THE ISSUES WITH TRANSNATIONAL
FAST MOVING CONSUMER GOODS SUPPLY CHAINS
ORIGINATING IN INDIA AND SOUTH AFRICA

Dinesh Kumar

A thesis submitted to the Graduate School of Business Administration, University of Witwatersrand, in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

Johannesburg
July, 2010
ABSTRACT

The use of transnational supply chains has been perceived as the “mantra for success” in the era of globalisation, changing customer demographics and demand. The fast-moving consumer goods (FMCG) industry has also joined this bandwagon, along with other industries, such as the high-technology industry, in order to gain competitive advantage. However, the trade regimes of developing (emerging) economies have played a significant role in establishing the context for the supply chains originating in a particular country, and therefore in containing the foreseen benefits accruing from supply chains becoming a transnational process.

This thesis was focused on identifying issues within selected transnational FMCG supply chains originating in India and South Africa. It also identified the steps that supply chain managers were taking to address these issues. It also proposed a framework for supply chain operating model to address the identified issues.

The researcher used a combination of analytical models to investigate the different aspects of the various transnational supply chains. To examine the underlying aspects of the various FMCG supply chains, a typology model in conjunction with an operational model, a financial model and a governance model were used. Supply chain operations reference (SCOR), an operational analytical model, was used extensively in this thesis. Detailed typology and process flow maps specific to transnational FMCG supply chains were also developed.
The collective case study approach was used as the research methodology. A total of four cases spanning two countries – India and South Africa – and dealing with two product segments (packaged food and personal care products) were studied. Data for the study was collected through primary sources (in multiple face-to-face interviews) and secondary sources (from case-specific documents and reports).

After the data was analysed, it was found that the various supply chains in the FMCG industry displayed similar typologies and issues, some of which were unique to each country. The typology of the transnational supply chains for all four cases was very similar in terms of their distribution structure setup, product life cycle, sourcing models combination, customer relations, marketing methods and degree of globalisation. However, in both countries, the supply chain issues identified in the personal care segment, such as product proliferation and supplier unreliability, were different from those identified in the packaged food segment, such as strict food-related regulatory laws and greater manufacturing complexities. Some of the typical issues affecting local supply chains, such as the bullwhip effect and lower supply chain adaptability, were not evident in the transnational supply chains.

The steps supply chain managers were taking to address these issues, such as standardising processes and implementing new technology, were found to be similar in all cases. However, in India, supply chain managers were also focusing on government initiatives, establishing contracts with suppliers and customers, and implementing supply chain policies, while in South Africa they were also
focusing on improving supply chain skills, improving branding in transnational markets and implementing foreign exchange controls.

The overall conclusion was that there was considerable potential for achieving competitive advantage by setting up transnational supply chains, provided that the problems identified within transnational supply chains were adequately addressed by supply chain managers. However, in some scenarios, the steps taken in terms of available best practice models resulted in a further set of issues arising.

The identification of the issues facing supply chain managers and the development of a proposed framework of operating model to address the identified issues with transnational FMCG supply chains were the most significant contributions of this research study.

**Keywords:** supply chain, FMCG industry, transnational, supply chain managers, India, South Africa.
DECLARATION

I, Dinesh Kumar declare that this thesis is, unless otherwise indicated, my own unaided work. It is submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in the University of Witwatersrand, Johannesburg, South Africa. It has not been submitted before for any degree or examination at any other university.

Dinesh Kumar
Johannesburg
05th July 2010
DEDICATION

This thesis is dedicated to my mother, Bimla Bansal for a lifetime of understanding, camaraderie, love and every possible sacrifice she has ever made to provide me with the best possible opportunities.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

My thanks go firstly to the most enduring supervisor, Professor Neil Duffy, who has unstintingly shared his knowledge and insights throughout the duration of this thesis.

I would like to sincerely thank the following people for making a contribution to this thesis:

Prof. David Dickinson for his continuous feedback to improve the research proposal.

Mr. Anil Agarwal for his efforts and assistance in enabling key contacts during the field research study in India.

Mr. Mohan Saxena for his time and support during the research study at Dabur India (Pty) Limited, India.

Mr. Paul Dallas for his time and support during the research study at Amka Products (Pty) Limited, South Africa.

Mr. William Sears for his time and support during the research study at Anglo Vaal Industries Limited, South Africa.

