Four-Four Masihlalisane – Newspaper representation of the South African minibus taxi industry in relation to the *Bus Rapid Transit (BRT)* system

Nkosinathi Leonard Selekane

Dr Sarah Chiumbu
(Supervisor)

A thesis submitted to the Faculty of Humanities, University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg, in fulfilment of the Degree of Master of Arts in Media Studies

---

Four- Four Masihlalisane: The term was frequently used in the minibus taxi industry to refer to a situation where passengers were asked to share seats and this amounted in the overloading of minibus taxis. Currently with state regulation such practices are no longer common. The term was used in the title of the study because no individual who has ever used minibus taxis will fail to link the term to the minibus taxi industry. It is a negative term that promotes negative stereotypes about the minibus taxi industry. It is however relevant in the context of the findings of this study.
DECLARATION

I declare that this research report is my own work. It is submitted for the Degree of Master of Arts at the University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg. It has not been submitted for any other degree or examination in any form.

_______________________________

Nkosinathi Leonard Selekeane

_______________ Day of ________________
DEDICATION

This dissertation is dedicated to my late uncle Mr Louis Selekeane (Mokone), may his soul rest in peace alongside God and my ancestors, for the support he provided spiritually and physically in my life and to my daughter Amahle (Mumu) and my wife Lebo for giving me the strength to live.
Acknowledgements

I thank the Almighty God for granting me the opportunity to do this and to complete this work. I am grateful to my employer the University of South Africa for funding this particular study. I wish to offer my gratitude to my supervisor Dr Sarah Chiumbu for her patience with this study and her guidance. I am grateful to my colleagues at the University of South Africa (Department of Communication Science) for their constant support especially to my two mentors Dr BS Karam and Prof BT Mbatha for their consistency in checking on the progress of this dissertation. To my parents, thank you for the motivation that has pushed me this far.
ABSTRACT

By

Nkosinathi Leonard Selekané

This study examined the newspaper representation of the South African minibus taxi industry in relation to the roll out of the Bus Rapid Transit/Integrated Rapid Transit system in 2009. Articles from major newspapers in 2009 were examined in order to understand how the minibus taxi industry was represented. The aim of the study was to add to the body of knowledge on the media’s representation of the black working class in post-apartheid South Africa. The study was undertaken against a backdrop of existing debates on whether the media in South Africa is transforming. The research is theoretically based on Cultural Studies and the Critical Political Economy of the media. The study investigated the way in which twenty newspaper articles represented the minibus taxi industry during the introduction of the Bus Rapid Transit System. Norman Fairclough’s Critical Discourse Analysis was used to analyse the content of the newspaper articles. The study only focused on English newspapers and did not investigate news from other media, such as the radio and television. A further limitation was the sample size, which was small in comparison to the number of articles that were published on the Bus Rapid Transit System in 2009. The findings revealed that the media continues to perpetuate negative stereotypes of the minibus taxi industry. Future research should include the analysis of images through semiotics and expand the research topic to include the taxi recapitalisation project and road safety. A larger sample should also be used to study the representation of the minibus taxi industry in South African media.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AMPS</td>
<td>All Media and Products Survey</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ANC</td>
<td>African National Congress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BRT</td>
<td>Bus Rapid Transit System</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GDP</td>
<td>Gross Domestic Product</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IRT</td>
<td>Integrated Rapid Transit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NAFCOC</td>
<td>National African Federated Chamber of Commerce and Industry</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NTA</td>
<td>Western Cape National Taxi Alliance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SANTACO</td>
<td>South African National Taxi Council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PPPs</td>
<td>Public Private Partnerships</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UIF</td>
<td>Unemployment Insurance Fund</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UTAF</td>
<td>United Taxi Association Forum</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

Declaration iii  
DEDICATION iv  
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS v  
ABSTRACT vi  
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS vii  

## 1. CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION AND RESEARCH BACKGROUND 1  
1.1 Introduction 1  
1.2 Research background and contextual setting 2  
  1.2.1 A brief overview of the minibus taxi industry 2  
  1.2.2 Taxi industry in South Africa as part of the informal sector 3  
  1.2.3 The Bus Rapid Transit /Integrated Rapid Transit systems 4  
  1.2.4 Newspaper ownership in South Africa 5  
1.3 Problem Statement 7  
1.4 Research Hypothesis 8  
1.5 Aim of the study 8  
1.6 Research questions 8  
1.7 Research design 9  
1.8 Organization of the research paper 9  

## 2. CHAPTER TWO: LITERATURE REVIEW AND THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK 10  
2.1 Introduction 10  
  2.1.1 Class and the media 10  
  2.1.2 Media representation of the minibus taxi industry prior to the new dispensation 16  
  2.1.3 Black identity in South Africa 17  
  2.1.4 Racism and transformation in South African media 20  
2.2 Cultural Studies 23  
  2.2.1 Representation and stereotypes 23  
  2.2.2 Racial stereotypes in the media 27  
2.3 Critical Political Economy of the media 31  
  2.3.1 Media ownership in capitalist societies 31
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.3.2 Advertising influence on the media</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.3 Media concentration and conformity</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4 Sociology of news production: news values and journalistic bias</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4.1 News values and journalistic bias</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5 Conclusion</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>3. Chapter Three: Research Methodology</strong></td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1 Introduction</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2 Research design and methodology</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.1 Rationale for using qualitative and quantitative research</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3 Data Collection Methods</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4 Data analysis methods</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.1 Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA)</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.2 The thematic approach</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5 Conclusion</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>4. CHAPTER FOUR: DATA PRESENTATION AND ANALYSIS</strong></td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1 Introduction</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2 News articles on the BRT and minibus taxi industry in 2009</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3 Analysis of headlines, sub headlines, and full articles</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4 Identified themes</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5 Conclusion</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>5. CHAPTER FIVE: DEMYSTIFYING MEDIA REPRESENTATION</strong></td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1 Introduction</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2 The problems of the media in capitalist societies</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2.1 Conformity in headlines</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2.2 Conformity with sources</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3 Race and class</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4 Conclusion</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>6. CHAPTER SIX: CONCLUSION</strong></td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1 Conclusion</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.2 Limitations of the study</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3 Recommendations for future study</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>BIBLIOGRAPHY</strong></td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
1. CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION AND RESEARCH BACKGROUND

1.1 INTRODUCTION

During apartheid, the media generally portrayed black people negatively in an effort to legitimize racial segregation in South Africa (Tomaselli & Teer-Tomaselli, 2008). This also applied to the representation of black business, such as the minibus taxi industry (Sonderling, 1992; Sauti, 2006; Ferreira, 2010). Biased reporting perpetuated negative stereotypes of black people to deliberately shift the focus away from legitimate concerns and effectively silence black voices.

Press ownership changed in the early 1990s (see Tomaselli 1997, Berger 1999), as South Africa was moving towards democratic rule. The victory of the African National Congress (ANC) in 1994 resulted in majority rule which was also followed by the implementation of policies that had to transform the institutions of the country to represent all citizens. The media, like other institutions in South Africa, was also tasked with moving away from limited and biased representation of marginalised social groups, which was a common feature of apartheid news reports, to being equally representative of all individuals in society.

It is important to investigate whether the negative stereotypes are still resilient in the press, and to uncover the factors that might be supporting this continuity if they are. This study sought to determine whether the media has changed in its representation of the black working class since the end of apartheid, focusing on the newspaper representation of the South African minibus taxi industry in the context of the introduction of the Bus Rapid Transit (BRT) system in 2009.

The Bus Rapid Transit (BRT) system is a public private partnership (PPP) which is strongly endorsed by neo-liberal policies and is perceived to be economically viable as the state is left without the burden of running operations. Since the end of apartheid, the press is self-regulatory and said to advocate neo-liberal policies because its entities are also dependent on the free market system for sustainability (Kariithi & Kareithi, 2007; Mayher & McDonald, 2007). Therefore, while media ethics propose that the media
remain objective in their reporting at all times, factors such as market forces have created new obstacles that prevent the media from taking such an objective position.

Morley (1976) and Radebe (2006) attest to the fact that for a long time now, the media has represented issues of the working class negatively with respect to industrial action or when such entities opposed government policies. The inquiry into the representation of race and class in post-apartheid South Africa is pivotal in the context of how the media has supposedly transformed.

1.2 RESEARCH BACKGROUND AND CONTEXTUAL SETTING

1.2.1 A brief overview of the minibus taxi industry

The minibus taxi industry grew as a result of the apartheid policy of situating black settlements on the periphery of urban areas. This left many black inhabitants in dire need of transportation to the workplace in white owned urban areas. Prior to 1977, taxi operations were limited to sedan motor vehicles that were equipped with fare meters. After 1977, public transport was deregulated, leading to the black community’s use of minibus taxis that disregarded the use of meters in taxis and that carried 15 passengers at a time (Ingle, 2009, 74). The minibus taxi industry in South Africa experienced tremendous growth as it came to be regarded as a “shining example of black entrepreneurship” (Ibid, 74).

The government at the time had no choice but to embrace the efforts of black business as the taxi industry was able to deliver labour to industries. The minibus taxi industry boomed due to high demand as individuals that resided in the periphery needed to get to work, shop, and conduct business in areas that they were not permitted to reside in (Ingle, 2009). State-owned transportation, such as buses and trains, were costly to commuters, while the minibus taxis were cheap, adding to their appeal.

The minibus taxi industry in South Africa is represented by Santaco (South African National Taxi Council), and its members belong to local taxi associations. Santaco has been transforming over the years, with attempts to formalize the minibus taxi industry
and establish a press office\textsuperscript{2}. The industry operates approximately 283 159 public minibus taxis, and the industry is estimated to contribute more than R30 billion to South Africa’s GDP (Ndebele, 2011).

The minibus taxi industry is of great significance to the South African economy as it has historically served and continues to serve the majority of the poor who depend on public transport, and negative media reports about the industry pose serious problems to the development of the industry.

1.2.2 Taxi industry in South Africa as part of the informal sector

The informal sector is a sponge to South Africa’s high unemployment rate, absorbing the majority of individuals who cannot be accommodated in the mainstream economy (Fourie, 2013). In South Africa, the informal sector is not viewed as a tax revenue generating sector. In most cases, workers in this sector do not pay income tax, and in the past were subject to conditions where they did not even have unemployment insurance. Progress has been made by the South African government to include taxi drivers, domestic workers and farm workers in the Unemployment Insurance Fund (UIF), a system that allows individuals to acquire financial assistance after their work contract has expired due to dismissal or retrenchment\textsuperscript{3}. The benefits of UIF used to be exclusive to individuals employed in the formal economy.

The informal sector in the South African context is viewed as an aiding sector to the government as it assists in creating employment where the government has failed to do so (Valodia, 2007). In return the government has, in most instances, opted not to collect taxes from the informal economy. The informal economy is not organised like the mainstream economy, which is well accounted for in terms of its contribution to the Gross Domestic Product (GDP). However, the role that the informal sector plays in development should not be underestimated.

\textsuperscript{2} \url{http://www.santaco.co.za/}, Retrieved from the World Wide Web on 14 February 2012.

For the most part, the informal sector does not have labour union representation, which puts individuals who are involved in the sector at a disadvantage, especially if they are running other people’s businesses (Valodia, 2007). The rights of the individuals who are employed in this sector are usually abused by their employers. Labour legislation policies are not really considered by the employers of these individuals.

The informal economy is poorly organised, with no proper communication channels, and in most instances is often at a disadvantage when its employees need to voice their concerns to the general public. Individuals that work in the informal sector are situated on the lower end of the economic ladder, and rely on their own efforts in order to make a living.

1.2.3 The Bus Rapid Transit /Integrated Rapid Transit systems

The Bus Rapid Transit (BRT) system, also referred to as the Integrated Rapid Transit (IRT) system in Cape Town, is an initiative by the South African Department of Transport, and its operations are solely administered by Rea Vaya in Johannesburg. Rea Vaya is said to be the end product of negotiations held in 2006 and 2007 between the government (City of Johannesburg), taxi operators, and bus operators. As stated earlier, the project is a public private partnership (PPP), which means that a state asset is operated by a private company.

According to the SA government, the aim of the BRT system is to provide a transport service that is fast, efficient, affordable, and environmentally-friendly to people residing within cities. The BRT is an ongoing project; according to the government, the main objective is to introduce the system to all the major cities in South Africa.

As discussed earlier, the minibus taxi industry has always been a major provider of transport services to people residing within cities. On the 1st of September 2009, the Rea Vaya (BRT) started operating in the Johannesburg area, and there was a lot of resentment towards the system from minibus taxi owners and drivers. The minibus taxi industry argued that the system was a threat to their livelihood, and that the minibus

---

taxis had been running the transport service in the cities for many years without government interference. The industry claimed that the government had failed to honour the role that their industry has played in the South African economy. They also alleged that the government did not include them in any transport-related activities during the 2010 Fifa World Cup that was hosted in South Africa⁵.

The resentment culminated in a violent protest by taxi drivers and owners against the full launch of the BRT in Johannesburg in September 2009. Owing to the standoff, the media has provided extensive coverage of the BRT and the position of the minibus taxi industry with regard to the system over the past few years.

1.2.4 Newspaper ownership in South Africa

The media in South Africa is only owned by a few players, and has been accused of being a 'slow-transforming' industry (Da Silva, 2009). The newspaper market in South Africa is owned by four newspaper groups, namely Media24, Times Media Group, Caxton, and Sekunjalo Group (Independent News Media Group)⁶. The four companies have offices across the country that generate news, and their publications share news stories depending on which office is situated closer to the news event. The focus of this study was only on the English publications of these newspaper groups.

In the English newspaper market, Media24, which is subsidiary of Naspers, owns the Daily Sun, City Press, The Witness and the Sunday Sun. The Daily Sun’s readership is said to be working class with a progressive outlook on society, and a readership that is open to new experiences⁷. The readership is described as individuals who, prior to the new dispensation, were disadvantaged and disempowered. City Press is a national Sunday newspaper with an estimated readership of 1.7 million (AMPS 2012). The publication covers news about South Africa, the continent, and the rest of the world.

⁶ Formerly Independent News & Media SA (INMSA), owned by the Irish Industrialist, Tony O’Reilly. Ireland-based parent company Independent News & Media (INM) confirmed on June 17 2013 that its shareholders had voted in favour of selling the media group to the Sekunjalo Group.
newspaper has separate business, sport and career sections, and a tabloid supplement.8

The Witness, which is distributed Monday to Friday, is a broadsheet morning newspaper focusing on Pietermaritzburg and the inland areas of KwaZulu Natal. The Weekend Witness is a Saturday publication distributed all over the province. It is referred to as a tabloid with a mix of news, commentary, sport, personal finance, entertainment, and property supplements.9 The Sunday Sun has a readership of over 241600 and is the fastest growing newspaper in the country. The readers of Sunday Sun are similar to the readers of the Daily Sun in the sense that both are referred to by Media24 as new readers of newspapers. The new readers in this particular instance also appear to consist of the working class.10

Times Media owns the following English newspapers: the Sunday Times, The Times, Sowetan, Sunday World, The Herald, Daily Dispatch, Saturday Dispatch, Business Day and Weekend Post. The Sunday Times is distributed on Sundays and is a broadsheet with supplements on business, sport, politics, and careers.

Caxton owns the Citizen newspaper which is a daily newspaper distributed on weekdays and on Saturdays. The Citizen is a tabloid-type newspaper that covers national and international news. The newspaper covers subjects such as sport, economics, politics, entertainment and leisure, motoring, health and horse racing.11

The Independent Newspapers group owns the Star, Pretoria News, Cape Times, Cape Argus, The Mercury, and The Daily News, which are all English broadsheet publications. The Sunday Tribune, the Sunday Independent, the Independent on Saturday, DFA, Saturday Star, and the Weekend Argus are the weekend newspapers

---

that are offered by this group\textsuperscript{12}. The group is largely entrenched in the English newspaper market. These four newspaper groups dominate the mainstream newspaper market in South Africa, and this study solely explored news from their publications.

Other publications include the \textit{New Age}, which is an English publication that was established in 2010 by TNA Media as a national daily newspaper covering national events, columns, politics, African and international news, sports, business, entertainment, lifestyle, science and technology\textsuperscript{13}. \textit{The Mail and Guardian} was previously known as the \textit{The Weekly Mail} under apartheid. \textit{The Mail and Guardian} was launched in 1994 and is said to be “reputed internationally for its quality content”\textsuperscript{14}. The newspaper’s 87.5 percent share is owned by Newtrust Company Botswana Limited, which is owned by Zimbabwean publisher and entrepreneur Trevor Ncube. The Guardian Newspapers Limited in London holds 10 percent, and minority shareholders make up the rest. The newspaper focuses on political analysis, investigative reporting, Southern African news, comprehensive coverage of local arts, music and popular culture and more.

\textbf{1.3. Problem Statement}

There is an academic gap that needs to be filled with regard to how the media represents the black working class in post-apartheid South Africa. Many working class citizens have a strong interest in the minibus taxi industry as it provides them with transportation services to places of employment on a daily basis. This study investigates the representation of the minibus taxi industry in newspapers pertaining to the issue of the Bus Rapid Transit (BRT) system. The study explores the representation of the taxi industry in post-apartheid South Africa with an interest in discovering whether media representation of the taxi industry has changed over the past years.

The BRT, as a ‘national interest’ issue, brings to the fore government and media relations, and the taxi industry and its media relations. Furthermore, as the BRT is a

\textsuperscript{13} http://thenewage.co.za/, Retrieved from the World Wide Web on 5 April 2013.
public private partnership (PPP), it also evokes the relationship between the media and capitalism. Studying the taxi industry in relation to its press coverage provides knowledge on post-apartheid representation of black people, black informal business, and the working class in contemporary South Africa. The study only investigates news about the BRT system, although there are many other contentious issues in the news about the minibus taxi industry, such as the taxi recapitalization project. The rationale for this limitation is that the representation of the minibus taxi industry in its entirety cannot be covered in a study of this nature.

1.4 RESEARCH HYPOTHESIS

The minibus taxi industry was represented negatively in newspapers during the introduction of the Bus Rapid Transit (BRT) system.

1.5 AIM OF THE STUDY

The aim of this study was to critically analyse newspaper representation of the South African minibus taxi industry in the context of the introduction of the Bus Rapid Transit (BRT) system in 2009. Furthermore, through its critical approach, the study explored the possible causes for the representation conferred upon the minibus taxi industry by major newspapers in news about the BRT system. In doing so, the study hoped to contribute knowledge on the representation of the black working class in post-apartheid South Africa.

1.6 RESEARCH QUESTIONS

This study addressed two research questions:

1. In what ways did newspapers represent the minibus taxi industry during the introduction of the Bus Rapid Transit (BRT) system?
2. How can this type of representation be explained?

1.7 RESEARCH DESIGN

The study employed a qualitative and quantitative research design in its application of Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) to news articles. Purposive sampling was used to acquire the twenty news articles which were used in the study. A thematic approach was used to categorize the information extracted from the news articles before their frequency was calculated.

1.8 ORGANIZATION OF THE RESEARCH PAPER

This research paper consists of six chapters: i) Chapter 1 provides the introduction and a brief research and contextual background; ii) Chapter 2 presents the literature review and theoretical framework of the study; iii) Chapter 3 discusses the research methodology; iv) Chapter 4 presents the findings from the data analysis; v) Chapter 5 discusses the causes of the findings observed in Chapter 4; and vi) Chapter 6 presents the conclusion of the study and recommendations for further research.
2. CHAPTER TWO: LITERATURE REVIEW AND THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

2.1 INTRODUCTION

This chapter presents a literature review that focuses on the relations between class and media; media representation of the taxi industry in South Africa prior to the end of apartheid; black identity; and racism and transformation in South African media. The study is theoretically founded on the notion of stereotypes as an integral part of media representation, which is drawn from a Cultural Studies approach. Furthermore, Critical Political Economy (CPE) of the media also informs the study on the issue of problems created by media ownership in capitalist societies, and the sociology of news production informs the study with regard to understanding the different practices in news organisations that result in the news product.

2.1.1 Class and the media

A discussion of class and the media is pivotal in an analysis of the representation of the minibus taxi industry, which is part of the working class. Classical Marxist theory emphasises the economic position as the strongest predictor of social differences (Lull, 2003). The concept of ideology has its origins in Marx's book, *The German Ideology* (1845), where Marx notes that: “The ideas of the ruling class are, in every stage, the ruling ideas” (Strinati, 1995:131). Marx stipulates that the dominant ideology leads to the working class accepting the existing class structure as the natural order (Abercrombie, Hill and Turner, 1980). Neo-Marxism was developed in the 1970s, and it differs from Marxism in that, “instead of studying income distribution and occupational prestige scores, neo- Marxists focus on the production sphere of the political economy” (So, 1991:39). Neo-Marxists stress that there is conflict among different classes in society, and advocate for the transformation of capitalist societies (Ibid). Class analysis allows for the study of class formation, class struggle, and the historical trajectories of social change (Wright, 1985). For Wright (1985:37), the Marxist concept of class “is not meant to be used simply in the description and analysis of the structural properties of society. It is also, fundamentally, meant to provide a way of understanding class formation and
class struggle”. According to Dahrendorf (1959) and Bourdieu (in So, 1991:45), there are structural constraints that can be conceptualized as conservative dynamics to preserve the existing class structure. These are:

- **Political constraints**, such as political intimidation, repression, and execution. The state denies its citizens the rights to form opposing organizations and to express political opinions.

- **Technical constraints**, such as the lack of leadership to articulate a workable strategy for political struggle.

- **Social constraints**, such as the lack of a channel of communication (e.g., the isolation of French peasants during the mid-19th century) and the absence of a structural pattern of recruitment (e.g. delinquents).

- **Cultural constraints**, such as the lack of ‘cultural capital’ to wage an effective challenge on the dominant cultural values.

It is important to note that in class struggle, the dominant class engages strategies that assist it in maintaining the status quo. It is not uncommon for a dominant class in society to represent protest action of the subordinate class in negative light, for example by relating the protest action of the subordinate class to ethnicity this tends to deviate from the concerns of the political economy (So, 1991). In doing so, the dominant class shifts debates away from its dominance and its control of capital.

The dominant class is said to be occupied with the task of suppressing the consciousness of the subordinate class (Ibid). They do this by counterattacking “through ideological suppressions as the tightening of controls over the mass media and educational institutions. The aim of the dominant class is to maintain cultural hegemony by suppressing radical ideas” (Ibid, 48). Furthermore, the dominant class can denounce “the subordinate class ideology as false, non-scientific, and harmful to the existing society” (Ibid, 48). They can also argue that “workers should not engage in a class struggle because it will lower productivity, reduce the nation’s competitiveness in the world market, lead to job loss, cut the state’s tax revenue, and result in fewer social
services delivered to the workers” (Ibid, 48). “The dominant class also glorifies its own ideology, such as the claim that its values are universal and eternal. For example, capitalist values, like self-interest, profit-seeking, utilitarianism, and individualism, are taken to be part of human nature and thus exist in all human societies” (Ibid, 48).

