation. This role requires interaction with all stakeholders, both internally and externally (CDM Organisational Development Study Report, 2004).

- **Managers and supervisors** – Managers and supervisors must be effective change agents who coach employees through the change process.

- **Employees** – While employees may function effectively in the current environment, they also need to do so during and after the transition. Change-competent employees have the tools and processes required to effectively manage their personal transition through change.

The ODSR (2004) concluded that to build change competency, all levels of the organisation must understand the change process and acquire the tools and techniques to make change seamless and effortless across the organisation. However these proposed recommendations were never implemented.

Instead, the organisation instituted another change process i.e. business process reengineering (BPR), which resulted in the municipality having to deal with unmanaged change results and recommendations. This was counter-productive and a major factor eroding organisational trust, which also resulted in poor leadership.

Public organisations often attempt to implement changes in the governance, design and delivery of public services (Ferlie, Hartley and Martin, 2003 in Van der Voet, 2013). According to Van der Voet (2013, citing Bamford and Forrester, 2003), the emergent approach to change implementation came about as a reaction to the planned approach to change.

Fernandez and Rainey (2006, in Van der Voet, 2013) have reviewed literature in order to identify the factors that contribute to the successful implementation of change in public organisations, but their model is almost identical to well-known private sector models such as Kotter’s (1996) and Kanter et al’s (1992).
Change management theory, which is traditionally based on private sector research, may not necessarily be appropriate in a public sector context (Thomas, 1996; Steward and Kringas, 2003 and Boyne, 2006 in Van der Voet 2013). In both the public management literature and the change management literature, there is thus little empirical evidence about how change management is influenced by the specific characteristics of public organisations (Kuipers et al., 2013 in Van der Voet, 2013).

2.3 Organisational transformational change
Organisational transformation, transformational change or simply transformation is popular concepts in the change domain. Change as transformation emphasises the result or consequence of the change: the organisation looks different in its appearance and/or character once it has experienced transformational change Serfontein (2006, citing Cummings and Worley, 2001).

According to Cady and Hardalupas (1999, in Shrock, 2004), a variety of different terms are used to describe major organisational change. After examining common patterns of the use of language across popular business models, Cady and Hardalupas (1999) proposed that the term transformation be used to serve as a label for discourse on major organisational change. Cady and Hardalupas (1999, in Shrock, 2004) define organisational transformation as a change that alters an entire organisation, including its strategy, structure, core processes, power distribution, control systems, culture and people’s work.

Organisational change suggests the importance of understanding reciprocal influences in the change process (Poole and Van de Ven, 2004). According to Serfontein (2006), in South Africa the term transformation could mean different things to different people. The South African context has injected a special meaning into the transformational change concept, particularly in the post-1994 business environment.

McNamara (1998, in Serfontein, 2006) states that different constituencies, such as the public sector (government perspective), organised labour (trade unions) and the business sector; each developed its own unique view of transformation. Despite frequent contact between the different stakeholders, these constituencies’ specific views of transformation have remained entrenched.
According to Samantaray (2006), organisational transformation is a term referring collectively to such activities as reengineering, redesigning and redefining business systems.

In order to manage change, the University of Adelaide (UA), Australia, for example, had to adapt. When it was confronted with change, UA developed a guide for the university staff titled *Leading Change, Transition and Transformation* (2009). This guide indicates that transformation occurs as a well-orchestrated and well-led change strategy and transition plan. The result is a metamorphosis to the desired state through which there is a profound adoption of the desired changes and their associated values, principles and/or processes.

Ee Wan (2013) argues that much research on leadership and organisations points out that organisations are operating in an increasingly complex and dynamic environment. This challenge is often cited as a reason for organisations to undergo transformation so that they can continue to stay relevant in the face of a potential crisis or an actual crisis that has already taken place (Kotter, 1995 cited by Ee Wan, 2013).

Scholars of organisational change often make a distinction between the content and process of change Van der Voet (2013, citing Armenakis and Bedeian, 1999; Van de Ven and Poole, 2005; Kuipers et al. 2013). The content of change refers to what changes within an organisation, while the process of change refers to how organisational change comes about.

This distinction between planned and emergent change is the dominant way of distinguishing between the different approaches to change (Bamford and Forrester, 2009 in Van der Voet, 2013). Most people and organisations are not prepared for the often accelerated pace of change. In the changing business environment, values are the guiding force for companies (Samantaray, 2006).

The external environment of an organisation consists of the relevant physical and social factors that are located outside the boundaries of the organisation, but which have a bearing on the decision making processes and organisational behaviour of actors within the organisation (Duncan, 1972 in Van der Voet, 2013).
According to the Institutional Development (IDep) Report: *An Organisational Diagnosis for CDM* (2009), some of the challenges facing the CDM are largely centred on the positioning of the municipality and the overall approach the municipality is taking towards fulfilling its mandate and functions.

The CDM therefore has to embark on organisational change which encompasses shifts in culture, management practices and roles and responsibilities. One of the best approaches to take in order to address these challenges is based on the Burke Litwin model, which addresses organisational change in a holistic manner. According to the IDep Report (2009) the model speaks to the need to address change by taking three key approaches:

- Organisational change needs to align the leadership to the strategic intent of the municipality, thereby changing organisational culture and subsequently changing systems and policies to support the new organisational culture.
- Organisational change needs to translate strategy into a new structure with new roles and responsibilities that enforce new behaviours and new outputs that lead to improved performance.
- Facilitating organisational change by aligning leadership to the new strategy will create a need for new management practices that will create a work climate that supports the required change.

It is imperative that any organisational change is dependent on changing the way the leadership team approaches work, what the leadership team rewards and the work climate that the leadership team is able to create.

It is also important that the human resource management team is equipped to guide management through organisational change and facilitate the necessary changes in structures, systems and policies required by the change. A robust change management approach is imperative to facilitate sustainable change (IDep Report, 2009).

The IDep Report (2009) emphasises the importance of using the Burke Litwin model as a reference. The model, depicted below, illustrates organisational change while emphasising that implementing organisational change also requires individual commitment to change.
This is done by addressing the individual aspects of the change, thereby understanding that each employee, even managers, will go through a similar change process. Building commitment is an essential part of any transformation initiative.

**Diagram 3: Burke Litwin Model**

![Burke Litwin Model Diagram]

Most organisations involved in change have not taken the time to understand what commitment is, what must be done to prepare for it, how it is developed and how it can be lost. This is imperative in order to provide a cognitive map of how commitment is generated (IDep Report, 2009).
The individual change journey is depicted in Diagram 4 below:

Diagram 4: Individual Change Journey

Source: Resolve Group (2009)

According to Lundberg (1989, in Serfontein, 2006), the general impression left by practitioners in this field is that transformational change stands alone as an intervention to bring about important alignments among the organisation’s strategies, design elements and culture and between the organisation and its competitive environment.

Transformational change is often associated with significant alterations in the firm’s business strategy, which in turn may require modifying corporate culture as well as internal structures and processes to support the new direction (Serfontein, 2006).

2.4 Strategic change management

The strategic management perspective suggests that managers are central figures in organisational change. To have effective strategic changes take place, a manager must have creative ideas and be innovative and original, but should also be practical and reachable. Strategic management is thus an important part of change management (Nel, Van Dyk, Haasbroek, Schultz, Sono and Werner, 2001).
Balogun (2001) argues that there is no easy way to manage change and no simple formula that will work in all cases. All organisations are currently undergoing some type of change. Many of these changes arise from concepts such as culture change, business process reengineering, empowerment and total quality. The term ‘strategic change’ is usually reserved for such initiatives, according to Balogun (2001). Lewis (1999, in Shrock, 2004) explains that strategic change involves a decision that affects the whole organisation well into the future and involves an often irreversible allocation of valuable resources.

It is important to note here that strategy is sometimes considered to be something different from change, though the two may influence each other. Tsoukas and Knudsen (2002, cited by Ströh, 2005), argue, for example, that the configuration school is not a theory of strategy but of corporate change, making a distinction between the two concepts. However, Mintzberg (1978a, cited by Ströh, 2005), explains:

\[ \text{That is why even though the concept of strategy is rooted in stability, so much of the strategy making focuses on change....The very encouragement of strategy to get on with it – its very role in protecting the organisation against distraction – impedes the organisation’s capacity to respond to change in the environment (p.50).} \]

According to Johnson (1992), the notion of strategy has to do with the long term direction of the organisation and not just the short term response to difficulties.

### 2.5 Business process reengineering

In 2007, the CDM implemented a business process reengineering (BPR). The BPR was meant to provide an indicative report with regard to the strategic management processes in the organisation. The process was meant to align business operations with the strategic objectives of the municipality, and to also assist a rethink and redesign of business processes to improve performance. According to Kosaner (2008), BPR is a management approach aimed at operational improvement by increasing efficiency and effectiveness within and across organisations.
In short, BPR is about competitiveness (Carr and Johansson, 1995). The fundamental rethinking and radical redesign of a business process is meant to achieve dramatic improvements in critical contemporary measures of performance, such as costs, quality, service, and speed (Kosaner, 2008, citing Hammer and Champy, 1993). Carr and Johanson (1995) argue that in order for reengineering to achieve major improvements in performance, it needs to take place in the core business process which is critical for competitive advantage. Dramatic “stretch targets” are set first, and then the core business processes are reengineered to achieve those targets.

This point is encapsulated in the BPR model depicted below, which was developed by ESSKAEE, a management solution company that focuses on HR transformation by providing transactional consulting and outsourcing solutions to clients. The process re-engineering (PR) model focuses on the transformation of the business processes being executed in the organisation that typically impact on organisational development, growth, revenue generation (financial impact), resource utilisation, and activities which are drivers for the organisational sustainability (esskaee.com, 2014).

Diagram 5: The Process Re-engineering Model

Source: esskaee.com (2014)
In his online article, Pilsworth (2014) also presents a business re-engineering model which supplements the BPR process. Pilsworth argues that the BPR or the business process innovation takes a ‘clean sheet’ approach to the process, which is usually either broken, or so slow that it is no longer competitive in delivering the company’s value to its customer, a fact that the PR model by ESSKAE (2014) recognises because central to the model are clients, time, cost and quality, which are key ingredients of a successful PR. Below is the BPR model as presented by Pilsworth.

![Diagram 6: The BPR Model](Source: WBL - online.org.uk (2014))

Pilsworth(2014) elucidates his argument by also referencing Davenport (1992), who prescribes a five step approach to the BPR model:

1. **Develop the business vision and process objectives**: The BPR is driven by a business vision, which implies outlining specific business objectives, such as cost reduction, time reduction and output quality improvement.
2. **Identify the business process to be redesigned**: Most firms use a ‘high impact’ approach which focuses on the most important process or those that conflict most with the new business vision. Some firms use the ‘exhaustive approach’, which attempts to identify all the processes within an organisation and then prioritise them in order of redesign urgency.

3. **Understand and measure the existing processes**: This is imperative in order to avoid repeating old mistakes and to provide a baseline for future improvements.

4. **Identify information technology (IT) levers**: Awareness of IT capabilities can and should influence the BPR.

5. **Design and build a prototype of the new process**: The actual design should not be viewed as the end of the BPR process. Rather, it should be viewed as a prototype, with successive iterations. The metaphor of a prototype implies that the BPR should be results and customer-driven.

### 2.6 TQM versus BPR

Johanson et al. (1993, cited by Kosaner, 2008), provide a description of BPR relative to other process-oriented views, such as Total Quality Management (TQM) and Just-In-time (JIT). They state:

“BPR, although a close relative, seeks radical rather than merely continuous improvement. It escalates the efforts of JIT and TQM to make process orientation a strategic tool and a core competence of the organisation. BPR concentrates on core business processes, and uses the specific techniques within the JIT and TQM “toolboxes” as enablers, while broadening the process vision.”

Hammer and Champy (2001, as cited by Shurrab, 2013) indicate that process innovation or BPR is a fundamentally new and radical restructuring of core processes to achieve dramatic and simultaneous improvements of critical result factors, such as cost and quality, service and swiftness. It is designing new processes without using the present structure.
According to Omnex (2014), TQM and BPR share a cross-functional relationship. Quality specialists tend to focus on incremental change and gradual improvement of processes, while proponents of reengineering often seek radical redesign and drastic improvement of processes. The extreme difference between continuous improvement and BPR lies in where you start from and also the magnitude and the rate of resulting change.

