# TABLE OF CONTENTS

DECLARATION i

ABSTRACT ii

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS iii

DETAILED TABLE OF CONTENTS 2

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 8

CHAPTER 1
Introduction: The transformation of South African administrative law 10

CHAPTER 2
Development of the grounds of review 44

CHAPTER 3
Access to judicial remedies 113

CHAPTER 4
Towards a substantive style of judicial reasoning 150

CHAPTER 5
The completion of administrative law 188

CHAPTER 6
Conclusion: An assessment of the transformation of South African administrative law since 1994 231

BIBLIOGRAPHY 240

TABLE OF CASES 258

APPENDIX 1
Constitutional rights to administrative justice 280

APPENDIX 2
The Promotion of Administrative Justice Act 282

APPENDIX 3
The Breakwater Declaration 293
# DETAILED TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>DECLARATION</td>
<td>i</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ABSTRACT</td>
<td>ii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS</td>
<td>iii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TABLE OF CONTENTS</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER 1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction: The transformation of South African administrative law</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1 Background to the thesis</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2 Nature and scope of the thesis</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(a) Title and aim of the thesis</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(b) Research question to be explored</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(c) Methodology</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3 Terminology</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(a) Transformation rather than reform</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(b) Administrative law</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.4 The transformative Constitution: Towards a culture of justification</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(a) A transformative Constitution</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(b) A culture of justification</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(c) The promise for administrative law</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.5 Achieving a culture of justification: Four aspirations for South</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>African administrative law</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(a) Well-developed grounds of review</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(b) Improved access to judicial remedies</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(c) A more substantive style of judicial reasoning</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(d) The completion of administrative law</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.6 Outline of the study</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(a) Chapter 1</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(b) Chapter 2</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(c) Chapter 3</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(d) Chapter 4</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER 2
Development of the grounds of review

2.1 Introduction

2.2 Lawfulness

(a) Introduction and overview
(b) Dishonesty and the relevance of motive
(c) Review for error of law
(d) Review for mistake of fact
   (i) Jurisdictional facts
   (ii) Non-jurisdictional facts
(e) Conclusion

2.3 Reasonableness

(a) Introduction and overview
(b) The pre-democratic law
(c) The constitutional era
   (i) The elements of ‘reasonable’ administrative action
   (ii) The interpretation of section 6(2)(h) of the PAJA
   (iii) The distinction between review and appeal
(d) Reasonableness and the principle of legality
(e) Conclusion

2.4 Procedural fairness

(a) Introduction and overview
(b) The application of fairness at common law
   (i) The classification of functions
   (ii) Rejection of the classification of functions
   (iii) The rise of the legitimate expectation doctrine
(c) The constitutional era
   (i) Section 3(1) of the PAJA
   (ii) Determination or deprivation?
   (iii) The application of fairness in multi-staged decision-making
   (iv) The development of the legitimate expectation doctrine
2.5 Reasons
(a) Introduction and overview
(b) The treatment of reasons at common law
(c) Section 24(c) of the interim Constitution
(d) The 1996 Constitution and the PAJA
   (i) Section 5 of the PAJA
   (ii) The development of the concept of ‘adequate’ reasons
(e) Conclusion

CHAPTER 3
Access to Judicial Remedies
3.1 Introduction
3.2 Standing
   (a) Introduction and overview
   (b) Standing at common law
   (c) Standing under the Bill of Rights
   (d) The courts’ treatment of standing
      (i) Anyone acting in their own interest
      (ii) Acting on behalf of another person who cannot act in their own name
      (iii) Acting as a member of, or in the interest of, a group or class of persons
      (iv) Acting in the public interest
      (v) An association acting in the interest of its members
   (e) Conclusion
3.2 Legislative obstacles to judicial redress
   (a) Introduction and overview
   (b) The main legislative obstacles
      (i) Ouster clauses
      (ii) Limitation clauses
      (iii) Finality clauses
      (iv) Indemnity and amnesty clauses
      (v) Subjective language
(c) Section 7 of the PAJA
   (i) The 180-day time limit 141
   (ii) The duty to exhaust internal remedies 143
(d) Conclusion 149

