STRUCTURE AND EXPERIENCE IN THE MAKING OF APARTHEID

6 - 10 February 1990

AUTHOR: Ari Sitas


For Jabu Ndlovu, singer and shop-steward, assassinated Pmg, 1989.
THE VOICE AND GESTURE IN SOUTH AFRICA'S REVOLUTION: A STUDY OF WORKER GATHERINGS AND PERFORMANCE-GENRES IN NATAL.

An Silea

For Jabu Ndlovu, singer and shop-steward, assassinated Pmg, 1989.

1

In Omar Badsha's photographic essay, "Rituals, Prayers and Megaphones" (1), our eyes meet textile and rubber workers, performers, shacklords, squatters, policemen, youth, in short, ordinary people gathered around loudhailers. The essay captures through this, and through these vocal boosters or trumpets, a historical moment when gatherings have grown just BEYOND the powers of the natural voice and just BEFORE the microphone-systems of the larger rallies or celebrations. In its uncanny way, photography freezes for us such events into a series of extroverted moments of public performance and asks of us to imagine what is the ESSENCE of this relationship: the oral communication, the sounds, the rhetoric; that is, the public voice of South Africa's revolution.

For the sensory organs that are used to moving through the spaces which are frozen on paper, three further points can be made: these gatherings are not some pristine traditional form of mass communication; they are rather, organized and patterned events prescribed by goals and agendas. Secondly, they are events that occur within defined material spaces (2) which presuppose definite socio-historical circumstances. For example, the soccer field used by workers to trumpet their messages might be the company's property and their presence there might also be the result of ferocious conflicts and compromises. Similarly, the squatters gathered to listen to their shacklord on sloping ground, meet at his property and within a space difficult to carve-out for more shacks. Thirdly, the relationship there is not one of a spontaneous self-communication in black communities: it is rather, embedded in POWER relations. Between the foreground, the people who occupy it, who control the agenda AND the megaphones, and the broader gathering there exist conditions of authority and power. It is within such constraints and possibilities within popular gatherings that a vibrant performance culture re-emerged in Natal. (3)

Still, photography can only freeze for our senses the aura of these gatherings and gestures that hint at a continuum of sound and movement. This sociological essay attempts to achieve its own freezing-process: to define better, out of this "continuum", the linkages between crowds and their participative interaction with
oral performers: to describe briefly the varieties of sound and gesture that have been developing recently so that we can decipher achievements, limitations and innovations.14

It is indeed another attempt (5) at explicating the affinity between popular and working-class culture, between performance and cultural formations, between defensive combinations, social structure and grassroots creativity. How all this noise and posture, finally, is a central element in the mobilization of social movements. For many trade unionists and cultural workers this is familiar and uninteresting terrain, but for many commentators who are interested in this grassroots energy, it is a necessary dispelling of imaginative fictions.

II

As against the passive consumption of scripted poetry, bourgeois drama or formal performance, cultural events in political gatherings, have captured the imagination of many social and literary critics. They provide an organic alternative: a communion between audience and performers which, does not separate art from life but which affords people the opportunity to be active participants in the work itself. The vibrant approach between crowds and performers goes beyond the "staid" relationship between stage and gallery, musicians and listeners, producers and private consumers. The oral and committed communication involved is seen to differ in form and substance, opening up alternative possibilities for creative work. And thus, alongside oral history what has gained credibility once more is the study of orality and oral performance.16

Crudely portrayed: there are three strands of interpretation on orality and its traditions, each with its own complicated tributaries and gorges. One, would argue that African oral traditions have an undying quality— they are able to digest modernist currents and reinvigorate themselves, whilst their essential nature, their African creative life-force remains the same. Every new manifestation is yet another demonstration of its vitality. As long, for example, as Mzwakhe Mbuli's or Ingopole Ndingoane's or Nise Malange's poetry can be shown to feed-off some of such life-force it can be absorped as another manifestation of this essential spirit. Another, influenced by recent scholarship on culture and ideology, argues that there is "tradition", but there is always its constant "reinvention" under new contexts and interests— here, the "present" is always the re-creator of the past, and since the past is unpoised by the present, it naturally provides a storehouse for powerful imaginings and recreations. A third way, is less appreciative of
the tradition- it sees it as a limited, marginal and limiting form rather out of place in the modern context, a creation of ethnic and anti-universal tendencies- at best an "elegant Primitivism". All these see modern industrial and bourgeois societies as periods of immense stresses and strains of the tradition, if not its gradual extinction.(7)