Economically, the minibus taxi industry is a lucrative industry and is estimated to contribute highly to the Gross Domestic Product (GDP) (See 1.2.1 above). However, power still resides largely with conventional businesses that have strong influence on policy-making due to their large contribution to state revenue. Hegemony is an important issue in a study that investigates the issues of subordinate groups. According to Lull (2003:61), “Hegemony is the power or dominance that one social group holds over others.” This in particular refers to the differences between and among social classes within a nation. Hall (1985) defines hegemony as dominance and subordination in the field of social relations structured by power. Hegemony is not only about having social power, but also a method for gaining and maintaining power (Lull, 2003). Lull (2003) states that in today’s world, social class differences are not determined solely or directly by economic factors, and that ideological influence is now the pivotal factor in the exercise of social power.

Ideology refers to “images, concepts and premises that provide the frameworks through which we represent, interpret, understand and ‘make sense’ of some aspect of social existence” (Hall, 1996:160). Gramsci’s theory of ideological hegemony refers to mass media as tools that the ruling elites use to “perpetuate their power, wealth, and status [by popularizing] their own philosophy, culture and morality” (Boggs, 1976:39). Barthes (1972) states that ideological power lies in the hands of those that own capital, the argument being that in society there will always be a class that will dominate all spheres of society. Gramsci (in Dines and Humez, 2003:61) states that as society progresses, it becomes difficult to identify ideology, as ideology is not constant and is subject to change with society.
Nordenstreng (1977:276) describes the mass media as an institution that “introduces elements into the individual consciousness because they are so commonly shared in the cultural community”. Lull (2003) states that the messages that are supportive of the status quo come from institutions such as schools, businesses, political organisations and the mass media; this in essence contributes to the “hegemony”. Hegemony depends on the subordinated groups accepting the dominant ideology as normal reality or common sense, in active forms of experience and consciousness (Williams, 1976; Martin-Barbero, 1993). Hegemony is said to be fragile and requires renewal and modification through the assertion of and reassertion of power (Lull, 2003). According to Hall (1977: 333), “hegemony” is not fixed but changes in the same way as ideology: “It has to be actively won and secured but it can also be lost.”

Hegemony is linked to those sectors of society that wield economic power and that can influence the ideas of that particular time. In South Africa, there is a strong link between class and race. The majority of black people are still part of the working class due to the legacy of apartheid. Even with improved economic policies that have empowered a number of black people, the majority of black people are still largely part of the working class. Literature and theories on relations between the media and the working class have to inform a study such as this in the disputed matter of the BRT system in order to understand how the media reports on industrial disputes (strikes) by the working class.

Morley (1976) provides a perspective on how the media reported on the working class in industrial disputes in Britain in the 1970s. He observed that the media often acted as the spokesperson of ‘national interest’. The position of ‘national interest’ amounts to the media advocating for any policy or issue that appears to be developmental for the country (Morley, 1976; Kumar, 2005). The ‘national interest’ in most cases is the interest of the ruling elite or those with executive powers. Morley (1976:250) went on to find that entities that are perceived to oppose the ‘national interest’ are rarely portrayed in a positive light by the media. Morley (1976) provided the example of coverage by the British media on strikes by health workers in March 1973. He found that the coverage seemed to imply that the workers were putting lives in jeopardy, and that the reports largely failed to engage the issues of workers, particularly their reasons for taking on
Morley (1976:251) observed that in relation to industrial action, trade unions in the news were largely described as ‘narrow-minded’, focusing only on their sectional interest, while the government was presented as “being motivated, in a non-sectarian way, with a concern for the ‘national interest’”. McColl (1980) confirms that most studies on media coverage of strikes have concluded that Western media’s news reports often allocate blame for the industrial action on the labour union(s) or workers.

This perspective of industrial action points to the failure by the media to consider that resolving the grievances of the working class by the government protects the ‘national interest’. Industrial action is presented in a negative light by the media while the state as the employer is presented as the protector of the ‘rule of law’ (Morley, 1976:251). The state is presented as solely fighting for the interests of all classes in society and not just one particular class, and the authorities are presented as being highly concerned about ‘public welfare’ during strikes.

Morley (1976:252) found that the media often portrayed the leaders of the workers as unrepresentative and militant. Strikes are presented as morally wrong and insensitive to the wellbeing of society, and the media is quick to refer to strikers as ‘militant’ (Ibid, 255). Strikers are also presented as being intransigent with the unwillingness to compromise, while the authorities are presented as helpless and lacking the power to resolve the dispute. The authorities have the means to end the disputes, but the impression is given that they lack prerogative. The studies by Morley (1976) and Kumar (2005) both found that media reports often imply that striking workers lack dedication to their work, hence their engagement in the strike is portrayed as disruptive to the lives of the people that they are supposed to service, while individuals that assist with the crisis amounting from the strikes by providing alternative services are championed as heroes.

Morley (1976:258) also observed how a form of action taken by strikers, such as chanting, constitutes irrational behaviour, and how the media is quick to refer to the disruption to the economy because of workers embarking on industrial action. He further referred to how the issue of peace is put above all other matters of injustice, while strikes are signified as causing chaos, disrupting the functions of the economy, and threatening the national interest (Ibid, 259). Morley (1976:259) observed the
assumptions made by the media with regard to strikes in different industries and their effects:

- The gas strike meant the danger of explosions
- The hospital strike meant danger to patients
- The rail strike meant inconvenience to commuters
- The teachers’ strike meant disruption to children’s education
- The customs’ strike meant the creation of a ‘drug smuggler’s paradise’ (Ibid, 259)

Geertz (1964) argued that the acts of violence and chanting that are part of some industrial actions result in the media viewing these as spectacular entertainment. Furthermore, protestors with their acts in public expose themselves to media attention and the media cannot ignore the negativity that arises from such action. Kumar (2005:131) offers an American perspective, and confirms the fact that issues of workers, especially strikes, are always framed by the media as a problem for the national economy and as a significant threat to national security. Furthermore, Kumar (2005:132) posits that this narrative of national economy and national security serves to universalize the interests of the capitalist class. Kumar (2005) also refers to the reliance by the media on ‘expert sources’ who support the interests of business during strikes at the expense of workers. Morley (1976), McColl (1980), and Kumar (2005) all paint a picture of how the media represents workers negatively in news about industrial actions. In the South African context, Kariithi and Kareithi (2007) also attest to the negative media representation of the working class and the trade unions that represent such individuals. The limited representation through the use of stereotypes fails to account for the multiple identities that exist within the working class. The assigning of the same stereotypes to leaders of trade unions and workers is misleading.

Stereotypes were present in the representation of black people during apartheid, and henceforth for this study, an understanding of black identity in the post- apartheid era is pivotal in order to ascertain the extent of stereotypes that exist about black people. A discussion of identity provides a platform for understanding that not all individuals are
the same, even if they come from the same ethnic group. It further provides a sound platform from which to challenge the stereotypes that tend to be assigned to people in the mass media.

2.1.2 Media representation of the minibus taxi industry prior to the new dispensation

A number of studies that have focused on the content provided by the mass media on a variety of issues of social importance have found that the content often distorts and deviates from social realities (Bortner, 1984; Cohen, 1972; Fishman 1982; Kristiansen, 1983; Roshier 1982; Sheley and Ashkins, 1984; Harding, 2006). In some instances, the mass media fails in the way that it presents facts or issues, and some news practices do not yield an accurate depiction of what is being represented. As people, journalists maintain certain ideologies about the world, and may promote these ideologies either consciously or unconsciously. Sonderling (1992:58) argued that the media, in order to attain credibility, only views the activities of those who are considered credible and legitimate sources of information as important. In relation to hegemony, the media, by reporting information from credible sources, presents the political work, practices and strategies of those who have power to make news (Molotch and Lester, 1974; Gans, 1980; Tiffen, 1989).

Media reports are largely filled with the views and opinions of government officials, politicians and interest groups that set the agenda for further discussion (Sonderling, 1992). During apartheid, the views of those who were perceived to be lower in the social hierarchy, particularly black and working class people, were not considered in news reporting. The black working class did not have hegemony in most social institutions. Their depiction was negative as the media supported the status quo, and reported news from the perspective of the white elites. An understanding can be formulated that news was and still is a product of those that had or have hegemony. This foundation of apartheid made it inevitable for the media to report negatively on the majority, as the majority did not wield any significant power. As stated in chapter one, the regime was content with presenting a negative image of black people in order to reinforce the status quo of segregation. The media was white owned, and whites were economically well off due to economic policies that were in their favour. The media also operated under the
watchful eye of the state in the service of apartheid propaganda (Durrheim, Quayle, Whitehead and Kriel, 2005). Under apartheid, the media was not free to investigate matters openly and engage all citizens, in particular black people. This functioned to distort the perceptions of some of the citizenry about particular social groups.

The taxi industry, as an entity of the working class and as a black owned enterprise, fell victim to such negative constructs. In 1992, Sonderling (1992) conducted a study that investigated the reporting of the minibus taxi industry in South Africa. This study was done in the final years of apartheid, and the findings reflect a misguided view of the minibus taxi industry by the journalists of the time. According to Dugard (2001), in the period 1991 to 1999, “Taxi-related violence claimed an average of 19 lives a month with a further 26 seriously injured every month.” This violence generated a lot of negative publicity for the minibus taxi industry, and barely a day went by where there were no media reports on taxi violence (Ingle, 2009). However, the study by Sonderling (1992) revealed that the number of deaths and collisions reported by the media was exaggerated. More recently, Ferreira (2010) conducted a study that focused on the views of minibus taxi drivers and commuters, and it refers to the image of the minibus taxi industry as “tarnished” due to statements made by the public and the media. Sauti (2006) likewise noted that the media has been guilty of unfavourably representing the minibus taxi industry on previous occasions.

2.1.3 Black identity in South Africa

The media is a platform where ideas about the identity of members of society are represented. Zegeye (2003) states that black identities have changed, and that ‘blackness’ in the present is diverse and comprising of individuals with different social experiences and cultural identities.

Zegeye (2001:3) states that under apartheid, identities were fixed constructs on which “the discourse of racial discrimination was based”. Zegeye (2001:3) offers a perspective on approaching identity as fluid and open to construction and deconstruction in line with the changing social order. During the struggle against white-rule in South Africa, black issues or black identity were not debated in the media; the only representation offered a
limited and stereotypical view of black people (Posel, 1990; Louw, 2004). As discussed earlier, black people were politically disenfranchised, with no right to vote and little economic power as they comprised a large proportion of the working class. The media was owned by a minority that was white, and the media did not have the freedom to present any perspectives that challenged the apartheid system (Hachten & Giffard, 1984 and Durrheim, Quayle, Whitehead, Kriel, 2005).

The former president of South Africa, Thabo Mbeki, was critical of the identities formulated by the media in their representation of black people in 2003. (He once stated that “the media's role [is] more clearly framed in terms of racial identity” (Mbeki in Wasserman, 2005:80). Mbeki's statements were published in 2003 in the ANC Today, the website of the ruling African National Congress (ANC). Mbeki further referred to the existence of racist stereotypes which are part of South African society, and he made the statement that these racist stereotypes were still being perpetuated (Wasserman, 2005:80):

> We should not, and will not, abandon the offensive to defeat the insulting campaigns further to entrench a stereotype that has, for centuries, sought to portray Africans as a people that are corrupt, given to telling lies, prone to theft and self-enrichment by immoral means, a people that are otherwise contemptible in the eyes of the ‘civilised’.

The above representation of Africans was common when Africa was still colonized by Europe. The negative identity assigned to black people began with colonization and continued in South Africa under apartheid (Posel, 1990), resulting in a lineage of representation where black identity was static. Zegeye and Harris (2003:6) state that 'blackness' is a political and cultural construct that cannot be based on fixed transcultural or transcendental racial categories. It is important for all analyses that look at black communities to take into account the class, gender, sexuality and ethnicity of the particular black community that is being studied.

In apartheid South Africa, black people were the ‘minority’ in terms of power relations and politics (Zegeye and Harris, 2003:7). This is no longer the case; politically, black
people are the majority, and in terms of economic power there are a number of wealthy black individuals. A significant percentage of black people have also benefited from policies such as Black Economic Empowerment (BEE), which was developed to redress the past. Amidst all this, there are some black people who still live in appalling conditions that were set up by apartheid policies. In his statements, South Africa’s former president Mbeki painted a picture of a media that was not quick to transform and implied that this media had not been neutral in its coverage of black Africans. Questions about the race of the journalists who were writing the stories at the time were raised (Zegeye and Harris, 2003), but it can also be argued that replacing a white journalist with a black journalist does not necessarily mean that coverage will automatically be free of racist stereotypes or negative identities. Racist stereotypes and transformation are covered in detail in 2.1.4.

Zegeye (2001:3) stipulates that in post-apartheid South Africa, “Exclusionary notions of identity, based on race and ethnicity, are still operative among certain sectors of post-apartheid South African society”. This statement by Zegeye emphasizes ongoing negative thinking with regard to black identity, and is similar to the arguments raised by Mbeki (2003) on some of the continuing negative stereotypes of Africans. Mbeki referred to the negative identities that were created by colonialism in representing Africans and pointed to the media in 2003 as guilty of the same practices. However, it is pivotal to note that like stereotypes, identities are not constant; to be relevant the media must also change [transform] in its representation of society.

The new dispensation in South Africa and its policies have created a platform that allows individuals to formulate their own directions and identities against the backdrop of the 1996 Constitution which values individual rights. The liberties that were introduced with the 1996 Constitution have provided a platform for identity construction in South Africa, as black people can no longer be viewed in the same way as when they were disenfranchised.
2.1.4 Racism and transformation in South African media

The ruling African National Congress (ANC) is said to have championed the transformation of the media in South Africa in the mid-1990s (Tomaselli and Teer-Tomaselli, 2008). The ANC was faced with the task of facilitating the transformation of the media that had been regulated by policies of apartheid and that had failed to fairly represent all citizens. Broadcasting media was subjected to regulation through the Independent Communications Authority of South Africa (ICASA), previously the Independent Broadcasting Authority (IBA). The press was left to police itself through the structures of the South African National Editor’s Forum (SANEF) (Ibid). Newspapers are to this day, subjected to their own system of regulation which has created the perception that the South African press is independent of the government.

From a liberal perspective, the media in South Africa is “an independent ‘mirror’ of society, solely reflecting what is happening” (Steenveld, 2004:92). The media is perceived to be neutral in its dissemination of information, and this perspective further stipulates that all citizens have equal access to the media. However, taking South Africa’s apartheid history into account is testament to the fact that the media has not always been neutral in its representation of individuals in South African society.

A background on racism in South African media is important, particularly because the minibus taxi industry is a black-owned industry managed by a racial group that was previously marginalized. Posel (1990) provides the example of the biased representation of township violence in the late 1980s. White audiences were presented with barbaric images of black people in townships, throwing stones at the police and causing great civil unrest. This type of reporting, Posel (1990:161) explains, was a deliberate measure by the media to “justify state violence as black protesters were represented as primitive and mindless stone throwing mobs”.

The introduction of the new Constitution in 1996 and the political transformation has had a strong impact on the media. The new dispensation prohibits blatant racism, typecasting or explicit arguments for segregation or discrimination (Durrheim et al., 2005). The transformation also resulted in increased black ownership of the media.
Amidst such transformation, in 1999 charges of racism in the media were laid against the *Sunday Times* and the *Mail & Guardian* newspapers by two black professional organisations: the Black Lawyers Association (BLA) and the Association of Black Accountants of South Africa (ABASA). The two newspapers were accused of racially biased reporting and editorial commentary (SAHRC, 1999). The professional organisations accused the two newspapers of the following:

- The media remained largely white-owned, and white males continued by and large to control public opinion.
- The *Mail & Guardian* exposed corruption in a way that created the impression that black people were essentially corrupt and incompetent.
- The *Mail & Guardian* treated instances of plagiarism by a black and white journalist differently.
- The *Mail & Guardian* refused to carry letters from black people, responding to articles in which they were criticised.
- The *Sunday Times* trivialised deaths of black people by reducing them to mere statistics, while covering deaths of white people in detail.
- The *Sunday Times* printed hate speech in which a columnist suggested that African Americans should “realise that they would probably be living in shacks with no running water if their ancestors hadn’t been abducted by slave traders” (Durrheim et al, 2005:170).

The Media Monitoring Project (MMP) (now Media Monitoring Africa) (1999), also made public submissions of its findings that showed that stereotypical representations of race were still very common in the media. Braude (1999:42), who was tasked with investigating racism in South African media by the *South African Human Rights Commission* (SAHRC), made similar findings that stereotypes of black people as inferior, incompetent and criminal, continued to be perpetuated in the media. This was a milestone in South African media, where the media stood accused of perpetuating the same misrepresentation of black people as it had in the apartheid era. However, the SAHRC enquiry into racism in the media was also criticized because it did not operate according to a well formulated definition of racism, and hence its findings were very
much disputed. Bertelsen (2000) criticised the SAHRC report on the basis that it failed to investigate race in line with the question of class. A large proportion of the working class is black, and hence it was important for the enquiry to also focus on class in order to achieve well-articulated and broadly acceptable findings. The decision to not include class by the SAHRC in an enquiry into racism in South Africa cannot be regarded as methodologically accurate. It is important to note that this enquiry was the only one conducted in the new South Africa to investigate racism in the media. It is questionable why such enquiries are not undertaken anymore, as they are important in offering an insight into the problem of race in the media. It appears as if the failures of the 1999 report have created an environment where no one wants to embark on the question of race and the media.

It was unexpected for the media, which was transforming due to increased black ownership, to be accused of racist reporting. This supports the idea that ideology and hegemony can sometimes be deeply entrenched to an extent that they can create a platform for the continuity of racist media reporting. After 1994, black organizations, such as the Congress of South African Trade Unions (COSATU), acquired some media shares. The South African Human Rights Commission (SAHRC) enquiry on Racism in the Media occurred at the time of this transformed ownership, but allegations still abound about the media representing black people with apartheid stereotypes. Tomaselli and Teer-Tomaselli (2008:172) argue that the press in South Africa did not really change after the new government came into power in 1994. They agree that some newspaper names were changed, and that some media outlets acquired new owners in the new socio-political system. However, they make the controversial assertion that despite changes in newspaper ownership, these changes did not reflect in the content of newspapers.

Today, one has to take into consideration that there are incidences where the representation of a particular social group will not be fair or balanced. Hall (2003) acknowledges that some media have been slow in changing their perspective on

---

issues. He propagates that some media outlets are progressive in the sense that they are willing to offer a wide view of societal issues, while others are not progressive and still use stereotypical representations of racial, gender and cultural issues.

According to Tomaselli (1997:65), transformation allowed for “new management styles, which mobilise African practices and beliefs in a meshing of capitalist imperatives with the cultural habits and values of black employees”. However, Tomaselli (1997) also argued that while the working class attains media ownership through trade unions and provident funds, this does not have a significant impact on the social order. A counterargument is proposed by Duncan (2000:12-13), who suggests that workers are part of the economy and that in due time, workers will be able to influence the media to serve their interests.

2.2 CULTURAL STUDIES

This section focuses on representation, which is an integral part of cultural studies. The cultural studies approach is beneficial for this study as it explores how meaning is created through various texts, such as media content. The approach is appropriate because it can be employed when trying to establish the meaning that is derived from newspaper articles about the minibus taxi industry.

2.2.1 Representation and stereotypes

Pickering (2001), in the preface of the book Stereotyping: The Politics of Representation, states that stereotyping remains “a central source of contention in the politics of representation”. In the present context, it was believed that theories of stereotypes would assist with analysing the media representations of the minibus taxi industry, especially with regard to the discourse used in news articles about the industry. Theories of stereotypes provide a foundation for understanding how particular descriptions about groups in society are formulated, and more especially where a particular description originates and how it prevails:

The ultimate aim does not consist of attempting to prevent the categorisation of human beings into distinct groups – this would be
impossible and not even desirable - but helping to create ‘neutral’ categories, within which each human being is evaluated in terms of specific information about him, and not in terms of a powerful evaluative frame of reference applying to the category of which he happens to be a member (Tajfel, 1963:14).

Representation is said to refer to the process by which signs and symbols are created with the aim of conveying certain meanings (Bernstein, 2002:260). According to Hall (1997), signs and symbols can be constructed in any medium and are an important feature of social life; they are said to allow people to communicate and make sense of their surroundings. Manning (2001:50) argues that representations are not accurate, mirror reflections of reality, but are instead the result of processes of construction and “fabrication”.

Bernstein (2002) refers to representation as a performance of resemblance (an act of image-making) or even imitation. This point emphasises that representation is a social construct that attempts to portray various objects/subjects in society. In this instance, reality is questionable. An important aspect in representation is that media items (newspapers articles, television news programmes, etc.) cannot represent the whole reality of a reported event. Representation also has the capacity to create truth out of something that is not true at all. It is therefore a process that has the power to manufacture reality. There are many factors that can lead to reality being misrepresented entirely, such as some of the constraints that exist in newsrooms.

According to Dyer (1993), in order for ‘reality’ to be represented, codes and conventions of presentation have to be used, as without these elements, media texts cannot be understood by audiences. Stereotyping is commonly used in order to assist audiences with understanding particular issues in society. Within media studies the term is defined as “the continuous repetition of ideas about groups of people in the media” (Dyer, 1993). When the term ‘stereotype’ is used in relation to the media, it means that certain people are not individuals, but are the same as each other (McQueen, 1998). Stereotypes can easily be recognised in media content by audiences since stereotypes exist in society prior to the media reproducing them. What sells to the audiences is said
to be what they are already aware of, or what they might have prior knowledge of. Newspapers sell because they strive to express what the society wants to hear about. Stereotypes survive because of their continued use in society and in the media. The content provided must fit into the minds of the readers and the reader builds on what he/she already knows about a particular subject. Lippmann (1922) defines stereotypes as pictures that individuals carry in their minds as a way of getting to understand the world before experiencing it directly. Hilton and Von Hippel (1994) and Hall (1997) expand by stating that stereotypes exist as a way of maintaining social and symbolic order.

The theoretical assumption underlying this discussion is that the mass media of today, preserves, transmits and creates important cultural information (Bernstein, 2002). Furthermore, how members of society tend to see themselves - how they are viewed, and even treated, by others - is determined to a great extent by their media representation (Dyer, 1993). According to Stadler (2008:357):

Stereotypes organise expectations about the roles, characteristics and abilities of people in various social categories. Although stereotypes work with generalisations, they are useful as tools for cultural analysis.

