ASSESSMENT OF ROLES AND RESPONSIBILITIES OF HOSPITAL BOARDS IN A PUBLIC HOSPITAL IN THE LIMPOPO PROVINCE

by

TSHIMAUSWU ALUKHWATHI GODFREY

SUPERVISOR: SAGIE PILLAY

“A research report submitted to the School of Public Health, University of Witwatersrand, Johannesburg, in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Public Health: Hospital Management”

JOHANNESBURG, MAY 2011
DECLARATION

I declare that this report is my own unaided work. It is being submitted for the Degree of Master of Public Health: Hospital Management at the University of Witwatersrand, Johannesburg. It has not been submitted before for any degree or examination at any other University.

Signature of Candidate………………………………………

On the ..................Day of ..................of 2011
DEDICATION

This piece of work is dedicated to my wife, Phathutshedzo, three children; Gundo, Unarine and Ndivho, mother Balanganani Grace, and three sisters; Mushaathoni, Milingoni and Rendani, also dedicated it in memory of the late brother, Robert Nndanduleni and my late father, Ishmael Tshifhumulo and the late colleague/classmate and former C.E.O of Seshego Hospital, M. Putuka of the Limpopo Province’s Department of Health and Social Development, whose cruel demise left a huge void which can not replaced.
CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS ............................................................... viii
ABSTRACT .................................................................................. x
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS ............................ xii
DEFINITIONS OF TERMS .............................................................. xii

CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION, LITERATURE REVIEW, AIMS AND
OBJECTIVES

1.1 Introduction

1.1.1 Background ................................................................. 1
1.1.2 History of hospital boards.............................................. 3
1.1.3 Information on hospital boards in the Limpopo Province.. 3
1.1.4 Brief background of Tshilidzini Hospital....................... 5
1.1.5 Information about district hospitals ......................... 5
1.1.6 Legislative framework governing hospital boards....... 5

1.1.6.2 National Health Act 61 of 2003...................... 6
1.1.6.2 Northern Province Health Act No. 5 of 1998 and provincial gazette extraordinary regulations, 27/12/2000 ....................... 7

1.2 Literature review

1.2.1 Introduction ................................................................. 7
1.2.2 Strategic management and policy development........ 8
1.2.3 Financial management ............................................... 8
1.2.4 Human resource management, planning and training.... 10
1.2.5 Roles and responsibilities of hospital boards.............. 10
1.2.6 Oversight role: advisory and technical support to
management .......................................................... 13
1.2.7 Community participation and advocacy .................. 14
1.2.8 Physical facility improvements .......................... 15
1.2.9 Complaint management: internal and external customers … 15
1.2.10 Challenges facing hospital boards ....................... 15
1.2.11 Governance and leadership .............................. 16
1.2.12 Qualifications and skills of hospital board members…… 18

1.3 Aims and objectives of the study ................................ 20
   1.3.1 Main aim of the study ..................................... 20
   1.3.2 Objectives of the study .................................... 20

1.4 Rationale and problem statement ............................. 20
   1.4.1 Justification for the study ............................... 20
   1.4.2 Statement of the problem .............................. 21

1.5 Limitations of the study ...................................... 21

CHAPTER 2: RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY

2.1 Study design ......................................................... .... 23
2.2 Study population ................................................... 23
2.3 Study sample ........................................................ 24
2.4 Study area ........................................................... 25
2.5 Pilot study ............................................................ 25
2.6 Data collection, management and analysis .................. 25
2.7 Ethical considerations .......................................... 27

CHAPTER 3: FINDINGS

3.1 Introduction .......................................................... 29
3.2 Social demographic characteristics of participants ......... 29
   3.2.1 Age .............................................................. 29
   3.2.2 Gender ......................................................... 29
   3.2.3 Employment status of board members .................. 30
   3.2.4 Year of appointment ...................................... 30
3.3 Strategic planning matters .......................................................... 31
    3.3.1 Strategic planning and monitoring implementation of plans .......................................................... 31
3.4 Advisory, technical support and oversight role .......................... 31
3.5 Financial management .............................................................. 32
3.6 Supply chain management ....................................................... 33
3.7 Physical facility management ................................................... 34
3.8 Human resource management, planning and training .............. 35
3.9 Community participation and communication .......................... 37
3.10 Information management and complaint management ............ 38
3.11 Advocacy and fundraising ...................................................... 38
3.12 Quality assurance and monitoring .......................................... 39
    3.12.1 Development of ethos and attending to patients’ interests... 40
3.13 Risk and security management ................................................ 40
3.14 Appreciation of roles and responsibilities by the hospital management ......................................................... 41
3.15 Possible challenges and problems experienced by hospital boards 41
    3.15.1 Lack of commitment and multi-tasking board members .... 41
    3.15.2 Knowledge, experience and expertise in health matters and lack of capacity .................................................. 42
    3.15.3 The relationship between the management and the hospital board ......................................................... 43
    3.15.4 Role confusion: misinterpretation of powers .................. 44
    3.15.5 Inadequate incentives for board members attending meetings 45
3.16 Recommendations on how hospital boards can be more effective and efficient ..................................................... 47
    3.16.1 Training and development ............................................. 47
    3.16.2 Incentives ................................................................. 47
    3.16.3 Monitoring and evaluation of activities ............................ 47
3.17 Criteria for the selection of hospital boards .............................. 48
    3.17.1 Local community members with interest in health matters .... 48
    3.17.2 Skill and experience ................................................... 49
3.18 Hospital board members’ recommendations on how to enhance overall performance ................................................................. 50
3.18.1 Review of the subsistence and travelling allowance ........... 50
3.18.2 Review of the Act and policy guidelines governing hospital boards operations ................................................................. 51
3.18.3 Monitoring and evaluation ............................................. 51
3.18.4 Training and development ............................................. 51