But oral performance-genres survive and regenerate themselves in all public gatherings. But their dominance there, however vibrant, must not be romanticised. They survive because of the conditions of life that privilege orality over literacy (8); they are vibrant because they draw from sturdy historical processes that have crafted in Africa, and especially in Natal through the creation of the Zulu kingdom, finely tuned techniques of rhetoric, gesture and sound. As long as people gather or mobilise, and as long the natural rhythms of the, in this case, Zulu language survive, oral craftsmanship in communication and performance will flourish. Perhaps this is what Hlatshwayo means when he asserts that, "oral traditions are deeply structured in our historical background... You cannot censor a word-people carry words with them wherever they go. The oppressor has not and cannot, censor the oral tradition"(9) But is hasty enough to assert that, "we live in a capitalist society, we no longer live in tribal communes".

As Elizabeth Gunner has argued, "the reliance of izibongo on an active performer-audience situation, and the reliance, or need, of izibongo to be associated with some power and authority" (10), is central for its survival. And here in Natal, since the eruption of performance forms in trade union and political life, the survival of all of them is contingent on the intricate web of power, organisation and participation.

III

To the sociology of gatherings then: prior to 1983 when the first stirrings of a cultural revolution were being felt, trade union meetings were not devoid of performance-genres. A "typical" meeting would involve the chairperson leading crowds into prayers, militant and defiant songs, call and response chants and depending on the individual's symbolic capital, through poetic reveries. In total control s/he would rhythmically indicate that the "defiant" mode was over and workers would settle down for the discussions and resolutions. At crucial moments again in the midst of speaking, the chairperson would energise proceedings with more chants, slogans and songs. Finally, beyond the relationship between call and response between the foreground and the crowd, a choir
might add some religious or traditional harmonies; or a dancing-troupe would emerge and entertain the participants. The process of participation reconfirmed most of the time the dominance of Zulu-based performance languages. Whereas discussion usually was conducted in both English and Zulu.\\)

For analytical purposes, each mass event can be separated into three different modes: each one with its own laws of participation and limits. Firstly, meetings are places where the emotive threads are sown together to create the fabric of mass movements. They affirm and manufacture identities and comradeships. They create the sense of belonging and demonstrate ritually resistance and defiance. One of the central functions of the person with the “megaphone”, the leader who chairs, etc., is to weave these solidarities. S/he, (and most of the time He) has to be talented in movement, rhetoric and song; has to also be an improviser and if need be an innovator. In weaving such solidarities, s/he is in control of the patterns of self-expression, albeit within limits set by the workers’ cultural formations.\\)

Secondly, those who control the “stage”, the foreground also control the messages, the images and the interpellations. Here a broader grouping of leaders participate in a cognitive mode—people are asked to settle down, think, discuss, explain, justify; but, most often than not, ratify and endorse. The cognitive component of every such gathering is pre-planned, agendas are pre-decided, speakers are identified, issues are ranked and priorities are presented. Whatever the social mandate leaders have, and however democratic their process of election and accountability might be, they do exercise influence over the manner through which issues are presented. For the purposes of this discussion, what is crucial is the emphasis on the “cognitive” mode, or a mode where rational as opposed to symbolic capital is being exchanged.

Thirdly, there is, as opposed to the first more defiant and heroic mode, a festive or more “carnival-esque” mode where people (and in this case workers) are asked to “enjoy” performances that assert strictly speaking the performance vitality of popular culture. Here the occasional local talent, or dance group, or choir, are organised to liven-up the proceedings—to sing religious hymns, to dance bawdy sexual dances, and, in moments of extroversion witness their president do a shuffle.

Such distinctions, too neatly frozen on paper into ideal-typical constructs, allow us to tighten our perceptions in four interrelated ways: firstly, one can clearly articulate that each mode
demands different forms of participation from people. Spontaneity, has to be qualified, and in each instant the relationship between the foreground and the people shifts and changes. Secondly, from meeting to meeting, and from organization to organization, the first two modes share dominance, (15) it is always the third that always, however enjoyable, ends up in a subordinate position. Thirdly, one is dealing with the most potent ways through which public identities and solidarities are created; this creation, or negotiation is initiated by groupings of people who are in control of the foreground. Fourthly, it is within such gatherings, their limits and constraints that Natal's worker-led cultural revolution was launched. Each of these, shall occupy this text for the ensuing pages, before innovations in performance culture can be discussed.

