

**The discourses on the Right to Housing
in Gauteng Province, 1994-2008.**

Christopher Gerald Thomas

**A thesis submitted to the Faculty of Humanities, University of the
Witwatersrand, Johannesburg, in fulfillment of the requirements for the
degree of Doctor of Sociology.**

Johannesburg, February 2010

abstract

The post-apartheid government of 1994 is a product of the 'Age of Rights'. State-making processes and the exercise of state powers is managed by the rule of law based on a constitution. Constitutionally recognised rights, and rights protection institutions, animate a transition from a legacy of Black political exclusion and underdevelopment. Intensifying class stratification and inequality constrain Black's formal realisation of citizenship rights, placing great pressure on creative interpretation of constitutionally legitimated claims.

My thesis examines the rights discourse informing the Constitution, particularly issues about the realisation of social and economic rights. I examine the unfolding of discourses on the right to housing between 1994 to 2008, to illustrate of the complexity of the discourse. Episodic housing protests suggest significant degrees of alienation, marginalisation, and disappointment with expectations of citizenship and the non-realisation of social and economic rights. Housing rights is an issue that will affect the democratic consolidation and political stability prospects of the new political order. I examine the interface between macro-economic policies, budgets, and the realisation of housing rights, and assess the impact of an identifiable configuration of forces expected to play important roles in realising a rights culture and broadening the discourse.

My study draws on a spectrum of qualitative, interpretive, and analysis of discourse approaches, using data from: published articles, annual reports and archives, speeches, court proceedings and statements, interviews with persons whose scope of activities impact the unfolding of the concerned rights, namely, representatives of government departments, private sector developers, financing institutions, and civil society formations.

My main findings are that few actors in the configuration support the view that the Constitution should be changed to make explicit the state's obligations on the realisation of social and economic rights. Nevertheless, there are isolated cases of people expressing an absolute entitlement sense of rights --- the state should deliver when demands are made. My conclusions are that considerable political unrest about non-realisation of these rights will persist, but will not cause a collapse of the post-1994 political institutions and processes. More likely, political actors, legal scholars and jurists, will persistently engage the prevailing rights discourse and the variety of institutions acting towards their realisation, without effecting drastic changes to these, but always invoking positions about how they still are suited for a post-apartheid transformation project yet need critical interrogation and improvisation.

KEYWORDS: apartheid, transition, citizenship, rights discourse, Constitution, socio-economic rights, inequality, redistribution, configuration of institutions promoting rights, right of access to adequate housing, qualification of rights, fiscal limits on state capacities, available resources.

Declaration

I declare that this thesis is my own unaided work. It is submitted for the degree of Doctor of Sociology in the University of Witwatersrand, Johannesburg. It has not been submitted before for any other degree or examination in any other university.

Christopher G Thomas

_____ day of _____, 2010

Dedication

In memory of my parents, George and Mary,
whose tireless struggle to provide their children
with a comfortable house and home inspired my values.

Acknowledgments

To Professor Ran Greenstein,
for meticulous supervision through the years.

Abbreviations

AB	Afrikaner Broederbond
AHI	Afrikaanse Handel Instituut
ANC	African National Congress
APF	Anti-Privatisation Forum
AZAPO	Azanian People's Organisation
BASA	Banking Association of South Africa
BCM	Black Consciousness Movement
BESG	Built Environment Support Group
CALS	Centre for Applied Legal Studies
CASE	Community Agency for Social Enquiry
CODESA	Convention for a Democratic South Africa
COHRE	Centre on Housing Rights and Evictions
COSATU	Congress of South African Trade Unions
CSIR	Council for Scientific and Industrial Research
DA	Democratic Alliance
DBSA	Development Bank of South Africa
DP	Democratic Party
DPLG	Department of Provincial and Local Government
DRC	Dutch Reformed Church
FC	Final Constitution
GATT	General Agreement on Trades and Tariffs
GEAR	Growth, Employment and Redistribution
GNU	Government of National Unity
HSRC	Human Sciences Research Council
IC	Interim Constitution
IDT	Independent Development Trust
IFP	Inkatha Freedom Party
ICCPR	International Convention on Civil and Political Rights
ICESCR	International Convention on Social and Economic Rights
ICRS	Inner City Regeneration Strategy
IMF	International Monetary Fund
JMPD	Johannesburg Metropolitan Police Department
JOTA	Johannesburg Tenants Association
LPM	Landless People's Movement
MEC	Member of Executive Committee
MPNF	Multi-Party Negotiating Forum
MK	Umkhonto we Sizwe
MWT	Marxist Workers' Tendency (of ANC)
NEDLAC	National Economic Development and Labour Council
NEM	Normative Economic Model
NHBRC	National Home Builders Registration Council
NF	National Forum
NGO	Non-Governmental Organisation
NHF	National Housing Forum
NIA	National Intelligence Agency
NIMBY	'not in my back yard'