Devenport (1993, cited by Shurrab, 2013) states that BPR also refers to redesigned and improved work processes within a bounded time frame. On the other hand, TQM or continuous improvement refers to initiatives that emphasize incremental improvement in work and outputs over an open-ended period of time (Shurrab, 2013 citing Bergman and Klefsjö, 2010). These essential differences are shown in Table C below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PARAMETER</th>
<th>IMPROVEMENT</th>
<th>INNOVATION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Level of change</td>
<td>Incremental</td>
<td>Radical</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Starting point</td>
<td>Existing process</td>
<td>Clean slate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Frequency of change</td>
<td>One-time/continuous</td>
<td>Innovation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Time required</td>
<td>Short</td>
<td>Long</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participation</td>
<td>Bottom</td>
<td>Top-down</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Typical scope</td>
<td>Narrow, within functions</td>
<td>Broad, cross-functional</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Risk</td>
<td>Moderate</td>
<td>High</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Primary enabler</td>
<td>Statistical control</td>
<td>Information/technology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Type of change</td>
<td>Cultural</td>
<td>Cultural/structural</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source: Shurrab (2013)*
The Kouzes and Posner leadership challenge model

Yukl (1989, in Shrock, 2004) argues that leadership cannot be decoupled. There are many different definitions of leadership, which is a complex and multifaceted phenomenon. It has been defined in terms of, *inter alia*, individual traits, behaviour, follower perception, influence over followers and influence over organisational culture.

The leadership challenge model presents an alternative to the standard traditions and approaches by offering a set of leadership practices that are based on the real world experiences of hundreds of ordinary people who have assumed leadership (Kouzes and Posner, 1987). Kouzes and Posner created a leadership model that illustrates how leaders can lead effectively and have extraordinary things done in the organisation.

“Leadership challenge is about how leaders mobilise others to want to get extraordinary things done. It is about the practices leaders use to transform values into realities, obstacles into innovations, separateness into solidarity, and risks into rewards. It is about a climate in which people turn challenging opportunities into remarkable success” (Kouzes and Posner, 1987)

Through this model, Kouzes and Posner (1987) propose seven practices that can be used to turn challenging opportunities into remarkable success:

1. Knowing what leadership is really about
2. Challenging the process
3. Inspiring a shared vision
4. Enabling others to act
5. Modelling the way
6. Encouraging the heart
7. The beginning of leadership
Kouzes and Posner (1997) discovered five themes that characterise strong leaders, which, however, do not in any manner negate the seven practices listed above. The researcher presents the five themes from Kouzes and Posner as an emphasis of leadership qualities. The table below depicts Kouzes and Posner’s five practices of exemplary leadership.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Practice</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Model the way</td>
<td>The leaders’ actions speak louder than words. Leaders must become involved and demonstrate their commitment.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inspire the Vision</td>
<td>Leaders must have a vision of change and must be able to eloquently share that vision with others.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Challenge the process</td>
<td>Successful leaders use change and innovation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enable others to act</td>
<td>Successful leadership and accomplishments are not the result of a single person. Leaders foster teamwork and encourage others to exceed their own expectations.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Encourage the process</td>
<td>Successful leaders know that constituents require recognition and celebration. This fosters a strong sense of community.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Adapted from Kouzes & Posner (1997)

There are continuous unifying elements running through Kouzes and Posner’s leadership theory, a result of decades of research aimed at understanding changes in economies, technologies and the workplace. If everyone needs a leader to transform values into action and realities, obstacles into innovations, then leadership is everyone’s business (Shelon, 2014).

### 2.7 Kotter’s leading change model

In light of the research question and the scope of this research study, the researcher found Kotter’s *Leading Change Model: Why Transformation Efforts Fail* (1995) attractive, because this model looks at key success factors in leading change and also shows the factors that impede change in general.
Kotter (1995) has observed more than 100 companies remake themselves into significantly better competitors. These companies have implemented change management processes using the concepts of total quality management, reengineering, right sizing, restructuring, cultural change, and turnaround. The Capricorn District Municipality has basically gone the same route. The adoption of Kotter’s model as a theory will assist the researcher to provide a more insightful perspective on factors leading to unsuccessful implementation of change efforts.

Kotter’s model illustrates how vital it is to manage change so that transformational change is not undermined. This model presents factors that should be considered when implementing change. According to Serfontein (2006, citing Weber and Weber, 2001), transformation involves all the organisational features, such as processes, structures, systems, technology, culture, policies, rewards and incentives. But people are central and give definition to all the features.

Cellars (2007), argues that, as with other models, Kotter’s Eight Step Change Model (Diagram 7 below) has many disadvantages and benefits. One advantage is that this is a step by step model which is easy to follow. Another is that it does not focus on the change itself, but rather on the acceptance of and the preparedness for change, which makes it an easier transition.

**Diagram 7: Kotter’s Eight Step Change Model**

Source: enterpriselearning.com.au
According to Mindtools (2014), one of the cornerstone models for understanding organisational change was developed by Kurt Lewin back in the 1950s, which is still relevant today. His model is known as *Unfreeze – Change – Refreeze*, and refers to the three stage process of change. Lewin, a physicist and social scientist, explained organisational change using the analogy of changing the shape of an ice block.

Mindtools (2014) explains Lewin’s model as follows:

“If you have a large cube of ice, what do you do? First you must melt the ice to make it amenable to change (unfreeze). Then you must mold the iced water into the shape you want (change). Finally, you must solidify the new shape (refreeze)”.

Tanner (2014) says that the beauty of Lewin’s model is that it is simple, consisting of only three steps. First, convince the organisational stakeholders that the change you propose is necessary, facilitate the change and then make it a permanent way of doing business. According to Tanner (2014), Lewin’s model alone in today’s modern workplace is simplistic and he proposes that Kotter’s model can be used in combination with Lewin’s model to convince senior leadership of the need for orderly organisational change. Tanner (2014) argues that Kotter’s model is compatible with Lewin’s model and is in reality its extension. Below are Kotter’s eight steps for leading change, aligned with Lewin’s model.

| Table E: Alignment of Lewin’s Change Model & Kotter’s Eight Steps for leading change |
|---------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------|
| **Kurt Lewin**                  | **John Kotter**                                  |
| **Unfreeze**                    | 1. Establish a Sense of Urgency                 |
|                                 | 2. Create the Guiding Coalition                 |
|                                 | 3. Develop a Vision and Strategy                |
|                                 | 4. Communicate the Change Vision                |
| **Change**                      | 5. Empower Broad-Based Action                    |
|                                 | 6. Generate Short Term Wins                      |
|                                 | 7. Consolidate Gains & Make More Change          |
| **Refreeze**                    | 8. Anchor New Approaches in the Culture          |

*Source: managementisajourney.com*
According to Tanner (2014), if various forces in organisations are too impatient for change and push for working on short-term wins when the organisation has still not communicated the change vision, it is often simpler to communicate using Lewin’s model, the rationale being the need to finish unfreezing the organization before long-term change can be implemented. This model would work in communicating change within the CDM’s context. According to the IDep report (2012):

“Interviews and engagements with staff in different occupational categories and levels (indicated) that CDM tends to be change averse. Change is seen as threatening and levels of resistance are high, even amongst managers who under normal circumstances would be expected to lead and drive change”.

It is the researcher’s contention that this could be resolved by following Tanner’s recommendation to use Lewin’s model to communicate change.

2.8 Theoretical framework - leading change

Organisations are under continuous pressure to adapt in order to meet the changing requirements of turbulent markets and a dynamic business environment. In order to remain competitive, and in some cases to merely survive, organisational leadership is confronted with the challenge of altering their approach to doing business (Shrock, 2004). According to Newman (1996), there is no single model of leadership in local government and many studies have emphasised that leading change must be seen as a collective and multifaceted process.

However, leadership in local government is fundamentally different from that in business because of the pivotal importance of the officer or member relationship, and because of the divisionalised form of most local authorities.

Much of the literature suggests that as organisations review and adjust to the changing environment, some of these change processes have been unsuccessful and the CDM is no exception. The researcher seeks to explore how these change processes could draw lessons from various successful models of leading change.

The researcher will discuss Kouzes and Posner’s Leadership Challenge Model and Kotter’s Leading Change: Why Transformations Efforts Fail model, which provide a basis for theoretical analysis and as such could be used as a theoretical framework.
2.9 Conclusion
Transformation is a daunting challenge that differs from organisation to organisation. The method of transformation, leadership style, pertinent strategy, type of industry and corporation, all impact uniquely on processes within the ultimate business model achieved (Shrock, 2004). According to Newman (1996), different leadership approaches and skills are required at different stages of the process. Coalition building, consensus seeking and agenda seeking are required in the early stages, but once the direction is established, visible and public leadership is needed. The literature review provided the theoretical basis for the research problem.
CHAPTER THREE: RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

3. Introduction

In this chapter, the researcher provides a description and explanation of methods used in conducting this research. The researcher will also validate the basis for electing to follow the qualitative case study as a research strategy in this study. In this chapter the researcher will also provide details regarding the research approach chosen, the research design as well as the data collection methods used, which will explain the steps and processes followed in data analysis.

This section will be concluded by giving an account on how vital reliability and validity are to this research and also highlight the different roles that reliability and validity play during a research study of this nature.

3.1 Research approach

According to Henning (2004), methodology denotes a way of doing something. Henning (2004) indicates that methodology refers to a coherent group of methods that complement one another and can deliver data and findings that will reflect the research question and suit the research purpose. Mouton (1996) points out that the choice of the most appropriate methodology is largely determined by the epistemic ideal or goal that is set for science.

According to Creswell (2014), the overall decision on methodology involves which approach should be used to study a topic and informing this decision should be the philosophical assumptions the researcher brings to the study. Mouton (1996) argues that whereas the epistemological dimension addresses the question of what constitutes knowledge, the methodological dimension is concerned with the questions of how we attain knowledge and how we ensure that we reach our research goal.

According to Mouton (1996), what we define as the goal of a certain action will usually, though not always, determine the choice of means to attain that goal. The method follows from the kind of sociology adopted, which in turn incorporates a philosophical view of what the world is like and how humans can know about it (Payne and Payne, 2004).
Creswell (2014) advances three approaches to research and argues that the three approaches are unquestionably not as discrete as they first appear. These approaches are *qualitative, quantitative and mixed methods*. Research approaches are plans and procedures for research that span the steps from broad assumptions to detailed methods of data collection, analysis, and interpretation (Creswell, 2014).

In elucidating the differences of these approaches, Creswell (2014) indicates that “qualitative and quantitative approaches should not be viewed as polar opposites or dichotomies but instead they represent the different ends on a continuum”. Mixed methods research resides in the middle of this continuum because it incorporates elements of both qualitative and quantitative approaches (Creswell, 2014).

The concept of combining these approaches is also discussed by De Vos, Strydom, Fouchè and Delport (2002) as the concept of triangulation. According to De Vos et.al (2002), the concept of triangulation is sometimes used to designate a conscious combination of qualitative and quantitative approaches. The term triangulation, according to Mouton and Marias (1990, in De Vos et.al, 2002) as originally coined by Denzin (1978), refers to the use of multiple methods of data collection with a view to increasing the reliability of observation, and not specifically to the combination of qualitative and quantitative approaches.

### 3.1.1 Qualitative approach

A qualitative approach is exploring and understating the meaning individuals or groups ascribe to a social or human problem (Creswell, 2014). According to De Vos et.al (2002), when a researcher is working from a qualitative perspective, the researcher attempts to gain first-hand holistic understanding of phenomena and data collection gets shaped as the investigation proceeds.

Qualitative methods produce detailed and non-quantitative accounts of small groups, seeking to interpret the meanings people make of their lives in natural settings, on the assumption that social interactions form an integrated set of relationships best understood by inductive procedures (Payne and Payne, 2005). According to Silverman (1993, in Payne and Payne, 2005) qualitative methods are especially interested in how ordinary people observe and describe their lives.
In qualitative research, the types of approaches have become more distinct since the 1990s and into the 21st century (Creswell, 2014). However, Merriam (2007) argues that it was not until the evolution of qualitative research methods that case studies received attention from a methodological perspective.

3.1.2 Quantitative approach

Creswell (2014) argues that the purpose of the quantitative approach is to test objective theories by examining relationships among variables. The building blocks of quantitative research are variables (Christensen, Johnson, and Turner, 2011), which, in turn, can be measured, typically using identified instruments, so that numbered data can be analysed using statistical procedures (Creswell, 2014).

According to Mouton and Marias (1990, as quoted in De Vos et.al, 2002), the quantitative approach is more highly formalised, as well as more explicitly controlled, than the qualitative approach, with a range that is more exactly defined and relatively close to the physical sciences. This argument is shared by Henning (2004), who indicates that the distinction between the qualitative paradigm and the better known quantitative paradigm lies in this quest for understanding and for in-depth inquiry.

In a quantitative study, Henning says that “the focus will be on control of all the components in the actions and representations of the participants – the variables will be controlled and the study will be guided with an acute focus on how variables are related”.

In quantitative study, researchers test a theory by specifying narrow hypotheses and the collection of data to support or refute the hypotheses. An experimental design is used in which attitudes are assessed both before and after an experimental treatment (Creswell, 2014).

According to Payne and Payne (2005), almost all forms of quantitative research share certain features:

- The core concern is to describe and account for regularities in social behaviour, rather than seeking out and interpreting the meanings that people bring to their own actions.
• Patterns of behaviour can be separated out into variables, and represented by numbers, rather than treating actions as part of a holistic social process and context.

• Explanations are expressed as associations (usually statistical) between variables, ideally in a form that enables the prediction of outcomes from known regularities.