1. Each mode bears its own oral communication strategies, primarily because of the different ways audiences participate, or expect to participate in terms of their experiences. In short, their cultural formations and their socio-political histories have pre-coded a series of rules or "tropes"(16) that influence the ways people participate in mass events. On the basis of these, aesthetic principles emerge that define what a competent form of UMDLALO(performance) is. Such observations lead directly to scantily researched areas of cultural studies, but allow at least our argument to point to grassroots complexities in the relationship between megaphones and crowds. (17)

Provided the form of communication is competent, audiences or gatherings respond and participate, take over, interact and return to listening and quiet appreciation etc... A chairperson of a meeting who is not culturally empowered to lead in song, whose sense of rhythm and timing is out of joint needs only to try before the crowd remind him or her of limitations. A poet with a sweet whispering voice, with no intonations and peculiar metaphors begins sweating after the nth verse.

Yet, a worker able to master the craft of the izibongo and who stands in front of a gathering, pouring-out aggregative and additive metaphors in the requisite fury, will get a response and will elicit participation in pre-coded ways: after the initial roar of approval, the end of every stanza would bring forth the stock responses of encouragement and appreciation. The betterable poet will elicit more than stock responses and send the crowd in a flurry of exclamations and praises, impromptu power-dances and ululations.
Such a process of interaction makes the praise-poem a fertile symbolic resource for the affirmation of identities and comradeships. The poetry in its metaphorical language, in its heroic cast, endows movements with peculiar strengths and ascribes values to actions and enriches the experience of "belonging," but the praise-poem form is only one "poetic" strategy: propaganda poems in English punctuated with chants, toivi-toivi sequences with quasi-poetic call and response vocalising, struggle songs all serve to create solidarities and to strike defiant chords.\(^{(18)}\)

In contradistinction, people tend to participate through different codes when a "festive" mode is underway. They respond with joyous appreciation when, for example, the Hammersdale textile workers' dance group performs with bravado, athleticism and sexual innuendoes their frenetic dancing. They also change gears when discussion is underway.

We need, therefore, to be sensitive of both the creative possibilities that each mode generates and cognisant also of the aesthetic models and expectations a gathering brings with it from its forms of life.

Gatherings of crowds and their festive intensity and energy have gained popularity in the most recent theories of society: as against the greyness of organisational functions, strategic rationality, they constitute manifestations of DESIRE, of what was repressed by the social order. The festive mode, or what since Bakhtin has been seen as the grotesque humour and carnival-like performances of the poor and the oppressed, or indeed what Lenin identified as the "festival of the oppressed" in revolutionary gatherings, is only a subordinate moment in the dynamics of worker gatherings here.\(^{(19)}\)

They have been and are subordinate to the first mode - the ritual affirmation of identity, comradeship and defiance and/or, the cognitive mode - the discussion, argument and resolution of issues. By emphasising the ritual or symbolic aspects of defiance, I am not trying to wish away the potential and actual violence that might or does occur in such gatherings. Gatherings that have as their purpose an immediate action: a strike, a defence of the community, and paradoxically funerals, violence can and does break out. As Sartre pointed out such gatherings turn people from an unstructured ensemble into groups-in-fusion who actively try and alter or transform a situation; usually, the presence of the "other", the "enemy" or the "system" either causes violence, or initiates explosive situations of "counter-violence".\(^{(20)}\)
but in most worker gatherings, the militancy and defiance is a
ritual process of identity formation and comradeship-building. A
process which interacts with the cognitive exchanges of agenda
items. And here, worker leaders and a variety of talented public
individuals occupy the foreground.

Labour studies in South Africa had commented on two forms of
leadership in working life: an informal one, tucked away inside
the nooks and crannies of industry or community—life, in
compounds or in hostels—resisting always managerial or state
prerogatives; and, with the rise of trade unionism, a
democratically-elected one made-up of shop-stewards. This newly
created leadership was seen to be the essence of trade union
power. (21) After a research period on the East Rand, my work
explored further forms of leadership: in defining "cultural
formations" and "defensive combinations" it also stressed
grassroots forms of worker leadership based on forms of public
class knowledge (read, also popular wisdom) and drawing on the
symbolic and evocative resources of the countryside. (22) Two
further contributions stressed different facets of trying to
understand grassroots leadership: firstly, Moses Ngoasheng,
responding to the cultural work emerging in Natal's working
class, he argued that its cultural workers must be seen as
organic intellectuals. They, in their own ways fulfilled
alongside shop-stewards and community leaders the "functions"
enunciated by Gramsci—they were innovators, educators, they
"captured the spontaneous cultural energies of the masses and
directed them to serve the interest of the working class", and,
provided new visions. Through this he could also argue that
intellectual work was not only the preserve of those on the
"mental" divide of society, but also of those of the manual
divide. (23)

