THE CONSTRAINTS OF USING DESIGN AND BUILD FOR THE PROCUREMENT OF CONSTRUCTION PROJECTS IN SOUTH AFRICA

NDONWI GERALD MFONGEH

A research report submitted to the Faculty of Engineering and the Built Environment, University of the Witwatersrand, in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Science in Building.

Johannesburg, 2010

DECLARATION

I declare that this research repor	t is my own unaided work. It has been submitted for the
Degree of Master of Science	in Building in the University of the Witwatersrand,
Johannesburg. It has not been s	submitted before for any degree or examination in any
other University.	
Ndonwi Gerald Mfongeh	
Day of	(year)

Dedication:

This work is dedicated to my parents Mr. and Mrs. Mfongeh for their love, encouragement and total commitment toward the betterment of my life. They have compromised their well being continuously to make sure that I achieve whatever success that I have accomplished up to this moment, and still continue to guide me morally, financially and otherwise.

Acknowledgment:

My sincere gratitude goes to my supervisor, Professor Alfred Talukhaba for his guidance, advice and continuous encouragement throughout this project. I thank you very much Sir. Special thanks also go to my boss Mr. Seeraj Mohamed who created the space for me to be able to complete this work despite the tight schedules that the job usually entailed.

I thank sincerely my friends and family for all the love, support, encouragement which gave me the courage to bring this study to completion. I am thinking of my siblings, Barbara, Elvis, Vera, Ngwa and Noel, my good friend Charles Nyuykonge who edited and proofread this work, , Fon Mbakwa Emmanuel, WA Mpama, Olivier Pamen Meneukeu and Mpolokeng Manoto. I thank you all whole heartedly.

Abstract

Despite the numerous advantages that design and build has as a procurement method for construction projects, which have made it the procurement method of choice for construction projects in Europe and North America, not many South African construction companies are making use of it. This study investigates the constraints which are associated with design and build in South Africa. It also seeks to find out how certain performance indicators in construction fare when design and build is used. It then proposes recommendations on how the method can be improved in order to increase its use in South Africa.

Data for the study was collected from six major professions in the construction industry including contractors, engineers, quantity surveyors, project owners, project managers and architects in order to give a more balanced view of the problems. Questionnaires, emails and telephonic conversations were methods used to collect the data. Sample t-tests were then conducted on the data using the statistical package, Statistical Analysis Systems (SAS).

The results obtained show that there are numerous problems faced in all phases of construction projects when design and build is used as the procurement method of choice in South Africa. Most of the problems are around the issues of inadequate knowledge by project owners in construction, and also the unavailability of manpower to help owners with technical issues. Of the performance indicators investigated, time management and project quality are found to perform poorly. Project owners should deploy their own project managers in the construction process.

Table of Contents

Co	ntents	Page	
De	clarati	onvi	
De	edicatio	onvi	
Ac	knowl	edgementvi	
Αb	stract	vi	
	t of		
fig	ures	vi	
	t of		
Ta	bles	vi	
Аp	pendi	cesvi	
1	Cha	pter one: Introduction	1
	1.1	Background	1
	1.2	Problem statement	
	1.3	Objectives	
		,	
	1.4	Hypotheses	
	1.5	Significance of the study	5
	1.6	Delimitations	5
	1.7	Scope of the study	6
	1.8	Assumptions	6
	1.9	Structure of the research report	6
2	Cha	pter Two: Procurement Systems	8
	2.1	Introduction to Procurement systems	
	2.1	Definition of procurement in the construction context	

	2.3	3	Maj	or trends in procurement systems	9
		2.3.1	L	Separated and co-operative procurement systems	. 10
		2.3.2	2	Integrated procurement system	. 11
		2.3.3	3	Management-Oriented Procurement System	. 12
	2.4	1	Fact	ors to consider when selecting a procurement method	. 13
		2.4.1	L	The time line facing the owner	. 13
		2.4.2	2	Financing issues	. 13
		2.4.3	3	Size and complexity of the project	. 13
		2.4.4	ļ.	Owner's knowledge of the construction industry	. 14
		2.4.5	5	Legal issues	. 14
	2.5	5	Con	clusion	. 14
3		Chap	oter '	Three: Design and Build Procurement	. 15
	3.1	1	Defi	nition	. 15
	3.2	2	Proj	ect types suited to design and build systems	. 16
	3.3	3	Sect	ors that make use of design and build	. 17
	3.4	1	Use	of design and build in South Africa	. 18
	3.5	5	Com	parison of use of the design and build in South Africa and other regions	. 19
	3.6	â	Cha	racteristics of the design and build system	. 20
		3.6.1	L	Early knowledge of contract sum and project time	. 21
		3.6.2	2	More accurate estimation of cost and time	. 21
		3.6.3	3	Well defined scope/brief	. 21
		3.6.4	l	Contractors must have both design and build capabilities	. 22
	3.7	7	Hyb	rids of design and build	. 22
		3.7.1	L	Pure design and build	. 24
		3.7.2	2	Integrated design and build	. 25