Mr. B.P. Agarwal for his support and time during the research study at Surya Foods (Pty) Limited, India.
I would also like to thank the love of my life, my wife, Mahima for her continuous support, complete dedication and love while managing our first baby, Rohan (born on 28 April 2009).

I am also grateful to the role model in my life, my father, Shri Krishan Bansal, and my remarkable sisters, Madhu Bala and Poonam Bansal for their encouragement and selfless support.

And last but not the least, thanks to all my friends who supported and encouraged me throughout the duration of this thesis.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Contents</th>
<th>Page no.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ABSTRACT</td>
<td>II</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DECLARATION</td>
<td>V</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DEDICATION</td>
<td>VI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS</td>
<td>VII</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TABLE OF CONTENTS</td>
<td>IX</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF APPENDICES</td>
<td>XIII</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF TABLES</td>
<td>XV</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF FIGURES</td>
<td>XVI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS</td>
<td>XVIII</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1. INTRODUCTION .............................................. 1

1.1 Background .............................................. 1

1.2 Rationale for the study ............................... 6

1.3 Problem statement ...................................... 9

1.4 Research sub-questions ................................ 10

1.5 Contribution to the body of knowledge .............. 11

1.6 Outline of the report .................................. 12

1.7 Summary ................................................ 15

2. LITERATURE REVIEW ........................................ 17

2.1 Supply chain ............................................ 18

2.1.1 Definition ........................................... 18

2.1.2 Components ........................................... 22

2.1.3 Role of a supply chain ............................... 24

2.1.4 Supply chain organisational structure ............ 26

2.2 Fast-moving consumer goods industry ............... 31

2.2.1 Characteristics .................................... 31

2.2.2 Fast-moving consumer goods supply chains ....... 34
LIST OF APPENDICES

Appendix A: Information from cases ............................................................... 264
  A1: Introductory letter ........................................................................ 264

Appendix B: Protocol of the interviews ...................................................... 266
  B1: Supply chain setup of the cases ..................................................... 266
  B2: Specific information obtained from the cases ................................. 268

Appendix C: Consistency matrix ................................................................. 271

Appendix D: Additional documents .......................................................... 273
  D1: Detailed literature map ................................................................. 273
  D2: Taxation setup for supply chains in India ...................................... 274
  D3: CLS linked currencies (as of Oct 2009) ........................................ 275
  D4: Difference between transactional, information sharing and collaborative partnerships ........................................ 276
  D5: Collaboration ............................................................................. 277
  D6: Information collected from cases .................................................. 278
    D6.1: Supply chain roles from the cases .......................................... 278
    D6.2: Involvement of roles with the supply chain activities ............... 279
    D6.3: Quantitative data obtained from research .............................. 280
  D7: SKU rationalisation ................................................................. 281
  D8: Process flow setup .................................................................... 282
  D9: Trade-off between inventory and service level .............................. 284
  D10: Details on other models .............................................................. 285
    D10.1: Use of technology ................................................................. 285
    D10.2: Adherence to international regulations .................................... 287
    D10.3: Supply chain process model ................................................ 288
    D10.4: Supply chain operating model ............................................. 289
    D10.5: Supply chain organisational structure ................................... 290
    D10.6: Regular supply chain analysis ............................................. 291
    D10.7: Supply chain risk management ............................................. 292
    D10.8: Environmental footprint ...................................................... 293
    D10.9: International contract management ...................................... 294
D10.10: Integrated business planning ................................................................. 295
D10.11: Lean operations ..................................................................................... 296
D10.12: Working capital reduction ..................................................................... 297
D10.13: Outsourcing ......................................................................................... 298
D10.14: Integrated planning model .................................................................... 299
# LIST OF TABLES