CHAPTER 4: DISCUSSION OF FINDINGS

4.1 Introduction ........................................................................... 53
4.2 Strategic management and policy development ..................... 53
4.3 Advisory, technical support and oversight to management ..... 54
4.4 Financial management .......................................................... 57
4.5 Supply chain management .................................................... 58
4.6 Physical facility management ............................................... 59
4.7 Human resource management, planning and development..... 60
4.8 Community participation and communication ...................... 62
4.9 Information management and complaint management ......... 63
4.10 Advocacy and fund raising .................................................. 65
4.11 Quality assurance and monitoring ....................................... 66
  4.11.1 Development of Ethos and Attending to Patients’ Interests..... 66
4.12 Risk and security management ............................................ 67

CHAPTER 5: CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS ............ 68

5.1 Roles and responsibilities (Objective 1) .............................. 68
5.2 Challenges experienced by board members (Objective 2) .........69
5.3 Criteria for selection (Objective 3) ........................................ 70

REFERENCES ............................................................................. 71
ANNEXURES ............................................................................... 74
A-Questionnaires Section 1 and 2 ..............................................74
B- Information Sheet - for respondents ..................................... 79
C- Informed Consent - individual interviews ............................. 81
D- Informed Consent – tape recording ......................................................... 81
E- Respondent’s profile ........................................................................ 82
F- Ethic’s clearance letter- approval from Wits University .................... 84
G- Approval letter from HOD –Limpopo Province .................................... 85

TABLES
Table 3.1:  Age .................................................................................. 29
Table 3.2:  Gender ............................................................................... 29
Table 3.3:  Employment status .............................................................. 30
Table 3.4:  Year of appointment .............................................................. 30
Table 3.5:  Strategic planning matters .................................................. 31
Table 3.6:  Advisory and technical support to management, oversight role ...... 31
Table 3.7:  Financial management ......................................................... 33
Table 3.8:  Financial management ......................................................... 33
Table 3.9:  Supply chain management .................................................... 34
Table 3.10:  Physical facility management .............................................. 35
Table 3.11:  Physical facility management .............................................. 35
Table 3.12:  Human resource management, planning and development .......... 36
Table 3.13:  Human resource management, planning and development .......... 36
Table 3.14:  Community participation and communication ....................... 37
Table 3.15:  Information dissemination .................................................. 38
Table 3.16:  Advocacy and fundraising ............................................... 39
Table 3.17:  Advocacy and fundraising ............................................... 39
Table 3.18:  Quality assurance and monitoring ....................................... 40
Table 3.19:  Quality assurance & patient interest .................................... 40
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

• I would like to thank my family for their prayers and support during the hard times in my studies since 2006.

• I thank the whole management team of Louis Trichardt Memorial Hospital and those promoted to other government departments and agencies for their unwavering support and encouragement. They proved to me that working as a team yields positive results and it ensures that effective and efficient service delivery is rendered to communities. Much appreciation also goes to the former finance manager, F.E. Ndou, who played a very instrumental role in availing the much needed expertise and support at all times.

• I am deeply indebted to my supervisor Mr Sagie Pillay - former CEO of Johannesburg General Hospital, now CEO of National Health Laboratory Services (NHLS), who gave me courage when things were not turning out positively. I have noted with great appreciation his patience and mentoring skills throughout the project. Without his astute and prudent guidance this study would not be possible. His contribution to my personal, professional and academic growth and development was also immense.

• I also wish to acknowledge efforts of all the programme coordinators and administrators of Hospital Management Department of Health and Social Development from the School of Public Health at Wits University. I thank them very much for coordinating the programme without giving up, even though the road we travelled together seemed to be crooked.

• I thank the first cohort group (MPH-Hospital Management: Wits and KZN Universities) for their support and for venturing into the programme with me. I
sincerely extend my heartfelt gratitude to all the efforts they have put in this project.