It is important to note that stereotypes are still largely employed by most individuals when making policy-related decisions (Gilbert, 1951; Karlins, Coffman, & Walters, 1969; Maykovich, 1971; Clark & Pearson, 1982; Golebiowska, 2007; Stangor, 2009). Stereotypes also have real material consequences when decisions are made about who is to be given priority in various societal institutions (Surlin, 1977; Farley, 1997; Steele, 1999; Golebiowska, 2007). Various groups in society are represented on the basis of stereotypes that particular media practitioners have perpetuated about such individuals. In some cases, the media practitioners will choose to write about certain individuals solely on the knowledge that they have acquired from the media about the entity. Stereotypes are more entrenched in individuals who have not had first-hand experience of a particular subject or the issues that are being covered in the media.
Stereotypes are employed to provide an understanding of the ‘Other’ or the out-group. Hall (1997: 258) refers to the concept of ‘Otherness’ which he states is used to refer to others as being less important or as almost being second-class citizens. Hilton and Von Hippel (1994), in their explanation of ‘Otherness’, state that the out-group members are perceived as homogenous, which leads to the assumption that most out-group members share the attributes of the specific out-group they come from. Lippmann (1922) explains that stereotypes come from socialised experiences and, unless educated differently, those preconceptions serve as the basis for the judgement of the familiar and unfamiliar. For example, it is known that the media has, over the time, continued to portray women as individuals that are not capable of accomplishing what men can accomplish (Karam, 2008). Karam (2008:317) provides the following assertion on how the media portrays gender:

The media do not only portray men as the dominant class, thereby supporting patriarchy and capitalism. They constantly portray women as submissive (and this criticism of the media can be applied to other situations, such as working class versus middle class or upper class, blacks versus whites and so on).

The media has different ways of portraying different groups of people, and Karam (2008) emphasises the fact that representation of social groups is not the same. Individuals are said to maintain stereotypes by accepting confirmatory information while disregarding contradictory evidence (Allport, 1958). It is important to acknowledge that stereotypes, like identities, are concepts that evolve with time (Kluegel, 1990; Wood & Chesser, 1994; Hunt, 2007). Chesser (1994:32) states that stereotypes about black people are not disappearing, but have shifted from images of black people as “happy-go-lucky”, ignorant, musical, and lazy,” to a “threatening image of blacks as loud, aggressive, lazy, quick-tempered, and ostentatious”. For example, Stadler (2008) notes how the movies Shaft and Hijack Stories attracted criticism from reviewers as they use stereotyped representations of black men, perpetuating the idea that black neighbourhoods and townships are populated with criminals that engage in various criminal activities. Although this is a look at the depiction of black people in fiction
(popular culture) and not in the news, this analysis by Stadler (2008) offers an insight into images that are usually employed when black people are represented in the media. It is important to note that an old stereotype can be replaced with a new stereotype; one can further make the argument that this new stereotype can either be positive or negative when it is employed to describe a particular group.

2.2.2 Racial stereotypes in the media

Hall (1996:160) states that racism and the media are directly interlinked with the problem of ideology, and the media is a platform for the ‘production and transformation of ideologies’. An intervention in the media’s construction of race also touches on the concept of ideology. To reiterate, Hall (2003:89) describes ideology as a concept that deals with those “images, concepts and premises that provide the framework through which we represent, interpret, understand, and ‘make sense’ of some aspect of social existence”.

According to Hall (1981:273), the media constructs for us the definition of what race is, the imagery that race carries, and what the “problem of race” is understood to be. The media helps to classify the world in terms of categories of race, and offers a platform for ideas about race. However, Hall (2003:89) also states that the media is an institution that provides a platform where ideas about race can be debated. He emphasises that “racism and the media” invoke the problem of ideology because the media’s primary role is also to produce and transform ideologies (Hall, 2003:89).

Language and ideology are said to be two different concepts. The linguistic term ‘democracy’, for example, can be used within different ideological discourses (Hall, 2003:89). According to Hall (2003:89), “Ideologies are said not to consist of isolated and separate concepts, but in the articulation of different elements into a distinctive set or chain of meanings”. Different ideological positions lead to meaning being interpreted in different ways. In liberal ideology, ‘freedom’ is said to refer to individualism, while in socialist ideology, the concept refers to the collective. It is important to acknowledge how the same concept is differently positioned within the logic of different ideological discourses (Hall, 2003:90). An emphasis is made that people communicate through the
ideologies that are active in their society and from this they make sense of social relations. A solitary individual cannot lead to the transformation of ideology; ideology can only be transformed by society as a whole.

Ideologies are said to work effectively when people are not aware of them. This is evident when people construct statements about the world only to realize that their construction is underpinned by ideological premises (Hall, 2003). In, *The Whites of Their Eyes*, Hall (2003) identifies two kinds of racism that are found in the media when representing issues about race. The first is overt racism, which Hall (2003:91) explains as the “occasions when open and favourable coverage is given to arguments, positions and spokespersons who are in the business of elaborating an openly racist argument or advancing a racist policy or view”. The second is inferential racism, which refers to “naturalised representations of events and situations relating to race, whether ‘factual’ or ‘fictional’, which have racist premises and propositions inscribed in them as a set of unquestioned assumptions”.

Parisi (1998:239) argues that as forms of narration, print media stories inevitably involve “political assumptions, ideology, social values, cultural and racial stereotypes and assumptions as well as specific textual strategies”. According to Parisi (2008), racial stereotypes are said to exist within the media when stories are constructed on various racial groups. Parisi (2008) emphasises that these prejudices cannot be eliminated when stories are written for newspapers.

Investigating the representation of Australian indigenous people, Gardiner (2003:236) describes white media discourse in Australia as fundamentally engaged in the construction of indigienity since the first colonial presses began in the late 18th century. A set of recurring themes in Australian media were identified in the representations of indigenous people:

- Tribalism and primitivism
- The threat to white culture or indigenous crime
- Aboriginal people as non-copers, undisciplined, or incapable
- Aboriginal people as victims of prejudice
The themes distinguished above reflect the kind of stereotypical reporting that the media engages in when reporting on race. It is obvious that the media cannot escape engaging in stereotypical representation as in most instances it gratifies the readers of that particular media. This is evidence that some old ideologies remain and resurface under particular social circumstances.

Harding (2006) focused on the representation of the Canadian aboriginal people and states that news discourse on the aboriginal people had remained the same (unaltered) over the last century and a half. In the late 1990s, the Canadian media framed issues the same way as it had framed them in colonial times. This kind of representation protected dominant interests and signified aboriginal people as a threat.

A study by Klocker and Dunn (2003) found that in 2001 and 2002, the Australian media followed the Howard Government’s lead in portraying asylum seekers in a negative manner. They discovered that the media depended on official statements made by government officials, which were said to subscribe to the “propaganda model” that was propagated by Herman and Chomsky in 1988. The model informs the theoretical framework of Critical Political Economy (CPE), which is discussed later in the chapter.

The propaganda model states that the media does not engage in proper research when covering issues; they simply report the government’s perspective on a story. The propaganda model is a conceptual framework from the CPE that states that the media is responsible for making the public accept policies that are put forward by authorities. The media is then put to the task of convincing the public about such policies, and the media in this instance does not contest such policies. An example of this is the media’s failure to criticize capitalism as an economic system and its acceptance of this system. The media can make the public fear other social entities by presenting negative aspects of such groups in society.

McKay et al. (2011) investigated how the Australian media represents asylum seekers, and discovered that the reporting on such individuals was two-sided, with both negative and positive coverage. On the one hand, the asylum seekers are portrayed as in genuine need of protection, fleeing their country because of a well-founded fear of
persecution. On the other, they are represented as individuals that exploit asylum policies for their own economic and personal gain (McKay, Thomas and Warwick Blood, 2011:608). Therefore the positive humanitarian stories tend to be counter-framed by the media’s coverage of legal and security concerns that arise with the influx of asylum seekers. Humanitarian ideals are essentially overshadowed by debates on Australian security. According to MacKay et al. (2011:608), “Leading advocacy groups have accused the Australian media of promoting fears and actually promoting unfavourable attitudes towards refugees through the negative framing of stories about refugees.”

According to McKay et al (2011), complaints were launched with the Australian Press Council about the language and terminology used in newspapers when describing the asylum seekers in Australia. The media used words such as ‘illegal immigrant’, ‘illegal refugee’, and ‘illegal asylum seeker’, and these words were perceived to be derogatory and inaccurate. The Australian Press Council resorted to issuing new guidelines that cautioned against the use of such language in the press (McKay et al., 2011:611). There are isolated cases where the media’s coverage is purely one sided or entirely negative. The Australian examples highlight the bias that can stem from the media when representing or covering the ‘Other’ in the news. The examples further prove that in some contexts, the coverage can be driven by personal preferences and not entirely by liberal journalistic ideals.

A study by Johnson, Olivo, Gibson, Reed and Ashburn-Nardo (2009) discovered that African-American victims of Hurricane Katrina were represented badly in news reports around the time that they sought assistance from the American public. 80 percent of the pictures in the media about black people were of looting, which did not generate empathy from the American public. On the contrary, the media did not use negative images of white Hurricane Katrina victims which led to greater empathy for such victims. This kind of selection by the media is problematic, especially when one considers the pledge by the media to subscribe to journalistic objectivity, fairness and balanced reporting.

The studies by Gardiner (2003); Harding (2006); McKay et al, (2011); and Johnson et al. (2009) reflect different levels of bias and misrepresentation in media reports about
marginalised groups in society. Evidently some media practitioners are trapped in old or racist ideologies that skew their perspectives when writing about the marginalised. The negative representation can be a result of factors such as the race of the individuals that are being represented, and of course it may also be related to the socio-economic status of the group.

It is important to note that the media has a strong influence through its chosen representation to influence public opinion towards a particular agenda and can also influence audiences to deviate from a particular perspective. This is important, especially when policy-making decisions have to be made by the public; in some instances the media can embark on representing a certain idea in a bad light which can lead to the public not committing to that particular idea.

2.3 CRITICAL POLITICAL ECONOMY OF THE MEDIA

Critical Political Economy (CPE) is concerned with the “balance between capitalist enterprise and public intervention” and is said to “engage with basic moral questions of justice, equity and the public good” (Golding & Murdock, 2000: 72-73). This approach offers an understanding of the factors that are involved when news is being produced, from the issues of ownership of media content, to the sources that are used in news stories, and the operations that take place in newsrooms when news reports are created. Critical Political Economy employs a Marxist approach in the study of the media, in that it considers the question of who owns the media. CPE is concerned with understanding which economic classes have access to the media, and investigates how capitalist ownership of the media affects media content. CPE also investigates whether capitalist media ownership allows for diverse views in media content (Murdock & Golding, 2005).

2.3.1 Media ownership in capitalist societies

According to Curran (1991:87), media integration into capitalism has encouraged it to endorse discourses that are supportive of capital. In capitalist societies, a Marxist perspective would state that powerful social classes own the media and use the media
to convey their views and values (Steenveld, 2004). Mayher and MacDonald (2007) discovered that the print media in South Africa was servicing the ideology of neo-liberalism through its support of privatization of state assets. They discovered that there was rarely discourse in the press that opposed the privatization of state assets and the creation of Public Private Partnerships (PPP). Privatization was painted as an efficient solution to managing the economy and as a system that should be welcomed by governments. It is important to bear in mind that the private media operates on the principles of demand and supply, where survival is dependent on the number of copies that the media outlets sell to the public. It is highly unlikely that such media would be hostile or highly critical of the system that sustains it.

Peet (2001:57), in the analysis of neo-liberal hegemony in post-apartheid South Africa, acknowledges that the media is considered to be very influential in providing any ideological legitimacy. Kariithi and Kareithi (2007) also concur with the idea that the media is protective of capitalism in the sense that it will most likely represent striking workers in a negative way when an industrial dispute arises due to disagreements between workers and management. The authors (Kariithi and Kareithi, 2007) agree that the media is propagating and legitimizing neo-liberal ideology.

Media companies in capitalist societies are mostly owned by private entities that are in business to make profit on behalf of shareholders. Murdock and Golding (2005) argue that market forces have a negative impact on the media and emphasise government intervention as a solution to this problem. On the powers of private media ownership, Murdock (1996:95) writes:

Owners possess two basic kinds of potential control over the symbolic environment. First and most obviously, they are able to regulate the output of the divisions they own directly, either by intervening in day-to-day operations, or by establishing general goals and understandings and appointing managerial and editorial staff to implement them with the constraints set by the overall allocation of resources. Second, they may also be able to influence the strategies of companies they do not own in their roles as competitors or suppliers.
Media ownership has changed over the past years, in the sense that media owners also have investments in organisations that are not part of the media industry. Media owners are no longer only media owners, but are owners with wide interests, and the media content is affected by the interests of these proprietors (Ross in Murdock, 1996:95). Karl Marx’s definition of capital is important as it reiterates that capital is the sum of money that is “employed, spent, with the aim of increasing it, if it is spent expressly in order to increase it” (1976:976 in Inglis, 1990). Proprietors of media invest their capital with the intention of generating interest on their investments. The media companies are under pressure to appease proprietors if they are to stay in business. The media in capitalist societies is largely financed by consumers through the purchase of a media product and by advertisers in pursuit of reaching consumers. In some countries, some media outlets are subsidized by the government. In the context of capitalist societies, the commercial media is free of government control because there is no direct government funding for the media, especially with the free market press. However, the government in capitalist society can still take on the role of the ‘wealthy advertiser’.

2.3.2 Advertising influence on the media

There is no overt proof that advertising has a strong impact on media content. According to Curran (1996:467), advertising is a concealed subsidy system for the mass media and different media entities compete for advertisers’ subsidies. Advertisers want to reach the public and they advertise in media that are popular with the public. News organisations are in a race against each other to be able to acquire advertising revenue, and they engage in many strategies that lead to the alteration of news content. Advertising is sought after by many commercial media as it helps to reduce production costs and allows for the sustainability of the commercial media. However competition is tough, as advertisers look for media that attracts large audiences or the right audiences to buy their products. Advertisers are said to make judgements about the effectiveness of particular media agencies (Curran, 1996). Curran (1996:467) states that advertisers are “not neutral in their desire to reach all members of the public: they usually wish to reach – and will pay more to reach – particular segments of the market rather than
others”. According to Wasserman and de Beer (2007), it is pivotal for advertisers to reach the appropriate audience, which is usually the elite market.

Advertisers are not ‘passive’, and often change the criteria that they use for media selection. Changes in marketing perspectives, research perspectives, research procedures, and data inputs result in changes with regard to how advertisers spend their money with long term consequences for the development of the media (Curran, 1996). For example, changes in the economies of capitalist societies have resulted in changes in advertising expenditure. The emergence of new advertisers and the decline of others has had major repercussions on media systems.

2.3.3 Media concentration and conformity

According to Swanson and Mancini (1996:11), the media is no longer seen as an institution that only serves the government, political parties or citizens; it is powerful in its own right and competes with other powers. Media concentration and convergence is a global phenomenon that has also affected the media in South Africa (Tomaselli and Teer-Tomaselli, 2008). As a result, South Africa has four newspaper firms that dominate the newspaper landscape with many publications on a daily and weekly basis.

The South African Competition Commission has held hearings in its investigation of the transformation of the print and digital media industry (Ensor, 2013). The Competition Commission notified the four media groups, Times Media, Sekunjalo Independent Newspapers, Media24 and Caxton, of its intention to investigate allegations made against them by smaller emerging independent publishers of anti-competitive behaviour. The major publishers are alleged to quash new entrants through buyouts or squeeze them out of the market through cut-throat pricing. The smaller publishers also cited the problem of acquiring government advertising because of the fact that it is difficult for them to prove circulation of their publications. This intervention sheds light on the lack of competition in the South African newspaper market, and highlights the problems that emerge for smaller independent media organisations in an oligopolistic media environment. These smaller independent organisations might be able to provide alternative perspectives or diverse viewpoints in search of their own unique identity.
According to Albaran et al (2003:41), media concentration is a process comprised of “mergers, takeovers, acquisition and alliances” that result in the creation of powerful media groups. Cost cutting, staff retrenchment, less investment in content and threats to editorial independence, are just some of the repercussions of media concentration (Bilir, 2005:11). According McChesney (2003:30), the reason for organisations to opt for concentration is to maximise profit by reducing risk, but this also gives organisations the ability to eliminate their competition.

Concentration results in the disappearance of diverse ideas and points of view in the media (Doyle, 2002). Media concentration is said to also result in pack journalism, which means that journalists will tend to go after the same story with the perception that it will have mass appeal (Graber, 1986:263). The issue of conformity comes to the fore with media concentration as news media tends to rely on the same sources and cover stories from the same angles (Ntuli, 2010). The news presented by different publications in big news firms tends to reflect issues from a similar perspective. Conformity is an issue that is more observable in a concentrated media environment as the number of publications that report the news are owned by one entity.

Pack journalism further implies that journalists largely rely on each other for ideas on particular issues, and this reliance is said to be a factor that reduces diversity in content (Shoemaker & Reese, 1991:101). Journalists who deviate from covering a story from the same angle in pack journalism are perceived to have failed in doing their job (Schudson, 2000).

2.4 SOCIOLOGY OF NEWS PRODUCTION: NEWS VALUES AND JOURNALISTIC BIAS

Theories of news production are important for this study as they offer an understanding of what practices take place when news is created. Sociology of news production assists in understanding what factors are involved when news stories are created and the journalistic practices that govern such a process (Gieber, 1964; Fishman, 1980; Schudson, 1989). It is an integral part of Critical Political Economy.
2.4.1 News values and journalistic bias

To say that a news report is a story, no more, but no less, is not to demean news, nor to accuse it of being fictitious. Rather, it alerts us that news, like all public documents, is a constructed reality possessing its own internal validity (Tuchman, 1976:97).

Golding and Murdock (1996:405) state that news values are used in the following ways:

i) They provide “criteria of selection from material available to the newsroom of those items worthy of inclusion in the final product”, and ii) They “are guidelines for the presentation of items, suggesting what to emphasise, what to omit, and where to give priority in the preparation of the items for presentation to the audience”.

According to Hall (1978:53), “news is the end-product of a complex process which begins with a systematic sorting and selecting of events and topics according to a socially constructed set of categories”, a process referred to by media students as ‘news values’. Hall et al. (1978:54) declared that:

If newsmen did not have available – in however routine a way – such cultural ‘maps’ of the social world, they could not ‘make sense’ for their audiences of the unusual, unexpected and unpredicted events which from the basic content of what is ‘newsworthy’.

News values are said to originate from journalistic practice (e.g. journalistic convention, nature of sources, publication frequency, schedule, etc.) and “a consensual mode of society” (Hall, 1978; Hartley, 1982). This thinking within the media opens the door for the existence or the use of stereotypical representation of various subjects and issues in news coverage. The media outlets embrace one perspective about a particular event or subject and reject alternatives that might not be reinforcing the knowledge already gathered on a particular issue.

Van Dijk (1991), McQuail (1992), and Goshorn and Gandy (1995) focused on how some media institutions create bias in news stories because of the existence of news routines which allow them to focus only on various aspects of a story while ignoring others. It is
said that “through the habits of language and repeated news routines (form); reporters teach about particular co-cultural groups” (Perkins and Starosta, 2001:74). Teaching and learning is said to centre on “the way stories are organised and written, and the phrases that are used in headlines” (Weston, 1996:163). Readers of news learn to understand various ethnic groups through the language utilised by the media (Perkins and Starosta, 2001).

Gibson and Zillmann (1993:800) suggest that:

> It has been shown that direct quotation – at least in print news reports – can greatly influence readers’ perceptions of issues and that imbalanced quotation in testimony can be effective in swaying readers’ opinions to one side of an issue... The journalist, in being able to choose which points of view to represent with direct quotation in a news story, is thus invested with considerable power.

Perkins and Starosta (2001) conducted a study that investigated news values and how they can incorporate journalistic biases. Their study focused on the representation of Native Americans in the United States in regional and local newspapers. They used the 5 point model proposed by De Fleur & De Fleur (1967), Gerbner, Gross, Morgan and Signorielli (1986), and McCombs and Bells (1996) to understand media representation of Native Americans and the model focuses on the following issues in a news article:

1. Who is/is not quoted? (2) Who is/is not given credence by title? (3) Where are those cited positioned within the news reports? (4) Whose ideas are supported (reinforced)/ questioned? and (5) Which details are included or excluded? (Perkins and Starosta, 2001:76).

This five point model was used by Perkins and Starosta (2001) to investigate the journalistic biases that tend to reflect in the news. The five point model provides a foundation for analysing the kind of coverage given to a particular group in the news. However, Critical Discourse Analysis (see Chapter 3) offers better insight with its qualitative approach. Perkins and Storasta’s study offers an insight into the task of analyzing newspapers. The study established that Native Americans were represented
negatively in the news, and further exposed the fact that the press was less sympathetic to the issues of minorities or those who held trivial economic power in the United States.

According to Brooks, Kennedy, Moen & Ranly (1996:60), “The use of a title gives the story credibility.” The referral to individuals only by their names and without providing their titles is said to make them less credible in news stories. Race, gender and where a person is from, is always mentioned in the news and it can be perceived as important in adding credibility or interest to the story.

Stamm, Jackson and Jacoubovitch (1980:63) state that news readers have a tendency to peruse only the headline or the first one or two paragraphs of an article. Therefore the most pivotal information must be in the headline, and the first and second paragraphs of the article. Individuals that are positioned first in the news articles are also seen by readers as important pertaining to the issue that is being discussed in the news article.

According to Fico and Soffin (1995:621), another important concern pertaining to news reports is to consider which “particular points of view on a single issue are given more attention than others; their public salience will increase and thereby alter the public debate resolving the issue”. If there are two sides with different opinions on a particular issue, the media has to provide balanced reporting in order to offer readers the opportunity to make informed decisions.

In understanding journalistic practice further, Van Dijk (1991) uses the metaphor of the tip of a pyramid in explaining how news stories are written. The argument he makes is that complex issues are summarised by the media and important information is not given great attention, which is misleading to readers. News therefore becomes a product that trivialises even serious social events in order to be appealing to readers.

It is a gross understatement to insinuate that because (through widespread ownership) the media is a capitalist-owned enterprise that supports the views of its proprietors while ignoring the autonomy of journalists and news producers. The media can represent the interests of capital in its coverage of the news without being directly financially remunerated (Hall, Chritcher, Jefferson, Clarke and Roberts, 1996). The media acquire
their news from reliable or regular institutional sources that have the means to provide sufficient content. These sources are likely to be from the government and institutions that are engaged with issuing out press releases (Rock in Hall et al., 1996).

The media is said to be an institution that associates itself with the notions of ‘impartiality’, ‘balance’ and ‘objectivity’ (Hall et al, 1996:427). The professional rules that govern the media lead to media statements that are sourced from so called ‘accredited sources’. The media tends to use “accredited representatives from major institutions in society such as members of parliament when writing on politics, employers and trade union leaders for industrial matters and so on” (Hall et al, 1996: 427). Representatives are accredited because of the position and power they wield within such organisations. Another source that is frequently relied upon by the media, is the ‘expert’ source who is an authority or highly knowledgeable in his/her field. Statements by expert sources are perceived as to be objective. In using experts and accredited representatives, the media only gives a voice to sources that are powerful and hold high positions.

2.5 Conclusion

This chapter provided a discussion on how the media represents the working class, and elaborated that in some special cases, the media can provide news stories with information that is distorted. Hegemony has been covered as a factor that explains why the opinions of the ruling elite are shown to be important than those of the working class because of issues related to having access to the media. Identity has been discussed in particular black identity during apartheid and post-apartheid South Africa. A section on racism and transformation in South African media provided an insight into the representation of black people during apartheid and an insight into the problems of representing black people in the media today. Stereotypes and racial representation were also discussed as part of the cultural studies approach. Political economy of the media provided a perspective on the problems of private media ownership in capitalist societies. The sociology of news production helped with developing an understanding of issues around journalistic bias and values that inform the production of news. The next chapter presents the research methodology.
3. CHAPTER THREE: RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

3.1 INTRODUCTION

This chapter discusses the methodology that was used in this study. The study followed a qualitative and quantitative research design and was exploratory in nature. Purposive sampling was used to select newspaper articles from the year 2009 about the minibus taxi industry and the BRT. Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) was employed as a data analysis tool.