CHAPTER 4
Towards a substantive style of judicial reasoning 150
4.1 Introduction 150
4.2 Formalism in South Africa’s legal culture 151
   (a) The autonomous legal order and the separation of law and politics 152
   (b) Judicial formalism under apartheid 154
   (c) Formalism and the demands of a culture of justification 155
4.3 Formalism in administrative law before and after 1994 158
   (a) The distinction between review and appeal and its ramifications 158
      (i) The pre-democratic era 159
      (ii) Developments since 1994 161
   (b) The classification of functions 164
      (i) The pre-democratic era 164
      (ii) Developments since 1994 165
   (c) The rules of standing 168
      (i) The pre-democratic era 168
      (ii) Developments since 1994 169
   (d) The public/private distinction and the treatment of contracts in
      administrative law 170
      (i) The pre-democratic era 170
      (ii) Developments since 1994 172
4.4 The PAJA: A return to conceptualism? 175
   (a) The statutory definition of administrative action 177
   (b) Sections 3, 4 and 5 of the PAJA 181
4.5 Judicial steps away from formalism 182
   (a) The principle of legality 182
   (b) The development of a doctrine of deference 183
4.6 Conclusion 187
CHAPTER 5
The completion of administrative law

5.1 Introduction 188

5.2 Judicial review 190
   (a) The prominence of judicial review 191
   (b) The basis and nature of review 193
   (c) The possibility of non-judicial review 196

5.3 Administrative appeals 198
   (a) The need for reform before 1994 199
   (b) Developments since 1994 201

5.4 Legislative oversight 203
   (a) The enactment of legislation 204
   (b) The responsibility of Ministers to Parliament 205
   (c) Parliamentary scrutiny of delegated legislation 206
   (d) Reports to Parliament 207

5.5 Public participation 208
   (a) Public participation under the democratic Constitution 209
   (b) Public participation and the PAJA 210

5.6 Ombudsman institutions 212
   (a) The Public Protector 213
   (b) The Auditor-General 217

5.7 Access to information 219
   (a) The constitutional right of access to information 220
   (b) The Promotion of Access to Information Act 221
       (i) Access to state-held information 222
       (ii) Access to information in private hands 224

5.8 Missed opportunities and the need for further reform 226

5.9 Conclusion 229

CHAPTER 6
Conclusion: An assessment of the transformation of South African administrative law since 1994 231

6.1 The aspirations of a transformed administrative law 231

6.2 The transformation of the law since 1994 234
(a) The development of the grounds of review 234
(b) Improved access to judicial remedies 236
(c) A more substantive style of judicial reasoning 237
(d) The completion of administrative law 237

6.3 Conclusion 238

BIBLIOGRAPHY 240

TABLE OF CASES 258

APPENDIX 1
Constitutional rights to administrative justice 280

APPENDIX 2
The Promotion of Administrative Justice Act 282

APPENDIX 3
The Breakwater Declaration 293
# LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AAT</td>
<td>Administrative Appeals Tribunal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACJ</td>
<td>Acting Chief Justice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ADJP</td>
<td>Acting Deputy Judge President</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AJ</td>
<td>Acting Judge / Justice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AJA</td>
<td>Acting Judge of Appeal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AJP</td>
<td>Acting Judge President</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ANC</td>
<td>African National Congress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ARC</td>
<td>Administrative Review Council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AS</td>
<td>Annual Survey of South African Law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AZAPO</td>
<td>Azanian People’s Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CCMA</td>
<td>Commission for Conciliation, Mediation and Arbitration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>cf</td>
<td>compare</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CJ</td>
<td>Chief Justice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DCJ</td>
<td>Deputy Chief Justice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DJP</td>
<td>Deputy Judge President</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DP</td>
<td>Deputy President</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ed(s)</td>
<td>editor(s), edition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>et al</td>
<td>and others</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>et seq</td>
<td>and the following</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ff</td>
<td>and following pages</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GG</td>
<td>Government Gazette</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GN</td>
<td>Government Notice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICASA</td>
<td>Independent Communications Authority of South Africa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICD</td>
<td>Independent Complaints Directorate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IDASA</td>
<td>Institute for Democracy in South Africa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ILJ</td>
<td>Industrial Law Journal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>J</td>
<td>Judge, Justice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JA</td>
<td>Judge of Appeal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JP</td>
<td>Judge President</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
MEC  Member of the Executive Council
P     President
PAIA  Promotion of Access to Information Act 2 of 2000
PAJA  Promotion of Administrative Justice Act 3 of 2000
para(s) paragraph(s)
Proc  Proclamation
reg(s) regulation(s)
RSA   Republic of South Africa
SA    South Africa
s(s)  section(s)
SAJHR South African Journal on Human Rights
SALC  South African Law Commission
SALJ  South African Law Journal
SARFU South African Rugby Football Union
Stell LR Stellenbosch Law Review
subsec(s) subsection(s)
THRHR Tydskrif vir Hedendaagse Romeins-Hollandse Reg
TSAR  Tydskrif vir Suid-Afrikaanse Reg
VwVfG Verwaltungsverfahrensgestez