Table 2-1: Initial definitions of supply chain .................................................. 18
Table 2-2: Three levels of supply chain ............................................................... 20
Table 2-3: Supply chain organisational structure .............................................. 28
Table 2-4: Typology for fast-moving consumer goods supply chain ................. 37
Table 2-5: Differences in typology for fast-moving consumer goods and high-technology industries .................................................. 41
Table 2-6: India at a glance ................................................................................. 49
Table 2-7: South Africa at a glance ..................................................................... 55
Table 2-8: Expected growth rate for key positions in consumer goods industry ... 65
Table 2-9: Roles and responsibilities of a supply chain manager ...................... 66
Table 2-10: Overall supply chain metrics (financial) ......................................... 76
Table 2-11: Overall supply chain metrics (customer) ......................................... 76
Table 2-12: Overall supply chain metrics (internal) .......................................... 76
Table 2-13: Overall supply chain metrics (learning & innovation) .................... 76
Table 2-14: Comparison criteria for the operational performance models .......... 77
Table 2-15: Definitions for supply chain performance attributes ..................... 79
Table 2-16: Elements of financial indicators ..................................................... 80
Table 2-17: Definitions of different types of beyond-nation's supply chains ........ 86
Table 2-18: Risks with low-cost country sourcing .............................................. 90
Table 2-19: Model used in the research ............................................................ 103
Table 3-1: Setup of case studies ...................................................................... 111
Table 3-2: Data approach for case studies ....................................................... 116
Table 4-1: Historical growth for AVI ................................................................. 130
Table 5-1: Supply chain setups of the cases .................................................... 133
Table 6-1: Decoupling points in the supply chains .......................................... 186
Table 6-2: Measurement criterion for different types of supply chain ............. 200
Table 6-3: Issues with the best practice models .............................................. 210
Table 7-1: General links between proposition, finding and comments .......... 221
LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1-1: The research framework ................................................................. 15
Figure 2-1: Overview of the literature study ...................................................... 17
Figure 2-2: Components of supply chain ......................................................... 23
Figure 2-3: Supply chains: past and future ....................................................... 25
Figure 2-4: Total supply chain cost calculation ................................................ 29
Figure 2-5: Total supply chain cost calculation (simple form) .......................... 30
Figure 2-6: Leading fast-moving consumer goods firms (worldwide) ............... 31
Figure 2-7: Leading retail firms (worldwide) .................................................... 33
Figure 2-8: Supply chain functions of a fast-moving consumer goods firm ........ 34
Figure 2-9: Supply chain activities in a consumer goods supply chain .............. 35
Figure 2-10: Relationship between business functions and supply chain levels .... 36
Figure 2-11: Supply chain objectives of fast-moving consumer goods industry .... 38
Figure 2-12: Country map of India ................................................................. 47
Figure 2-13: GDP for India (in INR billion) ...................................................... 50
Figure 2-14: Indian urban and rural growth rates for personal care products ....... 53
Figure 2-15: Country map of South Africa ...................................................... 54
Figure 2-16: Gross domestic product growth in South Africa ......................... 57
Figure 2-17: Comparative export indicators between India and South Africa ....... 59
Figure 2-18: Logistics cost as a percentage of GDP ......................................... 60
Figure 2-19: Trade to GDP ratio ................................................................. 61
Figure 2-20: Inventory days in Brazil, India and South Africa ......................... 63
Figure 2-21: Skilled labour gap ................................................................. 64
Figure 2-22: Competency model for supply chain managers ......................... 68
Figure 2-23: Supply chain KPIs shared among supply chain functions .......... 70
Figure 2-24: Resource-event-agent links ...................................................... 72
Figure 2-25: SCOR management processes ................................................... 74
Figure 2-26: Balanced scorecard framework ................................................. 75
Figure 2-27: Supply chain governance model .............................................. 83
Figure 2-28: Carbon emission from India and South Africa ............................ 97
# LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3PL</td>
<td>Third-Party Logistics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4PL</td>
<td>Fourth-Party Logistics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Amka</td>
<td>Amka Products (Pty) Limited</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APICS</td>
<td>Association for Operations Management earlier, American Productivity and Inventory Control Society</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APS</td>
<td>Advanced Planning and Scheduling</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ASEAN</td>
<td>Association of South-East Asian Nations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AVI</td>
<td>Anglo Vaal Industries Limited</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B2B</td>
<td>Business-to-Business</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B2C</td>
<td>Business-to-Consumer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BIMSTEC</td>
<td>Bangladesh, India, Myanmar, Sri Lanka, Thailand, Bhutan and Nepal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BSC</td>
<td>Balanced Scorecard</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CEO</td>
<td>Chief Executive Officer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CFA</td>
<td>Carrying &amp; Forwarding Agent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CII</td>
<td>Confederation of Indian Industry</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CLS</td>
<td>Continuous Linked Settlement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COGS</td>
<td>Cost of Goods Sold</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CPFR</td>
<td>Collaborative Planning Forecasting and Replenishment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CR</td>
<td>Continuous Replenishment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dabur</td>
<td>Dabur India (Pty) Limited</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DC</td>
<td>Distribution Centre</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DPM</td>
<td>Distribution Planning Model</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DRP</td>
<td>Distribution Requirement Planning</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
ECR  Efficient Customer Response
EDI  Electronic Data Interchange
ERP  Enterprise Resource Planning
EU  European Union
FCL  Full Container Load
FDI  Foreign Direct Investment
FMCG  Fast-Moving Consumer Goods
FTL  Full Truck Load
GDP  Gross Domestic Product
Hi-Tech  High-Technology
HR  Human Resources
IBP  Integrated Business Planning
IBSA  India-Brazil-South Africa
INR  Indian Rupees
ISO  International Organisation for Standardisation
IT  Information Technology
ITAC  International Trade Administration Commission
JIT  Just-in-Time
JV  Joint Venture
KPI  Key Performance Indicator
LCCS  Low-Cost Country Sourcing
MRP  Manufacturing Resource Planning
MTO  Make-to-Order
MTS  Make-to-Stock
NAFTA  North American Free Trade Agreement
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acronym</th>
<th>Full Form</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>NPI</td>
<td>New Product Introduction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PoD</td>
<td>Proof-of-Delivery</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PoS</td>
<td>Point-of-Sale</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>QR</td>
<td>Quantitative Restrictions, also Quick Response</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R&amp;D</td>
<td>Research and Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>REA</td>
<td>Resource-Event-Agent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RFID</td>
<td>Radio Frequency Identification Data</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ROI</td>
<td>Return on Investment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RTA</td>
<td>Regional Trade Agreement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S&amp;OP</td>
<td>Sales and Operations Planning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SACU</td>
<td>South African Customs Union</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SADC</td>
<td>South African Development Community</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCC</td>
<td>Supply Chain Council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCM</td>
<td>Supply Chain Management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCOR</td>
<td>Supply Chain Operations Reference</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SEA</td>
<td>South-East Asia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SEZ</td>
<td>Special Economic Zones</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SG&amp;A</td>
<td>Selling, General &amp; Administrative Expenses</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SKU</td>
<td>Stock-Keeping Unit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SLA</td>
<td>Service Level Agreement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Surya</td>
<td>Surya Foods (Pty) Limited</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SWOT</td>
<td>Strength, Weakness, Opportunity and Threat</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOM</td>
<td>Target Operating Model</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TSCC</td>
<td>Total Supply Chain Cost</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UK</td>
<td>United Kingdom</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abbreviation</td>
<td>Description</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>US</td>
<td>United States</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VAT</td>
<td>Value-Added Tax</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VMI</td>
<td>Vendor Managed Inventory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VP</td>
<td>Vice President</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WIP</td>
<td>Work-in-Progress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WTO</td>
<td>World Trade Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ZAR</td>
<td>South African Rand</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
1. INTRODUCTION