3.7.3	Fragmented design and build	26
3.7.4	Novation design and build	27
3.8 Ber	nefits of using design and build in construction projects	28
3.8.1	Single point of reference	28
3.8.2	Shorter project time	29
3.8.3	Savings in cost	29
3.8.4	Possible increases in the quality of projects	30
3.8.5	Room for innovation and improvement	30
3.9 Sur	mmary	30
-	Four: Constraints and Management Issues Associated with the use of Design and	
Build in Cons	truction	32
4.1 The	e general mechanism of design and build systems	32
4.2 Ter	nder preparation and evaluation issues in Design and Build	34
4.2.1	Tender preparation constraints	34
4.2.2	Tender evaluation constraints	35
4.3 Cor	ntract management issues in design and build systems	36
4.3.1	Contract between the owner and the main contractor	36
4.3.2	Design and build Contract Liability	38
	nagement issues at project implementation (design and construction phases) level and build	39
4.4.1	Planning and scheduling issues	39
4.4.2	Communication and information dissemination constraints	41
4.4.3	Coordination issues among various teams	42
4.5 Sur	mmary of constraints associated with design and build systems	42
4.5.1	The tender process in design and build contracts	42
4.5.2	The design phase	43

	4.5.	3 Construction phase	43
	4.6 Africa.	Changes to the design and build environment that could increase its use in South	43
	4.6.	1 Including knowledgeable owners in the design and build process	44
	4.6.	2 Including the owner's project manager in the design and build process	45
	4.7	Summary of findings from Literature	46
5	Cha	pter Five: Methodology	47
	5.1	Introduction	47
	5.2	Objectives	47
	5.3	Research Approach	47
	5.4	Information collection models	49
	5.4.	1 Secondary data source: Literature Review	49
	5.4.	2 Primary data collection	50
	5.4.	3 Questionnaire design	50
	5.4.	4 Likert's Scale	53
	5.5	Test for data reliability: Cronbach's Alpha Test	54
	5.6	Data analysis	55
	5.7	Hypotheses testing	55
6	Cha	pter Six: Results and analyses	57
	6.1	Characteristics of the sample obtained	57
	6.2	Reliability of the data: Cronbach's Alpha test	58
	6.3	Results obtained	58
	6.4	Analyses	61
	6.4.	1 Tender preparation and evaluation	61
	6.4.	2 Design phase	63
	6.4.3	.3 Construction phase	64

6.4.4	Performance indicators	64
6.4.5	Effect of including a project manager by the project owner	65
7 Chapter	Seven: Summary, Conclusions and recommendations	67
7.1 Sur	mmary of findings	67
7.2 Res	search findings	68
7.3 Cor	nclusions	68
7.4 Red	commendations	69
7.4.1	Project owners should include their project managers in design and build projects	69
7.4.2	Clear communication lines between all parties	70
7.4.3	Proper planning	70
7.4.4	Well prepared brief or Request for Proposal	70
7.4.5	Engage the right teams/companies	70
7.5 Are	eas for further study	71
References		72

Table of figures

Figure 1: Separated procurement systems (Wadani, 2004)	. 10
Figure 2: Integrated procurement methods (Mohamed, 2005)	. 11
Figure 3: Management procurement systems (Mosley, 1990)	. 12
Figure 4: Pure design and build systems (Mosley, 1990)	. 24
Figure 5: Integrated design and build system (Mohamed, 2005)	. 25
Figure 6: Fragmented design and build systems (Mohamed, 2005)	. 26
Figure 7: Novation design and build system (Wadani, 2004)	. 27

List of Tables

Table 1: Issues faced in various stages of design and build projects	51
Table 2: Results of tests obtained for various potential problems in design and build	58
Table 3: Tender preparation and evaluation	61
Table 4: Design phase results	63
Table 5: Performance indicators results	64
Table 6: Effects of including a project manager in design and build processes	65

Appendices

Appendix 1	Survey questionnaire	76
Appendix 2	Collated data	86
Appendix 3	Recommendations to constraints	87
Appendix 4	T-test outputs	90
Appendix5	Del Siegel output for computing Cronbach's Alpha	95