Bonnin furthered our understanding by introducing the argument
about orality: leadership and cultural work was exercised and
initiated in an oral world of communication and gatherings by
charismatic clusters of people who combined cognitive and
cultural contributions to struggling communities. To denote
orality and experiential prowess as against text-related
intellectual development, she spoke of "grassroots intellectuals". (24) What studies of this nature seek to define is
that over and above the democratic processes of election and
decision making in unions, leadership, hegemony, consent,
identity-formation, solidarity and so on, is developed also in the
public world of mass gatherings. This creative process involves a
cluster of leaders who as creative cadres AND grassroots
intellectuals, through their voice and gesture, (or in mobilising
others’ talents) also create the vibrancy of social movements.
What is distinctive then in Natal is that a significant number of workers began combining their creativity with cultural work to lead in public contexts. Through this, a cultural movement began which brought about serious innovations. Some of these innovations occurred because of new demands on old forms of performance; yet also, some occurred because these people were in control of the new material and contexts at their disposal.

4. As mentioned earlier, performance-genres were not foreign to worker gatherings in the past. Indeed, their entertainment qualities were valued highly. What started transforming the role of such performances in trade union gatherings was the decision of worker leaders to introduce plays as part of their agendas. The Dunlop Play for example, was created to play a role in the "cognitive" mode of mass-gatherings. It was to communicate to workers and people the issues, the grievances and struggles in the factory. Since then, as Astrid Von Kotze has argued, worker plays were either intended as playing an educational role, or were meant to mobilise support over issues and campaigns. This jarred in many cases with worker expectations about meetings and about performance. From their expected entertainment value, these plays were departing to introduce new ideas and political discussion; they also demanded patience and time on their agendas. For the performers/cultural activists it meant a challenge to capture the interest and imagination of workers; so although the intentions always were to insert material through what we have identified as the "cognitive mode", the performances itself in order to sustain interest and to affirm solidarities started borrowing from each one. At worst, these plays were a static reenactment of issues and sloganeering, uneasily taking much of the gathering's time. At best, they were an entertaining combination of genres which succeeded in creating a vibrant rapport with spectators, and, eliciting popular participation.

Since 1983, and especially since the formation of the Durban Workers' Cultural Local, performance-genres proliferated and struggled to gain acceptability in mass gatherings. What occurred as a consequence was a tremendous collision, sometimes intended, but mostly unintended, of performance modes. Choirs were told by worker leaders, who had witnessed worker plays, that they must introduce issues in their songs and cut down on "hallelujah". Some did: they started singing in pious ways, with lowered and with mellifluous harmonies how they would smash the "amabunu", how they would pick up the spear of struggle and how powerful their organisations were. Examples of a strange,
The jarring quality in many of these products are manifold. The constant transference of performance modes and expectations from the one to the other created an accumulation of contradictions of a formal overdetermination which either caused a creative rupture and therefore brought about innovations or, it remained an unresolved bundle of tensions, in short, an unconvincing performance. It ushered though, a process of transformation and innovation that produced ensembles of cultural groups which innovated creatively and created new aesthetic models.

The Culture and Working Life Project organised over the Mayday period of 1989 a series of performances by worker, community and youth groups to mark the broader worker celebrations. During these, the project tried to invite those performers who would be representative of the main currents of worker and popular culture. For the three evenings, 205 grassroots performers confirmed both the grassroots vibrancy of the cultural revolution in Natal and the innovations which have been marked over time. In isolating three examples from choir work, from oral poetry and from plays, the features of innovations can be traced.

1. Choirwork: The Chesterville Youth Choir (involving approx. 14 youths of both sexes, from the ages of 12-19) is the most "explosive" and accomplished choir in Natal. They lack the harmonic range of the best worker choirs, like the Isithebe one, with its forty-strong voices, or the resonant contrasts of the KwaNzu youth choir which consists on the average of "older" youth. They make up for these limitations through their furious energy and performance-discipline. All these choirs have similar formal roots in church/school choir traditions. They all started from the pious "amakhwaya" style, with the women wearing blue skirts and white blouses and the men blue pants and white shirts. Their singing style ranged from the introspective hymnal harmonies of Wesleyan origin, mixed-up with mild forms of call and response styles. From the pious swaying their moves would break into some shuffling steps in the more joyous gospel moments. Since unions moved towards larger events dozens and dozens of these choirs have added a side-note of devotion in the meetings.