NP	National Party
PAC	Pan Africanist Congress
PEBCO	Port Elizabeth Black Civics Organisation
PIE (Act)	Prevention of Illegal Eviction and Unlawful Occupation of Land Act
PISA	Prevention of Illegal Squatting Act
PLANACT	an NGO assisting communities, mostly in Gauteng, adversely affected by apartheid policies
PRC	Peoples' Republic of China
PWV	Pretoria/Witwatersrand/Vereeniging
RDP	Reconstruction and Development Programme
RSA	Republic of South Africa
SAAU	South African Agricultural Union
SABRA	South African Bureau of Racial Affairs
SACC	South African Council of Churches
SACP	South African Communist Party
SAHRC	South African Human Rights Commission
SAIRR	South African Institute for Race Relations
SALC	South African Law Commission
SANCO	South African Civics Organisation
SANGOCO	South African National Nongovernmental Organisations Coalition
SAPs	Structural Adjustment Plans
SAPS	South African Police Services
STATSSA	Statistics South Africa
TRA	Tembisa Residents Association
TRC	Truth and Reconciliation Commission
UCDP	United Christian Democratic Party
UDF	United Democratic Front
UDHR	Universal Declaration of Human Rights
UF	Urban Foundation
UN	United Nations
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
USAID	United States Agency for International Development
USN	Urban Sector Network
WOSA	Workers' Organisation for Socialist Action

CONTENTS	Page
Abstract	i
Keywords	i
Declaration	ii
Dedication	iii
Acknowledgments	iv
Abbreviations	v
1 INTRODUCTION	1
1.1 Introduction	
1.2 A synopsis of apartheid, the black housing question, and political transition	3
1.3 Housing in post-apartheid transformation	18
1.4 Rights and consolidating a new democracy	20
1.5 Discourse and Critical Theory approaches to Rights	24
1.6 Conclusion	29
2 METHODOLOGY	31
2.1 Introduction	31
2.2 Specifying the scope of my qualitative data collection	32
2.3 The notion of “discourses” on the realisation of rights	34
2.3.1 Distinguishing between discourse, discourse analysis, discourse theory, and the analysis of discourses	34
2.3.2 Analysis of discourses and sources of data	48
2.4 Sources of quantitative and qualitative data on the realisation of social and economic rights	49
2.4.1 The National Department of Housing annual reports	50
2.4.2 The Gauteng Department of Housing annual reports	51
2.4.3 Studies by the Human Rights Commission	52
2.4.4 Studies of rights and delivery in post-apartheid South Africa	53
2.4.4.1 <i>The study by the Community Agency for Social Enquiry (CASE)</i>	53
2.4.4.2 <i>Studies of the monitoring process</i>	55
2.4.4.3 <i>Journal monitoring and debates</i>	55
2.4.4.4 <i>Miscellaneous publications on housing developments</i>	57
2.4.5 Archives	58
2.4.6 Interviews and interview informants	59
2.4.6.1 <i>The Landless People’s Movement (LPM)</i>	60

	2.4.6.2	<i>Builders associations / project developers: Wietpro Housing</i>	61
	2.4.6.3	<i>The South African Human Rights Commission</i>	61
	2.4.6.4	<i>Gauteng Department of Housing</i>	61
	2.4.6.5	<i>Financing institutions: First National Bank</i>	61
	2.4.6.6	<i>Courts and the Constitutional Court</i>	62
2.4.7		Research questions used in interviews and in the examination of published sources	62
	2.4.7.1	<i>Views on budgets and the state of the economy</i>	63
	2.4.7.2	<i>Standards, quality of housing, understanding of “adequate housing”</i>	63
	2.4.7.3	<i>The Constitution</i>	64
	2.4.7.4	<i>Government capacity, management, and the banking institutions</i>	65
	2.4.7.5	<i>Co-option and exclusion</i>	66
	2.4.7.6	<i>International forces</i>	66
	2.4.7.7	<i>Civil society</i>	67
3		RIGHTS PHILOSOPHY, CONSTITUTIONS, AND STATES	68
	3.1	Introduction	68
	3.2	Rights: a contested notion	69
	3.3	The genesis of Rights philosophy	73
		3.3.1 Rights: ideology or discourse?	74
		3.3.2 The mainstream Natural Rights doctrine	81
		3.3.3 The Utilitarian critique	86
		3.3.4 The collectivistic critique	89
		3.3.5 The Marxist critique	90
		3.3.6 Contemporary pragmatic approaches	95
	3.4	Constitutions and the realisation of rights	102
	3.5	States and the realisation of rights	104
	3.6	Conclusion	109
4		THE ESSENCE OF APARTHEID	110
	4.1	Introduction	110
	4.2	Rightful claims to an ‘empty land’	110
	4.3	What to do about urban blacks? Segregation and apartheid	115
	4.4	Conclusion	128
5		THE TRANSITION TO RIGHTS-BASED TRANSFORMATION INSTITUTIONS	129
	5.1	Introduction	129