3.2 RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY

This study employed Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA), which is a qualitative research method. CDA entailed applying a linguistic approach to the content in news articles in order to generate meaning in relation to the social context. Furthermore, CDA, as a qualitative method, allowed for the generation of themes from the news articles as a means of capturing the most important information from the news. With a thematic approach, the number of times a particular theme emerged from the articles was quantified.

3.2.1 Rationale for using qualitative and quantitative research

Qualitative research allows for a broad and open-ended approach to finding meaning (Maykut and Morehouse, 2001). Qualitative research is a method of inquiry that aims to gather an in-depth understanding of various issues. While on the contrary, quantitative research relies on ‘replicability, testing hypotheses, and objective procedures (Cho and Trent, 2006: 319). Quantitative research does however guarantee non-discrimination in the selection of data which helps in obtaining validity and reliability. Human phenomena cannot only be studied through quantitative enquiry with the aim of obtaining objectivity in results, as a remedy qualitative research provides for interpretative, contextual and constructivist approaches (Richardson, 2007).
Qualitative research provides for interpretative, contextual and constructivist approaches (Richardson, 2007). Qualitative research does this by asking why and how with regards to the research topic. The research is exploratory, meaning that it provides an insight into a particular topic or issue, and it is research that is conducted because a problem has not been clearly defined (Babbie & Mouton, 2001:79). In addition, exploratory research is utilised when the topic or issue is new and when certain data is difficult to collect. It is flexible and allows the researcher to address all types of research questions such as how and why (Du Plooy, 2001).

3.3 DATA COLLECTION METHODS

Purposive sampling means that elements are selected for the study on the basis of knowledge of the population and the aims of the study (Babbie, 2001). The sampling method is preferred by researchers because it can allow the researcher to strictly select elements that he/she is particularly interested in study. This sampling method allows for bias as the researcher is left alone to determine which elements are relevant.

The articles that were used in the study covered the minibus taxi industry and the Bus Rapid Transit (BRT) system which were issues that were being investigated. Articles on the minibus taxi industry that did not deal with the BRT were not utilised in the study.

This study focused on newspaper articles from the 1st of January 2009 to the 31st December 2009. The search term that was used in the SA Media database was ‘TAXI and BRT’, while the publication type selected was ‘Major Newspapers’. The year 2009 generated 332 results which was the largest sample, implying that the year had extensive coverage on the taxi industry and the BRT system. This figure is the largest in comparison to the years 2008, 2010, 2011, 2012 and 2013. The year is important for analysis as it was the year when the BRT was initiated in the major cities as a transport system to assist with the hosting of the Fifa Confederations Cup in 2009, and of course to assist in 2010 with the Fifa World Cup. The system received a high volume of coverage for 2009 in light of these events. There was immense debate about the readiness of South Africa to host the events, and there were many questions about the transport infrastructure ahead of the Confederations Cup in 2009. BRT was only
implemented around the 1st of September 2009, and it therefore failed to service the *Fifa Confederations Cup* that was held in June 2009.

A total of twenty (20) articles were selected for analysis from a total of 332 articles on the BRT in 2009. The sampling yielded 5 (five) articles for each of the four (4) major newspaper companies, namely Times Media, Caxton, Media24 and Independent Newspapers. The study only analysed English articles from the South African press. Twenty articles were sufficient for the study as a detailed analysis of each article was performed, although pictures were not included in the analysis. As this study applied was a qualitative study that applied CDA, 20 articles provided sufficient data for extensive analysis and a larger sample would not have been feasible taking time in account. Public opinion articles and letters to the editors were not included as they are not produced by journalists.

### 3.4 Data analysis methods

#### 3.4.1 Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA)

Newspapers represent the world through language, from the headlines to the actual article. Language is employed to formulate a picture in the minds of readers; it is a tool for conveying meaning. Richardson (2007:10) states that “language is produced by society and (through the effect of language’s use on people) it goes on to help recreate it. Language first represents social realities and second contributes to the production and reproduction of social reality or social life”.

Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) is a theory and method of newspaper analysis that advocates interpretative, contextual and constructivist approaches. CDA implies that analysts offer “interpretations of the meanings of texts rather than just quantifying textual features, they situate what is written in the context in which it occurs with the strongest argument being that textual meaning is constructed through an interaction between producer, text and consumer rather than simply being ‘read off’ the page by all readers in exactly the same way” (Ibid, 15).

CDA is multidisciplinary, although it focuses primarily on social problems and political issues (van Dijk, 1998). It does not merely describe discourse structures, but also
attempts to explain them in terms of social interaction (van Dijk, 1998). The method further looks at:

The ways discourse structures enact, confirm, legitimate, reproduce or challenge relations of power and dominance in society. Critical Discourse Analysis is a type of discourse analytical research that primarily studies the way social power abuse, dominance and inequality are enacted, reproduced and resisted by text and talk in the social and political context (van Dijk, 1998:1).

According to van Dijk (2001), the vocabulary in CDA includes words such as: power, dominance, hegemony, ideology, class, gender, discrimination, interests, reproduction, institutions, social structure and social order. CDA research tends to refer to leading social philosophers and social scientists when theorising about fundamental notions in society (van Dijk, 1998). CDA allowed the researcher to interrogate the linguistic meaning of the words that are used in newspapers with respect to the minibus taxi industry and the BRT, and what possible meaning/implications they have in the social context.

Fairclough and Wodak (1997:271–280) list the following as the main components of CDA:

- CDA addresses social problems
- Power relations are discursive
- Discourse constitutes society and culture
- Discourse does ideological work
- Discourse is historical
- The link between text and society is mediated
- Discourse analysis is interpretative and explanatory
- Discourse is a form of social action
Most importantly, CDA investigates “the way specific discourse structures are deployed in the reproduction of social dominance, whether they are part of a conversion or a news report or other genres and contexts” (van Dijk, 1998:3).

CDA recognises power as a tool that yields control for those who possess it over those who do not. This power mostly stems from access to scarce or rare social resources, such as force, money, status, fame, knowledge, information, culture, or various forms of public discourse and communication (van Dijk, 1998). The power of the dominant group may be integrated in laws, rules, norms, habits and even hegemony. Class domination, sexism and racism are components that emanate from hegemony. Power is important as it can offer control over discourse in relation to politics, the media or science. People’s minds are said to be influenced by text and conversation, and it is proven that discourse can control people’s actions through persuasion and manipulation.

CDA also investigates the issue of who has access to public discourse. In most instances, elites such as professors have access to academic discourse while journalists have access to news discourse. The individuals or groups that have control over many discourses are perceived to be more powerful. Over the past years, CDA has gone as far as to address the role of discourse in the enactment and reproduction of ethnic and ‘racial’ inequality.

According to Philips and Jorgenson (2002:1), the word ‘discourse’ is underlined by the general idea that language is structured according to different patterns that people’s utterances follow when they take part in different aspects of social life, familiar examples being ‘medical discourse’ and ‘political discourse’.

Betrand and Hughes (2005:87) explain that:

> The application of discourse analysis to the media grew out of semiotic studies attempting to assess the meaning of language in terms of implicit ideological assumptions, and discourse analysis pays specific attention to the linguistic component of language use in the media.
Betrand and Hughes (2005:87) further state that discourse analysis contends that, “News is a representation of the world in language, it imposes a structure of values, social and economic in origin, on whatever is represented.” News is said to be a construction because each form of linguistic expression in the text-wording, syntax, etc.-has a specific role to play. Most discourse analyses consist of several techniques that also involve linguistic analysis (Betrand & Hughes, 2005:88).

CDA is part of postmodernist thinking, and thrives on the assumption that there is no one true view of the world. Postmodernist thinking further states that there is no meaning in the world, and that the world is inherently fragmented and heterogeneous. Any way of making sense or belief is viewed by postmodernists as subjective interpretation (Frohmann, 1992). Furthermore, any interpretation is conditioned by the social surroundings from whence it emerges and the dominant discourse of the time.

The aim of this study was to explore the language that was used to represent the minibus taxi industry in relation to the BRT in newspapers. The rationale behind this was to attempt to discover the kind of representation that is awarded to the taxi industry by newspapers. The focus was on determining the kind of meaning or meanings that can be derived from the news content. This particular study relied on Fairclough’s method of Critical Discourse Analysis which is comprised of three phases of analysis: textual analysis, discursive practices and social practices (Fairclough, 2003). Textual analysis involves performing linguistic analyses on the text, and this particular study used the tools prescribed by Richardson (2007) in its linguistic analysis:

- **Lexical analysis: the choice and meaning of words**

This refers to the analysis of particular words that are used in newspaper articles. Words are said to convey society’s imprint and value judgements, and convey connoted as well as denoted meanings.

- **Naming and references**

The way people are named in news discourse can have a significant impact on how they are viewed. Individuals possess “a range of identities, roles and characteristics that
could be used to describe them equally accurately but not with the same meaning” (Ibid, 49).

- **Predication**

  This emphasises paying attention to the choice of words used to represent the values and characteristics of social actors (Ibid, 52).

- **Sentence construction: syntax and transitivity**

  Transitivity is concerned with how actions are represented; what kind of actions appear in a text, who does them and to whom they are done’ – in short, the ‘who’ (or what) does what to whom (or what)’. A major concern in transitivity is the “realisation that in producing texts there is a range of choices to be made, and every text which has been produced could have been produced differently” (Ibid, 54).

- **Sentence construction: modality**

  Modality is said to be “the counter-part of transitivity, referring to judgements, comment and attitude in text and talk, and specifically the degree to which a speaker or writer is committed to the claim he or she is making” (Ibid, 59). Simpson (1993:47) states that: “Modality refers broadly to a speaker’s attitude towards, or opinion about, the truth of a proposition expressed by a sentence. It also extends to their attitude towards the situation or event described by a sentence.”

- **Presupposition**

  Presupposition implies that not all meaning is immediately ‘there’ in a text to be simply discerned from the manifest content; there are hidden or presupposed meanings in texts. A presupposition is a taken-for-granted, implicit claim embedded within the explicit meaning of a sentence or utterance (Richardson, 2007:63).

- **Rhetorical tropes**

  Journalists are said to create content that is embedded with rhetorical strategies that persuade people to adopt their point of view. Journalism represents “opinion statements
embedded in argumentation that makes them more or less defensible, reasonable, justifiable or legitimate as conclusions” (van Dijk in Richardson, 2007:65).

- **Hyperbole**

Hyperbole is an example of excessive exaggeration made for rhetorical effect. This is commonly used in headlines and reflects sensationalism and humour, especially in tabloid newspapers (Ibid, 65).

- **Metaphor**

A metaphor involves perceiving one thing in terms of another. There are metaphors for various genres of journalism. Metaphors of war are largely found in journalism, especially in sports reports (Ibid, 66).

- **Metonym**

Jasinski (in Richardson, 2007:67) explains that metonymy “is a form of substitution in which something that is associated with X is substituted for X. It is a trope in which one word, phrase or object is substituted for another from a semantically related field of reference”.

- **Neologism**

Neologisms are created in a number of ways. One of them is through the addition of prefixes or suffixes to create new words. Neologisms can also be created by shifting the meanings of words, either by changing grammatical function or developing a new euphemistic meaning (Ibid, 69).

- **Puns**

Puns are a form of word-play that fall into three main categories: homographic puns that exploit multiple meanings of essentially the same word; ideographic puns that substitute words of similar but not identical sound; and homophonic puns that substitute words with the same sound but unrelated meaning (Ibid, 70).

- **Narrative**
News is presented as stories. The narrative content is the sequence of events as they occurred in the actual story: the plot or the structure of actions. The narrative form is the sequence in which the events are presented to us (the readers). Hard news narrative is organised according to the inverted pyramid or 'climax-first' structure. Franklin et al. (in Richardson, 1997:71) writes that the inverted pyramid is the “standardised format for writing a hard news story which places the most important information at the head of the story and uses the lead paragraph to answer the five 'W questions': Who? What? Why? Where? and When?”

According to Fairclough (1995a), the second phase (the discursive phase) involves investigating discursive practices with respect to news discourse focusing on the various aspects of the processes of text production. At this stage, discourse analysis focuses on texts and their embedded meaning and how they relate in the social conditions of production and consumption (Richardson, 2007). The discursive phase does not entail only encoding and decoding of the content, but importantly aims to acquire more meaning from the text. This requires the analyst to also look at the producer of the text and the institutions that produce such texts (Richardson, 2007:41).

The last phase in CDA is the social practices phase, which involves the analysis of the text’s “socio-cultural practice” or “the social and cultural goings-on which the communicative event is part of” (Ibid, 114). Social practices are said to shape the work of journalists. The analysis of the social practices surrounding newspaper discourse require the analyst to look outside the text and to examine the relationship between journalism and the social formation as a whole (Richardson, 2007:114).

3.4.2 The thematic approach

Thematic analysis allows the researcher to identify a limited number of themes that adequately reflect textual data (Johnstone, 2008). It is a qualitative research tool, and the researcher must be extremely familiar with the data that he/she intends to analyse using this method. The researcher is required to carry out data collection on his/her own in order to develop a thorough understanding of the data. If not, he or she will be at a disadvantage. Thematic analysis goes beyond simply counting phrases or words in a
text and moves on to identifying implicit and explicit ideas within the data. A theme represents a level of patterned response or meaning from the data that is related to the research questions. The researcher’s judgement is important in determining which themes are more crucial. Research questions should not be used as themes but rather the researcher should attempt to create codes (Braun & Clarke, 2006).

The researcher is expected to explain the themes sufficiently in order for others to understand what they mean. The themes that were developed in this study emerged from the content in the twenty news articles. Thematic analysis goes beyond simply counting phrases or words in a text and moves on to identifying implicit and explicit ideas within the data.

3.5 CONCLUSION

A qualitative and quantitative research design was used in the study, and purposive sampling was applied in order to acquire the sample for analysis. Critical Discourse Analysis provided tools for analysing the newspaper articles and for interrogating the texts pertaining to issues about the minibus taxi industry and the BRT system in the socio-political environment of South Africa. A thematic approach assisted in capturing important information or recurring issues in the content of the articles and quantifying the frequency of themes. Chapter 4 presents the data analysis.
4. CHAPTER FOUR: DATA PRESENTATION AND ANALYSIS

4.1 INTRODUCTION

This chapter presents and analyses the content in twenty (20) news articles drawn from major newspapers on the minibus taxi industry and the BRT system in South Africa in 2009, focusing on the headlines, sub-headlines, the newspaper that published the article, and the sources that were used in the news articles. Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) was applied to the headlines, sub-headlines, and the content of each news article. The CDA assisted in providing the themes for the news articles in terms of the representation awarded to the minibus taxi industry in the issue of the BRT system. The chapter therefore answers the following research question:

- In what ways did newspapers represent the minibus taxi industry during the introduction of the Bus Rapid Transit (BRT) system?

4.2 NEWS ARTICLES ON THE BRT AND MINIBUS TAXI INDUSTRY IN 2009

Table 1 below provides information relating to the twenty (20) news articles that were used in this study, specifically the names of the newspapers, dates, headlines, sub-headlines and the sources that were used in the articles.

**Table 1: News articles on the BRT in 2009**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PUBLICATION</th>
<th>DATE</th>
<th>HEADLINE</th>
<th>SUBHEADLINE</th>
<th>SOURCES</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Business Day</td>
<td>8/4/09</td>
<td>Threat of taxi strikes hangs over SA</td>
<td>Gauteng becomes the eighth province to demand protest action over planned BRT systems</td>
<td>Taxi (SANTACO)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Newspaper</td>
<td>Date</td>
<td>Event Description</td>
<td>Protesting Entities</td>
<td>Threatened Groups</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sowetan</td>
<td>27/10/09</td>
<td>Taximen in Cape Town protest against BRT</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Government; Taxi (NTA); Special interest groups; Business; informal sector (Hawkers)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Herald (Eastern Cape)</td>
<td>10/2/09</td>
<td>Taxi operators threaten to extend Bay strike</td>
<td>Western Cape, KZN counterparts all set to join in protest action</td>
<td>Taxi; Special interest groups (Chamber of Commerce); government (SAPS); Business (VW South Africa, GM South Africa); university</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sunday Times</td>
<td>6/9/09</td>
<td>Soweto taxi boss critic of BRT shot dead</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Government and Taxi (United Taxi Association Forum)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sowetan</td>
<td>25/5/09</td>
<td>We'll disrupt all modes of transport</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Taxi (Utaf)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citizen</td>
<td>18/8/09</td>
<td>Taxi strike over BRT looms</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Taxi (Utaf); Government</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citizen</td>
<td>28/8/09</td>
<td>‘BRT is here, whether taxis like it or not’</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Government</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Source</td>
<td>Date</td>
<td>Event Description</td>
<td>Stakeholders</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citizen</td>
<td>9/7/09</td>
<td>Premier backs bus system</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Government</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citizen</td>
<td>26/3/09</td>
<td>Taxi body wants Radebe to go</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Taxi (Utaf); Special Interest Group (South African Transport and Allied Workers’ Union)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citizen</td>
<td>9/4/09</td>
<td>Mass taxi strike set for election day, if demands not met</td>
<td>Taxi (Utaf); Political Party (African National Congress) and Government</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City Press</td>
<td>15/3/09</td>
<td>Prepared to die’ for their trade</td>
<td>Taxi fury over transit plans</td>
<td>Taxi (Utaf); Government; Taxi (SANTACO)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City Press</td>
<td>15/3/09</td>
<td>Drivers threaten to halt World Cup in anger over bus system</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Taxi (SANTACO) and Government (Police).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City Press</td>
<td>14/6/09</td>
<td>Stalemate in BRT and taxi talks but joint committee is planned</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Government; Taxi (drivers); Taxi (Utaf); Special interest (South African Commuter Organisation).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Source</td>
<td>Date</td>
<td>Title</td>
<td>Details</td>
<td>Involvement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City Press</td>
<td>6/9/09</td>
<td>Taxi boss killed after government talks</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Taxi (Drivers)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City Press</td>
<td>15/3/09</td>
<td>Uneducated’ taxi man: I will fight to protect job</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Taxi (taxi marshal)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Star</td>
<td>1/9/09</td>
<td>Full Steam Ahead: Large queues as new system tries to find its feet</td>
<td>No serious incidents of resistance as taxi stayaway causes headache</td>
<td>Government; Para statal (Metrorail); Special interest (South African Transport and Allied Workers Union and South African Commuter Organisation; taxi (Utaf); Commuters</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Daily News</td>
<td>17/8/09</td>
<td>We won’t tolerate anarchy: Mchunu</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Government and Taxi (KZN Taxi Council).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cape Argus</td>
<td>19/5/09</td>
<td>FIFA’s Plan B for 2010 fans</td>
<td>World football body says it has a back-up if BRT is not sorted out</td>
<td>Government; special interest group (FIFA); taxi (SANTACO) and taxi (Western Cape</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4.3 Analysis of headlines, sub headlines, and full articles

1. Business Day, 8 April 2009

Headline:

*Threat of taxi strikes hangs over SA*

The headline of this article refers to a threat of strikes across South Africa. However, the BRT had only been proposed for three metropolitan cities in South Africa, namely Johannesburg, Cape Town and Port Elizabeth. Furthermore, the headline propagates the idea of a ‘threat’, suggesting that the news article will contain a description of the potential violence that might emanate from the taxi strike. A more accurate headline
would be: *Threat of taxi strikes hang over Johannesburg, Cape Town and Port Elizabeth.*

In this instance, the writer of the article shows his or her perception about what strikes entail, i.e. that they are a ‘threat’ to the everyday functions of the economy. The strike has not taken place yet, and so it is merely the prediction of the news writer that the strike will not be peaceful. The writer therefore provides his/her own perspective (opinion) and speculates on possible consequences of the incident.

[Threat]

The word ‘threat’ connotes fear, especially with respect to issues of security (threat to security), and it is a word that suggests that the taxi strike will be violent. Industrial action is feared, and a headline that uses the word ‘threat’ already presupposes that the strike will be something to fear.

Article:

This article reported on the protests that were to be undertaken by the taxi industry in response to the BRT system which they did not want government to implement. It further reported on the meetings that took place between Santaco and the various taxi associations in Gauteng.

[The government agreed last year on the roll-out of BRT systems in three metropolitan areas and reactions in the already fractious industry have varied]

The use of the word ‘already’ is a presupposition in this particular sentence. It seems to imply that the minibus taxi industry is and has been a fractious industry for some time. This particular sentence contains some words that can be analysed as the opinion of the writer of the article, which indicates some compromise on ‘objectivity’ from the journalist’s side. The denotative meaning of the word ‘fractious’ is easily irritated and bad tempered. The synonyms for the word ‘fractious’ are cantankerous, peevish and petulant. It is often used in relation to children. The use of the word gives the reader the impression that the minibus taxi industry is quarrelsome and in disagreement with itself.

---

The difference between ‘reactions in the industry have varied’ and ‘reactions in the already fractious industry have varied’ is obvious: the former is calm, while the latter implies trouble.

[Taxi interests that protested in Johannesburg last month say that the associations negotiating with the city do not represent their interests]

The reference to the taxi associations as ‘taxi interests’ raises many questions about which taxi associations these are. There were of course disagreements with regard to the BRT amongst different taxi associations. The wording is problematic as it does not specify to which interests the article refers.

2. Sowetan, 27 October 2009

Headline:

**Taximen in Cape Town protest against BRT**

The headline refers to ‘taximen’ as the only protesters in Cape Town, but there were other organisations in solidarity with the taxi industry in the protest against the BRT system in Cape Town. The headline captures the BRT issue as if it is only a problem for the minibus taxi industry, when in fact there were other entities that disagreed with the system such as the South African National Civics Organisation and National African Federated Chamber of Commerce and Industry.

Article:

This article looks at various organisations including the taxi industry that protested against the implementation of the BRT in the Western Cape. The National Taxi Alliance in this article voices its concerns with the BRT.

Western Cape National Taxi Alliance (NTA) provincial chairperson Mandla Mata is quoted on his views of the former ANC youth league president Julius Malema. Mata is presented as fascinated with Malema’s ‘shoot to kill’ slogan and this paints him as an irrational leader of the taxi industry.
3. The Herald, 10 February 2009

**Taxi operators threaten to extend Bay strike**

Headline:

Once again, the word ‘threaten’ yields a negative image of what the minibus taxi industry proposes to do. The word is emotionally charged and instils concern, agitation, or fear in readers. An analogy of war is evident in this headline. The strike in this headline is portrayed as a negative undertaking and not as a protest by disgruntled citizens against the proposed BRT system.

Article:

The article reported on the promise by the taxi industry in the Nelson Mandela Bay area to extend a strike that had already taken place and that had left commuters stranded without transport to commute.