The Chesterville youth choir was started by the son of a trade unionist who with his schoolmates decided to sing liberation songs. Everyday after school they would meet at a church hall and practice. But then new experiences marked their lives—firstly,
their struggles in Chesterville around 1985-7 against the A-team and vigilantes, the violence that marked their streets, the funerals they attended, brought to them the roar of clashes and the marching rhythms of the toxi-toxi. Secondly, their parents' working class lives and organisations brought them through the shop-steward councils and locals to the Chairwood Trade Union Centre. There, they began inserting themselves in trade union cultural events organised by COSATU. Thirdly, they were caught and influenced by the poetry and ideas of Hlatshwayo and Gowabaza, which led them to incorporate poetry in the choral singing, and, in the case of a couple of them to compose their own struggle poems. Although the blue bottom-part of their attire remained, red youth-organisation T-shirts, or, COSATU track-suits took over the top half.

Once all these influences began operating in their performances, the older "amakhwaya" form was put in severe stresses and strains and out of them the form was exploded into a vibrant, fresh and exciting format. There are still many echoes of the older style, but, the liberation from "piety", the new militant stances, the disciplined and crisp precision of movements and the infectious energy of harmony and performance leave a definite mark on any gathering. What they sing about is nothing unusual: militant "struggle" songs, with themes and sounds familiar to most youth congress members. HOW they sing them has become a new model.

2. Oral Poetry - Madlizingyoka Ntanzi's poetry is an heroic celebration of worker and national struggles. He has been performing through metaphoric constructions that he learnt by listening to the elders in the Pongola region and later he had to memorise at school; but this poetry, delivered with energy and prowess lacks the critical wisdom of the imbongi form's history. A "wisdom" that had been sustained through for example, Mi Hlatshwayo's and Qabula's poems. His is an affirmative PRAISE-poetry: he celebrates the growth of unionism, praises the strength of workers and COSATU and praises political and national leaderships.(31)

His craftsmanship is NOT in the lines he delivers, but in the way he delivers them, and furthermore, in his extension of "performance-language", the politics of athletic gesture. His understanding of the rhythms of Zulu language, but also his intermixing it with songs, slogans (call and response) and dance, show an ability to exploit gatherings for good effect. Hlatshwayo has singled him out as particularly effective both in creativity and propaganda value. In short, he has mastered the relationship between the "affirmative" mode and the "festive" mode, which make his performances popular. But no
practical "wisdom" is communicated through his lines. His and Dumi Zulu's poems are similar and what the latter gains on Sunzi through a more powerful pair of lungs and timbre he loses when one compares the athleticism of the performances.

Yet this is not the only oral poetry communicated from the platforms. Many more poets eschew the metaphorical politics and sounds of the imbongi tradition and recite in both languages more direct political poems. Dozens of these poems occur in meetings, but very few are breaking new ground, or begin to match some such tradition initiated by black consciousness a decade back.

Plays: "Bambatha's Children" (32) created by SAWCO is a significant extension of their highly-regarded first play, "The Long March". It is simultaneously, a historical reconstruction of their communities' struggles against dispossession, it is a statement about their struggles against BTR Saracol, and it is, in its right, a continuous oral spectacle: they have managed to combine playful and humorous enthusiasm with memorable song and dance sequences. And, through that, they wove narrative after narrative of their epic stories: it speaks of the land dispossession after Bambatha's resistance, it speaks of the struggle to find new roots through labour-tenant, on "white" farms; it also shows the final dispossession towards strict wage-labour. Such broad themes are woven together via the stories of a family of the Zondi people.

In short, they have managed to craft together, cognitive, affirmative and festive moments in a powerful combination which communicates totally to a popular audience. Not only, do they respond in a cathartic way in support of the "movement" or the "struggle", but they come to know of histories, and sufferings unrecorded in books, and leave with stark images that refuse to leave them. What also remains is a new model, which now in its own right influences further work throughout Natal.