5.2	From protest and armed struggle to negotiations	129
5.3	Negotiations, elections and an Interim Constitution	140
5.4	Drafting a Final Constitution	150
5.5	Conclusion	154
6	TAKING SOCIO-ECONOMIC RIGHTS SERIOUSLY IN SOUTH AFRICA	155
6.1	Introduction	155
6.2	Incorporating social and economic rights in the Final Constitution	156
6.3	The configuration promoting a rights culture in South Africa	163
6.3.1	The Constitutional Court	163
6.3.1.1	<i>Soobramoney: the right of access to health care services</i>	166
6.3.1.2	<i>Grootboom: the right to have access to adequate housing</i>	171
6.3.1.3	<i>The Treatment Action Campaign: the right of access to health care services</i>	175
6.3.1.4	<i>Khosa: the right to have access to social security</i>	176
6.3.1.5	<i>The Constitutional Court in the larger social structure</i>	178
6.3.2	The South African Human Rights Commission	189
6.3.3	International agreements on economic and social rights	183
6.3.4	Civil society organisations	186
6.4	Conclusion	193
7	HOUSING POLICY IN SOUTH AFRICA	196
7.1	Introduction	196
7.2	The apartheid years: 1948-1976	197
7.3	Reforms in black housing policy: 1976 to 1994	205
7.3.1	Shifts in urbanisation policy	206
7.3.2	Shifts in NP economic policy and its effects on housing policy	208
7.3.3	The Urban Foundation's entry into housing provision	209
7.3.4	State-led initiatives: the 'Big sale'	214
7.3.5	The Independent Development Trust	215
7.3.6	The World Bank and housing in SA	216
7.3.7	The de Loor report on housing	217
7.3.8	The National Housing Forum	219
7.3.9	The marginalised discourses	221
7.4	Giving life to the New Constitution's rights rhetoric: National Housing Policy, 1994 to 2004	222

7.5	Economic forces shaping post-apartheid housing policy	234
7.5.1	Economic policy beginnings with the RDP	236
7.5.2	The shift to GEAR	240
7.5.1	GEAR's breakdown	243
7.6	Issues developing from housing policy since 1994	249
7.6.1	The national budget's housing provision	250
7.6.2	Financial institutions and low-income housing loans	259
7.6.3	The quality and standards of low-income housing products	267
7.6.4	Problems about the housing bureaucracy	275
7.6.5	The urban-rural bias, the availability of land, and housing unrest	280
7.6.6	The Constitution: Housing rights as entitlements and state obligations	291
7.7	Conclusion	294
8	THE RIGHT TO HOUSING IN GAUTENG PROVINCE	296
8.1	Introduction	296
8.2	The housing need in Gauteng province	297
8.3	Issues in the management of the provincial housing budget	312
8.4	The operation of the subsidy scheme and the allocation of housing to applicants	316
8.5	Issues in housing quality and size	319
8.6	Banks and low-income housing	324
8.7	Housing developments, infrastructure, and service provision	326
8.8	Housing unrest in Gauteng province	330
8.9	Challenging hegemonic housing rights discourse: land occupation and squatter evictions	336
8.9.1	Land occupation in the peri-urban areas	336
8.9.2	Contestation of inner city evictions	357
8.9.3	Homelessness, evictions, protest and the law under a transformative constitution	367
8.10	Conclusion	375
9	ANALYSIS OF DISCOURSES ON THE RIGHT TO HOUSING	378
9.1	Introduction	378
9.2	Assessing the key forces in the unfolding rights discourse and rights-based transformation process	379
9.2.1	To have rights or not, and how to conceptualise rights	382
9.2.2	Land claims and realising rights	394
9.2.3	State resources as an element in realising rights	400

	9.2.4 Policy priorities and obligations to rights	408
	9.2.5 Access to adequate housing	412
9.3	Conclusion: Outline of the perspectives of the main forces	415
10	CONCLUSION	422
11	BIBLIOGRAPHY	429
	11.1 Books, book chapters, journal articles, newspaper articles, internet articles	429
	11.2 Cases consulted	493
	11.3 Legislation, government reports, commissions	495