• I want especially to thank both the National Ministry of Health and the Limpopo Department for affording me the opportunity to be part of the programme and for allowing me to conduct the research in the Province and I cannot forget my thanks to my Italian mentor, Emanuela Figolia for her assistance in developing the analysis tool for this piece of work.

• To all Chief Executive Officers (in the province and outside) I say bravo and forward with the quest: “towards better managed public hospitals” and an improved quality of life for the people they serve.
ABSTRACT

Introduction: This study sought to assess the roles and responsibilities performed by hospital boards in the public hospitals in the Limpopo Province since 2004. The rationale for embarking on the study is due to the fact that most public hospitals boards are characterized by role ambiguity resulting in squabbles and conflicts with health facility management, functionality crises or challenges, poor representation of communities being served, lack of personal commitment and will to the detriment of service delivery.

Objectives: To determine the roles and responsibilities of the hospital boards in the Limpopo Province since 2004, to establish the main challenges that are experienced by public hospital board members which hinder good performance and to determine the qualification criteria for those appointed to be members of the hospital boards.

Methodology: This is a qualitative study where the researcher interviewed board members of Tshilidzini Regional Hospital in the Vhembe District appointed in 2004 by the Provincial Member of Executive Council (MEC) for the Department of Health and Social Development in the Limpopo Province in terms of Northern Province Health Act of 1998. The study has been conducted from August to September 2008.

Study Sample: The sample is a purposive one made up of 18 members from six district hospitals and 5 members from Tshilidzini Regional Hospital, all found in Vhembe district. The respondents were interviewed, using both open-ended and a closed-ended questionnaire.

Data analysis and interpretation: As the study is a descriptive, the collected data was analyzed, taking into consideration the views and inputs as presented by different participants in the study. The researcher developed some themes or topics in accordance with the main focus areas of study and from what had been learnt via the literature
reviews on the roles and responsibilities of hospital boards in the country and internationally.

**Results:** The study found out that board members were not adequately performing the expected roles and responsibilities. Furthermore, the study shows numerous challenges and difficulties hindering board members in the execution of said roles and responsibilities that need to be addressed by the Department. The respondents also gave recommendations and inputs on the issue of criteria to consider when selecting community members interested to being hospital board members.

**Recommendations:** A substantive recommendation is made for the Department of Health and Social Development in the Limpopo province including other provinces and the national Ministry of Health in South Africa to engage in a systematic review of the National Health Act, 61 of 2003. The study has evidence of the problems in the implementation of the Act which perhaps needs intervention through appropriate recruitment and appointment process, capacity building and clarification of roles and responsibilities. To address challenges pertaining to incentives for board members, it is further recommended that a policy needs to be developed. In order to enforce accountability, monitoring guidelines and reporting mechanisms should be developed in the form of regulations in the provinces. The appointed hospital board members should have background in financial management, financial accounting, strategic management, community development, human resource management, clinical matters, legal environment, quality assurance and risk management so that they can enhance good governance in a public hospital.
ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS

CEO : Chief Executive Officer
DHS : District Health System
MEC : Member of the Executive Council
HOD : Head of Department
HSP : Hospital Strategy Project
NHS : National Health System
PHC : Primary Health Care
PFMA : Public Finance Management Act

DEFINITIONS OF TERMS

- **Chief Executive Officer (C.E.O):** A health facility manager appointed to run the day to day affairs of such health care facility.
- **District hospital:** A first level non-specialist public hospital to which patients from nearby clinics or health centre maybe referred..
- **Health centre:** A community based structure that excludes a private hospital, usually providing a 24-hour health facility with a greater variety of services that are not provided at clinic.
- **Hospital board:** A hospital board established in terms of the Northern Province Health Act 5 of 1998 and National Health Act 61 of 2003.
- **Hospital:** A health care institution with an organized medical, professional and support staff and with in-patient beds available around the clock. Its primary function is to provide medical, nursing and other health related services to in-patients for both surgical and non-surgical conditions and other services and emergency care to out-patients.
- **Primary Health Care (PHC):** Often abbreviated as PHC, is “essential health care based on practical, scientifically sound and socially acceptable methods and
technology made universally accessible to individuals and families in the
community through their full participation and at a cost that the community and
the country can afford to maintain at every stage of their development in the spirit
of self-determination" (Alma Ata international conference definition)

- **Regional hospital**: A secondary public hospital to which patients are referred
  from a district hospital. The hospital serves several district hospitals by providing
  more specialized services.

- **Tertiary Care**: A specialized consultative care, usually provided after a referral
  from primary or secondary medical care personnel, by specialists working at a
  center that has personnel and facilities for special investigation and treatment. It is
  also related to secondary medical care that medical care provides through a
  physician who acts as a consultant at the request of a primary physician.