• Quantitative studies explore social phenomena not just as they naturally occur, but by introducing stimuli like survey questions and through collecting data by systematic, repeated and controlled measurements.

• Quantitative studies are based on the assumption that social processes exist outside of individual actions, and are accessible to researchers by virtue of their prior theoretical and empirical knowledge.

3.1.3 Mixed method approach
Mixed methods involve combining or integrating qualitative and quantitative research and data in a research project (Creswell, 2014). According to Christensen et al. (2011), mixed method research is the third major research methodology, but it is also the newest methodology (after quantitative research and qualitative research) and, therefore, is the least developed at present.

Mouton (1996) indicates that there are numerous examples where researchers combine techniques that are accepted as quantitative and qualitative. For instance, a researcher can use probability sampling techniques in conjunction with in-depth interviewing or basic descriptive statistics in analysing qualitative data. Mouton (1996) emphasises that for many researchers, this way of doing research is not only possible, but in fact desirable as they would argue that the use of multiple methods and techniques is actually one of the best ways to improve the quality of research.

According to Creswell (2014), when using the mixed methods approach the researcher bases the inquiry on the assumption that collecting diverse types of data best provides a more complete understanding of a research problem than either quantitative or qualitative data alone.
Creswell (2014) specifies the three components that are involved in the mixed method approach **(Diagram 8 below)**. By this the researcher understood Creswell to mean that in all the research approaches discussed here, there is some level of interconnectedness. In planning a study, researchers need to think through the philosophical worldviews that they bring to the study, the research design that is related to these world views and the specific methods or procedures of research that translate the approach into practice.

**Diagram 8: A Framework for Research – the interconnectedness of Worldview, Design and Research methods**

- **Philosophical Worldview**
  - Post positivist
  - Constructivist
  - Transformative
  - Pragmatic

- **Research Approaches**
  - Quantitative
  - Qualitative
  - Mixed Methods

- **Research Methods**
  - Questions
  - Data Collection
  - Data Analysis
  - Interpretation
  - Validation

- **Designs**
  - Quantitative (e.g. Experiments)
  - Qualitative (e.g. Ethnographies)
  - Mixed Methods (e.g. Explanatory Sequential)

**Source: Creswell (2014:3)**

Creswell (2014) further argues that all research involves philosophical assumptions as well as distinct methods or procedures. According to Alveson and Sköldberg (2000, as cited in Henning, 2004), the social researcher is the main meaning maker of an inquiry and is the one who tries to present a balance between “some sort of reality ‘out there’, and the rhetorical and narrative nature of our knowledge of this reality”.

Henning (2004) however cautions that if we accept that we are reflexively the co-creators of the findings, with sufficient data and theoretical evidence to show how we constructed them, then the notion of a design type is also a notion of who we as researchers are in the research project.
The research paradigm in this study is qualitative in nature. Leedy and Ormond (in Shrock, 2004) indicate that the intent of qualitative research is to answer questions about the complex nature of phenomena, often with the purpose of describing and understanding the phenomena from the participants’ point of view. The purpose of selecting the qualitative approach is for verification. According to Creswell (2003), researchers choose qualitative research for its explorative nature and the fact that the subject in question has been explored and the researcher wants to gain more insight in the matter.

Neuman (2006) argues that the qualitative researcher forms and refines constructs as they examine their data. This study is located in the sphere of qualitative research as it largely focuses on seeking a better insight of the complex situations with the aim of providing a descriptive analysis of phenomena from the participants’ point of view.

3.2 Research design

Cooper and Schindler (2001) define research design as the plan and structure of investigation so conceived as to obtain answers to research questions. In this regard the research design will be based on an explanatory case study. According to Yin (1994, in Shrock, 2004), this entails examining how and why questions are more explanatory and are likely to lead to the use of case studies as part of the preferred research strategy.

This is because such questions deal with operational links needing to be traced overtime, rather than mere frequencies or incidence. The case study method has the inherent ability to deal with multifarious evidence, such as documents, interviews and observation.

The case study allows an investigation to retain the holistic and meaningful characteristics of real-life events, such as individual life cycles, organisational and managerial processes, neighbourhood change, international relations and the maturation of industries (Yin, 1994). Yin (1984) defines the case study research method as an empirical enquiry that investigates a contemporary phenomenon within its real life context.
According to Merriam (2007), qualitative case studies share with other forms of qualitative research the search for meaning and understanding, with the researcher as the primary instrument of data collection and analysis, using an inductive investigative strategy, and the end of the product being richly descriptive.

An explanatory case study method was also used to obtain an understanding of the complexities involved in this study. The focus of the study will largely be on the challenges faced by the CDM leadership in implementing change management interventions and will also provide descriptive analyses of success factors leading to change. An in-depth analysis will delve into the approaches of leadership in local government and interrogate the types of change management models and approaches that were undertaken.

The researcher will describe, explain and analyse the leadership challenges encountered when leading change in the CDM, which will be used as a unit of analysis.

According to Salkind (2006), case studies are not limited to people. The Harvard Business School (HBS) regularly conducts case studies of businesses that fail, as well as of those that succeed. This allows students to review the steps that were taken and better understand the mechanics of how businesses might be affected by a variety of factors.

Although there are limitations with using case studies, as they rely heavily on multiple applications of theories and require a lot of time, resources and expertise, this method allows the researcher to retain the holistic and meaningful characteristics of real life events (Yin, 1994)

### 3.3 Data collection

This section will present the types of data gathered in this qualitative paradigm. According to Creswell (2013), a typical reaction to thinking about qualitative data collection is to focus on the actual types of data and the procedures for gathering it. Multiple sources and methods of data collection are used in case study research. For example, case study data might come from in-depth interviews, documents such as questionnaires, test results and archival records (Christensen et.al, 2011).
The researcher made use of structured questions to engage on the subject of leading change in the CDM and the role that leadership played in this process. The interviews centred on what was understood to be the vision of the municipality and how the leadership of this municipality was driving this vision, as well as broadly on the leadership challenges encountered by the municipality. These questions form the basis on which change interventions were carried out in the municipality. Hence, this process was used to guide the researcher in analysing the processes that were undertaken when seeking to manage and lead change in the municipality.

Importantly, the qualitative paradigm uses secondary and primary data collection.

3.3.1 Primary data

This is the data that would be collected from the primary sources of evidence. Primary data was collected through interviews and semi-structured personal interviews were used to gather data. Cooper and Schindler (1998, in Shrock, 2001) state that interviewers can probe deeper with the use of additional questions and gather supplemental information through formal conversations using pre-arranged questions. As such, in-depth details will be obtained through interviews.

In certain instances this was necessary, considering that the participants were largely management, and some had limited time to sit through interviews. As a result, a semi-structured questionnaire was e-mailed to some participants prior to the face-to-face interviews. This allowed the participants that preferred to answer the questions on their own to do so and to have discussions where clarity was required by the researcher at a later stage.

Personal interviewing is limited in that it is very time consuming and may depend on access to an individual who is not willing to spend the time required for the personal interview. There is the possibility of the interviewer influencing respondents by, for example, explaining what kind of answer is sought, and this can result in bias (Cooper and Schindler, 1998 in Shrock, 2001).
3.3.2 Secondary data
Published journals, the internet, books, reports and articles written by accredited scholars will be used to collect relevant information. Documents are regarded as a valuable source of information. This research required a lot of data from documentation that could be used to provide an informed insight about the study. In this study, organisational reports and other documents were reviewed to build on existing knowledge.

3.4 Sampling
Neuman (2006) defines a sample as a smaller case a researcher selects from a larger pool and generalises to the population. The primary purpose of sampling is to collect specific cases, events or actions that can clarify and deepen understanding.

Purposive sampling will be used in this research. According to Neuman (2006), purposive sampling is a valuable kind of sampling used in exploratory research or in field research. It uses the judgement of an expert in selecting cases with a specific purpose in mind. In this research project, the researcher sampled the following respondents to be interviewed:

- Four members of the CDM’s top management team
- Six members of the management team
- Four members of the Local Labour Forum, including the chairperson of the Corporate Services Portfolio.

Purposive sampling is appropriate in selecting unique cases that are especially informative (Neuman, 2006). In the case of the CDM, there have been attempts to implement different change management interventions. The researcher will use reports from an organisational study and an enterprise resource planning intervention to establish common trends regarding leadership challenges and contributing failures in dealing with these interventions.

3.5 Data analysis
Qualitative research analyses data by organising it into categories on the basis of themes, concepts or similar features. Over time, qualitative data analysis has evolved into a more specific and systematic step-by-step approach. Nevertheless, no single qualitative data analysis approach is widely accepted (Neuman, 2006).
In this study, all the data that was collected was analysed and interpreted through the formulation of a new conceptual definition, which then resulted in a new case study. According to Bouma and Atkison (1995), the difference between qualitative and quantitative research is that in the former, the researcher does not seek to prove a hypothesis, but instead the aim is to show that the hypothesis is plausible.

Once you have identified certain hypotheses you can then analyse the extent to which your results support these hypotheses. Both direct observations and inferences can be used to do this. Statements derived from interviews can be analysed on the assumption that the researcher had basic prior exposure to or knowledge of the selected subject. The researcher analysed the data according to the qualitative paradigm following a conceptualisation process.

Through interviews, the researcher used the data collected to develop a systematic and conceptual definition of the meaning of leading change in the CDM. The data was collected from the top and middle management and from the leadership of the local labour forum. In all this, the underlying purpose was to give meaning to the concept of leading change as it affects the various stakeholders.

Although the overall purpose of the study was to understand the concept of change leadership from a corporate or business perspective, the researcher was also eager to obtain the personal perspectives of the various participants in the processes. This was also done to assess whether stakeholders were even aware why change processes were failing in the municipality and whether they would be in a position to recommend changes or new approaches.

It was also critical that the study clarified whether ultimate change interventions would address the emerging challenges because mere conceptualisation, no matter how well-thought out it appeared, would not be sufficient to bridge the divide between the abstract and operationalisation.

Neuman (2006) defines operationalisation as the process of moving from a construct’s conceptual definition to specific activities or measures that allow a researcher to observe it empirically.
3.6 Validity
The literature and other sources used by the researcher built a base of new knowledge that provided an in-depth understanding of the issues pertinent to the study. As a result, there was an extensive review and description of the relevant literature. Efforts were made to ensure that the process is done within the prescripts and ethics of conventional research method design. According to Neuman (2006), reliability is necessary for validity.

**Internal validity:** Leedy and Ormond (2001, in Shrock, 2004) indicate that internal validity is the extent to which the design and the data that it yields allow the researcher to draw accurate conclusions from the data collected.

**External validity:** External validity is the ability to generalise experimental findings to events and settings outside the experiment itself. If a study lacks validity, its findings hold true only in experiments, making it useless to both basic and applied science (Neuman, 2006). Considering the size of the sample this research will ensure that the findings and recommendations are not generalised beyond the sampled group of respondents or the municipality as a case study. Creswell (2014) cautions against the potential threats of external validity when experiments draw incorrect inferences from the sample data to other persons, other settings, and past or future situations. Creswell (2014, p. 176) explains that these threats arise because of the characteristics of individuals selected for the sample, the uniqueness of the setting, and the timing of the experiment.

3.7 Reliability
Reliability refers to how reliable, consistent and dependable is the data being measured. There is reliability when a test measures the same thing more than once and results in the same outcomes (Salkind, 2006). Shrock (2004) states that the researcher should attempt to improve the chances of reliability by operating in a systematic manner during the interviews, connecting the views of respondents to a theoretical framework and also providing additional detail regarding central assumptions and the steps that are followed through out of the process.

3.8 Ethical considerations
The researcher will ensure that the information collected through individual interviews is treated with utmost privacy. The information shall be respected as
confidential and interviewees shall be accorded the right to exercise control over the disclosure of information about them as individual stakeholders (World Medical Association Assembly, 2002)

3.9 Conclusion
This chapter examined the research methodology to be followed in the proposed research. The chapter looked at the various research methodologies and their specific aspects in detail in an attempt to illustrate how the researcher intends to explore the aspect of leading change in the CDM.

The chapter also gave an account of how vital reliability and validity are to qualitative research. The discussion was also focused on the approaches that would be used for data collection and analysis. The chapter also highlighted the different roles that reliability and validity play during qualitative research.
CHAPTER FOUR: PRESENTATION OF FINDINGS

4. Introduction

This part of the research seeks to present the results of the interviews that were conducted. This will follow from the literature review that set out the context for the study and what sort of responses the research questions elicited. In discussing the findings, the notion of leading change in the CDM will be demystified. The concept will be further analysed on the basis of the results of the study.

In terms of the purpose of this study, the researcher was required to profoundly analyse whether previous organisational transformation processes could have failed because recommendations or proposals were not properly addressed, or whether there were other plausible explanations for the failure of such interventions.

As indicated in earlier chapters, the CDM commissioned a couple of studies between the 2004/05 and 2011/12 financial years in order to initiate organisational transformation. The researcher paid attention to the reasons why the studies were undertaken because the research questions were derived from these explanations.