In the article, commuters are not interviewed on their concerns about the strike. However, representatives from companies such as *General Motors South Africa* and *Volkswagen South Africa* are interviewed in relation to worker turnout due to the taxi strike. The article interviews individuals in the car industry (mainstream economy) about the industrial action of the taxi industry (the informal sector). Coincidentally, both are in the business of transport. The media’s reliance on elite sources as their credible sources for news is underscored in this article; the insights of the mainstream economy will always be sought by the media.

[A public health standing committee meeting was also cancelled yesterday as councillors, mostly ANC, did not arrive due to the taxi strike]

This seems to imply that ANC councillors did not arrive at their meeting because of the taxi strike. Councillors are not disadvantaged in terms of resources; in most cases they are middle class and do not rely on taxis for commuting. Councillors are not customers of the minibus taxi industry, and the reference to their cancelled meeting because of the strike is unfounded.
4. Sunday Times, 6 September 2009

Headline:

*Soweto taxi boss critic of BRT shot dead*

The taxi owner is described as a BRT critic. This description suggests that the taxi owner might have been murdered by those who were pro-BRT. This presupposes that there might be other taxi associations which were content with the BRT system, or alternatively that government committed the horrific act.

Article:

This article reports on the murder of a taxi official who was shot outside his home and he was said to be very vocal about his discontent with BRT. The murder of the taxi owner is linked to BRT disputes without substantial evidence. The news article paints a picture of the BRT disputes as violent and as amounting to murders. The idea of the BRT system as a negotiation between relevant stakeholders is overshadowed by the position taken by the article. In this instance the BRT negotiations are painted as violent while there are other factors that could have resulted in the shooting of the taxi official such as disagreements with other taxi associations and for other unknown personal reasons. The article attempts to link the shooting to the fact that the taxi official was a critic of BRT.

5. Sowetan, 25 May 2009

Headline:

*We’ll disrupt all modes of transport*

The headline appears to be a statement that is not a true reflection of what is in the article; it is sensational and fails to capture the issues presented in the article. The readers are made to make their own judgement about who is the source of the quote and so it is linked to the taxi industry without any substantial evidence from the article.

Article:
The article discusses the summit that was held by the United Taxi Association Forum (Utaf) to stop all public transport including trains if government did not meet their demands on BRT. Taxi industry members are said to have been disgruntled by BRT. Utaf made a statement that they do not want taxi members who advocate for BRT and that such individuals should remove their taxis if they decide to get involved in BRT as stakeholders. No source in the article can be accredited to the quote in the headline. The reader might assume that the statement is from a representative of the taxi industry. The article does provide other direct quotations that are accredited to sources.

6. Citizen, 18 August 2009

Headline:

*Taxi strike over BRT looms*

The word 'looms' elicits fear and arouses security concerns in the minds of readers with regards to the upcoming strike.

Article:

The word 'bosses' is used to refer to taxi owners. Although the word is conventionally used to refer to individuals who are in charge of executing decisions in organisations, it still carries some negative connotations. In popular culture, the word 'boss' is associated with the mafia and underground crime organisations. During apartheid the word 'boss' was used to refer to white people and many people still use it today and largely because of apartheid it has negative connotations.

The word is used to refer to individuals at the helm of organizations in society, such as private companies and some public entities. However, in news reports, descriptive titles are normally used to refer to those in charge such as chief operations officer, managing director and chairman. Basically, the use of the word 'boss' is rather casual in comparison to the use of 'chief executive officer' or 'chairmen’ of taxi associations.

7. Citizen, 28 August 2009

Headline:
‘BRT is here, whether taxis like it or not’

The headline is a direct quotation from the premier of the Gauteng province, Nomvula Mokonyane. The headline suggests that the government is frustrated with the matter of the BRT, and is unwilling to compromise on its position. The tone is forceful and militant; negotiations appear to be over. The taxi industry in this article is positioned as a threat to “law abiding citizens” and the government’s role as that of a protector of citizens of the country from unruly criminals who are members of the taxi industry.

Article:

The article only provides news from the perspective of the government on the BRT issue, and talks about the concerns of the government. The article fails to provide any input or comments from the taxi industry.

8. Citizen, 9 July 2009

Headline:

Premier backs bus system

This is another headline that paints the uncompromising stance of the government with regards to the BRT system. The BRT appears to be endorsed by the government, which awards it some legitimacy. The taxi industry’s stance is omitted.

Article:

Once again, the article only provides news from the perspective of the government on the BRT issue, and it talks about the concerns of the government. The article does not provide any input or comments from the taxi industry.

9. Citizen, 26 March 2009

Headline:

Taxi body wants Radebe to go
The headline implies that the taxi industry is dissatisfied with the Minister of Transport, whom they hold responsible for the implementation of the BRT system. The taxi industry is presented as intolerant and unwilling to negotiate.

Article:

In this article, the taxi industry wanted the Minister of Transport Jeff Radebe to resign because of his position with regard to the BRT. The Congress of People (COPE) supported the taxi industry and had also pointed to the BRT as problematic. Ralph Jones of Utaf promised to take disciplinary action against any taxi associations’ members that were violent or had assaulted people as they delivered their demands to government.

The word ‘fray’ is used in the article to refer to the attempt of the United Taxi Association Forum (Utaf) to engage with the Minister of Transport on the issue of the BRT system. The word implies that there are no debates or negotiations, but that with regard to BRT the taxi industry is just violent and unwilling to negotiate. The article did not state that Utaf was joining its counterparts in solidarity to debate with the government about the BRT system. The involvement of the taxi industry is perceived to be a violent intervention. In the article, the South African Transport and Allied Workers’ Union takes the position that the taxi industry is using violence in order to halt the inception of the BRT system. The Union is of the opinion that the taxi industry uses violence to persuade the government and other stakeholders to do what it wants.

10. Citizen, 9 April 2009

Headline:

Mass taxi strike set for election day, if demands not met
The headline proposes that the strike will interrupt Election Day, when in fact the taxi industry had proposed the strike to be longer than one day. The reference to Election Day in the headline adds a dramatic spin to the story. Referring to an event as big as the elections makes the story stand out to every reader, as every citizen considers elections to be important, and any threat to them is a threat to national security.

Article:

The article reported on the possibility of a taxi strike that could disrupt the elections in South Africa and the United Taxi Association Forum had announced this. The assumption is made in the article that the taxi industry strike will disrupt the elections in South Africa. The proposed strike is given greater importance than it deserves. The taxi industry is seemingly portrayed as unpatriotic in its willingness to disrupt important national events. Such representation potentially makes readers less sympathetic to the grievances of the industry.

11. City Press, 15 March 2009

Headline:

_Prepared to die’ for their trade_

A direct quotation is used in the headline, which is a statement taken from a disgruntled taxi driver who believed that he would lose his job because of the BRT system. Although this provides an alternative perspective on the news about the BRT system, this is not from an assigned spokesperson for the minibus taxi industry, but a worker in the industry. News reports on stories about the mainstream economy largely focus on interviewing assigned spokespeople by organisations instead of moving down the hierarchy to interview workers. This is a strategy to prevent uncensored statements that might jeopardise the whole agenda of the organisation. In this instance, the perspective of the taxi driver implies that the minibus taxi industry will use violence if it does not get what it wants.

Sub-headline:
Taxi fury over transit plans

The word ‘fury’ exemplifies great anger or rage. A raging entity (taxi industry) cannot be expected to participate in any negotiations or engage in diplomacy to resolve a dispute.

Article:

The article reports on the industrial action that was taken by the taxi industry on the 24th of March 2009 against the Joburg Rea Vaya transit system. There were similar strikes that were noted such as in Cape Town were 600 taxi operators went against the Integrated Rapid Transit system.

The story provides the background of the BRT system, and lists the benefits that the BRT will introduce to a developing country like South Africa. The article then states that some taxi ‘factions’ had stipulated that they were going to disrupt the 2009 Fifa Confederations Cup and the 2010 Fifa World Cup that were held in South Africa.

The perspective of a taxi driver is provided with regard to the BRT, but it is a rather radical standpoint that depicts the taxi driver as an individual who is determined to use violence to stop the BRT system from being implemented.

12. City Press, 15 March 2009

Headline:

Drivers threaten to halt World Cup in anger over bus system

The headline captures the anger of taxi drivers who felt that the BRT system would jeopardize their livelihood. A sensational statement was used in the headline. Not all statements made by the taxi drivers in the article are radical or of a violent nature, but the most radical statement was chosen to headline this article.

Article:

The article deals with threats made by taxi drivers to disrupt the World Cup if the government commences with the implementation of the BRT system. The story provides a background of the lives of the taxi drivers who share their views on the BRT
The drivers’ statements suggest that they do not know the leadership that is responsible for the BRT system, e.g.: “.. that Masondo guy”. Amos Masondo was the mayor of the City of Johannesburg at the time, and in reading the article, it appears as if taxi drivers either did not respect the mayor or were ignorant about the fact that he was the mayor. Such comments make taxi drivers appear to be ignorant about what they are fighting for or against. A taxi driver named Moodley in the article did not even care about what the council (City of Johannesburg) was proposing, reiterating the perception of taxi drivers as ignorant individuals. However, the article also provides information about the dependants of the interviewed taxi drivers and the amount of money that the drivers earn. Working conditions in the minibus taxi industry for the average taxi driver are also provided in the article. This is the kind of reporting that tries to show that taxi drivers are normal people with challenges like everyone else.

On the other hand, the article quotes radical statements made by taxi drivers about disrupting the 2010 Fifa World Cup, creating the impression that the minibus taxi industry is ignorant of the losses that the economy would incur as a result of losing the World Cup. Direct quotations predominate; reporting and paraphrasing are rarely used in the article. According to the ethics of journalism, direct quotations help to uphold the picture of journalism as an objective and impartial practice, but the question is, why always the radical statements and views from the taxi industry in the BRT story?

13. City Press, 14 June 2009

Headline:

*Stalemate in BRT and taxi talks but joint committee is planned*

This headline is representative of the events in the article and clearly reflects the deadlock that had taken place in the BRT negotiations.

Article:

The article discusses the deadlock that occurred in the talks between the City of Johannesburg and the taxi industry in relation to the BRT system. The article dwells on the amount of money invested by the City of Johannesburg in the BRT system.
However, the article does not discuss the money invested by the minibus taxi drivers in minibus taxis and petrol, and the losses that the industry could incur with the inception of the BRT system.

The spokesperson for United Taxi Association Forum (Utaf), Ralph Jones, is directly quoted in his use of the word ‘nonsense’ when referring to the proposed BRT system. The Utaf spokesperson is only directly quoted when he makes an evocative statement to the media, which was also an observable practice in the previous article. ‘Nonsense’ makes it seem like the taxi operators are acting childish when a system as heavily invested in as the BRT is being proposed.


Headline:

*Taxi boss killed after government talks*

This description suggests that the taxi owner might have been killed due to his participation in government talks. This headline is similar to the previous headline of the *Sunday Times* on the 6th of September 2009; both headlines provide a presupposition of what might be the cause of the murder.

Article:

The article talks about the life of a taxi owner Mr. Molefe, who was shot dead outside his home after he had met with the transport minister to discuss the BRT system. Molefe was the first deputy president of SANTACO. Information about Molefe’s life is provided. The article presents him as a family man and a caring individual. A point is made that Mr. Molefe was a taxi official and a taxi owner of great standing.

15. City Press, 15 March 2009

Headline:

*Uneducated’ taxi man: I will fight to protect job*
The headline stresses the point that the taxi man is ‘uneducated’, but what determines whether or not one is educated is debatable. The taxi man referred to in the headline was actually a queue marshal who had reached but failed to pass matric; it seems rather controversial to state that he is uneducated. South Africa is a developing country with a large number of illiterate citizens, and reaching matric means that the individual can basically read and write. The reader of the headline can be misled to think that the article will refer to an individual who has never been to school and who cannot read or write. The phrase ‘I will fight to protect job’ is linguistically incorrect to emphasize the lack of education in the taxi industry and it should rather read ‘I will fight to protect my job’.

Article:

The article looks at the life of a queue marshal who is not in favour of the proposed BRT system and who makes a living at the Noord taxi rank in Johannesburg. Information on the amount of money earned by the queue marshal in a week is provided in the article. The article is largely written from the perspective of the queue marshal. As in other articles, the queue marshal is also quoted making radical statements that are anti-BRT.

16. Star, 1 September 2009

Headline:

**Full Steam Ahead: Large queues as new system tries to find its feet**

The headline depicts zest on the side of the BRT system, with the statement “Full Steam Ahead”. The impression is given that the BRT is prepared to meet the challenge on its first day of operations.

Sub-headline:

*No serious incidents of resistance as taxi stayaway causes headache*

This statement captures some of the feelings of disgruntled commuters because of the taxi stayaway. It stipulates that the taxi industry did not cause any problems for the BRT
system on the day, but at the same time portrays the industry as an expected troublemaker.

Article:

This story covers the first operation of the BRT system in Johannesburg and reflects on the challenges that were faced by the system on this particular day. It also provides the views of the first passengers on the BRT buses.

Two organisations - the South African Transport and Allied Workers’ Union and the South African Commuter Organisation - refer to the BRT system as the ‘decent public transport’ that the country never had. The use of the word ‘decent’ is used to refer to the BRT system, but at the same time implies that the minibus taxi industry had failed to be a ‘decent’ public transport system to citizens.

[In the largest combined show of force since the xenophobic riots last year]

The magnitude of the taxi strike (stayaway) in the article is compared to the 2008 xenophobic attacks which resulted in deadly assaults on foreigners in South Africa. This perpetuates the idea that the minibus taxi industry strike is a threat to national security. It is emphasised that on the day of the strike, the South African National Defence Force (SANDF), the police (SAPS) and Johannesburg metro police were present to prevent any form of violence that might be initiated by the minibus taxi industry representatives. However one must concede that strikes can be violent in South Africa, which explains the police presence.

17. Daily News, 17 August 2009

Headline:

We won’t tolerate anarchy: Mchunu

The headline is composed of a statement by the MEC for Transport, Community Safety and Liaison in KwaZulu Natal. The statement gives the impression of a firm stance by the government on the BRT system, and an unwillingness to be pushed around by the taxi industry.
Article:

The story is about the MEC for Transport, Community Safety and Liaison, Willies Mchunu, and the statements he made to the Kwazulu-Natal Taxi Council with regard to their anti-BRT stance. The MEC mentioned that the government will not accept any form of violent protest from the taxi industry. A large part of the article is allocated to government statements and their stance on the BRT issue.

In the article, Mchunu offers his position to individuals who do not want the BRT to be implemented. He makes statements to the effect that the taxi industry is an entity filled with murderers and individuals who are willing to engage in violent protest to settle disagreements. Mchunu is a credible source as he is the MEC and his opinions are considered important by readers, his statement above taints the image of the taxi industry to some degree. The Kwazulu-Natal Deputy Chairman, Bhungane Hadebe, is quoted saying that he will cooperate with the MEC to make sure that negotiations go smoothly and without violence. The rest of the report is dominated with statements made by taxi ‘factions’ that are not willing to participate in negotiations with the government.

18. Cape Argus, 19 May 2009

Headline:

FIFA’s Plan B for 2010 fans

The headline suggests that Plan B would come into effect if the taxi industry created problems with the BRT ahead of the World Cup. The headline suggests that Fifa had a Plan B, as South Africa’s Plan A wasn’t working. Plan B denotes that something is seriously wrong ahead of the 2010 World Cup. In popular culture, Plan B is an ominous sign.

Sub-headline:

World football body says it has a back-up if BRT is not sorted out
The suggestion here is that the BRT situation will reach the point where Fifa will have to step in. The BRT disputes therefore appear to be disruptive to the biggest game on the planet.

Article:

The story covers Fifa’s plan to provide alternative transport for the 2010 World Cup if local authorities failed to implement the BRT system prior to the tournament.

[Taxi bosses have labelled this “disappointing”, with some even threatening bloodshed]

The taxi industry had labelled this revelation as disappointing because they would also lose if the World Cup is taken away from South Africa and managed by Fifa. There is no source allocated to this statement in the article. There is no taxi body to account for this statement, and the use of the words ‘taxi bosses’ as the source of this statement is quite controversial, as taxi bosses did not have a common strategy to deal with BRT. The source should have been clearly defined so that it can reflect the views of that particular individual or section of the taxi industry and not appear to be a view shared by the entire industry. The word ‘some’ is used to quantify the number of taxi organisations that would want to ‘shed blood’ and it is misleading as it fails to quantify which taxi organisation wanted this and which did not.

19. Saturday Star, 13 June 2009

Headline:

Why a 2010 transport timebomb is ticking for Zuma and Ndebele

The headline is indicative of a transport problem that will have negative effects on the 2010 Fifa World Cup. At the time, South Africa’s World Cup problems extended beyond the BRT to include most transport infrastructure. The metaphor of the ‘ticking timebomb’ signifies great urgency, and sensationalizes the story to attract readers.

Sub-headline:

The task of convincing taxi owners about the new system is still a challenge
The statement focuses on the matter of taxi owners having to be convinced into accepting the BRT system. It does not stipulate that all parties have to come to a resolution, but that the taxi industry has to be convinced while the government does not. The taxi industry appears to be stubborn, as it is the only party that has to be convinced on the matter of BRT system.

Article:

The story covers the problems of implementing the BRT system prior to the World Cup which was hosted in South Africa. The article focuses on the government’s failure to find a resolution on the matter of the BRT system with the taxi industry to enable the World Cup to be successful.

[And though they ferry millions of people to and from their destinations every day of the week, there are millions more who are too terrified to use them, a consequence of the taxi drivers’ reckless and aggressive behaviour]

The above statement is unfounded, as it refers to millions that use taxis and ‘millions more’ who are terrified them. Statistically the majority of South African’s are black (41000 938 or 79.2% of the population according to 2011 Census), and the majority of black people use taxis today based on where they statistically live in the country. (Census, 2011). Soweto alone has a population of 1,271,628. It is unlikely that the ‘terrified millions’ are black people, but the article can’t state that the terrified millions are whites. Therefore it doesn’t define who these ‘terrified millions’ are, suggesting that these millions are inclusive of South Africa’s entire population, and in fact that there are ‘millions more’ who are terrified of taxis. ‘The taxi drivers’ reckless and aggressive behaviour’ perpetuates the negative stereotype of the taxi industry, and arguably mimics the sort of wording that was used in the apartheid era to portray the behaviour of black people. For years, taxi drivers were left to their own devices and developed their own driving style to pick up and drop off passengers, which seem rude to other users of the road. One could argue that unlike the BRT, minibus taxis weren’t historically monitored or provided with bus lanes or bus stops, and drivers developed the habit of cutting across traffic, which constitutes ‘reckless and aggressive behaviour’.
The statement sensationalizes the fear of the minibus taxi industry. The article goes on to compare the hours worked by a taxi driver in the taxi industry with that of a driver in the mainstream economy. The impression this creates is that unlike conventional business, the taxi industry does not abide by labour regulations.

[Even the more radical elements of the taxi industry were satisfied with that move]

The use of ‘more radical elements’ paints a distorted picture of the taxi industry as a radical industry. The use of the adjective ‘more’ implies that there are individuals in the already radical taxi industry who are even more radical than others.


Headline:

*Rampaging taxi drivers block Joburg*

The word ‘rampaging’ is used to describe the actions of taxi drivers, which implies that they were out of control when they were protesting. The headline successfully raises the reader’s expectations of a depiction of violence in the article.

Sub-headline:

*City brought to a standstill, motorists attacked, cars smashed*

The metaphor in the sub-headline, ‘city brought to a standstill’, blows the taxi strike to massive proportions, as it implies that the city could not function at all because of the strike. The sub headline reads like a state of emergency or movie dramatization of a catastrophe.

Article:

The article looks at the taxi strike that took place on the 24th of March 2009 in Johannesburg that was reported to have been violent in nature. Taxi drivers took to the streets to protest against the proposed BRT system. The article details the actions of the 28 protesting taxi associations that form the United Taxi Association Forum (Utaf) on the streets of Johannesburg.
The article provides an extensive narrative of taxi drivers involved in violent behaviour, with particular emphasis on taxi drivers who were intoxicated while engaged in the strike. The protestors are referred to as a ‘mob’ in the article.

4.4 IDENTIFIED THEMES

Themes were developed for the purpose of capturing the most important information in a news article. The themes were generated from the headlines, sub-headlines and from analysing the content of the news articles. The themes that are provided were strictly drawn from the twenty (20) news articles. The researcher was able to discover three (3) prevailing themes for the analysis of the news content, as follows:

- **The taxi industry as a violent and lawless entity**

  This theme includes reports of the taxi industry that depict acts of violence, such as violent industrial strikes, or that show the industry to be a threat to public safety, or depict it as a cantankerous entity. These reports perpetuate the idea that the industry does not abide by the law and does not conform to regulations set up by the state.

- **The taxi industry as discontent with the BRT system and as opposing economic development**

  The portrayal of the taxi industry as unwilling to accommodate any new development projects, such as the BRT system. Moreover, the representation of the taxi industry as unsupportive of the economic benefits of the 2009 Confederations Cup and the 2010 FIFA World Cup. These reports portray the taxi industry as a backward entity that is unwilling to change with the times.

- **The taxi industry as an entity that is operated by individuals who are ignorant and uneducated**

  This theme entails any depiction of the taxi industry as operated by people who are unaware of the economic, political and social implications of economic development. This includes any news coverage that dwells largely on the lack of educated taxi
operators, or that attempts to link lack of education to ignorance about the benefits of the BRT system.

**Theme 1:** The taxi industry as a violent and lawless entity.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Theme</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The taxi industry as a violent and lawless entity.</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1: This table reflects the number of times a theme appeared in the 20 news articles. In this particular case, Theme 1 appeared 16 times in the 20 news articles.

The frequency of the theme implies that the taxi industry is represented in news reports as an industry that uses violence or threatens to use violence in order to get what it wants from society. In 2009, strikes were part of an attempt by the taxi industry to convince the government not to implement the BRT system in major cities in South Africa. From the news articles, there is evidence that the taxi industry was presented as lawless and as a threat to the country and its citizens when it embarked on protests to halt the implementation of the BRT system. As stated in Chapter 2 (2.1.2.), strikes (industrial actions) are largely associated with violence and disregard for the law in news media. The kind of reporting Morley refers to is also evident in the findings about the BRT and the taxi industry. Morley (1976) found that mainstream media often portrayed issues of the working class who were involved in industrial action in a negative way, and largely as a threat to the status quo. The stereotype of the working class as violent and not abiding with the law when negotiating their demands is largely evident in the news coverage of the taxi industry and the BRT system. Ferreira (2010) emphasised that the image of the taxi industry is tainted because of the statements that are made by the public and the media. The following headlines are important examples of the negative image of violence and lawlessness that the news can perpetuate with respect to the taxi industry on the BRT issue:

- *Threat of taxi strikes hangs over SA*
- *Prepared to die’ for their trade, taxi fury over transit plans*
• Taxi operators threaten to extend Bay strike
• Drivers threaten to halt World Cup in anger over bus system
• Uneducated’ taxi man: I will fight to protect job

There are also statements within the news articles that present the taxi industry’s stance on the BRT in a negative way:

• Taxi bosses have labelled this “disappointing”, with some even threatening bloodshed
• And though they ferry millions of people to and from their destinations every day of the week, there are millions more who are too terrified to use them, a consequence of the taxi drivers’ reckless and aggressive behaviour
• Even the more radical elements of the taxi industry were satisfied with that move
• In the largest combined show of force since the xenophobic riots last year

Theme 2: The taxi industry as discontent with the BRT system and as opposing economic development

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Theme</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The taxi industry as discontent with the BRT system and as opposing economic development.</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2: This table reflects the number of times a theme appeared in the 20 news articles. In this particular case, Theme 2 appeared 10 times in the 20 news articles.