1.1 Background

Goldratt & Cox (2004:10) stated in their book, *The Goal* that, "the aim of an organisation is to make money."

An organisation’s operational activities guide both its bottom line and top line and influence financial aspect of its activities. The focus on the inter-linkages between these operational activities forced firms to start concentrating on the interrelationships among the silo functions of the firm and among the firm, its markets, its industry and the national economy (Forrester, 1958). Supply chains emerged in the 1970s and 1980s as the platform to integrate all the operational functions and to achieve the organisational aim stated above (Fisher, 1997, Porter, 1998). A “supply chain”, as a concept, was earlier represented by the term “physical distribution”¹ (Drucker, 1962) and later by the term “logistics”² (Firth (ed.), 1981).

Supply chains encapsulate the flow of information and materials/goods among different entities such as customer, manufacturer, supplier, logistics service provider etc. Often, these entities are legally separated. Christopher (1986) stated that the key driver of the supply chain was to co-ordinate and integrate these entities in order to achieve competitiveness for an organisation.

---

¹ Drucker (1962) described physical distribution as "the economy’s dark continent" and as a neglected sore point, although it was also identified as the most promising area of business.
² "Logistics", as a term, was more popular than "supply chain" (Firth (ed.), 1981).
The fast-moving consumer goods (FMCG) industry is a quick, agile industry with a wide range of products (Kumar, 2002). This was confirmed by Unilever (2007:5), a leading FMCG firm, which stated that “150 million times a day, in 150 countries, people use our products at key moments of their day.”