The researcher could have limited his focus to these assumed failures to implement the recommendations of the interventions, but it was imperative to understand, on the basis of the responses from the participants, all the factors that could have affected subsequent developments within the CDM.

To provide guidance, a semi-structured questionnaire was developed alongside the research questions. This part of the research will also deal with a detailed review of previous studies and will be supplemented by interviews with management. The researcher will analyse the following reports as part of the available relevant documentation:

1. Organisational Development Study
2. Business Re-engineering Process (Final Report CDM)
3. SAP Growth Support Services Report, and
4. Institutional Development Report
The researcher will categorise the presentation of findings on the basis of the data collected from interviews and on an analysis of the documentation according to the following themes:

1. Factors leading to the problems being experienced in leading change in the CDM
2. Trends in leading change in the CDM
3. Strategies for consideration in leading change in the CDM.

Some of these aspects will be highlighted in the feedback from respondents. The researcher noted all the comments and views of the respondents as they were being expressed to ensure that authenticity and veracity was not lost. The participants in this study were grouped into three:

**Executive management (EM)**
This group was a critical part of the data collection process because it was directly involved with the interventions that were undertaken by the municipality. Their involvement could have been at the conceptualisation of the terms of reference at the beginning of business processes, before proposals were invited from service providers, or they could have formed part of the project steering committee during the implementation of the various projects. Their opinions about the processes were quite valuable for the research.

**Management team (MT)**
This group is usually left out during the conceptualisation of many organisational processes. In this study, members of this stratum were selected as essential because they are a direct link between the executive and the lower employment levels. They are often the ones who implement decisions made by executive management and are usually left with the burden to explain or sell the ideas proposed or conceived by management to staff for buy in. They were critical in this study, after the researcher pondered whether their involvement or non-involvement could have affected the fate of previous interventions.
Members of the Local Labour Forum and the Chairperson of the Local Labour Forum (LLF)

The local labour forum is a consultative and representative body of labour (SAMWU and IMATU) and the employer. Their sole mandate to ensure that they debate issues affecting employees to arrive at some common ground. This is done to ensure that the employees are not unduly discriminated against or excluded in organisational processes. The chairperson of the LLF is the political leader responsible for Corporate Services within the CDM and would usually lead change intervention projects in the municipality. The LLF’s involvement was important because the researcher also wanted to have the opinion of the political and labour components of the organisation as they represent quite critical constituencies.

4.1 Overview

The municipality has previously tried to implement a number of change management processes in order to put in place new kinds of organisational structures and arrangements. The purpose was to craft a strategic approach to deal with emerging challenges. The municipality has been confronted with pressures of considering new mechanisms and strategies to deal with the imperatives of meeting service delivery targets as reflected in the Integrated Development Plan (IDP).

As a result, the municipality launched the Business Process Reengineering (BPR) project, whose purpose was to identify best service delivery models which take into cognisance the various factors influencing the organisation’s operation. The BPR was preceded by an organisational development study. These processes were largely meant to ensure an integrated approach to service delivery, using appropriate service delivery models.

However, even after attempts were made to implement these two processes, the municipality remained deficient in as far as addressing the need for a shared vision in the municipality. There was also lack of coordination and integration among business units, as well as failed change management and insufficient attention paid to the need for capacity building within management.
These setbacks were reflected in the Enterprise Development Roadmap (EDR) report, which was an analysis of the municipality’s poorly managed change process and poor implementation of the SAP system. Given all these dynamics that had a major impact on the municipality’s service delivery, the municipality resolved to procure the services of an Organisational Development (OD) specialist to review internal change processes in order to have an aligned organisational/institutional development plan.

Through the process, the municipality would evaluate all processes and procedures that appeared to cause disparities within the structure as well as systematic challenges. If these processes were not dealt with properly, they would in time hamper any comprehensive implementation of the IDP.

The municipality enlisted the services of Resolve Group to facilitate an institutional development project whose purpose was to ensure that the municipality had a programme of action guiding the development and review of strategies, policies, programmes and systems. These functions and processes to be reviewed included organisational development (organisational structure, job evaluation and placement), human resource management, a general development strategy, as well as a comprehensive institutional development plan.

The process had to consolidate disparate recommendations from all previous unsuccessful organisational change projects and propose strategies and recommendations to be eventually adopted.
4.2 Thematic findings: Interviews and document analysis

4.2.1. Factors leading to the problems being experienced in leading change in the CDM

4.2.1.1 Organisational Development Study Report (ODSR)

The municipality appointed PriceWaterhouseCoopers (PWC) to conduct an organisational development study in September 2004. The focus of the study was to:

- Formulate recommendations on the adaptation of the current service delivery approach by the CDM;
- Evaluate the organisational structure in line with the IDP and departmental business plans to ensure effective service delivery;
- Analyse the organisational structure in terms of human resource utilisation and deployment, with specific reference to high level occupational work group based development competency gaps; and
- Provide recommendations on actions and tools to sustain and monitor and evaluate both individual and organisational performance.

According to the Organisational Development Study Report (ODSR) (2004), the project was executed and delivered through a series of workshops and meetings with managerial and political stakeholders. The objective of the interactions with stakeholders was to create a forum and an opportunity to provide the project team with insight into the current organisational structure. It soon became clear that there were definite organisational development issues that needed to be addressed before the CDM could embark on interventions aimed at addressing service delivery and organisational structure issues.

The EM respondents revealed that the organisational development report indicated that there was tension in the organisation due to the historical development of the organisation. This resulted in a high degree of unmanaged change, which, compounded by the perception of power and misaligned authority blocks in the organisation, contributed to superficial change compliance rather than genuine commitment to change.
As part of the study, PWC conducted a consultative process to ensure feedback and reflection on the current state of the organisational culture and developmental issues. A plenary workshop was facilitated with the EM group in order to obtain a macro-level perspective and this was followed by a series of meetings with MT members of all departments and the elected councillors. Labour was unfortunately excluded during this process even though it was a key stakeholder.

Below are the consolidated findings in terms of the current state of the organisational culture:

4.2.1.1.1 The current state of organisational culture – a macro-perspective

1. Although there is a shared vision within the CDM, its reach is limited due to the perceived “spaza shop” operational nature of the individual departments.
2. Due to the history of the organisation, there is a need for a co-ordinated change management intervention to create cohesion across the organisation, enabling employees to understand their roles in the bigger organisation.
3. There is a need for training and capacity building across the organisation, with specific reference to a needs-driven leadership management development programme.
4. Flowing from the perceived “spaza shop” functioning of the organisation, communication channels are not clear and well-defined, resulting in fragmented communication, which has a negative impact on the flow of information, knowledge sharing and service delivery.
5. There is a need for a well-managed evaluation and monitoring process to support organisational and individual performance management; and
6. There are perceived managerial and leadership development gaps across the organisation.
4.2.1.1.2 The current state of organisational culture – reflections from departments

1. As a result of unmanaged change during the restructuring of the Mayor’s and the Municipal Manager’s offices, the support and trust levels in the organisation are low, compounding high levels of discomfort.
2. There are perceptions of power blocks in the organisation, which blurs and inhibits organisational communication, resulting in barriers to knowledge and information sharing.
3. There are perceptions of a critical shortage of capacity across the organisation that negatively impact on service delivery.
4. There is consensus that, inter-departmentally, employees are focused and understand their roles in terms of their departments’ strategic imperatives. But due to the lack of knowledge sharing and insufficient communication, employees are not able to link their department’s role with other departments’ functional areas, which results in fragmented service delivery.
5. Role clarification is vague and there is uncertainty around universal and generic processes aimed at achieving service delivery as an organisation.
6. Most departments expressed frustration at their inability to be proactive in addressing the needs of their staff, which again can be attributed to the fragmented sharing of knowledge and poor communication.
7. A need for a centrally managed monitoring and evaluation approach was expressed, as well as a mechanism to ensure a cross-functional project management approach to ensure consolidated services; and
8. There were low levels employee initiative and drive.

The SAMWU respondents, part of the LLF, were not completely in agreement with this change process. SAMWU voiced its dissatisfaction by indicating that the total disregard of organised labour, specifically the majority union in this institution during the consultation process by the EM, was a clear indication of the negative current style of management.
The SAMWU respondents felt that:

“The process of appointing a service provider (specifically developing the terms of reference) should have been a joint process among all the stakeholders in the CDM, especially where management expected as part of the report, the restructuring of the organisational structure. We are of the opinion that the employees of CDM, the majority being our members, remain the most important and the most affected by any change that is bound to happen in an institution like ours.”

According to SAMWU, change, especially positive and constructive change, can only take place in an environment of trust and inclusivity. Again, any change involving the human capital which is at the centre of the CDM’s delivery of services, before being implemented, must be preceded by proper consultation. SAMWU went further to make concessions to specific recommendations by PWC regarding the organisational development study and below are SAMWU’s inputs:

1. **Adoption of the current service delivery approach**
   1.1 There was a need to focus on contract management;
   1.2 The skills and competency levels of the unit currently responsible for contract management had to be profiled to gauge its capacity; and
   1.3 The referee-player role played by line-function departments as far as contract management is concerned had to be curtailed.

2. **Alignment of the organisational structure, IDP and departmental business plans**
   2.1 The CDM had to await the skills audit and competency review report for a detailed analysis of the current skills and competency levels before embarking on organisational restructuring.

3. **An organisational development function**
   3.1 The organisational development function had to be located in the HR division. (*SAMWU was under the impression that it was there already.*)
4. Effective organisational communication and knowledge management

4.1 The CDM had to agree with the recommendations of the service provider.

5. Human resource utilisation and deployment

5.1 Performance plans had to be revisited and a window period be provided to deal specifically with addressing skills gaps.
5.2 Employees had to be engaged further on the skills audit forms and their significance.

6. Change management and change competent organisation

6.1 A change competent organisation acknowledges the need to build an integrated change management approach.
6.2 A change competent organisation develops effective tools/mechanisms to help employees align personal goals to organisational objectives.

7. Integrated learning, development and capacity building

7.1 The CDM had to agree with the recommendations of the service provider.

8. Strategic framework for monitoring and evaluation

8.1 There had to be a review of the current functions and roles of the Planning Unit, and whether it was properly positioned to provide strategic leadership to the functioning of the whole institution. There also had to a review of what the problem was with the limited role given to the unit, or the inability of the unit to perform a thought role.

8.2 SAMWU believed that the auditor needed to be independent and therefore his/her line of reporting needed to be clear as it was expensive to remedy avoidable.

8.3 Management had to share its views regarding the rest of the recommendations.
4.2.1.2 Business process reengineering project

The CDM appointed Phila-Thamaga to conduct a Business Process Reengineering (BPR) Project between April and June 2007. A critical milestone of the project was to produce a report on the findings relating to the organisation’s capacity to perform its mandate and execute its strategic and business plans.

The specific approach was to identify gaps between the current status quo and an ideal organisation, and then to work towards implementing the project’s findings.

Phila-Thamaga analysed the organisation in terms of aspects such as Leadership, Management competence, Strategy and policy, Structure, Processes and practices, Financial management, Human resource management, Performance management system and Organisational culture and climate.

The findings were then converted into executable recommendations, initially as a turnaround strategy, identifying relevant priorities in order for the CDM’s EM to implement. It is important to understand that thorough research and analysis necessitate consultation with all the relevant stakeholders. This process also indicated that attention needed to be paid to the competence, behaviours and attitudes of management.

According to the interviews held with EM, these members felt that in terms of the research questions reflected in Chapter 1, section 4, the change processes that were implemented by the municipality did not at all times enjoy the buy-in of employees at large and employees were not consulted in terms of the nature of the intervention and issues that the change progress needed to address.

Given the pending integration of new staff from the Department of Water Affairs and Forestry (DWAF) and the Department of Health (DoH), the BPR was timely and relevant. But it could not enjoy the support of labour as it appeared to be a high level and exclusivist process, which created anxiety from labour.
Adam (1994) argues that business reengineering impacts on a variety of managerial and organisational factors. The impact stretches across the following areas of the organisation: people, technology, processes and infrastructure. Adam states that these factors can be divided into two groups, one group involving process design and the other change management.

The process came to a halt when the recommendations had to be implemented because the municipality never conceptualised a model for change. The CDM’s leaders did not appear to have a mechanism on which to model the change or a way in which change processes were to be undertaken. From the comments and notes taken from members of MT, as well as from the leaders of the LLF, it seemed as if there was a lack of visionary leadership capability in the administrative arm of the CDM.

When the EM team adopted the BPR Project Charter at the start of the process, the management team defined and accepted intentions for the process that were expressed in terms of commitment, enthusiasm and hope. Sadly, this enthusiasm and intent were challenged when commitment to the process was needed, specifically with regard to time-keeping and meetings. This impression was also noted by Phila-Thamaga.