The theme of the taxi industry as anti-BRT and as opposing economic development appeared ten (10) times in twenty news articles. It is a common feature for news to represent the working class as individuals that are threatening the economy and hurting production due to their protest actions (Kumar, 2005). The following statements were drawn from the news articles that represented the taxi industry as anti-BRT and as an entity that is disturbing the normal functioning of the economy:

• Drivers threaten to halt World Cup in anger over bus system
A public health standing committee meeting was also cancelled yesterday as councillors, mostly ANC, did not arrive due to the taxi strike

One article opted to interview managers in the private sector in relation to how a taxi strike had led to low levels of worker turnout. However, taxi operators were not asked to provide comments on their strike. Elites were used to create the taxi story, with managers in the private sector voicing the negative consequences of the strikes for their businesses. The opinions provided by the mainstream economy on the taxi strike lead to the perception of the taxi industry as not understanding of the consequences that are incurred by the economy because of their actions. This of course seems to be a biased approach on the side of news media.

The media, in reporting on strikes, associates strikes with chaos and as incidences that lead to the loss of production in the economy and as standing against the ‘national interest’ (Morley, 1976: Kumar, 2005). In the articles, the BRT system was only projected as a concern for the taxi industry. Statements were made in the news articles that gave the impression that the taxi industry stood against national interest. The BRT was also referred to as an efficient and affordable transport system in comparison to the minibus taxi.

Morley (1976) observed that from time to time, the media tend to speak on behalf of national interest. This kind of reporting featured frequently in the news articles about the BRT system. In arguing for the national interest with regards to the BRT issue, the newspapers appeared to be choosing sides. Furthermore, Lull (2003) states that institutions in society such as the media disseminate messages which are supportive of the status quo, while Gramsci (in Boggs, 1976) refers to mass media as tools for the ruling class to promote their philosophy, culture and morality. The status quo is maintained in the media through its involvement in promoting the ‘national interest’ in service of those who wield power. Evidence of the media propagating the national interest is evident in the following two (2) statements from the news articles:

- The government plans to introduce the BRT systems in big cities as part of its integrated transport plans, but some taximen fear they will lose much of their
income to the modern high-speed, safe, cheap and efficient network that is envisioned.

- Taxis had been on the map for quite some time, and with the exception of Cape Town, had become the main form of transport in most cities. But they were unregulated, unruly and unable to reach the entire population. Though they provide services from and to the most remote townships and settlements, they are often the most expensive form of public transport for those with least money.

The media in this particular instance appears to be taking a pro-government stance in favour of so called ‘national interest’ by supporting the BRT system. In the former statement, there is no sympathy for the loss of income, and there is a lot of selling of the BRT, while in the latter statement, taxis are said to be unable to reach the entire population, yet they provide services to and from remote townships. The question is, where else are they supposed to reach? The BRT also roughly costs the same amount as taxi fare and will probably eventually be more expensive.

**Theme 3:** The taxi industry is operated by individuals who are ignorant and uneducated.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Theme 3</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The taxi industry is operated by individuals who are ignorant and uneducated</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 3: This table reflects the number of times a theme appeared in the 20 news articles. In this particular case, Theme 3 appeared 4 times in the 20 news articles.

This particular representation of taxi drivers is only evident in four (4) of the twenty (20) articles used in the study. Morley’s (1976) observation was that strikes are largely presented as ‘an irrational form of behaviour’. Parties that are involved in strikes are also presented as individuals who do not have a rational reason to embark on a strike. This perception is evident in the representation of taxi drivers and queue marshals as
oblivious to the real implications of the BRT for the economy. The level of education that was put forward in these news articles is an important characteristic in defining the taxi drivers and queue marshals' level of knowledge/ability to understand. There is also evidence of journalists correcting the statements uttered by taxi drivers. Some of the news articles' statements that portrayed the taxi drivers as uneducated and ignorant with regards to the BRT include:

- *Tell government that we do not want this BRT and we want a taxi rapid transit system instead.*
- *Uneducated' taxi man: I will fight to protect job’.*
- *I am not educated; I do not know how to operate a computer, I only have taxi experience.*

### 4.5 Conclusion

The analysis of the news articles discovered that the taxi industry was represented negatively. The largest observable theme was that the taxi industry is violent and disregards the law. Other themes that emerged were that the minibus taxi industry is anti-BRT and opposes economic development; and that it is operated by individuals who are ignorant and uneducated. The sources that were employed in the news articles were mostly representatives from the government and members of the taxi industry. The next chapter focuses on establishing the reasons for the findings.
5. CHAPTER FIVE: DEMYSTIFYING MEDIA REPRESENTATION

5.1 INTRODUCTION

The previous chapter provided an insight into how twenty newspaper articles represented the minibus taxi industry on the issue of the BRT system in 2009. This chapter aims to offer knowledge on the possible causes for such representation by interrogating the ownership of the media in capitalist societies, and the consequences of such. It further looks upon issues of race and class for further comprehension, and in doing so, answers the second research question of the study:

- How can this type of representation be explained?

5.2 THE PROBLEMS OF THE MEDIA IN CAPITALIST SOCIETIES

Private companies own the press in South Africa, with a large proportion of the market under the control of an oligopoly comprising of Times Media Group, Caxton, Media24 and Independent Newspapers. Shareholders of such entities invest in them in order to generate profit from such investments (Murdock, 1996). Newspapers in such an environment rely on having substantial readership in order to fall into the good books of advertisers. Curran (1996:467) states that advertisers are “not neutral in their desire to reach all members of the public: they usually wish to reach – and will pay more to reach – particular segments of the market rather than others”. Furthermore, advertisers will not support content that is not ideal for the promotion of their products or that takes a stance that jeopardizes their very foundation (Mayher and McDonald, 2007:446). With the triumph of neoliberal policies in South Africa, media companies, as privately owned entities, grew reliant on the market for sustainability. It is less likely that newspapers will promote the agendas that oppose a system which they are a part of.

Testimony to this, are the findings made by Kariithi and Kareithi (2007) and Mahyer and McDonald (2007) that the media tends to promote neoliberal policies in their representation of society. Marxist scholars have always argued that the media plays a
big role in shaping public opinion in favour of the interests of capital (Mayher and McDonald, 2007:445). Mahyer and McDonald (2007) made findings that the print media had been supportive of the privatisation of entities that are state owned in the economy through Public Private Partnerships (PPPs). From the present findings, it appears that the newspaper articles provided coverage that endorsed privatisation, and this is important to note because the BRT is a government initiative that is managed by a private entity. The findings revealed that those who were opposing the BRT, i.e. the taxi industry, had been represented negatively in the news. Essentially, the BRT is a project where the government is in business with private companies in order to deliver a service to the public.

Oligopolistic media ownership gives a few firms the power to disseminate information, and based on their offerings, these firms have the leverage to offer advertisers a large number of publications at a discounted fare. The economies of scale apply where even the advertiser benefits from discounted advertising rates, but this is to the detriment of independent newspapers or any other entity that wishes to launch its own publication (Albaran et al., 2003). As discussed earlier in 2.3.3, smaller emerging independent publishers have complained about the anti-competitive behaviour of the four firms mentioned above. Concentration of media ownership allows media firms to eliminate their competition (McChesney, 2003). In the process, they destroy alternative media that might be representative of ideas and opinions that mainstream media ignores. The concentration of media ownership often results in a common angle being taken by different newspapers in the coverage of events.

In a concentrated media environment, there is a tendency by the media to share practices with each other (Graber, 1986), even relying on the same sources and services of the same news agencies if stories are outsourced. Pack journalism arises from such practices, where journalists rely on each other for ideas on particular issues, and this compromises diversity in content (Shoemaker & Reese, 1991; Schudson, 2000). The concentration of media ownership creates conformity in news, and this was observable in the headlines and sources that were employed in news articles about the BRT system.
5.2.1 Conformity in headlines

It was observed that the headlines that were employed in the newspaper articles about the BRT system were largely sensational. This sensationalism was evident in all of the headlines from all four of the newspaper groups in their coverage of the issue. The headline is created from the journalists’ perceptions of news values, which Golding and Murdock (1996:405) refer to as “guidelines for the presentation of items, suggesting what to emphasise, what to omit, and where to give priority in the preparation of the items for presentation to the audience” (see 2.4.). As journalists carefully work to try and create the best possible headline to capture the crux of the story, they are also pressurized to create one that will resonate with the readers. Private media are in competition with other media, and the headlines that these media use must attract the largest number of readers.

The dramatisation of events allows the media to tell the story in a fascinating way that guarantees that the readers will take an interest. The headlines present the theme of the story, and generally provide readers with an idea of what is going to be in the article. Competing media tend to get entangled around the issue of creating the highest selling headline, a practice that results in the increased amount of sensational reporting. In this media contest, it is unlikely that the media will provide an alternative view that moves away from sensationalism (Schudson, 2003). The findings of the study revealed that all of the competing newspapers produced sensational headlines. The headlines analysed in the study reflect conformity in how the media covered the BRT system and the minibus taxi industry. This conformity is especially evident in the headlines that emphasise the violence that could (and eventually did) emanate from the taxi strikes and the dispute with the government in relation to the BRT system:

- *Prepared to die’ for their trade* (City Press, 15 March 2009)
- *Threat of taxi strikes hangs over SA* (Business Day, 08 April 2009)
- *Mass taxi strike set for election day, if demands not met* (Citizen, 09 April 2009)
As already stated, the newspaper is a product that is owned by private business that needs to make a profit in order to survive, and most importantly it needs to provide content that audiences can relate to. In their attempts to provide content that attracts readers, media practitioners use frames of meaning that the readers can identify with. This implies that certain traits that define a particular group have to be utilised to allow the audience to make sense of the news content. The problem arises when the news is created out of one particular characteristic of the group, which of course leads to stereotypical reporting.

The conformity that exists amongst the major newspapers with regards to reporting on the BRT system does not offer another angle from which to cover the position of the taxi industry. This conformity identifies certain problems and neglects others that emanate from the dispute between the minibus taxi industry and the government over the BRT system, and amounts to a single view of the BRT issue. Conformity is also evident in the sources that the newspaper articles employed in developing the BRT story.

5.2.2 Conformity with sources

Hegemony implies that certain individuals hold the power to disseminate their own ideas in society. The media claims to be free such influence and to rely on credible sources, but it is the elite who are primarily responsible for the prevailing discourse of the media (Sonderling, 1992). However, hegemony in the media is contested between the government, the media and other interest groups that also want to provide their own views on a subject. The sources identified in the newspaper reports about the BRT were the following:

- Government officials (national government, local government)
- Taxi associations (Utaf and SANTACO)
- Taxi industry workers (taxi drivers and queue marshals)
- Private companies
• Commuters

• Special interest groups

The BRT issue is a matter that affects the government and the taxi industry extensively, and hence sources from both of these entities dominated the coverage in the twenty articles. The media also interviewed taxi industry spokespeople. Taxi associations are created by taxi owners, and these associations represent the interests of the taxi owners and drivers when communicating with the media. Individuals from the private sector were also used in some of the articles as sources, providing an ‘alternative’ insight into the strikes arising because of BRT.

The articles from the four newspaper groups seemed to rely on the same government sources, and this was also evident with regard to the taxi sources. Local government sources issued statements on the BRT issue in Johannesburg, Port Elizabeth (Nelson Mandela Metropolitan), and Cape Town. Taxi industry sources were mainly drawn from the taxi associations within the respective cities. A number of the analysed articles used taxi drivers as sources to present an angle on the workers in the taxi industry. The inclusion of taxi drivers and queue marshals as sources ensured the inclusion of the workers in the news, but it also created room for negative comments that would not have been communicated by trained spokespeople for the taxi industry. Interviewing workers from the taxi industry as sources often leads to the most uncensored and radical statements being uttered, which jeopardise the position of the industry. Taxi associations are meant to communicate on behalf of taxi drivers and taxi owners. The media went out to interview taxi drivers regardless of the correspondence provided by the taxi associations but did not bother to reach taxi owners. Organisations prefer to practice internal gate-keeping with regards to their responses to the media, by assigning spokespeople with the task of addressing the media on their behalf.

The inclusion of the taxi industry’s working class in the news represents a move away from the use of elitist sources, but an embracing of an alternative angle which is not censored internally by the taxi industry. It can be argued that such interviews have contributed to the negative representation of the taxi industry in BRT news articles.
However, it is also important to note that many comments that are drawn from interviews are omitted through selection into the final news copy. This implies that it is also likely that the interviews with taxi drivers did not all result in the radical responses that are evident in the articles, but that there were other responses that were reasonable and favourable of the taxi position that were not included in the final copy. In this instance, the editors stand accused of picking the most sensational statements.

To reiterate, the news articles from the four newspaper groups all reflect the reliance on the same sources, which reveals conformity as a factor in the sourcing of news. The BRT story was told from a similar perspective by the majority of the articles. Conformity has the potential to sustain stereotypes that exist in the news as newspapers write from the same point of view in order to appeal to a larger reading public.

5.3 Race and class

As discussed in 2.1.4, the South African Human Rights Commission (SAHRC) enquiry into media racism in 1999 identified shortcomings with regards to how to define racist reporting (SAHRC 1999). The enquiry was the only official study ever conducted on racism and the media in South Africa, and its methodology was said to be flawed because it did not provide a clear definition of racism or precise methodology to determine what constitutes racist reporting. The press in South Africa remains self-regulatory, and the ethics of the press in South Africa have been negotiated to embrace the Bill of Rights, which is the highest law in the land. Henceforth racist reporting is essentially a banned practice that is prosecutable by law. The media has an obligation not to promote racism in society by reporting news in the most balanced manner possible, without prejudice to any parties. Although racist reporting was part of the old apartheid dispensation, there has been no serious intervention into the issue of race in the media since the SAHRC 1999 enquiry. However, this does not mean that the issue doesn’t exist in matters of representation.

The majority of South Africans are black, and were subjected to negative representation in the media during apartheid. It is a difficult task to distinguish what has been inherited from the past and what is new and untainted by it. Undoubtedly, newspapers would be
foolish to alienate a large and lucrative reading public in the current dispensation with racist content. But this might have more to do with money and status than new ideologies. To state that transformation is represented by increased black media ownership and the staffing of newsrooms with black journalists, is not to say that reporting is free of racial prejudice. Alternatively, it cannot also be said that since a large proportion of ownership remains white, then racist reporting must still exist, or that if it does not, then racist ideology has changed. The hegemony in South Africa has gradually changed from white to black since apartheid, and seemingly signalled the end of racism in the media. To this end, there was no evidence of racist reporting in the findings of the study. The taxi industry was referred to as a black-owned industry in the news articles, and the media did not use racist remarks in covering the BRT dispute. However, the analyzed articles suggest that negative representations of black people or black business seem to persist in the writings of both white and black journalists. Considering their previous position under apartheid, white journalists have had to change due to the change in hegemony, but this does not signify, in all cases, changes in ideology. On the other hand, both black and white journalists may have adopted existing media practices without questioning them, or perpetuate these stereotypes for other reasons, such as market forces and class. Evidently, racial prejudice is a difficult concept to identity in this present dispensation in the press, but one cannot simply claim that it does not exist. Arguably it is no longer dependent on identifying whether the journalist is black or white, but rather the ideological affiliations of such an individual or the organisation that they work for.

To further understand the negative representation of the taxi industry, it is important to remember that the industry is representative of the working class (informal economy), which, if viewed from a Marxist perspective, is subject to the hegemony of the mainstream economy or other entities that wield greater economic power and legitimacy. Bertelsen (2000) provides a criticism of the SAHRC report on the basis that it failed to investigate race in line with the question of class.
Based on Bertelsen’s observation, the study can look towards issues of class to further explain the representation that was made evident in the findings. The issue of class is largely linked to race in South Africa, as the working class in South Africa is mainly black, and market segmentation in South Africa is still largely based along racial lines. Mainstream print media is said to still “operate on the logic of distribution, circulation, price structure and advertising that has as their target the lucrative – arguably still white, or at least affluent black – elite market” (Jacobs in Wasserman and de Beer, 2007:39). From this statement, it cannot be true that race is a factor that can be used to discover which individuals comprise the newspaper reading public. With the current demographics in South Africa, it can be argued that race now plays second fiddle to the issue of class. The newspapers from which the articles were drawn, which constitute major newspapers in the country, are all English newspapers that mainly create content that targets the middle class as its primary readers. With this insight, it is fair to argue that a large part of the newspaper reading public is middle class and comprises of both black and white people.

Newspapers are created with the characteristics and expectations of their readers in mind. Kariithi and Kareithi (2007) found that newspapers had a tendency to represent issues of the working class unfavourably, especially when the working class opposed neoliberal policies such as privatisation. BRT is part of neo-liberalism as it is a Public Private Partnership (PPP), and the findings of Mayher and McDonald (2007) and Kariithi and Kareithi (2007) reveal that such interventions are rarely criticised in the media. The press tends to be supportive of positions that embrace the same system that it is a part of, which in this case is capitalism. Therefore, the taxi industry may have also received negative representation due to the affiliation of the press to neo-liberalism.

5.4 Conclusion

This chapter has afforded some knowledge on the representation of the minibus taxi industry in relation to the BRT system. The chapter questioned the ownership of the press in capitalist societies and discussed the problems emanating from oligopolistic press ownership. Concentration of media ownership was discussed on the basis that it
eliminates competition and in doing so, creates an environment where news content lacks diversity. Conformity in headlines and sources amongst various publications was also identified as a factor that resulted in the same angle being taken in BRT coverage. Race and class were discussed in providing a perspective on the representations of the minibus taxi industry, as the majority of its members are black, working class citizens.
6. CHAPTER SIX: CONCLUSION

6.1 CONCLUSION

This study examined the newspaper representation of the minibus taxi industry in the context of the introduction of the BRT system in 2009. It employed a qualitative research approach through its utilisation of Critical Discourse Analysis. Twenty news articles were selected from publications owned by the four major newspaper companies, namely Times Media Group, Caxton Publishers, Media24 and Independent Newspapers. Five were drawn from each group. Norman Fairclough’s Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) was used to analyse the content of the news articles. The study was founded on the hypothesis that the minibus taxi industry was represented negatively in news about the BRT system in 2009. The hypothesis proved to be valid as the representation of the minibus taxi industry in the analyzed articles centred on stereotypes of the industry as an entity that is violent and lawless, discontent with the BRT, and as opposed to economic development. It was also represented as an entity that is operated by individuals who are ignorant and uneducated.

Based on the analysis, it was determined that the media oligopoly had resulted in news that was similar in coverage across the four newspaper groups, and conformity appeared to be a common feature of the oligopoly. Media concentration was noted as a factor that resulted in this conformity. The headlines in the news were discovered to be dramatic and similar in all the publications owned by the four groups, and confirmed the argument of conformity as there appeared to be a similar angle taken on the minibus taxi industry and BRT feud. Conformity was also evident in the sources that were used in the articles about the BRT system and the taxi industry.

Oligopolistic media ownership has been noted as a factor that lessens the diversity in news. The change in media ownership since 1994 does not reflect in the content of the newspapers owned by the oligopoly. In the case of the BRT which is a Private Public Partnership (PPP), the press, as part of the capitalist enterprise, opted to present the taxi industry in a negative light in defence of the BRT.
The study further discovered that taxi drivers and queue marshals were given a platform to tell their side of the story. In doing so, the working class were given a voice in the news, which is usually not the case with mainstream media reporting. A large proportion of the sources used in creating the BRT story were from the taxi industry and the government. However, no taxi owners were interviewed as sources; only taxi associations that are said to represent the interests of owners and drivers. No article provided the perspective of the taxi owners with regards to their concerns with the BRT system, as in the case of taxi drivers.

This study showed that to some extent working class citizens were still being represented negatively in the media, especially when such entities opposed the policies of government and neoliberalism. The majority of the working class is black, and henceforth the findings of the study also reflect to some degree on the representation of race in post-apartheid South Africa.

6.2 Limitations of the study

The study only analysed twenty articles from a very large sample of 335 articles and henceforth the findings cannot be generalised. The researcher could not afford to analyse a larger sample due to time constraints as analysis was done on the entire news article. The study only used newspaper articles, and radio and television news were not included in the analysis. Images accompanying the newspaper articles were not analyzed, which would have given the study a semiotic analysis approach. The findings are only representative of newspapers owned by the oligopolistic press in South Africa. The study also focused solely on English newspapers and did not analyse articles written in any other South African language.

6.3 Recommendations for future study

In order to further interrogate South Africa’s media representation of the minibus taxi industry, future research can focus on images and television and radio news. Semiotic analysis can be used to analyse the images that are used in the news about the taxi
industry, and this has the potential to provide a more extensive picture of representation. A larger sample of articles on the research topic would also provide more valid and reliable findings. A more detailed analysis of ‘working class’ newspapers is necessary, as is the inclusion of media content in other languages. Other contentious issues, such as the taxi recapitalisation project and road safety, can also be used to analyse the representations of the minibus taxi industry.


Bilir, Hakan. 2005. Media Ownership Control: To what extent is competition law and policy sufficient to provide for diversity and plurality in the media? No 508, STPS, Media East Technical University.


Braun, V. and Clarke, V. 2006. Using thematic analysis in psychology. *Qualitative research in psychology* 3 (2), 77-101


93


Sonderling, S. 1992. 'Murder of the combi-taxi industry by the mass media: perceptions and realities of road safety'. Communicatio, 18: 2, 57 — 63.


Western Cape, KZN counterparts all set to join in protest action

Taxi operators threaten to extend Bay strike

Hani said Western Cape and KwaZulu Natal would show their support by staging their own protests. “We will evaluate how each day progresses. The municipality has drawn battles lines and we are ready to take them on.”

Western Cape Taxi Alliance chairman Mandla Mata confirmed they would be striking to support their Fort Elizabeth counterparts.

He said it could even be a month until they were happy with how their municipality responded to their demands. However, there are signs that commuters are losing patience.

SA National Civic Organisation (Sanco) secretary general Mcebisi Masizi yesterday warned that the strikes could lead to a backlash where commuters decide to boycott taxis. “If taxis continue to abuse the sympathy of commuters, they might be taking them for granted. “Clearly these demonstrations are an indication that there is a conflict of interests and both parties need to go back to the drawing board to rework the entire BRT plan.”

While there appeared little prospect of an early end to the strike, the municipality said it was working on a plan to resolve the crisis.

But it would not reveal any details. Municipal spokesman Kupido Baron said construction on the BRT system would go ahead as planned.

“The government has made a commitment to Fila to upgrade road infrastructure ahead of 2010 so this is what we have to do,” said Baron.

He said the municipality was working closely with the SAPS to ensure that workers at construction sites as well as commuters were not subjected to intimidation from strikers.