CONCLUSION

Examples can be multiplied to demonstrate shifts and changes. They can multiply better, or refuse to, if only people became more conscious of the materials, spaces and limits they are working with. Such a consciousness, adds more to attempts by people to control the world around them. An awareness of the
dynamics, possibilities and obstacles in the public life of events that crackle with megaphones, or, blast through mass amplification can only assist in the expanded reproduction of a substantive oral performativity. But an awareness also of the strains running through the cultural formations of gatherings will root performance better. The voices, sounds and gestures from worker gatherings will continue as long as the South African revolution propels people to gather, or to gather in different ways.
1. I would like to thank Astrid Von Kotze, for some of the ideas here were developed through intensive discussion and argument between us; also, Steve Krumberg and Debbie Bonnin.

2. The exhibition was hung at the HISTORY WORKSHOP, University of the Witwatersrand, 1987; it was expanded for the University of Durban-Westville's Culture Festival, 1988. Some of the photographs were printed in TRIQUARTERLY, no.60, Evanston, 1987.

3. See for e.g. my "Culture and Production: the Contradictions of Working Class Theatre", AFRICA PERSPECTIVE, New Series, nos 1&2, 1986. I attempt to develop a notion of "cultural spaces"; in a similar vein, but much broader in scope, P. Bourdieu has been looking at "champs" or "fields" through which symbolic capital is "invested" and controlled, see, DISTINCTIONS, New York, 1987.


5. See Sitas, "Contradictions...", op cit.

6. The work started from, "African Worker Responses on the East Rand to Changes in the Metal Industry", PhD thesis, University of the Witwatersrand, 1984. All the other 'Culture' essays and more, are to be brought out this year in THE FLIGHT OF THE GYALA-GYALA BIRD: LABOUR, POLITICS AND CULTURE IN NATAL.

7. Elisabeth Gunner et al


11. Observations like these come firstly from extensive exposure in these events primarily from cultural work. Also from content analysis of approx. 180 hours of documentary video footage from the Culture and Working Life Project.


13. Very little has been researched or written on mass gatherings, save asides in broader trade union analyses. J. Maree explores some of these implications for grassroots democracy, making the point that mass-participatory styles of organisation are not necessarily democratic. See, SAAW in the East London Area, SOUTH AFRICAN LABOUR BULLETIN, vol 7 nos 445, 1982, in "African Worker Responses", op cit. I also distinguish "grassroots control" from "grassroots democracy".


15. see J. Maree, op cit...

16. C. Shearing's critique of "rule" sociology and his insistence on "tropes".

17. S. Kromberg's masters thesis will begin addressing some of these issues in Natal.


19. See for instance, J. Kristeva's DESIRE IN LANGUAGE, New York, 1980 which starts a revival of Bakhtinian themes and links them to "desire".

20. J. P. Sartre's CRITIQUE OF DIALECTICAL REASON, London, 1973, has not been adequately examined for its powerful insights on the sociology of gatherings and action. His insights have been lost through the broader philosophical critique of his dialectics, but no serious engagement has been forthcoming. His, and E. Canetti's CROWDS AND POWER, remain neglected texts.

22. See, Sitas, "African Workers" op cit...

23. N. Ngoasheng, 'We Organise and Educate... Cultural Intellectuals in the Labour Movement', STAFFRIDER, vol. 8 nos 3&4, 1989.


25. Sitas, op cit, GWALA-GWALA...

26. On the Dunlop Play, see, Von Kotze, op cit; and A.T. Gqabula, A WORKING LIFE, CRUEL BEYOND BELIEF, Durban, 1989, pp83ff


28. The documentary footage collected by Culture and Working Life has at least ten such choirs in action. A striking demonstration occurs on the VNS documentary: COMPELLING FREEDOM, where two such choirs sing the most militant songs in the most pious ways.

29. An audio recording was made for the CWLP project by Dan Wyman and Dave Marks; a video one, by Cleo D'Hotman and by Stefanie Schycholdt from AVA.


32. "Bambatha's Children", does not have a script, it was created totally through oral performances. Footage of the play is scattered throughout many documentaries: try, the BBC, Channel Four's, SINGING THE CHANGES, produced by Angus Gibson, 1988. It has received widespread praises in all the progressive press. See also INKULA, no. 2, 1989; it is in the middle of a controversy about "elegant primitivism" started by Siphiwe Nene, in WRITERS' NOTEBOOK, vol. 1, 1989; a response by Bonginkosi Kzimande
followed in vol. 1 no. 2. An audio recording has been produced for SAVCO, by Braungart and yours truly in 1989.