The negative nature of the CDM culture was so strong that important BPR meetings and consultations were not taken seriously or never took place, and as a result, management lost the impetus to promote the change process. As such, key stakeholders were left out of the process. The change that was taking place could not be owned by those who should have benefitted from it. This made it very difficult to ensure that change management was in the right hands.

Interaction with members of the LLF led to observations that the EM were not “setting the example” of accepting change and demonstrating a willingness to “demonstrate respect” for others, for deadlines and for the process. This was a concern because the basis of the project was to address the challenges relating to current service delivery levels within the CDM and to create conditions within which the organisation could respond proactively to challenges in an effective and efficient manner.
According to the BPR Final Report (2007):

“The Managers manage change, but best-in class leaders create change by inspiring their employees. The report further argues that leaders champion change by infusing it into all organisational processes and ensuring that performance is integrated into the core values of the organisation. They recognise service delivery as an important goal, and position the responsibility for service delivery and performance squarely with top-level and senior executives”. (p.8)

The report further recommended that the municipality had to create a common frame of reference that established a solid foundation upon which to discuss performance and develop action plans to eliminate bias and barriers. The report also recognised that there was no “one-size-fits-all” nor any “magic pill” to make service delivery and performance “happen.” Communication channels the CDM could have used effectively to spread the service delivery message included policy statements, newsletters, meetings, speeches, training programmes and the intranet, but these were never effectively used.

According to the BPR Final Report (2007):

“Success, in terms of the CDM’s strategic intent, will only be achieved through inspired people operating in an environment based on mutual trust, respect, openness, candour, empowerment, teamwork, innovation, risk taking, integrity, and encouraging and valuing service delivery in a high performance culture.” (p.8)

This notion was evident when the recommendations of the project were not made public, a concern also raised by the MT respondents, who indicated that there was never a clearly defined path of what the leadership wanted out of the process and that the municipality did not seem to have created a space within which to define what change they wanted see happening.

As a result, there was little or no involvement by some key stakeholders, such as politicians, middle management and staff, in conceptualising change interventions. Importantly, the LLF respondents were largely concerned about the fate of transferred employees and what the change processes would do to address their integration into the municipality.
These employees came at the point when the organisational structure of the municipality was misaligned and there were still a lot of salary disparities across the municipality. So, clearly this was going to be of particular interest for labour and the political leadership, who had to ensure that this did not decimate staff moral and cause revolt.

4.2.1.3 SAP Growth Support Services (GSS) report

The CDM has implemented a SAP systems solution but has subsequently encountered difficulties in optimally exploiting the system. In an attempt to identify the primary reasons for these difficulties and to initiate the most appropriate actions to address these causes, the SAP Growth Support Service (GSS) (adapted to the needs of the CDM) was applied (EDR Report, 2008). The SAP GSS is a service offering from SAP South Africa. In the municipality, the service was provided by Business Edge Africa Consulting, which was appointed by the municipality for this intervention in 2008. The SAP GSS examined a number of factors affecting the optimum implementation of the SAP system in the municipality.

This intervention was implemented with parallel processes that included the Organisational Diagnostic Survey (ODDST), System Evaluation (Survey) and the Enterprise Road Map (EDR). The goal of the intervention was to assess the current status of information technology usage and specifically the Enterprise Resource Planning (ERP) system, which is referred to as the “SAP system” in the municipality.

According to the EDR Report (2008), the desired outcomes in applying the SAP GSS in the municipality were mainly as follows:

- There had to be a clear understanding of the organisational issues, personnel and organisational development, relevant to the management of the municipality.
- There had to be a clear understanding of the processes, procedures and SAP system issues that had to be addressed within the CDM.
- A clear roadmap to achieve the long-term strategic objectives of the CDM had to be developed by its own executives.
There had to be alignment with organisational objectives by all participating executives.

There was a need for a repository of information that could be utilised when this process is repeated in future.

The findings are presented in three parts, namely, the Organisational Diagnostic Survey Tool (ODDST), System Evaluation (Survey) and the Enterprise Road Map (EDR). These processes ensued from application of the SAP GSS in the CDM to address the desired outcomes mentioned above.

4.2.1.3.1 Organisational Diagnostic Survey (ODDST)

According to the EDR Report (2008), an ODDST survey and subsequent interviews were used as the basis for analysing the CDM’s use of the SAP system. An interim ODDST report was submitted in terms of this investigation to the management of the CDM through EDR workshops for their review and comments. These extensive views of the CDM managers are now incorporated into this document and in particular their responses to ODDST and the information that was extracted during the EDR workshops. Subsequent to the CDM management briefing sessions, a consultation team conducted further interviews with key members of the management team, including the acting Human Resource Manager of the CDM, in order to obtain additional information on the state of its human resource practices and other organisational shortcomings.

This report aims to elaborate on these findings and to recommend organisational development remedies that are essential to create a receptive atmosphere within the CDM as an immediate pre-requisite for the implementation of the EDR as well as effectively operationalising its SAP System (EDR Report, 2008).
Findings

The main finding of the EDR report was that there was sub-optimal use of human resources within the CDM. This was especially evident in the domains of career development and the widespread lack of task and work focus amongst personnel in many of its organisational and occupational tiers.

The lack of task focus is one of the principal constraints of the organisation and hampers overall organisational performance, and is one of the primary reasons for failure in making optimal use of the SAP System.

Another key finding was the identification of 'retention', which, according to the report, is a cultural phenomenon that preserves the established systems and their behaviours and practices. This is relatively common in organisations that have existed for a period of time. Consequently, there was resistance against adaptation and change at the CDM, which led to inertia in that its structure, systems and management culture inhibited change.

On the basis of these findings, the CDM is relatively outdated in terms of its management philosophy and practices. Retention is one of the principal causes of the lack of user acceptance and proficiency in the SAP System.

Respondents indicated that it was evident that the CDM did not resort to any successful change management practices. High impact events such as the absorption of the former DWAF staff and realignment of concomitant functions, as well as the introduction of the SAP ERP System, were not facilitated by a transformation strategy. Most of the respondents were extremely critical of the organisational leadership and blamed their own lack of performance focus on the senior management of the organisation.

It was further indicated by the EDR Report that employees were of the view that the present performance management system was open to manipulation and that information used in the review forms was generally not verifiable. It was readily apparent from the aforementioned that urgent intervention was essential to effect an organisational turn-around at the CDM.
4.2.1.3.2 System evaluation and assessment

An evaluation was conducted to gain a deeper understanding of the current status of information technology usage, and specifically the ERP system that is referred to as “the SAP system”, in the CDM. The objective was to establish the extent to which information technology is currently used to support the day-to-day operations of the organisation and to determine which factors inhibit the successful exploitation of available technologies. The assessment was conducted using questionnaires and feedback systems. Online checking and verification of the SAP systems was also conducted to determine the availability and status of application functionality. Available application functionality was compared to the original blueprints that were used to implement the SAP System (EDR Report, 2008).

The following findings were made:

- The contextuali
cation of the SAP system in terms of business problems was found to be inappropriate. This was evident from the general sense that the system was underutilised in terms of its potential. The knowledge and skills level related to the SAP system was rated as low. Although nearly all the respondents had received some form of training, it was believed that the training was rudimentary and not intense. Corresponding to the cultural audit, The Systems Assessment indicated that the implementation of any significant organisational intervention or improvement is most likely to be resisted by the staff as many employees and role players in the organisation were change averse.

- Internal support infrastructure and systems were not appropriately aligned to derive optimal use of available technologies. There was no super user group or related function that focused on maximising potential benefits from the efficient and effective use of available technologies within the CDM. The evolution and integration of application technology into the organisation’s DNA had not started. There was no technology usage evolution to speak of - it could even be suggested that evolution had been backward from the day the SAP system was implemented and training was completed.
Management’s alignment of people and the system had not been successful. There were strong indications that the organisation’s culture had degenerated into a negative network culture, which had culminated into complacency and a non-futuristic worldview. Many employees were in comfort zones and tended to shift problems to their managers. Employees were not performance or action orientated and this affected performance in the organisation. It was thus not possible to make an absolute determination regarding the CDM environment’s readiness for systemisation. Although policies and procedures were comprehensive and detailed, they were not consistently and reliably applied, which reflected a leadership problem which would need to be urgently addressed for the CDM to have a reasonable chance of succeeding with the systemisation of its operations (EDR Report, 2008).

4.2.1.3.3 Enterprise Road Map (EDR)
In this part of the intervention, relevant concepts were clarified since most of the work done during this part was really a consolidation of the ideas of the CDM’s EM recorded during work sessions. The EDR report covered the following main areas:

The process defined the enterprise environment, where descriptions of concepts such as value proposition, value drivers, market segments, market drivers, value chain, value programs, competitors, basis of competing, business partners and external dependencies were made.

There was a portfolio of Critical Success Factors (CSFs) derived from a critical examination and evaluation of the enterprise’s market, operations, competitors, stakeholders, dependencies, socio-political considerations and regulatory requirements.

A set of foresights (well-formulated decisions about how things should be in future) was developed through an assessment of the enterprise’s current performance in seven internal management dimensions.
The enterprise’s executives’ understanding of the current strategy as well as the projected future strategy to develop the business to the next level was assessed. These strategy thrusts present the focus areas for the enterprise’s development.

The projects required to execute and realise the strategic objectives as defined for each strategy thrust, with associated tasks, and objectives were also assessed.

Findings

Related data suggests that it was possible to apply the SAP Growth Support EDR Process within the CDM environment without any significant adaptation to the standard EDR process, other than the nomenclature, although certain objects relevant to a private enterprise were found not to be applicable to the CDM as a public statutory enterprise. The process took considerably longer to complete than anticipated and this was in part due to the lack of executive experience of the senior management of the CDM with the unfamiliar language and strategic concepts of the new system.

Further findings indicated that the largest impact, however, could be attributed to the intermittent participation of senior managers, and the detrimental work ethic endemic within the CDM’s organisational culture. This was exacerbated by a feeling of disempowerment by the participating managers.

This often taxed the facilitation effort as these open discussions took unexpected directions during the work sessions. The EDR Report (2008) indicates that as this was primarily a facilitated process, there was a high reliance on the continuous participation of senior managers. The lack of continuity in attendance and lack of participation by some of the senior managers deprived the work sessions of the desired quality. This nevertheless provided an acceptable overview of the factors considered critical to the success of the CDM.
4.2.1.4 Institutional development project

The CDM recognised that in order to achieve the outcomes of the Integrated Development Plan (IDP) and position the district for success, it needed to review its roles and strategic imperatives. The CDM then appointed Resolve Group to assist in reviewing its strategic direction and plans, and to identify the areas requiring development in order enable the CDM to achieve its strategic objectives. It was based on this background that the Institutional Development Project (IDeP) was conceived.

The project was initially implemented in 2009, but was put on hold after some time and was only resuscitated in 2011.

Respondents noted the haphazard nature of implementing change in the municipality. The LLF stated that the former Municipal Manager seemed to have a tendency to institute change processes but never followed them through. Based on discussions held with both MT and EM groups, the BPR that was instituted under her leadership was unceremoniously aborted and its recommendations never implemented. The IDeP initially (in 2009/10) suffered the same consequence.

When conceived, the project was meant to ensure that the municipality had a programme of action guiding the development and organisational review of strategies, policies, programmes, systems and procedures related to organisational development. The municipality revised the scope after the new Municipal Manager was appointed from the previous intervention that was implemented in 2009/10.

The Resolve Group was reappointed by the CDM in October 2011 to provide technical support for the implementation of specific interventions as part of its institutional development process. At this point, the CDM had resolved that all outstanding activities from this project would be completed within the 2011/12 financial year.
In order to address some of the institutional issues identified in the process, the IDeP was intended, amongst other things, to deliver the following:

- A revised organisational structure inclusive of water services and municipal health;
- Validated and quality assured job descriptions for all positions;
- Evaluated jobs on the Tuned Assessment of Skills and Knowledge (T.A.S.K) job evaluation system to determine the size/job grades and relative ranking of jobs in the municipality;
- A remuneration review report, with specific focus on travel allowance, highlighting anomalies and/or discrepancies as well as concrete recommendations on how to address the anomalies/discrepancies;
- A placement framework that would guide the placement of staff (particularly those that had been absorbed from the former DWAF and Environmental Health department) into the organisational structure;
- A change management model with capacitated “change agents”; and
- An HR strategy.

**Findings**

Under the new leadership, the project enjoyed both political and administrative support. According to the final report presented by the Resolve Group (2012):

“It was envisaged at the time that this would be a highly participatory and consultative process and as such the process itself involved extensive stakeholder engagement including the roll out of specific communications interventions. It should be noted that as a result of the robust consultations that took place during the development of the deliverables as well as during sign off on the deliverables the overall end date of the end of March in line with the project plan was exceeded by a few weeks.”

Most respondents felt that the process was implemented in a manner that allowed full participation and consultation.
The respondents, especially the LLF, indicated that it was worth noting that the following governance arrangements were put in place:

- The Municipal Manager was the overall sponsor of the project;
- The Executive Manager: Corporate Services was the designated project champion and also chaired the Project Steering Committee which was made up of Executive Managers and organised labour (SAMWU and IMATU); and
- The CDM Project Manager was the acting HR Manager when the project kicked-off.