“We do have action plans in place but I cannot disclose any of that information because it is a serious and highly sensitive matter. We are in constant negotiation with the taxi industry and we call on them to come to the table so we can resolve this matter,” Baron said.

Police spokesman Captain Sandra Janse van Rensburg said yesterday’s strikes had been relatively quiet.

She said there had been an incident where taxi drivers marched through the city centre’s main street intimidating street vendors and shops, forcing them to close down.

“They blocked Govan Mbeki Avenue, disturbing
motorists and intimidating metered cab drivers, in some cases taking away their car keys," she said.

However, the group soon dispersed when more police were sent to the scene.

Janse van Rensburg said those responsible were mainly "guardtjies" who also threatened to march and disrupt the construction process of the World Cup stadium in North End.

She said each station had additional policemen in place although she could not disclose how many. She also said support staff had been asked to assist for the day and confirmed there had been no violence and no arrests, but police were monitoring the situation.

"We had a meeting with all our station commissioners and we have come up with some plans. The police will not tolerate any problems from these strikes."

Port Elizabeth Regional Council of Commerce and Industry chief executive Odwa Mlati said all the relevant parties should strive to make the resolution of the strikes their utmost priority.

"There is no will to resolve the impasse. Parties are focused on the correctness of their positions, rather than on moving forward to resolve their differences, and demonstrate little or no regard for the impact on the people and the economy of the metro."

"This situation needs to be resolved as a matter of urgency through constructive engagement and a genuine will to find a lasting solution," Mlati said.

Nelson Mandela Bay's National African Federated Chamber of Commerce and Industry president Kutoano Headbush said the poorest of the poor were the ones suffering the most.

"Everybody is affected but it is the school children, the contract workers and domestic workers who are suffering the most. All businesses are suffering in this economic climate. We really do not need these strikes, especially at this time."

General Motors South Africa communications manager Denise van Huyssteen said attendance levels were lower yesterday compared to previous strikes, at just 80 per cent.

"We were able to continue with limited production operations and greatly appreciated the commitment displayed by employees who walked long distances in the rain to get to work."

Volkswagen South Africa spokesman Bill Stephens said attendance had not been affected by yesterday’s strikes.

Nelson Mandela Metropolitan University spokesman Roslyn Baatjies said the strike did not hamper lectures, which resumed yesterday.

"It is business as usual at NMMU. Staff and students made alternative arrangements to get here and lectures went ahead," she said.

A public health standing committee meeting was also cancelled yesterday as councillors, mostly ANC, did not arrive due to the taxi strike.
Threat of taxi strikes hangs over SA

Gauteng becomes the eighth province to demand protest action over planned BRT systems

MICHAEL BLEBY
Writer at Large

SA FACED a national day of taxi strikes after Gauteng yesterday became the eighth province whose operators demanded protest action over the planned Bus Rapid Transport (BRT) systems in Johannesburg, Cape Town and Port Elizabeth.

A meeting between the national industry body, the South African National Taxi Council (Santaco), and Gauteng members was the latest in a series that leaves only consultation in Limpopo to go. Santaco officials are on a national roadshow addressing members, many of whom fear being excluded from business opportunities coming out of the bus networks.

Santaco will hold a summit next Thursday at which it will propose to the national government how to structure BRT systems to benefit taxi interests. The association is seeking to influence the rules, but is also channelling the anger of members.

"The meeting did not end with a clear-cut resolution, but it was the unresolved general feeling of the people that we must go on strike," said Thabiso Molelekewa, a Santaco official. "All the provinces say we must go on strike nationally and Gauteng had the same sentiment.

He did not say when the strike would be. The meeting yesterday was filled with anti-BRT rhetoric, much of it from Santaco's president.

"We don't accept it, we don't support it, we reject it," Arthur Mthembu told the cheering group of taxi operators. "It's almost guaranteed, in forming the BRT, the majority of you will be history."

The government agreed last year to the roll-out of BRT systems in three metropolitan areas and reactions in the already fractious industry have varied. In Johannesburg, where the first phase of the bus system is due to begin operating on June 1, a steering committee of taxi associations is due to begin a final round of negotiations as early as next week.

Taxi interests that protested in Johannesburg last month say that the associations negotiating with the city do not represent their interests.

Santaco, however, spent much of yesterday's meeting fending off accusations that it had done little to represent operators' interests and that it had only started publicly criticising BRT after last month's protests. Mthembu denied this was the case.

Santaco's deputy president, Tutu Molele, yesterday struck a conciliatory tone, saying the council could not recall the taxi interests who were negotiating with the city of Johannesburg because they were mandated to do so at a regional level and Santaco did not have the authority to do so.

biebym@bridm.co.za
Soweto taxi boss critic of BRT shot dead

KAREN VAN ROOYEN

THE voice of one of the new Bus Rapid Transport system's many critics has been silenced.

Mthuthuzeli Molefe, first deputy president of the South African National Taxi Council, was shot outside his home in Eboton, south of Johannesburg, on Friday.

It came just days after a passenger and a policeman were injured when gunmen opened fire on two Rea Vaya buses travelling from Soweto to Ellis Park Station and the Johannesburg CBD.

A police spokesman, Inspector Mzimkhulu Mthimkhulu, said Molefe, 57, was leaving his home on his motorcycle at about 7pm when he was shot at least six times.

"About 20m from his home, he was shot and killed by unknown men. They left the scene in a silver car. Police found six cartridges from a 9mm firearm. We are still investigating if they all came from the same firearm," he said.

Minister of transport Sbu Ndebele offered his condolences to the family yesterday.

"We want to express our outrage and disgust at the cold-blooded murder of Mthuthuzeli Molefe. We are working closely with the enforcement agencies, including the intelligence services, to ensure the swift arrest of the perpetrators of this heinous crime," he said in a statement.

Ralph Jones, a spokesman for the United Taxi Association Forum, said he was "shocked" by Molefe's murder, but would not comment on whether the incident was related to the BRT, which launched in Johannesburg a week ago.

"One can't really say. The industry itself has its own ups and downs, so you don't know where to start," he said.

"A lot of things will come up now: is it the BRT, is it the taxi industry, is it an internal association conflict? It's for intelligence to go out and do the best they can to unravel this and find out who's involved." Molefe earlier this year accused the government of failing to engage the industry on matters which impacted on them.

"Whether it is an agenda for government officials and consultants and other companies to benefit out of, that we don't know," he was quoted as having said.
WE’LL DISRUPT ALL MODES OF TRANSPORT

Penwell Dlamini

A SUMMIT organised by the United Taxi Association Forum (Utaf) has vowed to stop all public transport, including trains, from moving if the government does not meet their demands on the bus rapid transit system.

The government plans to introduce the BRT systems in big cities as part of its integrated transport plans, but some taxis fear they will lose much of their income to the modern high-speed, safe, cheap and efficient network that is envisioned.

A summit of disgruntled taxi men was held on Friday at the Booyens Hotel in Johannesburg. It was attended by taxi owners from as far afield as KwaZulu-Natal, Eastern and Western Cape.

The gathering resolved that the Transport Department should liaise directly with the chairmen of taxi associations and not with the SA National Taxi Council, which represents the broad industry.

Utaf has promised to ban any of its members who participate in an explanatory tour for taxi men of the BRT system in Johannesburg today.

“If they get into those buses they should take their taxis with them because we don’t want them on our routes any more,” said Njabulo Nkomo, a delegate.

Mhlabuzile Radebe, who chaired the proceedings, said they wanted President Jacob Zuma to come and repeat his words that the “BRT should be halted”.
Taxi strike over BRT looms

STEVEN TAU
A MANDATE from members of the United Taxi Association Forum (Utaf) to their leaders tomorrow will determine whether a strike in the industry over the Rea Vaya Bus Rapid Transit (BRT) system will go ahead in the coming days or weeks.

The meeting organised by Utaf has been scheduled to take place in Kibler Park, south of Joburg tomorrow over the BRT issue.

At the same time, Utaf intends to apply for a court order, interdicting the first phase of the controversial Bus Rapid Transit (BRT) system by the City of Johannesburg.

Taxi bosses met in Krugersdorp on the West Rand yesterday, in mapping out a way forward.

Speaking to The Citizen shortly after their meeting yesterday, Utaf’s spokesman Ralf Jones said their lawyer gave them the green light to go the legal route against the city.

“This is the resolution taken yesterday and we will be meeting with the various taxi associations tomorrow to get the mandate from them as to whether we should embark on a strike or not,” said Jones.

The city’s executive mayor announced last week that the first BRT phase will become operational at the end of this month, just days before residents of Soweto were given free rides on the new buses unveiled by community safety MEC Khabisi Mosunkutu in Thokoza on Sunday. – stevent@citizen.co.za
Rampaging taxi drivers block Joburg

City brought to a standstill, motorists attacked, cars smashed

STAFF REPORTERS

ARGE parts of Joburg were yesterday brought to a standstill as disgruntled taxi drivers protested against the Bus Rapid Transport (BRT) project.

The sun had barely risen when reports of violence in the taxi strike were aired on radio – a Putco bus driver had been shot in the hand.

By 7am, many of the arteries feeding Joburg were gridlocked as taxi drivers began inching their way into the city centre, blocking major routes.

By the time the crowds began gathering in Newtown, rubber bullets were cracking across Joburg and reports of commuters, bus drivers and motorists being viciously assaulted were spreading. Countless commuters were left stranded across the city.

On the N12 highway near Lenasia, dozens of taxis blocked all lanes and took control of the north-bound side. The backlog stretched for hundred of metres as Knobkerrie-wielding drivers listened to music, danced, drank and fought with Metro Police officers.

Some jumped out of their seats and ran alongside their vehicles as they rolled down the highway. Others hung out of their windows, waving weapons and chanting.

By 8am, police were firing rubber bullets at drivers in Sauer Street in the inner city and in Soweto, where a taxi driver was shot in the head and windscreen exploded.

The battle then moved to the M1 highway, where a handful of police officers fired hundreds of rounds of rubber bullets, dispersing taxis which blocked major roads.

One driver, Jim Green, reported seeing a mob of taxi drivers pulling over a bus on the M1, pulling out about 40 passengers and assaulting them. One passenger was beaten severely, Green said.

"Next thing, they turned on him and started hitting him with wheel spanners and sjamboks. They kicked him out into the road, spewing blood."

As he drove away, Green said, the drivers kicked his car and smashed his taillights. Chanting masses, with knobkerries held aloft, made their way down Jeppe Street towards Mary Fitzgerald Square.

One group that made their way down Sauer Street and into Bree Street stopped the procession briefly to run into a corner bottle store to stock up for the long day of strike action ahead.

A heavy police presence, including mounted units, monitored proceedings while a police helicopter hovered over the square. All the while, Provincial Police Commissioner Perumal Naidoo observed proceedings from the M2 freeway above the square.

The striking drivers are from 28 taxi associations – forming the United Taxi Association Forum – that have refused to align themselves with those in support of the BRT.

Addressing a gathering at Mary Fitzgerald Square, Soweto Taxi Service chairman Mhlabuzile Radebe accused the government of “taking our jobs”.

“We have co-operated and gave into the recapitalisation thing. We bought the bigger Quantum minibuses which carry fewer passengers, as stipulated. Just when we’re fighting to pay those expensive vehicles off, they want to take us off our routes and replace our taxis with buses.

“We’re fighting for our jobs here,” Radebe said.

Alexandra Taxi Association spokesman Velile Thambe said the taxi industry was being undermined and pushed to a point of collapse.

“We’re not going to allow these buses to happen and that is what we’re going to tell (ANC president Jacob) Zuma.”

Faraday Taxi Association spokesman Sipho Mbatha warned: “If this thing continues and we’re still not happy, we won’t vote for the government that is not listening to us. ‘It will not end there as we’ll embark on more protests, with no bus or train operating.”

After hours of waiting for the “10 000” protesters to converge on Mary Fitzgerald Square, the 2 000-strong protesters made their way through the city to Beyers Naude Square.

“Black Jesus Jacob Zuma. Save us” read one of their posters.

The protesters were finally met by ANC secretary-general Gwede Mantashe, who accepted their memorandum seeking the ruling party’s intervention. Mantashe urged the taxi associations to form one voice over the BRT matter.

The forum said in the memorandum they wanted the government and City of Joburg to halt the BRT project until such time as an agreement had been reached with them.

By 2pm, the protest had fizzled out. Taxi drivers began making their way to various parts of the city, a few reeling and cursing, barely holding on to their beers or bottles of brandy. A small group of protesters smashed car windows with sticks and knobkerries in Bree Street.
Why a 2010 transport timebomb is ticking for Zuma and Ndebele

The task of convincing taxi owners about the new system is still a challenge

FIONA FORDE

A COUPLE of years back, as the country began to ready itself for the 2010 World Cup, Thabo Mbeki’s government began to take a look at the public transport system.

They knew the country was badly in need of a modern-day system and 2010 provided the perfect opportunity and impetus to drag the structures that we had kicking and screaming into the 21st century.

Taxis had been on the map for quite some time, and with the exception of Cape Town, had become the main form of transport in most cities. But they were unregulated, unruly and unable to reach the entire population.

Though they provide services from and to the most remote townships and settlements, they are often the most expensive form of public transport for those with least money.

And though they ferry millions of people to and from their destinations every day of the week, there are millions more who are too terrified to use them, a consequence of the taxi drivers’ reckless and aggressive behaviour.

Besides, the 200 000-strong fleet does little good for traffic congestion, given their ability to ferry only 16 people compared with the larger capacity of a bus.

Ideally, light rail would have provided the perfect alternative for city transport but it was deemed too expensive to contemplate, even though the same government would end up throwing R27 billion at the Gautrain, the largest and most expensive project in our transport history, albeit one that’s designed to service only the first economy once complete.

It was at the same time that transport expert Dr Lloyd Wright attended the South African Transport Conference and explained what a Bus Rapid Transit system could do. He had years of experience and plenty of successful stories under his belt, particularly in the developing world.

“As we watched the presentation we had a sense that in this lies the solution,” recalls Rehana Moosajee, the transport chief in the office of Mayor Amos Mando in Johannesburg.

BRT is relatively cost-effective, in terms of the required infrastructure, and relatively quick to roll out. With an eye on 2010, the government knew that with BRT, it would be able to tell Fifa that South Africa would have a reliable transport system within the required time frame. And so it was that the authorities of Johannesburg and Cape Town set about developing their respective BRT plans, which in Cape Town is referred to as IRT or Integrated Rapid Transport.

But it wouldn’t take long until the taxi operators began to resist.

What they feared about BRT was the end result: a public transport system that would largely rely on buses and no longer on taxis. In response, the government explained that this wouldn’t be the case. While BRT would be bus-heavy, it would always need taxis to feed into it.

The taxi industry was not convinced. Who would own it, they wanted to know. You will, the respective authorities responded, explaining that the option was there to buy into the system as a shareholder. Who will run it, they asked. You will, came the response.

The city authorities claim there will be no loss involved and insist there are enough BRT jobs to go around for everyone who is lawfully employed in the bus and taxi industry as it is.

However, a quick glance at the figures would suggest otherwise. Take Cape Town’s Phase 1a as a case in point. On that route, which is designed for trunk routes from Atlantis through to the city centre and on to Hout Bay, and a number of feeder routes, there are currently 726 taxis and 217 buses operating.

Yet only 156 buses will eventually service the future IRT
system, though they will be complemented by a number of feeder vehicles. Already the shortage is glaring.

City planners insist the number of IRT buses does not paint a full picture, however, as IRT is more than just the vehicle operating system, and includes station management, fare operations and security systems. All told it will require

a staff complement of about 1 400.

Working conditions are promising under the new deal. Drivers will work six-hour shifts. They will be paid a minimum wage, complete with health insurance, a pension plan and three weeks paid leave a year, conditions that stand in stark contrast to their current set-up. Currently, they work 15 to 17 hours a day.

However, the number of jobs and working conditions in the new system do not paint a full picture either. What BRT requires is that taxi owners relinquish their existing operations and buy into the system.

City authorities would, in effect, buy them out of their taxi operations, and with the money the taxi owners would buy a shareholding in that particular BRT route. Yet it is hard to see how that route, or any other for that matter, would generate enough of an income to satisfy so many taxi operators. In addition, not all operators may want to buy back into the new system; some may decide to take their golden handshake and walk.

How the cities of Cape Town and Johannesburg will calculate those buy-outs remains to be seen. It will surely be based on existing turnover, about which the taxi operators will have to come clean.

Given that the existing industry is largely unregulated, it is thought that a lot of their earnings are not fully declared. If they now declare the whole lot, so as to maximise their buy-out, it won’t be long before the taxman comes knocking. If they don’t declare their full earnings so as to stay below the SARS radar, the buy-out will not be attractive enough for them to walk. And it appears to be a lose-lose situation, either way.

In Johannesburg, the city is ready to go live with the Rea Vaya route, which stretches from Soweto to the city centre and beyond. But there is ample resistance as it is to BRT, before discussions even begin on the issue of buy-outs.

Taxi operators claim they have not been fully briefed about the project, though to their credit the authorities have spent more than a year, and millions of rand, on roadshows and talks to explain what is really in store. While their efforts went some way in allaying the industry’s concerns, it’s the figures and the finances that have yet to be finalised.

One taxi official tells of a meeting with Jeff Radebe at which the then transport minister assured him he could guarantee him a 65% stake in BRT. “With all due respect, minister, why would I accept 65% when I already own 100%?” the official responded.

It’s an argument that any businessman in his right mind would hold on to and one that forced Jacob Zuma to the table two days ahead of April’s election.

Zuma listened to what the taxmen had to say and agreed there and then to put the process on hold until the new administration was in place. It was a politically astute move; Zuma knew that if any sector of society was capable of hijacking the election it was the taxi owners and drivers and he was not prepared to take that chance.

Even the more radical elements of the taxi industry were satisfied with that move. Mvuyisi Mente, the spokesman for the Western Cape wing of the National Taxi Alliance said: “We felt Zuma understood us. He listened to what we had to say and we feel he understands our fears.”

Zuma returned to the issue of the taxis in his State of the Nation address last week. “In April this year, I gave an under-
Fifa’s Plan B for 2010 fans

World football body says it has a back-up if BRT is not sorted out

CLAYTON BARNES and ELLA SMOOK
Staff Reporters

WORLD football body Fifa says it will transport foreign spectators itself during next year’s World Cup if the government does not resolve issues affecting the Bus Rapid Transit (BRT) ahead of the tournament.

Taxi bosses have labelled this “disappointing”, with some even threatening bloodshed.

And at a lecture in Cape Town last night, Deputy Transport Minister Jeremy Cronin said he was “desperately worried” about the future of the BRT system in the Western Cape, and has called on the DA and the opposition in the province and city to set aside their political differences to ensure development and delivery takes place.

Taxi bosses have threatened to make the World Cup unworkable if the BRT system, which forms part of the bigger integrated rapid transit (IRT) system, is not scrapped.

Transport Minister Sibusiso Ndebele is expected to meet industry players to discuss how to deal with the problem over the next few weeks.

Speaking during a stop-over in Cape Town, Hans Klaus, Fifa’s director of communications and public affairs, said the organisation was taking “precautionary measures”.

He said spectators could be transported through Match Hospitality, Fifa’s partner, if the BRT problems remained unresolved.

“We are aware of the problem with this new transport system and have made it very clear to the government that the issue should be resolved before the World Cup,” said Klaus.

“But we do take measures on our side and, if needs be, we will be transporting spectators during that period."

Klaus added that many of their spectator travel packages, through Match Hospitality, would in any event include transport to and from matches.

“Although we are concerned, we still have time before the World Cup and hope that these issues will be resolved,” he said.

But taxi operators are determined to see the BRT system “done away with”, despite promises from transport authorities that the new system will work in their favour.

Phillip Tshiboisch, chairman of the South African National Taxi Council (Santaco), said taxi operators still don’t know whether the system would be implemented.

He said operators were waiting for a meeting with Ndebele to express their concerns.

“We will only know the way forward after meeting with the minister,” said Tshiboisch.

He said it would be “absolutely disappointing” should Fifa transport foreign spectators.

Tshiboisch added that it was unfortunate that local municipalities were going ahead with the construction of BRT lanes and stations.

Mvuysile Mente, spokesman for the Western Cape National Taxi Alliance (NTA), said going ahead with the BRT system in Cape Town “means trouble for the Western Cape”.

He said there would be “destruction” if any other operators were found on any of the historic routes during the World Cup.

“There will be blood on our premier’s hands,” said Mente.

“We are saying no to BRT until we know that the system is a viable option."

Cronin, explaining his concerns over the BRT system after the Harold Wolpe Memorial Trust’s 75th open dialogue at UCT last night, said parties should not allow their differences to undermine the importance of collaborating on delivery.

“We must resist the temptation as the ANC, in our case, of trying to score cheap political points” to the detriment of delivery, he said.

Cronin said threats to render the province unworkable formed part
of his concern, and said that both the ANC and the DA leadership needed to build a co-operative relationship.

Cronin said he and Ndebele would this week meet officials in four cities and thereafter key stakeholders, including the taxi and trade union sectors, regarding the BRT system.

Cape Town Mayor Dan Plato said the city had not yet been given any instructions to continue with negotiations after they were halted by the national government before the April elections.

If the process is to continue, national government needs to discuss this with the taxi industry, he said.

It would have a huge impact on the 2010 tournament and the transport industry if the process was halted, said Plato.

"The city does not want the taxi industry to hold it hostage." — Additional reporting by Lindsay Dentlinger

clayton.barnes@inl.co.za
ella.smook@inl.co.za
We won’t tolerate anarchy: Mchunu

THE newly appointed MEC for Transport, Community Safety and Liaison, Willies Mchunu, has said there would be no room for anarchy in the taxi industry.

At the same time he has asked for time to sort out the problems in the industry.

Mchunu addressed the KwaZulu-Natal Taxi Council at the weekend where he asked for their guidance and support while he was still learning about the challenges that the industry faced.

With uncertainty and opposition from the industry to both the Taxi Recapitalisation Programme and the Bus Rapid Transport System, Mchunu has inherited a transport system from his predecessor, Bheki Cele, that is no closer to being fully regulated.

“I believe in engagement. I will provide many platforms for all of us to engage, to solve teething problems in this sector. My style of leadership is always to call for calm even in a situation that resembles a war zone,” he said.

Mchunu said he remained particularly perturbed by this sector’s volatility.

“We want this crucial sector to thrive. In the same vein, we will not tolerate anarchy. Lives of our people are paramount, and no one should be allowed to kill,” he said.

With this being said, a concern was raised about the government penchant for meeting with non-statutory taxi bodies without due regard to the agreement of government and taxi industry to speak with one voice.

Mchunu said it was impossible to meet with everybody who asked for a meeting with the government. However, he undertook to respect statutory bodies and inform them of his other engagements and the commitments made to non-statutory bodies.

KZN Taxi Council deputy chairman, Bhungane Hadebe, said: “We are unequivocally willing to work, support and hold your hand.”

The association also raised matters which they felt required Mchunu’s urgent attention which included operating permits, taxi recapitalisation, subsidy for the taxi industry, 2010 Fifa World Cup and the provision of pupil transport.