Such a huge industry was easily recognised by its customers and its supply chains were seen as a role model for other industries (Armstrong, Enright, Lempres & Rauch, 1996). FMCG industry supply chains generated innovative ideas and a framework for the industry because of its high volumes of product flows, closer interaction with its customers, less complex manufacturing processes and the dominance of retailers (to some extent). Some of its ideas such as point-of-sale (PoS) solutions, transport milk runs and subcontracted manufacturing were adopted by other industries.

However, a very complex underlying supply chain setup was identified during this study. Despite the innovative ideas generated, FMCG supply chains were faced with unique challenges and issues (Kumar, 2002). Some of the issues, such as the hockey stick effect, the bullwhip effect, and higher returns and transit losses, were widely evident in these supply chains.

In order to achieve the organisational goal of making money, supply chain managers tried to find cheaper suppliers, low-cost manufacturing facilities, strategically located distribution centres (DCs) and highly profitable or high-volume customer markets. Bartlett & Ghoshal (1998) stated that supply chains often
extended beyond the borders of a country in order to encapsulate these features and became known as "transnational supply chains".

Transnational as a term is most commonly substituted by the terms "global", "international", "overseas", etc. Transnational concepts came into existence when organisations started conducting worldwide businesses in the 1950s (Clee & Di Scipio, 1959, Clee & Sachtjen, 1964). Firms started expanding their footprints into the international arena\(^3\) in order to tap into the worldwide customer base (Smith, 2008); however, these practices also brought a new set of challenges.

It was imperative to clarify the term "transnational" before discussing the issues around transnational supply chains. The term "transnational" was rather ambiguous and the literature did not clearly define it. Could a firm with one sales branch overseas or a firm with a manufacturing establishment in a foreign country be considered transnational? Farrell (2004) stated that "off-shoring"\(^4\) was not considered as being transnational. Also, another question that arose was, were transnational (global) markets creating transnational minded firms?\(^5\) Denise (2009) stated that transnational firms displayed enormous differences, as they were inevitably linked to the political and economic setup in their home countries.

When supply chains became transnational, a further set of supply chain issues emerged that were different from those faced by local supply chains. It was found from the literature that, while trying to achieve the organisational goal,

\(^3\) Smith (2008) identified "international expansion" in terms of supplier base and marketplace.
\(^4\) "Off-shoring" referred to subcontracting a service overseas.
\(^5\) Some other questions raised were: do firms' practices match the grand rhetoric of globalisation? Are global firms overwhelming the efforts of nations to preserve their distinctive identities? (Denise, 2009)
transnational supply chains often lost sight of other issues that arose in the process of “transnationalisation”. Factors such as pricing irregularities\textsuperscript{6} (Acker, 2009), cultural differences (Jiang, 2002), political systems, trade agreements\textsuperscript{7} (Blanchard, 2009), stretched transportation lines, reduced velocity (Londe, 2006), quality control (Resse, 2009) and the taxation systems of the various countries involved led to issues such as long lead times (Christopher, Towill & Peck, 2006), less visibility\textsuperscript{8} (Kumar & Bala, 2009), poor product safety and loss of trust. This thesis was focused only on tangible issues identified within transnational supply chains, not ethical issues (such as loss of trust, corporate responsibility, etc., which are suggested as future research areas).

Supply chains have evolved over a number of years and have also adopted new techniques and philosophies to tackle the new issues that they faced (Ballou, 2007). Supply chain managers became more responsive to a transnational operating environment by acting as global economists\textsuperscript{9} (Bovet, 2008). The management of such transnational issues as long lead times, supplier relationships, cost containment, skills and processes became important in the life of a transnational supply chain manager.

Supply chains in developing countries were evolving, but were still not fully matured compared to those of developed countries. Dimitrijevic (2009) stated, however, that the term “developing” or “emerging” countries was obsolete. In 2008, the gross domestic product (GDP) of India was higher than that of

\textsuperscript{6} The product pricing was not aligned between the local and the global supply chains (Acker, 2009).
\textsuperscript{7} A high complexity was associated with the understanding and the leveraging of trade agreements (Blanchard, 2009).
\textsuperscript{8} It resulted in high supply chain risks - as not knowing - where is your delivery? (Kumar & Bala, 2009).
\textsuperscript{9} This role involved identifying opportunities in the areas of pricing, sourcing, making and moving.
Germany.\textsuperscript{10} Also in 2008, the combined trade of Brazil, India, China and South Africa was as large as that of Europe. India and South Africa were spending a higher percentage of their GDPs on logistics, which reflected the importance of supply chains to these countries (World Trade Organisation, 2009a).