The majority of respondents acknowledged that most of the achievements of the project were as a result of a properly set up governance structure provided for by the IDeP, As such, it allowed regular reporting and communication across the municipality.

Evidently, it was as a result of these arrangements that the project was able to reach the following milestones:

- A revised organisational structure inclusive of water services and municipal health;
- Validated and quality assured job descriptions for all positions;
- Evaluated jobs on the T.A.S.K job evaluation system to determine the size/job grades and relative ranking of jobs in the municipality;
- A remuneration review report – with specific focus on travel allowance – highlighting anomalies and/or discrepancies as well as concrete recommendations on how to address the anomalies/discrepancies;
- A placement framework that will guide the placement of staff (particularly those that have been absorbed from the former DWAF and Environmental Health) into the organisational structure;
- A change management model and capacitated “change agents”; and
- An HR strategy.
Some of the interviewees related the fact the same cannot be said about the project when it was undertaken in 2009. According to the Resolve Group, the process in 2009 was marred by a lot of inconsistencies from the former Municipal Manager, who was the project sponsor. Some of the challenges related by the respondents as well as the service provider were as follows:

- There were delays in delivering on the project due to:
  - Changes in scope
  - Lack of feedback on deliverables
  - The temporary suspension of the project in August 2009, pending resolution of the concerns raised by the Municipal Manager.

- There had been poor communication, especially between the Municipal Manager and the project steering committee.

- Responses to the requests by Resolve for the validation of role profiles developed to date had not been satisfactory.

- Resolve continuously received conflicting messages from various sources within the CDM that did not seem to be aligned to the expected deliverables, priorities, etc.

These findings represent some of the views by stakeholders involved in the change management processes of the municipality. It is important to note that leading change in the CDM should be a highly participatory and consultative process. As such, the process must involve extensive stakeholder engagement, including the roll out of specific communication interventions. It should be further noted that as a result of the robust consultations during the conceptualisation of change management interventions, there is usually harmony across the organisation when these change processes are being implemented.
4.2.2 Trends in leading change in the CDM

As part of the mandate of the IDeP, Resolve was also required to submit an institutional development plan. It had been observed that the municipality had instituted a number of organisational transformations without following a particular framework or a road map. It was also observed that the municipality did not have procedures or policies in place that fostered the alignment of resources and capacity to adequately respond to the IDP. This should have been encapsulated in the comprehensive IDeP, which would ensure that integration resulted from the institutional transformation.

The respondents also referred to the fact that when the SAP system was being implemented as the ERP solution of choice for the municipality, not much thought went into assessing the institutional readiness for such a systematic shift. As a result, the implementation of SAP as the ERP solution of choice was bound to be a dismal failure. The CDM was therefore exposed to extreme vulnerability and experienced a decline that neutralised productivity, prohibited change and the achievement of the CDM’s organisational goals and eroded strategic capacity.

The CDM was thus threatened with complete organisational stagnation. At that rate of decline it would soon reach a critical point in its organisational life cycle where organisational failure became a reality. If it was a commercial venture it would have completely failed by then.

According to most respondents, this lack of strategic capability also meant that the CDM did not run at full capacity and was thus unable to adapt to any future shift in client needs. Retention was also evident in its management practices and in particular in its human resource management department, which had degenerated to a state where the human resource discipline had become completely dysfunctional and was severely hampering the overall strategic and operational performance of the CDM.
The IDeP approach was meant to implement change in a guided manner and to ensure proper alignment of applicable legislative requirements. The approach adopted for the institutional development review by Resolve is illustrated in Diagram 9 below. Its advantages is that it enables an analysis of the CDM from a strategic perspective (with national and provincial focuses, legislative frameworks and imperatives specific to the Limpopo Province), and provides the institutional perspective (municipal structures, systems and processes) necessary to ensure alignment of the CDM with external and internal forces that shape its context.

Diagram 9: Institutional/Organisational Development Approach

Source: Resolve Group (2009)
In order to develop the IDeP, the Resolve Group:

- Attended the CDM’s Strategic Session;
- Did a desktop review of all strategic documentation and legislation governing the CDM, such as environmental impact assessments (EIA);
- Reviewed key organisational documentation, including the organisational structure, Section 78 reports and the IDPs of local municipalities;
- Interviewed line managers, HR practitioners and relevant stakeholders;
- Analysed the municipality against the McKinsey Seven S model; and
- Presented its findings to key stakeholders for validation.

Unfortunately, the IDeP as a guiding framework for approaching change in the municipality was put on ice as it was never signed off by the former Municipal Manager, just as in the case of the recommendations of the BPR and the SAP GSS. Respondents were concerned that decisions could so easily be changed without consultation, which was evident during the previous “business planning and budgeting processes”. As a result, there was intense resistance to change, as evidenced by the union representatives withdrawing from the Steering Committee and effectively the BPR process. The ability to respond to the need for change was compromised by the nature of the organisation and its culture, where importance is placed on trivial issues rather than on important far reaching issues like competence, cohesion and organisational identity.

When the institutional development project was resuscitated in 2011, a detailed review of these reports, supplemented by interviews with managers, highlighted the following critical issues:

- The CDM was an organisational structure that was not aligned to the core mandate of the municipality.
- There was a need to formally integrate employees who had been transferred from the former DWAF and the provincial DoH as a result of the devolution of water services and environmental health service functions respectively.
- There was a need for a framework through which to facilitate the migration of staff from the current structure to the revised structure.
There was a need for an HR strategy to be used as a basis for addressing personnel issues within the municipality.

There was a need for a change management framework to support change processes within the municipality.

The lack of validated job descriptions for the various posts on the approved organisational structure of the municipality created uncertainty.

There was a need to formally adopt the T.A.S.K. job evaluation system as the uniform system for evaluating the size/value of jobs within the municipality.

There was a need for a review of the travel allowance policy of the municipality to ensure alignment with legislative requirements; and

There was a need to consider expanding the concept of total cost to company to other categories of employees i.e., Levels 2 and 3 within the municipality.

These issues created instability and were a cause for concern. An urgent turnaround was required. Most respondents felt that the municipality did not enjoy the support of top management during the implementation of these transformation processes and that there seemed to be no sense of urgency from leadership on matters of organisational transformation. Some of the reasons for this conduct were attributed to the leadership of the former Municipal Manager. It was stated that:

“The lack of urgency concerning the critical … issues related to the IDP and the budgeting process has created … the impression of misunderstanding of the prioritisation need” (BPR Report, 2007, p.8).

All this undermined the BPR process and the image of CDM (BPR Report, 2007, p.9). According to the EDR Report (2008), a worrying trend was the high level of rejection generally felt by managers towards the top management of the CDM. There was regular reference to a “leadership vacuum” within the CDM, and “a lack of vision” from the leadership. To some extent this had to be construed as self-criticism, but this was also criticism of the non-participating managers as well as top management.
The MT also reported that during the SAP GSS process the former Municipal Manager was hardly available for any of the working sessions. This is confirmed by the assertions in the EDR Report (2008):

“During the entire assignment and especially to the regular participants of EDR workshops, it was apparent that the same dedication and commitment was not shared by all. Not even the Municipal Manager was able to find more than a few hours to attend the first day of workshops”. (p.21)

4.2.3. Strategies for consideration in leading change in the CDM

The municipality has made significant progress under the new leadership and some aspects of change have been dealt with and some frameworks have been adopted. Some respondents asserted that the municipality needed to consider setting up a dedicated change structure that would ensure that the organisation developed and implemented a project charter regarding meetings, timekeeping, attendance and corporate respect, as well as the development of a matrix project management system that ensured process ownership and accountability. Previously, undertakings were made for specific actions and then simply not carried out, which led to employee dissatisfaction which had negative long-term implications for the CDM’s cohesion.

Respondents also stressed the fact that the municipality needed to capacitate the human resource management (HRM) team to be in a position to drive transformation processes. As such, there was a need to develop a change management training programme. Once properly capacitated, the HRM team would ensure, among others, that there was a framework to facilitate the migration of staff from the current structure to the revised organisational structure aligned to the core mandate of the municipality.

The BPR Report (2007) indicates that “problems exist in that there is little evidence of visionary leadership, and buy in to any real vision” (p.9). It is concludes that the source of influence in the CDM was based on positional and political power.
People felt and continue to feel disempowered as rational decisions are overturned, despite the appearance of a consultative management style, which actually tends to be autocratic. This has all led to great uncertainty and a lack of trust in the decision making process.

4.3 Conclusion
In this chapter the researcher presented the findings of the interviews that were conducted. This chapter also dealt with a detailed review of reports produced by previous transformation studies, and the reviews were supplemented by interviews with management and other stakeholders. The researcher analysed the following reports as part of documentation evidence: Organisational Development Study, Business Reengineering Process (Final Report CDM), SAP Growth Support Services Report and Institutional Development Report. The researcher will be able to interpret and analyse the findings in the next chapter.
CHAPTER FIVE: INTERPRETATION AND ANALYSIS OF FINDINGS

5. Introduction

This chapter will focus on an analysis of the key thematic findings and also assess the extent to which they address the research questions. For the purpose of analysing these key findings, Chapter Two serves as a premise for the discussion of theoretical and empirical concepts regarding change and transformation.

Jambo (2010) suggests that as with most qualitative research, some secondary themes appear as emerging concepts that might have been previously analytically discussed, but not with sufficient intellectual vigour. As in the case of Van Der Voet (2013, citing Fernandez and Rainey, 2006), Robertson and Seneviratne, 1995), this study intends to contribute to insights about change management in public organisations. This research study sought to answer the following research questions:

1. What are the factors leading to the problems being experienced in leading change in the CDM?
2. What are the trends in leading change in the CDM?
3. What strategies are being considered in leading change in the CDM?

In this part of the research, the researcher will interpret and analyse the key findings presented in Chapter Four. In order to provide a guided trajectory for the analysis and interpretation of the findings, the researcher will be confined to the themes as discussed in Chapter Four.

Considering that the themes were derived from the research questions themselves the linkage in the analysis will be shown. The researcher will also go back to the literature reflected in Chapter Two.
The researcher will discuss Kouzes and Posner’s Leadership Challenge Model and Kotter’s Leading Change: Why Transformations Efforts Fail Model. These models provide a point of reference for case studies of the CDM where leadership change or leading change have been successfully implemented. In Chapter Two these models provided a basis for theoretical analysis and as such the researcher will use these two models as a theoretical framework.

5.1 Interpretation and analysis of key themes

5.1.1 Factors leading to the problems being experienced in leading change in the CDM

Despite the importance of organisational change for public management practice, organisational change is generally not studied as an implementation problem in public management research (Van der Voet, 2013, citing Steward and Kringas, 2003; Olsen, 1991). In terms of the findings of this research, the challenges facing the CDM are largely centred on the positioning of the municipality and the overall approach the municipality is taking towards fulfilling its mandate and functions. The CDM therefore has to embark on organisational change specifically relating to culture, management practices and roles and responsibilities. The implementation of change through business reengineering calls for a review of the roles of leadership and other stakeholders (Van der Voet, 2013).

As indicated by Nyalunga (2006), municipalities in South Africa are faced with new changes and challenges. Among other challenges facing municipalities in South Africa today are the following:

1. The creation of larger areas of jurisdiction through the demarcation of new municipal boundaries. This is often done through the integration of former townships and rural areas into established municipalities;
2. A corresponding increase in service delivery backlogs, which new municipalities must eliminate;
3. A complete redefinition of local government roles;
4 The devolution of new powers and functions to local government, without an accompanying increase in its fiscal base;
5 Increased demands and opportunities provided by the information age;
6 A new and evolving relationship between councillors and officials, for example, the introduction of Executive Mayor, Speaker positions and so on;
7 New ways of service delivery;
8 Electricity restructuring;
9 Lack of capacity; and
10 New development duties.

This scenario is also true for the CDM. One of the key challenges in “restructuring processes” is the anxiety that this creates among many employees, who fear that the process will result in job losses. This was particularly true in the case of employees who were transferred from other entities to the CDM, a development that resulted in great uncertainty. Bekink (2006, in Reddy et al. 2012) argues that municipalities must investigate and understand their local circumstances, needs and dynamics and develop a concrete vision to improve the overall quality of life of the local citizenry.

Respondents expected the full involvement and participation of all stakeholders throughout the change interventions. Respondents indicated what role they expected to be played by both leadership and the general staff in the change process. Some respondents mentioned the non-involvement of key stakeholders and poor participation by leadership as some of the factors that made transformation processes fail.