In order to address these matters, it was agreed that an urgent strategic planning meeting would need to take place. – Daily News Reporter
FULL STEAM AHEAD

Large queues as new system tries to find its feet

No serious incidents of resistance as taxi stayaway causes headache

ANNA COX AND BEAUREGARD TROMP

At least 70,000 commuters used the Rea Vaya Bus Rapid Transit system on its first day. This was despite some hiccups due to the taxi stayaway, which resulted in long queues as commuters battled to get onto the buses.

But the City of Joburg has promised some relief today, with 150 Gauteng provincial buses, from as far afield as Brakpan, running in Joburg to assist commuters.

The 40 BRT buses were barely able to cater for passengers — many of whom waited for more than an hour to get on buses from Soweto.

Metrorail will also be adding 46 train sets to its route from Soweto.

During a press briefing held by the City of Joburg and Gauteng province yesterday to sum up the first day of operations, Rehana Moosajee, member of the mayoral committee responsible for transport, said: “We are going. Yes, we have had teething problems, but these were to be expected on the first day.”

“Our assessment of the first morning of operation is that it was very successful. We managed to transport all commuters at our stations and trust that, under the circumstances, most were able to arrive at work on time,” she said.

Moosajee added that the city did not anticipate the large numbers attributed to the stayaway by taxi drivers.

She said the drivers had undergone training, but some were still learning how to master docking at the stations and at certain instances, the gap between the doors of the stations and doors of the buses could be a bit large.

“I am particularly impressed with how quickly the station management staff, such as ambassadors and cashiers, have been able to master their jobs,” she said.

At certain stations, the demand was so high that tickets had to be replenished.

A strong police and metro police department (JMPD) presence will be maintained until the situation is stabilised.

She reiterated that lawlessness would not be tolerated.

On Sunday, the JMPD impounded 10 cars found in the dedicated lanes, and this would continue, Moosajee said.

She said talks with the taxi industry were ongoing and that the SA National Taxi Council had requested a meeting with her and the province.

“I would like to reiterate that the BRT has not been introduced to replace the taxi industry and covers only 25.5km of routes in the city. The need for integrated, inter-modal and inter-modal transport remains central to the government’s plans,” she said.

Furthermore, she said, the city chose only 40 buses as it had agreed in local negotiations to use drivers from the taxi industry.

“We will scale this up by January, at which point negotiations should have been concluded with operators, who would have formed themselves into a bus operating company that will own and run all 143 buses.

In the largest combined show of force since the xenophobic riots last year, members of the SA National Defence Force, police and metro police were on the streets in large numbers in anticipation of a violent confrontation with the taxi industry.

“While it is generally accepted that taxi strikes are, as a norm, directed at one or the other sphere of government, the disturbing trend of violence and intimidation that often accompanies these actions inevitably spills over and affects other public transport modes, commuter rail included,” said Metrorail spokesman Sibusiso Ngomane.

The company has under-
taken a threat analysis and deployed its own security along with police, at various possible hotspots to ensure train users' safety, he said.

The government continued to receive unwavering support from the SA Transport and Allied Workers Union and SA Commuter Organisation in rolling out the BRT.

The two bodies yesterday slammed taxi operators for allegedly intimidating Rea Vaya drivers.

Both organisations said the new system allowed commuters an opportunity to use decent public transport for the first time in 15 years, and also afforded former taxi drivers jobs offering guaranteed salaries of R6 000 a month and benefits, compared to the abysmal working conditions taxi drivers face under their bosses.

The Rea Vaya system ran without incident, even as they passed taxi ranks where drivers joined pedestrians in marvelling at the red-and-blue spectacle.

"We haven't come across any serious resistance from anybody, not even the taxi industry," said JMPD spokeswoman Edna Mamonyane.

She said about 600 of their officers were on patrol yesterday and would continue "educating" the public as the city gets used to the new system.

Police spokesman Lungelo Dlamini refused to divulge the number of police deployed for the BRT, but said specialised police units were among the scores of members drawn from various police stations around the city. Each bus had two or more police officers on them.

"I am not aware of any incidents at all. We will continue the operation for as long as we see fit," said Dlamini.

In the meantime, the United Taxi Association Forum (UTAF) remained adamant that the people to whom the council was talking were not the people representing the industry.

"After today, they should have seen that the people who pretend to be representative are not the rightful leaders. There was no strike today. What you saw was the people affected by these routes deciding not to operate," UTAF chairman Ralph Jones said.

"Tomorrow there will be transport. Tomorrow we will have a meeting and it's up to the government to invite us to the negotiating table," said Jones.

By 6.30pm yesterday, the queues at the Rea Vaya stations on Commissioner Street were still long. Some passengers said they had been waiting for as long as three hours for their trip home to Soweto.

First in line was Thembi Hlatshwayo, who had to watch in frustration as full Rea Vaya buses sped past the terminus.

In 10 minutes, three drove past without stopping.

"The buses are nice to ride in, but I still have to get home and cook," Hlatshwayo said.
Taxi boss killed after government talks

LUMKA OLIPHANT

JUST a few hours before he was gunned down outside his home, taxi boss Mthuthuzeli Molefe (67) had met with Transport Minister Sbu Ndebele to sort out their differences over the Bus Rapid Transit System (BRT).

Molefe, who was the first deputy president of the SA National Taxi Council (Santaco), was one of the people who disagreed with the government over the BRT at a meeting held at Gallagher Estate, Joburg, on Friday.

His brother, Lucky Twala, could not hold back his tears as he related how his brother was “one minute talking to his wife and the next he was dead”.

Molefe was killed about 20 metres from his house by unknown gunmen. Twala said his brother had to sleep at different places because of the nature of the business he was in.

One of those shocked by the news of Molefe’s death was Bafana Gamede (38) whose tertiary education Molefe paid for.

“He was a mentor and father to me. He loved me and made sure my tuition, books and transport were paid for.”

Santaco general secretary Philip Taalbosch said: “We were sitting next to each other at Gallagher Estate and the next thing he is dead.”

He added: “We appeal to our members to remain calm and not to speculate about the motive for Molefe’s killing.”

Ndebele expressed outrage and disgust at the callous murder. “We’re working closely with enforcement agencies, including the intelligence services, to ensure ... that these criminals face the consequences of their actions.”

Spokesperson for the Sebokeng police Inspector Mthimkhulu Mthimkhulu said they had not made any arrests. He would not be drawn to comment on the possible motive for the killing, but could only say: “Of course we cannot rule out the recent developments in the taxi industry as one of the motives.”

Molefe leaves behind his wife, Dineo, three daughters and two grandchildren. He will be buried on Sunday in Evaton and a memorial service will be held on Thursday at the McCamel Church in that township at 11am.
Stalemate in BRT and taxi talks

But joint committee is planned

LUMKA OLIPHANT and
GERSHWIN CHUYENYANE

THE taxi associations’ forum has spurned attempts by the City of Joburg (COJ) to blame them for a R400 million debt.

The angry reaction stems from the fact that the COJ pre-ordered buses costing R391 million on behalf of 10 taxi associations, allegedly without consultation.

The city hoped that in line with the bus rapid transit (BRT) system, the 10 associations operating routes between Regina Mundi in Soweto and Ellis Park in Johannesburg would form a bus operating company and take over the debt over 12 years.

However, Ralph Jones, spokesperson for the United Taxi Association Forum (UTAF), dismissed this as “nonsense” and a waste of the city’s money.

“If they say we are the nucleus of BRT, how come they went behind our backs? They should have taken a delegation from the taxi industry to assess the buses.”

He said the taxi industry had told them since 2006 that they did not understand BRT.

“Why are they pushing it down our throats? I wish those bus manufacturers would sue, because the 10 associations are our members, and they have never said they wanted buses,” said Jones.

He alleged that the city was so desperate it was approaching individual association members with promises of money if they agreed to BRT.

The BRT system was to have been operational during the Fifa Confederations Cup, which kicks off today. It would have been a dry run for next year’s Fifa World Cup, according to Lisa Seftel, COJ’s executive director of transport.

However, the city missed the deadline to implement phase 1A of the BRT on June 1, and even the extension to June 5 was not met, as predicted by City Press. There is a new August 1 deadline now.

Seftel said they had explained to the operators that there was mayoral approval for the COJ to go ahead with the pre-order of 143 buses at a cost of R391 million.

She said the buses would have replaced 575 minibus taxis from the 10 associations operating on the Regina Mundi to Ellis Park routes.

“The COJ ordered the buses on the understanding that when a bus operating company was formed by the affected taxi operators, the company would take over liability for the buses.

“The COJ has also looked at raising funding for the industry so that they can pay back the cost of the buses over 12 years,” Seftel said.

She did, however, concede that there was no agreement on the table between the associations and COJ.

“The city is seeking to negotiate this deal with operators from 10 associations who presently operate taxis between Regina Mundi and Ellis Park,” she said.

It is now back to the drawing board for the transport department and the taxi industry.

The long-awaited meeting between the industry and government this week could only yield plans to form a joint working committee.

And it appears government and the taxi associations were still miles apart as taxi bosses were now concerned about how the working committee would operate.

Jones said: “There is Santaco, UTAF and many associations which were represented at the meeting so the question is how they are going to form this working committee and who it is going to represent.”

Santaco’s president Arthur Mthembu said they agreed with government in principle on the integration of the transport system, but said it was important to make sure that all concerns were ironed out.

Transport department director-general Mpumi Mpofu said they were busy with a business model to ensure repayment for the buses bought by the city did not hit the pockets of taxi operators too hard.
Drivers threaten to halt World Cup in anger over bus system

LUMKA OLIPHANT

"I CAN tell you now this BRT is bull ..." This is what Emmanuel Moodley (28), a taxi driver who operates between Eldorado Park and Johannesburg, says when he talks about the City of Joburg’s planned Bus Rapid Transit (BRT) system.

Moodley does not even want to hear what the council is proposing.

"Everything the government does is to destroy the taxis while they cannot even provide jobs for us.

"What kind of government is this? I am even ashamed to say that we were better off during apartheid because we were allowed to operate our business the way we saw fit."

Moodley wants "that Masondo guy" – mayor Amos Masondo – to come and speak to them and explain that he is going to pay the R800 a week he earns from the taxis.

Phumlani Makhaza (36) is another taxi driver who operates between Johannesburg and Midrand and has six children to look after.

Makhaza also earns R800 a week and uses it to pay rent of R350 and R150 for electricity. On top of that he has to pay R20 a day to get a taxi from Alexandra to Johannesburg to fetch the taxi he drives.

"Tell me, what does this government want me to do if they are not afraid to tell me I am going to lose my job. Tell government that we do not want this BRT and we want a taxi rapid transit system instead."

He said the city was now using the Johannesburg Metro Police, with their Operation Nomakanjani, to push the taxis out of business.

"They have another thing coming. It looks like they have forgotten what we are capable of. "We will bring this country down and we will stop the World Cup. We hope (Fifa president) Sepp Blatter has another plan to take this World Cup elsewhere," warned Makhaza."
‘Uneducated’ taxi man: I will fight to protect job

LUMKA OLIPHANT

MANDLA Ndaba is a 36-year-old queue marshal at the Noord Street taxi rank in Joburg’s city centre. Since failing matric 15 years ago he has never known any other job.

His job at the taxi rank is to ensure “law and order” and that taxis move swiftly and on time.

He came to Johannesburg from Piet Retief immediately after the 1994 election to find a better life.

Since he is not educated and could not go back to school, he could find work only in the taxi industry.

Ndaba earns R900 a week from the different taxi associations. He is married and has two children and also supports his wife’s family and his parents back in Piet Retief.

Ndaba does not want to hear of the planned Bus Rapid Transit system.

“They are taking away my bread and butter. What kind of an animal is this BRT?” he asked.

He said from the information he had received the BRT system would have no place for people like him.

“I am not educated, I do not know how to operate a computer. I only have taxi experience. Now tell me, where are they going to fit me in? I don’t want this BRT,” he said.

He said since 1994 government had been urging everyone to “vuk’uzenzela” (do it yourself), and they even had a TV programme in that name. “And when we are doing that, they want to take it all away.”

Ndaba said it was a pity that leaders in government had conveniently forgotten that the taxi industry was a poor man’s business.

“We started this business without any assistance. Now that they see there is money in it they want to take it away and turn around and paint us as hooligans,” said Ndaba.

He said he would fight to protect his job and no bus would operate anywhere near Noord Street.
‘Prepared to die’ for their trade

Taxi fury over transit plans

LUMKA OLIPHANT

THOUSANDS of taxi operators have pledged to cause havoc in major cities if the multimillion-rand Bus Rapid Transit (BRT) system goes on. March 24 is the date the taxi industry will go on strike indefinitely in protest against the Joburg Rea Vaya transit system.

This follows similar actions in Cape Town, where 600 taxi operators are striking against the city’s Integrated Rapid Transit system.

Cape Town’s Mayor Helen Zille has threatened to call in the South African National Defence Force to stop any action in the Mother City.

Joburg taxi operators have promised a strike “bigger than Cape Town” and have vowed to stop this year’s football Confederations Cup and the 2010 World Cup tournament if their demands are not met.

And they say they will “vote for a party that will stop this BRT”.

The proposed system has also divided taxi operators, who accuse one another of trying to leave other operators behind while cashing in on the project.

The RT is a system designed to provide a high-quality, fast, safe and affordable transport system.

It makes use of a middle lane for large, high-tech buses which will transport passengers comfortably and quickly around Johannesburg using specifically designated routes, enclosed bus stations along the routes and a high-tech control centre.

So perturbed are the taxi operators that they have even hired a legal representative to take their matter to “the highest court” if the strike does not have any effect.

They say they are not opposed to the system but the council needs to state clearly what will happen to:

■ The 25 000 drivers in Joburg;
■ The 17 000 new taxis they were forced to buy when the taxi recapitalisation programme was introduced; and
■ The 6 000 queue marshals.

They want the city to guarantee that there will be no job losses.

They say most taxi owners have not received the R50 000 government promised them during the recapitalisation programme, which was aimed at regulating the industry and getting rid of old, unsafe taxis.

“We were still busy with this recapitalisation and we complied with what government was asking. Now they are coming with the BRT. Are we now done with recapitalisation?” asked Thulani Ngubane, a taxi driver.

Ngubane said he was “prepared to die” to protect his business.

Taxi operators accuse the city of not being open and honest with them.

Ralph Jones, spokesperson for the United Johannesburg Taxi Association Forum, which represents 21 taxi associations, said: “We are not opposed to change, but the government is failing the taxi industry in a big way.”

The operators want the city to negotiate with them in a language they understand, not English. They want to know:

■ What is the BRT?
■ Who are the owners?
■ How are they going to benefit?

"It is very important that government ensures that the people on the ground understand how their businesses will be affected," said Jones.

They say they have also notified the city to stop negotiating with the steering committee that they elected because “it is not giving us adequate information and they are only interested in enriching themselves”.

City Press is in possession of a draft report of a meeting held between Joburg Mayor Amos Masondo and the association on February 17. In the meeting taxi drivers voiced their concerns that the city had gone ahead with road infrastructure and that BRT buses had already arrived while “negotiations” were continuing.

Speakers noted that the BRT system should be “put on hold until we are clear in our minds on what is taking place”.

Masondo did not guarantee the operators anything, but said government had no intention of wiping out the taxi industry.

He was also clear that they would not make money available to individuals but “to an intergrated public transport system”.

Rehana Moosajee, member of the mayoral committee, stressed that the city had no plans to take the taxis off Johannesburg’s roads. In fact they were trying to find ways for the same taxi operators to run the project.

She said it should be stressed that the first phase, which the city is now busy with, does not include all taxi operators and every time a taxi route was affected they would negotiate with the relevant operators.

“We included them in the process before this project even started and we appreciate the response we have been getting from the industry and we wish to continue working with them,” said Moosajee.
Stephen Sangweni, president of the South African Commuter Organisation, said they supported the BRT.

He said from their understanding, the BRT was not going to take any business from the taxi operators but operators needed to also deal with their own politics.

Sangweni said government must also find ways to communicate properly with the people on the ground because "the only problem here is communication".

Go to www.citypress.co.za to view a clip featuring taxi drivers talking to us about the BRT.
Mass taxi strike set for election day, if demands not met

STEVEN TAU

THERE is the possibility of a national taxi strike that could seriously threaten the general elections.

This was confirmed by the United Taxi Association Forum's Ralf Jones yesterday.

Speaking to The Citizen, Jones said a decision would be taken at the national taxi summit on April 16.

"All representatives ... will make a decision on whether to embark on a nationwide strike.

"The decision taken at the summit will be based on whether the ANC and government respond to our demands of doing away with the proposed Rapid Bus System."

Jones said the strike could be a week or even a month long, depending on whether demands are met.

Should their demands not be met, it would mean the strike would start in just over two weeks (April 20).

Those planning to vote could be left stranded in the pending strike.

In response, the ANC's Brian Sokutu said meetings with the taxi industry are ongoing, adding, it "takes the... demands seriously."

"There is a planned meeting with them in the coming weeks."

In an exclusive interview with The Citizen yesterday, state Communication and Information System CEO Themba Maseko called threats to disrupt the Confederations Cup and 2010 FIFA World Cup, concerning.

"I don't think though that South Africans... will allow that."

"Transport Minister Jeff Radebe is holding discussions with the taxi industry," Maseko said. He called the taxi drivers' violence "unacceptable". – stevent@citizen.co.za
Taxi body wants Radebe to go

STEVEN TAU AND KABELO MASENG
THE United Taxi Association Forum (Utaf) has joined the fray in calling for Transport Minister Jeff Radebe to resign.

The Congress of the People was the first to make the call in response to the taxi operators strike against the government’s proposed Rea Vaya Bus Rapid Transport (BRT) system that brought Johannesburg to a standstill this week.

Utaf’s spokesman Ralph Jones said it was time for Radebe to make way for fresh and young blood.

On their memorandum of demands accepted by ANC secretary-general Gwede Mantashe he said: “We don’t want to pre-empt at this stage as to what we will do should the ANC come with a response we were not expecting or if Government goes ahead with the implementation of the BRT system.

“We want to give them time to look at our demands, but government has failed us hence we sought the ANC’s intervention,” he said.

Jones said they are yet to receive complaints from people who said they were assaulted by striking drivers. He promised disciplinary action against members “found to have been involved in any violent activity”.

Meanwhile, the SA Transport and Allied Workers’ Union condemned the protests, saying the taxi industry should decide where it can fit into the BRT system and stop using violence to get what it wants.

– stevent@citizen.co.za
– kabelom@citizen.co.za
Premier backs bus system

NONI MOKATI
GATUENG Premier Nomvula Mokonyane has blasted those who continue to oppose the implementation of the Bus Rapid Transit (BRT) system.

"The public bus system is not a bone of contention. Neither is it confined to any entity. "Whoever suggests that we do away with it must rather stay away from it," said Mokonyane during a media briefing yesterday.

"Furthermore, there is no intellectual property ownership of public transport and that's what we need to clarify.

Taxi owners have threatened to stop the BRT system in its tracks because they claim they were never properly consulted.

But according to Mokonyane, there were many benefits from the integrated transport system.

"This is bigger than people perceive it. BRT is about improving the transport system and ensuring that there's adequate infrastructure to grow the economy," she said.

Turning to other issues, she said that the executive council was in the process of implementing a new mandate which would place a strong emphasis on renewal of government and accelerated service delivery.

The Mokonyane administration has undertaken to use its first 100 days in office to forge a relationship with businesses, labour and non-government organisations.

"Key activities will include developing a turnaround strategy for Chris Hani-Baragwanath Hospital and the living conditions of 20 townships," she said.

She added that her office would assume a central role in ensuring that the provincial government delivered on its mandate.

She said there would be continuous evaluation of her administration, with more emphasis put on service delivery.

- nonim@citizen.co.za
‘BRT is here, whether taxis like it or not’

STEVEN TAU AND
FAKAZI NKOSI
WHILE the clock is ticking down to the implementation of the Rea Vaya Bus Rapid Transit (BRT) system next week, the government yesterday issued stern warnings to disgruntled taxi operators.

Following the Cabinet meeting on Wednesday, the government condemned threats of violence against the implementation of the BRT.

“The law enforcement agencies will not hesitate to take strong action against those who either threaten or perpetrate any form of violence.

“While the right to protest by those who are unhappy about the BRT is respected, this right cannot be exercised at the expense of law-abiding citizens who have an equal right to a safe, punctual and efficient ride between home and work,” a statement read.

Gauteng Premier Nomvula Mokonyane said yesterday that the implementation of the BRT would go ahead, with or without the support from the taxi industry.

An outspoken Mokonyane said: “The taxi industry must not undermine the authority of the state. We also know that change is pain but change is needed,” she said.

“Our job as government is to protect the citizens of the country... we will protect this infrastructure as government,” she added.

– stevent@citizen.co.za/
fakazin@citizen.co.za
Taximen in Cape Town protest against BRT

Francis Hweshe

A NUMBER of concerned organisations in Western Cape have rallied behind the Western Cape National Taxi Alliance in lobbying against the government’s planned bus rapid transport system.

The South African National Civics Organisation, National African Federated Chamber of Commerce and Industry, the Struggle Veterans Action Committee and Ottery Toyota were some of the organisations that joined hundreds of people at the Du Noon informal settlement yesterday to condemn BRT.

Mayor Dan Plato, who also addressed the gathering, said much of the fear about BRT were based on misconceptions that needed to be addressed with the stakeholders.

“ar the government is playing with us. They are kicking us like a soccer ball,” said NTA provincial chairperson Mandla Mala.

He complained that the BRT project would wipe out the taxi industry, leaving most players without the means to put food on the table.

Mala said he was disappointed by ANC Youth League president Julius Malema, who talked about “shoot to kill” but was failed to be vocal about BRT.

He said most of his members had recently voted for the ANC with the hope that it would support them against the project, but that had not happened.

Nafoc provincial spokesperson Mandide Njoli said his organisation was behind the NTA and the “time to play” about BRT was gone.

His said there should be no compromise in rejecting BRT and “we will mobilise, strategise and move forward together”.

“The doors we will find closed, we will kick them open,” he said, pleading with the government to stop its plans around BRT because it would destroy small businesses owned by black people.

Faizel Moosa, provincial chairperson of the SVAC, took a swipe at Cosatu, the ANC and the Department of Transport for not attending the meeting.

“We will fight against the oppression of our people. We will stand together with you,” he said to applause from the crowd.

Ottery Toyota sales executive Char-maine Lategame said her company supported the NTA because “if the taxi owners and drivers don’t have a job, we also don’t have a job”.

Mavis Mbathathane, speaking on behalf of vendors in the area, told the gathering that if the taxi industry collapsed because of BRT their businesses would also fall apart.

“We don’t want it (BRT). We have children who work as taxi drivers and panelbeaters. We sell goods at the ranks. There are no jobs from the government. We ask everybody on the street to protest against BRT,” she said.

But Plato said there were many economic benefits for the taxi industry and concerned parties as a result of the implementation of BRT.

He said BRT generated unnecessary war talk in the media, such as turning Cape Town into a war zone.

If there were differences between the government and NTA they had to be resolved amicably, he said.

He said a date for a workshop with the NTA leadership and other stakeholders to resolve issues around BRT would be announced today.