A new set of issues, such as country-specific organisational structures (Denise, 2009) and parallel trade\textsuperscript{11} (Mosquera, 2009), were identified in developing countries. The skills required by supply chain managers to manage these transnational issues were perceived to be different from the ones that they used for local supply chains and in developed countries.

\footnotesize{\textsuperscript{10} It was based on purchasing power parity index.}

\footnotesize{\textsuperscript{11} Parallel trade, a common phenomenon in pharmaceutical industry, involved product moving across borders through grey channels potentially risking safety and eroding margin. This phenomenon was evident in FMCG industry too.}
1.2 Rationale for the study

One rationale for this study was to fill the gap that existed in the field of transnational supply chain management, i.e. that of identifying and comparing issues within transnational FMCG supply chains originating in developing countries, such as India and South Africa. Logistics (supply chain) was seen as a key aspect of business in South Africa (King (ed.), 2008) and comparing the South African experience with that in a similar developing country¹² in order to establish common trends and findings seemed to be a worthwhile focus of study.

The rationale for this study was based on the following central components:

- While the basic supply chain issues were well understood in the context of local FMCG industries, the transnational issues within this industry had not been fully ascertained. Therefore, the study of transnational FMCG supply chains in order to identify their specific issues will contribute to knowledge in the supply chain field.

- Country-specific regulations have an impact on trade between a specific country and its partners. A study of the microeconomic impacts of the trade regime on supply chains will identify the transformation requirements from the point of view of both the government and FMCG organisations.

- The trade regimes of the various developing nations play a major role in not only the design, but also the complexity of any supply chain. This thesis also holds that the issues pertaining to the transnational supply chains of a developing country such as India or South Africa were different from those of

¹² In terms of GDP and growth rate (World Bank, 2005).
a developed country such as the United States (US) and needed to be studied in their own terms.

- Parallel to transnational supply chains, local supply chains were already in existence. Therefore, a qualitative case study approach to identify the differences between transnational and local supply chains will create an information repository for further detailed research.

- A composite framework to identify the issues with respect to the operational and financial performance of transnational supply chains was felt to be necessary. Such a framework would help to clarify the many complex issues on which transnational supply chain managers must focus in order to ensure the survival of their operations.

- Central to the establishment of each of the case studies to be examined was the identification of the steps that supply chain managers were taking to address the issues that were identified. The analysis of these case studies will provide a range of information to supply chain professionals related to new strategies, ideas and programmes to tackle these issues.

- Comparing strategies and narratives of resilience and innovation among the cases can contribute to a deepening of the discourse on the development of supply chain management practice. This approach also holds that practice and experience should contribute to theory, and that the lower, execution level should be linked to the higher, strategic level.

A further reason for conducting this research was to address those discouraging questions that many transnational supply chains faced, particularly in the light of the current (year 2008/9) economic crisis and ever-changing customer demands:
• Why do so many organisations fail when they became transnational?
• What has hindered them in achieving the advantages of becoming transnational?  
• Are managers taking the right steps to neutralise the impacts of the issues that they face?
• Are the best practice frameworks adopted by organisations suited to addressing the needs of transnational supply chains?
• Can the FMCG industry, which works with thin margins and high volumes, afford to take the risk of reducing velocity in the supply chains of its constituent firms when they become transnational?
• What other risks are carried by supply chain managers as their supply chains become transnational?
• What is the common experience among similar countries with respect to the strategies that their firms adopt when facing these issues?
• Is there a framework for operating model of transnational supply chains?
1.3 Problem statement

In light of the discussion in the previous sections, the researcher decided to study and analyse the issues affecting transnational FMCG supply chains and to compare them in the developing country environment in terms of the impact of the trade regimes of selected countries on their supply chains.

Also, the mitigation strategies and actions used by supply chains managers to deal with the specific issues that they faced needed to be studied.

Hence, the research question addressed by this research study was:

What issues were supply chains managers facing within transnational supply chains in FMCG industry originating in India and South Africa?

However, no attempt was made to analyse the competence of supply chain managers or to understand the quality of the steps/decisions that they were taking to address the issues that they were facing. These aspects would be good areas of research for future studies.