Van der Voet et al. (2013, citing Burke, 2010; Armenakis and Bedeian, 1999) state that a central position in the literature review on change management is that the way an organisational change initiative is received by employees is dependent on the entire implementation process. As such, the way in which organisational change is implemented – the process of change – is an important antecedent of the commitment to change by all employees (cf. Kickert, 2010; By, 2005; Burnes, 2004, in Van der Voet et al. 2013).
In emergent change processes, change leadership is to a greater extent shared between different hierarchical levels. Change leadership activities are for a large part devolved to lower level organisational members. Change is initiated and guided by senior managers, but is largely filled in and implemented by lower level managers and employees. Leadership behaviours that are central to the change management literature, such as envisioning change, communicating change and role modelling, are carried out on lower levels in the organisational hierarchy than during the change process itself (Van der Voet, 2013, citing Gill, 2002; Herold, et al., Higgs and Roland, 2005).

In many organisations a barrier exists between the various layers of management and between management and staff. This barrier hinders organisational performance and introduces stress, politics and infighting where none should exist. The IDeP and the IDP advocated an inclusive process when implementing change. Both processes proposed an approach through which various key stakeholders are kept informed and engaged in order to obtain buy-in.

The various project teams consulted extensively on various aspects of the projects, whether it was facilitating workshops on the organisational structure, presenting deliverables to management and the Mayoral Committee, accounting to the Project Steering Committee, listening to the concerns of employees in satellite offices, and so forth.

5.1.2 Trends in leading change in the CDM

According to Van der Voet (2013), leading change in the public sector encompasses transformational leadership behaviours, but is also aimed at connecting with external actors, lobbying for support and making strategic trade-offs. On the higher organisational levels, leading change in the public sector is as much about envisioning as it is about negotiating the content of change. The findings of this research indicate that the municipality did not enjoy the support of top management during the transformation processes. There also often seemed to be no sense of urgency from leadership on matters of organisational transformation.
Further findings indicate that the CDM does not have procedures or policies in place that could foster the alignment of resources and capacity to adequately respond to the IDP’s imperatives.

The Kousez and Posner Leadership Challenge Model mentions one of the functions of leadership as being the ability to inspire vision. This means that leaders must have a vision of change and must be able to eloquently share that vision with others. The researcher concurs with Van der Voet’s assertion that envisioning is about negotiating the content of change (2013). The IDeP report also emphasises that the municipality can drive transformation processes to ensure that the role of top management during transformation processes is intact and proper organisational processes are adhered to.

The IDeP report proposes that the best approach for the municipality to address these challenges is based on the Burke Litwin model, which addresses organisational change in a holistic manner. The model speaks to the need to address change by using three key approaches:

1) Organisational change through aligning the leadership to the strategic intent of the municipality and thereby changing organisational culture and subsequently changing systems and policies to support the new organisational culture.

2) Achieving organisational change by translating strategy into a new structure with new roles and responsibilities that enforce new behaviours and new outputs that lead to (improved) performance.

3) Facilitating organisational change by aligning leadership to the new strategy, which will subsequently create a need for new management practices that will create a work climate that supports the required change.

A complex organisational environment calls for modified behaviour by senior managers that goes beyond transformational leadership (Van der Voet, 2013). It is imperative that any organisational change is dependent on changing the way the leadership team approaches work, what the leadership team rewards and the work climate that the leadership team is able to create.
It is also important that the human resource management team is equipped to guide management through organisational change and facilitates the necessary changes in structures, systems and policies required by the change. A robust change management approach is imperative to facilitate sustainable change.

5.1.3 Strategies for consideration in leading change in the CDM

As indicated in previous chapters, the municipality has implemented a number of change management processes in order to put in place new kinds of organisational structures and arrangements. Evidently, the municipality was never able to fuse the recommendations of these studies or transformational processes together. It is the contention of the researcher that this was a fundamental reflection of how under the leadership of the former Municipal Manager, change was viewed negatively.

The researcher believes that under this leadership, attention was never paid to taking advantage of the recommendations as well as the innovation that was brought about by these interventions. A good example is the implementation of the SAP system. The municipality at the time would have probably been among the few public sector organisations to benefit from this incredible ERP solution. It was stated in Chapter Four that even after this system was implemented, there was no technology usage evolution to speak of - it could even be suggested that evolution had been backward from the day the SAP system was implemented, as the training was insufficient and thus served no real purpose.

Further findings indicate that the former Municipal Manager would often not attend work sessions or even support some of the change processes she initiated. This was also often mirrored by the irregular participation of senior managers in other meetings and the negative work ethic prevailing within the CDM. The researcher contends that that this development was a distortion of Kotter’s (1995) assertion that one of management’s mandates is to minimise risk and to keep the current system operating.
A more positive reason posited by Kotter on why transformations fail, which he says is error number one, is *not establishing a great enough sense of urgency*. The municipality at this moment was not making an effort to address change imperatives. Kotter further shows that, by definition, change requires creating a new system, which in turn always demands leadership. According to Aiken and Keller (2007), when a CEO’s version of the transformation story is clear, success comes from taking it to employees, encouraging debate about it, reinforcing it and encouraging people to infuse it with their own personal meaning.

According to some of the key findings in Chapter Four, the municipality has made significant progress under the new leadership and some aspects of change have been dealt with and some frameworks have been adopted. However, the municipality still needs to consider setting up a dedicated organisational change structure that would ensure that the organisation develops continuously and in an organised and proactive manner. The CDM should also implement a project charter regarding meetings, timekeeping, attendance and corporate respect and develop a matrix project management system that ensures process ownership and accountability across the organisation.

Some respondents noted that undertakings were made for specific actions and then simply not carried out, which led to employee dissatisfaction and erosion of trust in management. The researcher acknowledges that the CDM was therefore exposed to extreme vulnerability and had virtually declined to a state that neutralised productivity, prohibited change and the achievement of its organisational goal, and eroded strategic capacity.

In the next chapter the researcher will provide recommendations on the challenges regarding the implementation of successful transformation processes in the CDM. The researcher’s final presentation of recommendations will cover all previous interventions, including the IDeP Report, the BPR report, SAP GSS, Organisational Development Study and the Institutional Development Project report.
In an attempt to provide points for consideration at this analysis stage, the researcher will consolidate some key activities that could be considered as recommendations for the successful implementation of organisational change through the comparison of what the municipality could have done and what the Kotter and Kouzes and Posner leadership change models provide. These considerations, although not exhaustive, arise from analysing some of the key recommendations in the analysed documentation as well as from interviews. This will ensure an integrated and successful change approach.

5.2 **Kouzes and Posner's Leadership Challenge Model and Kotter's Leading Change: Why Transformations Efforts Fail Model: Models for Consideration**

The Leadership Challenge Model by Kouzes and Posner (1987) and Kotter's Leading Change: Why Transformation Efforts Fail Model (1996) have been discussed by the researcher as part of the literature review in Chapter Two. The CDM could have adopted these two models, out of many, to implement transformational change. A large number of change leadership models exist, many of which often prescribe similar desired leadership behaviours. All of these models envision a future state, communicating the vision and providing a plan for action and consolidating changes (Van der Voet, 2013). Miller (2001, in Van der Voet, 2013) argues that successful change leaders focus on what is important, make sure that the need for change is emphasised, and personally lead the implementation.

The researcher was exposed to several other models when conducting the literature review for purposes of this study. Such models include Lewin’s model as well as the McKinsey7S model. Lewin’s model is often used to communicate change and to convince stakeholders that the change being undertaken is necessary. The McKinsey7S model is based on the premise that for an organisation to perform well, there are seven key elements that need to be aligned and mutually reinforcing, namely, shared values and vision, strategy, structure, systems, style, staff and skills.
The Leadership Challenge Model is really a communication model and the Kotter model is concerned with the performance of the organisation. While these models do not address all the aspects of leadership and change processes, the researcher contends that the chosen models are relevant and useful for the purpose of leading change in the CDM. The Kotter model on leading change illustrates how vital it is to manage change so that transformational change is not undermined. This model presents excellent factors that should be considered when implementing change.

Kouzes and Posner’s Leadership Challenge Model proposes seven practices that can be used to turn challenging opportunities into remarkable success. The practices are:

1. Knowing what leadership is really about
2. Challenging the process
3. Inspiring a shared Vision
4. Enabling others to act
5. Modeling the way
6. Encouraging the heart
7. The beginning of leadership

According to Huerta Melchor (2008), change in government implies the transformation of culture and attitudes. The implementation of a reform initiative invariably generates opposition from people who perceive their interests as being negatively affected and their values as threatened. Thus, overcoming resistance and obtaining and maintaining people’s support for a reform initiative indicates effective management of change. Leadership plays a crucial role in making change happen by influencing people’s mindsets and eliciting their commitment to the change process.

The CDM has sought to implement a number of change management processes in order to put in place new organisational structures and arrangements. If fully implemented, this would have allowed the CDM to be able to craft a strategic approach in dealing with emerging challenges.
However, these change management processes were either not successful or were abandoned. Given the fact that this had serious financial and leadership implications, there is a need to reflect on models that could be successfully used during the change management processes in the CDM. Newman (1996) indicates that local government review has profound implications for both organisational and political cultures.

Most respondents found that some of the change interventions that were implemented lacked a fundamental basis or an inclusive frame of reference and in certain instances appeared unguided. The researcher discussed several models or frameworks with most of the respondents, mostly EM and MT members, who were aware of Kotter’s model and suggested that the model be used as a guide for implementing change. Some of the respondents, however, did not seem to have specific suggestions on how the models could be used.
5.2.1 Transforming CDM through Kotter’s Model and Kouzes and Posner’s Model

The tabular presentation below presents juxtaposition of the two models by indicating how the municipality could handle the change following these two models. The tabular presentation will consider both models.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Step (Kotter)</th>
<th>Best Practice (Kouzes &amp; Posner)</th>
<th>What the CDM could do to transform</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Establishing a sense of urgency – Examining market and competitive realities and identifying as well as discussing crises, or major opportunities</td>
<td>Challenging the process</td>
<td>The municipality could review the IDP to ensure that its IDP speaks to the new direction the municipality wants to take. The CDM could develop an implementation plan that sets out how it would implement this new strategy in terms of systems, structures, people, etc.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Forming a Powerful Guiding coalition - assembling a group with enough power to lead the change effort | Knowing what leadership is really about | The senior management team could discuss the new direction, what it means for each of the different divisions and for the municipality as a whole. The CDM must look at the new organisational culture (values and behaviours) it would want to implement and encourage. To do this, the CDM could take the following steps:  
- Define the new values and behaviours in a charter that sets out what behaviours the municipality would want to achieve, e.g. taking initiative, building sustainable networks, etc. (aligning new goals to Batho Pele)  
- Present the new behaviours to Council for approval and undertake an annual culture audit to identify if these values are lived in the Municipality. |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Step (Kotter)</th>
<th>Best Practice (Kouzes &amp; Posner)</th>
<th>What the CDM could do to transform</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Creating a Vision – <em>Creating a vision to help direct the change effort and develop strategies for achieving that vision</em></td>
<td>Inspiring a shared Vision</td>
<td>The municipality could create awareness of the new direction by calling all municipal employees to a road show where the Municipal Manager and the Mayor explain to employees what the new vision is and what that means for each employee. Key messages should be used to explain the benefits, i.e. there will be no job losses, services to communities will be improved, and affiliate municipalities will be supported.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Communication a Vision – <em>Using every vehicle possible to communicate the new vision and strategies</em></td>
<td>Encouraging the heart</td>
<td>HR, together with Communication, could look at values, awards, posters, notice board memos and other ways of ensuring employees stay aware. The CDM could ensure that labour is informed on pertinent issues, utilising internal publications or formal communiqués stating intent and key messages</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Empowering Others to Act on the Vision - <em>Getting rid of obstacles to change, changing systems or structures that seriously undermine the vision</em></td>
<td>Enabling others to act</td>
<td>HR could ensure that line managers receive appropriate support during these weekly or monthly meetings in order to ensure that the messages are consistent and change is sustained. HR, together with Communication, must develop weekly or monthly updates in terms of:  <em>Progress against the organisational goals</em>  <em>Answers to frequently asked questions</em>  <em>Next steps</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Step (Kotter)</td>
<td>Best Practice( Kouzes &amp; Posner)</td>
<td>What the CDM could do to transform</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| **Planning for and Creating short-term wins – planning for visible performance improvements, creating those improvements and recognising as well as rewarding employees involved in the improvements** | **Modeling the way** | Ensure that managers are part of teams set up to gauge whether employees understand the change and what the municipality needs to achieve. The manager should indicate:  
- The goals for the each division  
- The behaviours required in each division  
- What will be required of each employee  
- Progress so far and next steps  
- Address questions asked by employees  
(The meetings of such teams could happen weekly or monthly to ensure that individual needs are addressed, there is a positive perception of the change and employees adopt and drive the change) |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Step (Kotter)</th>
<th>Best Practice (Kouzes &amp; Posner)</th>
<th>What the CDM could do to transform</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Consolidating improvements – Using increased credibility to change systems, structures and policies that don't fit the vision</td>
<td><strong>The beginning of Leadership</strong></td>
<td>HR could ensure that line managers receive appropriate support during these weekly or monthly meetings in order to ensure that the messages are consistent and change is sustained. HR, together with Communication, could develop weekly or monthly updates in terms of:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Progress against the organisational goals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Answers to frequently asked questions and Next steps</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Present the final revised organisational structure to the Mayoral Committee and then Council for approval;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Ensure alignment with the IDP; and</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Executive Managers and Managers need to take ownership of the structure, lead from the front and prepare for implementation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Institutionalising New approaches – Articulating the connections new behaviours and corporate success and to develop the means to ensure leadership development and succession</td>
<td>Management practices and organisational policies and systems</td>
<td>Management could review all HR policies and organisational practices, such as performance management, to ensure that these practices reward the new behaviours. This would include things such as who bursaries are given to, etc.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
5.3 Conclusion

In this part of the research, the researcher interpreted and analysed the key findings. In the analysis and interpretation of the findings, the researcher was confined to the underpinning research questions dealing with:

- Factors leading to the problems being experienced in leading change in the CDM
- Trends in leading change in the CDM, as well as
- Strategies being considered in leading change in the CDM.