This research study also focussed on identifying and developing a framework for supply chain operating model for transnational FMCG supply chains.
1.4 Research sub-questions

To provide a framework for addressing the research question, the following research sub-questions were formulated:

a. What was the typology of FMCG supply chains originating in India and South Africa?

b. What were the issues facing transnational FMCG supply chains originating in India and South Africa?

c. What steps were supply chain managers taking to address the identified issues within transnational FMCG supply chains originating in India and South Africa?
1.5 Contribution to the body of knowledge

This thesis is intended to contribute the following to the existing body of knowledge:

1. The identification of a typology of transnational FMCG supply chains for India and South Africa. This typology could be adopted for other similar developing countries.

2. The identification of valid and proven supply chain analytical models to analyse FMCG supply chains.

3. The creation of detailed process maps that could be used by any transnational FMCG supply chain.

4. The creation of an in-depth data repository for transnational supply chains from the four case studies used in this research.

5. The definition of a framework to compare trade regimes and their impact on supply chains.

6. The identification of the elements of the transnational environment that were raising issues within FMCG supply chains.

7. The identification of the issues within transnational FMCG supply chains.

8. The identification of the changing requirements of the roles and responsibilities of supply chain managers.

9. The identification of steps that supply chain managers were taking to address the issues that they faced within transnational FMCG supply chains.

10. The development of a framework of supply chain operating model.

11. The recommendation of basic and advanced systems and processes (best or leading) for the governance of and further improvements to the supply chain.

12. The identification of further relevant areas of research.
1.6 Outline of the report

This thesis is structured in the following way:

Chapter 1 deals with the introduction, including the background, the problem formulation, the research questions, the study's contribution to the body of knowledge and the present section.

Chapter 2 presents a review of the literature covering seven main areas.

- Firstly, the supply chain is discussed with respect to its definition, its components, its role in an organisation and its organisational structure.
- Secondly, the FMCG industry is defined and its supply chains are explored. The challenges faced by FMCG supply chains are analysed and these typology of the supply chains is compared with that of the high-technology (Hi-Tech) industry. Also, the key product segments of the FMCG industry are identified.
- Thirdly, the trade regimes of India and South Africa are studied and briefly compared with those of South America.
- Fourthly, the roles and responsibilities of supply chain managers are explored with respect to their skills and competency requirements.
- Fifthly, the performance of supply chains is studied with respect to the identification of a suitable operational performance model among three different models. The relevant financial indicators and governance models are also used.
- Sixthly, the term "transnational" is defined, along with the issues affecting transnational supply chains. The latest trends in transnational supply chains are also discussed.

- Seventhly, the steps that supply chain managers are taking to deal with these issues are studied in terms of current approaches and best practices.

The **propositions** of the study are presented at the end of the literature review.

The **research methodology** is dealt with in chapter 3. The investigative approach is presented for a collective case study methodology that focuses on data collection through a set protocol and a content analysis of the information collected. Validity and reliability measures are also discussed.

Chapter 4 presents an **overview of the four cases** focusing on their histories, structures, brands and markets.

Chapter 5 presents the **findings of the research** based on the information collected from interviews and an analysis of the various documents. The findings are listed according to the investigative approach in the categories of general, typology, issues, supply chain steps and other findings.

Chapter 6 discusses the **interpretation of the findings**, including an analysis of the findings of the literature review conducted earlier and best practices. The propositions are also tested. A framework for supply chain operation model is also presented.
Chapter 7 concludes the major findings, identifies further areas of research and makes recommendations to the industry.

The references are then listed, followed by the appendices providing the details of the introductory letter, protocol, consistency matrix, the data collected from the cases, and further details on the recommended solutions.
1.7 Summary

The issues within transnational FMCG supply chains were perceived to be different from those in local supply chains, while the definition of the term "transnational" was not clear in the literature. It was therefore felt that it was necessary to study the impact of their respective trade regimes on the supply chains of two similar countries.

In summary, the elements given in figure 1-1 were analysed as part of the research framework.

![Research Framework Diagram](image)

Figure 1-1: The research framework

Hence, the objective of this thesis was defined broadly as that of identifying the key issues within transnational FMCG supply chains while articulating a set of models that identified the issues with respect to the operational and financial performance of these supply chains.

13 The research framework is explained in detail in the "research design" section.
The researcher therefore set out to investigate the abovementioned research problem and questions through the FMCG industry case studies of India and South Africa and to compare the findings from within and across the case studies. The findings were also benchmarked with best practices available locally and globally. Further, the thesis set out to reflect on the steps taken by supply chain managers to deal with the issues facing them as reflected in the case studies.