The researcher discussed Kouzes and Posner’s Leadership Challenge Model and Kotter’s Leading Change: Why Transformation Efforts Fail Model as models for change intervention in the municipality. Research questions were revisited and the researcher was able to draw a conclusion and make recommendations.
CHAPTER SIX: CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

6. Introduction

As outlined in Chapter One, the purpose of the research was to investigate the factors leading to the problems experienced in leading change in the Capricorn District Municipality. The research followed a qualitative case study paradigm.

6.1 Research questions

In determining the direction of the research, the following questions were asked:

1. What are the factors leading to the problems being experienced in leading change in the CDM?
2. What are the trends in leading change in the CDM?
3. What are the strategies being considered in leading change in the CDM?

6.2 Summary of research findings and analysis

A summary of the findings and analysis of the study will be presented by answering the three key research questions and thereafter making recommendations.

6.2.1 Research Question 1

*What are the factors leading to the problems being experienced in leading change in the CDM?*

The municipality does not have a strategy and mechanism/s to address emerging change.

It was noted that through the IDeP that a change management framework was developed. However, this framework was not properly used to manage change relating to current and future projects.
The following challenges were noted as leading to the problematic implementation of change in the municipality:

- There was no phased approach to implementing change processes;
- There was a lack of processes/templates for managing stakeholders during change;
- There was a lack of processes/templates for embedding change; and
- There was a lack of processes/templates for sustaining change interventions.

Change in the municipality is still seen as threatening by certain sectors and levels of resistance are high, even amongst managers who under normal circumstances would be expected to lead and drive change. There is a prevailing view that change efforts are a waste of time as the outcomes/results are never fully implemented. A review of the results of previous change initiatives confirms this position. The purpose of the change management framework was primarily to support future change projects.

6.2.2 Research Question 2

**What are the trends in leading change in the CDM?**

Managing change refers to the adaptation of people's mind sets, culture and attitudes to a new environment, paving the way for reform initiatives aimed at producing the desired results through facing undesired side-effects and resistance to change (Huerta Melchor, 2008). The absence of strategies for the implementation of change leads to haphazard and uncontrolled implementation of change interventions. The poor articulation of change in municipal processes as well as lack of ownership by management compromises the leadership and management when implementing transformation in the municipality. The slow implementation of recommendations on change processes is posing challenges as it breeds anxiety and mistrust among employees.

For example the CDM, like all municipalities in South Africa, is expected to migrate to the T.A.S.K job evaluation system as a mechanism to determine the size/value of jobs. However, this will bring major changes in the pay system and other administrative practices of municipalities across the country.
The CDM should implement a change management strategy to address whatever negative perceptions and anxieties may accompany this process, considering that the municipality has just completed an integration of transferred employees. A proactive response in the form of a well-communicated change management strategy would have avoided some of the mistakes of the past where change was haphazardly managed.

6.2.3. Research Question 3

**What strategies are being considered in leading change in the CDM?**

There seems to be lack of ownership, including by management, of the revised organisational structure as well as other related processes. Notwithstanding the number of consultations, there are still processes that have not been completed by management as recommended by different change interventions. A specific example is the Institutional Development Project that handled the review of the organisational structure and placement process of transferred staff, among other activities.

There is seemingly indecision in dealing with recommendations in this regard, mainly because there appears to be no commitment to owning and driving processes to completion. The following considerations are recommended for implementation:

1. Review and adapt the change management framework;
2. Implement the recommendations of all change management processes undertaken in the municipality;
3. Present the final revised organisational structure to the Mayoral Committee and then Council for approval;
4. Ensure alignment with the IDP; and
5. Executive Managers and Managers need to take ownership of the structure, lead from the front and prepare for implementation.
6.3 Kouzes and Posner’s Leadership Challenge Model and Kotter’s Leading Change: Why Transformations Efforts Fail Model: Models for consideration

According to Kotter (1995), some corporate change efforts have been very successful, while a few have been utter failures. Some have had partial success, but with a distinct tilt toward the lower end of the scale of achievement. The lessons that can be drawn are interesting and will probably be relevant to even more organisations in the increasingly competitive business environment. The Kouzes and Posner’s Leadership Challenge Model and Kotter’s Leading Change: Why Transformation Efforts Fail Model have been presented as models that the municipality could copy when implementing change as they are considered two of the best practices. Kotter’s Model has eight steps and Kouzez and Posner’s has seven Best Practises. Both models are presented in Table G below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Step (Kotter)</th>
<th>Best Practice (Kouzes &amp; Posner)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Establishing a sense of urgency</strong> – Examining market and competitive realities and identifying as well as discussing crises, or major opportunities**</td>
<td>Challenging the process</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Forming a powerful Guiding coalition</strong> – Assembling a group with enough power to lead the change effort</td>
<td>Knowing what leadership is really about</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Creating a Vision</strong> – Creating a vision to help direct the change effort and developing strategies for achieving that vision</td>
<td>Inspiring a shared Vision</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Communicating a Vision</strong> – Using every vehicle possible to communicate the new vision and strategies</td>
<td>Encouraging the heart</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Empowering Others to Act on the Vision</strong> – Getting rid of obstacles to change, changing systems or structures that seriously undermine the vision</td>
<td>Enabling others to act</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Planning for and Creating short-term wins</strong> – Planning for visible performance improvements, creating those improvements and recognising as well as rewarding employees involved in the improvements</td>
<td>Modelling the way</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Step (Kotter)</td>
<td>Best Practice (Kouzes and Posner)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consolidating Improvements – <em>Using increased credibility to change systems, structures and policies that don’t fit the vision</em></td>
<td>The beginning of Leadership</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Institutionalising new approaches – <em>Articulating the connections new behaviours and corporate success and to develop the means to ensure leadership development and succession</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 6.4 Conclusion

The researcher has reviewed the purpose the research and the research questions of the study so as to draw a conclusion. The study analysed the factors that led to the unsuccessful implementation of change management processes in the Capricorn District Municipality. The findings of the study generally show the following:

1. The absence of an integrated change management framework contributes towards the poor implementation of transformational change in the municipality.
2. There seems to be a lack of ownership by management in as far as change processes (including the organisational structure) are concerned. This results in weak consultation processes as well as poor engagement of labour organisations.
3. Change in the municipality is still seen as threatening and levels of resistance are high, even amongst managers who under normal circumstances would be expected to lead and drive change. There is a prevailing view that change efforts are a waste of time as the outcomes/results are never implemented.

The researcher believes that the CDM is making inroads in terms of looking at transformation and what benefits it can produce. It appears as if the municipality is making a concerted effort to ensure that the IDP is aligned to the provincial and national mandates.
However, the municipality still faces challenges regarding educating and mobilising critical stakeholders in as far as change is concerned. The Kouzes and Posner’s Leadership Challenge and Kotter’s Leading Change: Why Transformations Efforts Fail models present an opportunity for the CDM to improve the implementation of change interventions in the municipality.

6.5 Recommendations

In addressing the phenomenon of leading change in the Capricorn District Municipality, the researcher presented best case studies of leading change in local government in various contexts. The contexts were presented at a global level, the African context, the regional, the national and more specifically, within the context of the Limpopo Province. Lastly, a case study of the Capricorn District Municipality was also evaluated. Given this background, the researcher seeks to present recommendations to address the best practice scenario of leading change in local government.

6.5.1 Leading change in the Capricorn District Municipality

1. Review of the macro and micro structures of the municipality on an annual basis and ensure that:
   - Workshops with various stakeholders should be conducted to engage on structural matters
   - A detailed outline of the proposed structure should be drafted and communicated
   - Executive Management and Council approval for structure should be obtained
2. Address current HR management shortfalls by:
   - Interviewing line managers to identify gaps in the HR structure
   - Developing an HR competency framework
   - Conducting an HR competency audit to identify potential development areas
   - Developing an HR improvement plan geared towards both individual and structural growth

3. Improve mechanisms for addressing change/transformation by:
   - Reviewing current transformation strategies/ interventions
   - Signing off the Institution Development Plan
   - Reviewing the change management framework and seeking its adoption by Council
   - Identifying key strategies and interventions to address current transformation gaps.

Lastly, the municipality should consider using the principles and recommendations espoused in the Kouzes and Posner’s Leadership Challenge Model and Kotter’s Leading Change: Why Transformations Efforts Fail Model as a framework and philosophy for managing change.

6.5.2 Leading change in local government: Limpopo Province Context


It is the view of the researcher that at the provincial level measures need to be put in place to ensure that at all times district municipalities comply with the Municipal Structures Act and the Municipal Systems Act. These Acts define the different categories of municipalities and their roles. The Municipal Structures Act provides for the division of functions between category B and category C municipalities with a clear mandate to district municipalities in terms of district management areas.
This legislation describes the role of the district as a body that must seek to achieve equitable and sustainable social and economic development within its jurisdiction by:

- Ensuring integrated development planning for the district as a whole;
- Promoting bulk infrastructure development and provision of services for the district as a whole;
- Building the capacity of local municipalities in their jurisdictions to perform their functions and exercise their powers where such capacity is lacking; and
- Promoting the equitable distribution of resources between local municipalities and to ensure appropriate levels of access to municipal services.

It is on this basis that the researcher recommends that CoGHSTA should consider a review of the role of district municipalities and the District Integrated Development Plan. The district municipality needs to be strengthened and its role clarified\(^1\) in terms of:

1. Strategic planning, prioritisation and development planning
2. Economic development of the district as a whole
3. Spatial Development Planning (GIS, land use management, economic planning, transport planning and related issues)
4. Capacity building in local municipalities
5. Increasing its role as stakeholder manager and generator of investment in the district
6. Improving performance monitoring and evaluation, which includes aspects of performance reporting, local government transformation, monitoring and development of district Indicators and driving district-specific target setting and monitoring.

\(^1\) The White Paper on Local Government provided the first platform for clarity in terms of the role of metropolitan governance, district governance and local governance (Section D).
6.5.3 Leading change in local government: South African Context

To ensure that municipalities develop and implement plans made against clearly defined targets and goals set out in the Local Government Strategic Agenda at the national level, it is the recommendation of the researcher that national government should accelerate the implementation of the three strategic priorities identified as anchor elements to this process, namely:

- Mainstreaming hands-on support to local government to improve municipal governance, performance and accountability;
- Addressing the structure and governance arrangements of the State in order to better strengthen, support and monitor local government; and
- Refining and strengthening the policy, regulatory and fiscal environments for local government and giving greater attention to enforcement measures.

The researcher believes that implementing these anchor elements by national government will propel the local government transformation agenda. These elements have been translated into key performance areas with specific performance measures, deliverables and timeframes for national government.

6.5.4 Leading change in local government: African, SADC and global contexts

The researcher opted to combine recommendations for the southern African, African and global contexts. The researcher recommends the creation of an exchange programme for African leaders through which to dialogue lessons from the case studies presented in Chapter One. This initiative will promote the spirit of dialogue about issues of leadership and peer learning, which have been eroded by decades of the poor administration of government and public entities, as well as negative media reporting of African leadership.

The case studies in Chapter One focused on transformational change in Africa and internationally. In Africa, two case studies were considered - one was the enablers and disablers of leadership for transformational change in Africa research pilot project, and the other was the study on how African transformation was driven by the strategic application of information and communication technologies to climate change.
Globally, of particular interest was how sixteen economic development agents (DAs)/corporations from thirteen cities across Europe, North America and the rest of the world were used as change agents to propel the local government agenda.

6.6 Conclusion

It is the firm belief of the researcher that the recommendations made in this study will elevate the level of debate on the local government transformation agenda and how leaders across the African continent and the globe address the issues of leading change and transformation in local and hopefully other spheres of government. Local governments across the globe are concerned with reforms of one type or another and it is vital for government agencies, in particular local government, to lead in terms of developing best practices of leading change.
REFERENCES


Local Government: Municipal Finance Act 56 of 2003


Politics. (pp. 11-29) [http://repository.uwc.ac.za/xmlui/bitstream/handle/10566/551/PowellLocalGovernme nt2012.pdf?sequence=1]. Accessed on 17 March 2014.


